Republic

PLATO

c. 428–348 BC

Republic

Πολιτεία

Translated from the Greek with AI (Claude) and edited



FORAGE
forage.com

Republic · Plato (c. 428–348 BC)

Translated from the Greek with AI (Claude) and edited. Parallel-text edition, Forage, October 2026. forage.com/plato/republic

Greek text: John Burnet, *Platonis Opera*, vol. 4 (Oxford), via the Perseus Digital Library (github.com/PerseusDL/canonical-greekLit), CC BY-SA 4.0. English: translated from the Greek with AI (Claude), then edited for accuracy and consistency. Not reviewed by a human specialist. Free to reuse under CC BY-SA 4.0. Margin numbers are the standard Stephanus references.

The original text is in the public domain. This translation is free to share and adapt under the Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International license (CC BY-SA 4.0): creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0

Set in Source Serif 4, with Gentium Book Plus.

CONTENTS

Introduction vii

Book I 1
- Cephalus on old age and wealth 2
- Justice as paying what you owe 6
- Thrasymachus bursts in 13
- The shepherd and the tyrant 22
- Is injustice wiser and stronger? 29
- The function of the soul 35

Book II 39
- Where justice comes from 41
- The perfectly just and the perfectly unjust 43
- Adeimantus on rewards and reputations 45
- The city as the soul writ large 51
- The feverish city and its guardians 57
- Stories about the gods 62

Book III 73
- Heroes who lament and laugh 74
- Narration and imitation 80
- Modes and rhythms 88
- Physical training and medicine 95
- Choosing the rulers 105
- How the guardians are to live 110

Book IV 113
- Wealth, poverty and the unity of the city 115
- Wisdom, courage and moderation in the city 122
- Justice in the city: doing one's own 130
- The three parts of the soul 134
- Justice in the soul 141

Book V 149
- The first wave: women as guardians 151
- The second wave: wives and children in common 160
- The guardians at war 172
- The third wave: philosopher-kings 179
- Knowledge and opinion 184

Book VI 191
- Why philosophers seem useless 195
- How the philosophic nature is corrupted 199
- Philosophers as rulers 210
- The form of the good 216

The sun . . . 219
The divided line . . . 223

Book VII . . . 227
Education as a turning around . . . 231
Why the philosophers must go back down . . . 232
The studies that draw the soul upward . . . 235
Dialectic . . . 248
Choosing and training the rulers . . . 252
The dangers of argument . . . 255

Book VIII . . . 261
How the best city declines . . . 263
The timocratic man . . . 266
Oligarchy and the oligarchic man . . . 269
Democracy and the democratic man . . . 275
How tyranny arises . . . 284
The tyrant in power . . . 290

Book IX . . . 295
How the tyrannical man comes to be . . . 296
The tyrant is the most wretched . . . 301
Three kinds of pleasure . . . 307
True and false pleasure . . . 311
The many-headed beast . . . 318
The city within . . . 322

Book X . . . 325
The three beds . . . 326
Homer and the poets on trial . . . 330
The ancient quarrel . . . 341
The immortality of the soul . . . 342
The rewards of justice . . . 347
The myth of Er . . . 350

INTRODUCTION

The *Republic* begins with a simple question at a dinner in the Piraeus, the port of Athens: what is justice, and is a just person happier than an unjust one? To answer it, Socrates and his companions build an ideal city in words, and find the same structure in the human soul.

Along the way come some of the most famous images in philosophy: the ring of Gyges, the philosopher-kings, the sun, the divided line, the cave, and the myth of Er. It is Plato's longest and most ambitious work, and the one that has shaped Western thought about politics, education and the good life more than any other.

Socrates narrates the whole conversation himself. Each of the ten books is on its own page.

Book I

What is justice? Cephalus, Polemarchus and Thrasymachus.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
327a	**SOCRATES** κατέβην χθὲς εἰς Πειραιᾶ μετὰ Γλαύκωνος τοῦ Ἀρίστωνος προσευξόμενός τε τῇ θεῷ καὶ ἅμα τὴν ἑορτὴν βουλόμενος θεάσασθαι τίνα τρόπον ποιήσουσιν ἅτε νῦν πρῶτον ἄγοντες. καλὴ μὲν οὖν μοι καὶ ἡ τῶν ἐπιχωρίων πομπὴ ἔδοξεν εἶναι, οὐ μέντοι ἧττον ἐφαίνετο πρέπειν ἣν οἱ Θρᾷκες ἔπεμπον. [327b] προσευξάμενοι δὲ καὶ θεωρήσαντες ἀπῇμεν πρὸς τὸ ἄστυ. κατιδὼν οὖν πόρρωθεν ἡμᾶς οἴκαδε ὡρμημένους Πολέμαρχος ὁ Κεφάλου ἐκέλευσε δραμόντα τὸν παῖδα περιμεῖναί ἑ κελεῦσαι. καί μου ὄπισθεν ὁ παῖς λαβόμενος τοῦ ἱματίου, κελεύει ὑμᾶς, ἔφη, Πολέμαρχος περιμεῖναι. καὶ ἐγὼ μετεστράφην τε καὶ ἠρόμην ὅπου αὐτὸς εἴη. οὗτος, ἔφη, ὄπισθεν προσέρχεται· ἀλλὰ περιμένετε. ἀλλὰ περιμενοῦμεν, ἦ δ’ ὃς ὁ Γλαύκων. [327c]	**SOCRATES** I went down to the Piraeus yesterday with Glaucon, son of Ariston, to offer my prayers to the goddess, and also because I wanted to see how they would conduct the festival, since this was the first time they were holding it. I thought the procession of the local people was a fine one, but the one the Thracians sent looked every bit as good. [327b] When we had said our prayers and watched the show, we started back toward the city. Polemarchus, son of Cephalus, caught sight of us from a distance as we were setting off for home, and told his slave to run and ask us to wait for him. The slave caught hold of my cloak from behind and said, “Polemarchus wants you to wait.” I turned around and asked where Polemarchus himself was. “He’s coming up behind you,” he said. “Just wait.” “All right, we’ll wait,” said Glaucon. [327c] [1]
327c	καὶ ὀλίγῳ ὕστερον ὅ τε Πολέμαρχος ἦκε καὶ Ἀδείμαντος ὁ τοῦ Γλαύκωνος ἀδελφὸς καὶ Νικήρατος ὁ Νικίου καὶ ἄλλοι τινὲς ὡς ἀπὸ τῆς πομπῆς.	A little later Polemarchus arrived, with Adeimantus, Glaucon’s brother, Niceratus, son of Nicias, and a few others, apparently on their way from the procession.
	ὁ οὖν Πολέμαρχος ἔφη· ὦ Σώκρατες, δοκεῖτέ μοι πρὸς ἄστυ ὡρμῆσθαι ὡς ἀπιόντες.	Polemarchus said, “Socrates, it looks to me as if you two are off to town and leaving us.”
	οὐ γὰρ κακῶς δοξάζεις, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ.	“Not a bad guess,” I said.
	ὁρᾷς οὖν ἡμᾶς, ἔφη, ὅσοι ἐσμέν;	“Well, do you see how many of us there are?” he said.
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	“Of course.”
	ἢ τοίνυν τούτων, ἔφη, κρείττους γένεσθε ἢ μένετ’ αὐτοῦ.	“Then either prove yourselves stronger than all these,” he said, “or stay here.”
	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, ἔτι ἓν λείπεται, τὸ ἢν πείσωμεν ὑμᾶς ὡς χρὴ ἡμᾶς ἀφεῖναι;	“Isn’t there one other possibility,” I said: “that we persuade you to let us go?”
	ἦ καὶ δύναισθ’ ἄν, ἦ δ’ ὅς, πεῖσαι μὴ ἀκούοντας;	“But could you persuade people who won’t listen?” he said.
	οὐδαμῶς, ἔφη ὁ Γλαύκων.	“Certainly not,” said Glaucon.
	ὡς τοίνυν μὴ ἀκουσομένων, οὕτω διανοεῖσθε.	“Then you’d better assume we won’t be listening.”

1 The Piraeus is the harbor town of Athens. The goddess is Bendis, a Thracian deity whose festival had just been introduced there.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καὶ ὁ Ἀδείμαντος, ἆρά γε, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐδ' ἴστε ὅτι λαμπὰς ἔσται πρὸς ἑσπέραν ἀφ' ἵππων τῇ θεῷ;	And Adeimantus said, "Don't you even know that there's going to be a torch race on horseback this evening, for the goddess?"
	ἀφ' ἵππων; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· καινόν γε τοῦτο. λαμπάδια ἔχοντες διαδώσουσιν ἀλλήλοις ἁμιλλώμενοι τοῖς ἵπποις; ἢ πῶς λέγεις;	"On horseback?" I said. "That's something new. Will they carry torches and hand them on to one another as they race their horses? Or what do you mean?"
328a	οὕτως, ἔφη ὁ Πολέμαρχος. καὶ πρός γε παννυχίδα ποιήσουσιν, ἣν ἄξιον θεάσασθαι· ἐξαναστησόμεθα γὰρ μετὰ τὸ δεῖπνον καὶ τὴν παννυχίδα θεασόμεθα. καὶ συνεσόμεθά τε πολλοῖς τῶν νέων αὐτόθι καὶ διαλεξόμεθα. ἀλλὰ μένετε [328b] καὶ μὴ ἄλλως ποιεῖτε.	"Just that," said Polemarchus. "And on top of that they'll hold an all-night festival that's worth seeing. We'll get up after dinner and go and watch it. We'll meet lots of the young men there and have some conversation. So stay, [328b] and don't say no."
	καὶ ὁ Γλαύκων, ἔοικεν, ἔφη, μενετέον εἶναι.	And Glaucon said, "It looks as though we'll have to stay."
	ἀλλ' εἰ δοκεῖ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὕτω χρὴ ποιεῖν.	"Well, if you think so," I said, "that's what we should do."
328b	ἤιμεν οὖν οἴκαδε εἰς τοῦ Πολεμάρχου, καὶ Λυσίαν τε αὐτόθι κατελάβομεν καὶ Εὐθύδημον, τοὺς τοῦ Πολεμάρχου ἀδελφούς, καὶ δὴ καὶ Θρασύμαχον τὸν Καλχηδόνιον καὶ Χαρμαντίδην τὸν Παιανιᾶ καὶ Κλειτοφῶντα τὸν Ἀριστωνύμου· ἦν δ' ἔνδον καὶ ὁ πατὴρ ὁ τοῦ Πολεμάρχου Κέφαλος. καὶ μάλα πρεσβύτης μοι ἔδοξεν εἶναι· διὰ χρόνου γὰρ καὶ [328c] ἑωράκη αὐτόν. καθῆστο δὲ ἐστεφανωμένος ἐπί τινος προσκεφαλαίου τε καὶ δίφρου· τεθυκὼς γὰρ ἐτύγχανεν ἐν τῇ αὐλῇ. ἐκαθεζόμεθα οὖν παρ' αὐτόν· ἔκειντο γὰρ δίφροι τινὲς αὐτόθι κύκλῳ.	So we went to Polemarchus' house, and there we found Lysias and Euthydemus, Polemarchus' brothers, and also Thrasymachus of Chalcedon, Charmantides of Paeania, and Clitophon, son of Aristonymus. Polemarchus' father Cephalus was at home too. He looked very old to me, since it had been a long time since [328c] I'd seen him. He was sitting on a cushioned chair, wearing a garland, because he had just been offering a sacrifice in the courtyard. So we sat down beside him, since there were some chairs set out there in a circle.[2]

CEPHALUS ON OLD AGE AND WEALTH

At Polemarchus' house, old Cephalus tells Socrates that wealth helps a decent man face death with a clear conscience.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
328c	**SOCRATES** εὐθὺς οὖν με ἰδὼν ὁ Κέφαλος ἠσπάζετό τε καὶ εἶπεν· ὦ Σώκρατες, οὐ δὲ θαμίζεις ἡμῖν καταβαίνων εἰς τὸν Πειραιᾶ. χρῆν μέντοι. εἰ μὲν γὰρ ἐγὼ ἔτι ἐν δυνάμει ἦ τοῦ ῥᾳδίως πορεύεσθαι πρὸς τὸ ἄστυ, οὐδὲν ἂν σὲ ἔδει δεῦρο [328d] ἰέναι, ἀλλ' ἡμεῖς ἂν παρὰ σὲ ᾖμεν· νῦν δέ σε χρὴ πυκνότερον δεῦρο ἰέναι. ὡς εὖ ἴσθι ὅτι ἔμοιγε ὅσον αἱ ἄλλαι αἱ κατὰ τὸ σῶμα ἡδοναὶ ἀπομαραίνονται, τοσοῦτον αὔξονται αἱ περὶ τοὺς λόγους ἐπιθυμίαι τε καὶ ἡδοναί. μὴ οὖν ἄλλως ποίει, ἀλλὰ τοῖσδέ τε τοῖς νεανίσκοις σύνισθι καὶ δεῦρο παρ' ἡμᾶς φοίτα ὡς παρὰ φίλους τε καὶ πάνυ οἰκείους.	**SOCRATES** As soon as Cephalus saw me he greeted me and said, "Socrates, you don't often come down to the Piraeus to see us. You really should. If I still had the strength to walk up to town easily, there'd be no need for you to come here; [328d] we would come to you. But as things are, you ought to come here more often. I can tell you that for me, as the other pleasures, the bodily ones, wither away, my desire for conversation and my pleasure in it grow in equal measure. So don't say no. Spend time with these young men, and

2 Lysias later became a famous Athenian speechwriter; Thrasymachus of Chalcedon was a well-known sophist and teacher of rhetoric.

GREEK

ENGLISH

come and visit us here regularly, as you would friends who are very close to you."

328d καὶ μήν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Κέφαλε, χαίρω γε διαλεγόμενος 328e τοῖς σφόδρα πρεσβύταις· δοκεῖ γάρ μοι χρῆναι παρ' αὐτῶν πυνθάνεσθαι, ὥσπερ τινὰ ὁδὸν προεληλυθότων ἣν καὶ ἡμᾶς ἴσως δεήσει πορεύεσθαι, ποία τίς ἐστιν, τραχεῖα καὶ χαλεπή, ἢ ῥᾳδία καὶ εὔπορος. καὶ δὴ καὶ σοῦ ἡδέως ἂν πυθοίμην ὅτι σοι φαίνεται τοῦτο, ἐπειδὴ ἐνταῦθα ἤδη εἶ τῆς ἡλικίας ὃ δὴ ἐπὶ γήραος οὐδῷ φασιν εἶναι οἱ ποιηταί, πότερον χαλεπὸν τοῦ βίου, ἢ πῶς σὺ αὐτὸ ἐξαγγέλλεις.

"Well, Cephalus," I said, "I really do enjoy talking 328e with the very old. I think we ought to learn from them, since they've gone ahead of us down a road that we too will probably have to travel, what kind of road it is—rough and hard, or easy and smooth. And I'd especially like to hear from you how it looks to you, since you've now reached the time of life the poets call 'the threshold of old age.' Is it a hard part of life, or how would you describe it?"

329a ἐγώ σοι, ἔφη, νὴ τὸν Δία ἐρῶ, ὦ Σώκρατες, οἷόν γέ μοι φαίνεται. πολλάκις γὰρ συνερχόμεθά τινες εἰς ταὐτὸν παραπλησίαν ἡλικίαν ἔχοντες, διασῴζοντες τὴν παλαιὰν παροιμίαν· οἱ οὖν πλεῖστοι ἡμῶν ὀλοφύρονται συνιόντες, τὰς ἐν τῇ νεότητι ἡδονὰς ποθοῦντες καὶ ἀναμιμνῃσκόμενοι περί τε ταφροδίσια καὶ περὶ πότους τε καὶ εὐωχίας καὶ ἄλλ' ἄττα ἃ τῶν τοιούτων ἔχεται, καὶ ἀγανακτοῦσιν ὡς μεγάλων τινῶν ἀπεστερημένοι καὶ τότε μὲν εὖ ζῶντες, νῦν δὲ οὐδὲ ζῶντες. 329b ἔνιοι δὲ καὶ τὰς τῶν οἰκείων προπηλακίσεις τοῦ γήρως ὀδύρονται, καὶ ἐπὶ τούτῳ δὴ τὸ γῆρας ὑμνοῦσιν ὅσων κακῶν σφίσιν αἴτιον. ἐμοὶ δὲ δοκοῦσιν, ὦ Σώκρατες, οὗτοι οὐ τὸ αἴτιον αἰτιᾶσθαι. εἰ γὰρ ἦν τοῦτ' αἴτιον, κἂν ἐγὼ τὰ αὐτὰ ταῦτα ἐπεπόνθη, ἕνεκά γε γήρως, καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι πάντες ὅσοι ἐνταῦθα ἦλθον ἡλικίας.

"By Zeus, Socrates," he said, "I'll tell you just how it seems to me. A few of us who are about the same age often get together, keeping up the old proverb. When we meet, most of us complain. They long for the pleasures of their youth and reminisce about sex and drinking and feasts and everything that goes with them, and they get upset, as if they'd been robbed of something important—back then they were living well, and now they're not even alive. 329b Some also lament how their families mistreat them in their old age, and on that account they recite a litany of all the evils old age causes them. But in my view, Socrates, these men are blaming the wrong thing. If old age were to blame, I'd have had the same experiences too, as far as old age goes, and so would everyone else who has reached these years.[3]

329b νῦν δ' ἔγωγε ἤδη ἐντετύχηκα οὐχ οὕτως ἔχουσιν καὶ ἄλλοις, καὶ δὴ καὶ Σοφοκλεῖ ποτε τῷ ποιητῇ παρεγενόμην ἐρωτωμένῳ ὑπό τινος· "πῶς," ἔφη, 329c "ὦ Σοφόκλεις, ἔχεις πρὸς ταφροδίσια; ἔτι οἷός τε εἶ γυναικὶ συγγίγνεσθαι"; καὶ ὅς, "εὐφήμει," ἔφη, "ὦ ἄνθρωπε· ἀσμενέστατα μέντοι αὐτὸ ἀπέφυγον, ὥσπερ λυττῶντά τινα καὶ ἄγριον δεσπότην ἀποδράς." εὖ οὖν μοι καὶ τότε ἔδοξεν ἐκεῖνος εἰπεῖν, καὶ νῦν οὐχ ἧττον. παντάπασι γὰρ τῶν γε τοιούτων ἐν τῷ γήρᾳ πολλὴ εἰρήνη γίγνεται καὶ ἐλευθερία· ἐπειδὰν αἱ ἐπιθυμίαι παύσωνται κατατείνουσαι καὶ χαλάσωσιν, παντάπασιν τὸ τοῦ Σοφοκλέους γίγνεται, 329d δεσποτῶν πάνυ πολλῶν ἐστι καὶ μαινομένων ἀπηλλάχθαι. ἀλλὰ καὶ τούτων πέρι καὶ τῶν γε πρὸς τοὺς οἰκείους μία τις αἰτία ἐστίν, οὐ τὸ γῆρας, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἀλλ' ὁ τρόπος τῶν ἀνθρώπων.

"As it is, I've met others who don't feel this way. In particular, I was once with the poet Sophocles when someone asked him, 'Sophocles,' he said, 329c 'how are you when it comes to sex? Can you still make love to a woman?' And he said, 'Hush, man! I'm very glad to have escaped it, as if I'd run away from a raging, savage master.' I thought he spoke well then, and I think so no less now. For in old age there comes a great peace and freedom from such things altogether. When the desires stop straining and relax, what Sophocles said comes completely true: 329d you're rid of a great many masters, and mad ones at that. But as regards these things, and our relations with our families too, there's one single cause, Socrates—not old age, but people's character.

329d

"If they're orderly and good-tempered, even old age is only moderately burdensome. If not, So-

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἂν μὲν γὰρ κόσμιοι καὶ εὔκολοι ὦσιν, καὶ τὸ γῆρας μετρίως ἐστὶν ἐπίπονον· εἰ δὲ μή, καὶ γῆρας, ὦ Σώκρατες, καὶ νεότης χαλεπὴ τῷ τοιούτῳ συμβαίνει.	crates, then both old age and youth turn out hard for someone like that."
	καὶ ἐγὼ ἀγασθεὶς αὐτοῦ εἰπόντος ταῦτα, βουλόμενος ἔτι [329e] λέγειν αὐτὸν ἐκίνουν καὶ εἶπον· ὦ Κέφαλε, οἶμαί σου τοὺς πολλούς, ὅταν ταῦτα λέγῃς, οὐκ ἀποδέχεσθαι ἀλλ' ἡγεῖσθαί σε ῥᾳδίως τὸ γῆρας φέρειν οὐ διὰ τὸν τρόπον ἀλλὰ διὰ τὸ πολλὴν οὐσίαν κεκτῆσθαι· τοῖς γὰρ πλουσίοις πολλὰ παραμύθιά φασιν εἶναι.	I admired him for saying this, and wanting him to keep [329e] talking, I prodded him and said, "Cephalus, I imagine that when you say this, most people don't accept it. They think you bear old age easily not because of your character but because you've acquired a great deal of wealth. The rich, they say, have many consolations."
329e	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη, λέγεις· οὐ γὰρ ἀποδέχονται. καὶ λέγουσι μέν τι, οὐ μέντοι γε ὅσον οἴονται· ἀλλὰ τὸ τοῦ Θεμιστοκλέους εὖ ἔχει, ὃς τῷ Σεριφίῳ λοιδορουμένῳ καὶ λέγοντι [330a] ὅτι οὐ δι' αὐτὸν ἀλλὰ διὰ τὴν πόλιν εὐδοκιμοῖ, ἀπεκρίνατο ὅτι οὔτ' ἂν αὐτὸς Σερίφιος ὢν ὀνομαστὸς ἐγένετο οὔτ' ἐκεῖνος Ἀθηναῖος. καὶ τοῖς δὴ μὴ πλουσίοις, χαλεπῶς δὲ τὸ γῆρας φέρουσιν, εὖ ἔχει ὁ αὐτὸς λόγος, ὅτι οὔτ' ἂν ὁ ἐπιεικὴς πάνυ τι ῥᾳδίως γῆρας μετὰ πενίας ἐνέγκοι οὔθ' ὁ μὴ ἐπιεικὴς πλουτήσας εὔκολός ποτ' ἂν ἑαυτῷ γένοιτο.	"That's true," he said. "They don't accept it. And they have a point, though not as much of one as they think. What Themistocles said fits well here. When a man from Seriphus was abusing him and saying [330a] that his fame was due not to himself but to his city, he answered that he wouldn't have become famous if he'd been a Seriphian, and neither would the other man if he'd been an Athenian. The same principle applies well to people who aren't rich and find old age hard. A decent man wouldn't find old age altogether easy to bear if he were poor, but an indecent one, even if he became rich, would never be at peace with himself."[4]
330a	πότερον δέ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Κέφαλε, ὧν κέκτησαι τὰ πλείω παρέλαβες ἢ ἐπεκτήσω; [330b]	"Cephalus," I said, "did you inherit most of what you own, or did you make it yourself?" [330b]
	ποῖ' ἐπεκτησάμην, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες; μέσος τις γέγονα χρηματιστὴς τοῦ τε πάππου καὶ τοῦ πατρός. ὁ μὲν γὰρ πάππος τε καὶ ὁμώνυμος ἐμοὶ σχεδόν τι ὅσην ἐγὼ νῦν οὐσίαν κέκτημαι παραλαβὼν πολλάκις τοσαύτην ἐποίησεν, Λυσανίας δὲ ὁ πατὴρ ἔτι ἐλάττω αὐτὴν ἐποίησε τῆς νῦν οὔσης· ἐγὼ δὲ ἀγαπῶ ἐὰν μὴ ἐλάττω καταλίπω τούτοισιν, ἀλλὰ βραχεῖ γέ τινι πλείω ἢ παρέλαβον.	"Make it, Socrates?" he said. "As a moneymaker I've come out somewhere between my grandfather and my father. My grandfather, whose name I share, inherited about as much property as I own now and multiplied it many times over, while my father Lysanias reduced it to even less than it is now. I'm content if I leave these boys not less, but a little more than I inherited."
330b	οὗ τοι ἕνεκα ἠρόμην, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι μοι ἔδοξας οὐ σφόδρα [330c] ἀγαπᾶν τὰ χρήματα, τοῦτο δὲ ποιοῦσιν ὡς τὸ πολὺ οἳ ἂν μὴ αὐτοὶ κτήσωνται· οἱ δὲ κτησάμενοι διπλῇ ἢ οἱ ἄλλοι ἀσπάζονται αὐτά. ὥσπερ γὰρ οἱ ποιηταὶ τὰ αὑτῶν ποιήματα καὶ οἱ πατέρες τοὺς παῖδας ἀγαπῶσιν, ταύτῃ τε δὴ καὶ οἱ χρηματισάμενοι περὶ τὰ χρήματα σπουδάζουσιν ὡς ἔργον ἑαυτῶν, καὶ κατὰ τὴν χρείαν ἥπερ οἱ ἄλλοι. χαλεποὶ οὖν καὶ συγγενέσθαι εἰσίν, οὐδὲν ἐθέλοντες ἐπαινεῖν ἀλλ' ἢ τὸν πλοῦτον.	"The reason I asked," I said, "is that you didn't seem to me especially [330c] attached to money. That's usually the way with people who didn't make it themselves. Those who did make it love it twice as much as anyone else. Just as poets love their own poems and fathers their children, so people who have made money care about it as their own work, as well as for its usefulness, as others do. That makes them hard even to be around: they won't praise anything but wealth."
	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη, λέγεις. [330d]	

3 The proverb is "like age delights like age," roughly "birds of a feather flock together."
4 Themistocles was the Athenian statesman who led the Greek fleet against Persia at Salamis in 480 BC; Seriphus was a small, insignificant island in the Aegean.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"That's true," he said. 330d
330d	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. ἀλλά μοι ἔτι τοσόνδε εἰπέ· τί μέγιστον οἴει ἀγαθὸν ἀπολελαυκέναι τοῦ πολλὴν οὐσίαν κεκτῆσθαι;	"It certainly is," I said. "But tell me one more thing. What do you think is the greatest good you've enjoyed from owning great wealth?"
	ὅ, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἴσως οὐκ ἂν πολλοὺς πείσαιμι λέγων. εὖ γὰρ ἴσθι, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, ὅτι, ἐπειδάν τις ἐγγὺς ᾖ τοῦ οἴεσθαι τελευτήσειν, εἰσέρχεται αὐτῷ δέος καὶ φροντὶς περὶ ὧν ἔμπροσθεν οὐκ εἰσήει. οἵ τε γὰρ λεγόμενοι μῦθοι περὶ τῶν ἐν Ἅιδου, ὡς τὸν ἐνθάδε ἀδικήσαντα δεῖ ἐκεῖ διδόναι 330e δίκην, καταγελώμενοι τέως, τότε δὴ στρέφουσιν αὐτοῦ τὴν ψυχὴν μὴ ἀληθεῖς ὦσιν· καὶ αὐτός —ἤτοι ὑπὸ τῆς τοῦ γήρως ἀσθενείας ἢ καὶ ὥσπερ ἤδη ἐγγυτέρω ὢν τῶν ἐκεῖ μᾶλλόν τι καθορᾷ αὐτά—ὑποψίας δ' οὖν καὶ δείματος μεστὸς γίγνεται καὶ ἀναλογίζεται ἤδη καὶ σκοπεῖ εἴ τινά τι ἠδίκησεν.	"Something," he said, "that I probably couldn't persuade many people of if I said it. You should know, Socrates," he said, "that when a man comes close to thinking he's going to die, fear and worry come over him about things that never troubled him before. The stories told about what happens in Hades—that someone who has done wrong here must pay 330e the penalty there—which he used to laugh at, now torment his soul with the fear that they might be true. And he himself—whether because of the weakness of old age, or because he's closer now to what's there and sees it more clearly —at any rate he's filled with suspicion and dread, and begins to reckon up and examine whether he has wronged anyone.
330e	ὁ μὲν οὖν εὑρίσκων ἑαυτοῦ ἐν τῷ βίῳ πολλὰ ἀδικήματα καὶ ἐκ τῶν ὕπνων, ὥσπερ οἱ παῖδες, θαμὰ ἐγειρόμενος δειμαίνει 331a καὶ ζῇ μετὰ κακῆς ἐλπίδος· τῷ δὲ μηδὲν ἑαυτῷ ἄδικον συνειδότι ἡδεῖα ἐλπὶς ἀεὶ πάρεστι καὶ ἀγαθὴ "γηροτρόφος ", ὡς καὶ Πίνδαρος λέγει. χαριέντως γάρ τοι, ὦ Σώκρατες, τοῦτ' ἐκεῖνος εἶπεν, ὅτι ὃς ἂν δικαίως καὶ ὁσίως τὸν βίον διαγάγῃ, γλυκεῖά οἱ καρδίαν ἀτάλλοισα γηροτρόφος συναορεῖ ἐλπὶς ἃ μάλιστα θνατῶν πολύστροφον γνώμαν κυβερνᾷ. εὖ οὖν λέγει θαυμαστῶς ὡς σφόδρα. πρὸς δὴ τοῦτ' ἔγωγε τίθημι τὴν τῶν χρημάτων κτῆσιν πλείστου ἀξίαν εἶναι, οὔ 331b τι παντὶ ἀνδρὶ ἀλλὰ τῷ ἐπιεικεῖ καὶ κοσμίῳ.	"The man who finds many wrongs in his life wakes up often from his sleep in terror, like children, 331a and lives with bad expectations. But the man who knows of no wrong he's done always has sweet hope beside him, a good 'nurse of old age,' as Pindar puts it. He said it beautifully, Socrates: whoever lives his life justly and piously, 'sweet hope goes with him, cherishing his heart, the nurse of his old age—hope, which most of all steers the twisting minds of mortals.' That's wonderfully well said. And it's with this in view that I count owning money most valuable—not 331b for every man, but for one who is decent and orderly.[5]
331b	τὸ γὰρ μηδὲ ἄκοντά τινα ἐξαπατῆσαι ἢ ψεύσασθαι, μηδ' αὖ ὀφείλοντα ἢ θεῷ θυσίας τινὰς ἢ ἀνθρώπῳ χρήματα ἔπειτα ἐκεῖσε ἀπιέναι δεδιότα, μέγα μέρος εἰς τοῦτο ἡ τῶν χρημάτων κτῆσις συμβάλλεται. ἔχει δὲ καὶ ἄλλας χρείας πολλάς· ἀλλὰ ἕν γε ἀνθ' ἑνὸς οὐκ ἐλάχιστον ἔγωγε θείην ἂν εἰς τοῦτο ἀνδρὶ νοῦν ἔχοντι, ὦ Σώκρατες, πλοῦτον χρησιμώτατον εἶναι. 331c	"Not cheating or lying to anyone, even unintentionally, and not having to depart for the other world afraid because you still owe sacrifices to a god or money to a person—the possession of money contributes a great deal to that. It has many other uses too. But weighing one thing against another, I'd put this down as not the least of the ways wealth is most useful to a man of sense, Socrates." 331c

5 Pindar was a lyric poet of the fifth century BC; the lines quoted come from a poem now lost.

JUSTICE AS PAYING WHAT YOU OWE

Polemarchus defines justice as helping friends and harming enemies, and Socrates refutes him.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
331c	**SOCRATES** παγκάλως, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λέγεις, ὦ Κέφαλε. τοῦτο δ' αὐτό, τὴν δικαιοσύνην, πότερα τὴν ἀλήθειαν αὐτὸ φήσομεν εἶναι ἁπλῶς οὕτως καὶ τὸ ἀποδιδόναι ἄν τίς τι παρά του λάβῃ, ἢ καὶ αὐτὰ ταῦτα ἔστιν ἐνίοτε μὲν δικαίως, ἐνίοτε δὲ ἀδίκως ποιεῖν; οἷον τοιόνδε λέγω· πᾶς ἄν που εἴποι, εἴ τις λάβοι παρὰ φίλου ἀνδρὸς σωφρονοῦντος ὅπλα, εἰ μανεὶς ἀπαιτοῖ, ὅτι οὔτε χρὴ τὰ τοιαῦτα ἀποδιδόναι, οὔτε δίκαιος ἂν εἴη ὁ ἀποδιδούς, οὐδ' αὖ πρὸς τὸν οὕτως ἔχοντα πάντα ἐθέλων τἀληθῆ λέγειν. 331d	**SOCRATES** "Beautifully put, Cephalus," I said. "But this very thing, justice—are we to say it's simply telling the truth and giving back whatever you've received from someone? Or is it sometimes just and sometimes unjust to do these very things? Here's the kind of case I mean. Surely everyone would agree that if you took weapons from a friend when he was in his right mind, and he went mad and asked for them back, you shouldn't return them, and whoever returned them wouldn't be just—nor would someone who was willing to tell the whole truth to a man in that state." 331d
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"You're right," he said.
331d	οὐκ ἄρα οὗτος ὅρος ἐστὶν δικαιοσύνης, ἀληθῆ τε λέγειν καὶ ἃ ἄν λάβῃ τις ἀποδιδόναι.	"Then this isn't the definition of justice: telling the truth and giving back what you've received."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, ὑπολαβὼν ὁ Πολέμαρχος, εἴπερ γέ τι χρὴ Σιμωνίδῃ πείθεσθαι.	"Yes, it is, Socrates," said Polemarchus, breaking in, "if we're to believe Simonides at all."
	καὶ μέντοι, ἔφη ὁ Κέφαλος, καὶ παραδίδωμι ὑμῖν τὸν λόγον· δεῖ γάρ με ἤδη τῶν ἱερῶν ἐπιμεληθῆναι.	"Well, in any case," said Cephalus, "I'm handing the argument over to you. It's time for me to see to the sacrifices."
	οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, ἐγώ, ὁ Πολέμαρχος, τῶν γε σῶν κληρονόμος;	"So I'm your heir, am I?" said Polemarchus.
	πάνυ γε, ἦ δ' ὃς γελάσας, καὶ ἅμα ᾔει πρὸς τὰ ἱερά. 331e	"Certainly," he said with a laugh, and went off to the sacrifices. 331e 6
331e	λέγε δή, εἶπον ἐγώ, σὺ ὁ τοῦ λόγου κληρονόμος, τί φῂς τὸν Σιμωνίδην λέγοντα ὀρθῶς λέγειν περὶ δικαιοσύνης;	"Tell me, then," I said, "you, the heir of the argument: what is it that Simonides says about justice that you think is right?"
	ὅτι, ἦ δ' ὅς, τὸ τὰ ὀφειλόμενα ἑκάστῳ ἀποδιδόναι δίκαιόν ἐστι· τοῦτο λέγων δοκεῖ ἔμοιγε καλῶς λέγειν.	"That it's just to give back to each person what is owed to him," he said. "In saying that, I think he speaks well."
	ἀλλὰ μέντοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, Σιμωνίδῃ γε οὐ ῥᾴδιον ἀπιστεῖν—σοφὸς γὰρ καὶ θεῖος ἀνήρ—τοῦτο μέντοι ὅτι ποτὲ λέγει, σὺ μέν, ὦ Πολέμαρχε, ἴσως γιγνώσκεις, ἐγὼ δὲ ἀγνοῶ· δῆλον γὰρ ὅτι οὐ τοῦτο λέγει, ὅπερ ἄρτι ἐλέγομεν, τό τινος παρακαταθεμένου τι ὁτῳοῦν μὴ σωφρόνως ἀπαιτοῦντι 332a ἀποδιδόναι. καίτοι γε ὀφειλόμενόν πού ἐστιν τοῦτο ὃ παρακατέθετο· ἦ γάρ;	"Well, it isn't easy to disbelieve Simonides," I said—"he's a wise and godlike man. But what on earth he means by this, Polemarchus, you may know; I don't. Clearly he doesn't mean what we were just talking about: that when someone has left something in your keeping and asks for it back when he's not in his right mind, you 332a return it. And yet what he left in your keeping is owed to him, isn't it?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	ἀποδοτέον δέ γε οὐδ' ὁπωστιοῦν τότε ὁπότε τις μὴ σωφρόνως ἀπαιτοῖ;	
	ἀληθῆ, ἦ δ' ὅς.	

6 Simonides of Ceos (c. 556–468 BC) was a celebrated lyric poet.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		“But it’s not to be returned under any circumstances when the person asking for it isn’t in his right mind?”
		“True,” he said.
332a	ἄλλο δή τι ἢ τὸ τοιοῦτον, ὡς ἔοικεν, λέγει Σιμωνίδης τὸ τὰ ὀφειλόμενα δίκαιον εἶναι ἀποδιδόναι.	“Then it seems Simonides means something different when he says it’s just to give back what is owed.”
	ἄλλο μέντοι νὴ Δί’, ἔφη· τοῖς γὰρ φίλοις οἴεται ὀφείλειν τοὺς φίλους ἀγαθὸν μέν τι δρᾶν, κακὸν δὲ μηδέν.	“Something different, by Zeus,” he said. “He thinks friends owe it to friends to do them some good, and nothing bad.”
	μανθάνω, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ—ὅτι οὐ τὰ ὀφειλόμενα ἀποδίδωσιν ὃς ἄν τῳ χρυσίον ἀποδῷ παρακαταθεμένῳ, ἐάνπερ ἡ ἀπόδοσις [332b] καὶ ἡ λῆψις βλαβερὰ γίγνηται, φίλοι δὲ ὦσιν ὅ τε ἀπολαμβάνων καὶ ὁ ἀποδιδούς—οὐχ οὕτω λέγειν φῂς τὸν Σιμωνίδην;	“I understand,” I said. “A man isn’t giving back what is owed if he returns gold to someone who deposited it with him, when the returning [332b] and receiving turn out to be harmful and the one who receives and the one who returns are friends. Isn’t that what you say Simonides means?”
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	“Certainly.”
	τί δέ; τοῖς ἐχθροῖς ἀποδοτέον ὅτι ἂν τύχῃ ὀφειλόμενον;	“What about enemies? Should we give them back whatever we happen to owe them?”
332b	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, ὅ γε ὀφείλεται αὐτοῖς, ὀφείλεται δέ γε οἶμαι παρά γε τοῦ ἐχθροῦ τῷ ἐχθρῷ ὅπερ καὶ προσήκει, κακόν τι.	“Absolutely,” he said, “what is owed to them. And what an enemy owes an enemy, I think, is just what’s fitting: something bad.”
	ἠινίξατο ἄρα, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, ὡς ἔοικεν, ὁ Σιμωνίδης ποιητικῶς [332c] τὸ δίκαιον ὃ εἴη. διενοεῖτο μὲν γάρ, ὡς φαίνεται, ὅτι τοῦτ’ εἴη δίκαιον, τὸ προσῆκον ἑκάστῳ ἀποδιδόναι, τοῦτο δὲ ὠνόμασεν ὀφειλόμενον.	“So it seems,” I said, “that Simonides was speaking in riddles, the way poets do, [332c] about what justice is. What he had in mind, apparently, was that justice is giving each person what is fitting for him, and he called this ‘what is owed.’”
	ἀλλὰ τί οἴει; ἔφη.	“Well, what do you think?” he said.
332c	ὦ πρὸς Διός, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, εἰ οὖν τις αὐτὸν ἤρετο· “ὦ Σιμωνίδη, ἡ τίσιν οὖν τί ἀποδιδοῦσα ὀφειλόμενον καὶ προσῆκον τέχνη ἰατρικὴ καλεῖται;” τί ἂν οἴει ἡμῖν αὐτὸν ἀποκρίνασθαι;	“By Zeus,” I said, “suppose someone had asked him, ‘Simonides, the craft called medicine gives what, owed and fitting, to what?’ What do you think he’d have answered us?”
	δῆλον ὅτι, ἔφη, ἡ σώμασιν φάρμακά τε καὶ σιτία καὶ ποτά.	“Obviously,” he said, “it’s the one that gives drugs, food and drink to bodies.”
	ἡ δὲ τίσιν τί ἀποδιδοῦσα ὀφειλόμενον καὶ προσῆκον τέχνη μαγειρικὴ καλεῖται; [332d]	“And the craft called cookery gives what, owed and fitting, to what?” [332d]
	ἡ τοῖς ὄψοις τὰ ἡδύσματα.	“The one that gives seasonings to dishes.”
	εἶεν· ἡ οὖν δὴ τίσιν τί ἀποδιδοῦσα τέχνη δικαιοσύνη ἂν καλοῖτο;	“Very well. Then the craft that would be called justice gives what to whom?”
332d	εἰ μέν τι, ἔφη, δεῖ ἀκολουθεῖν, ὦ Σώκρατες, τοῖς ἔμπροσθεν εἰρημένοις, ἡ τοῖς φίλοις τε καὶ ἐχθροῖς ὠφελίας τε καὶ βλάβας ἀποδιδοῦσα.	“If we’re to follow what was said before, Socrates,” he said, “it’s the one that gives benefits and harms to friends and enemies.”
	τὸ τοὺς φίλους ἄρα εὖ ποιεῖν καὶ τοὺς ἐχθροὺς κακῶς δικαιοσύνην λέγει;	“So by justice he means doing good to friends and harm to enemies?”

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	δοκεῖ μοι.	“I think so.”
	τίς οὖν δυνατώτατος κάμνοντας φίλους εὖ ποιεῖν καὶ ἐχθροὺς κακῶς πρὸς νόσον καὶ ὑγίειαν;	“Then who is most able to do good to sick friends and harm to enemies where disease and health are concerned?”
	ἰατρός. 332e	“A doctor.” 332e
	τίς δὲ πλέοντας πρὸς τὸν τῆς θαλάττης κίνδυνον;	“And to people at sea, when it comes to the dangers of the sea?”
	κυβερνήτης.	“A ship’s captain.”
	τί δὲ ὁ δίκαιος; ἐν τίνι πράξει καὶ πρὸς τί ἔργον δυνατώτατος φίλους ὠφελεῖν καὶ ἐχθροὺς βλάπτειν;	“What about the just man? In what activity and for what work is he most able to help friends and harm enemies?”
332e	ἐν τῷ προσπολεμεῖν καὶ ἐν τῷ συμμαχεῖν, ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ.	“In making war on the one and fighting alongside the other, I think.”
	εἶεν· μὴ κάμνουσί γε μήν, ὦ φίλε Πολέμαρχε, ἰατρὸς ἄχρηστος.	“Very well. But to people who aren’t sick, my dear Polemarchus, a doctor is useless.”
	ἀληθῆ.	“True.”
	καὶ μὴ πλέουσι δὴ κυβερνήτης.	“And a captain to people who aren’t sailing.”
	ναί.	“Yes.”
	ἆρα καὶ τοῖς μὴ πολεμοῦσιν ὁ δίκαιος ἄχρηστος;	“Then is the just man useless to people who aren’t at war?”
	οὐ πάνυ μοι δοκεῖ τοῦτο.	“I really don’t think so.”
	χρήσιμον ἄρα καὶ ἐν εἰρήνῃ δικαιοσύνη;	“So justice is useful in peacetime too?”
	χρήσιμον.	“It is.”
	καὶ γὰρ γεωργία· ἢ οὔ;	“So is farming, isn’t it?”
	ναί.	“Yes.”
	πρός γε καρποῦ κτῆσιν;	“For getting crops?”
	ναί.	“Yes.”
	καὶ μὴν καὶ σκυτοτομική;	“And shoemaking too?”
	ναί.	“Yes.”
	πρός γε ὑποδημάτων ἂν οἶμαι φαίης κτῆσιν;	“For getting shoes, I suppose you’d say?”
	πάνυ γε.	“Certainly.”
333a	τί δὲ δή; τὴν δικαιοσύνην πρὸς τίνος χρείαν ἢ κτῆσιν ἐν εἰρήνῃ φαίης ἂν χρήσιμον εἶναι;	“Well then, justice—for the use or acquisition of what would you say it’s useful in peacetime?”
	πρὸς τὰ συμβόλαια, ὦ Σώκρατες.	“For contracts, Socrates.”
	συμβόλαια δὲ λέγεις κοινωνήματα ἤ τι ἄλλο;	“By contracts do you mean partnerships, or something else?”
	κοινωνήματα δῆτα. 333b	“Partnerships, of course.” 333b
	ἆρ’ οὖν ὁ δίκαιος ἀγαθὸς καὶ χρήσιμος κοινωνὸς εἰς πεττῶν θέσιν, ἢ ὁ πεττευτικός;	“Then is it the just man who is a good and useful partner in placing the pieces in a board game, or the skilled player?”
	ὁ πεττευτικός.	“The skilled player.”
	ἀλλ’ εἰς πλίνθων καὶ λίθων θέσιν ὁ δίκαιος χρησιμώτερός τε καὶ ἀμείνων κοινωνὸς τοῦ οἰκοδομικοῦ;	
	οὐδαμῶς.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		“And in laying bricks and stones, is the just man a more useful and better partner than the builder?”
		“Not at all.”
333b	ἀλλ’ εἰς τίνα δὴ κοινωνίαν ὁ δίκαιος ἀμείνων κοινωνὸς τοῦ οἰκοδομικοῦ τε καὶ κιθαριστικοῦ, ὥσπερ ὁ κιθαριστικὸς τοῦ δικαίου εἰς κρουμάτων;	“Then in what kind of partnership is the just man a better partner than the builder or the lyre player, the way the lyre player is better than the just man at striking notes?”
	εἰς ἀργυρίου, ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ.	“In money matters, I think.”
	πλήν γ’ ἴσως, ὦ Πολέμαρχε, πρὸς τὸ χρῆσθαι ἀργυρίῳ, ὅταν δέῃ ἀργυρίου κοινῇ πρίασθαι ἢ ἀποδόσθαι ἵππον· τότε 333c δέ, ὡς ἐγὼ οἶμαι, ὁ ἱππικός. ἦ γάρ;	“Except perhaps, Polemarchus, when it comes to using money—when you and a partner need to buy or sell a horse with it. Then, 333c I think, it’s the horseman. Isn’t it?”
	φαίνεται.	“Apparently.”
	καὶ μὴν ὅταν γε πλοῖον, ὁ ναυπηγὸς ἢ ὁ κυβερνήτης;	“And when it’s a boat, the shipbuilder or the captain?”
	ἔοικεν.	“It seems so.”
	ὅταν οὖν τί δέῃ ἀργυρίῳ ἢ χρυσίῳ κοινῇ χρῆσθαι, ὁ δίκαιος χρησιμώτερος τῶν ἄλλων;	“Then when silver or gold has to be used jointly, when is the just man more useful than the others?”
333c	ὅταν παρακαταθέσθαι καὶ σῶν εἶναι, ὦ Σώκρατες.	“When it’s to be deposited and kept safe, Socrates.”
	οὐκοῦν λέγεις ὅταν μηδὲν δέῃ αὐτῷ χρῆσθαι ἀλλὰ κεῖσθαι;	“You mean when there’s no need to use it, just to let it lie?”
	πάνυ γε.	“Exactly.”
	ὅταν ἄρα ἄχρηστον ᾖ ἀργύριον, τότε χρήσιμος ἐπ’ αὐτῷ 333d ἡ δικαιοσύνη;	“So when money is useless, that’s when justice is useful 333d for it?”
	κινδυνεύει.	“It may be.”
	καὶ ὅταν δὴ δρέπανον δέῃ φυλάττειν, ἡ δικαιοσύνη χρήσιμος καὶ κοινῇ καὶ ἰδίᾳ· ὅταν δὲ χρῆσθαι, ἡ ἀμπελουργική;	“And when a pruning knife has to be kept safe, justice is useful, both in public and in private life; but when it has to be used, the vinedresser’s craft is?”
	φαίνεται.	“Apparently.”
	φήσεις δὲ καὶ ἀσπίδα καὶ λύραν ὅταν δέῃ φυλάττειν καὶ μηδὲν χρῆσθαι, χρήσιμον εἶναι τὴν δικαιοσύνην, ὅταν δὲ χρῆσθαι, τὴν ὁπλιτικὴν καὶ τὴν μουσικήν;	“And you’ll say that when a shield or a lyre has to be kept safe and not used at all, justice is useful, but when they have to be used, it’s the soldier’s craft and the musician’s?”
	ἀνάγκη.	“Necessarily.”
333d	καὶ περὶ τἆλλα δὴ πάντα ἡ δικαιοσύνη ἑκάστου ἐν μὲν χρήσει ἄχρηστος, ἐν δὲ ἀχρηστίᾳ χρήσιμος;	“And so with everything else: justice is useless when each thing is in use, and useful when it isn’t?”
	κινδυνεύει. 333e	“It may be.” 333e
	οὐκ ἂν οὖν, ὦ φίλε, πάνυ γέ τι σπουδαῖον εἴη ἡ δικαιοσύνη, εἰ πρὸς τὰ ἄχρηστα χρήσιμον ὂν τυγχάνει. τόδε δὲ σκεψώμεθα. ἆρ’ οὐχ ὁ πατάξαι δεινότατος ἐν μάχῃ εἴτε πυκτικῇ εἴτε τινὶ καὶ ἄλλῃ, οὗτος καὶ φυλάξασθαι;	“Then justice can’t be anything very important, my friend, if it’s only useful for things that aren’t being used. But let’s look at this. Isn’t the man most skilled at landing a blow in a fight, whether
	πάνυ γε.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἆρ' οὖν καὶ νόσον ὅστις δεινὸς φυλάξασθαι, καὶ λαθεῖν οὗτος δεινότατος ἐμποιήσας;	boxing or any other kind, also the most skilled at guarding against one?"
	ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ.	"Certainly."
		"And whoever is skilled at guarding against disease is also the most skilled at secretly producing it?"
		"I think so."
334a	ἀλλὰ μὴν στρατοπέδου γε ὁ αὐτὸς φύλαξ ἀγαθός, ὅσπερ καὶ τὰ τῶν πολεμίων κλέψαι καὶ βουλεύματα καὶ τὰς ἄλλας πράξεις;	"And the man who is a good guardian of an army camp is the same one who is good at stealing the enemy's plans and their other operations?"
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
	ὅτου τις ἄρα δεινὸς φύλαξ, τούτου καὶ φὼρ δεινός.	"So whatever someone is a skilled guardian of, he's also a skilled thief of."
	ἔοικεν.	"It seems so."
	εἰ ἄρα ὁ δίκαιος ἀργύριον δεινὸς φυλάττειν, καὶ κλέπτειν δεινός.	"Then if the just man is skilled at guarding money, he's also skilled at stealing it."
	ὡς γοῦν ὁ λόγος, ἔφη, σημαίνει.	"That's where the argument points, anyway," he said.
	κλέπτης ἄρα τις ὁ δίκαιος, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἀναπέφανται, καὶ κινδυνεύεις παρ' Ὁμήρου μεμαθηκέναι αὐτό· καὶ γὰρ ἐκεῖνος 334b τὸν τοῦ Ὀδυσσέως πρὸς μητρὸς πάππον Αὐτόλυκον ἀγαπᾷ τε καί φησιν αὐτὸν πάντας ἀνθρώπους κεκάσθαι κλεπτοσύνῃ θ' ὅρκῳ τε . ἔοικεν οὖν ἡ δικαιοσύνη καὶ κατὰ σὲ καὶ καθ' Ὅμηρον καὶ κατὰ Σιμωνίδην κλεπτική τις εἶναι, ἐπ' ὠφελίᾳ μέντοι τῶν φίλων καὶ ἐπὶ βλάβῃ τῶν ἐχθρῶν. οὐχ οὕτως ἔλεγες;	"So the just man has turned out to be a kind of thief, it seems. And you probably learned that from Homer. He admires 334b Autolycus, Odysseus' grandfather on his mother's side, and says he 'outdid all men in thieving and in oaths.' So according to you, and Homer, and Simonides, justice seems to be a kind of art of stealing—but for the benefit of friends and the harm of enemies. Isn't that what you meant?"[7]
334b	οὐ μὰ τὸν Δί', ἔφη, ἀλλ' οὐκέτι οἶδα ἔγωγε ὅτι ἔλεγον· τοῦτο μέντοι ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ ἔτι, ὠφελεῖν μὲν τοὺς φίλους ἡ δικαιοσύνη, βλάπτειν δὲ τοὺς ἐχθρούς. 334c	"No, by Zeus," he said. "I don't know anymore what I meant. But this much I still believe: justice is helping friends and harming enemies." 334c
	φίλους δὲ λέγεις εἶναι πότερον τοὺς δοκοῦντας ἑκάστῳ χρηστοὺς εἶναι, ἢ τοὺς ὄντας, κἂν μὴ δοκῶσι, καὶ ἐχθροὺς ὡσαύτως;	"By friends, do you mean those who seem good to a given person, or those who really are good, even if they don't seem so? And the same with enemies?"
	εἰκὸς μέν, ἔφη, οὓς ἄν τις ἡγῆται χρηστοὺς φιλεῖν, οὓς δ' ἂν πονηροὺς μισεῖν.	"It's natural," he said, "to love those you think are good and hate those you think are bad."
	ἆρ' οὖν οὐχ ἁμαρτάνουσιν οἱ ἄνθρωποι περὶ τοῦτο, ὥστε δοκεῖν αὐτοῖς πολλοὺς μὲν χρηστοὺς εἶναι μὴ ὄντας, πολλοὺς δὲ τοὐναντίον;	"But don't people make mistakes about this, so that many seem good to them who aren't, and many the reverse?"
	ἁμαρτάνουσιν.	"They do."
334c	τούτοις ἄρα οἱ μὲν ἀγαθοὶ ἐχθροί, οἱ δὲ κακοὶ φίλοι;	"So for them the good are enemies and the bad are friends?"
	πάνυ γε.	

7 The line is from the *Odyssey* (19.395–96); skill "in oaths" means skill at swearing deceptive or equivocal oaths.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἀλλ’ ὅμως δίκαιον τότε τούτοις τοὺς μὲν πονηροὺς 334d ὠφελεῖν, τοὺς δὲ ἀγαθοὺς βλάπτειν;	“Certainly.”
	φαίνεται.	“And all the same, it’s just for them in that case to help the bad 334d and harm the good?”
	ἀλλὰ μὴν οἵ γε ἀγαθοὶ δίκαιοί τε καὶ οἷοι μὴ ἀδικεῖν;	“Apparently.”
	ἀληθῆ.	“And yet the good are just and the sort who don’t do wrong?”
	κατὰ δὴ τὸν σὸν λόγον τοὺς μηδὲν ἀδικοῦντας δίκαιον κακῶς ποιεῖν.	“True.”
	μηδαμῶς, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες· πονηρὸς γὰρ ἔοικεν εἶναι ὁ λόγος.	“Then by your account it’s just to harm those who do no wrong.”
	τοὺς ἀδίκους ἄρα, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, δίκαιον βλάπτειν, τοὺς δὲ δικαίους ὠφελεῖν;	“Not at all, Socrates,” he said. “That seems a bad account.”
	οὗτος ἐκείνου καλλίων φαίνεται.	“Then it’s just,” I said, “to harm the unjust and help the just?”
		“That seems finer than the other.”
334d	πολλοῖς ἄρα, ὦ Πολέμαρχε, συμβήσεται, ὅσοι διημαρτήκασιν 334e τῶν ἀνθρώπων, δίκαιον εἶναι τοὺς μὲν φίλους βλάπτειν—πονηροὶ γὰρ αὐτοῖς εἰσιν—τοὺς δ’ ἐχθροὺς ὠφελεῖν —ἀγαθοὶ γάρ· καὶ οὕτως ἐροῦμεν αὐτὸ τοὐναντίον ἢ τὸν Σιμωνίδην ἔφαμεν λέγειν.	“Then for many people, Polemarchus—all who have misjudged 334e others—it will turn out to be just to harm their friends, since to them those friends are bad, and to help their enemies, since they’re good. And so we’ll be saying the very opposite of what we said Simonides meant.”
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, οὕτω συμβαίνει. ἀλλὰ μεταθώμεθα· κινδυνεύομεν γὰρ οὐκ ὀρθῶς τὸν φίλον καὶ ἐχθρὸν θέσθαι.	“That’s certainly how it turns out,” he said. “But let’s make a change. It looks as though we didn’t define friend and enemy correctly.”
	πῶς θέμενοι, ὦ Πολέμαρχε;	“How did we define them, Polemarchus?”
	τὸν δοκοῦντα χρηστόν, τοῦτον φίλον εἶναι.	“That whoever seems good is a friend.”
	νῦν δὲ πῶς, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, μεταθώμεθα;	“And how should we change it now?” I said.
334e	τὸν δοκοῦντά τε, ἦ δ’ ὅς, καὶ τὸν ὄντα χρηστὸν φίλον· 335a τὸν δὲ δοκοῦντα μέν, ὄντα δὲ μή, δοκεῖν ἀλλὰ μὴ εἶναι φίλον. καὶ περὶ τοῦ ἐχθροῦ δὲ ἡ αὐτὴ θέσις.	“That a friend is someone who both seems good and is good,” he said. 335a “Someone who seems good but isn’t only seems to be a friend and isn’t one. And the same goes for an enemy.”
	φίλος μὲν δή, ὡς ἔοικε, τούτῳ τῷ λόγῳ ὁ ἀγαθὸς ἔσται, ἐχθρὸς δὲ ὁ πονηρός.	“Then by this account, it seems, the good man will be a friend and the bad man an enemy.”
	ναί.	“Yes.”
335a	κελεύεις δὴ ἡμᾶς προσθεῖναι τῷ δικαίῳ ἢ ὡς τὸ πρῶτον ἐλέγομεν, λέγοντες δίκαιον εἶναι τὸν μὲν φίλον εὖ ποιεῖν, τὸν δ’ ἐχθρὸν κακῶς· νῦν πρὸς τούτῳ ὧδε λέγειν, ὅτι ἔστιν δίκαιον τὸν μὲν φίλον ἀγαθὸν ὄντα εὖ ποιεῖν, τὸν δ’ ἐχθρὸν κακὸν ὄντα βλάπτειν; 335b	“So you want us to add to what we said about the just at first. We said it was just to do good to a friend and harm to an enemy; now you want us to add that it’s just to do good to a friend who is good, and to harm an enemy who is bad?” 335b
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, οὕτως ἄν μοι δοκεῖ καλῶς λέγεσθαι.	“Certainly,” he said. “Put that way, I think it would be well said.”
	ἔστιν ἄρα, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, δικαίου ἀνδρὸς βλάπτειν καὶ ὁντινοῦν ἀνθρώπων;	“Then is it the part of a just man,” I said, “to harm anyone at all?”
	καὶ πάνυ γε, ἔφη· τούς γε πονηρούς τε καὶ ἐχθροὺς δεῖ βλάπτειν.	“Of course,” he said. “He has to harm those who are bad and are his enemies.”
	βλαπτόμενοι δ’ ἵπποι βελτίους ἢ χείρους γίγνονται;	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	χείρους.	“When horses are harmed, do they become better or worse?”
		“Worse.”
335b	ἆρα εἰς τὴν τῶν κυνῶν ἀρετήν, ἢ εἰς τὴν τῶν ἵππων;	“With respect to the excellence of dogs, or of horses?”
	εἰς τὴν τῶν ἵππων.	“Of horses.”
	ἦ δ’ οὖν καὶ κύνες βλαπτόμενοι χείρους γίγνονται εἰς τὴν τῶν κυνῶν ἀλλ’ οὐκ εἰς τὴν τῶν ἵππων ἀρετήν;	“And dogs, when they’re harmed, become worse with respect to the excellence of dogs, not of horses?”
	ἀνάγκη. [335c]	“Necessarily.” [335c]
	ἀνθρώπους δέ, ὦ ἑταῖρε, μὴ οὕτω φῶμεν, βλαπτομένους εἰς τὴν ἀνθρωπείαν ἀρετὴν χείρους γίγνεσθαι;	“And shouldn’t we say the same of human beings, my friend—that when they’re harmed they become worse with respect to human excellence?”
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	“Certainly.”
	ἀλλ’ ἡ δικαιοσύνη οὐκ ἀνθρωπεία ἀρετή;	“But isn’t justice human excellence?”
	καὶ τοῦτ’ ἀνάγκη.	“That’s necessary too.”
	καὶ τοὺς βλαπτομένους ἄρα, ὦ φίλε, τῶν ἀνθρώπων ἀνάγκη ἀδικωτέρους γίγνεσθαι.	“Then, my friend, people who are harmed necessarily become more unjust.”
	ἔοικεν.	“It seems so.”
335c	ἦ δ’ οὖν τῇ μουσικῇ οἱ μουσικοὶ ἀμούσους δύνανται ποιεῖν;	“Now can musicians, by music, make people unmusical?”
	ἀδύνατον.	“Impossible.”
	ἀλλὰ τῇ ἱππικῇ οἱ ἱππικοὶ ἀφίππους;	“Or horsemen, by horsemanship, make people bad at riding?”
	οὐκ ἔστιν.	“They can’t.”
	ἀλλὰ τῇ δικαιοσύνῃ δὴ οἱ δίκαιοι ἀδίκους; ἢ καὶ [335d] συλλήβδην ἀρετῇ οἱ ἀγαθοὶ κακούς;	“Then can just people, by justice, make people unjust? Or, [335d] to sum up, can good people, by excellence, make people bad?”
	ἀλλὰ ἀδύνατον.	“No, that’s impossible.”
	οὐ γὰρ θερμότητος οἶμαι ἔργον ψύχειν ἀλλὰ τοῦ ἐναντίου.	“It isn’t the work of heat, I suppose, to cool things, but of its opposite.”
	ναί.	“Yes.”
	οὐδὲ ξηρότητος ὑγραίνειν ἀλλὰ τοῦ ἐναντίου.	“Nor the work of dryness to make things wet, but of its opposite.”
	πάνυ γε.	“Certainly.”
	οὐδὲ δὴ τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ βλάπτειν ἀλλὰ τοῦ ἐναντίου.	“Nor, then, the work of the good to harm, but of its opposite.”
	φαίνεται.	“Apparently.”
	ὁ δέ γε δίκαιος ἀγαθός;	“And the just man is good?”
	πάνυ γε.	“Certainly.”
335d	οὐκ ἄρα τοῦ δικαίου βλάπτειν ἔργον, ὦ Πολέμαρχε, οὔτε φίλον οὔτ’ ἄλλον οὐδένα, ἀλλὰ τοῦ ἐναντίου, τοῦ ἀδίκου.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	παντάπασί μοι δοκεῖς ἀληθῆ λέγειν, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες. 335e	"Then it isn't the work of the just man to harm, Polemarchus, whether a friend or anyone else, but of his opposite, the unjust man."
	εἰ ἄρα τὰ ὀφειλόμενα ἑκάστῳ ἀποδιδόναι φησίν τις δίκαιον εἶναι, τοῦτο δὲ δὴ νοεῖ αὐτῷ τοῖς μὲν ἐχθροῖς βλάβην ὀφείλεσθαι παρὰ τοῦ δικαίου ἀνδρός, τοῖς δὲ φίλοις ὠφελίαν, οὐκ ἦν σοφὸς ὁ ταῦτα εἰπών. οὐ γὰρ ἀληθῆ ἔλεγεν· οὐδαμοῦ γὰρ δίκαιον οὐδένα ἡμῖν ἐφάνη ὂν βλάπτειν.	"I think what you say is entirely true, Socrates," he said. 335e
	συγχωρῶ, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"So if anyone says that it's just to give each person what is owed, and by this he means that the just man owes harm to his enemies and help to his friends, whoever said it wasn't wise. What he said wasn't true: it has become clear to us that it's never just to harm anyone."
		"I agree," he said.
335e	μαχούμεθα ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, κοινῇ ἐγώ τε καὶ σύ, ἐάν τις αὐτὸ φῇ ἢ Σιμωνίδην ἢ Βίαντα ἢ Πιττακὸν εἰρηκέναι ἤ τιν' ἄλλον τῶν σοφῶν τε καὶ μακαρίων ἀνδρῶν.	"Then you and I will fight side by side," I said, "against anyone who claims that Simonides said it, or Bias or Pittacus or any other of the wise and blessed men."
	ἐγὼ γοῦν, ἔφη, ἕτοιμός εἰμι κοινωνεῖν τῆς μάχης.	"I, for one," he said, "am ready to join the fight."
	ἀλλ' οἶσθα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὗ μοι δοκεῖ εἶναι τὸ ῥῆμα, τὸ φάναι δίκαιον εἶναι τοὺς μὲν φίλους ὠφελεῖν, τοὺς δ' ἐχθροὺς βλάπτειν;	"But do you know whose saying I think it is," I said, "that it's just to help friends and harm enemies?"
	τίνος; ἔφη.	"Whose?" he said.
	οἶμαι αὐτὸ Περιάνδρου εἶναι ἢ Περδίκκου ἢ Ξέρξου ἢ Ἰσμηνίου τοῦ Θηβαίου ἤ τινος ἄλλου μέγα οἰομένου δύνασθαι πλουσίου ἀνδρός.	"I think it's a saying of Periander, or Perdiccas, or Xerxes, or Ismenias of Thebes, or some other rich man who thought he had great power."
	ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"That's very true," he said.[8]

THRASYMACHUS BURSTS IN

Thrasymachus angrily claims that justice is the advantage of the stronger, and Socrates challenges him.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
336a	**SOCRATES** εἶεν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· ἐπειδὴ δὲ οὐδὲ τοῦτο ἐφάνη ἡ δικαιοσύνη ὂν οὐδὲ τὸ δίκαιον, τί ἂν ἄλλο τις αὐτὸ φαίη εἶναι; 336b	**SOCRATES** "Very well," I said. "Since it has become clear that justice and the just aren't this either, what else could anyone say it is?" 336b
	καὶ ὁ Θρασύμαχος πολλάκις μὲν καὶ διαλεγομένων ἡμῶν μεταξὺ ὥρμα ἀντιλαμβάνεσθαι τοῦ λόγου, ἔπειτα ὑπὸ τῶν παρακαθημένων διεκωλύετο βουλομένων διακοῦσαι τὸν λόγον· ὡς δὲ διεπαυσάμεθα καὶ ἐγὼ ταῦτ' εἶπον, οὐκέτι ἡσυχίαν ἦγεν, ἀλλὰ συστρέψας ἑαυτὸν ὥσπερ θηρίον ἧκεν ἐφ' ἡμᾶς ὡς διαρπασόμενος.	Now Thrasymachus had several times, while we were talking, started to break in and take over the argument, but he'd been held back by the people sitting near him, who wanted to hear it through. When we paused and I said this, he couldn't keep quiet any longer. He gathered himself like a wild beast and sprang at us as if to tear us to pieces.
336b	καὶ ἐγώ τε καὶ ὁ Πολέμαρχος δείσαντες διεπτοήθημεν· ὁ δ' εἰς τὸ μέσον φθεγξάμενος, τίς, ἔφη, ὑμᾶς πάλαι φλυαρία 336c ἔχει, ὦ Σώκρατες; καὶ τί εὐηθίζεσθε πρὸς ἀλλήλους	Polemarchus and I were terrified and flustered. He shouted out into our midst: "What's this nonsense that has had hold of you two 336c all this time, So-

8 Bias and Pittacus were counted among the Seven Sages of early Greece. Periander (tyrant of Corinth), Perdiccas (king of Macedon), Xerxes (king of Persia) and Ismenias (a wealthy Theban politician) stand for powerful men.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ὑποκατακλινόμενοι ὑμῖν αὐτοῖς; ἀλλ' εἴπερ ὡς ἀληθῶς βούλει εἰδέναι τὸ δίκαιον ὅτι ἔστι, μὴ μόνον ἐρώτα μηδὲ φιλοτιμοῦ ἐλέγχων ἐπειδάν τίς τι ἀποκρίνηται, ἐγνωκὼς τοῦτο, ὅτι ῥᾷον ἐρωτᾶν ἢ ἀποκρίνεσθαι, ἀλλὰ καὶ αὐτὸς ἀπόκριναι καὶ εἰπὲ τί φῂς εἶναι τὸ δίκαιον. καὶ ὅπως μοι μὴ ἐρεῖς ὅτι τὸ [336d] δέον ἐστὶν μηδ' ὅτι τὸ ὠφέλιμον μηδ' ὅτι τὸ λυσιτελοῦν μηδ' ὅτι τὸ κερδαλέον μηδ' ὅτι τὸ συμφέρον, ἀλλὰ σαφῶς μοι καὶ ἀκριβῶς λέγε ὅτι ἂν λέγῃς· ὡς ἐγὼ οὐκ ἀποδέξομαι ἐὰν ὕθλους τοιούτους λέγῃς.	crates? Why are you playing the simpleton with each other, bowing and deferring to one another? If you really want to know what the just is, don't just ask questions and show off by refuting whatever answer anyone gives—you know perfectly well that it's easier to ask than to answer. Give an answer yourself, and say what you claim the just is. And don't you dare tell me that it's [336d] what's needful, or what's beneficial, or profitable, or gainful, or advantageous. Tell me clearly and precisely whatever you mean. I won't accept it if you talk drivel like that."
336d	καὶ ἐγὼ ἀκούσας ἐξεπλάγην καὶ προσβλέπων αὐτὸν ἐφοβούμην, καί μοι δοκῶ, εἰ μὴ πρότερος ἑωράκη αὐτὸν ἢ ἐκεῖνος ἐμέ, ἄφωνος ἂν γενέσθαι. νῦν δὲ ἡνίκα ὑπὸ τοῦ λόγου ἤρχετο ἐξαγριαίνεσθαι, προσέβλεψα αὐτὸν πρότερος, [336e] ὥστε αὐτῷ οἷός τ' ἐγενόμην ἀποκρίνασθαι, καὶ εἶπον ὑποτρέμων· ὦ Θρασύμαχε, μὴ χαλεπὸς ἡμῖν ἴσθι· εἰ γάρ τι ἐξαμαρτάνομεν ἐν τῇ τῶν λόγων σκέψει ἐγώ τε καὶ ὅδε, εὖ ἴσθι ὅτι ἄκοντες ἁμαρτάνομεν. μὴ γὰρ δὴ οἴου, εἰ μὲν χρυσίον ἐζητοῦμεν, οὐκ ἄν ποτε ἡμᾶς ἑκόντας εἶναι ὑποκατακλίνεσθαι ἀλλήλοις ἐν τῇ ζητήσει καὶ διαφθείρειν τὴν εὕρεσιν αὐτοῦ, δικαιοσύνην δὲ ζητοῦντας, πρᾶγμα πολλῶν χρυσίων τιμιώτερον, ἔπειθ' οὕτως ἀνοήτως ὑπείκειν ἀλλήλοις καὶ οὐ σπουδάζειν ὅτι μάλιστα φανῆναι αὐτό.	When I heard this I was stunned, and I looked at him in fear. I think that if I hadn't seen him before he saw me, I'd have been struck dumb. As it was, when the argument began to drive him wild, I had looked at him first, [336e] so I was able to answer him, and I said, trembling a little, "Thrasymachus, don't be hard on us. If he and I are making some mistake in examining the arguments, you can be sure we're making it unwillingly. If we were looking for gold, you surely don't think we'd ever willingly defer to each other in the search and ruin our chances of finding it. So don't think that when we're looking for justice, a thing more precious than a great deal of gold, we'd then give way to each other so mindlessly, and not make every effort to bring it to light.[9]
336e	οἷον γε σύ, ὦ φίλε. ἀλλ' οἶμαι οὐ δυνάμεθα· ἐλεεῖσθαι οὖν ἡμᾶς πολὺ [337a] μᾶλλον εἰκός ἐστίν που ὑπὸ ὑμῶν τῶν δεινῶν ἢ χαλεπαίνεσθαι.	"No, my friend, you should believe we're in earnest. But I don't think we're able. So it's surely far [337a] more fitting for clever people like you to pity us than to be harsh with us."
	καὶ ὃς ἀκούσας ἀνεκάγχασέ τε μάλα σαρδάνιον καὶ εἶπεν· ὦ Ἡράκλεις, ἔφη, αὖτη 'κείνη ἡ εἰωθυῖα εἰρωνεία Σωκράτους, καὶ ταῦτ' ἐγὼ ᾔδη τε καὶ τούτοις προύλεγον, ὅτι σὺ ἀποκρίνασθαι μὲν οὐκ ἐθελήσοις, εἰρωνεύσοιο δὲ καὶ πάντα μᾶλλον ποιήσοις ἢ ἀποκρινοῖο, εἴ τίς τί σε ἐρωτᾷ.	When he heard this he burst out in a loud, sardonic laugh and said, "Heracles! Here it is, Socrates' usual irony. I knew it, and I told these people beforehand that you'd refuse to answer, that you'd play the innocent and do anything rather than answer if someone asked you something."
337a	σοφὸς γὰρ εἶ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Θρασύμαχε· εὖ οὖν ᾔδησθα ὅτι εἴ τινα ἔροιο ὁπόσα ἐστὶν τὰ δώδεκα, καὶ ἐρόμενος προείποις [337b] αὐτῷ— "ὅπως μοι, ὦ ἄνθρωπε, μὴ ἐρεῖς ὅτι ἔστιν τὰ δώδεκα δὶς ἓξ μηδ' ὅτι τρὶς τέτταρα μηδ' ὅτι ἑξάκις δύο μηδ' ὅτι τετράκις τρία· ὡς οὐκ ἀποδέξομαί σου ἐὰν τοιαῦτα φλυαρῇς" —δῆλον οἶμαί σοι ἦν ὅτι οὐδεὶς ἀποκρινοῖτο τῷ οὕτως πυνθανομένῳ. ἀλλ' εἴ σοι εἶπεν· "ὦ Θρασύμαχε, πῶς λέγεις; μὴ ἀποκρίνωμαι ὧν προεῖπες	"That's because you're wise, Thrasymachus," I said. "So you knew very well that if you asked someone how much twelve is, and when you asked him you warned him in advance, [337b] 'And don't you tell me, man, that twelve is two times six, or three times four, or six times two, or four times three, because I won't accept that kind of

9 A folk belief held that anyone seen by a wolf before seeing it would lose his voice.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	μηδέν; πότερον, ὦ θαυμάσιε, μηδ' εἰ τούτων τι τυγχάνει ὄν, ἀλλ' ἕτερον εἴπω τι [337c] τοῦ ἀληθοῦς; ἢ πῶς λέγεις;" τί ἂν αὐτῷ εἶπες πρὸς ταῦτα;	drivel from you'—it was clear to you, I think, that nobody would answer a person who asked that way. But suppose he said to you, 'Thrasymachus, what do you mean? Am I not to give any of the answers you ruled out? Even, you amazing man, if one of them happens to be right? Am I to say something other [337c] than the truth? Or what do you mean?' What would you say to him?"
337c	εἶεν, ἔφη· ὡς δὴ ὅμοιον τοῦτο ἐκείνῳ. οὐδέν γε κωλύει, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· εἰ δ' οὖν καὶ μὴ ἔστιν ὅμοιον, φαίνεται δὲ τῷ ἐρωτηθέντι τοιοῦτον, ἧττόν τι αὐτὸν οἴει ἀποκρινεῖσθαι τὸ φαινόμενον ἑαυτῷ, ἐάντε ἡμεῖς ἀπαγορεύωμεν ἐάντε μή; ἄλλο τι οὖν, ἔφη, καὶ σὺ οὕτω ποιήσεις· ὧν ἐγὼ ἀπεῖπον, τούτων τι ἀποκρινῇ; οὐκ ἂν θαυμάσαιμι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· εἴ μοι σκεψαμένῳ οὕτω δόξειεν. [337d] τί οὖν, ἔφη, ἂν ἐγὼ δείξω ἑτέραν ἀπόκρισιν παρὰ πάσας ταύτας περὶ δικαιοσύνης, βελτίω τούτων; τί ἀξιοῖς παθεῖν;	"Oh, of course," he said. "As if this case were like that one!" "Nothing stops it from being," I said. "But even if it isn't alike, and yet it seems so to the person being asked, do you think he's any less likely to answer as it seems to him, whether we forbid him or not?" "So that's what you're going to do too?" he said. "You're going to give one of the answers I ruled out?" "I wouldn't be surprised," I said, "if that's how it seemed to me once I'd looked into it." [337d] "Well then," he said, "what if I show you a different answer about justice, besides all these, and better than them? What penalty do you think you deserve?"[10]
337d	τί ἄλλο, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἢ ὅπερ προσήκει πάσχειν τῷ μὴ εἰδότι; προσήκει δέ που μαθεῖν παρὰ τοῦ εἰδότος· καὶ ἐγὼ οὖν τοῦτο ἀξιῶ παθεῖν. ἡδὺς γὰρ εἶ, ἔφη· ἀλλὰ πρὸς τῷ μαθεῖν καὶ ἀπότεισον ἀργύριον. οὐκοῦν ἐπειδάν μοι γένηται, εἶπον. ἀλλ' ἔστιν, ἔφη ὁ Γλαύκων. ἀλλ' ἕνεκα ἀργυρίου, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, λέγε· πάντες γὰρ ἡμεῖς Σωκράτει εἰσοίσομεν. [337e] πάνυ γε οἶμαι, ἦ δ' ὅς· ἵνα Σωκράτης τὸ εἰωθὸς διαπράξηται· αὐτὸς μὲν μὴ ἀποκρίνηται, ἄλλου δ' ἀποκρινομένου λαμβάνῃ λόγον καὶ ἐλέγχῃ.	"What else," I said, "but the penalty that's fitting for someone who doesn't know? And what's fitting, I suppose, is to learn from someone who does. So that's the penalty I propose for myself." "You're delightful," he said. "But on top of learning, you'll pay a fine in cash too." "I will, once I have some," I said. "But he has it," said Glaucon. "If it's a question of money, Thrasymachus, speak. We'll all chip in for Socrates." [337e] "Oh yes, of course," he said, "so that Socrates can do what he always does: not answer himself, but take up someone else's answer and refute it."
337e	πῶς γὰρ ἄν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὦ βέλτιστε, τὶς ἀποκρίναιτο πρῶτον μὲν μὴ εἰδὼς μηδὲ φάσκων εἰδέναι, ἔπειτα, εἴ τι καὶ οἴεται, περὶ τούτων ἀπειρημένον αὐτῷ εἴη ὅπως μηδὲν ἐρεῖ ὧν ἡγεῖται ὑπ' ἀνδρὸς οὐ φαύλου; ἀλλὰ σὲ δὴ μᾶλλον [338a] εἰκὸς λέγειν· σὺ γὰρ δὴ φῂς εἰδέναι καὶ ἔχειν εἰπεῖν. μὴ οὖν ἄλλως ποίει, ἀλλὰ ἐμοί τε χαρίζου	"But my excellent friend," I said, "how could anyone answer when, first, he doesn't know and doesn't claim to know, and second, even if he does have some view about these things, he's been forbidden by no ordinary man to say any of what he believes? No, it's more [338a] reasonable for you to speak, since you're the one who claims to know

10 Thrasymachus mimics the Athenian court procedure in which a convicted defendant proposed the penalty he thought he deserved.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἀποκρινόμενος καὶ μὴ φθονήσῃς καὶ Γλαύκωνα τόνδε διδάξαι καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους.	and to have something to say. So don't refuse. Do me a favor and answer, and don't begrudge your teaching to Glaucon here and the others."
338a	εἰπόντος δέ μου ταῦτα, ὅ τε Γλαύκων καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι ἐδέοντο αὐτοῦ μὴ ἄλλως ποιεῖν. καὶ ὁ Θρασύμαχος φανερὸς μὲν ἦν ἐπιθυμῶν εἰπεῖν ἵν' εὐδοκιμήσειεν, ἡγούμενος ἔχειν ἀπόκρισιν παγκάλην· προσεποιεῖτο δὲ φιλονικεῖν πρὸς τὸ ἐμὲ εἶναι τὸν ἀποκρινόμενον. τελευτῶν δὲ συνεχώρησεν, [338b] κἄπειτα, αὕτη δή, ἔφη, ἡ Σωκράτους σοφία· αὐτὸν μὲν μὴ ἐθέλειν διδάσκειν, παρὰ δὲ τῶν ἄλλων περιιόντα μανθάνειν καὶ τούτων μηδὲ χάριν ἀποδιδόναι.	When I'd said this, Glaucon and the others begged him not to refuse. It was obvious that Thrasymachus wanted to speak so as to win a good name, since he thought he had a splendid answer; but he pretended to insist that I be the one to answer. In the end he gave in, [338b] and then he said, "So this is Socrates' wisdom: he refuses to teach anything himself, but goes around learning from others, and doesn't even thank them for it."
338b	ὅτι μέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μανθάνω παρὰ τῶν ἄλλων, ἀληθῆ εἶπες, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, ὅτι δὲ οὔ με φῂς χάριν ἐκτίνειν, ψεύδῃ· ἐκτίνω γὰρ ὅσην δύναμαι. δύναμαι δὲ ἐπαινεῖν μόνον· χρήματα γὰρ οὐκ ἔχω. ὡς δὲ προθύμως τοῦτο δρῶ, ἐάν τίς μοι δοκῇ εὖ λέγειν, εὖ εἴσῃ αὐτίκα δὴ μάλα, ἐπειδὰν ἀποκρίνῃ· οἶμαι γάρ σε εὖ ἐρεῖν. [338c] ἄκουε δή, ἦ δ' ὅς. φημὶ γὰρ ἐγὼ εἶναι τὸ δίκαιον οὐκ ἄλλο τι ἢ τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος συμφέρον. ἀλλὰ τί οὐκ ἐπαινεῖς; ἀλλ' οὐκ ἐθελήσεις.	"That I learn from others," I said, "is true, Thrasymachus. But when you say I don't pay back the favor, that's false: I pay back as much as I can. And all I can do is praise, since I don't have any money. How eagerly I do that when someone seems to me to speak well, you'll find out very soon, once you've answered—because I think you'll speak well." [338c] "Listen, then," he said. "I say that what is just is nothing other than the advantage of the stronger. Well, why don't you praise me? No, you won't want to."
338c	ἐὰν μάθω γε πρῶτον, ἔφην, τί λέγεις· νῦν γὰρ οὔπω οἶδα. τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος φῂς συμφέρον δίκαιον εἶναι. καὶ τοῦτο, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, τί ποτε λέγεις; οὐ γάρ που τό γε τοιόνδε φῄς· εἰ Πουλυδάμας ἡμῶν κρείττων ὁ παγκρατιαστὴς καὶ αὐτῷ συμφέρει τὰ βόεια κρέα πρὸς τὸ σῶμα, τοῦτο τὸ [338d] σιτίον εἶναι καὶ ἡμῖν τοῖς ἧττοσιν ἐκείνου συμφέρον ἅμα καὶ δίκαιον. βδελυρὸς γὰρ εἶ, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, καὶ ταύτῃ ὑπολαμβάνεις ἢ ἂν κακουργήσαις μάλιστα τὸν λόγον. οὐδαμῶς, ὦ ἄριστε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· ἀλλὰ σαφέστερον εἰπὲ τί λέγεις.	"I will, once I understand what you mean," I said. "Right now I don't yet know. You say that the advantage of the stronger is just. What on earth do you mean by that, Thrasymachus? Surely you don't mean something like this: if Polydamas the pancratiast is stronger than we are, and beef is good for his body, then this [338d] food is also advantageous, and just as well, for us who are weaker than he is." "You're disgusting, Socrates," he said. "You take up the argument in whatever way lets you do it the most damage." "Not at all, my excellent friend," I said. "Just tell me more clearly what you mean."[11]
338d	εἶτ' οὐκ οἶσθ', ἔφη, ὅτι τῶν πόλεων αἱ μὲν τυραννοῦνται, αἱ δὲ δημοκρατοῦνται, αἱ δὲ ἀριστοκρατοῦνται; πῶς γὰρ οὔ; οὐκοῦν τοῦτο κρατεῖ ἐν ἑκάστῃ πόλει, τὸ ἄρχον; πάνυ γε. [338e]	"Well, don't you know," he said, "that some cities are ruled by tyrants, some are democracies, and some are aristocracies?" "Of course."

11 Polydamas of Scotussa was a celebrated champion who won the pancration, a brutal combination of boxing and wrestling, at the Olympic Games of 408 BC.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τίθεται δέ γε τοὺς νόμους ἑκάστη ἡ ἀρχὴ πρὸς τὸ αὑτῇ συμφέρον, δημοκρατία μὲν δημοκρατικούς, τυραννὶς δὲ τυραννικούς, καὶ αἱ ἄλλαι οὕτως· θέμεναι δὲ ἀπέφηναν τοῦτο δίκαιον τοῖς ἀρχομένοις εἶναι, τὸ σφίσι συμφέρον, καὶ τὸν τούτου ἐκβαίνοντα κολάζουσιν ὡς παρανομοῦντά τε καὶ ἀδικοῦντα.	"And in each city it's the ruling element that holds power?" "Certainly." 338e "And each ruling body makes laws for its own advantage: a democracy makes democratic laws, a tyranny tyrannical ones, and the others the same way. Having made them, they declare that this—what's to their own advantage—is just for their subjects, and they punish anyone who departs from it as a lawbreaker and a wrongdoer.
338e	τοῦτ' οὖν ἐστιν, ὦ βέλτιστε, ὃ λέγω ἐν ἁπάσαις 339a ταῖς πόλεσιν ταὐτὸν εἶναι δίκαιον, τὸ τῆς καθεστηκυίας ἀρχῆς συμφέρον· αὕτη δέ που κρατεῖ, ὥστε συμβαίνει τῷ ὀρθῶς λογιζομένῳ πανταχοῦ εἶναι τὸ αὐτὸ δίκαιον, τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος συμφέρον. νῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἔμαθον ὃ λέγεις· εἰ δὲ ἀληθὲς ἢ μή, πειράσομαι μαθεῖν. τὸ συμφέρον μὲν οὖν, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, καὶ σὺ ἀπεκρίνω δίκαιον εἶναι—καίτοι ἔμοιγε ἀπηγόρευες ὅπως μὴ τοῦτο ἀποκρινοίμην—πρόσεστιν δὲ δὴ αὐτόθι τὸ "τοῦ κρείττονος." 339b σμικρά γε ἴσως, ἔφη, προσθήκη.	"This, then, my excellent friend, is what I mean: in all 339a cities the same thing is just, the advantage of the established rule. And that rule, I take it, holds power, so that anyone who reasons correctly concludes that everywhere the just is the same thing, the advantage of the stronger." "Now I understand what you mean," I said. "Whether it's true or not, I'll try to find out. So you too, Thrasymachus, have answered that the just is the advantageous—though you forbade me to give that answer. But you've added 'of the stronger' to it." 339b "A small addition, perhaps," he said.
339b	οὔπω δῆλον οὐδ' εἰ μεγάλη· ἀλλ' ὅτι μὲν τοῦτο σκεπτέον εἰ ἀληθῆ λέγεις, δῆλον. ἐπειδὴ γὰρ συμφέρον γέ τι εἶναι καὶ ἐγὼ ὁμολογῶ τὸ δίκαιον, σὺ δὲ προστιθεῖς καὶ αὐτὸ φῂς εἶναι τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος, ἐγὼ δὲ ἀγνοῶ, σκεπτέον δή. σκόπει, ἔφη. ταῦτ' ἔσται, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. καί μοι εἰπέ· οὐ καὶ πείθεσθαι μέντοι τοῖς ἄρχουσιν δίκαιον φῂς εἶναι; ἔγωγε. 339c πότερον δὲ ἀναμάρτητοί εἰσιν οἱ ἄρχοντες ἐν ταῖς πόλεσιν ἑκάσταις ἢ οἷοί τι καὶ ἁμαρτεῖν; πάντως που, ἔφη, οἷοί τι καὶ ἁμαρτεῖν.	"It isn't clear yet whether it's even a big one. But it is clear that we have to examine whether what you say is true. I too agree that the just is something advantageous; but you add to it and say it's the advantage of the stronger, and that I don't know. So we have to examine it." "Examine away," he said. "I will," I said. "Tell me: you also say, don't you, that obeying the rulers is just?" "I do." 339c "And are the rulers in each city infallible, or are they capable of making mistakes too?" "Of course," he said, "they're capable of making mistakes too."
339c	οὐκοῦν ἐπιχειροῦντες νόμους τιθέναι τοὺς μὲν ὀρθῶς τιθέασιν, τοὺς δέ τινας οὐκ ὀρθῶς; οἶμαι ἔγωγε. τὸ δὲ ὀρθῶς ἆρα τὸ τὰ συμφέροντά ἐστι τίθεσθαι ἑαυτοῖς, τὸ δὲ μὴ ὀρθῶς ἀσύμφορα; ἢ πῶς λέγεις; οὕτως. ἃ δ' ἂν θῶνται ποιητέον τοῖς ἀρχομένοις, καὶ τοῦτό ἐστι τὸ δίκαιον;	"So when they set about making laws, some they make correctly, but some incorrectly?" "I suppose so." "And making them correctly means making them to their own advantage, and incorrectly to their disadvantage? Or how would you put it?" "That way."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ; 339d	"And whatever they lay down, the subjects must do, and that is what's just?"
	οὐ μόνον ἄρα δίκαιόν ἐστιν κατὰ τὸν σὸν λόγον τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος συμφέρον ποιεῖν ἀλλὰ καὶ τοὐναντίον, τὸ μὴ συμφέρον.	"Of course." 339d
	τί λέγεις σύ; ἔφη.	"Then according to your argument it's just to do not only what's to the advantage of the stronger but also the opposite, what isn't to his advantage."
		"What are you saying?" he said.
339d	ἃ σὺ λέγεις, ἔμοιγε δοκῶ· σκοπῶμεν δὲ βέλτιον. οὐχ ὡμολόγηται τοὺς ἄρχοντας τοῖς ἀρχομένοις προστάττοντας ποιεῖν ἅττα ἐνίοτε διαμαρτάνειν τοῦ ἑαυτοῖς βελτίστου, ἃ δ' ἂν προστάττωσιν οἱ ἄρχοντες δίκαιον εἶναι τοῖς ἀρχομένοις ποιεῖν; ταῦτ' οὐχ ὡμολόγηται;	"What you're saying, I think. But let's look at it more carefully. Haven't we agreed that when rulers order their subjects to do something they sometimes miss what's best for themselves, and that whatever the rulers order, it's just for the subjects to do? Haven't we agreed on that?"
	οἶμαι ἔγωγε, ἔφη. 339e	"I suppose so," he said. 339e
339e	οἷον τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ τὸ ἀσύμφορα ποιεῖν τοῖς ἄρχουσί τε καὶ κρείττοσι δίκαιον εἶναι ὡμολογῆσθαί σοι, ὅταν οἱ μὲν ἄρχοντες ἄκοντες κακὰ αὑτοῖς προστάττωσιν, τοῖς δὲ δίκαιον εἶναι φῇς ταῦτα ποιεῖν ἃ ἐκεῖνοι προσέταξαν —ἆρα τότε, ὦ σοφώτατε Θρασύμαχε, οὐκ ἀναγκαῖον συμβαίνειν αὐτὸ οὑτωσί, δίκαιον εἶναι ποιεῖν τοὐναντίον ἢ ὃ σὺ λέγεις; τὸ γὰρ τοῦ κρείττονος ἀσύμφορον δήπου προστάττεται τοῖς ἥττοσιν ποιεῖν.	"Then you must realize," I said, "that you've also agreed it's just to do what's to the disadvantage of the rulers, the stronger, whenever the rulers unintentionally order what's bad for themselves, since you say it's just for the others to do whatever the rulers have ordered. In that case, my most wise Thrasymachus, doesn't it necessarily follow that it's just to do the opposite of what you say? For the weaker are then ordered, surely, to do what's to the disadvantage of the stronger."
	ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, ὁ Πολέμαρχος, σαφέστατά γε.	"Yes, by Zeus, Socrates," said Polemarchus, "that's perfectly clear."
	ἐὰν σύ γ', ἔφη, αὐτῷ μαρτυρήσῃς, ὁ Κλειτοφῶν ὑπολαβών.	"If you're his witness, anyway," Clitophon broke in.
340a	καὶ τί, ἔφη, δεῖται μάρτυρος; αὐτὸς γὰρ Θρασύμαχος ὁμολογεῖ τοὺς μὲν ἄρχοντας ἐνίοτε ἑαυτοῖς κακὰ προστάττειν, τοῖς δὲ δίκαιον εἶναι ταῦτα ποιεῖν.	"And what need is there of a witness?" he said. "Thrasymachus himself agrees that rulers sometimes order what's bad for themselves, and that it's just for the others to do it."
	τὸ γὰρ τὰ κελευόμενα ποιεῖν, ὦ Πολέμαρχε, ὑπὸ τῶν ἀρχόντων δίκαιον εἶναι ἔθετο Θρασύμαχος.	"Yes, Polemarchus, because what Thrasymachus laid down as just was doing what the rulers command."
	καὶ γὰρ τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος, ὦ Κλειτοφῶν, συμφέρον 340b δίκαιον εἶναι ἔθετο. ταῦτα δὲ ἀμφότερα θέμενος ὡμολόγησεν αὖ ἐνίοτε τοὺς κρείττους τὰ αὑτοῖς ἀσύμφορα κελεύειν τοὺς ἥττους τε καὶ ἀρχομένους ποιεῖν. ἐκ δὲ τούτων τῶν ὁμολογιῶν οὐδὲν μᾶλλον τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος συμφέρον δίκαιον ἂν εἴη ἢ τὸ μὴ συμφέρον.	"Yes, Clitophon, and he also laid down that the advantage of the stronger 340b is just. And having laid down both, he agreed in turn that the stronger sometimes order the weaker, their subjects, to do what's to the stronger's own disadvantage. From these agreements it follows that the advantage of the stronger would be no more just than what isn't to their advantage."
340b		"But," said Clitophon, "by the advantage of the stronger he meant what the stronger believes to be

GREEK

ENGLISH

ἀλλ', ἔφη ὁ Κλειτοφῶν, τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος συμφέρον ἔλεγεν ὃ ἡγοῖτο ὁ κρείττων αὑτῷ συμφέρειν· τοῦτο ποιητέον εἶναι τῷ ἥττονι, καὶ τὸ δίκαιον τοῦτο ἐτίθετο.

ἀλλ' οὐχ οὕτως, ἦ δ' ὃς ὁ Πολέμαρχος, ἐλέγετο. 340c

to his advantage. That's what the weaker must do, and that's what he laid down as just."

"But that's not what was said," said Polemarchus. 340c

οὐδέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Πολέμαρχε, διαφέρει, ἀλλ' εἰ νῦν οὕτω λέγει Θρασύμαχος, οὕτως αὐτοῦ ἀποδεχώμεθα. καί μοι εἰπέ, ὦ Θρασύμαχε· τοῦτο ἦν ὃ ἐβούλου λέγειν τὸ δίκαιον, τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος συμφέρον δοκοῦν εἶναι τῷ κρείττονι, ἐάντε συμφέρῃ ἐάντε μή; οὕτω σε φῶμεν λέγειν;

"It makes no difference, Polemarchus," I said. "If that's how Thrasymachus puts it now, let's accept it from him. Tell me, Thrasymachus: is this what you meant by the just—what seems to the stronger to be to the stronger's advantage, whether it actually is or not? Shall we say that's what you mean?"

340c ἥκιστά γε, ἔφη· ἀλλὰ κρείττω με οἴει καλεῖν τὸν ἐξαμαρτάνοντα ὅταν ἐξαμαρτάνῃ;

ἔγωγε, εἶπον, ᾤμην σε τοῦτο λέγειν ὅτε τοὺς ἄρχοντας ὡμολόγεις οὐκ ἀναμαρτήτους εἶναι ἀλλά τι καὶ ἐξαμαρτάνειν. 340d

"Not in the least," he said. "Do you think I call someone who makes a mistake 'stronger' at the very moment he's making it?"

"I did think," I said, "that that was what you meant, when you agreed that rulers aren't infallible but do make some mistakes." 340d

340d συκοφάντης γὰρ εἶ, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἐν τοῖς λόγοις· ἐπεὶ αὐτίκα ἰατρὸν καλεῖς σὺ τὸν ἐξαμαρτάνοντα περὶ τοὺς κάμνοντας κατ' αὐτὸ τοῦτο ὃ ἐξαμαρτάνει; ἢ λογιστικόν, ὃς ἂν ἐν λογισμῷ ἁμαρτάνῃ, τότε ὅταν ἁμαρτάνῃ, κατὰ ταύτην τὴν ἁμαρτίαν; ἀλλ' οἶμαι λέγομεν τῷ ῥήματι οὕτως, ὅτι ὁ ἰατρὸς ἐξήμαρτεν καὶ ὁ λογιστὴς ἐξήμαρτεν καὶ ὁ γραμματιστής· τὸ δ' οἶμαι ἕκαστος τούτων, καθ' ὅσον τοῦτ' ἔστιν 340e ὃ προσαγορεύομεν αὐτόν, οὐδέποτε ἁμαρτάνει· ὥστε κατὰ τὸν ἀκριβῆ λόγον, ἐπειδὴ καὶ σὺ ἀκριβολογῇ, οὐδεὶς τῶν δημιουργῶν ἁμαρτάνει. ἐπιλειπούσης γὰρ ἐπιστήμης ὁ ἁμαρτάνων ἁμαρτάνει, ἐν ᾧ οὐκ ἔστι δημιουργός· ὥστε δημιουργὸς ἢ σοφὸς ἢ ἄρχων οὐδεὶς ἁμαρτάνει τότε ὅταν ἄρχων ᾖ, ἀλλὰ πᾶς γ' ἂν εἴποι ὅτι ὁ ἰατρὸς ἥμαρτεν καὶ ὁ ἄρχων ἥμαρτεν.

"That's because you argue in bad faith, Socrates," he said, "like a malicious prosecutor. For instance, do you call someone who makes mistakes about the sick a doctor with respect to the very mistake he's making? Or someone who makes an error in calculation an accountant at the moment he makes it, with respect to that error? We talk that way, I think—we say the doctor made a mistake, and the accountant made a mistake, and the schoolteacher. But in fact, I think, each of these, insofar as he is what 340e we call him, never makes mistakes. So, speaking precisely—since you insist on precision—no craftsman ever makes a mistake. The one who errs errs when his knowledge fails him, and in that respect he isn't a craftsman. So no craftsman or wise man or ruler makes mistakes at the moment he's a ruler, even though everyone would say that the doctor made a mistake and the ruler made a mistake.

340e τοιοῦτον οὖν δή σοι καὶ ἐμὲ ὑπόλαβε νυνδὴ ἀποκρίνεσθαι· τὸ δὲ ἀκριβέστατον ἐκεῖνο τυγχάνει ὄν, τὸν ἄρχοντα, καθ' 341a ὅσον ἄρχων ἐστίν, μὴ ἁμαρτάνειν, μὴ ἁμαρτάνοντα δὲ τὸ αὑτῷ βέλτιστον τίθεσθαι, τοῦτο δὲ τῷ ἀρχομένῳ ποιητέον. ὥστε ὅπερ ἐξ ἀρχῆς ἔλεγον δίκαιον λέγω, τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος ποιεῖν συμφέρον.

εἶεν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Θρασύμαχε· δοκῶ σοι συκοφαντεῖν;

πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

οἴει γάρ με ἐξ ἐπιβουλῆς ἐν τοῖς λόγοις κακουργοῦντά σε ἐρέσθαι ὡς ἠρόμην;

"Take my answer just now in that sense too. But the most precise version of it is this: the ruler, insofar 341a as he is a ruler, makes no mistakes; and making no mistakes, he lays down what's best for himself, and this is what his subject must do. So, as I said at the start, what I call just is doing what's to the advantage of the stronger."

"Very well, Thrasymachus," I said. "So you think I argue in bad faith?"

"I certainly do," he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"You think I asked the questions I did as a deliberate plot to do you harm in the argument?"
341a	εὖ μὲν οὖν οἶδα, ἔφη. καὶ οὐδέν γέ σοι πλέον ἔσται· 341b οὔτε γὰρ ἄν με λάθοις κακουργῶν, οὔτε μὴ λαθὼν βιάσασθαι τῷ λόγῳ δύναιο.	"I don't think it, I know it," he said. "And it won't get you anywhere. 341b You can't do me harm without my noticing, and once I've noticed, you can't overpower me in argument."
	οὐδέ γ' ἂν ἐπιχειρήσαιμι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ μακάριε. ἀλλ' ἵνα μὴ αὖθις ἡμῖν τοιοῦτον ἐγγένηται, διόρισαι ποτέρως λέγεις τὸν ἄρχοντά τε καὶ τὸν κρείττονα, τὸν ὡς ἔπος εἰπεῖν ἢ τὸν ἀκριβεῖ λόγῳ, ὃ νυνδὴ ἔλεγες, οὗ τὸ συμφέρον κρείττονος ὄντος δίκαιον ἔσται τῷ ἥττονι ποιεῖν.	"I wouldn't even try, my dear fellow," I said. "But so that nothing like this happens to us again, make clear which you mean by the ruler and the stronger: the one who is so called in ordinary speech, or the one in the precise sense you were just talking about, whose advantage, since he's stronger, it will be just for the weaker to carry out."
341b	τὸν τῷ ἀκριβεστάτῳ, ἔφη, λόγῳ ἄρχοντα ὄντα. πρὸς ταῦτα κακούργει καὶ συκοφάντει, εἴ τι δύνασαι—οὐδέν σου παρίεμαι—ἀλλ' οὐ μὴ οἷός τ' ᾖς. 341c	"The ruler in the most precise sense," he said. "Do your worst against that with your tricks and bad-faith arguments, if you can—I'm not asking for any mercy. But you won't be able to." 341c
	οἴει γὰρ ἄν με, εἶπον, οὕτω μανῆναι ὥστε ξυρεῖν ἐπιχειρεῖν λέοντα καὶ συκοφαντεῖν Θρασύμαχον;	"Do you think I'm so mad," I said, "as to try to shave a lion, or to argue in bad faith against Thrasymachus?"
	νῦν γοῦν, ἔφη, ἐπεχείρησας, οὐδὲν ὢν καὶ ταῦτα.	"You tried just now, anyway," he said, "useless as you are at it."
	ἄδην, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τῶν τοιούτων. ἀλλ' εἰπέ μοι· ὁ τῷ ἀκριβεῖ λόγῳ ἰατρός, ὃν ἄρτι ἔλεγες, πότερον χρηματιστής ἐστιν ἢ τῶν καμνόντων θεραπευτής; καὶ λέγε τὸν τῷ ὄντι ἰατρὸν ὄντα.	"Enough of this sort of thing," I said. "But tell me: the doctor in the precise sense, whom you mentioned just now—is he a moneymaker or someone who takes care of the sick? And speak of the one who really is a doctor."
	τῶν καμνόντων, ἔφη, θεραπευτής.	"Someone who takes care of the sick," he said.[12]
341c	τί δὲ κυβερνήτης; ὁ ὀρθῶς κυβερνήτης ναυτῶν ἄρχων ἐστὶν ἢ ναύτης;	"And what about a ship's captain? Is the captain, properly speaking, a ruler of sailors or a sailor?"
	ναυτῶν ἄρχων. 341d	"A ruler of sailors." 341d
	οὐδὲν οἶμαι τοῦτο ὑπολογιστέον, ὅτι πλεῖ ἐν τῇ νηί, οὐδ' ἐστὶν κλητέος ναύτης· οὐ γὰρ κατὰ τὸ πλεῖν κυβερνήτης καλεῖται, ἀλλὰ κατὰ τὴν τέχνην καὶ τὴν τῶν ναυτῶν ἀρχήν.	"I don't suppose we should take into account the fact that he sails in the ship; that doesn't mean he should be called a sailor. It isn't for sailing that he's called a captain, but for his craft and his rule over the sailors."
	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη.	"True," he said.
	οὐκοῦν ἑκάστῳ τούτων ἔστιν τι συμφέρον;	"Now, is there something that's to the advantage of each of these?"
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
	οὐ καὶ ἡ τέχνη, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐπὶ τούτῳ πέφυκεν, ἐπὶ τῷ τὸ συμφέρον ἑκάστῳ ζητεῖν τε καὶ ἐκπορίζειν;	
	ἐπὶ τούτῳ, ἔφη.	

12 "Shaving a lion" was a proverbial image for a reckless and hopeless undertaking.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"And isn't the craft," I said, "by its nature aimed at just this—seeking out and providing for each what's to its advantage?"
		"Yes, at that," he said.
341d	ἆρ' οὖν καὶ ἑκάστῃ τῶν τεχνῶν ἔστιν τι συμφέρον ἄλλο ἢ ὅτι μάλιστα τελέαν εἶναι; 341e	"Then is there something to the advantage of each of the crafts too, other than being as perfect as possible?" 341e
	πῶς τοῦτο ἐρωτᾷς;	"What do you mean by that question?"
	ὥσπερ, ἔφην ἐγώ, εἴ με ἔροιο εἰ ἐξαρκεῖ σώματι εἶναι σώματι ἢ προσδεῖταί τινος, εἴποιμ' ἂν ὅτι "παντάπασι μὲν οὖν προσδεῖται. διὰ ταῦτα καὶ ἡ τέχνη ἐστὶν ἡ ἰατρικὴ νῦν ηὑρημένη, ὅτι σῶμά ἐστιν πονηρὸν καὶ οὐκ ἐξαρκεῖ αὐτῷ τοιούτῳ εἶναι. τούτῳ οὖν ὅπως ἐκπορίζῃ τὰ συμφέροντα, ἐπὶ τούτῳ παρεσκευάσθη ἡ τέχνη." ἦ ὀρθῶς σοι δοκῶ, ἔφην, ἂν εἰπεῖν οὕτω λέγων, ἢ οὔ;	"It's as if," I said, "you asked me whether it's enough for a body to be a body, or whether it needs something more. I'd say: 'It certainly needs something more. That's why the craft of medicine has now been discovered: because a body is defective, and it isn't enough for it to be as it is. So the craft was developed to provide it with what's to its advantage.' Do you think I'd be right to say that, or not?"
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη. 342a	"Right," he said. 342a
342a	τί δὲ δή; αὐτὴ ἡ ἰατρικὴ ἐστιν πονηρά, ἢ ἄλλη τις τέχνη ἔσθ' ὅτι προσδεῖταί τινος ἀρετῆς—ὥσπερ ὀφθαλμοὶ ὄψεως καὶ ὦτα ἀκοῆς καὶ διὰ ταῦτα ἐπ' αὐτοῖς δεῖ τινος τέχνης τῆς τὸ συμφέρον εἰς αὐτὰ ταῦτα σκεψομένης τε καὶ ἐκποριούσης— ἆρα καὶ ἐν αὐτῇ τῇ τέχνῃ ἔνι τις πονηρία, καὶ δεῖ ἑκάστῃ τέχνῃ ἄλλης τέχνης ἥτις αὐτῇ τὸ συμφέρον σκέψεται, καὶ τῇ σκοπουμένῃ ἑτέρας αὖ τοιαύτης, καὶ τοῦτ' ἔστιν ἀπέραντον; 342b ἢ αὐτὴ αὑτῇ τὸ συμφέρον σκέψεται;	"Well then: is medicine itself defective? Is there any other craft that needs some further excellence—the way eyes need sight and ears hearing, so that they need some craft over them to consider and provide what's to their advantage? Is there some defect in the craft itself too, so that each craft needs another craft to consider what's to its advantage, and the one doing the considering needs yet another like it, and so on without end? 342b Or will each craft consider its own advantage for itself?
342b	ἢ οὔτε αὐτῆς οὔτε ἄλλης προσδεῖται ἐπὶ τὴν αὐτῆς πονηρίαν τὸ συμφέρον σκοπεῖν· οὔτε γὰρ πονηρία οὔτε ἁμαρτία οὐδεμία οὐδεμιᾷ τέχνῃ πάρεστιν, οὐδὲ προσήκει τέχνῃ ἄλλῳ τὸ συμφέρον ζητεῖν ἢ ἐκείνῳ οὗ τέχνη ἐστίν, αὐτὴ δὲ ἀβλαβὴς καὶ ἀκέραιός ἐστιν ὀρθὴ οὖσα, ἕωσπερ ἂν ᾖ ἑκάστη ἀκριβὴς ὅλη ἥπερ ἐστίν; καὶ σκόπει ἐκείνῳ τῷ ἀκριβεῖ λόγῳ· οὕτως ἢ ἄλλως ἔχει;	"Or does it need neither itself nor another to consider what's to its advantage in view of its own defect? For there's no defect or error at all in any craft, and it isn't proper for a craft to seek the advantage of anything other than what it's the craft of. It is itself unharmed and pure, being correct, as long as each is precisely and wholly what it is. Look at it in that precise sense of yours: is it so or otherwise?"
	οὕτως, ἔφη, φαίνεται. 342c	"It appears to be so," he said. 342c
	οὐκ ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἰατρικὴ ἰατρικῇ τὸ συμφέρον σκοπεῖ ἀλλὰ σώματι.	"Then medicine," I said, "doesn't consider what's to the advantage of medicine, but of the body."
	ναί, ἔφη.	"Yes," he said.
	οὐδὲ ἱππικὴ ἱππικῇ ἀλλ' ἵπποις· οὐδὲ ἄλλη τέχνη οὐδεμία ἑαυτῇ—οὐδὲ γὰρ προσδεῖται—ἀλλ' ἐκείνῳ οὗ τέχνη ἐστίν.	"And horsemanship doesn't consider what's to the advantage of horsemanship, but of horses. No other craft considers its own advantage either—it
	φαίνεται, ἔφη, οὕτως.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἀλλὰ μήν, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, ἄρχουσί γε αἱ τέχναι καὶ κρατοῦσιν ἐκείνου οὗπέρ εἰσιν τέχναι.	doesn't need anything—but that of what it's the craft of."
	συνεχώρησεν ἐνταῦθα καὶ μάλα μόγις.	"So it appears," he said.
	οὐκ ἄρα ἐπιστήμη γε οὐδεμία τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος συμφέρον σκοπεῖ οὐδ' ἐπιτάττει, ἀλλὰ τὸ τοῦ ἥττονός τε καὶ ἀρχομένου [342d] ὑπὸ ἑαυτῆς.	"But surely, Thrasymachus, the crafts rule and hold power over what they're the crafts of."
		He conceded this too, though very reluctantly.
		"Then no kind of knowledge considers or orders what's to the advantage of the stronger, but what's to the advantage of the weaker, which is ruled [342d] by it."
342d	συνωμολόγησε μὲν καὶ ταῦτα τελευτῶν, ἐπεχείρει δὲ περὶ αὐτὰ μάχεσθαι· ἐπειδὴ δὲ ὡμολόγησεν, ἄλλο τι οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐδὲ ἰατρὸς οὐδείς, καθ' ὅσον ἰατρός, τὸ τῷ ἰατρῷ συμφέρον σκοπεῖ οὐδ' ἐπιτάττει, ἀλλὰ τὸ τῷ κάμνοντι; ὡμολόγηται γὰρ ὁ ἀκριβὴς ἰατρὸς σωμάτων εἶναι ἄρχων ἀλλ' οὐ χρηματιστής. ἢ οὐχ ὡμολόγηται;	In the end he agreed to this too, though he tried to put up a fight over it. When he had agreed, I said, "Then isn't it also true that no doctor, insofar as he's a doctor, considers or orders what's to the doctor's advantage, but what's to the patient's? For we've agreed that the doctor in the precise sense is a ruler of bodies and not a moneymaker. Or haven't we?"
	συνέφη.	He agreed.
	οὐκοῦν καὶ ὁ κυβερνήτης ὁ ἀκριβὴς ναυτῶν εἶναι ἄρχων ἀλλ' οὐ ναύτης; [342e]	"And that the captain in the precise sense is a ruler of sailors, not a sailor?" [342e]
	ὡμολόγηται.	"We have."
342e	οὐκ ἄρα ὅ γε τοιοῦτος κυβερνήτης τε καὶ ἄρχων τὸ τῷ κυβερνήτῃ συμφέρον σκέψεταί τε καὶ προστάξει, ἀλλὰ τὸ τῷ ναύτῃ τε καὶ ἀρχομένῳ.	"Then a captain and ruler of that kind won't consider or order what's to the captain's advantage, but what's to the advantage of the sailor, the one he rules."
	συνέφησε μόγις.	He agreed, reluctantly.
	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, οὐδὲ ἄλλος οὐδεὶς ἐν οὐδεμιᾷ ἀρχῇ, καθ' ὅσον ἄρχων ἐστίν, τὸ αὑτῷ συμφέρον σκοπεῖ οὐδ' ἐπιτάττει, ἀλλὰ τὸ τῷ ἀρχομένῳ καὶ ᾧ ἂν αὐτὸς δημιουργῇ, καὶ πρὸς ἐκεῖνο βλέπων καὶ τὸ ἐκείνῳ συμφέρον καὶ πρέπον, καὶ λέγει ἃ λέγει καὶ ποιεῖ ἃ ποιεῖ ἅπαντα.	"Then, Thrasymachus," I said, "no one else in any position of rule either, insofar as he's a ruler, considers or orders what's to his own advantage, but what's to the advantage of the one he rules, the one for whom he practices his craft. It's to that he looks, and to what's advantageous and fitting for it, in everything he says and everything he does."

THE SHEPHERD AND THE TYRANT

Thrasymachus argues that rulers treat subjects like sheep, and Socrates says true rule serves the ruled.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
343a	**SOCRATES** ἐπειδὴ οὖν ἐνταῦθα ἦμεν τοῦ λόγου καὶ πᾶσι καταφανὲς ἦν ὅτι ὁ τοῦ δικαίου λόγος εἰς τοὐναντίον περιειστήκει, ὁ Θρασύμαχος ἀντὶ τοῦ ἀποκρίνεσθαι, εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, τίτθη σοι ἔστιν;	**SOCRATES** When we had reached this point in the argument and it was plain to everyone that the account of the just had been turned into its opposite, Thrasymachus, instead of answering, said, "Tell me, Socrates, do you have a nurse?"
	τί δέ; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· οὐκ ἀποκρίνεσθαι χρῆν μᾶλλον ἢ τοιαῦτα ἐρωτᾶν;	"Why?" I said. "Shouldn't you be answering rather than asking questions like that?"

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ὅτι τοί σε, ἔφη, κορυζῶντα περιορᾷ καὶ οὐκ ἀπομύττει δεόμενον, ὅς γε αὐτῇ οὐδὲ πρόβατα οὐδὲ ποιμένα γιγνώσκεις.	"Because she lets you go around with a runny nose," he said, "and doesn't wipe it when you need it—seeing that, thanks to her, you can't even tell sheep from shepherd."
	ὅτι δὴ τί μάλιστα; ἦν δ' ἐγώ. [343b]	"And why exactly do you say that?" I said. [343b]
343b	ὅτι οἴει τοὺς ποιμένας ἢ τοὺς βουκόλους τὸ τῶν προβάτων ἢ τὸ τῶν βοῶν ἀγαθὸν σκοπεῖν καὶ παχύνειν αὐτοὺς καὶ θεραπεύειν πρὸς ἄλλο τι βλέποντας ἢ τὸ τῶν δεσποτῶν ἀγαθὸν καὶ τὸ αὑτῶν, καὶ δὴ καὶ τοὺς ἐν ταῖς πόλεσιν ἄρχοντας, οἳ ὡς ἀληθῶς ἄρχουσιν, ἄλλως πως ἡγῇ διανοεῖσθαι πρὸς τοὺς ἀρχομένους ἢ ὥσπερ ἄν τις πρὸς πρόβατα διατεθείη, καὶ ἄλλο τι σκοπεῖν αὐτοὺς διὰ νυκτὸς καὶ ἡμέρας ἢ τοῦτο, [343c] ὅθεν αὐτοὶ ὠφελήσονται.	Because you think that shepherds and cowherds consider the good of their sheep or cattle, and fatten them and look after them, with an eye to something other than their masters' good and their own. And you suppose that rulers in cities too—the ones who truly rule—think about their subjects differently from the way a man would regard his sheep, and that night and day they consider anything other than this: [343c] how they themselves will profit.
343c	καὶ οὕτω πόρρω εἶ περί τε τοῦ δικαίου καὶ δικαιοσύνης καὶ ἀδίκου τε καὶ ἀδικίας, ὥστε ἀγνοεῖς ὅτι ἡ μὲν δικαιοσύνη καὶ τὸ δίκαιον ἀλλότριον ἀγαθὸν τῷ ὄντι, τοῦ κρείττονός τε καὶ ἄρχοντος συμφέρον, οἰκεία δὲ τοῦ πειθομένου τε καὶ ὑπηρετοῦντος βλάβη, ἡ δὲ ἀδικία τοὐναντίον, καὶ ἄρχει τῶν ὡς ἀληθῶς εὐηθικῶν τε καὶ δικαίων, οἱ δ' ἀρχόμενοι ποιοῦσιν τὸ ἐκείνου συμφέρον κρείττονος ὄντος, καὶ εὐδαίμονα ἐκεῖνον ποιοῦσιν ὑπηρετοῦντες [343d] αὐτῷ, ἑαυτοὺς δὲ οὐδ' ὁπωστιοῦν. σκοπεῖσθαι δέ, ὦ εὐηθέστατε Σώκρατες, οὑτωσὶ χρή, ὅτι δίκαιος ἀνὴρ ἀδίκου πανταχοῦ ἔλαττον ἔχει.	And you're so far off about the just and justice, and the unjust and injustice, that you don't realize that justice and the just are really someone else's good—the advantage of the stronger, the ruler—and a harm to the one who obeys and serves. Injustice is the opposite: it rules over those who are truly naive, the just, and the ruled do what's to the advantage of the ruler, since he's the stronger, and by serving [343d] him they make him happy, but themselves not in the least. You should look at it this way, my most naive Socrates: a just man always gets less than an unjust one.
343d	πρῶτον μὲν ἐν τοῖς πρὸς ἀλλήλους συμβολαίοις, ὅπου ἂν ὁ τοιοῦτος τῷ τοιούτῳ κοινωνήσῃ, οὐδαμοῦ ἂν εὕροις ἐν τῇ διαλύσει τῆς κοινωνίας πλέον ἔχοντα τὸν δίκαιον τοῦ ἀδίκου ἀλλ' ἔλαττον· ἔπειτα ἐν τοῖς πρὸς τὴν πόλιν, ὅταν τέ τινες εἰσφοραὶ ὦσιν, ὁ μὲν δίκαιος ἀπὸ τῶν ἴσων πλέον εἰσφέρει, ὁ δ' ἔλαττον, ὅταν τε λήψεις, [343e] ὁ μὲν οὐδέν, ὁ δὲ πολλὰ κερδαίνει. καὶ γὰρ ὅταν ἀρχήν τινα ἄρχῃ ἑκάτερος, τῷ μὲν δικαίῳ ὑπάρχει, καὶ εἰ μηδεμία ἄλλη ζημία, τά γε οἰκεῖα δι' ἀμέλειαν μοχθηροτέρως ἔχειν, ἐκ δὲ τοῦ δημοσίου μηδὲν ὠφελεῖσθαι διὰ τὸ δίκαιον εἶναι, πρὸς δὲ τούτοις ἀπεχθέσθαι τοῖς τε οἰκείοις καὶ τοῖς γνωρίμοις, ὅταν μηδὲν ἐθέλῃ αὐτοῖς ὑπηρετεῖν παρὰ τὸ δίκαιον· τῷ δὲ ἀδίκῳ πάντα τούτων τἀναντία ὑπάρχει.	First, in private contracts: wherever one of this sort goes into partnership with one of the other, you'll never find, when the partnership is dissolved, the just man with more than the unjust, but less. Then in dealings with the city: when there are taxes to pay, the just man pays more on the same property and the other less; and when there's something to be received, [343e] the one gains nothing and the other a great deal. And when each of them holds some office, the just man's lot, even if he suffers no other penalty, is that his own affairs go downhill from neglect, while he gets no benefit from public funds because he's just; and on top of that he's hated by his relatives and acquaintances when he refuses to do them any favor that goes against what's just. For the unjust man it's the exact opposite in every respect.
343e	λέγω γὰρ [344a] ὅνπερ νυνδὴ ἔλεγον, τὸν μεγάλα δυνάμενον πλεονεκτεῖν· τοῦτον οὖν σκόπει, εἴπερ βούλει κρίνειν ὅσῳ μᾶλλον συμφέρει ἰδίᾳ αὐτῷ ἄδικον εἶναι ἢ τὸ	I mean [344a] the man I was talking about just now, the one with the power to take more than his share on a large scale. Look at him, if you want to

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	δίκαιον. πάντων δὲ ῥᾷστα μαθήσῃ, ἐὰν ἐπὶ τὴν τελεωτάτην ἀδικίαν ἔλθῃς, ἣ τὸν μὲν ἀδικήσαντα εὐδαιμονέστατον ποιεῖ, τοὺς δὲ ἀδικηθέντας καὶ ἀδικῆσαι οὐκ ἂν ἐθέλοντας ἀθλιωτάτους.	judge how much more it profits him personally to be unjust than to be just. You'll see it most easily of all if you go to the most complete injustice, which makes the wrongdoer happiest, and those who are wronged, and who wouldn't be willing to do wrong themselves, most miserable.
344a	ἔστιν δὲ τοῦτο τυραννίς, ἣ οὐ κατὰ σμικρὸν τἀλλότρια καὶ λάθρᾳ καὶ βίᾳ ἀφαιρεῖται, καὶ ἱερὰ καὶ ὅσια καὶ ἴδια καὶ δημόσια, ἀλλὰ [344b] συλλήβδην· ὧν ἐφ' ἑκάστῳ μέρει ὅταν τις ἀδικήσας μὴ λάθῃ, ζημιοῦταί τε καὶ ὀνείδη ἔχει τὰ μέγιστα—καὶ γὰρ ἱερόσυλοι καὶ ἀνδραποδισταὶ καὶ τοιχωρύχοι καὶ ἀποστερηταὶ καὶ κλέπται οἱ κατὰ μέρη ἀδικοῦντες τῶν τοιούτων κακουργημάτων καλοῦνται—ἐπειδὰν δέ τις πρὸς τοῖς τῶν πολιτῶν χρήμασιν καὶ αὐτοὺς ἀνδραποδισάμενος δουλώσηται, ἀντὶ τούτων τῶν αἰσχρῶν ὀνομάτων εὐδαίμονες καὶ μακάριοι [344c] κέκληνται, οὐ μόνον ὑπὸ τῶν πολιτῶν ἀλλὰ καὶ ὑπὸ τῶν ἄλλων ὅσοι ἂν πύθωνται αὐτὸν τὴν ὅλην ἀδικίαν ἠδικηκότα· οὐ γὰρ τὸ ποιεῖν τὰ ἄδικα ἀλλὰ τὸ πάσχειν φοβούμενοι ὀνειδίζουσιν οἱ ὀνειδίζοντες τὴν ἀδικίαν.	That is tyranny, which takes away other people's property by stealth and by force—sacred and consecrated, private and public—not bit by bit but [344b] all at once. When someone is caught committing any single part of this injustice, he's punished and meets with the deepest disgrace: those who commit such crimes piecemeal are called temple-robbers, kidnappers, burglars, swindlers and thieves. But when someone, on top of seizing the citizens' property, kidnaps and enslaves the citizens themselves, instead of these shameful names he's called happy and blessed, [344c] not only by the citizens but by everyone else who hears that he has committed injustice in full. For those who condemn injustice do so not because they're afraid of doing unjust things, but because they're afraid of suffering them.
344c	οὕτως, ὦ Σώκρατες, καὶ ἰσχυρότερον καὶ ἐλευθεριώτερον καὶ δεσποτικώτερον ἀδικία δικαιοσύνης ἐστὶν ἱκανῶς γιγνομένη, καὶ ὅπερ ἐξ ἀρχῆς ἔλεγον, τὸ μὲν τοῦ κρείττονος συμφέρον τὸ δίκαιον τυγχάνει ὄν, τὸ δ' ἄδικον ἑαυτῷ λυσιτελοῦν τε καὶ συμφέρον. [344d]	So, Socrates, injustice, when it's on a large enough scale, is stronger, freer and more masterful than justice; and, as I said at the start, the just is what's to the advantage of the stronger, while the unjust is what profits and benefits oneself. [344d]
344d	ταῦτα εἰπὼν ὁ Θρασύμαχος ἐν νῷ εἶχεν ἀπιέναι, ὥσπερ βαλανεὺς ἡμῶν καταντλήσας κατὰ τῶν ὤτων ἀθρόον καὶ πολὺν τὸν λόγον· οὐ μὴν εἴασάν γε αὐτὸν οἱ παρόντες, ἀλλ' ἠνάγκασαν ὑπομεῖναί τε καὶ παρασχεῖν τῶν εἰρημένων λόγον. καὶ δὴ ἔγωγε καὶ αὐτὸς πάνυ ἐδεόμην τε καὶ εἶπον· ὦ δαιμόνιε Θρασύμαχε, οἷον ἐμβαλὼν λόγον ἐν νῷ ἔχεις ἀπιέναι πρὶν διδάξαι ἱκανῶς ἢ μαθεῖν εἴτε οὕτως εἴτε ἄλλως [344e] ἔχει; ἢ σμικρὸν οἴει ἐπιχειρεῖν πρᾶγμα διορίζεσθαι ὅλου βίου διαγωγήν, ᾗ ἂν διαγόμενος ἕκαστος ἡμῶν λυσιτελεστάτην ζωὴν ζῴη;	Having said this, Thrasymachus meant to leave, like a bath attendant who had drenched our ears with his speech in one great flood. But those present wouldn't let him; they made him stay and give an account of what he'd said. I myself begged him hard as well, and said, "Thrasymachus, you extraordinary man, after hurling a speech like that at us, do you mean to leave before properly teaching us, or learning, whether it's so or otherwise? [344e] Or do you think it's a small matter you're trying to settle—the conduct of a whole life, the way each of us can live the most profitable life?"
344e	ἐγὼ γὰρ οἶμαι, ἔφη ὁ Θρασύμαχος, τουτὶ ἄλλως ἔχειν; ἔοικας, ἦν δ' ἐγώ—ἤτοι ἡμῶν γε οὐδὲν κήδεσθαι, οὐδέ τι φροντίζειν εἴτε χεῖρον εἴτε βέλτιον βιωσόμεθα ἀγνοοῦντες ὃ σὺ φῂς εἰδέναι.	"And do you suppose I think otherwise?" said Thrasymachus. "You seem to," I said. "Or else you don't care about us at all, and aren't the least bit concerned whether we'll live worse or better in our ignorance of what you claim to know.

GREEK

ENGLISH

ἀλλ', ὠγαθέ, προθυμοῦ καὶ ἡμῖν ἐνδείξασθαι—οὔτοι [345a] κακῶς σοι κείσεται ὅτι ἂν ἡμᾶς τοσούσδε ὄντας εὐεργετήσῃς—ἐγὼ γὰρ δή σοι λέγω τό γ' ἐμόν, ὅτι οὐ πείθομαι οὐδ' οἶμαι ἀδικίαν δικαιοσύνης κερδαλεώτερον εἶναι, οὐδ' ἐὰν ἐᾷ τις αὐτὴν καὶ μὴ διακωλύῃ πράττειν ἃ βούλεται. ἀλλ', ὠγαθέ, ἔστω μὲν ἄδικος, δυνάσθω δὲ ἀδικεῖν ἢ τῷ λανθάνειν ἢ τῷ διαμάχεσθαι, ὅμως ἐμέ γε οὐ πείθει ὡς ἔστι τῆς δικαιοσύνης κερδαλεώτερον. ταῦτ' οὖν [345b] καὶ ἕτερος ἴσως τις ἡμῶν πέπονθεν, οὐ μόνος ἐγώ· πεῖσον οὖν, ὦ μακάριε, ἱκανῶς ἡμᾶς ὅτι οὐκ ὀρθῶς βουλευόμεθα δικαιοσύνην ἀδικίας περὶ πλείονος ποιούμενοι.

"Come on, my good man, be willing to show us too —it won't [345a] be a bad investment for you, whatever favor you do for so many of us. For I'll tell you where I stand: I'm not persuaded, and I don't believe that injustice is more profitable than justice, not even if it's given free rein and not prevented from doing what it wants. My good man, let someone be unjust, and let him have the power to do wrong, either by going undetected or by fighting it out: still, he doesn't convince me that it's more profitable than justice. Perhaps [345b] someone else here feels the same way, not just me. So convince us properly, my dear fellow, that we're wrong to value justice more than injustice."

345b καὶ πῶς, ἔφη, σὲ πείσω; εἰ γὰρ οἷς νυνδὴ ἔλεγον μὴ πέπεισαι, τί σοι ἔτι ποιήσω; ἢ εἰς τὴν ψυχὴν φέρων ἐνθῶ τὸν λόγον;

"And how am I to convince you?" he said. "If you aren't convinced by what I said just now, what more can I do for you? Am I to take the argument and stuff it into your soul?"

μὰ Δί', ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μὴ σύ γε· ἀλλὰ πρῶτον μέν, ἃ ἂν εἴπῃς, ἔμμενε τούτοις, ἢ ἐὰν μετατιθῇ, φανερῶς μετατίθεσο καὶ ἡμᾶς μὴ ἐξαπάτα. νῦν δὲ ὁρᾷς, ὦ Θρασύμαχε—ἔτι [345c] γὰρ τὰ ἔμπροσθεν ἐπισκεψώμεθα—ὅτι τὸν ὡς ἀληθῶς ἰατρὸν τὸ πρῶτον ὁριζόμενος τὸν ὡς ἀληθῶς ποιμένα οὐκέτι ὥου δεῖν ὕστερον ἀκριβῶς φυλάξαι, ἀλλὰ πιαίνειν οἴει αὐτὸν τὰ πρόβατα, καθ' ὅσον ποιμήν ἐστιν, οὐ πρὸς τὸ τῶν προβάτων βέλτιστον βλέποντα ἀλλ', ὥσπερ δαιτυμόνα τινὰ καὶ μέλλοντα ἑστιάσεσθαι, πρὸς τὴν εὐωχίαν, ἢ αὖ πρὸς τὸ [345d] ἀποδόσθαι, ὥσπερ χρηματιστὴν ἀλλ' οὐ ποιμένα.

"By Zeus, no, don't do that!" I said. "But first, stick to whatever you say—or if you change position, change it openly and don't deceive us. As it is, Thrasymachus, you see—let's [345c] go back over what came before—that although you first defined the true doctor, you didn't think you needed to keep strictly to the true shepherd later on. You think that he, insofar as he's a shepherd, fattens his sheep not with an eye to what's best for the sheep but, like a dinner guest about to be treated to a banquet, with an eye to the feast—or else to [345d] selling them, like a moneymaker and not a shepherd.

345d τῇ δὲ ποιμενικῇ οὐ δήπου ἄλλου του μέλει ἢ ἐφ' ᾧ τέτακται, ὅπως τούτῳ τὸ βέλτιστον ἐκποριεῖ—ἐπεὶ τά γε αὑτῆς ὥστ' εἶναι βελτίστη ἱκανῶς δήπου ἐκπεπόρισται, ἕως γ' ἂν μηδὲν ἐνδέῃ τοῦ ποιμενικὴ εἶναι—οὕτω δὲ ὥμην ἔγωγε νυνδὴ ἀναγκαῖον εἶναι ἡμῖν ὁμολογεῖν πᾶσαν ἀρχήν, καθ' ὅσον ἀρχή, μηδενὶ ἄλλῳ τὸ βέλτιστον σκοπεῖσθαι ἢ ἐκείνῳ, τῷ [345e] ἀρχομένῳ τε καὶ θεραπευομένῳ, ἔν τε πολιτικῇ καὶ ἰδιωτικῇ ἀρχῇ. σὺ δὲ τοὺς ἄρχοντας ἐν ταῖς πόλεσιν, τοὺς ὡς ἀληθῶς ἄρχοντας, ἑκόντας οἴει ἄρχειν;

"But the shepherd's craft surely cares about nothing other than providing what's best for what it's been put in charge of—since its own affairs, so that it's at its best, are surely provided for well enough, as long as it lacks nothing of being the shepherd's craft. That's why I thought just now that we had to agree that every kind of rule, insofar as it's rule, considers what's best for nothing other than that [345e] which it rules and looks after, whether in public or in private rule. But do you think that the rulers in cities, the ones who truly rule, rule willingly?"

345e μὰ Δί' οὔκ, ἔφη, ἀλλ' εὖ οἶδα.

"By Zeus, I don't think it," he said. "I know it."

τί δέ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Θρασύμαχε; τὰς ἄλλας ἀρχὰς οὐκ ἐννοεῖς ὅτι οὐδεὶς ἐθέλει ἄρχειν ἑκών, ἀλλὰ μισθὸν αἰτοῦσιν, ὡς οὐχὶ αὐτοῖσιν ὠφελίαν ἐσομένην ἐκ τοῦ

"Really, Thrasymachus?" I said. "Don't you notice that in the other kinds of office no one is willing to

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἄρχειν ἀλλὰ [346a] τοῖς ἀρχομένοις; ἐπεὶ τοσόνδε εἰπέ· οὐχὶ ἑκάστην μέντοι φαμὲν ἑκάστοτε τῶν τεχνῶν τούτῳ ἑτέραν εἶναι, τῷ ἑτέραν τὴν δύναμιν ἔχειν; καί, ὦ μακάριε, μὴ παρὰ δόξαν ἀποκρίνου, ἵνα τι καὶ περαίνωμεν.	rule of his own accord? They ask for pay, on the assumption that the benefit from ruling will go not to themselves but [346a] to those they rule. Tell me this much: don't we say that each of the crafts is different from the others in having a different power? And, my dear fellow, don't answer against what you really think, so that we can get somewhere."
	ἀλλὰ τούτῳ, ἔφη, ἑτέρα.	"Yes," he said, "that's what makes it different."
346a	οὐκοῦν καὶ ὠφελίαν ἑκάστη τούτων ἰδίαν τινὰ ἡμῖν παρέχεται ἀλλ' οὐ κοινήν, οἷον ἰατρικὴ μὲν ὑγίειαν, κυβερνητικὴ δὲ σωτηρίαν ἐν τῷ πλεῖν, καὶ αἱ ἄλλαι οὕτω;	"And each of them provides us with some particular benefit, not a common one—medicine health, for instance, navigation safety at sea, and the others likewise?"
	πάνυ γε. [346b]	"Certainly." [346b]
	οὐκοῦν καὶ μισθωτικὴ μισθόν; αὕτη γὰρ αὐτῆς ἡ δύναμις· ἢ τὴν ἰατρικὴν σὺ καὶ τὴν κυβερνητικὴν τὴν αὐτὴν καλεῖς; ἢ ἐάνπερ βούλῃ ἀκριβῶς διορίζειν, ὥσπερ ὑπέθου, οὐδέν τι μᾶλλον, ἐάν τις κυβερνῶν ὑγιὴς γίγνηται διὰ τὸ συμφέρον αὐτῷ πλεῖν ἐν τῇ θαλάττῃ, ἕνεκα τούτου καλεῖς μᾶλλον αὐτὴν ἰατρικήν;	"And wage-earning provides wages? That's its power. Or do you call medicine and navigation the same thing? Or rather, if you want to make precise distinctions, as you proposed, and a captain becomes healthy because sailing on the sea is good for him, would you call his craft medicine on that account?"
	οὐ δῆτα, ἔφη.	"Of course not," he said.
346b	οὐδέ γ', οἶμαι, τὴν μισθωτικήν, ἐὰν ὑγιαίνῃ τις μισθαρνῶν.	"Nor, I think, would you call wage-earning medicine if someone is healthy while earning wages."
	οὐ δῆτα.	"Of course not."
	τί δέ; τὴν ἰατρικὴν μισθαρνητικήν, ἐὰν ἰώμενός τις μισθαρνῇ; [346c]	"Well then, would you call medicine wage-earning if someone earns wages while healing?" [346c]
	οὐκ ἔφη.	He said no.
	οὐκοῦν τήν γε ὠφελίαν ἑκάστης τῆς τέχνης ἰδίαν ὡμολογήσαμεν εἶναι;	"And we agreed that the benefit of each craft is particular to it?"
	ἔστω, ἔφη.	"Granted," he said.
	ἤντινα ἄρα ὠφελίαν κοινῇ ὠφελοῦνται πάντες οἱ δημιουργοί, δῆλον ὅτι κοινῇ τινι τῷ αὐτῷ προσχρώμενοι ἀπ' ἐκείνου ὠφελοῦνται.	"Then whatever benefit all craftsmen receive in common, they clearly get from making additional use of some one thing that's common to them all."
	ἔοικεν, ἔφη.	"It seems so," he said.
	φαμὲν δέ γε τὸ μισθὸν ἀρνυμένους ὠφελεῖσθαι τοὺς δημιουργοὺς ἀπὸ τοῦ προσχρῆσθαι τῇ μισθωτικῇ τέχνῃ γίγνεσθαι αὐτοῖς.	"And we say that craftsmen benefit by earning wages because they make additional use of the craft of wage-earning."
	συνέφη μόγις. [346d]	He agreed, reluctantly. [346d]
346d	οὐκ ἄρα ἀπὸ τῆς αὐτοῦ τέχνης ἑκάστῳ αὕτη ἡ ὠφελία ἐστίν, ἡ τοῦ μισθοῦ λῆψις, ἀλλ', εἰ δεῖ ἀκριβῶς σκοπεῖσθαι, ἡ μὲν ἰατρικὴ ὑγίειαν ποιεῖ, ἡ δὲ μισθαρνητικὴ μισθόν, καὶ ἡ μὲν οἰκοδομικὴ οἰκίαν, ἡ δὲ μισθαρνητικὴ αὐτῇ ἑπομένη μισθόν, καὶ αἱ ἄλλαι πᾶσαι οὕτως τὸ αὑτῆς ἑκάστη ἔργον ἐργάζεται καὶ ὠφελεῖ	"Then this benefit, receiving wages, doesn't come to each of them from his own craft. If we're to examine it precisely, medicine produces health, and wage-earning wages; building produces a house, and wage-earning, which goes along with it, wages; and all the others likewise each do their

GREEK

ENGLISH

ἐκεῖνο ἐφ' ᾧ τέτακται. ἐὰν δὲ μὴ μισθὸς αὐτῇ προσγίγνηται, ἔσθ' ὅτι ὠφελεῖται ὁ δημιουργὸς ἀπὸ τῆς τέχνης;

οὐ φαίνεται, ἔφη. 346e

ἆρ' οὖν οὐδ' ὠφελεῖ τότε, ὅταν προῖκα ἐργάζηται;

οἶμαι ἔγωγε.

own work and benefit what they've been put in charge of. But if no wage is added, does the craftsman get any benefit from his craft?"

"It doesn't appear so," he said. 346e

"Then does he confer no benefit either, when he works for nothing?"

"I think he does confer benefit."

346e οὐκοῦν, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, τοῦτο ἤδη δῆλον, ὅτι οὐδεμία τέχνη οὐδὲ ἀρχὴ τὸ αὑτῇ ὠφέλιμον παρασκευάζει, ἀλλ', ὅπερ πάλαι ἐλέγομεν, τὸ τῷ ἀρχομένῳ καὶ παρασκευάζει καὶ ἐπιτάττει, τὸ ἐκείνου συμφέρον ἥττονος ὄντος σκοποῦσα, ἀλλ' οὐ τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος.

"So, Thrasymachus, this much is now clear: no craft and no kind of rule provides what's beneficial to itself. As we've been saying for some time, it provides and orders what's beneficial to the one it rules, considering the advantage of the weaker, not of the stronger.

διὰ δὴ ταῦτα ἔγωγε, ὦ φίλε Θρασύμαχε, καὶ ἄρτι ἔλεγον μηδένα ἐθέλειν ἑκόντα ἄρχειν καὶ τὰ ἀλλότρια κακὰ μεταχειρίζεσθαι ἀνορθοῦντα, 347a ἀλλὰ μισθὸν αἰτεῖν, ὅτι ὁ μέλλων καλῶς τῇ τέχνῃ πράξειν οὐδέποτε αὐτῷ τὸ βέλτιστον πράττει οὐδ' ἐπιτάττει κατὰ τὴν τέχνην ἐπιτάττων, ἀλλὰ τῷ ἀρχομένῳ· ὧν δὴ ἕνεκα, ὡς ἔοικε, μισθὸν δεῖν ὑπάρχειν τοῖς μέλλουσιν ἐθελήσειν ἄρχειν, ἢ ἀργύριον ἢ τιμήν, ἢ ζημίαν ἐὰν μὴ ἄρχῃ.

"That's exactly why, my dear Thrasymachus, I said just now that no one is willing to rule of his own accord and take other people's troubles in hand to set them right, 347a but asks for pay: anyone who is going to practice his craft well never does or orders what's best for himself, when he gives orders according to his craft, but what's best for the one he rules. That's why, it seems, there has to be pay for those who are going to be willing to rule—money, or honor, or a penalty if he doesn't rule."

347a πῶς τοῦτο λέγεις, ὦ Σώκρατες; ἔφη ὁ Γλαύκων· τοὺς μὲν γὰρ δύο μισθοὺς γιγνώσκω, τὴν δὲ ζημίαν ἥντινα λέγεις καὶ ὡς ἐν μισθοῦ μέρει εἴρηκας, οὐ συνῆκα.

τὸν τῶν βελτίστων ἄρα μισθόν, ἔφην, οὐ συνιεῖς, δι' ὃν 347b ἄρχουσιν οἱ ἐπιεικέστατοι, ὅταν ἐθέλωσιν ἄρχειν. ἢ οὐκ οἶσθα ὅτι τὸ φιλότιμόν τε καὶ φιλάργυρον εἶναι ὄνειδος λέγεταί τε καὶ ἔστιν;

ἔγωγε, ἔφη.

"What do you mean by that, Socrates?" said Glaucon. "The two kinds of pay I recognize, but I don't understand what this penalty is, or how you can count it as a kind of pay."

"Then you don't understand the pay of the best people," I said, "the pay for which 347b the most decent people rule, when they're willing to rule. Don't you know that loving honor and loving money are called disgraceful, and are?"

"I do," he said.

347b διὰ ταῦτα τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὔτε χρημάτων ἕνεκα ἐθέλουσιν ἄρχειν οἱ ἀγαθοὶ οὔτε τιμῆς· οὔτε γὰρ φανερῶς πραττόμενοι τῆς ἀρχῆς ἕνεκα μισθὸν μισθωτοὶ βούλονται κεκλῆσθαι, οὔτε λάθρᾳ αὐτοὶ ἐκ τῆς ἀρχῆς λαμβάνοντες κλέπται. οὐδ' αὖ τιμῆς ἕνεκα· οὐ γάρ εἰσι φιλότιμοι. δεῖ δὴ 347c αὐτοῖς ἀνάγκην προσεῖναι καὶ ζημίαν, εἰ μέλλουσιν ἐθέλειν ἄρχειν—ὅθεν κινδυνεύει τὸ ἑκόντα ἐπὶ τὸ ἄρχειν ἰέναι ἀλλὰ μὴ ἀνάγκην περιμένειν αἰσχρὸν νενομίσθαι—τῆς δὲ ζημίας μεγίστη τὸ ὑπὸ πονηροτέρου ἄρχεσθαι, ἐὰν μὴ αὐτὸς ἐθέλῃ ἄρχειν· ἣν δείσαντές μοι φαίνονται ἄρχειν, ὅταν ἄρχωσιν, οἱ ἐπιεικεῖς, καὶ τότε ἔρχονται ἐπὶ τὸ ἄρχειν οὐχ ὡς ἐπ' ἀγαθόν τι ἰόντες οὐδ' ὡς

"That's why," I said, "good people aren't willing to rule for the sake of money or honor. They don't want to be called hirelings for openly taking pay for ruling, or thieves for secretly helping themselves from their office. Nor will they rule for honor, since they don't love honor. So compulsion 347c and a penalty have to be applied to them if they're going to be willing to rule—which is probably why going to rule willingly, instead of waiting to be compelled, has come to be thought shameful. And the greatest penalty is to be ruled by someone worse, if one isn't willing to rule oneself. It's from fear of this, it seems to me, that decent people

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	εὐπαθήσοντες ἐν αὐτῷ, ἀλλ' [347d] ὡς ἐπ' ἀναγκαῖον καὶ οὐκ ἔχοντες ἑαυτῶν βελτίοσιν ἐπιτρέψαι οὐδὲ ὁμοίοις.	rule, when they do rule. And then they go to it not as to something good, or expecting to enjoy themselves in it, but [347d] as to something necessary, since they have no one better than themselves, or even as good, to entrust it to.
347d	ἐπεὶ κινδυνεύει πόλις ἀνδρῶν ἀγαθῶν εἰ γένοιτο, περιμάχητον ἂν εἶναι τὸ μὴ ἄρχειν ὥσπερ νυνὶ τὸ ἄρχειν, καὶ ἐνταῦθ' ἂν καταφανὲς γενέσθαι ὅτι τῷ ὄντι ἀληθινὸς ἄρχων οὐ πέφυκε τὸ αὑτῷ συμφέρον σκοπεῖσθαι ἀλλὰ τὸ τῷ ἀρχομένῳ· ὥστε πᾶς ἂν ὁ γιγνώσκων τὸ ὠφελεῖσθαι μᾶλλον ἕλοιτο ὑπ' ἄλλου ἢ ἄλλον ὠφελῶν πράγματα ἔχειν. τοῦτο μὲν οὖν ἔγωγε οὐδαμῇ συγχωρῶ [347e] Θρασυμάχῳ, ὡς τὸ δίκαιόν ἐστιν τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος συμφέρον. ἀλλὰ τοῦτο μὲν δὴ καὶ εἰς αὖθις σκεψόμεθα· πολὺ δέ μοι δοκεῖ μεῖζον εἶναι ὃ νῦν λέγει Θρασύμαχος, τὸν τοῦ ἀδίκου βίον φάσκων εἶναι κρείττω ἢ τὸν τοῦ δικαίου. σὺ οὖν ποτέρως, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Γλαύκων, αἱρῇ; καὶ πότερον ἀληθεστέρως δοκεῖ σοι λέγεσθαι;	rule, when they do rule. And then they go to it not as to something good, or expecting to enjoy themselves in it, but [347d] as to something necessary, since they have no one better than themselves, or even as good, to entrust it to. "For if a city of good men came to be, it's likely that people would fight to avoid ruling, as they now fight to rule; and there it would become plain that a true ruler really isn't by nature the kind to consider his own advantage, but that of the one he rules. So anyone who knew this would choose to be benefited by another rather than to go to the trouble of benefiting someone else. So on this point I don't concede [347e] to Thrasymachus in the slightest that the just is the advantage of the stronger. But we'll look into that again another time. What Thrasymachus is saying now—when he claims that the unjust man's life is better than the just man's—seems to me much more important. Which do you choose, Glaucon?" I said. "And which view do you think is closer to the truth?"
347e	τὸν τοῦ δικαίου ἔγωγε λυσιτελέστερον βίον εἶναι. ἤκουσας, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅσα ἄρτι Θρασύμαχος ἀγαθὰ διῆλθεν τῷ τοῦ ἀδίκου; ἤκουσα, ἔφη, ἀλλ' οὐ πείθομαι. βούλει οὖν αὐτὸν πείθωμεν, ἂν δυνώμεθά πῃ ἐξευρεῖν, ὡς οὐκ ἀληθῆ λέγει; πῶς γὰρ οὐ βούλομαι; ἦ δ' ὅς.	"For my part, I think the just man's life is more profitable." "Did you hear," I said, "all the good things Thrasymachus just listed for the unjust man's life?" "I heard," he said, "but I'm not persuaded." "Then do you want us to persuade him, if we can find some way, that what he says isn't true?" "Of course I want to," he said.
348a	ἂν μὲν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀντικατατείναντες λέγωμεν αὐτῷ λόγον παρὰ λόγον, ὅσα αὖ ἀγαθὰ ἔχει τὸ δίκαιον εἶναι, καὶ αὖθις οὗτος, καὶ ἄλλον ἡμεῖς, ἀριθμεῖν δεήσει [348b] τἀγαθὰ καὶ μετρεῖν ὅσα ἑκάτεροι ἐν ἑκατέρῳ λέγομεν, καὶ ἤδη δικαστῶν τινων τῶν διακρινούντων δεησόμεθα· ἂν δὲ ὥσπερ ἄρτι ἀνομολογούμενοι πρὸς ἀλλήλους σκοπῶμεν, ἅμα αὐτοί τε δικασταὶ καὶ ῥήτορες ἐσόμεθα. πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη. ὁποτέρως οὖν σοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀρέσκει. οὕτως, ἔφη.	"Well then," I said, "if we match him speech for speech, setting out in our turn all the good things there are in being just, and then he replies, and then we give another speech, we'll have to count [348b] the good things and measure how many each side mentions in each speech, and then we'll need some judges to decide between us. But if we examine the matter as we did just now, by reaching agreement with each other, we'll be judges and advocates ourselves at the same time." "Certainly," he said. "So which way do you prefer?" I said. "This way," he said.

IS INJUSTICE WISER AND STRONGER?

Socrates argues against Thrasymachus that justice, not injustice, is wise, good and strong.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
348b	**SOCRATES** ἴθι δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, ἀπόκριναι ἡμῖν ἐξ ἀρχῆς. τὴν τελέαν ἀδικίαν τελέας οὔσης δικαιοσύνης λυσιτελεστέραν φῂς εἶναι; 348c	**SOCRATES** "Come on, then, Thrasymachus," I said, "answer us from the beginning. You say that perfect injustice is more profitable than perfect justice?" 348c
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν καὶ φημί, ἔφη, καὶ δι' ἅ, εἴρηκα.	"I certainly do say so," he said, "and I've told you why."
	φέρε δή, τὸ τοιόνδε περὶ αὐτῶν πῶς λέγεις; τὸ μέν που ἀρετὴν αὐτοῖν καλεῖς, τὸ δὲ κακίαν;	"Well then, how would you put the following about them? I suppose you call one of the two an excellence and the other a badness?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
	οὐκοῦν τὴν μὲν δικαιοσύνην ἀρετήν, τὴν δὲ ἀδικίαν κακίαν;	"Justice the excellence, and injustice the badness?"
	εἰκός γ', ἔφη, ὦ ἥδιστε, ἐπειδή γε καὶ λέγω ἀδικίαν μὲν λυσιτελεῖν, δικαιοσύνην δ' οὔ.	"Oh, very likely, my sweet friend," he said, "when I'm saying that injustice pays and justice doesn't!"
	ἀλλὰ τί μήν;	"Then what?"
	τοὐναντίον, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"The opposite," he said.
348c	ἦ τὴν δικαιοσύνην κακίαν;	"You mean justice is a badness?"
	οὔκ, ἀλλὰ πάνυ γενναίαν εὐήθειαν. 348d	"No, but a thoroughly noble good-naturedness." 348d
	τὴν ἀδικίαν ἄρα κακοήθειαν καλεῖς;	"Then you call injustice ill-naturedness?"
	οὔκ, ἀλλ' εὐβουλίαν, ἔφη.	"No—good judgment," he said.
	ἦ καὶ φρόνιμοί σοι, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, δοκοῦσιν εἶναι καὶ ἀγαθοὶ οἱ ἄδικοι;	"Do you actually think the unjust are intelligent and good, Thrasymachus?"
	οἵ γε τελέως, ἔφη, οἷοί τε ἀδικεῖν, πόλεις τε καὶ ἔθνη δυνάμενοι ἀνθρώπων ὑφ' ἑαυτοὺς ποιεῖσθαι· σὺ δὲ οἴει με ἴσως τοὺς τὰ βαλλάντια ἀποτέμνοντας λέγειν. λυσιτελεῖ μὲν οὖν, ἦ δ' ὅς, καὶ τὰ τοιαῦτα, ἐάνπερ λανθάνῃ· ἔστι δὲ οὐκ ἄξια λόγου, ἀλλ' ἃ νυνδὴ ἔλεγον. 348e	"The ones who can do wrong to perfection, at any rate," he said, "who are able to bring whole cities and nations of people under their power. You probably think I mean purse-snatchers. Not that that sort of thing doesn't pay too," he said, "so long as you don't get caught. But it isn't worth mentioning next to what I was just describing." 348e
348e	τοῦτο μέν, ἔφην, οὐκ ἀγνοῶ ὃ βούλει λέγειν, ἀλλὰ τόδε ἐθαύμασα, εἰ ἐν ἀρετῆς καὶ σοφίας τιθεῖς μέρει τὴν ἀδικίαν, τὴν δὲ δικαιοσύνην ἐν τοῖς ἐναντίοις.	"I know what you mean," I said. "What surprised me was that you rank injustice with excellence and wisdom, and justice with their opposites."
	ἀλλὰ πάνυ οὕτω τίθημι.	"But that's exactly how I rank them."
	τοῦτο, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἤδη στερεώτερον, ὦ ἑταῖρε, καὶ οὐκέτι ῥᾴδιον ἔχειν ὅτι τις εἴπῃ.	"Now that's a tougher position, my friend," I said, "and it's no longer easy to know what to say.
	εἰ γὰρ λυσιτελεῖν μὲν τὴν ἀδικίαν ἐτίθεσο, κακίαν μέντοι ἢ αἰσχρὸν αὐτὸ ὡμολόγεις εἶναι ὥσπερ ἄλλοι τινές, εἴχομεν ἄν τι λέγειν κατὰ τὰ νομιζόμενα λέγοντες· νῦν δὲ δῆλος εἶ ὅτι φήσεις αὐτὸ καὶ καλὸν καὶ ἰσχυρὸν εἶναι καὶ	"If you had held that injustice pays, but admitted, as some others do, that it's a badness or something shameful, we could have said something by appealing to conventional views. But as it is, you'll

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τἆλλα αὐτῷ πάντα προσθήσεις [349a] ἃ ἡμεῖς τῷ δικαίῳ προσετίθεμεν, ἐπειδή γε καὶ ἐν ἀρετῇ αὐτὸ καὶ σοφίᾳ ἐτόλμησας θεῖναι.	obviously call it both fine and strong, and credit it with all the other qualities [349a] we used to credit to the just, since you've dared to rank it with excellence and wisdom."
	ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη, μαντεύῃ.	"Your prophecy is perfectly true," he said.
349a	ἀλλ' οὐ μέντοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀποκνητέον γε τῷ λόγῳ ἐπεξελθεῖν σκοπούμενον, ἕως ἄν σε ὑπολαμβάνω λέγειν ἅπερ διανοῇ. ἐμοὶ γὰρ δοκεῖς σύ, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, ἀτεχνῶς νῦν οὐ σκώπτειν, ἀλλὰ τὰ δοκοῦντα περὶ τῆς ἀληθείας λέγειν.	"All the same," I said, "I mustn't shrink from following the argument through and examining it, as long as I take you to be saying what you really think. Because it seems to me, Thrasymachus, that you're honestly not joking now, but saying what you believe to be the truth."
	τί δέ σοι, ἔφη, τοῦτο διαφέρει, εἴτε μοι δοκεῖ εἴτε μή, ἀλλ' οὐ τὸν λόγον ἐλέγχεις; [349b]	"What difference does it make to you," he said, "whether I believe it or not? Why don't you just refute the argument?" [349b]
	οὐδέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. ἀλλὰ τόδε μοι πειρῶ ἔτι πρὸς τούτοις ἀποκρίνασθαι· ὁ δίκαιος τοῦ δικαίου δοκεῖ τί σοι ἂν ἐθέλειν πλέον ἔχειν;	"None," I said. "But try to answer me this as well. Do you think a just man would want to have more than another just man?"
	οὐδαμῶς, ἔφη· οὐ γὰρ ἂν ἦν ἀστεῖος, ὥσπερ νῦν, καὶ εὐήθης.	"Not at all," he said. "Otherwise he wouldn't be the charming, good-natured fellow he is."
349b	τί δέ; τῆς δικαίας πράξεως;	"What about more than the just action?"
	οὐδὲ τῆς δικαίας, ἔφη.	"Not more than the just action either," he said.
	τοῦ δὲ ἀδίκου πότερον ἀξιοῖ ἂν πλεονεκτεῖν καὶ ἡγοῖτο δίκαιον εἶναι, ἢ οὐκ ἂν ἡγοῖτο;	"And would he think it right to outdo the unjust man, and consider that just, or wouldn't he?"
	ἡγοῖτ' ἄν, ἦ δ' ὅς, καὶ ἀξιοῖ, ἀλλ' οὐκ ἂν δύναιτο.	"He'd consider it just," he said, "and think it right, but he wouldn't be able to."
	ἀλλ' οὐ τοῦτο, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐρωτῶ, ἀλλ' εἰ τοῦ μὲν [349c] δικαίου μὴ ἀξιοῖ πλέον ἔχειν μηδὲ βούλεται ὁ δίκαιος, τοῦ δὲ ἀδίκου;	"That's not what I'm asking," I said. "I'm asking whether the just man doesn't think it right, and doesn't want, to have more than [349c] the just man, but does want to have more than the unjust."
	ἀλλ' οὕτως, ἔφη, ἔχει.	"That's how it is," he said.
	τί δὲ δὴ ὁ ἄδικος; ἆρα ἀξιοῖ τοῦ δικαίου πλεονεκτεῖν καὶ τῆς δικαίας πράξεως;	"And what about the unjust man? Does he think it right to outdo the just man and the just action?"
349c	πῶς γὰρ οὔκ; ἔφη, ὅς γε πάντων πλέον ἔχειν ἀξιοῖ;	"Of course," he said, "since he thinks it right to have more than everybody."
	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἀδίκου γε ἀνθρώπου τε καὶ πράξεως ὁ ἄδικος πλεονεκτήσει καὶ ἀμιλλήσεται ὡς ἁπάντων πλεῖστον αὐτὸς λάβῃ;	"So the unjust man will outdo an unjust person and an unjust action too, and will compete to take the most of everything for himself?"
	ἔστι ταῦτα.	"That's right."
	ὧδε δὴ λέγωμεν, ἔφην· ὁ δίκαιος τοῦ μὲν ὁμοίου οὐ πλεονεκτεῖ, τοῦ δὲ ἀνομοίου, ὁ δὲ ἄδικος τοῦ τε ὁμοίου καὶ [349d] τοῦ ἀνομοίου;	"Then let's put it this way," I said. "The just man doesn't outdo his like, but only his unlike, while the unjust man outdoes both his like and [349d] his unlike?"
	ἄριστα, ἔφη, εἴρηκας.	"Excellently put," he said.
	ἔστιν δέ γε, ἔφην, φρόνιμός τε καὶ ἀγαθὸς ὁ ἄδικος, ὁ δὲ δίκαιος οὐδέτερα;	
	καὶ τοῦτ', ἔφη, εὖ.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		“And the unjust man,” I said, “is intelligent and good, and the just man neither?”
		“That’s well put too,” he said.
349d	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, καὶ ἔοικε τῷ φρονίμῳ καὶ τῷ ἀγαθῷ ὁ ἄδικος, ὁ δὲ δίκαιος οὐκ ἔοικεν;	“So,” I said, “the unjust man also resembles the intelligent and the good, and the just man doesn’t?”
	πῶς γὰρ οὐ μέλλει, ἔφη, ὁ τοιοῦτος ὢν καὶ ἐοικέναι τοῖς τοιούτοις, ὁ δὲ μὴ ἐοικέναι;	“How could it be otherwise?” he said. “Someone of that kind must resemble people of that kind, and the other must not.”
	καλῶς. τοιοῦτος ἄρα ἐστὶν ἑκάτερος αὐτῶν οἵσπερ ἔοικεν;	“Fine. So each of them is of the same kind as those he resembles?”
	ἀλλὰ τί μέλλει; ἔφη.	“What else would he be?” he said.
	εἶεν, ὦ Θρασύμαχε· μουσικὸν δέ τινα λέγεις, ἕτερον δὲ 349e ἄμουσον;	“Very well, Thrasymachus. You call one man musical, and another 349e unmusical?”
	ἔγωγε.	“I do.”
	πότερον φρόνιμον καὶ πότερον ἄφρονα;	“Which of them is intelligent, and which unintelligent?”
	τὸν μὲν μουσικὸν δήπου φρόνιμον, τὸν δὲ ἄμουσον ἄφρονα.	“The musical one is intelligent, surely, and the unmusical one unintelligent.”
	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἅπερ φρόνιμον, ἀγαθόν, ἃ δὲ ἄφρονα, κακόν;	“And good in the things he’s intelligent in, and bad in the things he’s unintelligent in?”
	ναί.	“Yes.”
349e	τί δὲ ἰατρικόν; οὐχ οὕτως;	“And the same with a doctor?”
	οὕτως.	“The same.”
	δοκεῖ ἂν οὖν τίς σοι, ὦ ἄριστε, μουσικὸς ἀνὴρ ἁρμοττόμενος λύραν ἐθέλειν μουσικοῦ ἀνδρὸς ἐν τῇ ἐπιτάσει καὶ ἀνέσει τῶν χορδῶν πλεονεκτεῖν ἢ ἀξιοῦν πλέον ἔχειν;	“Now do you think, my excellent friend, that a musician tuning his lyre would want to outdo another musician in tightening and loosening the strings, or think it right to have more?”
	οὐκ ἔμοιγε.	“I don’t.”
	τί δέ; ἀμούσου;	“What about outdoing an unmusical man?”
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη.	“Necessarily,” he said.
	τί δὲ ἰατρικός; ἐν τῇ ἐδωδῇ ἢ πόσει ἐθέλειν ἄν τι ἰατρικοῦ πλεονεκτεῖν ἢ ἀνδρὸς ἢ πράγματος;	“And a doctor? In prescribing food or drink, would he want to outdo a doctor, or medical practice?”
	οὐ δῆτα.	“Certainly not.”
	μὴ ἰατρικοῦ δέ;	“But a non-doctor?”
	ναί.	“Yes.”
350a	περὶ πάσης δὴ ὅρα ἐπιστήμης τε καὶ ἀνεπιστημοσύνης εἴ τίς σοι δοκεῖ ἐπιστήμων ὁστισοῦν πλείω ἂν ἐθέλειν αἱρεῖσθαι ἢ ὅσα ἄλλος ἐπιστήμων ἢ πράττειν ἢ λέγειν, καὶ οὐ ταὐτὰ τῷ ὁμοίῳ ἑαυτῷ εἰς τὴν αὐτὴν πρᾶξιν.	“Now look at every kind of knowledge and ignorance, and see whether you think anyone with knowledge, whoever he is, would want to choose to do or say more than another person with knowledge, rather than the same as someone like himself in the same action.”
	ἀλλ’ ἴσως, ἔφη, ἀνάγκη τοῦτό γε οὕτως ἔχειν.	“Well, perhaps,” he said, “it has to be that way.”
	τί δὲ ὁ ἀνεπιστήμων; οὐχὶ ὁμοίως μὲν ἐπιστήμονος 350b πλεονεκτήσειεν ἄν, ὁμοίως δὲ ἀνεπιστήμονος;	
	ἴσως.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ὁ δὲ ἐπιστήμων σοφός;	"And what about the ignorant man? Wouldn't he outdo the knowledgeable [350b] and the ignorant alike?"
	φημί.	"Perhaps."
	ὁ δὲ σοφὸς ἀγαθός;	"And the knowledgeable man is wise?"
	φημί.	"I say so."
		"And the wise man is good?"
		"I say so."
350b	ὁ ἄρα ἀγαθός τε καὶ σοφὸς τοῦ μὲν ὁμοίου οὐκ ἐθελήσει πλεονεκτεῖν, τοῦ δὲ ἀνομοίου τε καὶ ἐναντίου.	"So the man who is good and wise won't want to outdo his like, but only his unlike and opposite."
	ἔοικεν, ἔφη.	"So it seems," he said.
	ὁ δὲ κακός τε καὶ ἀμαθὴς τοῦ τε ὁμοίου καὶ τοῦ ἐναντίου.	"While the bad and ignorant man will outdo both his like and his opposite."
	φαίνεται.	"Apparently."
	οὐκοῦν, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὁ ἄδικος ἡμῖν τοῦ ἀνομοίου τε καὶ ὁμοίου πλεονεκτεῖ; ἢ οὐχ οὕτως ἔλεγες;	"Now, Thrasymachus," I said, "our unjust man outdoes both his unlike and his like? Isn't that what you said?"
	ἔγωγε, ἔφη. [350c]	"I did," he said. [350c]
	ὁ δέ γε δίκαιος τοῦ μὲν ὁμοίου οὐ πλεονεκτήσει, τοῦ δὲ ἀνομοίου;	"And the just man won't outdo his like, but will outdo his unlike?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
350c	ἔοικεν ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὁ μὲν δίκαιος τῷ σοφῷ καὶ ἀγαθῷ, ὁ δὲ ἄδικος τῷ κακῷ καὶ ἀμαθεῖ.	"So the just man resembles the wise and good man," I said, "and the unjust man resembles the bad and ignorant one."
	κινδυνεύει.	"It looks that way."
	ἀλλὰ μὴν ὡμολογοῦμεν, ᾧ γε ὅμοιος ἑκάτερος εἴη, τοιοῦτον καὶ ἑκάτερον εἶναι.	"But we agreed that each is of the same kind as the one he resembles."
	ὡμολογοῦμεν γάρ.	"Yes, we did."
	ὁ μὲν ἄρα δίκαιος ἡμῖν ἀναπέφανται ὢν ἀγαθός τε καὶ σοφός, ὁ δὲ ἄδικος ἀμαθής τε καὶ κακός.	"Then the just man has turned out to be good and wise, and the unjust man ignorant and bad."
	ὁ δὴ Θρασύμαχος ὡμολόγησε μὲν πάντα ταῦτα, οὐχ [350d] ὡς ἐγὼ νῦν ῥᾳδίως λέγω, ἀλλ' ἑλκόμενος καὶ μόγις, μετὰ ἱδρῶτος θαυμαστοῦ ὅσου, ἅτε καὶ θέρους ὄντος—τότε καὶ εἶδον ἐγώ, πρότερον δὲ οὔπω, Θρασύμαχον ἐρυθριῶντα—ἐπειδὴ δὲ οὖν διωμολογησάμεθα τὴν δικαιοσύνην ἀρετὴν εἶναι καὶ σοφίαν, τὴν δὲ ἀδικίαν κακίαν τε καὶ ἀμαθίαν, εἶεν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοῦτο μὲν ἡμῖν οὕτω κείσθω, ἔφαμεν δὲ δὴ καὶ ἰσχυρὸν εἶναι τὴν ἀδικίαν. ἢ οὐ μέμνησαι, ὦ Θρασύμαχε;	Now Thrasymachus agreed to all this, not [350d] easily, the way I'm telling it now, but dragged along, reluctantly, sweating an amazing amount, since it was summer as well—and it was then that I saw something I had never seen before: Thrasymachus blushing. But once we had agreed that justice is excellence and wisdom, and injustice badness and ignorance, I said, "All right, let's take that as settled. But we also said that injustice was strong. Or don't you remember, Thrasymachus?"
350d	μέμνημαι, ἔφη· ἀλλ' ἔμοιγε οὐδὲ ἃ νῦν λέγεις ἀρέσκει, καὶ ἔχω περὶ αὐτῶν λέγειν. εἰ οὖν λέγοιμι, εὖ οἶδ' ὅτι [350e] δημηγορεῖν ἄν με φαίης. ἢ οὖν ἔα με εἰπεῖν ὅσα βούλομαι,	"I remember," he said. "But I'm not happy with what you're saying now either, and I have something to say about it. Only, if I said it, I know per-

GREEK

ENGLISH

ἤ, εἰ βούλει ἐρωτᾶν, ἐρώτα· ἐγὼ δέ σοι, ὥσπερ ταῖς γραυσὶν ταῖς τοὺς μύθους λεγούσαις, "εἶεν" ἐρῶ καὶ κατανεύσομαι καὶ ἀνανεύσομαι.

μηδαμῶς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, παρά γε τὴν σαυτοῦ δόξαν.

ὥστε σοί, ἔφη, ἀρέσκειν, ἐπειδήπερ οὐκ ἐᾷς λέγειν. καίτοι τί ἄλλο βούλει;

οὐδὲν μὰ Δία, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀλλ' εἴπερ τοῦτο ποιήσεις, ποίει· ἐγὼ δὲ ἐρωτήσω.

fectly well [350e] you'd say I was making a public speech. So either let me say as much as I like, or, if you want to ask questions, ask them, and I'll say 'very well' to you, the way people do to old women telling stories, and nod yes and shake my head no."

"Not against your own opinion, please," I said.

"Just to please you," he said, "since you won't let me speak. What else do you want?"

"Nothing, by Zeus," I said. "If that's what you're going to do, do it. I'll ask the questions."

350e ἐρώτα δή.

"Ask away, then."

τοῦτο τοίνυν ἐρωτῶ, ὅπερ ἄρτι, ἵνα καὶ ἑξῆς διασκεψώμεθα [351a] >τὸν λόγον, ὁποῖόν τι τυγχάνει ὂν δικαιοσύνη πρὸς ἀδικίαν. ἐλέχθη γάρ που ὅτι καὶ δυνατώτερον καὶ ἰσχυρότερον εἴη ἀδικία δικαιοσύνης· νῦν δέ γ', ἔφην, εἴπερ σοφία τε καὶ ἀρετή ἐστιν δικαιοσύνη, ῥᾳδίως οἶμαι φανήσεται καὶ ἰσχυρότερον ἀδικίας, ἐπειδήπερ ἐστὶν ἀμαθία ἡ ἀδικία— οὐδεὶς ἂν ἔτι τοῦτο ἀγνοήσειεν—ἀλλ' οὔ τι οὕτως ἁπλῶς, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, ἔγωγε ἐπιθυμῶ, ἀλλὰ τῇδέ πῃ σκέψασθαι· [351b] πόλιν φαίης ἂν ἄδικον εἶναι καὶ ἄλλας πόλεις ἐπιχειρεῖν δουλοῦσθαι ἀδίκως καὶ καταδεδουλῶσθαι, πολλὰς δὲ καὶ ὑφ' ἑαυτῇ ἔχειν δουλωσαμένην;

"Well, I'm asking the same thing I asked just now, so that we can pursue [351a] the argument in order: what sort of thing justice is, compared with injustice. It was said, I think, that injustice is more powerful and stronger than justice. But now," I said, "if justice is wisdom and excellence, it will easily turn out, I think, to be stronger than injustice too, since injustice is ignorance—nobody could fail to see that any longer. Still, I don't want to look at it quite so simply, Thrasymachus; I'd rather look at it this way. [351b] Would you say that a city can be unjust, and try to enslave other cities unjustly, and succeed in enslaving them, and hold many of them enslaved under itself?"

351b πῶς γὰρ οὔκ; ἔφη. καὶ τοῦτό γε ἡ ἀρίστη μάλιστα ποιήσει καὶ τελεώτατα οὖσα ἄδικος.

μανθάνω, ἔφην, ὅτι σὸς οὗτος ἦν ὁ λόγος. ἀλλὰ τόδε περὶ αὐτοῦ σκοπῶ· πότερον ἡ κρείττων γιγνομένη πόλις πόλεως ἄνευ δικαιοσύνης τὴν δύναμιν ταύτην ἕξει, ἢ ἀνάγκη αὐτῇ μετὰ δικαιοσύνης; [351c]

εἰ μέν, ἔφη, ὡς σὺ ἄρτι ἔλεγες ἔχει—ἡ δικαιοσύνη σοφία—μετὰ δικαιοσύνης· εἰ δ' ὡς ἐγὼ ἔλεγον, μετὰ ἀδικίας.

πάνυ ἄγαμαι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, ὅτι οὐκ ἐπινεύεις μόνον καὶ ἀνανεύεις, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἀποκρίνῃ πάνυ καλῶς.

σοὶ γάρ, ἔφη, χαρίζομαι.

"Of course," he said. "And it's the best city, the one that is most perfectly unjust, that will do this most of all."

"I understand," I said, "that this was your position. But here's the point I'm examining: will a city that becomes stronger than another have this power without justice, or must it have it with justice?" [351c]

"If it's as you were saying just now," he said, "that justice is wisdom, then with justice; but if it's as I was saying, with injustice."

"I'm delighted, Thrasymachus," I said, "that you aren't just nodding and shaking your head, but giving very fine answers."

"That's to please you," he said.

351c εὖ γε σὺ ποιῶν· ἀλλὰ δὴ καὶ τόδε μοι χάρισαι καὶ λέγε· δοκεῖς ἂν ἢ πόλιν ἢ στρατόπεδον ἢ λῃστὰς ἢ κλέπτας ἢ ἄλλο τι ἔθνος, ὅσα κοινῇ ἐπί τι ἔρχεται ἀδίκως, πρᾶξαι ἄν τι δύνασθαι, εἰ ἀδικοῖεν ἀλλήλους; [351d]

οὐ δῆτα, ἦ δ' ὅς.

"And very kind of you. But please me in this too, and tell me: do you think a city, or an army, or a band of robbers or thieves, or any other group that sets out together to do something unjustly, could

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τί δ' εἰ μὴ ἀδικοῖεν; οὐ μᾶλλον;	accomplish anything if its members wronged one another? 351d
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly not," he said.
	στάσεις γάρ που, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, ἥ γε ἀδικία καὶ μίση καὶ μάχας ἐν ἀλλήλοις παρέχει, ἡ δὲ δικαιοσύνη ὁμόνοιαν καὶ φιλίαν· ἦ γάρ;	"And if they didn't wrong one another? Wouldn't they be better able to?"
	ἔστω, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἵνα σοι μὴ διαφέρωμαι.	"Certainly."
		"Because injustice, Thrasymachus, produces factions and hatreds and fights among people, while justice produces unity of mind and friendship. Isn't that so?"
		"Let it be so," he said, "so as not to quarrel with you."
351d	ἀλλ' εὖ γε σὺ ποιῶν, ὦ ἄριστε. τόδε δέ μοι λέγε· ἆρα εἰ τοῦτο ἔργον ἀδικίας, μῖσος ἐμποιεῖν ὅπου ἂν ἐνῇ, οὐ καὶ ἐν ἐλευθέροις τε καὶ δούλοις ἐγγιγνομένη μισεῖν ποιήσει ἀλλήλους καὶ στασιάζειν καὶ ἀδυνάτους εἶναι κοινῇ μετ' 351e ἀλλήλων πράττειν;	"That's good of you, my excellent friend. Now tell me this: if it's the work of injustice to produce hatred wherever it is, then whenever it arises among free men or slaves, won't it make them hate one another and split into factions and be unable to act together with 351e one another?"
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
	τί δὲ ἂν ἐν δυοῖν ἐγγένηται; οὐ διοίσονται καὶ μισήσουσιν καὶ ἐχθροὶ ἔσονται ἀλλήλοις τε καὶ τοῖς δικαίοις;	"And what if it arises in two people? Won't they be at odds and hate each other, and be enemies both to each other and to the just?"
	ἔσονται, ἔφη.	"They will," he said.
	ἐὰν δὲ δή, ὦ θαυμάσιε, ἐν ἑνὶ ἐγγένηται ἀδικία, μῶν μὴ ἀπολεῖ τὴν αὑτῆς δύναμιν, ἢ οὐδὲν ἧττον ἕξει;	"And if injustice arises in a single person, my remarkable friend, surely it won't lose its power? Or will it keep it just the same?"
351e	μηδὲν ἧττον ἐχέτω, ἔφη.	"Let it keep it just the same," he said.
	οὐκοῦν τοιάνδε τινὰ φαίνεται ἔχουσα τὴν δύναμιν, οἵαν, ᾧ ἂν ἐγγένηται, εἴτε πόλει τινὶ εἴτε γένει εἴτε στρατοπέδῳ εἴτε 352a ἄλλῳ ὁτῳοῦν, πρῶτον μὲν ἀδύνατον αὐτὸ ποιεῖν πράττειν μεθ' αὑτοῦ διὰ τὸ στασιάζειν καὶ διαφέρεσθαι, ἔτι δ' ἐχθρὸν εἶναι ἑαυτῷ τε καὶ τῷ ἐναντίῳ παντὶ καὶ τῷ δικαίῳ; οὐχ οὕτως;	"Then it apparently has a power of this kind: whatever it arises in, whether a city or a clan or an army or 352a anything else at all, it first makes that thing unable to act together with itself, because of faction and disagreement, and then makes it an enemy both to itself and to everything opposed to it, including the just. Isn't that so?"
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
352a	καὶ ἐν ἑνὶ δὴ οἶμαι ἐνοῦσα ταὐτὰ ταῦτα ποιήσει ἅπερ πέφυκεν ἐργάζεσθαι· πρῶτον μὲν ἀδύνατον αὐτὸν πράττειν ποιήσει στασιάζοντα καὶ οὐχ ὁμονοοῦντα αὐτὸν ἑαυτῷ, ἔπειτα ἐχθρὸν καὶ ἑαυτῷ καὶ τοῖς δικαίοις· ἦ γάρ;	"And when it's in a single person too, I suppose, it will do the very things it naturally produces. First it will make him unable to act, being at odds and not of one mind with himself, and then an enemy both to himself and to the just. Isn't that right?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	δίκαιοι δέ γ' εἰσίν, ὦ φίλε, καὶ οἱ θεοί;	"And the gods are just too, my friend?"
	ἔστω, ἔφη. 352b	"Let it be so," he said. 352b
	καὶ θεοῖς ἄρα ἐχθρὸς ἔσται ὁ ἄδικος, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, ὁ δὲ δίκαιος φίλος.	

GREEK	ENGLISH
εὐωχοῦ τοῦ λόγου, ἔφη, θαρρῶν· οὐ γὰρ ἔγωγέ σοι ἐναντιώσομαι, ἵνα μὴ τοῖσδε ἀπέχθωμαι.	"Then the unjust man will be an enemy to the gods as well, Thrasymachus, and the just man their friend." "Feast on your argument," he said, "and enjoy it. I won't oppose you, so as not to make enemies of the people here."
352b ἴθι δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ τὰ λοιπά μοι τῆς ἑστιάσεως ἀποπλήρωσον ἀποκρινόμενος ὥσπερ καὶ νῦν. ὅτι μὲν γὰρ καὶ σοφώτεροι καὶ ἀμείνους καὶ δυνατώτεροι πράττειν οἱ δίκαιοι φαίνονται, οἱ δὲ ἄδικοι οὐδὲ πράττειν μετ' ἀλλήλων οἷοί 352c τε—ἀλλὰ δὴ καὶ οὕς φαμεν ἐρρωμένως πώποτέ τι μετ' ἀλλήλων κοινῇ πρᾶξαι ἀδίκους ὄντας, τοῦτο οὐ παντάπασιν ἀληθὲς λέγομεν· οὐ γὰρ ἂν ἀπείχοντο ἀλλήλων κομιδῇ ὄντες ἄδικοι, ἀλλὰ δῆλον ὅτι ἐνῆν τις αὐτοῖς δικαιοσύνη, ἣ αὐτοὺς ἐποίει μήτοι καὶ ἀλλήλους γε καὶ ἐφ' οὓς ἦσαν ἅμα ἀδικεῖν, δι' ἣν ἔπραξαν ἃ ἔπραξαν, ὥρμησαν δὲ ἐπὶ τὰ ἄδικα ἀδικίᾳ ἡμιμόχθηροι ὄντες, ἐπεὶ οἵ γε παμπόνηροι καὶ τελέως ἄδικοι τελέως εἰσὶ καὶ πράττειν ἀδύνατοι—ταῦτα 352d μὲν οὖν ὅτι οὕτως ἔχει μανθάνω, ἀλλ' οὐχ ὡς σὺ τὸ πρῶτον ἐτίθεσο· εἰ δὲ καὶ ἄμεινον ζῶσιν οἱ δίκαιοι τῶν ἀδίκων καὶ εὐδαιμονέστεροί εἰσιν, ὅπερ τὸ ὕστερον προυθέμεθα σκέψασθαι, σκεπτέον.	"Come on, then," I said, "fill up the rest of my banquet by answering the way you have been. We've seen that the just are wiser and better and more capable of acting, while the unjust can't even act together— 352c and in fact, when we say that people who are unjust have ever vigorously accomplished anything together, what we're saying isn't entirely true. For if they had been completely unjust, they wouldn't have kept their hands off one another. Clearly there was some justice in them, which kept them from wronging one another at the same time as the people they were attacking, and it was through this that they did what they did. They set out on their unjust deeds only half-corrupted by injustice, since the utterly wicked and perfectly unjust are perfectly incapable of acting as well. That this 352d is how things are, I understand, and not as you first proposed. But whether the just also live better than the unjust and are happier—the question we proposed to examine next—is something we must examine.
352d φαίνονται μὲν οὖν καὶ νῦν, ὡς γέ μοι δοκεῖ, ἐξ ὧν εἰρήκαμεν· ὅμως δ' ἔτι βέλτιον σκεπτέον. οὐ γὰρ περὶ τοῦ ἐπιτυχόντος ὁ λόγος, ἀλλὰ περὶ τοῦ ὅντινα τρόπον χρὴ ζῆν.	"They do appear to, even now, I think, from what we've said. Still, we must look into it more carefully. For the argument isn't about some chance matter, but about how one ought to live."

THE FUNCTION OF THE SOUL

Socrates argues justice is the soul's excellence, and Glaucon asks for a fuller defense.

GREEK	ENGLISH
SOCRATES σκόπει δή, ἔφη.	SOCRATES "Look into it, then," he said.
σκοπῶ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. καί μοι λέγε· δοκεῖ τί σοι εἶναι ἵππου ἔργον; 352e	"I am," I said. "Tell me: do you think a horse has some function?" 352e
ἔμοιγε.	"I do."
ἆρ' οὖν τοῦτο ἂν θείης καὶ ἵππου καὶ ἄλλου ὁτουοῦν ἔργον, ὃ ἂν ἢ μόνῳ ἐκείνῳ ποιῇ τις ἢ ἄριστα;	"And would you take the function of a horse, or of anything else, to be what one can do only with it, or best with it?"
οὐ μανθάνω, ἔφη.	"I don't understand," he said.
ἀλλ' ὧδε· ἔσθ' ὅτῳ ἂν ἄλλῳ ἴδοις ἢ ὀφθαλμοῖς;	"Look at it this way: is there anything you could see with except eyes?"
οὐ δῆτα.	
τί δέ; ἀκούσαις ἄλλῳ ἢ ὠσίν;	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	οὐδαμῶς.	“Certainly not.”
	οὐκοῦν δικαίως ἂν ταῦτα τούτων φαμὲν ἔργα εἶναι;	“Or hear with, except ears?”
	πάνυ γε.	“Not at all.”
		“So we’d be right to say that these are their functions?”
		“Certainly.”
353a	τί δέ; μαχαίρᾳ ἂν ἀμπέλου κλῆμα ἀποτέμοις καὶ σμίλῃ καὶ ἄλλοις πολλοῖς;	“And what about this: you could cut off a vine shoot with a knife or a chisel or many other things?”
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	“Of course.”
	ἀλλ’ οὐδενί γ’ ἂν οἶμαι οὕτω καλῶς ὡς δρεπάνῳ τῷ ἐπὶ τούτῳ ἐργασθέντι.	“But with nothing, I imagine, as well as with a pruning hook made for the purpose.”
	ἀληθῆ.	“True.”
	ἆρ’ οὖν οὐ τοῦτο τούτου ἔργον θήσομεν;	“So shall we take this to be its function?”
	θήσομεν μὲν οὖν.	“Yes, we shall.”
	νῦν δὴ οἶμαι ἄμεινον ἂν μάθοις ὃ ἄρτι ἠρώτων, πυνθανόμενος εἰ οὐ τοῦτο ἑκάστου εἴη ἔργον ὃ ἂν ἢ μόνον τι ἢ κάλλιστα τῶν ἄλλων ἀπεργάζηται.	“Now I think you’ll better understand what I was asking just now, when I wanted to know whether the function of each thing isn’t what it alone accomplishes, or accomplishes better than anything else.”
	ἀλλά, ἔφη, μανθάνω τε καί μοι δοκεῖ τοῦτο ἑκάστου 353b πράγματος ἔργον εἶναι.	“Yes,” he said, “I understand, and I think that is the function of each 353b thing.”
353b	εἶεν, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ. οὐκοῦν καὶ ἀρετὴ δοκεῖ σοι εἶναι ἑκάστῳ ᾧπερ καὶ ἔργον τι προστέτακται; ἴωμεν δὲ ἐπὶ τὰ αὐτὰ πάλιν· ὀφθαλμῶν, φαμέν, ἔστι τι ἔργον;	“Very well,” I said. “And do you think there is also an excellence for each thing to which some function is assigned? Let’s go back to the same examples. Eyes, we say, have a function?”
	ἔστιν.	“They do.”
	ἆρ’ οὖν καὶ ἀρετὴ ὀφθαλμῶν ἔστιν;	“So do eyes have an excellence too?”
	καὶ ἀρετή.	“An excellence too.”
	τί δέ; ὤτων ἦν τι ἔργον;	“And ears had a function?”
	ναί.	“Yes.”
	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἀρετή;	“And so an excellence too?”
	καὶ ἀρετή.	“An excellence too.”
	τί δὲ πάντων πέρι τῶν ἄλλων; οὐχ οὕτω;	“And what about all the other things? Isn’t it the same?”
	οὕτω.	“It is.”
	ἔχε δή· ἆρ’ ἄν ποτε ὄμματα τὸ αὑτῶν ἔργον καλῶς 353c ἀπεργάσαιντο μὴ ἔχοντα τὴν αὑτῶν οἰκείαν ἀρετήν, ἀλλ’ ἀντὶ τῆς ἀρετῆς κακίαν;	“Hold on, then. Could eyes ever perform their function well 353c if they lacked their own proper excellence and had badness instead of excellence?”
353c	καὶ πῶς ἄν; ἔφη· τυφλότητα γὰρ ἴσως λέγεις ἀντὶ τῆς ὄψεως.	“How could they?” he said. “I suppose you mean blindness instead of sight.”

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἤτις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, αὐτῶν ἡ ἀρετή· οὐ γάρ πω τοῦτο ἐρωτῶ, ἀλλ' εἰ τῇ οἰκείᾳ μὲν ἀρετῇ τὸ αὐτῶν ἔργον εὖ ἐργάσεται τὰ ἐργαζόμενα, κακίᾳ δὲ κακῶς.	"Whatever their excellence may be," I said. "I'm not asking about that yet, only whether things that have a function perform it well through their own proper excellence, and badly through badness."
	ἀληθές, ἔφη, τοῦτό γε λέγεις.	"That much is true," he said.
	οὐκοῦν καὶ ὦτα στερόμενα τῆς αὑτῶν ἀρετῆς κακῶς τὸ αὑτῶν ἔργον ἀπεργάσεται;	"So ears too, deprived of their own excellence, will perform their function badly?"
	πάνυ γε. 353d	"Certainly." 353d
	τίθεμεν οὖν καὶ τἆλλα πάντα εἰς τὸν αὐτὸν λόγον;	"And do we apply the same argument to everything else?"
	ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ.	"I think so."
353d	ἴθι δή, μετὰ ταῦτα τόδε σκέψαι. ψυχῆς ἔστιν τι ἔργον ὃ ἄλλῳ τῶν ὄντων οὐδ' ἂν ἑνὶ πράξαις, οἷον τὸ τοιόνδε· τὸ ἐπιμελεῖσθαι καὶ ἄρχειν καὶ βουλεύεσθαι καὶ τὰ τοιαῦτα πάντα, ἔσθ' ὅτῳ ἄλλῳ ἢ ψυχῇ δικαίως ἂν αὐτὰ ἀποδοῖμεν καὶ φαῖμεν ἴδια ἐκείνης εἶναι;	"Come on, then, and consider this next. Does the soul have a function that you couldn't perform with anything else there is? Something like this: taking care of things, ruling, deliberating, and everything of that sort—is there anything other than a soul to which we could rightly assign these and say they were its own?"
	οὐδενὶ ἄλλῳ.	"Nothing else."
	τί δ' αὖ τὸ ζῆν; οὐ ψυχῆς φήσομεν ἔργον εἶναι;	"And what about living? Won't we say that's a function of the soul?"
	μάλιστά γ', ἔφη.	"Most certainly," he said.
	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἀρετήν φαμέν τινα ψυχῆς εἶναι;	"And we also say the soul has an excellence?"
	φαμέν. 353e	"We do." 353e
353e	ἆρ' οὖν ποτε, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, ψυχὴ τὰ αὑτῆς ἔργα εὖ ἀπεργάσεται στερομένη τῆς οἰκείας ἀρετῆς, ἢ ἀδύνατον;	"Then will a soul ever perform its functions well, Thrasymachus, if it's deprived of its own proper excellence, or is that impossible?"
	ἀδύνατον.	"Impossible."
	ἀνάγκη ἄρα κακῇ ψυχῇ κακῶς ἄρχειν καὶ ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, τῇ δὲ ἀγαθῇ πάντα ταῦτα εὖ πράττειν.	"So a bad soul must rule and take care of things badly, and a good one do all these things well."
	ἀνάγκη.	"It must."
	οὐκοῦν ἀρετήν γε συνεχωρήσαμεν ψυχῆς εἶναι δικαιοσύνην, κακίαν δὲ ἀδικίαν;	"And we agreed that justice is the soul's excellence, and injustice its badness?"
	συνεχωρήσαμεν γάρ.	"We did."
	ἡ μὲν ἄρα δικαία ψυχὴ καὶ ὁ δίκαιος ἀνὴρ εὖ βιώσεται, κακῶς δὲ ὁ ἄδικος.	"So the just soul and the just man will live well, and the unjust man badly."
	φαίνεται, ἔφη, κατὰ τὸν σὸν λόγον.	"So it appears," he said, "by your argument."
	ἀλλὰ μὴν ὅ γε εὖ ζῶν μακάριός τε καὶ εὐδαίμων, ὁ δὲ μὴ τἀναντία.	"And surely whoever lives well is blessed and happy, and whoever doesn't is the opposite."
354a	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
	ὁ μὲν δίκαιος ἄρα εὐδαίμων, ὁ δ' ἄδικος ἄθλιος.	"So the just man is happy, and the unjust man miserable."
	ἔστω, ἔφη.	"Let it be so," he said.
	ἀλλὰ μὴν ἄθλιόν γε εἶναι οὐ λυσιτελεῖ, εὐδαίμονα δέ.	

GREEK

πῶς γὰρ οὔ;

οὐδέποτ᾽ ἄρα, ὦ μακάριε Θρασύμαχε, λυσιτελέστερον ἀδικία δικαιοσύνης.

ταῦτα δή σοι, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, εἰστιάσθω ἐν τοῖς Βενδιδίοις.

ὑπὸ σοῦ γε, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, ὦ Θρασύμαχε, ἐπειδή μοι πρᾷος ἐγένου καὶ χαλεπαίνων ἐπαύσω. οὐ μέντοι καλῶς γε [354b] εἰστίαμαι, δι᾽ ἐμαυτὸν ἀλλ᾽ οὐ διὰ σέ· ἀλλ᾽ ὥσπερ οἱ λίχνοι τοῦ ἀεὶ παραφερομένου ἀπογεύονται ἁρπάζοντες, πρὶν τοῦ προτέρου μετρίως ἀπολαῦσαι, καὶ ἐγώ μοι δοκῶ οὕτω, πρὶν ὃ τὸ πρῶτον ἐσκοποῦμεν εὑρεῖν, τὸ δίκαιον ὅτι ποτ᾽ ἐστίν, ἀφέμενος ἐκείνου ὁρμῆσαι ἐπὶ τὸ σκέψασθαι περὶ αὐτοῦ εἴτε κακία ἐστὶν καὶ ἀμαθία, εἴτε σοφία καὶ ἀρετή, καὶ ἐμπεσόντος αὖ ὕστερον λόγου, ὅτι λυσιτελέστερον ἡ ἀδικία τῆς δικαιοσύνης, οὐκ ἀπεσχόμην τὸ μὴ οὐκ ἐπὶ τοῦτο ἐλθεῖν ἀπ᾽ ἐκείνου, ὥστε μοι νυνὶ γέγονεν ἐκ τοῦ διαλόγου μηδὲν [354c] εἰδέναι· ὁπότε γὰρ τὸ δίκαιον μὴ οἶδα ὅ ἐστιν, σχολῇ εἴσομαι εἴτε ἀρετή τις οὖσα τυγχάνει εἴτε καὶ οὔ, καὶ πότερον ὁ ἔχων αὐτὸ οὐκ εὐδαίμων ἐστὶν ἢ εὐδαίμων.

ENGLISH

“But it doesn’t pay to be miserable; it pays to be happy.”

“Of course.”

“Then injustice, my blessed Thrasymachus, is never more profitable than justice.”

“Well, Socrates,” he said, “let that be your feast for the Bendidea.”[13]

“Provided by you, Thrasymachus,” I said, “since you’ve turned gentle with me and stopped being harsh. Still, I haven’t feasted [354b] well—through my own fault, not yours. Gluttons snatch a taste of each dish as it’s carried round before they’ve properly enjoyed the one before, and I think I’ve done the same. Before finding what we were first looking into—what justice is—I let go of that and rushed off to examine whether it is badness and ignorance, or wisdom and excellence. Then later, when the argument that injustice is more profitable than justice burst in, I couldn’t keep from leaving the other question and going after this one. So now the upshot of our discussion is that I know [354c] nothing. For when I don’t know what justice is, I’ll hardly know whether it is in fact an excellence or not, or whether the person who has it is unhappy or happy.”

13 The Bendidea was the festival of Bendis being celebrated that day.

Book II

The ring of Gyges, and the founding of a city in words.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
357a	**SOCRATES** ἐγὼ μὲν οὖν ταῦτα εἰπὼν ᾤμην λόγου ἀπηλλάχθαι· τὸ δ' ἦν ἄρα, ὡς ἔοικε, προοίμιον. ὁ γὰρ Γλαύκων ἀεί τε δὴ ἀνδρειότατος ὢν τυγχάνει πρὸς ἅπαντα, καὶ δὴ καὶ τότε τοῦ Θρασυμάχου τὴν ἀπόρρησιν οὐκ ἀπεδέξατο, ἀλλ' ἔφη· ὦ Σώκρατες, πότερον ἡμᾶς βούλει δοκεῖν πεπεικέναι ἢ ὡς [357b] ἀληθῶς πεῖσαι ὅτι παντὶ τρόπῳ ἄμεινόν ἐστιν δίκαιον εἶναι ἢ ἄδικον;	**SOCRATES** When I'd said this, I thought I was done with the discussion. But it turned out, apparently, to have been only a prelude. Glaucon is always extremely bold in everything, and on this occasion too he wouldn't accept Thrasymachus' giving up, but said, "Socrates, do you want to seem to have persuaded us, or to [357b] truly persuade us, that it's better in every way to be just than unjust?"
	ὡς ἀληθῶς, εἶπον, ἔγωγ' ἂν ἑλοίμην, εἰ ἐπ' ἐμοὶ εἴη.	"Truly," I said, "I'd choose that, if it were up to me."
357b	οὐ τοίνυν, ἔφη, ποιεῖς ὃ βούλει. λέγε γάρ μοι· ἆρά σοι δοκεῖ τοιόνδε τι εἶναι ἀγαθόν, ὃ δεξαίμεθ' ἂν ἔχειν οὐ τῶν ἀποβαινόντων ἐφιέμενοι, ἀλλ' αὐτὸ αὑτοῦ ἕνεκα ἀσπαζόμενοι, οἷον τὸ χαίρειν καὶ αἱ ἡδοναὶ ὅσαι ἀβλαβεῖς καὶ μηδὲν εἰς τὸν ἔπειτα χρόνον διὰ ταύτας γίγνεται ἄλλο ἢ χαίρειν ἔχοντα;	"Then you're not doing what you want," he said. "Tell me: do you think there is a kind of good that we'd welcome having not because we want what results from it, but because we value it for its own sake—like enjoyment, and all the harmless pleasures that bring nothing later on except the enjoyment of having them?"
	ἔμοιγε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δοκεῖ τι εἶναι τοιοῦτον. [357c]	"I think there is something of that kind," I said. [357c]
	τί δέ; ὃ αὐτό τε αὑτοῦ χάριν ἀγαπῶμεν καὶ τῶν ἀπ' αὐτοῦ γιγνομένων, οἷον αὖ τὸ φρονεῖν καὶ τὸ ὁρᾶν καὶ τὸ ὑγιαίνειν; τὰ γὰρ τοιαῦτά που δι' ἀμφότερα ἀσπαζόμεθα.	"And what about the kind we love both for its own sake and for what comes from it—like understanding, and seeing, and being healthy? We welcome things like these, I suppose, for both reasons."
357c	ναί, εἶπον.	"Yes," I said.
	τρίτον δὲ ὁρᾷς τι, ἔφη, εἶδος ἀγαθοῦ, ἐν ᾧ τὸ γυμνάζεσθαι καὶ τὸ κάμνοντα ἰατρεύεσθαι καὶ ἰάτρευσίς τε καὶ ὁ ἄλλος χρηματισμός; ταῦτα γὰρ ἐπίπονα φαῖμεν ἄν, ὠφελεῖν δὲ ἡμᾶς, καὶ αὐτὰ μὲν ἑαυτῶν ἕνεκα οὐκ ἂν δεξαίμεθα ἔχειν, [357d] τῶν δὲ μισθῶν τε χάριν καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ὅσα γίγνεται ἀπ' αὐτῶν.	"And do you see a third kind of good," he said, "which includes exercising, and being treated when you're sick, and practicing medicine, and money-making generally? These we'd call burdensome but beneficial to us, and we wouldn't welcome having them for their own sake, [357d] but for the sake of the pay and whatever else comes from them."
	ἔστιν γὰρ οὖν, ἔφην, καὶ τοῦτο τρίτον. ἀλλὰ τί δή;	"Yes, there is this third kind too," I said. "But what of it?"
	ἐν ποίῳ, ἔφη, τούτων τὴν δικαιοσύνην τιθεῖς;	"In which of these kinds," he said, "do you place justice?"
358a	ἐγὼ μὲν οἶμαι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐν τῷ καλλίστῳ, ὃ καὶ δι' αὐτὸ καὶ διὰ τὰ γιγνόμενα ἀπ' αὐτοῦ ἀγαπητέον τῷ μέλλοντι μακαρίῳ ἔσεσθαι.	"I think," I said, "in the finest kind—the one that anyone who is going to be blessed must love both for its own sake and for what comes from it."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	οὐ τοίνυν δοκεῖ, ἔφη, τοῖς πολλοῖς, ἀλλὰ τοῦ ἐπιπόνου εἴδους, ὃ μισθῶν θ' ἕνεκα καὶ εὐδοκιμήσεων διὰ δόξαν ἐπιτηδευτέον, αὐτὸ δὲ δι' αὑτὸ φευκτέον ὡς ὂν χαλεπόν.	"That's not what most people think," he said. "They put it in the burdensome kind, which has to be practiced for the sake of pay and the good name that comes from reputation, but in itself is to be avoided as hard."
	οἶδα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι δοκεῖ οὕτω καὶ πάλαι ὑπὸ Θρασυμάχου ὡς τοιοῦτον ὂν ψέγεται, ἀδικία δ' ἐπαινεῖται· ἀλλ' ἐγώ τις, ὡς ἔοικε, δυσμαθής. 358b	"I know that's what they think," I said, "and Thrasymachus has been disparaging it as that sort of thing for some time now, and praising injustice. But I seem to be a slow learner." 358b
358b	ἴθι δή, ἔφη, ἄκουσον καὶ ἐμοῦ, ἐάν σοι ἔτι ταὐτὰ δοκῇ. Θρασύμαχος γάρ μοι φαίνεται πρῳαίτερον τοῦ δέοντος ὑπὸ σοῦ ὥσπερ ὄφις κεληθῆναι, ἐμοὶ δὲ οὔπω κατὰ νοῦν ἡ ἀπόδειξις γέγονεν περὶ ἑκατέρου· ἐπιθυμῶ γὰρ ἀκοῦσαι τί τ' ἔστιν ἑκάτερον καὶ τίνα ἔχει δύναμιν αὐτὸ καθ' αὑτὸ ἐνὸν ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ, τοὺς δὲ μισθοὺς καὶ τὰ γιγνόμενα ἀπ' αὐτῶν ἐᾶσαι χαίρειν. οὑτωσὶ οὖν ποιήσω, ἐὰν καὶ σοὶ δοκῇ· ἐπανανεώσομαι 358c τὸν Θρασυμάχου λόγον, καὶ πρῶτον μὲν ἐρῶ δικαιοσύνην οἷον εἶναί φασιν καὶ ὅθεν γεγονέναι, δεύτερον δὲ ὅτι πάντες αὐτὸ οἱ ἐπιτηδεύοντες ἄκοντες ἐπιτηδεύουσιν ὡς ἀναγκαῖον ἀλλ' οὐχ ὡς ἀγαθόν, τρίτον δὲ ὅτι εἰκότως αὐτὸ δρῶσι· πολὺ γὰρ ἀμείνων ἄρα ὁ τοῦ ἀδίκου ἢ ὁ τοῦ δικαίου βίος, ὡς λέγουσιν.	"Come on, then," he said, "listen to me too, and see if you still think the same. Thrasymachus seems to me to have been charmed by you, like a snake, sooner than he should have been. But I'm not yet satisfied with the demonstration on either side. I want to hear what each of them is, and what power each has, itself by itself, when it's present in the soul, and to say goodbye to the rewards and what comes from them. So here's what I'll do, if you agree. I'll revive 358c Thrasymachus' argument. First I'll say what sort of thing people say justice is, and where it came from. Second, that all who practice it do so unwillingly, as something necessary, not as something good. Third, that it's reasonable for them to act this way, since the life of the unjust man is, it turns out, far better than the life of the just man—so they say.
358c	ἐπεὶ ἔμοιγε, ὦ Σώκρατες, οὔ τι δοκεῖ οὕτως· ἀπορῶ μέντοι διατεθρυλημένος τὰ ὦτα ἀκούων Θρασυμάχου καὶ μυρίων ἄλλων, τὸν δὲ ὑπὲρ τῆς δικαιοσύνης λόγον, ὡς 358d ἄμεινον ἀδικίας, οὐδενός πω ἀκήκοα ὡς βούλομαι—βούλομαι δὲ αὐτὸ καθ' αὑτὸ ἐγκωμιαζόμενον ἀκοῦσαι—μάλιστα δ' οἶμαι ἂν σοῦ πυθέσθαι. διὸ κατατείνας ἐρῶ τὸν ἄδικον βίον ἐπαινῶν, εἰπὼν δὲ ἐνδείξομαί σοι ὃν τρόπον αὖ βούλομαι καὶ σοῦ ἀκούειν ἀδικίαν μὲν ψέγοντος, δικαιοσύνην δὲ ἐπαινοῦντος. ἀλλ' ὅρα εἴ σοι βουλομένῳ ἃ λέγω.	"Not that I think so myself, Socrates. But I'm at a loss, with my ears ringing from listening to Thrasymachus and countless others, while the argument on behalf of justice, that it's 358d better than injustice, I've never yet heard from anyone the way I want to—I want to hear it praised itself by itself—and I think I'm most likely to hear that from you. So I'm going to speak at full stretch in praise of the unjust life, and in doing so I'll show you how I want to hear you, in turn, criticizing injustice and praising justice. But see whether what I'm proposing is what you want."
358d	πάντων μάλιστα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· περὶ γὰρ τίνος ἂν μᾶλλον πολλάκις τις νοῦν ἔχων χαίροι λέγων καὶ ἀκούων; 358e	"More than anything," I said. "What subject could a person with any sense be happier to talk and hear about again and again?" 358e
	κάλλιστα, ἔφη, λέγεις· καὶ ὃ πρῶτον ἔφην ἐρεῖν, περὶ τούτου ἄκουε, τί ὄν τε καὶ ὅθεν γέγονε δικαιοσύνη.	"Beautifully put," he said. "Then listen to what I said I'd speak about first: what justice is, and where it came from."

WHERE JUSTICE COMES FROM

Glaucon argues that justice is a compromise among the weak, illustrated by the ring of Gyges.

GREEK

358e **SOCRATES** πεφυκέναι γὰρ δή φασιν τὸ μὲν ἀδικεῖν ἀγαθόν, τὸ δὲ ἀδικεῖσθαι κακόν, πλέονι δὲ κακῷ ὑπερβάλλειν τὸ ἀδικεῖσθαι ἢ ἀγαθῷ τὸ ἀδικεῖν, ὥστ' ἐπειδὰν ἀλλήλους ἀδικῶσί τε καὶ ἀδικῶνται καὶ ἀμφοτέρων γεύωνται, τοῖς μὴ δυναμένοις τὸ [359a] μὲν ἐκφεύγειν τὸ δὲ αἱρεῖν δοκεῖ λυσιτελεῖν συνθέσθαι ἀλλήλοις μήτ' ἀδικεῖν μήτ' ἀδικεῖσθαι· καὶ ἐντεῦθεν δὴ ἄρξασθαι νόμους τίθεσθαι καὶ συνθήκας αὐτῶν, καὶ ὀνομάσαι τὸ ὑπὸ τοῦ νόμου ἐπίταγμα νόμιμόν τε καὶ δίκαιον· καὶ εἶναι δὴ ταύτην γένεσίν τε καὶ οὐσίαν δικαιοσύνης, μεταξὺ οὖσαν τοῦ μὲν ἀρίστου ὄντος, ἐὰν ἀδικῶν μὴ διδῷ δίκην, τοῦ δὲ κακίστου, ἐὰν ἀδικούμενος τιμωρεῖσθαι ἀδύνατος ᾖ· τὸ δὲ δίκαιον ἐν μέσῳ ὂν τούτων ἀμφοτέρων ἀγαπᾶσθαι οὐχ ὡς [359b] ἀγαθόν, ἀλλ' ὡς ἀρρωστίᾳ τοῦ ἀδικεῖν τιμώμενον· ἐπεὶ τὸν δυνάμενον αὐτὸ ποιεῖν καὶ ὡς ἀληθῶς ἄνδρα οὐδ' ἂν ἑνί ποτε συνθέσθαι τὸ μήτε ἀδικεῖν μήτε ἀδικεῖσθαι· μαίνεσθαι γὰρ ἄν.

ENGLISH

SOCRATES They say that doing wrong is by nature good, and suffering wrong bad, but that the badness of suffering wrong far exceeds the good of doing it. So when people do wrong to one another and suffer it, and get a taste of both, those who can't [359a] escape the one and get the other decide it pays to make an agreement with one another neither to do wrong nor to suffer it. From there they begin to make laws and covenants among themselves, and to call what the law commands lawful and just. And this, they say, is the origin and essence of justice. It lies between the best thing, which is to do wrong without paying the penalty, and the worst, which is to suffer wrong without being able to take revenge. The just, lying in the middle between these two, is loved not as [359b] a good, but as something honored because people are too weak to do wrong. For anyone able to do it, a real man, would never make an agreement with anyone neither to do wrong nor to suffer it. He'd be mad to.

359b ἡ μὲν οὖν δὴ φύσις δικαιοσύνης, ὦ Σώκρατες, αὕτη τε καὶ τοιαύτη, καὶ ἐξ ὧν πέφυκε τοιαῦτα, ὡς ὁ λόγος.

That, Socrates, according to this argument, is the nature of justice, and that is its character, and those are the conditions it naturally arises from.

ὡς δὲ καὶ οἱ ἐπιτηδεύοντες ἀδυναμίᾳ τοῦ ἀδικεῖν ἄκοντες αὐτὸ ἐπιτηδεύουσι, μάλιστ' ἂν αἰσθοίμεθα, εἰ τοιόνδε ποιήσαιμεν [359c] τῇ διανοίᾳ· δόντες ἐξουσίαν ἑκατέρῳ ποιεῖν ὅτι ἂν βούληται, τῷ τε δικαίῳ καὶ τῷ ἀδίκῳ, εἶτ' ἐπακολουθήσαιμεν θεώμενοι ποῖ ἡ ἐπιθυμία ἑκάτερον ἄξει. ἐπ' αὐτοφώρῳ οὖν λάβοιμεν ἂν τὸν δίκαιον τῷ ἀδίκῳ εἰς ταὐτὸν ἰόντα διὰ τὴν πλεονεξίαν, ὃ πᾶσα φύσις διώκειν πέφυκεν ὡς ἀγαθόν, νόμῳ δὲ βίᾳ παράγεται ἐπὶ τὴν τοῦ ἴσου τιμήν. εἴη δ' ἂν ἡ ἐξουσία ἣν λέγω τοιάδε μάλιστα, εἰ αὐτοῖς γένοιτο οἵαν [359d] ποτέ φασιν δύναμιν τῷ Γύγου τοῦ Λυδοῦ προγόνῳ γενέσθαι. εἶναι μὲν γὰρ αὐτὸν ποιμένα θητεύοντα παρὰ τῷ τότε Λυδίας ἄρχοντι, ὄμβρου δὲ πολλοῦ γενομένου καὶ σεισμοῦ ῥαγῆναί τι τῆς γῆς καὶ γενέσθαι χάσμα κατὰ τὸν τόπον ᾗ ἔνεμεν.

That even those who practice it do so unwillingly, from inability to do wrong, we'd see most clearly if we did the following [359c] in thought. Let's give each of them, the just man and the unjust, the freedom to do whatever he wants, and then follow along and watch where desire will lead each of them. We'd catch the just man red-handed going the same way as the unjust, because of the urge to have more than others. This is what every nature naturally pursues as good, though law forcibly diverts it into respect for equality. The freedom I mean would be most complete if they got the kind of power [359d] that they say once came to the ancestor of Gyges the Lydian. He was, they say, a shepherd in the service of the man who then ruled Lydia. There was a heavy rainstorm and an earthquake, and the ground split open, and a chasm appeared at the spot where he was grazing his flock.[1]

1 Gyges seized the throne of Lydia, in western Asia Minor, in the seventh century BC; Herodotus tells a different story of how he did it.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
359d	ἰδόντα δὲ καὶ θαυμάσαντα καταβῆναι καὶ ἰδεῖν ἄλλα τε δὴ ἃ μυθολογοῦσιν θαυμαστὰ καὶ ἵππον χαλκοῦν, κοῖλον, θυρίδας ἔχοντα, καθ' ἃς ἐγκύψαντα ἰδεῖν ἐνόντα νεκρόν, ὡς φαίνεσθαι μείζω ἢ κατ' ἄνθρωπον, τοῦτον δὲ ἄλλο μὲν οὐδέν, περὶ δὲ [359e] τῇ χειρὶ χρυσοῦν δακτύλιον ὄντα περιελόμενον ἐκβῆναι. συλλόγου δὲ γενομένου τοῖς ποιμέσιν εἰωθότος, ἵν' ἐξαγγέλλοιεν κατὰ μῆνα τῷ βασιλεῖ τὰ περὶ τὰ ποίμνια, ἀφικέσθαι καὶ ἐκεῖνον ἔχοντα τὸν δακτύλιον·	He saw it and was amazed, and went down into it, and saw, among the other marvels they tell of, a hollow bronze horse with little doors in it. Stooping and looking in through these, he saw a corpse inside, which looked larger than human size. It had nothing else on, only a gold ring on its [359e] hand; he took this off and came out. When the shepherds held their usual meeting to report to the king each month about the flocks, he came too, wearing the ring.
359e	καθήμενον οὖν μετὰ τῶν ἄλλων τυχεῖν τὴν σφενδόνην τοῦ δακτυλίου περιαγαγόντα πρὸς ἑαυτὸν εἰς τὸ εἴσω τῆς χειρός, τούτου δὲ γενομένου [360a] >ἀφανῆ αὐτὸν γενέσθαι τοῖς παρακαθημένοις, καὶ διαλέγεσθαι ὡς περὶ οἰχομένου. καὶ τὸν θαυμάζειν τε καὶ πάλιν ἐπιψηλαφῶντα τὸν δακτύλιον στρέψαι ἔξω τὴν σφενδόνην, καὶ στρέψαντα φανερὸν γενέσθαι. καὶ τοῦτο ἐννοήσαντα ἀποπειρᾶσθαι τοῦ δακτυλίου εἰ ταύτην ἔχοι τὴν δύναμιν, καὶ αὐτῷ οὕτω συμβαίνειν, στρέφοντι μὲν εἴσω τὴν σφενδόνην ἀδήλῳ γίγνεσθαι, ἔξω δὲ δήλῳ· αἰσθόμενον δὲ εὐθὺς διαπράξασθαι τῶν ἀγγέλων γενέσθαι τῶν παρὰ τὸν βασιλέα, ἐλθόντα [360b] δὲ καὶ τὴν γυναῖκα αὐτοῦ μοιχεύσαντα, μετ' ἐκείνης ἐπιθέμενον τῷ βασιλεῖ ἀποκτεῖναι καὶ τὴν ἀρχὴν οὕτω κατασχεῖν.	As he sat with the others, he happened to turn the bezel of the ring toward himself, to the inside of his hand, and when this happened [360a] he became invisible to those sitting beside him, and they talked about him as if he'd gone away. He was amazed, and fingering the ring again he turned the bezel outward, and as he turned it he became visible. Noticing this, he tested the ring to see whether it really had this power, and it turned out that way: when he turned the bezel inward he became invisible, and when he turned it outward, visible. As soon as he realized this, he arranged to be one of the messengers sent to the king. When he got [360b] there, he committed adultery with the king's wife, and with her help attacked the king, killed him, and so took over the kingdom.
360b	εἰ οὖν δύο τοιούτω δακτυλίω γενοίσθην, καὶ τὸν μὲν ὁ δίκαιος περιθεῖτο, τὸν δὲ ὁ ἄδικος, οὐδεὶς ἂν γένοιτο, ὡς δόξειεν, οὕτως ἀδαμάντινος, ὃς ἂν μείνειεν ἐν τῇ δικαιοσύνῃ καὶ τολμήσειεν ἀπέχεσθαι τῶν ἀλλοτρίων καὶ μὴ ἅπτεσθαι, ἐξὸν αὐτῷ καὶ ἐκ τῆς ἀγορᾶς ἀδεῶς ὅτι βούλοιτο λαμβάνειν, [360c] καὶ εἰσιόντι εἰς τὰς οἰκίας συγγίγνεσθαι ὅτῳ βούλοιτο, καὶ ἀποκτεινύναι καὶ ἐκ δεσμῶν λύειν οὕστινας βούλοιτο, καὶ τἆλλα πράττειν ἐν τοῖς ἀνθρώποις ἰσόθεον ὄντα. οὕτω δὲ δρῶν οὐδὲν ἂν διάφορον τοῦ ἑτέρου ποιοῖ, ἀλλ' ἐπὶ ταὐτ' ἂν ἴοιεν ἀμφότεροι. καίτοι μέγα τοῦτο τεκμήριον ἂν φαίη τις ὅτι οὐδεὶς ἑκὼν δίκαιος ἀλλ' ἀναγκαζόμενος, ὡς οὐκ ἀγαθοῦ ἰδίᾳ ὄντος, ἐπεὶ ὅπου γ' ἂν οἴηται ἕκαστος οἷός τε ἔσεσθαι ἀδικεῖν, ἀδικεῖν.	Now suppose there were two rings like this, and the just man put on one and the unjust man the other. No one, it would seem, would be so steely as to stay in justice and bring himself to keep away from other people's property and not touch it, when he could take whatever he wanted from the marketplace without fear, [360c] go into houses and have sex with anyone he wanted, kill or free from prison anyone he wanted, and in all other respects act among human beings like a god. Doing this, he'd be acting no differently from the other; both would go the same way. And someone might say this is strong evidence that no one is just willingly, but only under compulsion, since justice isn't a good for a person privately. For wherever each person thinks he'll be able to do wrong, he does wrong.
360c	λυσιτελεῖν γὰρ δὴ οἴεται πᾶς ἀνὴρ πολὺ [360d] μᾶλλον ἰδίᾳ τὴν ἀδικίαν τῆς δικαιοσύνης, ἀληθῆ οἰόμενος, ὡς φήσει ὁ περὶ τοῦ τοιούτου λόγου λέγων· ἐπεὶ εἴ τις τοιαύτης ἐξουσίας ἐπιλαβόμενος μηδέν ποτε ἐθέλοι ἀδικῆσαι μηδὲ ἅψαιτο τῶν ἀλλοτρίων, ἀθλιώτατος μὲν ἂν δόξειεν εἶναι	Every man thinks injustice pays him far [360d] better privately than justice—and he's right to think so, as the spokesman for this argument will say. For if someone got hold of this kind of freedom and was never willing to do any wrong or touch other

GREEK

τοῖς αἰσθανομένοις καὶ ἀνοητότατος, ἐπαινοῖεν δ' ἂν αὐτὸν ἀλλήλων ἐναντίον ἐξαπατῶντες ἀλλήλους διὰ τὸν τοῦ ἀδικεῖσθαι φόβον. ταῦτα μὲν οὖν δὴ οὕτω. [360e]

ENGLISH

people's property, those who knew about it would think him the most miserable and foolish of men. Still, they'd praise him to each other's faces, deceiving one another out of fear of being wronged. So much for that. [360e]

THE PERFECTLY JUST AND THE PERFECTLY UNJUST

Glaucon contrasts the perfectly unjust man reputed just with the just man reputed unjust.

GREEK

360e **SOCRATES** τὴν δὲ κρίσιν αὐτὴν τοῦ βίου πέρι ὧν λέγομεν, ἐὰν διαστησώμεθα τόν τε δικαιότατον καὶ τὸν ἀδικώτατον, οἷοί τ' ἐσόμεθα κρῖναι ὀρθῶς· εἰ δὲ μή, οὔ. τίς οὖν δὴ ἡ διάστασις; ἥδε· μηδὲν ἀφαιρῶμεν μήτε τοῦ ἀδίκου ἀπὸ τῆς ἀδικίας, μήτε τοῦ δικαίου ἀπὸ τῆς δικαιοσύνης, ἀλλὰ τέλεον ἑκάτερον εἰς τὸ ἑαυτοῦ ἐπιτήδευμα τιθῶμεν.

πρῶτον μὲν οὖν ὁ ἄδικος ὥσπερ οἱ δεινοὶ δημιουργοὶ ποιείτω—οἷον κυβερνήτης ἄκρος ἢ ἰατρὸς τά τε ἀδύνατα ἐν τῇ τέχνῃ καὶ τὰ δυνατὰ διαισθάνεται, [361a] καὶ τοῖς μὲν ἐπιχειρεῖ, τὰ δὲ ἐᾷ· ἔτι δὲ ἐὰν ἄρα πῃ σφαλῇ, ἱκανὸς ἐπανορθοῦσθαι—οὕτω καὶ ὁ ἄδικος ἐπιχειρῶν ὀρθῶς τοῖς ἀδικήμασιν λανθανέτω, εἰ μέλλει σφόδρα ἄδικος εἶναι. τὸν ἁλισκόμενον δὲ φαῦλον ἡγητέον· ἐσχάτη γὰρ ἀδικία δοκεῖν δίκαιον εἶναι μὴ ὄντα.

361a δοτέον οὖν τῷ τελέως ἀδίκῳ τὴν τελεωτάτην ἀδικίαν, καὶ οὐκ ἀφαιρετέον ἀλλ' ἐατέον τὰ μέγιστα ἀδικοῦντα τὴν μεγίστην δόξαν αὑτῷ [361b] παρεσκευακέναι εἰς δικαιοσύνην, καὶ ἐὰν ἄρα σφάλληταί τι, ἐπανορθοῦσθαι δυνατῷ εἶναι, λέγειν τε ἱκανῷ ὄντι πρὸς τὸ πείθειν, ἐάν τι μηνύηται τῶν ἀδικημάτων, καὶ βιάσασθαι ὅσα ἂν βίας δέηται, διά τε ἀνδρείαν καὶ ῥώμην καὶ διὰ παρασκευὴν φίλων καὶ οὐσίας. τοῦτον δὲ τοιοῦτον θέντες τὸν δίκαιον αὖ παρ' αὐτὸν ἱστῶμεν τῷ λόγῳ, ἄνδρα ἁπλοῦν καὶ γενναῖον, κατ' Αἰσχύλον οὐ δοκεῖν ἀλλ' εἶναι ἀγαθὸν ἐθέλοντα. ἀφαιρετέον δὴ τὸ δοκεῖν. εἰ γὰρ δόξει δίκαιος [361c] εἶναι, ἔσονται αὐτῷ τιμαὶ καὶ δωρεαὶ δοκοῦντι τοιούτῳ εἶναι· ἄδηλον οὖν εἴτε τοῦ δικαίου εἴτε τῶν δωρεῶν τε καὶ τιμῶν ἕνεκα τοιοῦτος εἴη.

ENGLISH

SOCRATES As for the actual judgment between the lives we're discussing, we'll be able to judge correctly only if we set the most just man and the most unjust man apart from each other; if not, we won't. So how do we set them apart? Like this: let's take nothing away from the unjust man's injustice, or from the just man's justice, but make each of them complete in his own way of life.

First, then, let the unjust man act the way skilled craftsmen do. An expert ship's captain or doctor, say, can tell what's impossible in his craft and what's possible, [361a] and attempts the one and leaves the other alone; and if he does slip up somewhere, he's able to put it right. In the same way, let the unjust man go about his wrongdoing properly and escape notice, if he's going to be thoroughly unjust. Anyone who gets caught must be regarded as a poor practitioner, since the height of injustice is to seem just when you aren't.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		So we must give the perfectly unjust man the most perfect injustice. We mustn't take anything away from it: we must let him commit the greatest wrongs while having secured for himself [361b] the greatest reputation for justice. If he does slip up somewhere, he must be able to set it right. He must be a capable enough speaker to persuade people, should any of his wrongdoing come to light, and able to use force wherever force is needed, thanks to his courage and strength and his supply of friends and money. Having set him up like this, let's stand the just man beside him in our argument: a simple, noble man who, in Aeschylus' phrase, wants not to seem good but to be good. So we must take away the seeming. For if he's going to seem just, [361c] honors and rewards will come to him for seeming so, and then it won't be clear whether he's like that for the sake of justice or for the sake of the rewards and honors.[2]
361c	γυμνωτέος δὴ πάντων πλὴν δικαιοσύνης καὶ ποιητέος ἐναντίως διακείμενος τῷ προτέρῳ· μηδὲν γὰρ ἀδικῶν δόξαν ἐχέτω τὴν μεγίστην ἀδικίας, ἵνα ᾖ βεβασανισμένος εἰς δικαιοσύνην τῷ μὴ τέγγεσθαι ὑπὸ κακοδοξίας καὶ τῶν ὑπ᾽ αὐτῆς γιγνομένων, ἀλλὰ ἴτω ἀμετάστατος μέχρι [361d] θανάτου, δοκῶν μὲν εἶναι ἄδικος διὰ βίου, ὢν δὲ δίκαιος, ἵνα ἀμφότεροι εἰς τὸ ἔσχατον ἐληλυθότες, ὁ μὲν δικαιοσύνης, ὁ δὲ ἀδικίας, κρίνωνται ὁπότερος αὐτοῖν εὐδαιμονέστερος.	He must be stripped of everything except justice and made the exact opposite of the first man. Though he does no wrong, let him have the greatest reputation for injustice, so that his justice may be put to the test by whether it's softened by a bad name and what comes of it. Let him go on unchanged until [361d] death, seeming unjust all his life but being just, so that when both have gone to the extreme, the one of justice and the other of injustice, we can judge which of the two is happier.
361d	βαβαῖ, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, ὦ φίλε Γλαύκων, ὡς ἐρρωμένως ἑκάτερον ὥσπερ ἀνδριάντα εἰς τὴν κρίσιν ἐκκαθαίρεις τοῖν ἀνδροῖν.	"Goodness, my dear Glaucon," I said, "how vigorously you're scouring each of the two men clean for judging, as if they were statues!"
	ὡς μάλιστ᾽, ἔφη, δύναμαι. ὄντοιν δὲ τοιούτοιν, οὐδὲν ἔτι, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, χαλεπὸν ἐπεξελθεῖν τῷ λόγῳ οἷος ἑκάτερον [361e] βίος ἐπιμένει. λεκτέον οὖν· καὶ δὴ κἂν ἀγροικοτέρως λέγηται, μὴ ἐμὲ οἴου λέγειν, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἀλλὰ τοὺς ἐπαινοῦντας πρὸ δικαιοσύνης ἀδικίαν.	As best I can, he said. And with the two of them like this, I don't think it's hard any more to go through in words what sort of life awaits each [361e] of them. So it must be said. And if it's said rather crudely, Socrates, don't think it's me speaking, but those who praise injustice above justice.
361e	ἐροῦσι δὲ τάδε, ὅτι οὕτω διακείμενος ὁ δίκαιος μαστιγώσεται, στρεβλώσεται, δεδήσεται, [362a] ἐκκαυθήσεται τὼφθαλμώ, τελευτῶν πάντα κακὰ παθὼν ἀνασχινδυλευθήσεται καὶ γνώσεται ὅτι οὐκ εἶναι δίκαιον ἀλλὰ δοκεῖν δεῖ ἐθέλειν. τὸ δὲ τοῦ Αἰσχύλου πολὺ ἦν ἄρα ὀρθότερον λέγειν κατὰ τοῦ ἀδίκου.	What they'll say is this: that the just man, being so disposed, will be whipped, racked, put in chains, [362a] and have his eyes burned out, and finally, after suffering every evil, he'll be impaled, and he'll realize that one should want not to be just but to seem so. And Aeschylus' line, it turns out, would have been far more correctly said of the unjust man.

2 Aeschylus, in *Seven Against Thebes*, says of the seer Amphiaraus that he wished "not to seem the best, but to be it."

GREEK

ENGLISH

362a τῷ ὄντι γὰρ φήσουσι τὸν ἄδικον, ἅτε ἐπιτηδεύοντα πρᾶγμα ἀληθείας ἐχόμενον καὶ οὐ πρὸς δόξαν ζῶντα, οὐ δοκεῖν ἄδικον ἀλλ' εἶναι ἐθέλειν, βαθεῖαν ἄλοκα διὰ φρενὸς καρπούμενον, [362b] ἐξ ἧς τὰ κεδνὰ βλαστάνει βουλεύματα, πρῶτον μὲν ἄρχειν ἐν τῇ πόλει δοκοῦντι δικαίῳ εἶναι, ἔπειτα γαμεῖν ὁπόθεν ἂν βούληται, ἐκδιδόναι εἰς οὓς ἂν βούληται, συμβάλλειν, κοινωνεῖν οἷς ἂν ἐθέλῃ, καὶ παρὰ ταῦτα πάντα ὠφελεῖσθαι κερδαίνοντα τῷ μὴ δυσχεραίνειν τὸ ἀδικεῖν· εἰς ἀγῶνας τοίνυν ἰόντα καὶ ἰδίᾳ καὶ δημοσίᾳ περιγίγνεσθαι καὶ πλεονεκτεῖν τῶν ἐχθρῶν, πλεονεκτοῦντα δὲ πλουτεῖν καὶ [362c] τούς τε φίλους εὖ ποιεῖν καὶ τοὺς ἐχθροὺς βλάπτειν, καὶ θεοῖς θυσίας καὶ ἀναθήματα ἱκανῶς καὶ μεγαλοπρεπῶς θύειν τε καὶ ἀνατιθέναι, καὶ θεραπεύειν τοῦ δικαίου πολὺ ἄμεινον τοὺς θεοὺς καὶ τῶν ἀνθρώπων οὓς ἂν βούληται, ὥστε καὶ θεοφιλέστερον αὐτὸν εἶναι μᾶλλον προσήκειν ἐκ τῶν εἰκότων ἢ τὸν δίκαιον.

For they'll say that it's really the unjust man, since he pursues something bound up with reality and doesn't live for appearances, who wants not to seem unjust but to be so, "reaping the deep furrow in his mind, [362b] from which his shrewd counsels spring." First, because he seems just, he holds office in the city; then he takes a wife from whatever family he likes and gives his children in marriage to whomever he likes; he makes contracts and partnerships with whomever he wants; and on top of all this he profits and gains, because he has no qualms about doing wrong. So when he enters contests, private or public, he comes out on top and gets the better of his enemies; and by getting the better of them he grows rich, [362c] does good to his friends and harm to his enemies, and offers sacrifices and dedicates offerings to the gods on an ample and magnificent scale. He serves the gods, and whichever men he chooses, far better than the just man does, so that in all likelihood it's more fitting for him, rather than the just man, to be dear to the gods.

362c οὕτω φασίν, ὦ Σώκρατες, παρὰ θεῶν καὶ παρ' ἀνθρώπων τῷ ἀδίκῳ παρεσκευάσθαι τὸν βίον ἄμεινον ἢ τῷ δικαίῳ. [362d]

That, Socrates, is how they say gods and men provide a better life for the unjust man than for the just. [362d]

ADEIMANTUS ON REWARDS AND REPUTATIONS

Adeimantus complains that people praise justice only for its rewards and reputation.

GREEK

ENGLISH

362d **SOCRATES** ταῦτ' εἰπόντος τοῦ Γλαύκωνος ἐγὼ μὲν αὖ ἐν νῷ εἶχόν τι λέγειν πρὸς ταῦτα, ὁ δὲ ἀδελφὸς αὐτοῦ Ἀδείμαντος, οὔ τί που οἴει, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἱκανῶς εἰρῆσθαι περὶ τοῦ λόγου;

ἀλλὰ τί μήν; εἶπον.

αὐτό, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐκ εἴρηται ὃ μάλιστα ἔδει ῥηθῆναι.

οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ λεγόμενον, ἀδελφὸς ἀνδρὶ παρείη· ὥστε καὶ σύ, εἴ τι ὅδε ἐλλείπει, ἐπάμυνε. καίτοι ἐμέ γε ἱκανὰ καὶ τὰ ὑπὸ τούτου ῥηθέντα καταπαλαῖσαι καὶ ἀδύνατον ποιῆσαι βοηθεῖν δικαιοσύνῃ. [362e]

SOCRATES When Glaucon had said this, I had it in mind to say something in reply, but his brother Adeimantus said, "Surely, Socrates, you don't think the case has been adequately stated?"

"Why, what else would I think?" I said.

"The very thing that most needed saying," he said, "hasn't been said."

"Well then," I said, "as the saying goes, let a brother stand by his man. So if Glaucon here is leaving anything out, you come to his aid. And yet what he's said is already enough to throw me flat and leave me unable to help justice." [362e]

362e καὶ ὅς, οὐδέν, ἔφη, λέγεις· ἀλλ' ἔτι καὶ τάδε ἄκουε. δεῖ γὰρ διελθεῖν ἡμᾶς καὶ τοὺς ἐναντίους λόγους ὧν ὅδε εἶπεν, οἳ δικαιοσύνην μὲν ἐπαινοῦσιν, ἀδικίαν δὲ ψέγουσιν, ἵν' ᾖ σαφέστερον ὅ μοι δοκεῖ βούλεσθαι Γλαύκων.

And he said: Nonsense. Listen to this as well. We need to go through the arguments opposed to the ones he stated, the ones that praise justice and blame injustice, so that what I take Glaucon to mean will be clearer.

GREEK

λέγουσι δέ που καὶ παρακελεύονται πατέρες τε υἱέσιν, καὶ πάντες οἱ 363a τινῶν κηδόμενοι, ὡς χρὴ δίκαιον εἶναι, οὐκ αὐτὸ δικαιοσύνην ἐπαινοῦντες ἀλλὰ τὰς ἀπ' αὐτῆς εὐδοκιμήσεις, ἵνα δοκοῦντι δικαίῳ εἶναι γίγνηται ἀπὸ τῆς δόξης ἀρχαί τε καὶ γάμοι καὶ ὅσαπερ Γλαύκων διῆλθεν ἄρτι, ἀπὸ τοῦ εὐδοκιμεῖν ὄντα τῷ δικαίῳ. ἐπὶ πλέον δὲ οὗτοι τὰ τῶν δοξῶν λέγουσιν. τὰς γὰρ παρὰ θεῶν εὐδοκιμήσεις ἐμβάλλοντες ἄφθονα ἔχουσι λέγειν ἀγαθά, τοῖς ὁσίοις ἅ φασι θεοὺς διδόναι· ὥσπερ ὁ γενναῖος Ἡσίοδός τε καὶ Ὅμηρός φασιν, ὁ μὲν τὰς δρῦς 363b τοῖς δικαίοις τοὺς θεοὺς ποιεῖν ἄκρας μέν τε φέρειν βαλάνους, μέσσας δὲ μελίσσας· εἰροπόκοι δ' ὄιες, φησίν, μαλλοῖς καταβεβρίθασι , καὶ ἄλλα δὴ πολλὰ ἀγαθὰ τούτων ἐχόμενα.

ENGLISH

Fathers, I suppose, tell their sons, and urge them, as do all who have anyone in 363a their care, that one must be just. They don't praise justice itself, but the good name that comes from it, so that someone who seems just may get from that reputation the offices and marriages and everything else Glaucon went through just now, which come to the just man from being well thought of. But these people make even more of reputations. They throw in good standing with the gods, and then they have endless goods to describe, which they say the gods give to the pious. So the noble Hesiod and Homer say. Hesiod says the gods make the oaks 363b for the just "bear acorns at the top and bees in the middle," and "the woolly sheep," he says, "are weighed down with fleece," and many other good things of that kind.

363b παραπλήσια δὲ καὶ ὁ ἕτερος· ὥς τέ τευ γάρ φησιν ἢ βασιλῆος ἀμύμονος ὅς τε θεουδὴς εὐδικίας ἀνέχῃσι, φέρῃσι δὲ γαῖα μέλαινα 363c πυροὺς καὶ κριθάς, βρίθῃσι δὲ δένδρεα καρπῷ, τίκτῃ δ' ἔμπεδα μῆλα, θάλασσα δὲ παρέχῃ ἰχθῦς. Μουσαῖος δὲ τούτων νεανικώτερα τἀγαθὰ καὶ ὁ ὑὸς αὐτοῦ παρὰ θεῶν διδόασιν τοῖς δικαίοις· εἰς Ἅιδου γὰρ ἀγαγόντες τῷ λόγῳ καὶ κατακλίναντες καὶ συμπόσιον τῶν ὁσίων κατασκευάσαντες ἐστεφανωμένους ποιοῦσιν τὸν ἅπαντα χρόνον 363d ἤδη διάγειν μεθύοντας, ἡγησάμενοι κάλλιστον ἀρετῆς μισθὸν μέθην αἰώνιον. οἱ δ' ἔτι τούτων μακροτέρους ἀποτείνουσιν μισθοὺς παρὰ θεῶν· παῖδας γὰρ παίδων φασὶ καὶ γένος κατόπισθεν λείπεσθαι τοῦ ὁσίου καὶ εὐόρκου.

The other poet says much the same: "like some blameless king who, fearing the gods, upholds justice, and the black earth bears 363c wheat and barley, the trees are heavy with fruit, the flocks bear young unfailingly, and the sea provides fish." Musaeus and his son give the just even headier goods from the gods than these. In their tales they take them down to Hades, lay them on couches, lay on a drinking party of the pious, and have them spend all 363d eternity drunk, with garlands on their heads, as if they thought eternal drunkenness the finest wage for excellence. Others stretch the wages from the gods out even further: they say that the pious man who keeps his oaths leaves behind his children's children and a line to come after him.[3]

363d ταῦτα δὴ καὶ ἄλλα τοιαῦτα ἐγκωμιάζουσιν δικαιοσύνην· τοὺς δὲ ἀνοσίους αὖ καὶ ἀδίκους εἰς πηλόν τινα κατορύττουσιν ἐν Ἅιδου καὶ κοσκίνῳ ὕδωρ ἀναγκάζουσι φέρειν, ἔτι τε ζῶντας 363e εἰς κακὰς δόξας ἄγοντες, ἅπερ Γλαύκων περὶ τῶν δικαίων δοξαζομένων δὲ ἀδίκων διῆλθε τιμωρήματα, ταῦτα περὶ τῶν ἀδίκων λέγουσιν, ἄλλα δὲ οὐκ ἔχουσιν. ὁ μὲν οὖν ἔπαινος καὶ ὁ ψόγος οὗτος ἑκατέρων.

With these and similar things they sing the praises of justice. The impious and unjust, on the other hand, they bury in some sort of mud in Hades and force to carry water in a sieve. And while they're still alive, 363e they bring them into disrepute: the punishments Glaucon described for the just who are thought unjust, these they tell of the unjust, and they have nothing else to say. That, then, is how each is praised and blamed.

363e πρὸς δὲ τούτοις σκέψαι, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἄλλο αὖ εἶδος λόγων περὶ δικαιοσύνης τε καὶ ἀδικίας ἰδίᾳ τε λεγόμενον 364a καὶ ὑπὸ ποιητῶν. πάντες γὰρ ἐξ ἑνὸς στόματος ὑμνοῦσιν ὡς καλὸν μὲν ἡ σωφροσύνη τε καὶ δικαιοσύνη,

Besides this, Socrates, consider yet another kind of talk about justice and injustice, heard both from private people 364a and from poets. They all hymn with one voice that moderation and justice are

3 Musaeus was a legendary singer linked with Orpheus; poems and oracles about the afterlife circulated under his name.

GREEK

χαλεπὸν μέντοι καὶ ἐπίπονον, ἀκολασία δὲ καὶ ἀδικία ἡδὺ μὲν καὶ εὐπετὲς κτήσασθαι, δόξῃ δὲ μόνον καὶ νόμῳ αἰσχρόν· λυσιτελέστερα δὲ τῶν δικαίων τὰ ἄδικα ὡς ἐπὶ τὸ πλῆθος λέγουσι, καὶ πονηροὺς πλουσίους καὶ ἄλλας δυνάμεις ἔχοντας εὐδαιμονίζειν καὶ τιμᾶν εὐχερῶς ἐθέλουσιν δημοσίᾳ τε καὶ ἰδίᾳ, τοὺς δὲ ἀτιμάζειν καὶ ὑπερορᾶν, οἳ ἄν πῃ ἀσθενεῖς τε [364b] καὶ πένητες ὦσιν, ὁμολογοῦντες αὐτοὺς ἀμείνους εἶναι τῶν ἑτέρων.

364b τούτων δὲ πάντων οἱ περὶ θεῶν τε λόγοι καὶ ἀρετῆς θαυμασιώτατοι λέγονται, ὡς ἄρα καὶ θεοὶ πολλοῖς μὲν ἀγαθοῖς δυστυχίας τε καὶ βίον κακὸν ἔνειμαν, τοῖς δ' ἐναντίοις ἐναντίαν μοῖραν. ἀγύρται δὲ καὶ μάντεις ἐπὶ πλουσίων θύρας ἰόντες πείθουσιν ὡς ἔστι παρὰ σφίσι δύναμις ἐκ θεῶν πoριζομένη θυσίαις τε καὶ ἐπῳδαῖς, εἴτε τι [364c] ἀδίκημά του γέγονεν αὐτοῦ ἢ προγόνων, ἀκεῖσθαι μεθ' ἡδονῶν τε καὶ ἑορτῶν, ἐάν τέ τινα ἐχθρὸν πημῆναι ἐθέλῃ, μετὰ σμικρῶν δαπανῶν ὁμοίως δίκαιον ἀδίκῳ βλάψει ἐπαγωγαῖς τισιν καὶ καταδέσμοις, τοὺς θεούς, ὥς φασιν, πείθοντές σφισιν ὑπηρετεῖν.

364c τούτοις δὲ πᾶσιν τοῖς λόγοις μάρτυρας ποιητὰς ἐπάγονται οἱ μὲν κακίας πέρι, εὐπετείας διδόντες, ὡς τὴν μὲν κακότητα καὶ ἰλαδὸν ἔστιν ἑλέσθαι [364d] ῥᾳϊδίως· λείη μὲν ὁδός, μάλα δ' ἐγγύθι ναίει· τῆς δ' ἀρετῆς ἱδρῶτα θεοὶ προπάροιθεν ἔθηκαν καί τινα ὁδὸν μακράν τε καὶ τραχεῖαν καὶ ἀνάντη· οἱ δὲ τῆς τῶν θεῶν ὑπ' ἀνθρώπων παραγωγῆς τὸν Ὅμηρον μαρτύρονται, ὅτι καὶ ἐκεῖνος εἶπεν— λιστοὶ δέ τε καὶ θεοὶ αὐτοί, καὶ τοὺς μὲν θυσίαισι καὶ εὐχωλαῖς ἀγαναῖσιν [364e] λοιβῇ τε κνίσῃ τε παρατρωπῶσ' ἄνθρωποι λισσόμενοι, ὅτε κέν τις ὑπερβήῃ καὶ ἁμάρτῃ.

364e βίβλων δὲ ὅμαδον παρέχονται Μουσαίου καὶ Ὀρφέως, Σελήνης τε καὶ Μουσῶν ἐκγόνων, ὥς φασι, καθ' ἃς θυηπολοῦσιν, πείθοντες οὐ μόνον ἰδιώτας ἀλλὰ καὶ πόλεις, ὡς ἄρα λύσεις τε καὶ καθαρμοὶ ἀδικημάτων διὰ θυσιῶν καὶ [365a] παιδιᾶς ἡδονῶν εἰσι μὲν ἔτι ζῶσιν, εἰσὶ δὲ καὶ τελευτήσασιν, ἃς δὴ τελετὰς καλοῦσιν, αἳ τῶν ἐκεῖ κακῶν ἀπολύουσιν ἡμᾶς, μὴ θύσαντας δὲ δεινὰ περιμένει.

ENGLISH

fine things, but hard and laborious, while self-indulgence and injustice are pleasant and easy to acquire, and shameful only in people's opinion and by convention. They say that unjust deeds are, for the most part, more profitable than just ones. They're quite ready to call bad people happy and to honor them, in public and in private, when they're rich or have other kinds of power, and to dishonor and look down on those who happen to be weak [364b] and poor, even though they agree that these are better than the others.

Most astonishing of all is what they say about the gods and excellence: that the gods, too, allot misfortune and a bad life to many good people, and the opposite lot to their opposites. Begging priests and seers go to rich men's doors and persuade them that they have a power, supplied by the gods through sacrifices and incantations, to heal with pleasures and festivals any [364c] wrong committed by the man himself or by his ancestors; and that if he wants to injure some enemy, at small expense he'll harm just and unjust alike with certain spells and binding curses, since, as they say, they persuade the gods to serve them.

For all these claims they bring in poets as witnesses. Some, speaking of badness, present it as easy: "Wickedness can be had in plenty, [364d] easily; smooth is the road, and she lives very near; but before excellence the gods have set sweat," and a road that's long, rough and uphill. Others call Homer to witness that gods are swayed by human beings, since he too said: "Even the gods themselves can be moved by prayer; with sacrifices and soothing vows, [364e] with libation and the savor of burnt fat, men turn them aside with their pleas, whenever someone oversteps and does wrong."

And they produce a clamor of books by Musaeus and Orpheus, offspring, so they say, of the Moon and the Muses, and by these they perform their rites. They persuade not only individuals but whole cities that there are releases and purifications from wrongdoing, through sacrifices and [365a] pleasant games, for the living and for the dead alike. These they call "initiations": they free us from the evils down there, while terrible things await those who haven't sacrificed.[4]

4 Orpheus: the legendary singer, under whose name poems circulated teaching rites of purification and what awaits the soul after death.

GREEK

ENGLISH

365a ταῦτα πάντα, ἔφη, ὦ φίλε Σώκρατες, τοιαῦτα καὶ τοσαῦτα λεγόμενα ἀρετῆς πέρι καὶ κακίας, ὡς ἄνθρωποι καὶ θεοὶ περὶ αὐτὰ ἔχουσι τιμῆς, τί οἰόμεθα ἀκουούσας νέων ψυχὰς ποιεῖν, ὅσοι εὐφυεῖς καὶ ἱκανοὶ ἐπὶ πάντα τὰ λεγόμενα ὥσπερ ἐπιπτόμενοι συλλογίσασθαι ἐξ αὐτῶν ποῖός τις ἂν [365b] ὢν καὶ πῇ πορευθεὶς τὸν βίον ὡς ἄριστα διέλθοι; λέγοι γὰρ ἂν ἐκ τῶν εἰκότων πρὸς αὑτὸν κατὰ Πίνδαρον ἐκεῖνο τὸ πότερον δίκᾳ τεῖχος ὕψιον ἢ σκολιαῖς ἀπάταις ἀναβὰς καὶ ἐμαυτὸν οὕτω περιφράξας διαβιῶ; τὰ μὲν γὰρ λεγόμενα δικαίῳ μὲν ὄντι μοι, ἐὰν μὴ καὶ δοκῶ ὄφελος οὐδέν φασιν εἶναι, πόνους δὲ καὶ ζημίας φανεράς· ἀδίκῳ δὲ δόξαν δικαιοσύνης παρεσκευασμένῳ θεσπέσιος βίος λέγεται.

All these things, my dear Socrates, he said, so many and of such a kind, that are said about excellence and badness, and about how men and gods value them: what do we think they do to the souls of the young who hear them? I mean those who are naturally gifted and able, as it were, to flit over everything they hear and gather from it what sort of person [365b] one should be, and what path one should take, to get through life as well as possible. In all likelihood such a young man would say to himself, in Pindar's words, "Shall I by justice climb the higher wall, or by crooked deceits," and so fence myself in and live out my life? For what they say is that if I'm just but don't also seem so, there's no benefit in it, only obvious troubles and penalties; but for the unjust man who has provided himself with a reputation for justice, a godlike life is promised.

365c οὐκοῦν, ἐπειδὴ "τὸ δοκεῖν ", ὡς δηλοῦσί μοι οἱ σοφοί, καὶ τὰν ἀλάθειαν βιᾶται καὶ κύριον εὐδαιμονίας, ἐπὶ τοῦτο δὴ τρεπτέον ὅλως· πρόθυρα μὲν καὶ σχῆμα κύκλῳ περὶ ἐμαυτὸν σκιαγραφίαν ἀρετῆς περιγραπτέον, τὴν δὲ τοῦ σοφωτάτου Ἀρχιλόχου ἀλώπεκα ἑλκτέον ἐξόπισθεν κερδαλέαν καὶ ποικίλην. "ἀλλὰ γάρ, φησί τις, οὐ ῥᾴδιον ἀεὶ λανθάνειν κακὸν ὄντα." οὐδὲ γὰρ ἄλλο οὐδὲν εὐπετές, [365d] φήσομεν, τῶν μεγάλων· ἀλλ' ὅμως, εἰ μέλλομεν εὐδαιμονήσειν, ταύτῃ ἰτέον, ὡς τὰ ἴχνη τῶν λόγων φέρει. ἐπὶ γὰρ τὸ λανθάνειν συνωμοσίας τε καὶ ἑταιρίας συνάξομεν, εἰσίν τε πειθοῦς διδάσκαλοι σοφίαν δημηγορικήν τε καὶ δικανικὴν διδόντες, ἐξ ὧν τὰ μὲν πείσομεν, τὰ δὲ βιασόμεθα, ὡς πλεονεκτοῦντες δίκην μὴ διδόναι.

So since, as the wise make plain to me, "seeming overpowers even truth" and is master of happiness, that's what I must turn to entirely. As a front and facade I must draw around myself a painted illusion of excellence, and trail behind me the fox of that wisest of men, Archilochus, greedy and cunning. "But," someone says, "it isn't easy to be bad and always go unnoticed." Nor is anything else that's great easy, [365d] we'll reply. Still, if we're going to be happy, this is the way we must go, where the tracks of the arguments lead. To go unnoticed we'll organize conspiracies and political clubs; and there are teachers of persuasion who offer skill in speaking to the assembly and the courts. With these we'll persuade in some cases and use force in others, so that we can take more than our share and not pay the penalty.[5]

365d "ἀλλὰ δὴ θεοὺς οὔτε λανθάνειν οὔτε βιάσασθαι δυνατόν." οὐκοῦν, εἰ μὲν μὴ εἰσὶν ἢ μηδὲν αὐτοῖς τῶν ἀνθρωπίνων μέλει, τί καὶ ἡμῖν [365e] μελητέον τοῦ λανθάνειν; εἰ δὲ εἰσί τε καὶ ἐπιμελοῦνται, οὐκ ἄλλοθέν τοι αὐτοὺς ἴσμεν ἢ ἀκηκόαμεν ἢ ἔκ τε τῶν νόμων καὶ τῶν γενεαλογησάντων ποιητῶν, οἱ δὲ αὐτοὶ οὗτοι λέγουσιν ὡς εἰσὶν οἷοι θυσίαις τε καὶ εὐχωλαῖς ἀγανῇσιν καὶ ἀναθήμασιν παράγεσθαι ἀναπειθόμενοι, οἷς ἢ ἀμφότερα ἢ οὐδέτερα πειστέον.

"But you can't hide from the gods, or use force on them." Well, if they don't exist, or care nothing for human affairs, why should we [365e] care about hiding either? And if they do exist and do care, we know of them, or have heard of them, from nowhere else than the laws and the poets who traced their genealogies; and these same people say that they're the kind who can be swayed and won over "with sacrifices and soothing vows" and offerings. We must believe them on both counts or on neither.

5 The "wise" quoted is the poet Simonides; Archilochus, a seventh-century BC poet, told fables of the crafty fox.

GREEK

ENGLISH

365e εἰ δ' οὖν πειστέον, ἀδικητέον καὶ θυτέον [366a] ἀπὸ τῶν ἀδικημάτων. δίκαιοι μὲν γὰρ ὄντες ἀζήμιοι μόνον ὑπὸ θεῶν ἐσόμεθα, τὰ δ' ἐξ ἀδικίας κέρδη ἀπωσόμεθα· ἄδικοι δὲ κερδανοῦμέν τε καὶ λισσόμενοι ὑπερβαίνοντες καὶ ἁμαρτάνοντες, πείθοντες αὐτοὺς ἀζήμιοι ἀπαλλάξομεν. "ἀλλὰ γὰρ ἐν Ἅιδου δίκην δώσομεν ὧν ἂν ἐνθάδε ἀδικήσωμεν, ἢ αὐτοὶ ἢ παῖδες παίδων." ἀλλ', ὦ φίλε, φήσει λογιζόμενος, αἱ τελεταὶ αὖ μέγα δύνανται καὶ οἱ λύσιοι θεοί, ὡς αἱ [366b] μέγισται πόλεις λέγουσι καὶ οἱ θεῶν παῖδες ποιηταὶ καὶ προφῆται τῶν θεῶν γενόμενοι, οἳ ταῦτα οὕτως ἔχειν μηνύουσιν.

And if we must believe them, then we should do wrong and offer sacrifices [366a] from the proceeds. If we're just, we'll merely go unpunished by the gods, and we'll forgo the gains from injustice; if we're unjust, we'll make our gains, and by our pleas as we overstep and do wrong we'll persuade them and get off unpunished. "But in Hades we'll pay the penalty for the wrongs we've done here, either we ourselves or our children's children." But my friend, he'll say, doing his calculations, the initiations have great power, and so do the gods of release, as the [366b] greatest cities say, and the children of gods who became poets and prophets of the gods, who reveal that this is how things are.

366b κατὰ τίνα οὖν ἔτι λόγον δικαιοσύνην ἂν πρὸ μεγίστης ἀδικίας αἱροίμεθ' ἄν, ἣν ἐὰν μετ' εὐσχημοσύνης κιβδήλου κτησώμεθα, καὶ παρὰ θεοῖς καὶ παρ' ἀνθρώποις πράξομεν κατὰ νοῦν ζῶντές τε καὶ τελευτήσαντες, ὡς ὁ τῶν πολλῶν τε καὶ ἄκρων λεγόμενος λόγος; ἐκ δὴ πάντων τῶν εἰρημένων [366c] τίς μηχανή, ὦ Σώκρατες, δικαιοσύνην τιμᾶν ἐθέλειν ᾧ τις δύναμις ὑπάρχει ψυχῆς ἢ χρημάτων ἢ σώματος ἢ γένους, ἀλλὰ μὴ γελᾶν ἐπαινουμένης ἀκούοντα;

So on what argument would we still choose justice over the greatest injustice? If we get injustice along with a counterfeit show of decency, we'll fare as we please with gods and men, in life and in death: so goes the account given by the many and by the best authorities. After all that's been said, [366c] Socrates, what way is there for anyone with any power, of soul or money or body or birth, to be willing to honor justice, and not laugh when he hears it praised?

366c ὡς δή τοι εἴ τις ἔχει ψευδῆ μὲν ἀποφῆναι ἃ εἰρήκαμεν, ἱκανῶς δὲ ἔγνωκεν ὅτι ἄριστον δικαιοσύνη, πολλήν που συγγνώμην ἔχει καὶ οὐκ ὀργίζεται τοῖς ἀδίκοις, ἀλλ' οἶδεν ὅτι πλὴν εἴ τις θείᾳ φύσει δυσχεραίνων τὸ ἀδικεῖν ἢ ἐπιστήμην λαβὼν [366d] ἀπέχεται αὐτοῦ, τῶν γε ἄλλων οὐδεὶς ἑκὼν δίκαιος, ἀλλ' ὑπὸ ἀνανδρίας ἢ γήρως ἤ τινος ἄλλης ἀσθενείας ψέγει τὸ ἀδικεῖν, ἀδυνατῶν αὐτὸ δρᾶν. ὡς δέ, δῆλον· ὁ γὰρ πρῶτος τῶν τοιούτων εἰς δύναμιν ἐλθὼν πρῶτος ἀδικεῖ, καθ' ὅσον ἂν οἷός τ' ᾖ.

So if anyone can show that what we've said is false, and is fully convinced that justice is best, he surely has great sympathy for the unjust and isn't angry with them. He knows that, apart from someone who by a divine nature finds wrongdoing repugnant, or who has gained knowledge and [366d] keeps away from it, no one else is just willingly. It's through cowardice or old age or some other weakness that people blame wrongdoing, because they're unable to do it. How this is so is clear: the first of such people to come into power is the first to do wrong, as far as he's able.

366d καὶ τούτων ἁπάντων οὐδὲν ἄλλο αἴτιον ἢ ἐκεῖνο, ὅθενπερ ἅπας ὁ λόγος οὗτος ὥρμησεν καὶ τῷδε καὶ ἐμοὶ πρὸς σέ, ὦ Σώκρατες, εἰπεῖν, ὅτι "ὦ θαυμάσιε, πάντων [366e] ὑμῶν, ὅσοι ἐπαινέται φατὲ δικαιοσύνης εἶναι, ἀπὸ τῶν ἐξ ἀρχῆς ἡρώων ἀρξάμενοι, ὅσων λόγοι λελειμμένοι, μέχρι τῶν νῦν ἀνθρώπων οὐδεὶς πώποτε ἔψεξεν ἀδικίαν οὐδ' ἐπῄνεσεν δικαιοσύνην ἄλλως ἢ δόξας τε καὶ τιμὰς καὶ δωρεὰς τὰς ἀπ' αὐτῶν γιγνομένας· αὐτὸ δ' ἑκάτερον τῇ αὑτοῦ δυνάμει τί δρᾷ, τῇ τοῦ ἔχοντος ψυχῇ ἐνόν, καὶ λανθάνον θεούς τε καὶ ἀνθρώπους, οὐδεὶς πώποτε οὔτ' ἐν ποιήσει οὔτ' ἐν ἰδίοις λόγοις ἐπεξῆλθεν ἱκανῶς τῷ λόγῳ

And the cause of all this is nothing other than the point from which this whole argument started, for Glaucon here and for me, when we spoke to you, Socrates: "You amazing man, of all [366e] of you who claim to be praisers of justice, starting from the heroes of old whose words have come down to us and ending with people today, not one has ever blamed injustice or praised justice except for the reputations, honors and rewards that come from them. What each of them does by its own power when it's present in the soul of the one who has it, unnoticed by gods and men, no one has ever ad-

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ὡς τὸ μὲν μέγιστον κακῶν ὅσα ἴσχει ψυχὴ ἐν αὑτῇ, δικαιοσύνη δὲ μέγιστον ἀγαθόν.”	equately gone through in argument, whether in poetry or in prose: that injustice is the greatest of all the evils a soul holds within itself, and justice the greatest good.”
367a	“εἰ γὰρ οὕτως ἐλέγετο ἐξ ἀρχῆς ὑπὸ πάντων ὑμῶν καὶ ἐκ νέων ἡμᾶς ἐπείθετε, οὐκ ἂν ἀλλήλους ἐφυλάττομεν μὴ ἀδικεῖν, ἀλλ’ αὐτὸς αὑτοῦ ἦν ἕκαστος ἄριστος φύλαξ, δεδιὼς μὴ ἀδικῶν τῷ μεγίστῳ κακῷ σύνοικος ᾖ.”	“If you’d all been talking like this from the start and persuading us of it from our youth, we wouldn’t be guarding one another against wrongdoing; each would be his own best guardian, afraid that by doing wrong he’d be living with the greatest evil.”
	ταῦτα, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἴσως δὲ καὶ ἔτι τούτων πλείω Θρασύμαχός τε καὶ ἄλλος πού τις ὑπὲρ δικαιοσύνης τε καὶ ἀδικίας λέγοιεν ἄν, μεταστρέφοντες αὐτοῖν τὴν δύναμιν φορτικῶς, ὥς γέ μοι δοκεῖ. ἀλλ’ ἐγώ, οὐδὲν γάρ σε [367b] δέομαι ἀποκρύπτεσθαι, σοῦ ἐπιθυμῶν ἀκοῦσαι τἀναντία, ὡς δύναμαι μάλιστα κατατείνας λέγω. μὴ οὖν ἡμῖν μόνον ἐνδείξῃ τῷ λόγῳ ὅτι δικαιοσύνη ἀδικίας κρεῖττον, ἀλλὰ τί ποιοῦσα ἑκατέρα τὸν ἔχοντα αὐτὴ δι’ αὑτὴν ἡ μὲν κακόν, ἡ δὲ ἀγαθόν ἐστιν· τὰς δὲ δόξας ἀφαίρει, ὥσπερ Γλαύκων διεκελεύσατο.	That, Socrates, and perhaps even more than that, is what Thrasymachus, and maybe someone else too, would say about justice and injustice, crudely turning their powers upside down, as it seems to me. But I, for I’ve no need to hide anything [367b] from you, am speaking with all the force I can because I want to hear you argue the opposite. So don’t just show us in argument that justice is better than injustice; show us what each of them does, itself through itself, to the one who has it, that makes the one bad and the other good. And take away the reputations, as Glaucon urged.
367b	εἰ γὰρ μὴ ἀφαιρήσεις ἑκατέρωθεν τὰς ἀληθεῖς, τὰς δὲ ψευδεῖς προσθήσεις, οὐ τὸ δίκαιον φήσομεν ἐπαινεῖν σε ἀλλὰ τὸ δοκεῖν, οὐδὲ τὸ ἄδικον εἶναι [367c] ψέγειν ἀλλὰ τὸ δοκεῖν, καὶ παρακελεύεσθαι ἄδικον ὄντα λανθάνειν, καὶ ὁμολογεῖν Θρασυμάχῳ ὅτι τὸ μὲν δίκαιον ἀλλότριον ἀγαθόν, συμφέρον τοῦ κρείττονος, τὸ δὲ ἄδικον αὐτῷ μὲν συμφέρον καὶ λυσιτελοῦν, τῷ δὲ ἥττονι ἀσύμφορον.	For unless you take away the true reputation from each and attach the false one, we’ll say you’re praising not being just but seeming so, and blaming not being unjust [367c] but seeming so; that you’re urging us to be unjust and go unnoticed, and agreeing with Thrasymachus that justice is someone else’s good, the advantage of the stronger, while injustice is to one’s own advantage and profit, and to the disadvantage of the weaker.
367c	ἐπειδὴ οὖν ὡμολόγησας τῶν μεγίστων ἀγαθῶν εἶναι δικαιοσύνην, ἃ τῶν τε ἀποβαινόντων ἀπ’ αὐτῶν ἕνεκα ἄξια κεκτῆσθαι, πολὺ δὲ μᾶλλον αὐτὰ αὑτῶν, οἷον ὁρᾶν, [367d] ἀκούειν, φρονεῖν, καὶ ὑγιαίνειν δή, καὶ ὅσ’ ἄλλα ἀγαθὰ γόνιμα τῇ αὐτῶν φύσει ἀλλ’ οὐ δόξῃ ἐστίν, τοῦτ’ οὖν αὐτὸ ἐπαίνεσον δικαιοσύνης, ὃ αὐτὴ δι’ αὑτὴν τὸν ἔχοντα ὀνίνησιν καὶ ἀδικία βλάπτει, μισθοὺς δὲ καὶ δόξας πάρες ἄλλοις ἐπαινεῖν· ὡς ἐγὼ τῶν μὲν ἄλλων ἀποδεχοίμην ἂν οὕτως ἐπαινούντων δικαιοσύνην καὶ ψεγόντων ἀδικίαν, δόξας τε περὶ αὐτῶν καὶ μισθοὺς ἐγκωμιαζόντων καὶ λοιδορούντων, σοῦ δὲ οὐκ ἄν, εἰ μὴ σὺ κελεύοις, διότι πάντα τὸν βίον [367e] οὐδὲν ἄλλο σκοπῶν διελήλυθας ἢ τοῦτο.	You’ve agreed, then, that justice is among the greatest goods, the ones worth having for the sake of what comes from them, but much more for their own sake, like seeing, [367d] hearing, understanding, and of course being healthy, and all the other goods that are productive by their own nature and not by reputation. So praise justice for just this: the benefit it brings, itself through itself, to the one who has it, and the harm injustice does. Leave wages and reputations for others to praise. I’d put up with others praising justice and blaming injustice in that way, extolling and reviling the reputations and wages that go with them; but not you, unless you told me to, because you’ve spent your whole life [367e] examining nothing but this.
367e	μὴ οὖν ἡμῖν ἐνδείξῃ μόνον τῷ λόγῳ ὅτι δικαιοσύνη ἀδικίας κρεῖττον, ἀλλὰ καὶ τί ποιοῦσα ἑκατέρα τὸν	So don’t just show us in argument that justice is better than injustice; show us too what each of

GREEK

ENGLISH

ἔχοντα αὐτὴ δι' αὑτήν, ἐάντε λανθάνῃ ἐάντε μὴ θεούς τε καὶ ἀνθρώπους, ἡ μὲν ἀγαθόν, ἡ δὲ κακόν ἐστι.

them does, itself through itself, to the one who has it, whether or not gods and men notice, that makes the one good and the other bad.

καὶ ἐγὼ ἀκούσας, ἀεὶ μὲν δὴ τὴν φύσιν τοῦ τε Γλαύκωνος καὶ τοῦ Ἀδειμάντου ἠγάμην, ἀτὰρ οὖν καὶ τότε πάνυ γε 368a ἥσθην καὶ εἶπον· οὐ κακῶς εἰς ὑμᾶς, ὦ παῖδες ἐκείνου τοῦ ἀνδρός, τὴν ἀρχὴν τῶν ἐλεγείων ἐποίησεν ὁ Γλαύκωνος ἐραστής, εὐδοκιμήσαντας περὶ τὴν Μεγαροῖ μάχην, εἰπών— παῖδες Ἀρίστωνος, κλεινοῦ θεῖον γένος ἀνδρός· τοῦτό μοι, ὦ φίλοι, εὖ δοκεῖ ἔχειν· πάνυ γὰρ θεῖον πεπόνθατε, εἰ μὴ πέπεισθε ἀδικίαν δικαιοσύνης ἄμεινον εἶναι, οὕτω δυνάμενοι εἰπεῖν ὑπὲρ αὐτοῦ. δοκεῖτε δή μοι ὡς 368b ἀληθῶς οὐ πεπεῖσθαι—τεκμαίρομαι δὲ ἐκ τοῦ ἄλλου τοῦ ὑμετέρου τρόπου, ἐπεὶ κατά γε αὐτοὺς τοὺς λόγους ἠπίστουν ἂν ὑμῖν—ὅσῳ δὲ μᾶλλον πιστεύω, τοσούτῳ μᾶλλον ἀπορῶ ὅτι χρήσωμαι.

When I heard this, though I'd always admired the natures of Glaucon and Adeimantus, I was especially 368a delighted on this occasion, and I said, "Sons of that man, it wasn't badly said of you when Glaucon's lover began his elegy, after you'd distinguished yourselves at the battle of Megara, with the words 'Sons of Ariston, godlike offspring of a famous man.' That seems to me well put, my friends. Something truly godlike has happened to you, if you aren't convinced that injustice is better than justice when you can speak for it like that. And I really do believe you 368b aren't convinced. I judge from the rest of your character, since from your words alone I wouldn't trust you. But the more I trust you, the more I'm at a loss what to do.[6]

368b οὔτε γὰρ ὅπως βοηθῶ ἔχω· δοκῶ γάρ μοι ἀδύνατος εἶναι— σημεῖον δέ μοι, ὅτι ἃ πρὸς Θρασύμαχον λέγων ᾠμην ἀποφαίνειν ὡς ἄμεινον δικαιοσύνη ἀδικίας, οὐκ ἀπεδέξασθέ μου—οὔτ' αὖ ὅπως μὴ βοηθήσω ἔχω· δέδοικα γὰρ μὴ οὐδ' ὅσιον ᾖ παραγενόμενον δικαιοσύνῃ κακηγορουμένῃ 368c ἀπαγορεύειν καὶ μὴ βοηθεῖν ἔτι ἐμπνέοντα καὶ δυνάμενον φθέγγεσθαι. κράτιστον οὖν οὕτως ὅπως δύναμαι ἐπικουρεῖν αὐτῇ.

"I can't come to the rescue, since I think I'm not capable of it. My evidence is that you didn't accept what I said to Thrasymachus when I thought I was showing that justice is better than injustice. Yet I can't refuse to help either. I'm afraid it may even be impious to stand by while justice is being slandered 368c and give up on helping her while I still have breath and can speak. So the best thing is to defend her as well as I can."

THE CITY AS THE SOUL WRIT LARGE

Socrates proposes to look for justice first in a city, and describes a simple city meeting basic needs.

GREEK

ENGLISH

368c **SOCRATES** ὅ τε οὖν Γλαύκων καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι ἐδέοντο παντὶ τρόπῳ βοηθῆσαι καὶ μὴ ἀνεῖναι τὸν λόγον, ἀλλὰ διερευνήσασθαι τί τέ ἐστιν ἑκάτερον καὶ περὶ τῆς ὠφελίας αὐτοῖν τἀληθὲς ποτέρως ἔχει. εἶπον οὖν ὅπερ ἐμοὶ ἔδοξεν, ὅτι τὸ ζήτημα ᾧ ἐπιχειροῦμεν οὐ φαῦλον ἀλλ' ὀξὺ βλέποντος, ὡς ἐμοὶ 368d φαίνεται. ἐπειδὴ οὖν ἡμεῖς οὐ δεινοί, δοκῶ μοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοιαύτην ποιήσασθαι ζήτησιν αὐτοῦ, οἵανπερ ἂν εἰ προσέταξέ τις γράμματα σμικρὰ πόρρωθεν ἀναγνῶναι μὴ πάνυ ὀξὺ βλέπουσιν, ἔπειτά τις ἐνενόησεν, ὅτι τὰ αὐτὰ γράμματα ἔστι που καὶ ἄλλοθι μείζω τε καὶ ἐν μείζονι, ἔρμαιον ἂν ἐφάνη οἶμαι ἐκεῖνα πρῶτον ἀναγνόντας οὕτως ἐπισκοπεῖν τὰ ἐλάττω, εἰ τὰ αὐτὰ ὄντα τυγχάνει.

SOCRATES So Glaucon and the others begged me to help in every way and not let the argument drop, but to search out what each of them is and what the truth is about their benefits. I told them what I thought: that the inquiry we were undertaking was no trivial matter, but one for someone with sharp sight, as it seemed 368d to me. "Since we aren't clever," I said, "I think we should conduct this search the way we would if people without very sharp sight had been told to read small letters from a distance, and then someone noticed that the same letters were written somewhere else too, larger and on a larger surface. It would be a

6 Ariston was the father of Glaucon, Adeimantus and Plato; the battle at Megara was probably fought in 409 BC.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		godsend, I think, to read those first and then examine the smaller ones, to see whether they're the same."
368d	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Ἀδείμαντος· ἀλλὰ τί τοιοῦτον, ὦ 368e Σώκρατες, ἐν τῇ περὶ τὸ δίκαιον ζητήσει καθορᾷς;	"Certainly," said Adeimantus. "But what do you see in our search for justice that's like this, 368e Socrates?"
	ἐγώ σοι, ἔφην, ἐρῶ. δικαιοσύνη, φαμέν, ἔστι μὲν ἀνδρὸς ἑνός, ἔστι δέ που καὶ ὅλης πόλεως;	"I'll tell you," I said. "There's justice, we say, of a single man, but surely also of a whole city?"
	πάνυ γε, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Certainly," he said.
	οὐκοῦν μεῖζον πόλις ἑνὸς ἀνδρός;	"And a city is bigger than a single man?"
	μεῖζον, ἔφη.	"Bigger," he said.
368e	ἴσως τοίνυν πλείων ἂν δικαιοσύνη ἐν τῷ μείζονι ἐνείη καὶ ῥᾴων καταμαθεῖν. εἰ οὖν βούλεσθε, πρῶτον ἐν ταῖς 369a πόλεσι ζητήσωμεν ποῖόν τί ἐστιν· ἔπειτα οὕτως ἐπισκεψώμεθα καὶ ἐν ἑνὶ ἑκάστῳ, τὴν τοῦ μείζονος ὁμοιότητα ἐν τῇ τοῦ ἐλάττονος ἰδέᾳ ἐπισκοποῦντες.	"Then perhaps there'll be more justice in the bigger thing, and it will be easier to understand. So if you like, let's first look for what it's like in 369a cities, and then examine it in each individual as well, looking for the likeness of the bigger in the form of the smaller."
	ἀλλά μοι δοκεῖς, ἔφη, καλῶς λέγειν.	"I think that's a good idea," he said.
	ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἰ γιγνομένην πόλιν θεασαίμεθα λόγῳ, καὶ τὴν δικαιοσύνην αὐτῆς ἴδοιμεν ἂν γιγνομένην καὶ τὴν ἀδικίαν;	"Then if we watched a city coming into being in argument," I said, "would we also see its justice coming into being, and its injustice?"
	τάχ' ἄν, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Probably," he said.
	οὐκοῦν γενομένου αὐτοῦ ἐλπὶς εὐπετέστερον ἰδεῖν ὃ ζητοῦμεν; 369b	"And once that's done, can we hope to see what we're looking for more easily?" 369b
	πολύ γε.	"Much more easily."
369b	δοκεῖ οὖν χρῆναι ἐπιχειρῆσαι περαίνειν; οἶμαι μὲν γὰρ οὐκ ὀλίγον ἔργον αὐτὸ εἶναι· σκοπεῖτε οὖν.	"Do you think we should try to carry it through, then? I don't think it's a small job. So think it over."
	ἔσκεπται, ἔφη ὁ Ἀδείμαντος· ἀλλὰ μὴ ἄλλως ποίει.	"We have," said Adeimantus. "Go ahead and do it."
	γίγνεται τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πόλις, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, ἐπειδὴ τυγχάνει ἡμῶν ἕκαστος οὐκ αὐτάρκης, ἀλλὰ πολλῶν ὢν ἐνδεής· ἢ τίν' οἴει ἀρχὴν ἄλλην πόλιν οἰκίζειν;	"Well then," I said, "a city comes into being, I think, because none of us happens to be self-sufficient; each of us needs many things. Or do you think a city is founded on any other principle?"
	οὐδεμίαν, ἦ δ' ὅς. 369c	"None," he said. 369c
	οὕτω δὴ ἄρα παραλαμβάνων ἄλλος ἄλλον, ἐπ' ἄλλου, τὸν δ' ἐπ' ἄλλου χρείᾳ, πολλῶν δεόμενοι, πολλοὺς εἰς μίαν οἴκησιν ἀγείραντες κοινωνούς τε καὶ βοηθούς, ταύτῃ τῇ συνοικίᾳ ἐθέμεθα πόλιν ὄνομα· ἦ γάρ;	"So one person takes on another for one need, and another for another; and since they need many things, they gather many people into one place to live as partners and helpers, and to this settlement we've given the name 'city.' Isn't that so?"
369c	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
	μεταδίδωσι δὴ ἄλλος ἄλλῳ, εἴ τι μεταδίδωσιν, ἢ μεταλαμβάνει, οἰόμενος αὐτῷ ἄμεινον εἶναι;	"And whenever they share things with one another, giving or taking, each does it thinking it's better for himself?"
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
	ἴθι δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τῷ λόγῳ ἐξ ἀρχῆς ποιῶμεν πόλιν· ποιήσει δὲ αὐτήν, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἡ ἡμετέρα χρεία.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	πῶς δ’ οὔ; 369d	“Come on, then,” I said, “let’s make a city in argument from the beginning. And what will make it, it seems, is our need.”
	ἀλλὰ μὴν πρώτη γε καὶ μεγίστη τῶν χρειῶν ἡ τῆς τροφῆς παρασκευὴ τοῦ εἶναί τε καὶ ζῆν ἕνεκα.	“Of course.” 369d
	παντάπασί γε.	“Now the first and greatest of our needs is the provision of food, so that we can exist and live.”
	δευτέρα δὴ οἰκήσεως, τρίτη δὲ ἐσθῆτος καὶ τῶν τοιούτων.	“Absolutely.”
	ἔστι ταῦτα.	“The second is housing, and the third clothing and that sort of thing.”
		“That’s right.”
369d	φέρε δή, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, πῶς ἡ πόλις ἀρκέσει ἐπὶ τοσαύτην παρασκευήν; ἄλλο τι γεωργὸς μὲν εἷς, ὁ δὲ οἰκοδόμος, ἄλλος δέ τις ὑφάντης; ἢ καὶ σκυτοτόμον αὐτόσε προσθήσομεν ἤ τιν’ ἄλλον τῶν περὶ τὸ σῶμα θεραπευτήν;	“Well then,” I said, “how will the city be able to provide so much? Won’t one be a farmer, another a builder, and another a weaver? Or shall we add a shoemaker too, or someone else who looks after the needs of the body?”
	πάνυ γε.	“Certainly.”
	εἴη δ’ ἂν ἥ γε ἀναγκαιοτάτη πόλις ἐκ τεττάρων ἢ πέντε ἀνδρῶν. 369e	“So the barest necessary city would consist of four or five men.” 369e
	φαίνεται.	“Apparently.”
369e	τί δὴ οὖν; ἕνα ἕκαστον τούτων δεῖ τὸ αὑτοῦ ἔργον ἅπασι κοινὸν κατατιθέναι, οἷον τὸν γεωργὸν ἕνα ὄντα παρασκευάζειν σιτία τέτταρσιν καὶ τετραπλάσιον χρόνον τε καὶ πόνον ἀναλίσκειν ἐπὶ σίτου παρασκευῇ καὶ ἄλλοις κοινωνεῖν, ἢ ἀμελήσαντα ἑαυτῷ μόνον τέταρτον μέρος ποιεῖν τούτου τοῦ 370a σίτου ἐν τετάρτῳ μέρει τοῦ χρόνου, τὰ δὲ τρία, τὸ μὲν ἐπὶ τῇ τῆς οἰκίας παρασκευῇ διατρίβειν, τὸ δὲ ἱματίου, τὸ δὲ ὑποδημάτων, καὶ μὴ ἄλλοις κοινωνοῦντα πράγματα ἔχειν, ἀλλ’ αὐτὸν δι’ αὑτὸν τὰ αὑτοῦ πράττειν;	“What next? Should each of them contribute his own work for all of them in common? Should the farmer, for example, being one man, provide food for four, spending four times the time and labor on providing food and sharing it with the others? Or should he not bother about them, and produce a quarter of this 370a food for himself alone in a quarter of the time, and spend the other three quarters providing a house, a cloak and shoes, not having the trouble of sharing with others but minding his own business by himself and for himself?”
370a	καὶ ὁ Ἀδείμαντος ἔφη· ἀλλ’ ἴσως, ὦ Σώκρατες, οὕτω ῥᾷον ἢ ’κεῖνος.	And Adeimantus said, “Maybe, Socrates, the first way is easier than the other.”
	οὐδέν, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, μὰ Δία ἄτοπον. ἐννοῶ γὰρ καὶ αὐτὸς εἰπόντος σοῦ, ὅτι πρῶτον μὲν ἡμῶν φύεται ἕκαστος οὐ πάνυ 370b ὅμοιος ἑκάστῳ, ἀλλὰ διαφέρων τὴν φύσιν, ἄλλος ἐπ’ ἄλλου ἔργου πράξει. ἢ οὐ δοκεῖ σοι;	“By Zeus,” I said, “that’s not at all surprising. Now that you say it, it occurs to me too that, first of all, each of us is born not at all 370b like anyone else, but different in nature, one suited to one job and another to another. Don’t you think so?”
	ἔμοιγε.	“I do.”
	τί δέ; πότερον κάλλιον πράττοι ἄν τις εἷς ὢν πολλὰς τέχνας ἐργαζόμενος, ἢ ὅταν μίαν εἷς;	“Well then, would someone do better working at many crafts on his own, or when one person works at one?”
	ὅταν, ἦ δ’ ὅς, εἷς μίαν.	“When one works at one,” he said.
	ἀλλὰ μὴν οἶμαι καὶ τόδε δῆλον, ὡς, ἐάν τίς τινος παρῇ ἔργου καιρόν, διόλλυται.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"And this too is clear, I think: if someone misses the right moment for a job, it's ruined."
370b	δῆλον γάρ.	"Yes, that's clear."
	οὐ γὰρ οἶμαι ἐθέλει τὸ πραττόμενον τὴν τοῦ πράττοντος σχολὴν περιμένειν, ἀλλ' ἀνάγκη τὸν πράττοντα τῷ πραττομένῳ 370c ἐπακολουθεῖν μὴ ἐν παρέργου μέρει.	"For the work, I think, isn't willing to wait until the worker has time; the worker has to keep up with the work 370c and not treat it as a sideline."
	ἀνάγκη.	"He has to."
	ἐκ δὴ τούτων πλείω τε ἕκαστα γίγνεται καὶ κάλλιον καὶ ῥᾷον, ὅταν εἷς ἓν κατὰ φύσιν καὶ ἐν καιρῷ, σχολὴν τῶν ἄλλων ἄγων, πράττῃ.	"So from this it follows that more of each thing gets done, and better and more easily, when one person does one thing, in accordance with his nature and at the right time, free of other tasks."
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν.	"Absolutely."
370c	πλειόνων δή, ὦ Ἀδείμαντε, δεῖ πολιτῶν ἢ τεττάρων ἐπὶ τὰς παρασκευὰς ὧν ἐλέγομεν. ὁ γὰρ γεωργός, ὡς ἔοικεν, οὐκ αὐτὸς ποιήσεται ἑαυτῷ τὸ ἄροτρον, εἰ μέλλει καλὸν εἶναι, 370d οὐδὲ σμινύην, οὐδὲ τἆλλα ὄργανα ὅσα περὶ γεωργίαν. οὐδ' αὖ ὁ οἰκοδόμος· πολλῶν δὲ καὶ τούτῳ δεῖ. ὡσαύτως δ' ὁ ὑφάντης τε καὶ ὁ σκυτοτόμος· ἢ οὔ;	"Then we need more citizens than four, Adeimantus, to provide the things we mentioned. For the farmer, it seems, won't make his own plow, if it's to be a good one, 370d or his hoe, or any of the other tools for farming. Nor will the builder, who also needs many things. The same goes for the weaver and the shoemaker, doesn't it?"
	ἀληθῆ.	"True."
	τέκτονες δὴ καὶ χαλκῆς καὶ τοιοῦτοί τινες πολλοὶ δημιουργοί, κοινωνοὶ ἡμῖν τοῦ πολιχνίου γιγνόμενοι, συχνὸν αὐτὸ ποιοῦσιν.	"So carpenters and smiths and many other craftsmen of that sort will join our little city and make it quite populous."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
370d	ἀλλ' οὐκ ἄν πω πάνυ γε μέγα τι εἴη, εἰ αὐτοῖς βουκόλους τε καὶ ποιμένας τούς τε ἄλλους νομέας προσθεῖμεν, ἵνα οἵ τε 370e γεωργοὶ ἐπὶ τὸ ἀροῦν ἔχοιεν βοῦς, οἵ τε οἰκοδόμοι πρὸς τὰς ἀγωγὰς μετὰ τῶν γεωργῶν χρῆσθαι ὑποζυγίοις, ὑφάνται δὲ καὶ σκυτοτόμοι δέρμασίν τε καὶ ἐρίοις.	"But it still wouldn't be very big if we added cowherds and shepherds and other herdsmen, so that 370e the farmers would have oxen for plowing, the builders, along with the farmers, would have draft animals for hauling, and the weavers and shoemakers would have hides and wool."
	οὐδέ γε, ἦ δ' ὅς, σμικρὰ πόλις ἂν εἴη ἔχουσα πάντα ταῦτα.	"It wouldn't be a small city either," he said, "if it had all that."
	ἀλλὰ μήν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, κατοικίσαι γε αὐτὴν τὴν πόλιν εἰς τοιοῦτον τόπον οὗ ἐπεισαγωγίμων μὴ δεήσεται, σχεδόν τι ἀδύνατον.	"And yet," I said, "it's practically impossible to found the city itself in a place where it won't need imports."
	ἀδύνατον γάρ.	"Yes, it's impossible."
370e	προσδεήσει ἄρα ἔτι καὶ ἄλλων, οἳ ἐξ ἄλλης πόλεως αὐτῇ κομιοῦσιν ὧν δεῖται.	"So it will need still others, who'll bring it what it needs from another city."
	δεήσει.	"It will."
	καὶ μὴν κενὸς ἂν ἴῃ ὁ διάκονος, μηδὲν ἄγων ὧν ἐκεῖνοι 371a δέονται παρ' ὧν ἂν κομίζωνται ὧν ἂν αὐτοῖς χρεία, κενὸς ἄπεισιν. ἦ γάρ;	"And if the one who serves it goes empty-handed, taking nothing that those people 371a need from whom they're getting what they need themselves, he'll come back empty-handed, won't he?"
	δοκεῖ μοι.	"I think so."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	δεῖ δὴ τὰ οἴκοι μὴ μόνον ἑαυτοῖς ποιεῖν ἱκανά, ἀλλὰ καὶ οἷα καὶ ὅσα ἐκείνοις ὧν ἂν δέωνται.	"So at home they must produce not only enough for themselves, but also goods of the kind and in the quantity those others need."
	δεῖ γάρ.	"They must."
	πλειόνων δὴ γεωργῶν τε καὶ τῶν ἄλλων δημιουργῶν δεῖ ἡμῖν τῇ πόλει.	"Then our city needs more farmers and other craftsmen."
	πλειόνων γάρ.	"Yes, more."
371a	καὶ δὴ καὶ τῶν ἄλλων διακόνων που τῶν τε εἰσαξόντων καὶ ἐξαξόντων ἕκαστα. οὗτοι δέ εἰσιν ἔμποροι· ἦ γάρ;	"And also, surely, other servants, to import and export each kind of goods. These are merchants, aren't they?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	καὶ ἐμπόρων δὴ δεησόμεθα.	"So we'll need merchants too."
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
	καὶ ἐὰν μέν γε κατὰ θάλατταν ἡ ἐμπορία γίγνηται, συχνῶν [371b] καὶ ἄλλων προσδεήσεται τῶν ἐπιστημόνων τῆς περὶ τὴν θάλατταν ἐργασίας.	"And if the trade goes by sea, it will need a good many [371b] others as well, who know about work at sea."
	συχνῶν μέντοι.	"A good many, yes."
	τί δὲ δή; ἐν αὐτῇ τῇ πόλει πῶς ἀλλήλοις μεταδώσουσιν ὧν ἂν ἕκαστοι ἐργάζωνται; ὧν δὴ ἕνεκα καὶ κοινωνίαν ποιησάμενοι πόλιν ᾠκίσαμεν.	"And what about in the city itself? How will they share with one another what each of them produces? It was for this, after all, that we formed a partnership and founded a city."
	δῆλον δή, ἦ δ' ὅς, ὅτι πωλοῦντες καὶ ὠνούμενοι.	"Clearly," he said, "by selling and buying."
371b	ἀγορὰ δὴ ἡμῖν καὶ νόμισμα σύμβολον τῆς ἀλλαγῆς ἕνεκα γενήσεται ἐκ τούτου.	"So from this we'll get a marketplace, and money as a token for the sake of exchange."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν. [371c]	"Certainly." [371c]
	ἂν οὖν κομίσας ὁ γεωργὸς εἰς τὴν ἀγοράν τι ὧν ποιεῖ, ἢ τις ἄλλος τῶν δημιουργῶν, μὴ εἰς τὸν αὐτὸν χρόνον ἥκῃ τοῖς δεομένοις τὰ παρ' αὐτοῦ ἀλλάξασθαι, ἀργήσει τῆς αὐτοῦ δημιουργίας καθήμενος ἐν ἀγορᾷ;	"Then if the farmer, or any other craftsman, brings some of his produce to the marketplace and doesn't arrive at the same time as those who need to exchange with him, will he sit in the marketplace idle, neglecting his own craft?"
371c	οὐδαμῶς, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἀλλὰ εἰσὶν οἳ τοῦτο ὁρῶντες ἑαυτοὺς ἐπὶ τὴν διακονίαν τάττουσιν ταύτην, ἐν μὲν ταῖς ὀρθῶς οἰκουμέναις πόλεσι σχεδόν τι οἱ ἀσθενέστατοι τὰ σώματα καὶ ἀχρεῖοί τι ἄλλο ἔργον πράττειν. αὐτοῦ γὰρ δεῖ μένοντας [371d] αὐτοὺς περὶ τὴν ἀγορὰν τὰ μὲν ἀντ' ἀργυρίου ἀλλάξασθαι τοῖς τι δεομένοις ἀποδόσθαι, τοῖς δὲ ἀντὶ αὖ ἀργυρίου διαλλάττειν ὅσοι τι δέονται πρίασθαι.	"Not at all," he said. "There are people who see this and appoint themselves to this service. In well-run cities they're usually those who are weakest in body and no use for any other work. They have to stay [371d] right there around the marketplace and give money in exchange for goods to those who need to sell something, and goods in exchange for money to all who need to buy something."
371d	αὕτη ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἡ χρεία καπήλων ἡμῖν γένεσιν ἐμποιεῖ τῇ πόλει. ἢ οὐ καπήλους καλοῦμεν τοὺς πρὸς ὠνήν τε καὶ πρᾶσιν διακονοῦντας ἱδρυμένους ἐν ἀγορᾷ, τοὺς δὲ πλανήτας ἐπὶ τὰς πόλεις ἐμπόρους;	"So this need," I said, "brings shopkeepers into being in our city. Or don't we call those who provide the service of buying and selling, set up in the marketplace, shopkeepers, and those who travel from city to city merchants?"
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν. [371e]	"Certainly." [371e]

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἔτι δή τινες, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, εἰσὶ καὶ ἄλλοι διάκονοι, οἳ ἂν τὰ μὲν τῆς διανοίας μὴ πάνυ ἀξιοκοινώνητοι ὦσιν, τὴν δὲ τοῦ σώματος ἰσχὺν ἱκανὴν ἐπὶ τοὺς πόνους ἔχωσιν· οἳ δὴ πωλοῦντες τὴν τῆς ἰσχύος χρείαν, τὴν τιμὴν ταύτην μισθὸν καλοῦντες, κέκληνται, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, μισθωτοί· ἦ γάρ;	"And there are still other servants, I think, who wouldn't be very worthwhile partners where the mind is concerned, but have enough bodily strength for hard labor. They sell the use of their strength and call the price a wage, and so they're called, I think, wage earners. Isn't that so?"
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
371e	πλήρωμα δὴ πόλεώς εἰσιν, ὡς ἔοικε, καὶ μισθωτοί.	"So wage earners too, it seems, help make up the full complement of a city."
	δοκεῖ μοι.	"I think so."
	ἆρ' οὖν, ὦ Ἀδείμαντε, ἤδη ἡμῖν ηὔξηται ἡ πόλις, ὥστ' εἶναι τελέα;	"Well, Adeimantus, has our city now grown to completion?"
	ἴσως.	"Perhaps."
	ποῦ οὖν ἄν ποτε ἐν αὐτῇ εἴη ἥ τε δικαιοσύνη καὶ ἡ ἀδικία; καὶ τίνι ἅμα ἐγγενομένη ὧν ἐσκέμμεθα;	"Then where in it would justice and injustice be? And along with which of the things we've looked at did they come into it?"
	ἐγὼ μέν, ἔφη, οὐκ ἐννοῶ, ὦ Σώκρατες, εἰ μή που ἐν αὐτῶν τούτων χρείᾳ τινὶ τῇ πρὸς ἀλλήλους.	"I can't think, Socrates," he said, "unless perhaps it's somewhere in the need these very people have of one another."
	ἀλλ' ἴσως, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καλῶς λέγεις· καὶ σκεπτέον γε καὶ οὐκ ἀποκνητέον.	"Perhaps you're right," I said. "We must look into it and not shrink from it."
372a	πρῶτον οὖν σκεψώμεθα τίνα τρόπον διαιτήσονται οἱ οὕτω παρεσκευασμένοι. ἄλλο τι ἢ σῖτόν τε ποιοῦντες καὶ οἶνον καὶ ἱμάτια καὶ ὑποδήματα; καὶ οἰκοδομησάμενοι οἰκίας, θέρους μὲν τὰ πολλὰ γυμνοί τε καὶ ἀνυπόδητοι ἐργάσονται, τοῦ δὲ [372b] χειμῶνος ἠμφιεσμένοι τε καὶ ὑποδεδεμένοι ἱκανῶς· θρέψονται δὲ ἐκ μὲν τῶν κριθῶν ἄλφιτα σκευαζόμενοι, ἐκ δὲ τῶν πυρῶν ἄλευρα, τὰ μὲν πέψαντες, τὰ δὲ μάξαντες, μάζας γενναίας καὶ ἄρτους ἐπὶ κάλαμόν τινα παραβαλλόμενοι ἢ φύλλα καθαρά, κατακλινέντες ἐπὶ στιβάδων ἐστρωμένων μίλακί τε καὶ μυρρίναις, εὐωχήσονται αὐτοί τε καὶ τὰ παιδία, ἐπιπίνοντες τοῦ οἴνου, ἐστεφανωμένοι καὶ ὑμνοῦντες τοὺς θεούς, ἡδέως συνόντες ἀλλήλοις, οὐχ ὑπὲρ τὴν οὐσίαν ποιούμενοι [372c] τοὺς παῖδας, εὐλαβούμενοι πενίαν ἢ πόλεμον.	"First, then, let's look at how people provided for in this way will live. Won't they produce grain and wine and clothes and shoes? They'll build houses, and in summer they'll mostly work stripped and barefoot, and in [372b] winter adequately clothed and shod. For food they'll make barley meal from their barley and flour from their wheat, baking some and kneading some, and they'll set out fine barley cakes and loaves on reeds or clean leaves. Reclining on beds strewn with bryony and myrtle, they'll feast, they and their children, drinking wine afterwards, wearing garlands and singing hymns to the gods. They'll enjoy one another's company, and won't have more [372c] children than their means allow, guarding against poverty or war."
372c	καὶ ὁ Γλαύκων ὑπολαβών, Ἄνευ ὄψου, ἔφη, ὡς ἔοικας, ποιεῖς τοὺς ἄνδρας ἑστιωμένους.	And Glaucon broke in. "Your men seem to be feasting on plain bread," he said, "with nothing to go with it."
	ἀληθῆ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λέγεις. ἐπελαθόμην ὅτι καὶ ὄψον ἕξουσιν, ἅλας τε δῆλον ὅτι καὶ ἐλάας καὶ τυρόν, καὶ βολβοὺς καὶ λάχανά γε, οἷα δὴ ἐν ἀγροῖς ἑψήματα, ἑψήσονται. καὶ τραγήματά που παραθήσομεν αὐτοῖς τῶν τε σύκων καὶ ἐρεβίνθων καὶ κυάμων, καὶ μύρτα καὶ φηγοὺς σποδιοῦσιν [372d] πρὸς τὸ πῦρ, μετρίως ὑποπίνοντες· καὶ οὕτω διάγοντες τὸν βίον ἐν εἰρήνῃ μετὰ	"That's true," I said. "I forgot that they'll have things to go with it: salt, obviously, and olives and cheese, and they'll boil onions and greens, the sort of things people boil in the country. And we'll set out desserts for them, of figs and chickpeas and beans, and they'll roast myrtle-berries and acorns

GREEK

ENGLISH

ὑγιείας, ὡς εἰκός, γηραιοὶ τελευτῶντες ἄλλον τοιοῦτον βίον τοῖς ἐκγόνοις παραδώσουσιν.

[372d] in the fire, drinking in moderation. And so, living out their lives in peace and good health, as you'd expect, they'll die old and hand on another life just like it to their descendants."

372d καὶ ὅς, εἰ δὲ ὑῶν πόλιν, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, κατεσκεύαζες, τί ἂν αὐτὰς ἄλλο ἢ ταῦτα ἐχόρταζες;

ἀλλὰ πῶς χρή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Γλαύκων;

ἅπερ νομίζεται, ἔφη· ἐπί τε κλινῶν κατακεῖσθαι οἶμαι τοὺς μέλλοντας μὴ ταλαιπωρεῖσθαι, καὶ ἀπὸ τραπεζῶν [372e] δειπνεῖν, καὶ ὄψα ἅπερ καὶ οἱ νῦν ἔχουσι καὶ τραγήματα.

And he said, "If you were founding a city of pigs, Socrates, what else would you fatten them on but this?"

"Well, how should they live, Glaucon?" I said.

"The customary way," he said. "If they aren't going to be miserable, I think they should recline on couches and dine off tables, [372e] and have the dishes and desserts people have nowadays."

THE FEVERISH CITY AND ITS GUARDIANS

Glaucon demands luxuries, and the enlarged city needs an army of guardians with the right natures.

GREEK

ENGLISH

372e **SOCRATES** εἶεν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· μανθάνω. οὐ πόλιν, ὡς ἔοικε, σκοποῦμεν μόνον ὅπως γίγνεται, ἀλλὰ καὶ τρυφῶσαν πόλιν. ἴσως οὖν οὐδὲ κακῶς ἔχει· σκοποῦντες γὰρ καὶ τοιαύτην τάχ' ἂν κατίδοιμεν τήν τε δικαιοσύνην καὶ ἀδικίαν ὅπῃ ποτὲ ταῖς πόλεσιν ἐμφύονται. ἡ μὲν οὖν ἀληθινὴ πόλις δοκεῖ μοι εἶναι ἣν διεληλύθαμεν, ὥσπερ ὑγιής τις· εἰ δ' αὖ βούλεσθε, καὶ φλεγμαίνουσαν πόλιν θεωρήσωμεν· οὐδὲν ἀποκωλύει.

SOCRATES "Very well," I said. "I understand. It seems we're examining not only how a city comes into being, but how a luxurious city does. Perhaps that's no bad thing: by examining a city like that too, we might well see how justice and injustice take root in cities. Now the true city, I think, is the one we've described, the healthy one, as it were. But if you want, let's also look at a city with a fever. Nothing stops us.

373a ταῦτα γὰρ δή τισιν, ὡς δοκεῖ, οὐκ ἐξαρκέσει, οὐδὲ αὕτη ἡ δίαιτα, ἀλλὰ κλῖναί τε προσέσονται καὶ τράπεζαι καὶ τἆλλα σκεύη, καὶ ὄψα δὴ καὶ μύρα καὶ θυμιάματα καὶ ἑταῖραι καὶ πέμματα, καὶ ἕκαστα τούτων παντοδαπά. καὶ δὴ καὶ ἃ τὸ πρῶτον ἐλέγομεν οὐκέτι ταναγκαῖα θετέον, οἰκίας τε καὶ ἱμάτια καὶ ὑποδήματα, ἀλλὰ τήν τε ζωγραφίαν κινητέον καὶ τὴν ποικιλίαν, καὶ χρυσὸν καὶ ἐλέφαντα καὶ πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα κτητέον. ἦ γάρ; [373b]

ναί, ἔφη.

"For some people, it seems, these things won't be enough, and neither will this way of life. Couches will be added, and tables and other furniture, and dishes too, and perfumes and incense, and courtesans and pastries, and every one of these in every variety. And the things we mentioned first, houses and clothes and shoes, can no longer be counted as the necessities; we'll have to set painting and embroidery going, and acquire gold and ivory and everything of that kind. Isn't that so?" [373b]

"Yes," he said.

373b οὐκοῦν μείζονά τε αὖ τὴν πόλιν δεῖ ποιεῖν· ἐκείνη γὰρ ἡ ὑγιεινὴ οὐκέτι ἱκανή, ἀλλ' ἤδη ὄγκου ἐμπλητέα καὶ πλήθους, ἃ οὐκέτι τοῦ ἀναγκαίου ἕνεκά ἐστιν ἐν ταῖς πόλεσιν, οἷον οἵ τε θηρευταὶ πάντες οἵ τε μιμηταί, πολλοὶ μὲν οἱ περὶ τὰ σχήματά τε καὶ χρώματα, πολλοὶ δὲ οἱ περὶ μουσικήν, ποιηταί τε καὶ τούτων ὑπηρέται, ῥαψῳδοί, ὑποκριταί, χορευταί, ἐργολάβοι, σκευῶν τε παντοδαπῶν δημιουργοί, τῶν τε ἄλλων [373c] καὶ τῶν περὶ τὸν γυναικεῖον κόσμον. καὶ δὴ καὶ διακόνων πλειόνων

"Then we have to make the city bigger again. The healthy one is no longer adequate; now it has to be filled with a mass and multitude of things that are no longer in cities because they're needed. All the hunters, for instance, and the imitators: many concerned with shapes and colors, many with music; poets and their assistants, rhapsodes, actors, chorus-dancers, contractors; and makers of all

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	δεησόμεθα· ἢ οὐ δοκεῖ δεήσειν παιδαγωγῶν, τιτθῶν, τροφῶν, κομμωτριῶν, κουρέων, καὶ αὖ ὀψοποιῶν τε καὶ μαγείρων; ἔτι δὲ καὶ συβωτῶν προσδεησόμεθα· τοῦτο γὰρ ἡμῖν ἐν τῇ προτέρᾳ πόλει οὐκ ἐνῆν—ἔδει γὰρ οὐδέν—ἐν δὲ ταύτῃ καὶ τούτου προσδεήσει.	kinds of goods, including those [373c] for women's adornment. We'll need more servants too. Or don't you think we'll need children's attendants, wet nurses, nannies, hairdressers, barbers, and cooks and butchers as well? And we'll need swineherds besides. There were none in our earlier city, since there was no need of them, but in this one we'll need them too.[7]
373c	δεήσει δὲ καὶ τῶν ἄλλων βοσκημάτων παμπόλλων, εἴ τις αὐτὰ ἔδεται· ἦ γάρ;	"And we'll need a great many other animals as well, if people are going to eat them. Won't we?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ; [373d]	"Of course." [373d]
	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἰατρῶν ἐν χρείαις ἐσόμεθα πολὺ μᾶλλον οὕτω διαιτώμενοι ἢ ὡς τὸ πρότερον;	"And living like this, we'll have far more need of doctors than before?"
	πολύ γε.	"Far more."
	καὶ ἡ χώρα γέ που, ἡ τότε ἱκανὴ τρέφειν τοὺς τότε, σμικρὰ δὴ ἐξ ἱκανῆς ἔσται. ἢ πῶς λέγομεν;	"And the land, I suppose, which was enough to feed the people back then, will now be too small instead of enough. Or what do we say?"
	οὕτως, ἔφη.	"Just that," he said.
	οὐκοῦν τῆς τῶν πλησίον χώρας ἡμῖν ἀποτμητέον, εἰ μέλλομεν ἱκανὴν ἕξειν νέμειν τε καὶ ἀροῦν, καὶ ἐκείνοις αὖ τῆς ἡμετέρας, ἐὰν καὶ ἐκεῖνοι ἀφῶσιν αὐτοὺς ἐπὶ χρημάτων κτῆσιν ἄπειρον, ὑπερβάντες τὸν τῶν ἀναγκαίων ὅρον; [373e]	"Then we'll have to cut off a slice of our neighbors' land, if we're going to have enough for pasture and plowing, and they'll want a slice of ours, if they too give themselves over to the unlimited acquisition of wealth and overstep the limit of what's necessary?" [373e]
	πολλὴ ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες.	"That's quite inevitable, Socrates," he said.
373e	πολεμήσομεν δὴ τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο, ὦ Γλαύκων; ἢ πῶς ἔσται;	"So next we'll go to war, Glaucon? Or how will it be?"
	οὕτως, ἔφη.	"Like that," he said.
	καὶ μηδέν γέ πω λέγωμεν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μήτ' εἴ τι κακὸν μήτ' εἰ ἀγαθὸν ὁ πόλεμος ἐργάζεται, ἀλλὰ τοσοῦτον μόνον, ὅτι πολέμου αὖ γένεσιν ηὑρήκαμεν, ἐξ ὧν μάλιστα ταῖς πόλεσιν καὶ ἰδίᾳ καὶ δημοσίᾳ κακὰ γίγνεται, ὅταν γίγνηται.	"And let's not say yet," I said, "whether war does any harm or any good, but only this much: that we've now found the origin of war too. It comes from the very things that, whenever they arise, are the chief source of evils in cities, both for individuals and for the community."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
	ἔτι δή, ὦ φίλε, μείζονος τῆς πόλεως δεῖ οὗ τι σμικρῷ, [374a] ἀλλ' ὅλῳ στρατοπέδῳ, ὃ ἐξελθὸν ὑπὲρ τῆς οὐσίας ἁπάσης καὶ ὑπὲρ ὧν νυνδὴ ἐλέγομεν διαμαχεῖται τοῖς ἐπιοῦσιν.	"Then the city needs to be bigger still, my friend, and not by a little, [374a] but by a whole army, which will march out and fight off invaders in defense of all its property and of everything we were just talking about."
374a	τί δέ; ἦ δ' ὅς· αὐτοὶ οὐχ ἱκανοί;	"Why?" he said. "Aren't the citizens themselves enough?"
	οὔκ, εἰ σύ γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ ἡμεῖς ἅπαντες ὡμολογήσαμεν καλῶς, ἡνίκα ἐπλάττομεν τὴν πόλιν· ὡμολογοῦμεν δέ	"No," I said, "not if you and the rest of us were right in what we agreed when we were shaping the

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	που, εἰ μέμνησαι, ἀδύνατον ἕνα πολλὰς καλῶς ἐργάζεσθαι τέχνας.	city. We agreed, if you remember, that it's impossible for one person to practice many crafts well."
	ἀληθῆ λέγεις, ἔφη. 374b	"That's true," he said. 374b
	τί οὖν; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· ἡ περὶ τὸν πόλεμον ἀγωνία οὐ τεχνικὴ δοκεῖ εἶναι;	"Well then," I said, "doesn't fighting a war seem to be a matter of skill?"
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
	ἦ οὖν τι σκυτικῆς δεῖ μᾶλλον κήδεσθαι ἢ πολεμικῆς;	"Should we care more about shoemaking than about the art of war?"
	οὐδαμῶς.	"Not at all."
374b	ἀλλ' ἆρα τὸν μὲν σκυτοτόμον διεκωλύομεν μήτε γεωργὸν ἐπιχειρεῖν εἶναι ἅμα μήτε ὑφάντην μήτε οἰκοδόμον ἀλλὰ σκυτοτόμον, ἵνα δὴ ἡμῖν τὸ τῆς σκυτικῆς ἔργον καλῶς γίγνοιτο, καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ἑνὶ ἑκάστῳ ὡσαύτως ἓν ἀπεδίδομεν, πρὸς ὃ ἐπεφύκει ἕκαστος καὶ ἐφ' ᾧ ἔμελλε τῶν ἄλλων 374c σχολὴν ἄγων διὰ βίου αὐτὸ ἐργαζόμενος οὐ παριεὶς τοὺς καιροὺς καλῶς ἀπεργάσεσθαι· τὰ δὲ δὴ περὶ τὸν πόλεμον πότερον οὐ περὶ πλείστου ἐστὶν εὖ ἀπεργασθέντα; ἢ οὕτω ῥᾴδιον, ὥστε καὶ γεωργῶν τις ἅμα πολεμικὸς ἔσται καὶ σκυτοτομῶν καὶ ἄλλην τέχνην ἡντινοῦν ἐργαζόμενος, πεττευτικὸς δὲ ἢ κυβευτικὸς ἱκανῶς οὐδ' ἂν εἷς γένοιτο μὴ αὐτὸ τοῦτο ἐκ παιδὸς ἐπιτηδεύων, ἀλλὰ παρέργῳ χρώμενος;	"Yet we wouldn't let the shoemaker try to be a farmer at the same time, or a weaver or a builder; he was to be a shoemaker, so that our shoemaking would be done well. And in the same way we gave each of the others one job, the one he was naturally suited for, which he was to work at all his life, free 374c of the others, not letting the right moments slip by, and so do it well. Now isn't it of the greatest importance that the business of war be done well? Or is it so easy that someone who farms, or makes shoes, or practices any other craft whatever, can be a soldier at the same time, when nobody could become even a competent player of board games or dice if he didn't practice that very thing from childhood but treated it as a sideline?
374d	καὶ ἀσπίδα μὲν λαβὼν ἤ τι ἄλλο τῶν πολεμικῶν ὅπλων τε καὶ ὀργάνων αὐθημερὸν ὁπλιτικῆς ἤ τινος ἄλλης μάχης τῶν κατὰ πόλεμον ἱκανὸς ἔσται ἀγωνιστής, τῶν δὲ ἄλλων ὀργάνων οὐδὲν οὐδένα δημιουργὸν οὐδὲ ἀθλητὴν ληφθὲν ποιήσει, οὐδ' ἔσται χρήσιμον τῷ μήτε τὴν ἐπιστήμην ἑκάστου λαβόντι μήτε τὴν μελέτην ἱκανὴν παρασχομένῳ;	"Will someone who picks up a shield, or any other weapon or instrument of war, be a competent fighter that very day, in the heavy infantry or any other kind of battle war involves, when no other tool, just by being picked up, will make anyone a craftsman or an athlete, or be any use to someone who hasn't acquired the knowledge of it or put in enough practice?"
	πολλοῦ γὰρ ἄν, ἦ δ' ὅς, τὰ ὄργανα ἦν ἄξια.	"If that were so," he said, "tools would be worth a great deal."
	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅσῳ μέγιστον τὸ τῶν φυλάκων ἔργον, 374e τοσούτῳ σχολῆς τε τῶν ἄλλων πλείστης ἂν εἴη καὶ αὖ τέχνης τε καὶ ἐπιμελείας μεγίστης δεόμενον.	"Then," I said, "the more important the guardians' work is, 374e the more it would need freedom from other occupations, and the greatest skill and care."
	οἶμαι ἔγωγε, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"I certainly think so," he said.
	ἆρ' οὖν οὐ καὶ φύσεως ἐπιτηδείας εἰς αὐτὸ τὸ ἐπιτήδευμα;	"And won't it also need a nature suited to that very pursuit?"
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	ἡμέτερον δὴ ἔργον ἂν εἴη, ὡς ἔοικεν, εἴπερ οἷοί τ' ἐσμέν, ἐκλέξασθαι τίνες τε καὶ ποῖαι φύσεις ἐπιτήδειαι εἰς πόλεως φυλακήν.	
	ἡμέτερον μέντοι.	

7 Rhapsodes were professional performers who recited epic poetry, especially Homer.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"Then it would be our job, it seems, if we're up to it, to pick out which natures, and what sort, are suited to guarding a city."
		"It is our job, yes."
374e	μὰ Δία, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐκ ἄρα φαῦλον πρᾶγμα ἠράμεθα· ὅμως δὲ οὐκ ἀποδειλιατέον, ὅσον γ' ἂν δύναμις παρείκῃ.	"By Zeus," I said, "it's no small task we've taken on. Still, we mustn't lose heart, as far as our strength allows."
	οὐ γὰρ οὖν, ἔφη.	"No, we mustn't," he said.
	οἴει οὖν τι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, διαφέρειν φύσιν γενναίου σκύλακος εἰς φυλακὴν νεανίσκου εὐγενοῦς;	"Do you think," I said, "that when it comes to guarding, the nature of a well-bred puppy is any different from that of a well-born young man?"
	τὸ ποῖον λέγεις;	"What do you mean?"
	οἷον ὀξύν τέ που δεῖ αὐτοῖν ἑκάτερον εἶναι πρὸς αἴσθησιν καὶ ἐλαφρὸν πρὸς τὸ αἰσθανόμενον διωκάθειν, καὶ ἰσχυρὸν αὖ, ἐὰν δέῃ ἑλόντα διαμάχεσθαι.	"Well, each of them has to be sharp at noticing things, quick at chasing down what he's noticed, and strong as well, if he has to fight once he's caught it."
	δεῖ γὰρ οὖν, ἔφη, πάντων τούτων.	"Yes," he said, "they need all of these."
	καὶ μὴν ἀνδρεῖόν γε, εἴπερ εὖ μαχεῖται.	"And brave too, surely, if he's going to fight well."
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
375a	ἀνδρεῖος δὲ εἶναι ἆρα ἐθελήσει ὁ μὴ θυμοειδὴς εἴτε ἵππος εἴτε κύων ἢ ἄλλο ὁτιοῦν ζῷον; ἢ οὐκ ἐννενόηκας ὡς [375b] ἄμαχόν τε καὶ ἀνίκητον θυμός, οὗ παρόντος ψυχὴ πᾶσα πρὸς πάντα ἄφοβός τέ ἐστι καὶ ἀήττητος;	"But will a horse or a dog or any other animal be willing to be brave if it isn't spirited? Haven't you noticed how [375b] irresistible and invincible spirit is? When it's present, every soul is fearless and unconquerable in the face of anything."
	ἐννενόηκα.	"I have noticed."
	τὰ μὲν τοίνυν τοῦ σώματος οἷον δεῖ τὸν φύλακα εἶναι, δῆλα.	"Then it's clear what the guardian must be like in body."
	ναί.	"Yes."
	καὶ μὴν καὶ τὰ τῆς ψυχῆς, ὅτι γε θυμοειδῆ.	"And in soul too: he must be spirited."
	καὶ τοῦτο.	"That too."
	πῶς οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Γλαύκων, οὐκ ἄγριοι ἀλλήλοις τε ἔσονται καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις πολίταις, ὄντες τοιοῦτοι τὰς φύσεις;	"Then how, Glaucon," I said, "will people with natures like that keep from being savage to one another and to the rest of the citizens?"
375b	μὰ Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐ ῥᾳδίως. [375c]	"By Zeus," he said, "it won't be easy." [375c]
	ἀλλὰ μέντοι δεῖ γε πρὸς μὲν τοὺς οἰκείους πρᾴους αὐτοὺς εἶναι, πρὸς δὲ τοὺς πολεμίους χαλεπούς· εἰ δὲ μή, οὐ περιμενοῦσιν ἄλλους σφᾶς διολέσαι, ἀλλ' αὐτοὶ φθήσονται αὐτὸ δράσαντες.	"And yet they have to be gentle toward their own people and harsh toward their enemies. Otherwise they won't wait for others to destroy them; they'll get there first and do it themselves."
	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη.	"True," he said.
	τί οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ποιήσομεν; πόθεν ἅμα πρᾷον καὶ μεγαλόθυμον ἦθος εὑρήσομεν; ἐναντία γάρ που θυμοειδεῖ πρᾳεῖα φύσις.	"What are we to do, then?" I said. "Where will we find a character that is gentle and high-spirited at once? A gentle nature is surely the opposite of a spirited one."
	φαίνεται.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἀλλὰ μέντοι τούτων γε ὁποτέρου ἂν στέρηται, φύλαξ ἀγαθὸς οὐ μὴ γένηται· ταῦτα δὲ ἀδυνάτοις ἔοικεν, καὶ οὕτω 375d δὴ συμβαίνει ἀγαθὸν φύλακα ἀδύνατον γενέσθαι.	"So it seems." "But if he lacks either of these, he'll never be a good guardian. And having both looks impossible, and so 375d it turns out that a good guardian can't exist."
375d	κινδυνεύει, ἔφη. καὶ ἐγὼ ἀπορήσας τε καὶ ἐπισκεψάμενος τὰ ἔμπροσθεν, δικαίως γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ φίλε, ἀποροῦμεν· ἧς γὰρ προυθέμεθα εἰκόνος ἀπελείφθημεν. πῶς λέγεις; οὐκ ἐννενοήκαμεν ὅτι εἰσὶν ἄρα φύσεις οἵας ἡμεῖς οὐκ ᾠήθημεν, ἔχουσαι τἀναντία ταῦτα. ποῦ δή;	"It looks that way," he said. I was at a loss too, but after thinking over what we'd said before, I said, "We deserve to be at a loss, my friend. We've abandoned the comparison we put forward." "What do you mean?" "We didn't notice that there are natures of the kind we thought didn't exist, with both these opposite qualities." "Where?"
	ἴδοι μὲν ἄν τις καὶ ἐν ἄλλοις ζῴοις, οὐ μεντἂν ἥκιστα 375e ἐν ᾧ ἡμεῖς παρεβάλλομεν τῷ φύλακι. οἶσθα γάρ που τῶν γενναίων κυνῶν, ὅτι τοῦτο φύσει αὐτῶν τὸ ἦθος, πρὸς μὲν τοὺς συνήθεις τε καὶ γνωρίμους ὡς οἷόν τε πραοτάτους εἶναι, πρὸς δὲ τοὺς ἀγνῶτας τοὐναντίον. οἶδα μέντοι. τοῦτο μὲν ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δυνατόν, καὶ οὐ παρὰ φύσιν ζητοῦμεν τοιοῦτον εἶναι τὸν φύλακα. οὐκ ἔοικεν. ἆρ' οὖν σοι δοκεῖ ἔτι τοῦδε προσδεῖσθαι ὁ φυλακικὸς ἐσόμενος, πρὸς τῷ θυμοειδεῖ ἔτι προσγενέσθαι φιλόσοφος τὴν φύσιν;	"You could see it in other animals too, but not least 375e in the one we compared with the guardian. You know, I'm sure, that this is the natural character of well-bred dogs: to be as gentle as can be toward the people they're used to and know, and the opposite toward strangers." "Yes, I know." "So it's possible," I said, "and it's not against nature to look for a guardian like that." "It seems not." "Then do you think the one who's going to be a guardian needs something more as well: to be not only spirited but also philosophical by nature?"
376a	πῶς δή; ἔφη· οὐ γὰρ ἐννοῶ. καὶ τοῦτο, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐν τοῖς κυσὶν κατόψει, ὃ καὶ ἄξιον θαυμάσαι τοῦ θηρίου. τὸ ποῖον; ὅτι ὃν μὲν ἂν ἴδῃ ἀγνῶτα, χαλεπαίνει, οὐδὲ ἓν κακὸν προπεπονθώς· ὃν δ' ἂν γνώριμον, ἀσπάζεται, κἂν μηδὲν πώποτε ὑπ' αὐτοῦ ἀγαθὸν πεπόνθῃ. ἢ οὔπω τοῦτο ἐθαύμασας; οὐ πάνυ, ἔφη, μέχρι τούτου προσέσχον τὸν νοῦν· ὅτι δέ που δρᾷ ταῦτα, δῆλον. ἀλλὰ μὴν κομψόν γε φαίνεται τὸ πάθος αὐτοῦ τῆς 376b φύσεως καὶ ὡς ἀληθῶς φιλόσοφον. πῇ δή;	"How so?" he said. "I don't follow." "You'll see this in dogs too," I said, "and it's something in the animal that deserves our admiration." "What's that?" "When it sees someone it doesn't know, it gets angry, though it has never suffered any harm from him; but when it sees someone it knows, it welcomes him, even if it has never had anything good from him. Haven't you ever marveled at that?" "I've never really paid attention to it until now," he said. "But obviously they do that." "Well, this trait of its nature looks like a clever one, 376b and truly philosophical." "In what way?"
376b		

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἦι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅψιν οὐδενὶ ἄλλῳ φίλην καὶ ἐχθρὰν διακρίνει ἢ τῷ τὴν μὲν καταμαθεῖν, τὴν δὲ ἀγνοῆσαι. καίτοι πῶς οὐκ ἂν φιλομαθὲς εἴη συνέσει τε καὶ ἀγνοίᾳ ὁριζόμενον τό τε οἰκεῖον καὶ τὸ ἀλλότριον;	"In that it tells a friendly face from a hostile one by nothing else than that it has come to know the one and doesn't know the other," I said. "And surely a creature that marks off what's its own from what's foreign by knowledge and ignorance must be a lover of learning?"
	οὐδαμῶς, ἦ δ' ὅς, ὅπως οὔ.	"It can't be otherwise," he said.
	ἀλλὰ μέντοι, εἶπον ἐγώ, τό γε φιλομαθὲς καὶ φιλόσοφον ταὐτόν;	"But surely," I said, "the love of learning and philosophy are the same thing?"
	ταὐτὸν γάρ, ἔφη.	"The same," he said.
	οὐκοῦν θαρροῦντες τιθῶμεν καὶ ἐν ἀνθρώπῳ, εἰ μέλλει 376c πρὸς τοὺς οἰκείους καὶ γνωρίμους πρᾷός τις ἔσεσθαι, φύσει φιλόσοφον καὶ φιλομαθῆ αὐτὸν δεῖν εἶναι;	"Then may we confidently lay it down for a human being too, that if he's going to 376c be gentle toward his own people and those he knows, he must be philosophical and a lover of learning by nature?"
	τιθῶμεν, ἔφη.	"Let's lay it down," he said.[8]
376c	φιλόσοφος δὴ καὶ θυμοειδὴς καὶ ταχὺς καὶ ἰσχυρὸς ἡμῖν τὴν φύσιν ἔσται ὁ μέλλων καλὸς κἀγαθὸς ἔσεσθαι φύλαξ πόλεως.	"So the one who's going to be a fine, good guardian of our city will be philosophical, spirited, fast and strong by nature."
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
	οὗτος μὲν δὴ ἂν οὕτως ὑπάρχοι. θρέψονται δὲ δὴ ἡμῖν οὗτοι καὶ παιδευθήσονται τίνα τρόπον; καὶ ἆρά τι προὔργου ἡμῖν ἐστιν αὐτὸ σκοποῦσι πρὸς τὸ κατιδεῖν οὗπερ ἕνεκα 376d πάντα σκοποῦμεν, δικαιοσύνην τε καὶ ἀδικίαν τίνα τρόπον ἐν πόλει γίγνεται; ἵνα μὴ ἐῶμεν ἱκανὸν λόγον ἢ συχνὸν διεξίωμεν.	"Then that's what he'll be to begin with. But how are they to be brought up and educated? And will looking into that help us see what 376d our whole inquiry is aimed at, how justice and injustice come to be in a city? We don't want to leave out anything that matters, or go through a long, drawn-out discussion."

STORIES ABOUT THE GODS

Socrates says the guardians' education must begin with stories, and censors false tales about the gods.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
376d	**SOCRATES** καὶ ὁ τοῦ Γλαύκωνος ἀδελφός, πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, ἔγωγε προσδοκῶ προὔργου εἶναι εἰς τοῦτο ταύτην τὴν σκέψιν.	**SOCRATES** And Glaucon's brother said, "Certainly. I fully expect this inquiry will help with that."
	μὰ Δία, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ φίλε Ἀδείμαντε, οὐκ ἄρα ἀφετέον, οὐδ' εἰ μακροτέρα τυγχάνει οὖσα.	"By Zeus, my dear Adeimantus," I said, "then we mustn't drop it, even if it turns out rather long."
	οὐ γὰρ οὖν.	"No, we mustn't."
	ἴθι οὖν, ὥσπερ ἐν μύθῳ μυθολογοῦντές τε καὶ σχολὴν ἄγοντες λόγῳ παιδεύωμεν τοὺς ἄνδρας. 376e	"Come on, then. Let's educate these men in our discussion, as if we were telling a story and had time on our hands." 376e
	ἀλλὰ χρή.	"We should."
	τίς οὖν ἡ παιδεία; ἢ χαλεπὸν εὑρεῖν βελτίω τῆς ὑπὸ τοῦ πολλοῦ χρόνου ηὑρημένης; ἔστιν δέ που ἡ μὲν ἐπὶ σώμασι γυμναστική, ἡ δ' ἐπὶ ψυχῇ μουσική.	"So what will their education be? Or is it hard to find a better one than the one discovered over a
	ἔστιν γάρ.	

8 The Greek word *philosophos* means literally "lover of wisdom."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		long time? That, I suppose, is physical training for the body and music for the soul." "Yes, it is."[9]
376e	ἆρ' οὖν οὐ μουσικῇ πρότερον ἀρξόμεθα παιδεύοντες ἢ γυμναστικῇ; πῶς δ' οὔ; μουσικῆς δ', εἶπον, τιθεῖς λόγους, ἢ οὔ; ἔγωγε. λόγων δὲ διττὸν εἶδος, τὸ μὲν ἀληθές, ψεῦδος δ' ἕτερον; ναί. παιδευτέον δ' ἐν ἀμφοτέροις, πρότερον δ' ἐν τοῖς ψευδέσιν; οὐ μανθάνω, ἔφη, πῶς λέγεις. οὐ μανθάνεις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι πρῶτον τοῖς παιδίοις μύθους λέγομεν; τοῦτο δέ που ὡς τὸ ὅλον εἰπεῖν ψεῦδος, ἔνι δὲ καὶ ἀληθῆ. πρότερον δὲ μύθοις πρὸς τὰ παιδία ἢ γυμνασίοις χρώμεθα. ἔστι ταῦτα.	"And won't we begin educating them in music before physical training?" "Of course." "Do you count stories as part of music," I said, "or not?" "I do." "And stories are of two kinds, true and false?" "Yes." "And they must be educated in both, but first in the false ones?" "I don't understand what you mean," he said. "Don't you understand," I said, "that the first thing we do is tell children tales? Taken as a whole, these are false, though there's some truth in them too. And we use tales with children before we use exercise." "That's so."
377a	τοῦτο δὴ ἔλεγον, ὅτι μουσικῆς πρότερον ἁπτέον ἢ γυμναστικῆς. ὀρθῶς, ἔφη. οὐκοῦν οἶσθ' ὅτι ἀρχὴ παντὸς ἔργου μέγιστον, ἄλλως [377b] τε δὴ καὶ νέῳ καὶ ἁπαλῷ ὁτῳοῦν; μάλιστα γὰρ δὴ τότε πλάττεται, καὶ ἐνδύεται τύπος ὃν ἄν τις βούληται ἐνσημήνασθαι ἑκάστῳ. κομιδῇ μὲν οὖν. ἆρ' οὖν ῥᾳδίως οὕτω παρήσομεν τοὺς ἐπιτυχόντας ὑπὸ τῶν ἐπιτυχόντων μύθους πλασθέντας ἀκούειν τοὺς παῖδας καὶ λαμβάνειν ἐν ταῖς ψυχαῖς ὡς ἐπὶ τὸ πολὺ ἐναντίας δόξας ἐκείναις ἅς, ἐπειδὰν τελεωθῶσιν, ἔχειν οἰησόμεθα δεῖν αὐτούς; οὐδ' ὁπωστιοῦν παρήσομεν.	"That's what I meant when I said we must take up music before physical training." "Rightly," he said. "Now you know that the beginning is the most important part of any task, [377b] especially with anything young and tender? That's when it's most easily shaped, and takes on whatever stamp one wants to impress on it." "Exactly." "Then shall we just casually let the children hear any old tales made up by any old people, and take into their souls opinions that are mostly the opposite of the ones we'll think they ought to have when they're grown up?" "We won't allow that at all."
377b	πρῶτον δὴ ἡμῖν, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἐπιστατητέον τοῖς μυθοποιοῖς, [377c] καὶ ὃν μὲν ἂν καλὸν μῦθον ποιήσωσιν, ἐγκριτέον, ὃν δ' ἂν μή, ἀποκριτέον. τοὺς δ' ἐγκριθέντας πείσομεν τὰς τροφούς τε καὶ μητέρας λέγειν τοῖς παισίν, καὶ πλάττειν τὰς ψυχὰς αὐτῶν τοῖς μύθοις πολὺ μᾶλλον ἢ τὰ σώματα ταῖς χερσίν· ὧν δὲ νῦν λέγουσι τοὺς πολλοὺς ἐκβλητέον.	"First, then, it seems, we must supervise the makers of tales, [377c] and accept any fine tale they make, and reject any that isn't. And we'll persuade nurses and mothers to tell the children the ones we've accepted, and to shape their souls with tales far more than they shape their bodies with their

9 *Mousikē*, "the art of the Muses," covered poetry, stories and song as well as music in the narrow sense.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ποίους δή; ἔφη.	hands. Most of the ones they tell now will have to be thrown out."
	ἐν τοῖς μείζοσιν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μύθοις ὀψόμεθα καὶ τοὺς ἐλάττους. δεῖ γὰρ δὴ τὸν αὐτὸν τύπον εἶναι καὶ ταὐτὸν	"Which ones?" he said.
377d	δύνασθαι τούς τε μείζους καὶ τοὺς ἐλάττους. ἢ οὐκ	"We'll see the lesser ones in the greater," I said. "The greater and the lesser have to be of the same stamp and have the same 377d effect. Don't you
	οἴει;	think so?"
	ἔγωγ', ἔφη· ἀλλ' οὐκ ἐννοῶ οὐδὲ τοὺς μείζους τίνας	"I do," he said. "But I don't see which ones you
377d	λέγεις.	mean by the greater either."
	οὓς Ἡσίοδός τε, εἶπον, καὶ Ὅμηρος ἡμῖν ἐλεγέτην καὶ οἱ	"The ones Hesiod and Homer told us," I said, "and
	ἄλλοι ποιηταί. οὗτοι γάρ που μύθους τοῖς ἀνθρώποις	the other poets. They made up false tales and told
	ψευδεῖς συντιθέντες ἔλεγόν τε καὶ λέγουσι.	them to people, and still do."
	ποίους δή, ἦ δ' ὅς, καὶ τί αὐτῶν μεμφόμενος λέγεις;	"Which ones do you mean," he said, "and what
	ὅπερ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, χρὴ καὶ πρῶτον καὶ μάλιστα μέμφεσθαι,	fault do you find with them?"
	ἄλλως τε καὶ ἐάν τις μὴ καλῶς ψεύδηται.	"The fault one should find first and foremost," I
	τί τοῦτο; 377e	said, "especially when the lie isn't a fine one."
		"What's that?" 377e **10**
	ὅταν εἰκάζῃ τις κακῶς οὐσίαν τῷ λόγῳ, περὶ θεῶν τε καὶ	"When someone gives a bad likeness in words of
377e	ἡρώων οἷοί εἰσιν, ὥσπερ γραφεὺς μηδὲν ἐοικότα γράφων	what gods and heroes are like, like a painter
	οἷς ἂν ὅμοια βουληθῇ γράψαι.	whose picture looks nothing like the things he
	καὶ γάρ, ἔφη, ὀρθῶς ἔχει τά γε τοιαῦτα μέμφεσθαι. ἀλλὰ	means to paint."
	πῶς δὴ λέγομεν καὶ ποῖα;	"Yes," he said, "it's right to find fault with things
		like that. But what do we mean, and what sort of
		things?"
	πρῶτον μέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ μέγιστον καὶ περὶ τῶν	"First," I said, "the greatest lie, about the greatest
	μεγίστων ψεῦδος ὁ εἰπὼν οὐ καλῶς ἐψεύσατο ὡς	matters, and not a fine lie either: the story that Ur-
	Οὐρανός τε ἠργάσατο ἅ φησι δρᾶσαι αὐτὸν Ἡσίοδος, ὅ τε	anus did what Hesiod says he did, and that Cronus
	αὖ Κρόνος 378a ὡς ἐτιμωρήσατο αὐτόν. τὰ δὲ δὴ τοῦ	378a took his revenge on him. As for what Cronus
	Κρόνου ἔργα καὶ πάθη ὑπὸ τοῦ υἱέος, οὐδ' ἂν εἰ ἦν ἀληθῆ	did, and what he suffered at the hands of his son,
	ᾤμην δεῖν ῥᾳδίως οὕτως λέγεσθαι πρὸς ἄφρονάς τε καὶ	even if it were true I wouldn't think it should be
	νέους, ἀλλὰ μάλιστα μὲν σιγᾶσθαι, εἰ δὲ ἀνάγκη τις ἦν	told so casually to young people who don't know
	λέγειν, δι' ἀπορρήτων ἀκούειν ὡς ὀλιγίστους,	any better. It would be best to keep quiet about it,
	θυσαμένους οὐ χοῖρον ἀλλά τι μέγα καὶ ἄπορον θῦμα,	and if there were some need to tell it, as few
	ὅπως ὅτι ἐλαχίστοις συνέβη ἀκοῦσαι.	people as possible should hear it, in secret, after
		sacrificing not a pig but some huge victim that's
		hard to come by, so that as few as possible would
		get to hear it."**11**
	καὶ γάρ, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὗτοί γε οἱ λόγοι χαλεποί. 378b	"Yes," he said, "those stories are hard ones." 378b
378a	καὶ οὐ λεκτέοι γ', ἔφην, ὦ Ἀδείμαντε, ἐν τῇ ἡμετέρᾳ	"And they mustn't be told in our city, Adeimantus,"
	πόλει. οὐδὲ λεκτέον νέῳ ἀκούοντι ὡς ἀδικῶν τὰ ἔσχατα	I said. "Nor must a young person be told, as he
	οὐδὲν ἂν θαυμαστὸν ποιοῖ, οὐδ' αὖ ἀδικοῦντα πατέρα	listens, that if he committed the worst crimes he'd
		be doing nothing remarkable, or if he punished

10 Hesiod (around 700 BC) ranked with Homer as the great early poet; his *Theogony* tells how the gods came to be.
11 In Hesiod's *Theogony* Uranus (Sky) keeps his children imprisoned and is castrated by his son Cronus, who is in turn overthrown by his own son Zeus.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	κολάζων παντὶ τρόπῳ, ἀλλὰ δρῴη ἂν ὅπερ θεῶν οἱ πρῶτοί τε καὶ μέγιστοι.	his father for wrongdoing by any means he could, but would only be doing what the first and greatest of the gods did."
	οὐ μὰ τὸν Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐδὲ αὐτῷ μοι δοκεῖ ἐπιτήδεια εἶναι λέγειν.	"No, by Zeus," he said, "I don't think those things are fit to be told either."
378b	οὐδέ γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ παράπαν ὡς θεοὶ θεοῖς πολεμοῦσί [378c] τε καὶ ἐπιβουλεύουσι καὶ μάχονται—οὐδὲ γὰρ ἀληθῆ —εἴ γε δεῖ ἡμῖν τοὺς μέλλοντας τὴν πόλιν φυλάξειν αἴσχιστον νομίζειν τὸ ῥᾳδίως ἀλλήλοις ἀπεχθάνεσθαι— πολλοῦ δεῖ γιγαντομαχίας τε μυθολογητέον αὐτοῖς καὶ ποικιλτέον, καὶ ἄλλας ἔχθρας πολλὰς καὶ παντοδαπὰς θεῶν τε καὶ ἡρώων πρὸς συγγενεῖς τε καὶ οἰκείους αὐτῶν —ἀλλ' εἴ πως μέλλομεν πείσειν ὡς οὐδεὶς πώποτε πολίτης ἕτερος ἑτέρῳ ἀπήχθετο οὐδ' ἔστιν τοῦτο ὅσιον, τοιαῦτα λεκτέα μᾶλλον πρὸς [378d] τὰ παιδία εὐθὺς καὶ γέρουσι καὶ γραυσί, καὶ πρεσβυτέροις γιγνομένοις καὶ τοὺς ποιητὰς ἐγγὺς τούτων ἀναγκαστέον λογοποιεῖν. Ἥρας δὲ δεσμοὺς ὑπὸ υἱέος καὶ Ἡφαίστου ῥίψεις ὑπὸ πατρός, μέλλοντος τῇ μητρὶ τυπτομένῃ ἀμυνεῖν, καὶ θεομαχίας ὅσας Ὅμηρος πεποίηκεν οὐ παραδεκτέον εἰς τὴν πόλιν, οὔτ' ἐν ὑπονοίαις πεποιημένας οὔτε ἄνευ ὑπονοιῶν.	"Nor, in fact," I said, "that gods make war on gods [378c] and plot against them and fight them, since it isn't even true, if the people who are going to guard our city are to think it utterly shameful to fall out with one another lightly. The last thing we should do is tell them tales of the battles of the giants, or embroider them on robes, or the many feuds of every kind between gods and heroes and their own kin and families. No, if we're somehow going to persuade them that no citizen has ever hated another, and that doing so is impious, then that's the kind of thing old men and old women should tell [378d] the children from the very start, and as they grow older, the poets too must be made to compose stories along these lines. But Hera's being tied up by her son, and Hephaestus' being hurled out of heaven by his father when he was going to defend his mother from a beating, and all the battles of the gods that Homer composed, must not be admitted into the city, whether they were composed with hidden meanings or without.[12]
378d	ὁ γὰρ νέος οὐχ οἷός τε κρίνειν ὅτι τε ὑπόνοια καὶ ὃ μή, ἀλλ' ἃ ἂν τηλικοῦτος ὢν λάβῃ ἐν ταῖς δόξαις δυσέκνιπτά [378e] τε καὶ ἀμετάστατα φιλεῖ γίγνεσθαι· ὧν δὴ ἴσως ἕνεκα περὶ παντὸς ποιητέον ἃ πρῶτα ἀκούουσιν ὅτι κάλλιστα μεμυθολογημένα πρὸς ἀρετὴν ἀκούειν.	"A young person can't judge what's a hidden meaning and what isn't, and whatever opinions he takes in at that age tend to become hard to wash out [378e] and impossible to change. Perhaps that's why we should do everything we can to make sure that the first stories they hear are told as finely as possible, to lead them toward excellence."
378e	ἔχει γάρ, ἔφη, λόγον. ἀλλ' εἴ τις αὖ καὶ ταῦτα ἐρωτῴη ἡμᾶς, ταῦτα ἅττα τ' ἐστὶν καὶ τίνες οἱ μῦθοι, τίνας ἂν φαῖμεν;	"That makes sense," he said. "But if someone were to ask us about this too, what these things are and which tales we mean, what would we say?"
	καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον· ὦ Ἀδείμαντε, οὐκ ἐσμὲν ποιηταὶ ἐγώ τε [379a] καὶ σὺ ἐν τῷ παρόντι, ἀλλ' οἰκισταὶ πόλεως· οἰκισταῖς δὲ τοὺς μὲν τύπους προσήκει εἰδέναι ἐν οἷς δεῖ μυθολογεῖν τοὺς ποιητάς, παρ' οὓς ἐὰν ποιῶσιν οὐκ ἐπιτρεπτέον, οὐ μὴν αὐτοῖς γε ποιητέον μύθους.	And I said, "Adeimantus, you and I aren't poets [379a] at the moment, but founders of a city. Founders ought to know the patterns the poets must follow when they tell their tales, and not permit them to depart from those patterns in what they compose; but it isn't the founders' job to make up tales themselves."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη· ἀλλ' αὐτὸ δὴ τοῦτο, οἱ τύποι περὶ θεολογίας τίνες ἂν εἶεν;	

12 "Hidden meanings": allegorical readings of Homer, already current in Plato's day, treated such stories as symbols of physical or moral truths.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"Right," he said. "But that's exactly the question: what would the patterns be for talk about the gods?"
379a	τοιοίδε πού τινες, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· οἷος τυγχάνει ὁ θεὸς ὤν, ἀεὶ δήπου ἀποδοτέον, ἐάντέ τις αὐτὸν ἐν ἔπεσιν ποιῇ ἐάντε ἐν μέλεσιν ἐάντε ἐν τραγῳδίᾳ.	"Something like this, I suppose," I said. "God must always be portrayed as he really is, whether in epic, in lyric, or in tragedy."
	δεῖ γάρ. 379b	"He must." 379b
	οὐκοῦν ἀγαθὸς ὅ γε θεὸς τῷ ὄντι τε καὶ λεκτέον οὕτω;	"Now god really is good, and must be described that way?"
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
	ἀλλὰ μὴν οὐδέν γε τῶν ἀγαθῶν βλαβερόν· ἦ γάρ;	"But nothing good is harmful, is it?"
	οὔ μοι δοκεῖ.	"I don't think so."
	ἆρ' οὖν ὃ μὴ βλαβερὸν βλάπτει;	"And does what isn't harmful do harm?"
	οὐδαμῶς.	"Not at all."
	ὃ δὲ μὴ βλάπτει κακόν τι ποιεῖ;	"And does what does no harm do anything bad?"
	οὐδὲ τοῦτο.	"No, not that either."
379b	ὃ δέ γε μηδὲν κακὸν ποιεῖ οὐδ' ἄν τινος εἴη κακοῦ αἴτιον;	"And what does nothing bad can't be the cause of anything bad?"
	πῶς γάρ;	"How could it be?"
	τί δέ; ὠφέλιμον τὸ ἀγαθόν;	"Well then: is the good beneficial?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	αἴτιον ἄρα εὐπραγίας;	"So it's the cause of doing well?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	οὐκ ἄρα πάντων γε αἴτιον τὸ ἀγαθόν, ἀλλὰ τῶν μὲν εὖ ἐχόντων αἴτιον, τῶν δὲ κακῶν ἀναίτιον. 379c	"Then the good isn't the cause of everything. It's the cause of things that are as they should be, but not responsible for bad things." 379c
	παντελῶς γ', ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
379c	οὐδ' ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὁ θεός, ἐπειδὴ ἀγαθός, πάντων ἂν εἴη αἴτιος, ὡς οἱ πολλοὶ λέγουσιν, ἀλλὰ ὀλίγων μὲν τοῖς ἀνθρώποις αἴτιος, πολλῶν δὲ ἀναίτιος· πολὺ γὰρ ἐλάττω τἀγαθὰ τῶν κακῶν ἡμῖν, καὶ τῶν μὲν ἀγαθῶν οὐδένα ἄλλον αἰτιατέον, τῶν δὲ κακῶν ἄλλ' ἄττα δεῖ ζητεῖν τὰ αἴτια, ἀλλ' οὐ τὸν θεόν.	"Then god, since he's good," I said, "can't be the cause of everything either, as most people say. He's the cause of a few things in human life, and not responsible for many, since we have far fewer good things than bad. The good things we must attribute to no one else, but for the bad things we have to look for some other causes, not god."
	ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη, δοκεῖς μοι λέγειν.	"What you say seems to me entirely true," he said.
	οὐκ ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀποδεκτέον οὔτε Ὁμήρου οὔτ' ἄλλου 379d ποιητοῦ ταύτην τὴν ἁμαρτίαν περὶ τοὺς θεοὺς ἀνοήτως ἁμαρτάνοντος καὶ λέγοντος— ὡς δοιοί τε πίθοι κατακείαται ἐν Διὸς οὔδει κηρῶν ἔμπλειοι, ὁ μὲν ἐσθλῶν, αὐτὰρ ὃ δειλῶν· καὶ ᾧ μὲν ἂν μείξας ὁ Ζεὺς δῷ ἀμφοτέρων, ἄλλοτε μέν τε κακῷ ὅ γε κύρεται, ἄλλοτε δ' ἐσθλῷ· ᾧ δ' ἂν μή, ἀλλ' ἄκρατα τὰ ἕτερα, τὸν δὲ κακὴ	"Then we mustn't accept from Homer or any other 379d poet this foolish mistake about the gods, when he says that 'two jars stand on the floor of Zeus's house, full of fates, one of good ones and the other of bad,' and that the man to whom Zeus gives a mixture of both 'meets sometimes with bad fortune, sometimes with good,' while the man to whom he gives not a mixture but one kind un-

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	βούβρωστις ἐπὶ χθόνα δῖαν ἐλαύνει· [379e] οὐδ' ὡς ταμίας ἡμῖν Ζεὺς— ἀγαθῶν τε κακῶν τε τέτυκται.	mixed, 'him evil hunger drives over the shining earth'; [379e] nor that Zeus is for us the 'dispenser of both good and evil.'[13]
379e	τὴν δὲ τῶν ὅρκων καὶ σπονδῶν σύγχυσιν, ἣν ὁ Πάνδαρος συνέχεεν, ἐάν τις φῇ δι' Ἀθηνᾶς τε καὶ Διὸς γεγονέναι, οὐκ ἐπαινεσόμεθα, οὐδὲ θεῶν ἔριν τε καὶ κρίσιν [380a] διὰ Θέμιτός τε καὶ Διός, οὐδ' αὖ, ὡς Αἰσχύλος λέγει, ἐατέον ἀκούειν τοὺς νέους, ὅτι— θεὸς μὲν αἰτίαν φύει βροτοῖς, ὅταν κακῶσαι δῶμα παμπήδην θέλῃ.	"And if anyone says that the breaking of the oaths and the truce, which Pandarus brought about, happened through Athena and Zeus, we won't approve; nor that strife and judgment among the gods [380a] came about through Themis and Zeus. Nor again must we let the young hear what Aeschylus says, that 'god makes guilt grow among mortals when he wants to ruin a house entirely.'[14]
380a	ἀλλ' ἐάν τις ποιῇ ἐν οἷς ταῦτα τὰ ἰαμβεῖα ἔνεστιν, τὰ τῆς Νιόβης πάθη, ἢ τὰ Πελοπιδῶν ἢ τὰ Τρωικὰ ἤ τι ἄλλο τῶν τοιούτων, ἢ οὐ θεοῦ ἔργα ἐατέον αὐτὰ λέγειν, ἢ εἰ θεοῦ, ἐξευρετέον αὐτοῖς σχεδὸν ὃν νῦν ἡμεῖς λόγον ζητοῦμεν, καὶ [380b] λεκτέον ὡς ὁ μὲν θεὸς δίκαιά τε καὶ ἀγαθὰ ἠργάζετο, οἱ δὲ ὠνίναντο κολαζόμενοι· ὡς δὲ ἄθλιοι μὲν οἱ δίκην διδόντες, ἦν δὲ δὴ ὁ δρῶν ταῦτα θεός, οὐκ ἐατέον λέγειν τὸν ποιητήν.	"But if anyone composes a work with these iambic lines in it, about the sufferings of Niobe, or of the house of Pelops, or the Trojan War, or anything else of that kind, either we mustn't let him say they are the work of a god, or, if they are, he must find pretty much the kind of account we're now looking for, and [380b] say that the god did what was just and good, and that they benefited from being punished. What we mustn't let the poet say is that those who paid the penalty were miserable, and that the one who did this to them was a god.[15]
380b	ἀλλ' εἰ μὲν ὅτι ἐδεήθησαν κολάσεως λέγοιεν ὡς ἄθλιοι οἱ κακοί, διδόντες δὲ δίκην ὠφελοῦντο ὑπὸ τοῦ θεοῦ, ἐατέον· κακῶν δὲ αἴτιον φάναι θεόν τινι γίγνεσθαι ἀγαθὸν ὄντα, διαμαχετέον παντὶ τρόπῳ μήτε τινὰ λέγειν ταῦτα ἐν τῇ αὐτοῦ πόλει, εἰ μέλλει εὐνομήσεσθαι, μήτε τινὰ ἀκούειν, [380c] μήτε νεώτερον μήτε πρεσβύτερον, μήτ' ἐν μέτρῳ μήτε ἄνευ μέτρου μυθολογοῦντα, ὡς οὔτε ὅσια ἂν λεγόμενα εἰ λέγοιτο, οὔτε σύμφορα ἡμῖν οὔτε σύμφωνα αὐτὰ αὑτοῖς.	"If they said that the wicked were miserable because they needed punishment, and that in paying the penalty they were benefited by the god, we should let them. But as for saying that god, who is good, becomes the cause of evils for anyone, we must fight in every way to stop anyone from saying these things in his own city, if it's going to be well governed, and anyone from hearing them, [380c] young or old, whether the tale is told in verse or in prose. Saying these things would be impious, and they would be neither to our advantage nor consistent with themselves."
380c	σύμψηφός σοί εἰμι, ἔφη, τούτου τοῦ νόμου, καί μοι ἀρέσκει. οὗτος μὲν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἷς ἂν εἴη τῶν περὶ θεοὺς νόμων τε καὶ τύπων, ἐν ᾧ δεήσει τούς τε λέγοντας λέγειν καὶ τοὺς ποιοῦντας ποιεῖν, μὴ πάντων αἴτιον τὸν θεὸν ἀλλὰ τῶν ἀγαθῶν. καὶ μάλ', ἔφη, ἀπόχρη. [380d]	"I'll vote with you for this law," he said. "I like it." "Then this," I said, "would be one of the laws and patterns about the gods, which speakers must follow in what they say and poets in what they compose: that god is not the cause of everything, but only of good things." "That's quite enough," he said. [380d]
380d	τί δὲ δὴ ὁ δεύτερος ὅδε; ἆρα γόητα τὸν θεὸν οἴει εἶναι καὶ οἷον ἐξ ἐπιβουλῆς φαντάζεσθαι ἄλλοτε ἐν ἄλλαις ἰδέαις	"Now what about this second one? Do you think god is a sorcerer, who shows himself by design in different forms at different times, sometimes actu-

13 The two jars come from Achilles' words to Priam in *Iliad* 24; the line about Zeus as dispenser is not in our text of Homer.
14 In *Iliad* 4 the Trojan Pandarus, urged on by Athena, breaks a sworn truce by shooting an arrow at Menelaus.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τοτὲ μὲν αὐτὸν γιγνόμενον, καὶ ἀλλάττοντα τὸ αὑτοῦ εἶδος εἰς πολλὰς μορφάς, τοτὲ δὲ ἡμᾶς ἀπατῶντα καὶ ποιοῦντα περὶ αὑτοῦ τοιαῦτα δοκεῖν, ἢ ἁπλοῦν τε εἶναι καὶ πάντων ἥκιστα τῆς ἑαυτοῦ ἰδέας ἐκβαίνειν;	ally changing, altering his own form into many shapes, and sometimes deceiving us and making us believe such things about him? Or is he simple, and less likely than anything to depart from his own form?"
	οὐκ ἔχω, ἔφη, νῦν γε οὕτως εἰπεῖν.	"I can't say," he said, "at least not offhand."
	τί δὲ τόδε; οὐκ ἀνάγκη, εἴπερ τι ἐξίσταιτο τῆς αὑτοῦ [380e] ἰδέας, ἢ αὐτὸ ὑφ' ἑαυτοῦ μεθίστασθαι ἢ ὑπ' ἄλλου;	"Well, what about this? If anything departs from its own [380e] form, isn't it necessarily changed either by itself or by something else?"
	ἀνάγκη.	"Necessarily."
380e	οὐκοῦν ὑπὸ μὲν ἄλλου τὰ ἄριστα ἔχοντα ἥκιστα ἀλλοιοῦταί τε καὶ κινεῖται;	"Now aren't things in the best condition the least altered and moved by something else?
	οἷον σῶμα ὑπὸ σιτίων τε καὶ ποτῶν καὶ πόνων, καὶ πᾶν φυτὸν ὑπὸ εἰλήσεών τε καὶ ἀνέμων καὶ τῶν τοιούτων παθημάτων, οὐ τὸ ὑγιέστατον καὶ ἰσχυρότατον [381a] ἥκιστα ἀλλοιοῦται;	"For instance, a body is affected by food and drink and exertion, and every plant by the sun's heat and winds and things of that kind. Isn't the healthiest and strongest [381a] least altered?"
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	ψυχὴν δὲ οὐ τὴν ἀνδρειοτάτην καὶ φρονιμωτάτην ἥκιστ' ἄν τι ἔξωθεν πάθος ταράξειέν τε καὶ ἀλλοιώσειεν;	"And the soul that is bravest and has the most understanding: wouldn't it be least disturbed and altered by anything outside it?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
381a	καὶ μήν που καὶ τά γε σύνθετα πάντα σκεύη τε καὶ οἰκοδομήματα καὶ ἀμφιέσματα κατὰ τὸν αὐτὸν λόγον τὰ εὖ εἰργασμένα καὶ εὖ ἔχοντα ὑπὸ χρόνου τε καὶ τῶν ἄλλων παθημάτων ἥκιστα ἀλλοιοῦται.	"And the same reasoning surely applies to everything that's put together, furniture and buildings and clothes: those that are well made and in good condition are least altered by time and other influences."
	ἔστι δὴ ταῦτα. [381b]	"That's so." [381b]
	πᾶν δὴ τὸ καλῶς ἔχον ἢ φύσει ἢ τέχνῃ ἢ ἀμφοτέροις ἐλαχίστην μεταβολὴν ὑπ' ἄλλου ἐνδέχεται.	"So everything in good condition, whether by nature or by craft or both, is least open to change by something else."
	ἔοικεν.	"So it seems."
	ἀλλὰ μὴν ὁ θεός γε καὶ τὰ τοῦ θεοῦ πάντῃ ἄριστα ἔχει.	"But god and what belongs to god are in the best condition in every way."
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	ταύτῃ μὲν δὴ ἥκιστα ἂν πολλὰς μορφὰς ἴσχοι ὁ θεός.	"So in this respect god would be the least likely to take many shapes."
	ἥκιστα δῆτα.	"The least likely, certainly."
381b	ἀλλ' ἆρα αὐτὸς αὑτὸν μεταβάλλοι ἂν καὶ ἀλλοιοῖ;	"But would he change and alter himself?"
	δῆλον, ἔφη, ὅτι, εἴπερ ἀλλοιοῦται.	"Obviously," he said, "if he's altered at all."
	πότερον οὖν ἐπὶ τὸ βέλτιόν τε καὶ κάλλιον μεταβάλλει ἑαυτὸν ἢ ἐπὶ τὸ χεῖρον καὶ τὸ αἴσχιον ἑαυτοῦ; [381c]	

15 The lines come from Aeschylus' lost *Niobe*. Niobe boasted of her children to the goddess Leto, whose children Apollo and Artemis then killed them.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, ἐπὶ τὸ χεῖρον, εἴπερ ἀλλοιοῦται· οὐ γάρ που ἐνδεᾶ γε φήσομεν τὸν θεὸν κάλλους ἢ ἀρετῆς εἶναι.	"Then does he change himself into something better and more beautiful, or into something worse and uglier than himself?" 381c
	ὀρθότατα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λέγεις. καὶ οὕτως ἔχοντος δοκεῖ ἄν τίς σοι, ὦ Ἀδείμαντε, ἑκὼν αὐτὸν χείρω ποιεῖν ὁπῃοῦν ἢ θεῶν ἢ ἀνθρώπων;	"It must be into something worse," he said, "if he's altered at all. For surely we won't say that god is lacking in beauty or excellence."
	ἀδύνατον, ἔφη.	"You're quite right," I said. "And that being so, Adeimantus, do you think anyone, god or human, would willingly make himself worse in any way?"
		"Impossible," he said.
381c	ἀδύνατον ἄρα, ἔφην, καὶ θεῷ ἐθέλειν αὑτὸν ἀλλοιοῦν, ἀλλ' ὡς ἔοικε, κάλλιστος καὶ ἄριστος ὢν εἰς τὸ δυνατὸν ἕκαστος αὐτῶν μένει ἀεὶ ἁπλῶς ἐν τῇ αὑτοῦ μορφῇ.	"Then it's impossible," I said, "even for a god to want to alter himself. Each of them, it seems, being as beautiful and as good as can be, remains forever and simply in his own shape."
	ἅπασα, ἔφη, ἀνάγκη ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ. 381d	"That seems to me absolutely necessary," he said. 381d
381d	μηδεὶς ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ ἄριστε, λεγέτω ἡμῖν τῶν ποιητῶν, ὡς— θεοὶ ξείνοισιν ἐοικότες ἀλλοδαποῖσι, παντοῖοι τελέθοντες, ἐπιστρωφῶσι πόληας· μηδὲ Πρωτέως καὶ Θέτιδος καταψευδέσθω μηδείς, μηδ' ἐν τραγῳδίαις μηδ' ἐν τοῖς ἄλλοις ποιήμασιν εἰσαγέτω Ἥραν ἠλλοιωμένην, ὡς ἱέρειαν ἀγείρουσαν— Ἰνάχου Ἀργείου ποταμοῦ παισὶν βιοδώροις· 381e καὶ ἄλλα τοιαῦτα πολλὰ μὴ ἡμῖν ψευδέσθων. μηδ' αὖ ὑπὸ τούτων ἀναπειθόμεναι αἱ μητέρες τὰ παιδία ἐκδειματούντων, λέγουσαι τοὺς μύθους κακῶς, ὡς ἄρα θεοί τινες περιέρχονται νύκτωρ πολλοῖς ξένοις καὶ παντοδαποῖς ἰνδαλλόμενοι, ἵνα μὴ ἅμα μὲν εἰς θεοὺς βλασφημῶσιν, ἅμα δὲ τοὺς παῖδας ἀπεργάζωνται δειλοτέρους.	"Then, my excellent friend," I said, "let none of the poets tell us that 'the gods, in the likeness of strangers from other lands, taking every kind of shape, go roaming through cities'; and let no one tell lies about Proteus and Thetis, or bring Hera onstage, in tragedy or any other poetry, transformed into a priestess collecting alms 'for the life-giving children of Inachus, the river of Argos'; 381e and let them not tell us many other lies like these. And mothers mustn't be won over by the poets and frighten their children by telling the tales badly, saying that certain gods go around at night looking like all sorts of strangers from everywhere. That way they won't blaspheme against the gods and make their children more cowardly at the same time."[16]
381e	μὴ γάρ, ἔφη.	"No, they mustn't," he said.
	ἀλλ' ἆρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, αὐτοὶ μὲν οἱ θεοί εἰσιν οἷοι μὴ μεταβάλλειν, ἡμῖν δὲ ποιοῦσιν δοκεῖν σφᾶς παντοδαποὺς φαίνεσθαι, ἐξαπατῶντες καὶ γοητεύοντες;	"But perhaps," I said, "while the gods themselves can't change, they make us think they appear in all sorts of forms, deceiving us and casting spells on us?"
	ἴσως, ἔφη.	"Perhaps," he said.
	τί δέ; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· ψεύδεσθαι θεὸς ἐθέλοι ἂν ἢ λόγῳ ἢ ἔργῳ φάντασμα προτείνων;	"Well then," I said, "would a god be willing to lie, either in words or by holding out an illusion in action?"
	οὐκ οἶδα, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"I don't know," he said.
	οὐκ οἶσθα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι τό γε ὡς ἀληθῶς ψεῦδος, εἰ οἷόν τε τοῦτο εἰπεῖν, πάντες θεοί τε καὶ ἄνθρωποι μισοῦσιν;	
	πῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις;	

16 Proteus and Thetis were sea divinities famous for changing their shapes; the first quotation is from Homer's *Odyssey*.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		“Don’t you know,” I said, “that the true lie, if one can call it that, is hated by all gods and humans?”
		“What do you mean?” he said.
382a	οὕτως, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, ὅτι τῷ κυριωτάτῳ που ἑαυτῶν ψεύδεσθαι καὶ περὶ τὰ κυριώτατα οὐδεὶς ἑκὼν ἐθέλει, ἀλλὰ πάντων μάλιστα φοβεῖται ἐκεῖ αὐτὸ κεκτῆσθαι.	“This,” I said: “no one is willing to be deceived in the most important part of himself about the most important things. That’s where he’s most afraid of all to have falsehood lodged.”
	οὐδὲ νῦν πω, ἦ δ’ ὅς, μανθάνω. 382b	“I still don’t understand,” he said. 382b
	οἴει γάρ τί με, ἔφην, σεμνὸν λέγειν· ἐγὼ δὲ λέγω ὅτι τῇ ψυχῇ περὶ τὰ ὄντα ψεύδεσθαί τε καὶ ἐψεῦσθαι καὶ ἀμαθῆ εἶναι καὶ ἐνταῦθα ἔχειν τε καὶ κεκτῆσθαι τὸ ψεῦδος πάντες ἥκιστα ἂν δέξαιντο, καὶ μισοῦσι μάλιστα αὐτὸ ἐν τῷ τοιούτῳ.	“That’s because you think I’m saying something profound,” I said. “All I’m saying is that to be deceived in one’s soul about the things that are, to be misled and ignorant, and to have and hold falsehood there, is what everyone would least accept. That’s where people hate falsehood most.”
	πολύ γε, ἔφη.	“Very much so,” he said.
382b	ἀλλὰ μὴν ὀρθότατά γ’ ἄν, ὃ νυνδὴ ἔλεγον, τοῦτο ὡς ἀληθῶς ψεῦδος καλοῖτο, ἡ ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ ἄγνοια ἡ τοῦ ἐψευσμένου· ἐπεὶ τό γε ἐν τοῖς λόγοις μίμημά τι τοῦ ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ ἐστὶν παθήματος καὶ ὕστερον γεγονὸς εἴδωλον, οὐ πάνυ 382c ἄκρατον ψεῦδος. ἢ οὐχ οὕτω;	“But as I was just saying, this is what would most rightly be called the true lie: the ignorance in the soul of someone who has been deceived. The lie in words is a kind of imitation of that condition in the soul, an image that comes after it, not a completely 382c pure lie. Isn’t that so?”
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	“Certainly.”
	τὸ μὲν δὴ τῷ ὄντι ψεῦδος οὐ μόνον ὑπὸ θεῶν ἀλλὰ καὶ ὑπ’ ἀνθρώπων μισεῖται.	“So the real lie is hated not only by gods but by human beings too.”
	δοκεῖ μοι.	“I think so.”
382c	τί δὲ δὴ τὸ ἐν τοῖς λόγοις ψεῦδος; πότε καὶ τῷ χρήσιμον, ὥστε μὴ ἄξιον εἶναι μίσους; ἆρ’ οὐ πρός τε τοὺς πολεμίους καὶ τῶν καλουμένων φίλων, ὅταν διὰ μανίαν ἤ τινα ἄνοιαν κακόν τι ἐπιχειρῶσιν πράττειν, τότε ἀποτροπῆς ἕνεκα ὡς φάρμακον χρήσιμον γίγνεται; καὶ ἐν αἷς νυνδὴ 382d ἐλέγομεν ταῖς μυθολογίαις, διὰ τὸ μὴ εἰδέναι ὅπῃ τἀληθὲς ἔχει περὶ τῶν παλαιῶν, ἀφομοιοῦντες τῷ ἀληθεῖ τὸ ψεῦδος ὅτι μάλιστα, οὕτω χρήσιμον ποιοῦμεν;	“But what about the lie in words? When is it useful, and to whom, so that it doesn’t deserve to be hated? Isn’t it useful against enemies, and with so-called friends when madness or some folly leads them to try to do something bad? Then it becomes useful as a medicine to turn them away from it. And in the tales we were just 382d talking about, since we don’t know the truth about ancient events, don’t we make it useful by making the falsehood as much like the truth as we can?”
	καὶ μάλα, ἦ δ’ ὅς, οὕτως ἔχει.	“Very much so,” he said.
382d	κατὰ τί δὴ οὖν τούτων τῷ θεῷ τὸ ψεῦδος χρήσιμον; πότερον διὰ τὸ μὴ εἰδέναι τὰ παλαιὰ ἀφομοιῶν ἂν ψεύδοιτο;	“Then for which of these reasons would a lie be useful to god? Would he lie, making up likenesses of the truth, because he doesn’t know about ancient events?”
	γελοῖον μεντἂν εἴη, ἔφη.	“That would be ridiculous,” he said.
	ποιητὴς μὲν ἄρα ψευδὴς ἐν θεῷ οὐκ ἔνι.	“So there’s no lying poet in god.”
	οὔ μοι δοκεῖ.	“I don’t think so.”
	ἀλλὰ δεδιὼς τοὺς ἐχθροὺς ψεύδοιτο; 382e	
	πολλοῦ γε δεῖ.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἀλλὰ δι' οἰκείων ἄνοιαν ἢ μανίαν;	"Then would he lie because he's afraid of his enemies?" 382e
	ἀλλ' οὐδείς, ἔφη, τῶν ἀνοήτων καὶ μαινομένων θεοφιλής.	"Far from it."
	οὐκ ἄρα ἔστιν οὗ ἕνεκα ἂν θεὸς ψεύδοιτο.	"Because of the folly or madness of his friends, then?"
	οὐκ ἔστιν.	"But no one foolish or mad is dear to the gods," he said.
	πάντῃ ἄρα ἀψευδὲς τὸ δαιμόνιόν τε καὶ τὸ θεῖον.	"Then there's no reason why a god would lie."
		"There isn't."
		"Then everything divine, whether spirit or god, is entirely free of lies."
382e	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
	κομιδῇ ἄρα ὁ θεὸς ἁπλοῦν καὶ ἀληθὲς ἔν τε ἔργῳ καὶ λόγῳ, καὶ οὔτε αὐτὸς μεθίσταται οὔτε ἄλλους ἐξαπατᾷ, οὔτε κατὰ φαντασίας οὔτε κατὰ λόγους οὔτε κατὰ σημείων πομπάς, οὔθ' ὕπαρ οὐδ' ὄναρ. 383a	"Then god is entirely simple and true in deed and in word. He doesn't change himself, and he doesn't deceive others—not by apparitions, not by words, not by sending signs, whether waking or dreaming." 383a
	οὕτως, ἔφη, ἔμοιγε καὶ αὐτῷ φαίνεται σοῦ λέγοντος.	"That's how it looks to me too," he said, "now that you say it."
	συγχωρεῖς ἄρα, ἔφην, τοῦτον δεύτερον τύπον εἶναι ἐν ᾧ δεῖ περὶ θεῶν καὶ λέγειν καὶ ποιεῖν, ὡς μήτε αὐτοὺς γόητας ὄντας τῷ μεταβάλλειν ἑαυτοὺς μήτε ἡμᾶς ψεύδεσι παράγειν ἐν λόγῳ ἢ ἐν ἔργῳ;	"So do you agree," I said, "that this is the second pattern within which we must speak and compose poetry about gods: that they are not sorcerers who transform themselves, and they don't mislead us with falsehoods in word or deed?"
	συγχωρῶ.	"I agree."
383a	πολλὰ ἄρα Ὁμήρου ἐπαινοῦντες, ἀλλὰ τοῦτο οὐκ ἐπαινεσόμεθα, τὴν τοῦ ἐνυπνίου πομπὴν ὑπὸ Διὸς τῷ Ἀγαμέμνονι· οὐδὲ Αἰσχύλου, ὅταν φῇ ἡ Θέτις τὸν Ἀπόλλω ἐν τοῖς αὑτῆς 383b γάμοις ᾄδοντα ἐνδατεῖσθαι τὰς ἐὰς εὐπαιδίας — νόσων τ' ἀπείρους καὶ μακραίωνας βίους, ξύμπαντά τ' εἰπὼν θεοφιλεῖς ἐμὰς τύχας παιᾶν' ἐπηυφήμησεν, εὐθυμῶν ἐμέ. κἀγὼ τὸ Φοίβου θεῖον ἀψευδὲς στόμα ἤλπιζον εἶναι, μαντικῇ βρύον τέχνῃ· ὁ δ', αὐτὸς ὑμνῶν, αὐτὸς ἐν θοίνῃ παρών, αὐτὸς τάδ' εἰπών, αὐτός ἐστιν ὁ κτανὼν τὸν παῖδα τὸν ἐμόν— 383c ὅταν τις τοιαῦτα λέγῃ περὶ θεῶν, χαλεπανοῦμέν τε καὶ χορὸν οὐ δώσομεν, οὐδὲ τοὺς διδασκάλους ἐάσομεν ἐπὶ παιδείᾳ χρῆσθαι τῶν νέων, εἰ μέλλουσιν ἡμῖν οἱ φύλακες θεοσεβεῖς τε καὶ θεῖοι γίγνεσθαι, καθ' ὅσον ἀνθρώπῳ ἐπὶ πλεῖστον οἷόν τε.	"So although we praise much in Homer, this we won't praise: Zeus sending the dream to Agamemnon. Nor will we praise Aeschylus when his Thetis says that Apollo, singing at her 383b wedding, dwelt on her happiness in her children: 'Lives long and untouched by sickness, and calling my fortunes in every way dear to the gods, he raised a song of triumph and gladdened my heart. And I believed the holy mouth of Phoebus, brimming with the prophetic art, was free of lies. Yet he who sang, he who sat at the feast, he who said these things—he himself is the one who killed my son.' 383c When anyone says such things about gods, we'll be angry and won't grant him a chorus, and we won't let teachers use it to educate the young—if our guardians are to become god-fearing and godlike, as far as a human being possibly can."[17]
383c		

17 In Athens a public official "granted a chorus" to the playwrights selected to compete at a dramatic festival.

GREEK	ENGLISH
παντάπασιν, ἔφη, ἔγωγε τοὺς τύπους τούτους συγχωρῶ, καὶ ὡς νόμοις ἂν χρῴμην.	“I agree with these patterns completely,” he said, “and I would treat them as laws.”

Book III

The education of the guardians.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
386a	**SOCRATES** τὰ μὲν δὴ περὶ θεούς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοιαῦτ' ἄττα, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἀκουστέον τε καὶ οὐκ ἀκουστέον εὐθὺς ἐκ παίδων τοῖς θεούς τε τιμήσουσιν καὶ γονέας τήν τε ἀλλήλων φιλίαν μὴ περὶ σμικροῦ ποιησομένοις.	**SOCRATES** "So where the gods are concerned," I said, "these, it seems, are the sorts of things that people should and shouldn't hear from childhood on, if they're going to honor the gods and their parents and not think lightly of their friendship with one another."
	καὶ οἶμαί γ', ἔφη, ὀρθῶς ἡμῖν φαίνεσθαι.	"And I think," he said, "we're right about that."
	τί δὲ δὴ εἰ μέλλουσιν εἶναι ἀνδρεῖοι; ἆρα οὐ ταῦτά τε λεκτέον καὶ οἷα αὐτοὺς ποιῆσαι ἥκιστα τὸν θάνατον δεδιέναι; 386b ἢ ἡγῇ τινά ποτ' ἂν γενέσθαι ἀνδρεῖον ἔχοντα ἐν αὑτῷ τοῦτο τὸ δεῖμα;	"What if they're to be courageous? Mustn't we tell them these things, and also things that will make them least afraid of death? 386b Or do you think anyone could ever become courageous with this terror inside him?"
	μὰ Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐκ ἔγωγε.	"No, by Zeus," he said, "I don't."
386b	τί δέ; τὰν Ἅιδου ἡγούμενον εἶναί τε καὶ δεινὰ εἶναι οἴει τινὰ θανάτου ἀδεῆ ἔσεσθαι καὶ ἐν ταῖς μάχαις αἱρήσεσθαι πρὸ ἥττης τε καὶ δουλείας θάνατον;	"And what about this? If someone believes that the things in Hades are real and terrible, do you think he'll be fearless of death and choose death in battle over defeat and slavery?"
	οὐδαμῶς.	"Not at all."
	δεῖ δή, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἡμᾶς ἐπιστατεῖν καὶ περὶ τούτων τῶν μύθων τοῖς ἐπιχειροῦσιν λέγειν, καὶ δεῖσθαι μὴ λοιδορεῖν ἁπλῶς οὕτως τὰ ἐν Ἅιδου ἀλλὰ μᾶλλον ἐπαινεῖν, ὡς οὔτε ἀληθῆ 386c ἂν λέγοντας οὔτε ὠφέλιμα τοῖς μέλλουσιν μαχίμοις ἔσεσθαι.	"Then it seems we must supervise those who undertake to tell these stories too, and ask them not simply to disparage the things in Hades like this but rather to praise them, since what they say is 386c neither true nor beneficial to those who are going to be fighters."
	δεῖ μέντοι, ἔφη.	"Yes, we must," he said.
386c	ἐξαλείψομεν ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀπὸ τοῦδε τοῦ ἔπους ἀρξάμενοι πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα— βουλοίμην κ' ἐπάρουρος ἐὼν θητευέμεν ἄλλῳ ἀνδρὶ παρ' ἀκλήρῳ, ᾧ μὴ βίοτος πολὺς εἴη ἢ πᾶσιν νεκύεσσι καταφθιμένοισιν ἀνάσσειν καὶ τὸ— 386d οἰκία δὲ θνητοῖσι καὶ ἀθανάτοισι φανείη σμερδαλέ', εὐρώεντα, τά τε στυγέουσι θεοί περ καὶ— ὦ πόποι, ἦ ῥά τις ἔστι καὶ εἰν Ἀΐδαο δόμοισιν ψυχὴ καὶ εἴδωλον, ἀτὰρ φρένες οὐκ ἔνι πάμπαν καὶ τὸ— οἷῳ πεπνῦσθαι, ταὶ δὲ σκιαὶ ἀΐσσουσι καὶ— ψυχὴ δ' ἐκ ῥεθέων πταμένη Ἄϊδόσδε βεβήκει, ὃν πότμον γοόωσα, λιποῦσ' ἀνδροτῆτα καὶ ἥβην	"Then we'll strike out," I said, "all passages like this, starting with this verse: 'I would rather be a laborer on the land, serving another man, some man with no land and not much to live on, than be king over all the dead who have perished.' And this: 386d 'and lest his house be revealed to mortals and immortals, dreadful and moldering, which even the gods abhor.' And: 'Ah me, so there is something even in the house of Hades, a soul and a phantom, but no mind in it at all.' And this: 'He alone has his wits; the others flit about as shadows.' And: 'His soul flew from his limbs and went

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		to Hades, bewailing its fate, leaving manhood and youth behind.'[1]
387a	καὶ τὸ— ψυχὴ δὲ κατὰ χθονός, ἠΰτε καπνός, ᾤχετο τετριγυῖα καὶ— ὡς δ' ὅτε νυκτερίδες μυχῷ ἄντρου θεσπεσίοιο τρίζουσαι ποτέονται, ἐπεί κέ τις ἀποπέσῃσιν ὁρμαθοῦ ἐκ πέτρης, ἀνά τ' ἀλλήλῃσιν ἔχονται, ὣς αἳ τετριγυῖαι ἅμ' ἧεσαν. [387b] ταῦτα καὶ τὰ τοιαῦτα πάντα παραιτησόμεθα Ὅμηρόν τε καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους ποιητὰς μὴ χαλεπαίνειν ἂν διαγράφωμεν, οὐχ ὡς οὐ ποιητικὰ καὶ ἡδέα τοῖς πολλοῖς ἀκούειν, ἀλλ' ὅσῳ ποιητικώτερα, τοσούτῳ ἧττον ἀκουστέον παισὶ καὶ ἀνδράσιν οὓς δεῖ ἐλευθέρους εἶναι, δουλείαν θανάτου μᾶλλον πεφοβημένους.	"And this: 'His soul went beneath the earth like smoke, shrieking.' And: 'As when bats in the depths of an eerie cave flit about shrieking, when one has fallen from the cluster off the rock and they cling to one another, so they went together, shrieking.' [387b] We'll ask Homer and the other poets not to be angry if we cross out these and all such passages—not because they aren't poetic and pleasant for most people to hear, but because the more poetic they are, the less they should be heard by boys and men who are meant to be free and to fear slavery more than death."
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν.	"Absolutely."
387b	οὐκοῦν ἔτι καὶ τὰ περὶ ταῦτα ὀνόματα πάντα τὰ δεινά τε καὶ φοβερὰ ἀποβλητέα, Κωκυτούς τε καὶ Στύγας καὶ [387c] "νέρους" καὶ "ἀλίβαντας", καὶ ἄλλα ὅσα τούτου τοῦ τύπου ὀνομαζόμενα φρίττειν δὴ ποιεῖ ὡς "οἴεται" πάντας τοὺς ἀκούοντας. καὶ ἴσως εὖ ἔχει πρὸς ἄλλο τι· ἡμεῖς δὲ ὑπὲρ τῶν φυλάκων φοβούμεθα μὴ ἐκ τῆς τοιαύτης φρίκης θερμότεροι καὶ μαλακώτεροι τοῦ δέοντος γένωνται ἡμῖν.	"Then we must also throw out all the terrible and frightening names connected with these things—Cocytus and Styx, [387c] 'those below' and 'the withered dead,' and all the other names of this sort which make everyone who hears them shudder—or so the poet supposes. Perhaps they're fine for some other purpose. But we're afraid for our guardians: that shudders like these will make them more heated and softer than they should be."
	καὶ ὀρθῶς γ', ἔφη, φοβούμεθα.	"And we're right to be afraid," he said.
	ἀφαιρετέα ἄρα;	"So they must be removed?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	τὸν δὲ ἐναντίον τύπον τούτοις λεκτέον τε καὶ ποιητέον;	"And the opposite pattern must be used in speaking and in poetry?"
	δῆλα δή. [387d]	"Obviously." [387d] [2]

HEROES WHO LAMENT AND LAUGH

Socrates removes from poetry scenes of heroes lamenting, laughing or behaving intemperately.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
387d	**SOCRATES** καὶ τοὺς ὀδυρμοὺς ἄρα ἐξαιρήσομεν καὶ τοὺς οἴκτους τοὺς τῶν ἐλλογίμων ἀνδρῶν;	**SOCRATES** "Then we'll also remove the wailing and lamentation of famous men?"
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, εἴπερ καὶ τὰ πρότερα.	"We must," he said, "if we removed the earlier things."
	σκόπει δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἰ ὀρθῶς ἐξαιρήσομεν ἢ οὔ. φαμὲν δὲ δὴ ὅτι ὁ ἐπιεικὴς ἀνὴρ τῷ ἐπιεικεῖ, οὗπερ καὶ ἑταῖρός ἐστιν, τὸ τεθνάναι οὐ δεινὸν ἡγήσεται.	"Consider, then," I said, "whether we'll be right to remove them or not. We say that a decent man won't think death a terrible thing for another decent man whose friend he is."
	φαμὲν γάρ.	

1 The verses in this passage come from Homer's *Odyssey* and *Iliad*; in the first, the ghost of Achilles is speaking in the underworld.
2 Cocytus and Styx were rivers of the underworld.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	οὐκ ἄρα ὑπέρ γ' ἐκείνου ὡς δεινόν τι πεπονθότος ὀδύροιτ' ἄν.	"We do say that."
	οὐ δῆτα.	"Then he wouldn't lament for him as though he had suffered something terrible."
	ἀλλὰ μὴν καὶ τόδε λέγομεν, ὡς ὁ τοιοῦτος μάλιστα αὐτὸς αὑτῷ αὐτάρκης πρὸς τὸ εὖ ζῆν καὶ διαφερόντως τῶν 387e ἄλλων ἥκιστα ἑτέρου προσδεῖται.	"Certainly not." "And we also say this: that such a man is, more than anyone, sufficient in himself for living well, and that he, above all 387e others, has the least need of anyone else."
387e	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη.	"True," he said.
	ἥκιστα ἄρ' αὐτῷ δεινὸν στερηθῆναι υἱέος ἢ ἀδελφοῦ ἢ χρημάτων ἢ ἄλλου του τῶν τοιούτων.	"So for him it's least terrible of all to be deprived of a son or a brother, or money, or anything else of that kind."
	ἥκιστα μέντοι.	"Least of all, certainly."
	ἥκιστ' ἄρα καὶ ὀδύρεσθαι, φέρειν δὲ ὡς πρᾳότατα, ὅταν τις αὐτὸν τοιαύτη συμφορὰ καταλάβῃ.	"Then he laments least, too, and bears it as calmly as he can when some such misfortune overtakes him."
	πολύ γε.	"Very much so."
	ὀρθῶς ἄρ' ἂν ἐξαιροῖμεν τοὺς θρήνους τῶν ὀνομαστῶν ἀνδρῶν, γυναιξὶ δὲ ἀποδιδοῖμεν, καὶ οὐδὲ ταύταις σπουδαίαις, 388a καὶ ὅσοι κακοὶ τῶν ἀνδρῶν, ἵνα ἡμῖν δυσχεραίνωσιν ὅμοια τούτοις ποιεῖν οὓς δή φαμεν ἐπὶ φυλακῇ τῆς χώρας τρέφειν.	"So we'd be right to remove the dirges of famous men and give them to women—and not to the serious ones at that— 388a and to men of poor character, so that those we say we're raising to guard the country will be disgusted at the idea of behaving like them."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.	"Right," he said.
388a	πάλιν δὴ Ὁμήρου τε δεησόμεθα καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ποιητῶν μὴ ποιεῖν Ἀχιλλέα θεᾶς παῖδα— ἄλλοτ' ἐπὶ πλευρᾶς κατακείμενον, ἄλλοτε δ' αὖτε ὕπτιον, ἄλλοτε δὲ πρηνῆ, τοτὲ δ' ὀρθὸν ἀναστάντα πλωΐζοντ' ἀλύοντ' ἐπὶ 388b θῖν' ἁλὸς ἀτρυγέτοιο, μηδὲ ἀμφοτέραισιν χερσὶν ἑλόντα κόνιν αἰθαλόεσσαν χευάμενον κὰκ κεφαλῆς , μηδὲ ἄλλα κλαίοντά τε καὶ ὀδυρόμενον ὅσα καὶ οἷα ἐκεῖνος ἐποίησε, μηδὲ Πρίαμον ἐγγὺς θεῶν γεγονότα λιτανεύοντά τε καὶ— κυλινδόμενον κατὰ κόπρον, ἐξονομακλήδην ὀνομάζοντ' ἄνδρα ἕκαστον.	"Once again, then, we'll ask Homer and the other poets not to portray Achilles, the son of a goddess, 'lying now on his side, now on his back, and now on his face, then getting up and wandering distraught along 388b the shore of the barren sea,' nor 'taking the sooty dust in both hands and pouring it over his head,' nor weeping and lamenting in all the ways and as often as Homer made him do; nor Priam, a near descendant of the gods, begging and 'rolling in the dung, calling on each man by name.'[3]
388b	πολὺ δ' ἔτι τούτων μᾶλλον δεησόμεθα μήτοι θεούς γε ποιεῖν ὀδυρομένους καὶ λέγοντας— 388c ὤμοι ἐγὼ δειλή, ὤμοι δυσαριστοτόκεια· εἰ δ' οὖν θεούς, μήτοι τόν γε μέγιστον τῶν θεῶν τολμῆσαι οὕτως ἀνομοίως μιμήσασθαι, ὥστε ὦ πόποι, φάναι, ἦ φίλον ἄνδρα διωκόμενον περὶ ἄστυ ὀφθαλμοῖσιν ὁρῶμαι, ἐμὸν δ' ὀλοφύρεται ἦτορ· καὶ— αἲ αἲ ἐγών, ὅ τέ μοι Σαρπηδόνα φίλτατον ἀνδρῶν 388d μοῖρ' ὑπὸ Πατρόκλοιο Μενοιτιάδαο δαμῆναι. εἰ γάρ, ὦ φίλε Ἀδείμαντε, τὰ τοιαῦτα ἡμῖν οἱ	"Much more still, we'll ask them not to portray gods lamenting and saying, 388c 'Ah me, poor wretch, ah me, unhappy mother of the best of men!' And if they must portray gods, at least they mustn't dare to represent the greatest of the gods so unlike himself as to say, 'Alas, a man dear to me is being chased around the city, I see it with my own eyes, and my heart grieves,' and, 'Ah me, that it is fated for Sarpedon, dearest of men to me, 388d

3 Achilles is mourning his friend Patroclus; Priam, king of Troy, is mourning his son Hector.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	νέοι σπουδῇ ἀκούοιεν καὶ μὴ καταγελῷεν ὡς ἀναξίως λεγομένων, σχολῇ ἂν ἑαυτόν γέ τις ἄνθρωπον ὄντα ἀνάξιον ἡγήσαιτο τούτων καὶ ἐπιπλήξειεν, εἰ καὶ ἐπίοι αὐτῷ τι τοιοῦτον ἢ λέγειν ἢ ποιεῖν, ἀλλ' οὐδὲν αἰσχυνόμενος οὐδὲ καρτερῶν πολλοὺς ἐπὶ σμικροῖσιν παθήμασιν θρήνους ἂν ᾄδοι καὶ ὀδυρμούς. 388e	to be brought down by Patroclus, son of Menoetius!' For, my dear Adeimantus, if our young people listened to things like this seriously and didn't laugh at them as unworthy, they would hardly think such things beneath themselves, being merely human, or rebuke themselves if it occurred to them to say or do anything of the sort. Instead, without shame or endurance, they'd sing many dirges and laments over small misfortunes." 388e **4**
388e	ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"What you say is very true," he said.
	δεῖ δέ γε οὔχ, ὡς ἄρτι ἡμῖν ὁ λόγος ἐσήμαινεν· ᾧ πειστέον, ἕως ἄν τις ἡμᾶς ἄλλῳ καλλίονι πείσῃ.	"But that mustn't happen, as our argument just showed us—and we must be persuaded by it until someone persuades us with a better one."
	οὐ γὰρ οὖν δεῖ.	"No, it mustn't."
	ἀλλὰ μὴν οὐδὲ φιλογέλωτάς γε δεῖ εἶναι. σχεδὸν γὰρ ὅταν τις ἐφιῇ ἰσχυρῷ γέλωτι, ἰσχυρὰν καὶ μεταβολὴν ζητεῖ τὸ τοιοῦτον.	"Nor should they be fond of laughter. For when someone gives in to violent laughter, it tends to bring on a violent swing the other way."
	δοκεῖ μοι, ἔφη.	"So it seems to me," he said.
	οὔτε ἄρα ἀνθρώπους ἀξίους λόγου κρατουμένους ὑπὸ 389a γέλωτος ἄν τις ποιῇ, ἀποδεκτέον, πολὺ δὲ ἧττον, ἐὰν θεούς.	"Then if anyone portrays people of any account overcome by 389a laughter, we mustn't accept it—much less if it's gods."
	πολὺ μέντοι, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Much less," he said.
389a	οὐκοῦν Ὁμήρου οὐδὲ τὰ τοιαῦτα ἀποδεξόμεθα περὶ θεῶν — ἄσβεστος δ' ἄρ' ἐνῶρτο γέλως μακάρεσσι θεοῖσιν, ὡς ἴδον Ἥφαιστον διὰ δώματα ποιπνύοντα· οὐκ ἀποδεκτέον κατὰ τὸν σὸν λόγον.	"Then we won't accept things like this from Homer about the gods either: 'Unquenchable laughter arose among the blessed gods when they saw Hephaestus bustling through the hall.' By your argument we mustn't accept it."
	εἰ σύ, ἔφη, βούλει ἐμὸν τιθέναι· οὐ γὰρ οὖν δὴ 389b ἀποδεκτέον.	"If you want to call it mine," he said. "Anyway, it mustn't 389b be accepted."
	ἀλλὰ μὴν καὶ ἀλήθειάν γε περὶ πολλοῦ ποιητέον. εἰ γὰρ ὀρθῶς ἐλέγομεν ἄρτι, καὶ τῷ ὄντι θεοῖσι μὲν ἄχρηστον ψεῦδος, ἀνθρώποις δὲ χρήσιμον ὡς ἐν φαρμάκου εἴδει, δῆλον ὅτι τό γε τοιοῦτον ἰατροῖς δοτέον, ἰδιώταις δὲ οὐχ ἁπτέον.	"But we must also value truth highly. If we were right just now, and falsehood really is useless to gods but useful to human beings as a kind of medicine, then clearly something like that must be left to doctors, and private individuals mustn't touch it."
	δῆλον, ἔφη.	"Clearly," he said.[5]
389b	τοῖς ἄρχουσιν δὴ τῆς πόλεως, εἴπερ τισὶν ἄλλοις, προσήκει ψεύδεσθαι ἢ πολεμίων ἢ πολιτῶν ἕνεκα ἐπ' ὠφελίᾳ τῆς πόλεως, τοῖς δὲ ἄλλοις πᾶσιν οὐχ ἁπτέον τοῦ τοιούτου· 389c ἀλλὰ πρός γε δὴ τοὺς τοιούτους ἄρχοντας ἰδιώτῃ ψεύσασθαι ταὐτὸν καὶ μεῖζον ἁμάρτημα φήσομεν	"Then if anyone is entitled to lie, it's the rulers of the city, in dealing with enemies or citizens for the city's benefit; nobody else may touch such a thing. 389c For a private individual to lie to such rulers, we'll say, is as great a mistake as—no, a greater one

4 The first line is spoken by Thetis, Achilles' mother; the others by Zeus, watching Hector and his own son Sarpedon go to their deaths.

5 Hephaestus, the lame smith-god, was hobbling about serving wine to the other gods.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἢ κάμνοντι πρὸς ἰατρὸν ἢ ἀσκοῦντι πρὸς παιδοτρίβην περὶ τῶν τοῦ αὑτοῦ σώματος παθημάτων μὴ τἀληθῆ λέγειν, ἢ πρὸς κυβερνήτην περὶ τῆς νεώς τε καὶ τῶν ναυτῶν μὴ τὰ ὄντα λέγοντι ὅπως ἢ αὐτὸς ἤ τις τῶν συνναυτῶν πράξεως ἔχει.	than—for a patient not to tell his doctor the truth about the condition of his own body, or an athlete his trainer, or for a sailor not to tell the captain the facts about the ship and the crew, and how he himself or one of his shipmates is doing."
	ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη. 389d	"Very true," he said. 389d
389d	ἂν ἄρ' ἄλλον τινὰ λαμβάνῃ ψευδόμενον ἐν τῇ πόλει— τῶν οἳ δημιοεργοὶ ἔασι, μάντιν ἢ ἰητῆρα κακῶν ἢ τέκτονα δούρων, κολάσει ὡς ἐπιτήδευμα εἰσάγοντα πόλεως ὥσπερ νεὼς ἀνατρεπτικόν τε καὶ ὀλέθριον.	"So if the ruler catches anyone else in the city lying—'any of those who are craftsmen, a prophet, or healer of ills, or joiner of timber'—he'll punish him for introducing a practice that capsizes and destroys a city just as it would a ship."
	ἐάνπερ, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἐπί γε λόγῳ ἔργα τελῆται.	"He will," he said, "if deeds are to follow words."
	τί δέ; σωφροσύνης ἆρα οὐ δεήσει ἡμῖν τοῖς νεανίαις;	"What next? Won't our young people need moderation?"
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	σωφροσύνης δὲ ὡς πλήθει οὐ τὰ τοιάδε μέγιστα, ἀρχόντων 389e μὲν ὑπηκόους εἶναι, αὐτοὺς δὲ ἄρχοντας τῶν περὶ πότους καὶ ἀφροδίσια καὶ περὶ ἐδωδὰς ἡδονῶν;	"And for most people, aren't these the most important parts of moderation: to obey the rulers, 389e and themselves to rule over the pleasures of drink, sex and food?"
	ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ.	"I think so."
389e	τὰ δὴ τοιάδε φήσομεν οἶμαι καλῶς λέγεσθαι, οἷα καὶ Ὁμήρῳ Διομήδης λέγει— τέττα, σιωπῇ ἧσο, ἐμῷ δ' ἐπιπείθεο μύθῳ, καὶ τὰ τούτων ἐχόμενα, τὰ— ἴσαν μένεα πνείοντες Ἀχαιοί, σιγῇ δειδιότες σημάντορας, καὶ ὅσα ἄλλα τοιαῦτα.	"Then we'll say, I think, that things like what Diomedes says in Homer are well said: 'Friend, sit in silence and do as I say,' and the lines that go with it: 'The Achaeans marched breathing fury, in silence, fearing their commanders,' and everything else like that."
	καλῶς.	"Well said."
	τί δέ; τὰ τοιάδε— οἰνοβαρές, κυνὸς ὄμματ' ἔχων, κραδίην δ' ἐλάφοιο 390a καὶ τὰ τούτων ἑξῆς ἆρα καλῶς, καὶ ὅσα ἄλλα τις ἐν λόγῳ ἢ ἐν ποιήσει εἴρηκε νεανιεύματα ἰδιωτῶν εἰς ἄρχοντας;	"What about things like this: 'Heavy with wine, with a dog's eyes and a deer's heart,' 390a and the lines after it? Are they well said—or any other insolence toward rulers from people under them that anyone has uttered in prose or verse?"
	οὐ καλῶς.	"No, they're not."[6]
390a	οὐ γὰρ οἶμαι εἴς γε σωφροσύνην νέοις ἐπιτήδεια ἀκούειν· εἰ δέ τινα ἄλλην ἡδονὴν παρέχεται, θαυμαστὸν οὐδέν. ἢ πῶς σοι φαίνεται;	"No, because I don't think they're fit for young people to hear—not for the sake of moderation, anyway. That they provide some other pleasure is no surprise. How does it look to you?"
	οὕτως, ἔφη.	"Just so," he said.
	τί δέ; ποιεῖν ἄνδρα τὸν σοφώτατον λέγοντα ὡς δοκεῖ αὐτῷ κάλλιστον εἶναι πάντων, ὅταν— παρὰ πλεῖαι ὦσι τράπεζαι 390b σίτου καὶ κρειῶν, μέθυ δ' ἐκ κρητῆρος ἀφύσσων οἰνοχόος φορέῃσι καὶ ἐγχείῃ δεπάεσσι, δοκεῖ σοι ἐπιτήδειον εἶναι πρὸς ἐγκράτειαν ἑαυτοῦ ἀκούειν	"And what about making the wisest of men say that the finest thing of all, in his view, is when 'the tables beside them are loaded 390b with bread and meat, and the wine-server draws wine from the mixing bowl and carries it round and pours it into

6 "Achaeans" is Homer's name for the Greeks at Troy. The insult is Achilles' attack on his commander, Agamemnon.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	νέῳ; ἢ τὸ— λιμῷ δ' οἴκτιστον θανέειν καὶ πότμον ἐπισπεῖν; ἢ Δία, καθευδόντων τῶν ἄλλων θεῶν τε καὶ ἀνθρώπων ὡς, μόνος ἐγρηγορὼς ἃ ἐβουλεύσατο, τούτων πάντων ῥᾳδίως [390c] ἐπιλανθανόμενον διὰ τὴν τῶν ἀφροδισίων ἐπιθυμίαν, καὶ οὕτως ἐκπλαγέντα ἰδόντα τὴν Ἥραν, ὥστε μηδ' εἰς τὸ δωμάτιον ἐθέλειν ἐλθεῖν, ἀλλ' αὐτοῦ βουλόμενον χαμαὶ συγγίγνεσθαι, λέγοντα ὡς οὕτως ὑπὸ ἐπιθυμίας ἔχεται, ὡς οὐδ' ὅτε τὸ πρῶτον ἐφοίτων πρὸς ἀλλήλους φίλους λήθοντε τοκῆας · οὐδὲ Ἄρεώς τε καὶ ἀφροδίτης ὑπὸ Ἡφαίστου δεσμὸν δι' ἕτερα τοιαῦτα.	the cups'? Do you think that's fit for a young man to hear, for his self-control? Or this: 'To die of hunger and meet one's fate is the most pitiful thing'? Or Zeus—while the other gods and men were asleep and he alone was awake—easily [390c] forgetting everything he'd planned because of his sexual desire, and so overwhelmed at the sight of Hera that he isn't even willing to go to their bedroom but wants to lie with her right there on the ground, saying he's gripped by desire as never before—not even when they first went to each other 'without their parents knowing'? Or Hephaestus binding Ares and Aphrodite for similar reasons?"[7]
390c	οὐ μὰ τὸν Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὔ μοι φαίνεται ἐπιτήδειον. [390d]	"No, by Zeus," he said, "it doesn't seem fit to me." [390d]
	ἀλλ' εἴ πού τινες, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καρτερίαι πρὸς ἅπαντα καὶ λέγονται καὶ πράττονται ὑπὸ ἐλλογίμων ἀνδρῶν, θεατέον τε καὶ ἀκουστέον, οἷον καὶ τὸ— στῆθος δὲ πλήξας κραδίην ἠνίπαπε μύθῳ· τέτλαθι δή, κραδίη· καὶ κύντερον ἄλλο ποτ' ἔτλης.	"But where famous men show endurance in the face of everything, in word or deed," I said, "that should be watched and heard—like this: 'He struck his chest and rebuked his heart: Endure, my heart; you've endured worse before now.'"
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
	οὐ μὲν δὴ δωροδόκους γε ἐατέον εἶναι τοὺς ἄνδρας οὐδὲ φιλοχρημάτους. [390e]	"And we certainly mustn't let our men take bribes or love money." [390e]
	οὐδαμῶς.	"Not at all."
390e	οὐδ' ᾀστέον αὐτοῖς ὅτι— δῶρα θεοὺς πείθει, δῶρ' αἰδοίους βασιλῆας· οὐδὲ τὸν τοῦ Ἀχιλλέως παιδαγωγὸν Φοίνικα ἐπαινετέον ὡς μετρίως ἔλεγε συμβουλεύων αὐτῷ δῶρα μὲν λαβόντι ἐπαμύνειν τοῖς Ἀχαιοῖς, ἄνευ δὲ δώρων μὴ ἀπαλλάττεσθαι τῆς μήνιος.	"Nor must they sing to them, 'Gifts persuade gods, gifts persuade revered kings.' Nor must we praise Achilles' tutor Phoenix as speaking sensibly when he advised him to take gifts and defend the Achaeans, but not to give up his wrath without gifts.
	οὐδ' αὐτὸν τὸν Ἀχιλλέα ἀξιώσομεν οὐδ' ὁμολογήσομεν οὕτω φιλοχρήματον εἶναι, ὥστε παρὰ τοῦ Ἀγαμέμνονος δῶρα λαβεῖν, καὶ τιμὴν αὖ λαβόντα νεκροῦ [391a] ἀπολύειν, ἄλλως δὲ μὴ θέλειν.	"Nor will we think it right, or agree, that Achilles himself was such a lover of money that he took gifts from Agamemnon, and again that he accepted payment for a corpse [391a] and released it, but otherwise refused."
	οὔκουν δίκαιόν γε, ἔφη, ἐπαινεῖν τὰ τοιαῦτα.	"Well, it's certainly not right," he said, "to praise things like that."[8]
391a	ὀκνῶ δέ γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δι' Ὅμηρον λέγειν ὅτι οὐδ' ὅσιον ταῦτά γε κατὰ Ἀχιλλέως φάναι καὶ ἄλλων λεγόντων πείθεσθαι, καὶ αὖ ὡς πρὸς τὸν Ἀπόλλω εἶπεν— ἔβλαψάς μ' ἑκάεργε, θεῶν ὀλοώτατε πάντων· ἦ σ' ἂν τισαίμην, εἴ μοι δύναμίς γε παρείη· [391b] καὶ ὡς πρὸς τὸν ποταμόν, θεὸν ὄντα, ἀπειθῶς εἶχεν καὶ μάχεσθαι ἕτοιμος ἦν, καὶ αὖ τὰς τοῦ ἑτέρου ποταμοῦ Σπερχειοῦ ἱερὰς τρίχας Πατρόκλῳ ἥρωϊ, ἔφη, κόμην ὀπάσαιμι φέρεσθαι , νεκρῷ ὄντι, καὶ ὡς	"Out of respect for Homer," I said, "I hesitate to say that it isn't even pious to say these things against Achilles, or to believe others who say them. But these things mustn't be believed either: that he said to Apollo, 'You've thwarted me, Far-shooter, most destructive of all the gods; I'd pay you back, if only I had the power'; [391b] that he defied the

7 The "wisest of men" is Odysseus, speaking at a feast in the *Odyssey*.
8 The corpse is Hector's, ransomed from Achilles by Priam.

GREEK

ENGLISH

ἔδρασεν τοῦτο, οὐ πειστέον· τάς τε αὖ Ἕκτορος ἕλξεις περὶ τὸ σῆμα τὸ Πατρόκλου καὶ τὰς τῶν ζωγρηθέντων σφαγὰς εἰς τὴν πυράν, σύμπαντα ταῦτα οὐ φήσομεν ἀληθῆ εἰρῆσθαι, οὐδ' ἐάσομεν 391c πείθεσθαι τοὺς ἡμετέρους ὡς Ἀχιλλεύς, θεᾶς ὢν παῖς καὶ Πηλέως, σωφρονεστάτου τε καὶ τρίτου ἀπὸ Διός, καὶ ὑπὸ τῷ σοφωτάτῳ Χείρωνι τεθραμμένος, τοσαύτης ἦν ταραχῆς πλέως, ὥστ' ἔχειν ἐν αὑτῷ νοσήματε δύο ἐναντίω ἀλλήλοιν, ἀνελευθερίαν μετὰ φιλοχρηματίας καὶ αὖ ὑπερηφανίαν θεῶν τε καὶ ἀνθρώπων.

river, a god, and was ready to fight it; and that of the locks of hair consecrated to the other river, the Spercheus, he said, 'Let me give my hair to the hero Patroclus to take with him'—who was a corpse—and that he did it. And Hector dragged around Patroclus' tomb, and the captives slaughtered on the pyre: we'll say that none of this is truly told, and we won't let 391c our people believe that Achilles—son of a goddess and of Peleus, the most moderate of men and third in descent from Zeus, and brought up by the wise Chiron—was so full of turmoil that he had in him two diseases opposed to each other: a meanness that went with love of money, and at the same time arrogance toward gods and men."[9]

391c ὀρθῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις.

"You're right," he said.

μὴ τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μηδὲ τάδε πειθώμεθα μηδ' ἐῶμεν λέγειν, ὡς Θησεὺς Ποσειδῶνος υὸς Πειρίθους τε Διὸς 391d ὥρμησαν οὕτως ἐπὶ δεινὰς ἁρπαγάς, μηδέ τιν' ἄλλον θεοῦ παῖδά τε καὶ ἥρω τολμῆσαι ἂν δεινὰ καὶ ἀσεβῆ ἐργάσασθαι, οἷα νῦν καταψεύδονται αὐτῶν· ἀλλὰ προσαναγκάζωμεν τοὺς ποιητὰς ἢ μὴ τούτων αὐτὰ ἔργα φάναι ἢ τούτους μὴ εἶναι θεῶν παῖδας, ἀμφότερα δὲ μὴ λέγειν, μηδὲ ἡμῖν ἐπιχειρεῖν πείθειν τοὺς νέους ὡς οἱ θεοὶ κακὰ γεννῶσιν, καὶ ἥρωες ἀνθρώπων οὐδὲν βελτίους· ὅπερ γὰρ ἐν τοῖς πρόσθεν ἐλέγομεν, 391e οὔθ' ὅσια ταῦτα οὔτε ἀληθῆ· ἐπεδείξαμεν γάρ που ὅτι ἐκ θεῶν κακὰ γίγνεσθαι ἀδύνατον.

"Then let's not believe this either," I said, "or allow it to be said: that Theseus son of Poseidon and Pirithous son of Zeus 391d set out on terrible abductions, or that any other child of a god, any hero, would have dared to do the terrible and impious deeds people now falsely tell of them. Let's compel the poets either to deny that these deeds were theirs or to deny that they were children of gods, and not to say both—and not to try to persuade our young people that the gods produce evil and that heroes are no better than human beings. As we said earlier, 391e these things are neither pious nor true; for we showed, I think, that evil can't come from gods."[10]

391e πῶς γὰρ οὔ;

"Of course not."

καὶ μὴν τοῖς γε ἀκούουσιν βλαβερά· πᾶς γὰρ ἑαυτῷ συγγνώμην ἕξει κακῷ ὄντι, πεισθεὶς ὡς ἄρα τοιαῦτα πράττουσίν τε καὶ ἔπραττον καὶ— οἱ θεῶν ἀγχίσποροι, οἱ Ζηνὸς ἐγγύς, ὧν κατ' Ἰδαῖον πάγον Διὸς πατρῴου βωμός ἐστ' ἐν αἰθέρι, καὶ— οὔ πώ σφιν ἐξίτηλον αἷμα δαιμόνων.

"What's more, they're harmful to those who hear them. Everyone will excuse himself for being bad once he's persuaded that such things are done, and were done, by 'the gods' close kin, near to Zeus, whose altar of ancestral Zeus stands high in the air on Ida's peak,' and 'in whom the blood of divinities has not yet faded.'

ὧν ἕνεκα παυστέον τοὺς τοιούτους μύθους, μὴ ἡμῖν πολλὴν 392a εὐχέρειαν ἐντίκτωσι τοῖς νέοις πονηρίας.

"For these reasons such stories must be stopped, in case they breed in our young people a great 392a readiness for wickedness."

κομιδῇ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

"Absolutely," he said.[11]

9 Achilles' hair had been vowed to the Spercheus, a river of his homeland, for his safe return. Chiron was the wise centaur who raised him.

10 Theseus and Pirithous tried to carry off Helen and Persephone.

11 The quoted lines come from Aeschylus' lost play *Niobe*.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
392a	τί οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἡμῖν ἔτι λοιπὸν εἶδος λόγων πέρι ὁριζομένοις οἵους τε λεκτέον καὶ μή; περὶ γὰρ θεῶν ὡς δεῖ λέγεσθαι εἴρηται, καὶ περὶ δαιμόνων τε καὶ ἡρώων καὶ τῶν ἐν Ἅιδου.	"Then what kind of speech is still left for us," I said, "as we lay down what may and may not be said? We've said how gods should be spoken of, and divinities, heroes and the things in Hades."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
	οὐκοῦν καὶ περὶ ἀνθρώπων τὸ λοιπὸν εἴη ἄν;	"Then what remains would be about human beings?"
	δῆλα δή.	"Obviously."
	ἀδύνατον δή, ὦ φίλε, ἡμῖν τοῦτό γε ἐν τῷ παρόντι τάξαι.	"But we can't settle that at present, my friend."
	πῶς;	"Why not?"
	ὅτι οἶμαι ἡμᾶς ἐρεῖν ὡς ἄρα καὶ ποιηταὶ καὶ λογοποιοὶ 392b κακῶς λέγουσιν περὶ ἀνθρώπων τὰ μέγιστα, ὅτι εἰσὶν ἄδικοι μὲν εὐδαίμονες πολλοί, δίκαιοι δὲ ἄθλιοι, καὶ ὡς λυσιτελεῖ τὸ ἀδικεῖν, ἐὰν λανθάνῃ, ἡ δὲ δικαιοσύνη ἀλλότριον μὲν ἀγαθόν, οἰκεία δὲ ζημία· καὶ τὰ μὲν τοιαῦτα ἀπερεῖν λέγειν, τὰ δ' ἐναντία τούτων προστάξειν ᾄδειν τε καὶ μυθολογεῖν. ἢ οὐκ οἴει;	"Because I think we'll say that poets and prose writers alike 392b speak badly about human beings on the most important matters: that many unjust people are happy and many just people wretched, that injustice pays if it goes undetected, and that justice is someone else's good and one's own loss. We'll forbid them to say such things and order them to sing and tell stories of the opposite. Don't you think so?"
	εὖ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, οἶδα.	"I know it well," he said.
	οὐκοῦν ἐὰν ὁμολογῇς ὀρθῶς με λέγειν, φήσω σε ὡμολογηκέναι ἃ πάλαι ζητοῦμεν;	"Then if you agree that I'm right, shall I say you've agreed to what we've been looking for all along?"
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη, ὑπέλαβες. 392c	"You've understood rightly," he said. 392c

NARRATION AND IMITATION

Socrates distinguishes plain narration from imitation and limits what the guardians may imitate.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
392c	**SOCRATES** οὐκοῦν περί γε ἀνθρώπων ὅτι τοιούτους δεῖ λόγους λέγεσθαι, τότε διομολογησόμεθα, ὅταν εὕρωμεν οἷόν ἐστιν δικαιοσύνη καὶ ὡς φύσει λυσιτελοῦν τῷ ἔχοντι, ἐάντε δοκῇ ἐάντε μὴ τοιοῦτος εἶναι;	**SOCRATES** "So we'll agree that such stories must be told about human beings only when we've discovered what justice is, and how by nature it benefits its possessor, whether he seems just or not?"
	ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη.	"Very true," he said.
	τὰ μὲν δὴ λόγων πέρι ἐχέτω τέλος· τὸ δὲ λέξεως, ὡς ἐγὼ οἶμαι, μετὰ τοῦτο σκεπτέον, καὶ ἡμῖν ἅ τε λεκτέον καὶ ὡς λεκτέον παντελῶς ἐσκέψεται.	"Then let that be the end of what concerns content. Next, I think, we must examine style, and then we'll have fully examined both what must be said and how."
	καὶ ὁ Ἀδείμαντος, τοῦτο, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐ μανθάνω ὅτι λέγεις. 392d	And Adeimantus said, "I don't understand what you mean by that." 392d
392d	ἀλλὰ μέντοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δεῖ γε· ἴσως οὖν τῇδε μᾶλλον εἴσῃ. ἆρ' οὐ πάντα ὅσα ὑπὸ μυθολόγων ἢ ποιητῶν λέγεται διήγησις οὖσα τυγχάνει ἢ γεγονότων ἢ ὄντων ἢ μελλόντων;	"Well, you should," I said. "Maybe you'll understand better this way. Isn't everything told by storytellers or poets a narration of things past, present or future?"
	τί γάρ, ἔφη, ἄλλο;	"What else could it be?" he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἆρ' οὖν οὐχὶ ἤτοι ἁπλῇ διηγήσει ἢ διὰ μιμήσεως γιγνομένῃ ἢ δι' ἀμφοτέρων περαίνουσιν;	"And don't they carry it out by plain narration, or by narration that works through imitation, or by both?"
	καὶ τοῦτο, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἔτι δέομαι σαφέστερον μαθεῖν.	"This too," he said, "I need to understand more clearly."
	γελοῖος, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἔοικα διδάσκαλος εἶναι καὶ ἀσαφής· ὥσπερ οὖν οἱ ἀδύνατοι λέγειν, οὐ κατὰ ὅλον ἀλλ' ἀπολαβὼν [392e] μέρος τι πειράσομαί σοι ἐν τούτῳ δηλῶσαι ὃ βούλομαι.	"I seem to be a ridiculous and unclear teacher," I said. "So, like people who are bad at explaining, I won't take the whole thing, but I'll take [392e] one part and try to show you in it what I mean.
392e	καί μοι εἰπέ· ἐπίστασαι τῆς Ἰλιάδος τὰ πρῶτα, ἐν οἷς ὁ ποιητής φησι τὸν μὲν Χρύσην δεῖσθαι τοῦ Ἀγαμέμνονος ἀπολῦσαι τὴν θυγατέρα, τὸν δὲ χαλεπαίνειν, τὸν δέ, ἐπειδὴ [393a] οὐκ ἐτύγχανεν, κατεύχεσθαι τῶν Ἀχαιῶν πρὸς τὸν θεόν;	"Tell me: do you know the beginning of the *Iliad*, where the poet says that Chryses begged Agamemnon to release his daughter, that Agamemnon was angry, and that Chryses, since [393a] he didn't get what he asked, prayed to the god against the Achaeans?"
	ἔγωγε.	"I do."[12]
393a	οἶσθ' οὖν ὅτι μέχρι μὲν τούτων τῶν ἐπῶν— καὶ ἐλίσσετο πάντας Ἀχαιούς, Ἀτρείδα δὲ μάλιστα δύω, κοσμήτορε λαῶν λέγει τε αὐτὸς ὁ ποιητὴς καὶ οὐδὲ ἐπιχειρεῖ ἡμῶν τὴν διάνοιαν ἄλλοσε τρέπειν ὡς ἄλλος τις ὁ λέγων ἢ αὐτός· τὰ δὲ μετὰ ταῦτα ὥσπερ αὐτὸς ὢν ὁ Χρύσης λέγει καὶ πειρᾶται [393b] ἡμᾶς ὅτι μάλιστα ποιῆσαι μὴ Ὅμηρον δοκεῖν εἶναι τὸν λέγοντα ἀλλὰ τὸν ἱερέα, πρεσβύτην ὄντα. καὶ τὴν ἄλλην δὴ πᾶσαν σχεδόν τι οὕτω πεποίηται διήγησιν περί τε τῶν ἐν Ἰλίῳ καὶ περὶ τῶν ἐν Ἰθάκῃ καὶ ὅλῃ Ὀδυσσείᾳ παθημάτων.	"Then you know that up to these lines—'and he begged all the Achaeans, and most of all the two sons of Atreus, marshals of the people'—the poet himself is speaking, and doesn't even try to turn our minds elsewhere, as if the speaker were someone other than himself. But after that he speaks as though he himself were Chryses, and tries as hard as he can [393b] to make us think that the speaker isn't Homer but the priest, an old man. And he's composed nearly all the rest of his narration this way, about what happened at Troy, and in Ithaca, and in the whole *Odyssey*."
393b	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Certainly," he said.
	οὐκοῦν διήγησις μέν ἐστιν καὶ ὅταν τὰς ῥήσεις ἑκάστοτε λέγῃ καὶ ὅταν τὰ μεταξὺ τῶν ῥήσεων;	"Now it's narration both when he gives the speeches and when he gives what comes between the speeches?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ; [393c]	"Of course." [393c]
	ἀλλ' ὅταν γέ τινα λέγῃ ῥῆσιν ὡς τις ἄλλος ὤν, ἆρ' οὐ τότε ὁμοιοῦν αὐτὸν φήσομεν ὅτι μάλιστα τὴν αὑτοῦ λέξιν ἑκάστῳ ὃν ἂν προείπῃ ὡς ἐροῦντα;	"But when he gives a speech as though he were someone else, won't we say that he then makes his own style as much like each speaker he introduces as he can?"
	φήσομεν· τί γάρ;	"We will—what else?"
	οὐκοῦν τό γε ὁμοιοῦν ἑαυτὸν ἄλλῳ ἢ κατὰ φωνὴν ἢ κατὰ σχῆμα μιμεῖσθαί ἐστιν ἐκεῖνον ᾧ ἄν τις ὁμοιοῖ;	"And isn't making oneself like someone else, in voice or in bearing, imitating the person one makes oneself like?"
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
393c		

12 Chryses was a priest of Apollo whose daughter had been taken captive by the Greeks.

GREEK	ENGLISH
ἐν δὴ τῷ τοιούτῳ, ὡς ἔοικεν, οὗτός τε καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι ποιηταὶ διὰ μιμήσεως τὴν διήγησιν ποιοῦνται.	"In a case like that, then, it seems, he and the other poets produce their narration through imitation."
πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
εἰ δέ γε μηδαμοῦ ἑαυτὸν ἀποκρύπτοιτο ὁ ποιητής, πᾶσα [393d] ἂν αὐτῷ ἄνευ μιμήσεως ἡ ποίησίς τε καὶ διήγησις γεγονυῖα εἴη. ἵνα δὲ μὴ εἴπῃς ὅτι οὐκ αὖ μανθάνεις, ὅπως ἂν τοῦτο γένοιτο ἐγὼ φράσω. εἰ γὰρ Ὅμηρος εἰπὼν ὅτι ἦλθεν ὁ Χρύσης τῆς τε θυγατρὸς λύτρα φέρων καὶ ἱκέτης τῶν Ἀχαιῶν, μάλιστα δὲ τῶν βασιλέων, μετὰ τοῦτο μὴ ὡς Χρύσης γενόμενος ἔλεγεν ἀλλ' ἔτι ὡς Ὅμηρος, οἶσθ' ὅτι οὐκ ἂν μίμησις ἦν ἀλλὰ ἁπλῆ διήγησις. εἶχε δ' ἂν ὧδε πως—φράσω δὲ ἄνευ μέτρου· οὐ γάρ εἰμι ποιητικός—ἐλθὼν [393e] ὁ ἱερεὺς ηὔχετο ἐκείνοις μὲν τοὺς θεοὺς δοῦναι ἑλόντας τὴν Τροίαν αὐτοὺς σωθῆναι, τὴν δὲ θυγατέρα οἱ λῦσαι δεξαμένους ἄποινα καὶ τὸν θεὸν αἰδεσθέντας.	"But if the poet never hid himself anywhere, his whole poem and narration [393d] would have come about without imitation. And so you won't say again that you don't understand, I'll explain how that would happen. If Homer, after saying that Chryses came bringing a ransom for his daughter, as a suppliant to the Achaeans and especially the kings, had gone on speaking not as though he had become Chryses but still as Homer, you know it wouldn't be imitation but plain narration. It would go something like this—I'll put it without meter, since I'm no poet: The priest came [393e] and prayed that the gods would grant that they capture Troy and come home safe themselves, and that they would release his daughter to him, accepting the ransom and respecting the god.
393e ταῦτα δὲ εἰπόντος αὐτοῦ οἱ μὲν ἄλλοι ἐσέβοντο καὶ συνῄνουν, ὁ δὲ Ἀγαμέμνων ἠγρίαινεν ἐντελλόμενος νῦν τε ἀπιέναι καὶ αὖθις μὴ ἐλθεῖν, μὴ αὐτῷ τό τε σκῆπτρον καὶ τὰ τοῦ θεοῦ στέμματα οὐκ ἐπαρκέσοι· πρὶν δὲ λυθῆναι αὐτοῦ τὴν θυγατέρα, ἐν Ἄργει ἔφη γηράσειν μετὰ οὗ· ἀπιέναι δ' ἐκέλευεν καὶ μὴ ἐρεθίζειν, [394a] >ἵνα σῶς οἴκαδε ἔλθοι. ὁ δὲ πρεσβύτης ἀκούσας ἔδεισέν τε καὶ ἀπῄει σιγῇ, ἀποχωρήσας δὲ ἐκ τοῦ στρατοπέδου πολλὰ τῷ Ἀπόλλωνι ηὔχετο, τάς τε ἐπωνυμίας τοῦ θεοῦ ἀνακαλῶν καὶ ὑπομιμνῄσκων καὶ ἀπαιτῶν, εἴ τι πώποτε ἢ ἐν ναῶν οἰκοδομήσεσιν ἢ ἐν ἱερῶν θυσίαις κεχαρισμένον δωρήσαιτο· ὧν δὴ χάριν κατηύχετο τεῖσαι τοὺς Ἀχαιοὺς τὰ ἃ δάκρυα τοῖς ἐκείνου βέλεσιν. οὕτως, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ ἑταῖρε, ἄνευ [394b] μιμήσεως ἁπλῆ διήγησις γίγνεται.	"When he had said this, the others were respectful and agreed, but Agamemnon grew savage, ordering him to leave now and not come back, or the staff and the god's wreaths would be no help to him. Before his daughter was set free, he said, she would grow old with him in Argos. He told him to go away and not provoke him, [394a] if he wanted to get home safe. When the old man heard this he was afraid and left in silence. But once he had withdrawn from the camp he prayed at length to Apollo, calling on the god by his titles and reminding him, and asking for a return if he had ever given him a gift that pleased him, whether in building temples or in sacrificing victims. In return for these, he prayed, let the Achaeans pay for his tears with the god's arrows. That, my friend," I said, "is how plain narration without [394b] imitation comes about."
394b μανθάνω, ἔφη.	"I understand," he said.
μάνθανε τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι ταύτης αὖ ἐναντία γίγνεται, ὅταν τις τὰ τοῦ ποιητοῦ τὰ μεταξὺ τῶν ῥήσεων ἐξαιρῶν τὰ ἀμοιβαῖα καταλείπῃ.	"Then understand," I said, "that the opposite of this comes about when someone takes out the poet's words between the speeches and leaves only the exchanges."
καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφη, μανθάνω, ὅτι ἔστιν τὸ περὶ τὰς τραγῳδίας τοιοῦτον.	"I understand this too," he said. "That's the way it is with tragedy."

GREEK

ENGLISH

ὀρθότατα, ἔφην, ὑπέλαβες, καὶ οἶμαί σοι ἤδη δηλοῦν ὃ ἔμπροσθεν οὐχ οἷός τ' ἦ, ὅτι τῆς ποιήσεώς τε καὶ μυθολογίας [394c] ἡ μὲν διὰ μιμήσεως ὅλη ἐστίν, ὥσπερ σὺ λέγεις, τραγῳδία τε καὶ κωμῳδία, ἡ δὲ δι' ἀπαγγελίας αὐτοῦ τοῦ ποιητοῦ—εὕροις δ' ἂν αὐτὴν μάλιστά που ἐν διθυράμβοις— ἡ δ' αὖ δι' ἀμφοτέρων ἔν τε τῇ τῶν ἐπῶν ποιήσει, πολλαχοῦ δὲ καὶ ἄλλοθι, εἴ μοι μανθάνεις.

ἀλλὰ συνίημι, ἔφη, ὃ τότε ἐβούλου λέγειν.

"You've taken it exactly right," I said, "and I think I can now make clear to you what I couldn't before: that one kind of poetry and storytelling [394c] works entirely through imitation—tragedy and comedy, as you say; another through the report of the poet himself—you'd find it mostly, I suppose, in dithyrambs; and another through both, in epic poetry and in many other places too, if you follow me."

"Yes, now I see," he said, "what you meant then."[13]

394c καὶ τὸ πρὸ τούτου δὴ ἀναμνήσθητι, ὅτι ἔφαμεν ἃ μὲν λεκτέον ἤδη εἰρῆσθαι, ὡς δὲ λεκτέον ἔτι σκεπτέον εἶναι.

ἀλλὰ μέμνημαι. [394d]

τοῦτο τοίνυν αὐτὸ ἦν ὃ ἔλεγον, ὅτι χρείη διομολογήσασθαι πότερον ἐάσομεν τοὺς ποιητὰς μιμουμένους ἡμῖν τὰς διηγήσεις ποιεῖσθαι ἢ τὰ μὲν μιμουμένους, τὰ δὲ μή, καὶ ὁποῖα ἑκάτερα, ἢ οὐδὲ μιμεῖσθαι.

μαντεύομαι, ἔφη, σκοπεῖσθαί σε εἴτε παραδεξόμεθα τραγῳδίαν τε καὶ κωμῳδίαν εἰς τὴν πόλιν, εἴτε καὶ οὔ.

"Then remember what came before this too: we said that what must be said had already been discussed, but how it must be said was still to be examined."

"I remember." [394d]

"Well, this is exactly what I meant: that we have to come to an agreement whether we'll let the poets produce their narrations for us by imitating, or by imitating in some parts and not in others—and which parts in each case—or not imitating at all."

"I have a hunch," he said, "you're considering whether or not we'll admit tragedy and comedy into the city."

394d ἴσως, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἴσως δὲ καὶ πλείω ἔτι τούτων· οὐ γὰρ δὴ ἔγωγέ πω οἶδα, ἀλλ' ὅπῃ ἂν ὁ λόγος ὥσπερ πνεῦμα φέρῃ, ταύτῃ ἰτέον.

καὶ καλῶς γ', ἔφη, λέγεις. [394e]

τόδε τοίνυν, ὦ Ἀδείμαντε, ἄθρει, πότερον μιμητικοὺς ἡμῖν δεῖ εἶναι τοὺς φύλακας ἢ οὔ· ἢ καὶ τοῦτο τοῖς ἔμπροσθεν ἕπεται, ὅτι εἷς ἕκαστος ἓν μὲν ἂν ἐπιτήδευμα καλῶς ἐπιτηδεύοι, πολλὰ δ' οὔ, ἀλλ' εἰ τοῦτο ἐπιχειροῖ, πολλῶν ἐφαπτόμενος πάντων ἀποτυγχάνοι ἄν, ὥστ' εἶναί που ἐλλόγιμος;

τί δ' οὐ μέλλει;

"Perhaps," I said, "and perhaps even more than that. I don't know yet myself; but wherever the argument carries us, like a wind, that's where we must go."

"And you're right," he said. [394e]

"Then consider this, Adeimantus: should our guardians be imitators or not? Or does this too follow from what we said before—that each person would practice one pursuit well, but not many, and if he tried, by dabbling in many he would fail at them all, and never make a name for himself in any?"

"Of course it follows."

394e οὐκοῦν καὶ περὶ μιμήσεως ὁ αὐτὸς λόγος, ὅτι πολλὰ ὁ αὐτὸς μιμεῖσθαι εὖ ὥσπερ ἓν οὐ δυνατός;

οὐ γὰρ οὖν.

σχολῇ ἄρα ἐπιτηδεύσει γέ τι ἅμα τῶν ἀξίων λόγου ἐπιτηδευμάτων καὶ πολλὰ μιμήσεται καὶ ἔσται μιμητικός, ἐπεί που οὐδὲ τὰ δοκοῦντα ἐγγὺς ἀλλήλων εἶναι δύο μιμήματα δύνανται οἱ αὐτοὶ ἅμα εὖ μιμεῖσθαι, οἷον

"And doesn't the same argument hold for imitation—that the same person can't imitate many things as well as he can one?"

"No, he can't."

"Then he'll hardly practice any pursuit worth mentioning while at the same time imitating many things and being an imitator. After all, even with two kinds of imitation that seem close to

13 A dithyramb was a choral song, traditionally in honor of Dionysus, performed at Athenian festivals.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	κωμῳδίαν καὶ τραγῳδίαν ποιοῦντες. ἢ οὐ μιμήματε ἄρτι τούτω ἐκάλεις;	each other, the same people can't do both well—writing comedy and tragedy, for instance. Didn't you just call these two imitations?"
	ἔγωγε· καὶ ἀληθῆ γε λέγεις, ὅτι οὐ δύνανται οἱ αὐτοί.	"I did. And you're right that the same people can't do both."
	οὐδὲ μὴν ῥαψῳδοί γε καὶ ὑποκριταὶ ἅμα.	"Nor can they be rhapsodes and actors at once."
	ἀληθῆ.	"True."
395a	ἀλλ' οὐδέ τοι ὑποκριταὶ κωμῳδοῖς τε καὶ τραγῳδοῖς οἱ [395b] αὐτοί· πάντα δὲ ταῦτα μιμήματα. ἢ οὔ;	"And the same actors don't even perform comedy and [395b] tragedy. Yet all these are imitations, aren't they?"
	μιμήματα.	"Imitations."
	καὶ ἔτι γε τούτων, ὦ Ἀδείμαντε, φαίνεταί μοι εἰς σμικρότερα κατακεκερματίσθαι ἡ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου φύσις, ὥστε ἀδύνατος εἶναι πολλὰ καλῶς μιμεῖσθαι ἢ αὐτὰ ἐκεῖνα πράττειν ὧν δὴ καὶ τὰ μιμήματά ἐστιν ἀφομοιώματα.	"And human nature, Adeimantus, seems to me to be minted into even smaller change than this, so that it can't imitate many things well, or do the very things of which the imitations are likenesses."
	ἀληθέστατα, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Very true," he said.
395b	εἰ ἄρα τὸν πρῶτον λόγον διασώσομεν, τοὺς φύλακας ἡμῖν τῶν ἄλλων πασῶν δημιουργιῶν ἀφειμένους δεῖν εἶναι [395c] δημιουργοὺς ἐλευθερίας τῆς πόλεως πάνυ ἀκριβεῖς καὶ μηδὲν ἄλλο ἐπιτηδεύειν ὅτι μὴ εἰς τοῦτο φέρει, οὐδὲν δὴ δέοι ἂν αὐτοὺς ἄλλο πράττειν οὐδὲ μιμεῖσθαι· ἐὰν δὲ μιμῶνται, μιμεῖσθαι τὰ τούτοις προσήκοντα εὐθὺς ἐκ παίδων, ἀνδρείους, σώφρονας, ὁσίους, ἐλευθέρους, καὶ τὰ τοιαῦτα πάντα, τὰ δὲ ἀνελεύθερα μήτε ποιεῖν μήτε δεινοὺς εἶναι μιμήσασθαι, μηδὲ ἄλλο μηδὲν τῶν αἰσχρῶν, ἵνα μὴ ἐκ τῆς μιμήσεως τοῦ εἶναι [395d] ἀπολαύσωσιν. ἢ οὐκ ᾔσθησαι ὅτι αἱ μιμήσεις, ἐὰν ἐκ νέων πόρρω διατελέσωσιν, εἰς ἔθη τε καὶ φύσιν καθίστανται καὶ κατὰ σῶμα καὶ φωνὰς καὶ κατὰ τὴν διάνοιαν;	"Then if we're to preserve our first argument—that our guardians must be released from all other crafts and be very exact [395c] craftsmen of the city's freedom, pursuing nothing that doesn't contribute to it—then they shouldn't do or imitate anything else. And if they do imitate, they should imitate from childhood what suits them—people who are courageous, moderate, pious, free, and everything of that kind. What is unfree they should neither do nor be clever at imitating, nor anything else shameful, so that they don't get a taste of the real thing [395d] from the imitation. Or haven't you noticed that imitations, if they're kept up from youth on for a long time, settle into habits and nature—in the body, the voice and the mind?"
395d	καὶ μάλα, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Very much so," he said.
	οὐ δὴ ἐπιτρέψομεν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὧν φαμὲν κήδεσθαι καὶ δεῖν αὐτοὺς ἄνδρας ἀγαθοὺς γενέσθαι, γυναῖκα μιμεῖσθαι ἄνδρας ὄντας, ἢ νέαν ἢ πρεσβυτέραν, ἢ ἀνδρὶ λοιδορουμένην ἢ πρὸς θεοὺς ἐρίζουσάν τε καὶ μεγαλαυχουμένην, οἰομένην [395e] εὐδαίμονα εἶναι, ἢ ἐν συμφοραῖς τε καὶ πένθεσιν καὶ θρήνοις ἐχομένην· κάμνουσαν δὲ ἢ ἐρῶσαν ἢ ὠδίνουσαν, πολλοῦ καὶ δεήσομεν.	"Then we won't allow those we say we care for," I said, "and who must become good men, to imitate a woman, since they are men—whether young or older, whether railing at her husband, or quarreling with gods and boasting because she thinks [395e] she's happy, or caught up in misfortunes, grief and lamentation. Still less one who's sick, or in love, or in labor."
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Absolutely," he said.
	οὐδέ γε δούλας τε καὶ δούλους πράττοντας ὅσα δούλων.	"Nor female and male slaves doing what slaves do."
	οὐδὲ τοῦτο.	"Not that either."

GREEK

ENGLISH

395e οὐδέ γε ἄνδρας κακούς, ὡς ἔοικεν, δειλούς τε καὶ τὰ ἐναντία πράττοντας ὧν νυνδὴ εἴπομεν, κακηγοροῦντάς τε καὶ κωμῳδοῦντας ἀλλήλους καὶ αἰσχρολογοῦντας, μεθύοντας ἢ [396a] καὶ νήφοντας, ἢ καὶ ἄλλα ὅσα οἱ τοιοῦτοι καὶ ἐν λόγοις καὶ ἐν ἔργοις ἁμαρτάνουσιν εἰς αὑτούς τε καὶ εἰς ἄλλους, οἶμαι δὲ οὐδὲ μαινομένοις ἐθιστέον ἀφομοιοῦν αὑτοὺς ἐν λόγοις οὐδὲ ἐν ἔργοις· γνωστέον μὲν γὰρ καὶ μαινομένους καὶ πονηροὺς ἄνδρας τε καὶ γυναῖκας, ποιητέον δὲ οὐδὲν τούτων οὐδὲ μιμητέον.

ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη.

"Nor bad men, it seems, cowards who do the opposite of what we just described—insulting and mocking one another and using foul language, drunk or [396a] even sober—or any of the other ways such people offend in word and deed against themselves and others. And I don't think they should get used to making themselves like madmen in word or deed either. For one has to recognize madmen and wicked people, both men and women, but must not do or imitate anything of theirs."

"Very true," he said.

396a τί δέ; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· χαλκεύοντας ἤ τι ἄλλο δημιουργοῦντας, [396b] ἢ ἐλαύνοντας τριήρεις ἢ κελεύοντας τούτοις, ἤ τι ἄλλο τῶν περὶ ταῦτα μιμητέον;

καὶ πῶς; ἔφη, οἷς γε οὐδὲ προσέχειν τὸν νοῦν τούτων οὐδενὶ ἐξέσται;

τί δέ; ἵππους χρεμετίζοντας καὶ ταύρους μυκωμένους καὶ ποταμοὺς ψοφοῦντας καὶ θάλατταν κτυποῦσαν καὶ βροντὰς καὶ πάντα αὖ τὰ τοιαῦτα ἦ μιμήσονται;

ἀλλ' ἀπείρηται αὐτοῖς, ἔφη, μήτε μαίνεσθαι μήτε μαινομένοις ἀφομοιοῦσθαι.

"What about this?" I said. "Should they imitate smiths or other craftsmen at work, [396b] or men rowing triremes or calling the stroke for them, or anything else connected with these?"

"How could they," he said, "when they won't even be allowed to pay attention to any of these things?"

"And what about horses neighing and bulls bellowing, rivers roaring and the sea crashing, and thunder, and all such things—will they imitate them?"

"No," he said. "They've been forbidden to be mad or to make themselves like madmen."[14]

396b εἰ ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μανθάνω ἃ σὺ λέγεις, ἔστιν τι εἶδος λέξεώς τε καὶ διηγήσεως ἐν ᾧ ἂν διηγοῖτο ὁ τῷ ὄντι καλὸς [396c] κἀγαθός, ὁπότε τι δέοι αὐτὸν λέγειν, καὶ ἕτερον αὖ ἀνόμοιον τούτῳ εἶδος, οὗ ἂν ἔχοιτο ἀεὶ καὶ ἐν ᾧ διηγοῖτο ὁ ἐναντίως ἐκείνῳ φύς τε καὶ τραφείς.

ποῖα δή, ἔφη, ταῦτα;

"Then if I understand what you mean," I said, "there is one kind of style and narration that a truly fine and good man [396c] would use whenever he had to say something, and another kind, unlike it, that a man of the opposite nature and upbringing would always keep to and use in his narration."

"What are they?" he said.

396c ὁ μέν μοι δοκεῖ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μέτριος ἀνήρ, ἐπειδὰν ἀφίκηται ἐν τῇ διηγήσει ἐπὶ λέξιν τινὰ ἢ πρᾶξιν ἀνδρὸς ἀγαθοῦ, ἐθελήσειν ὡς αὐτὸς ὢν ἐκεῖνος ἀπαγγέλλειν καὶ οὐκ αἰσχυνεῖσθαι ἐπὶ τῇ τοιαύτῃ μιμήσει, μάλιστα μὲν μιμούμενος [396d] τὸν ἀγαθὸν ἀσφαλῶς τε καὶ ἐμφρόνως πράττοντα, ἐλάττω δὲ καὶ ἧττον ἢ ὑπὸ νόσων ἢ ὑπὸ ἐρώτων ἐσφαλμένον ἢ καὶ ὑπὸ μέθης ἤ τινος ἄλλης συμφορᾶς· ὅταν δὲ γίγνηται κατά τινα ἑαυτοῦ ἀνάξιον, οὐκ ἐθελήσειν σπουδῇ ἀπεικάζειν ἑαυτὸν τῷ χείρονι, εἰ μὴ ἄρα κατὰ βραχύ, ὅταν τι χρηστὸν ποιῇ, ἀλλ' αἰσχυνεῖσθαι, ἅμα μὲν ἀγύμναστος ὢν τοῦ μιμεῖσθαι τοὺς

"I think," I said, "that when a moderate man comes in his narration to some speech or action of a good man, he'll be willing to report it as if he himself were that man, and won't be ashamed of that kind of imitation. He'll imitate the good man most [396d] when he is acting steadily and sensibly, and less, and less readily, when he's been tripped up by illness or love, or by drink or some other misfortune. But when he comes to someone unworthy of himself, he won't be willing to model himself seriously on someone worse than he is—

14 The trireme was the standard Greek warship, rowed by about 170 oarsmen kept in time by a caller.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τοιούτους, ἅμα δὲ καὶ δυσχεραίνων αὐτὸν ἐκμάττειν τε καὶ 396e ἐνιστάναι εἰς τοὺς τῶν κακιόνων τύπους, ἀτιμάζων τῇ διανοίᾳ, ὅτι μὴ παιδιᾶς χάριν.	except briefly, when that person does something good. Instead he'll be ashamed, both because he has no practice in imitating such people and because he can't stand molding himself on the patterns of worse men and 396e fitting himself into them. He holds it in contempt in his mind—except as play."
396e	εἰκός, ἔφη.	"Likely enough," he said.
	οὐκοῦν διηγήσει χρήσεται οἵᾳ ἡμεῖς ὀλίγον πρότερον διήλθομεν περὶ τὰ τοῦ Ὁμήρου ἔπη, καὶ ἔσται αὐτοῦ ἡ λέξις μετέχουσα μὲν ἀμφοτέρων, μιμήσεώς τε καὶ τῆς ἄλλης διηγήσεως, σμικρὸν δέ τι μέρος ἐν πολλῷ λόγῳ τῆς μιμήσεως; ἢ οὐδὲν λέγω;	"So he'll use the kind of narration we went through a little while ago in connection with Homer's epics. His style will share in both, imitation and plain narration, but with only a small portion of imitation in a long stretch of speech. Or am I talking nonsense?"
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, οἷόν γε ἀνάγκη τὸν τύπον εἶναι τοῦ τοιούτου ῥήτορος.	"Not at all," he said. "That's exactly the pattern such a speaker must follow."
397a	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὁ μὴ τοιοῦτος αὖ, ὅσῳ ἂν φαυλότερος ᾖ, πάντα τε μᾶλλον διηγήσεται καὶ οὐδὲν ἑαυτοῦ ἀνάξιον οἰήσεται εἶναι, ὥστε πάντα ἐπιχειρήσει μιμεῖσθαι σπουδῇ τε καὶ ἐναντίον πολλῶν, καὶ ἃ νυνδὴ ἐλέγομεν, βροντάς τε καὶ ψόφους ἀνέμων τε καὶ χαλαζῶν καὶ ἀξόνων τε καὶ τροχιλιῶν, καὶ σαλπίγγων καὶ αὐλῶν καὶ συρίγγων καὶ πάντων ὀργάνων φωνάς, καὶ ἔτι κυνῶν καὶ προβάτων καὶ ὀρνέων φθόγγους· 397b καὶ ἔσται δὴ ἡ τούτου λέξις ἅπασα διὰ μιμήσεως φωναῖς τε καὶ σχήμασιν, ἢ σμικρόν τι διηγήσεως ἔχουσα;	"And the one who isn't like that," I said, "will narrate anything at all, the more so the worse he is, and think nothing beneath him. So he'll undertake to imitate everything, in earnest and in front of a crowd, including the things we were just mentioning: thunder, the noise of wind and hail, of axles and pulleys, the voices of trumpets and pipes and panpipes and every instrument, and even the cries of dogs, sheep and birds. 397b His whole style will be imitation, by voice and gesture, with perhaps a little narration in it?"
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, καὶ τοῦτο.	"That must follow too," he said.
397b	ταῦτα τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἔλεγον τὰ δύο εἴδη τῆς λέξεως.	"These, then," I said, "are the two kinds of style I meant."
	καὶ γὰρ ἔστιν, ἔφη.	"Yes, they are," he said.
	οὐκοῦν αὐτοῖν τὸ μὲν σμικρὰς τὰς μεταβολὰς ἔχει, καὶ ἐάν τις ἀποδιδῷ πρέπουσαν ἁρμονίαν καὶ ῥυθμὸν τῇ λέξει, ὀλίγου πρὸς τὴν αὐτὴν γίγνεται λέγειν τῷ ὀρθῶς λέγοντι καὶ ἐν μιᾷ ἁρμονίᾳ—σμικραὶ γὰρ αἱ μεταβολαί—καὶ δὴ καὶ ἐν 397c ῥυθμῷ ὡσαύτως παραπλησίῳ τινί;	"Now one of the two involves only small variations. If you give the style a fitting mode and rhythm, someone speaking it correctly ends up speaking in pretty much the same mode throughout—a single mode, since the variations are small—and likewise in 397c a rhythm that stays roughly the same. Isn't that so?"
	κομιδῇ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, οὕτως ἔχει.	"That's exactly how it is," he said.
397c	τί δὲ τὸ τοῦ ἑτέρου εἶδος; οὐ τῶν ἐναντίων δεῖται, πασῶν μὲν ἁρμονιῶν, πάντων δὲ ῥυθμῶν, εἰ μέλλει αὖ οἰκείως λέγεσθαι, διὰ τὸ παντοδαπὰς μορφὰς τῶν μεταβολῶν ἔχειν;	"What about the other kind? Doesn't it need the opposite—every mode and every rhythm—if it's to be delivered in a way that suits it, since it contains every sort of variation?"
	καὶ σφόδρα γε οὕτως ἔχει.	"Very much so."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἆρ' οὖν πάντες οἱ ποιηταὶ καὶ οἵ τι λέγοντες ἢ τῷ ἑτέρῳ τούτων ἐπιτυγχάνουσιν τύπῳ τῆς λέξεως ἢ τῷ ἑτέρῳ ἢ ἐξ ἀμφοτέρων τινὶ συγκεραννύντες;	"Then do all poets, and everyone who says anything, hit on one or the other of these patterns of style, or on some mixture of the two?"
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη. 397d	"Necessarily," he said. 397d
	τί οὖν ποιήσομεν; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· πότερον εἰς τὴν πόλιν πάντας τούτους παραδεξόμεθα ἢ τῶν ἀκράτων τὸν ἕτερον ἢ τὸν κεκραμένον;	"So what shall we do?" I said. "Shall we admit all of these into the city, or one of the unmixed kinds, or the mixed one?"
397d	ἐὰν ἡ ἐμή, ἔφη, νικᾷ, τὸν τοῦ ἐπιεικοῦς μιμητὴν ἄκρατον.	"If my vote wins," he said, "the unmixed imitator of the decent man."
	ἀλλὰ μήν, ὦ Ἀδείμαντε, ἡδύς γε καὶ ὁ κεκραμένος, πολὺ δὲ ἥδιστος παισί τε καὶ παιδαγωγοῖς ὁ ἐναντίος οὗ σὺ αἱρῇ καὶ τῷ πλείστῳ ὄχλῳ.	"And yet, Adeimantus, the mixed kind is pleasant too. And by far the most pleasant, to children and their attendants and to the great mass of people, is the opposite of the one you choose."
	ἥδιστος γάρ.	"Yes, it's the most pleasant."
	ἀλλ' ἴσως, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐκ ἂν αὐτὸν ἁρμόττειν φαίης τῇ 397e ἡμετέρᾳ πολιτείᾳ, ὅτι οὐκ ἔστιν διπλοῦς ἀνὴρ παρ' ἡμῖν οὐδὲ πολλαπλοῦς, ἐπειδὴ ἕκαστος ἓν πράττει.	"But perhaps," I said, "you'd say it doesn't suit our 397e constitution, because among us there's no double man, nor a manifold one, since each person does one thing."
	οὐ γὰρ οὖν ἁρμόττει.	"No, it doesn't suit it."
397e	οὐκοῦν διὰ ταῦτα ἐν μόνῃ τῇ τοιαύτῃ πόλει τόν τε σκυτοτόμον σκυτοτόμον εὑρήσομεν καὶ οὐ κυβερνήτην πρὸς τῇ σκυτοτομίᾳ, καὶ τὸν γεωργὸν γεωργὸν καὶ οὐ δικαστὴν πρὸς τῇ γεωργίᾳ, καὶ τὸν πολεμικὸν πολεμικὸν καὶ οὐ χρηματιστὴν πρὸς τῇ πολεμικῇ, καὶ πάντας οὕτω;	"So that's why it's only in a city like ours that we'll find the shoemaker a shoemaker, and not a ship's pilot on top of his shoemaking; the farmer a farmer, and not a juror on top of his farming; the soldier a soldier, and not a moneymaker on top of his soldiering; and so with everyone?"
	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη.	"True," he said.
398a	ἄνδρα δή, ὡς ἔοικε, δυνάμενον ὑπὸ σοφίας παντοδαπὸν γίγνεσθαι καὶ μιμεῖσθαι πάντα χρήματα, εἰ ἡμῖν ἀφίκοιτο εἰς τὴν πόλιν αὐτός τε καὶ τὰ ποιήματα βουλόμενος ἐπιδείξασθαι, προσκυνοῖμεν ἂν αὐτὸν ὡς ἱερὸν καὶ θαυμαστὸν καὶ ἡδύν, εἴποιμεν δ' ἂν ὅτι οὐκ ἔστιν τοιοῦτος ἀνὴρ ἐν τῇ πόλει παρ' ἡμῖν οὔτε θέμις ἐγγενέσθαι, ἀποπέμποιμέν τε εἰς ἄλλην πόλιν μύρον κατὰ τῆς κεφαλῆς καταχέαντες καὶ ἐρίῳ στέψαντες, αὐτοὶ δ' ἂν τῷ αὐστηροτέρῳ καὶ ἀηδεστέρῳ ποιητῇ 398b χρώμεθα καὶ μυθολόγῳ ὠφελίας ἕνεκα, ὃς ἡμῖν τὴν τοῦ ἐπιεικοῦς λέξιν μιμοῖτο καὶ τὰ λεγόμενα λέγοι ἐν ἐκείνοις τοῖς τύποις οἷς κατ' ἀρχὰς ἐνομοθετησάμεθα, ὅτε τοὺς στρατιώτας ἐπεχειροῦμεν παιδεύειν.	"So it seems that if a man whose wisdom let him become every sort of thing and imitate anything at all were to arrive in our city, wanting to put himself and his poems on show, we would bow down to him as someone holy, wonderful and delightful. But we'd tell him that there's no such man in our city, and that it isn't lawful for one to arise there; and we'd send him off to another city, after pouring myrrh over his head and crowning him with wool. For ourselves, for our own benefit, we'd employ a harsher and less pleasing poet 398b and storyteller, one who would imitate the style of the decent man and would say what he says in the patterns we laid down at the start, when we set out to educate our soldiers."[15]

15 Anointing with perfumed oil and wreathing with wool were honors paid to sacred objects such as statues of the gods.

MODES AND RHYTHMS

Socrates admits only modes and rhythms suited to a brave and orderly life.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
398b	**SOCRATES** καὶ μάλ', ἔφη, οὕτως ἂν ποιοῖμεν, εἰ ἐφ' ἡμῖν εἴη.	**SOCRATES** "We certainly would," he said, "if it were up to us."
	νῦν δή, εἶπον ἐγώ, ὦ φίλε, κινδυνεύει ἡμῖν τῆς μουσικῆς τὸ περὶ λόγους τε καὶ μύθους παντελῶς διαπεπεράνθαι· ἅ τε γὰρ λεκτέον καὶ ὡς λεκτέον εἴρηται.	"And now, my friend," I said, "it looks as though we've completely finished with the part of music that concerns speeches and stories. We've said both what must be said and how."
	καὶ αὐτῷ μοι δοκεῖ, ἔφη. 398c	"I think so too," he said. 398c
	οὐκοῦν μετὰ τοῦτο, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ περὶ ᾠδῆς τρόπου καὶ μελῶν λοιπόν;	"So what's left after this is the manner of song and melody?"
	δῆλα δή.	"Obviously."
	ἆρ' οὖν οὐ πᾶς ἤδη ἂν εὕροι ἃ ἡμῖν λεκτέον περὶ αὐτῶν οἷα δεῖ εἶναι, εἴπερ μέλλομεν τοῖς προειρημένοις συμφωνήσειν;	"Couldn't anyone at all work out by now what we have to say about them—what they must be like—if we're going to be consistent with what we've said already?"
398c	καὶ ὁ Γλαύκων ἐπιγελάσας, ἐγὼ τοίνυν, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, κινδυνεύω ἐκτὸς τῶν πάντων εἶναι· οὔκουν ἱκανῶς γε ἔχω ἐν τῷ παρόντι συμβαλέσθαι ποῖα ἄττα δεῖ ἡμᾶς λέγειν· ὑποπτεύω μέντοι.	Glaucon laughed and said, "Well, Socrates, I'm afraid your 'anyone at all' leaves me out. At the moment I can't quite infer what sort of thing we ought to say—though I have my suspicions."
	πάντως δήπου, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πρῶτον μὲν τόδε ἱκανῶς ἔχεις 398d λέγειν, ὅτι τὸ μέλος ἐκ τριῶν ἐστιν συγκείμενον, λόγου τε καὶ ἁρμονίας καὶ ῥυθμοῦ.	"Well, at any rate," I said, "you can surely say this much 398d to begin with: that a song is composed of three things—words, mode and rhythm."
	ναί, ἔφη, τοῦτό γε.	"Yes," he said, "that much I can."
	οὐκοῦν ὅσον γε αὐτοῦ λόγος ἐστίν, οὐδὲν δήπου διαφέρει τοῦ μὴ ᾀδομένου λόγου πρὸς τὸ ἐν τοῖς αὐτοῖς δεῖν τύποις λέγεσθαι οἷς ἄρτι προείπομεν καὶ ὡσαύτως;	"And as far as it's words, it surely doesn't differ at all from words that aren't sung, in having to be spoken according to the same patterns we laid down just now, and in the same way?"
	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη.	"True," he said.
398d	καὶ μὴν τήν γε ἁρμονίαν καὶ ῥυθμὸν ἀκολουθεῖν δεῖ τῷ λόγῳ.	"And the mode and the rhythm must follow the words."
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	ἀλλὰ μέντοι θρήνων γε καὶ ὀδυρμῶν ἔφαμεν ἐν λόγοις οὐδὲν προσδεῖσθαι.	"But we said we had no need of dirges and laments in our speeches."
	οὐ γὰρ οὖν. 398e	"No, we don't." 398e
	τίνες οὖν θρηνώδεις ἁρμονίαι; λέγε μοι· σὺ γὰρ μουσικός.	"Which modes are the mournful ones, then? Tell me—you're the musician."
	μειξολυδιστί, ἔφη, καὶ συντονολυδιστὶ καὶ τοιαῦταί τινες.	"Mixolydian," he said, "and Tense Lydian, and others like them."
	οὐκοῦν αὗται, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀφαιρετέαι; ἄχρηστοι γὰρ καὶ γυναιξὶν ἃς δεῖ ἐπιεικεῖς εἶναι, μὴ ὅτι ἀνδράσι.	"Then these must be removed?" I said. "They're useless even for women who are meant to be decent, let alone for men."
	πάνυ γε.	
	ἀλλὰ μὴν μέθη γε φύλαξιν ἀπρεπέστατον καὶ μαλακία καὶ ἀργία.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Certainly."
		"And drunkenness is utterly unfitting for guardians, and so are softness and idleness."
		"Of course."[16]
398e	τίνες οὖν μαλακαί τε καὶ συμποτικαὶ τῶν ἁρμονιῶν;	"Which of the modes are soft and suited to drinking parties?"
	ἰαστί, ἦ δ' ὅς, καὶ λυδιστὶ αὖ τινες χαλαραὶ καλοῦνται.	"Ionian," he said, "and some Lydian ones, the kind called 'slack.'"
	ταύταις οὖν, ὦ φίλε, ἐπὶ πολεμικῶν ἀνδρῶν ἔσθ' ὅτι χρήσῃ;	"Then will you have any use for these, my friend, with men who are warriors?"
	οὐδαμῶς, ἔφη· ἀλλὰ κινδυνεύει σοι δωριστὶ λείπεσθαι καὶ φρυγιστί.	"None at all," he said. "It looks as if you're left with Dorian and Phrygian."
399a	οὐκ οἶδα, ἔφην ἐγώ, τὰς ἁρμονίας, ἀλλὰ κατάλειπε ἐκείνην τὴν ἁρμονίαν, ἣ ἔν τε πολεμικῇ πράξει ὄντος ἀνδρείου καὶ ἐν πάσῃ βιαίῳ ἐργασίᾳ πρεπόντως ἂν μιμήσαιτο φθόγγους τε καὶ προσῳδίας, καὶ ἀποτυχόντος ἢ εἰς τραύματα ἢ εἰς [399b] θανάτους ἰόντος ἢ εἴς τινα ἄλλην συμφορὰν πεσόντος, ἐν πᾶσι τούτοις παρατεταγμένως καὶ καρτερούντως ἀμυνομένου τὴν τύχην· καὶ ἄλλην αὖ ἐν εἰρηνικῇ τε καὶ μὴ βιαίῳ ἀλλ' ἐν ἑκουσίᾳ πράξει ὄντος, ἢ τινά τι πείθοντός τε καὶ δεομένου, ἢ εὐχῇ θεὸν ἢ διδαχῇ καὶ νουθετήσει ἄνθρωπον, ἢ τοὐναντίον ἄλλῳ δεομένῳ ἢ διδάσκοντι ἢ μεταπείθοντι ἑαυτὸν ἐπέχοντα, καὶ ἐκ τούτων πράξαντα κατὰ νοῦν, καὶ μὴ ὑπερηφάνως ἔχοντα, ἀλλὰ σωφρόνως τε καὶ μετρίως ἐν πᾶσι τούτοις [399c] πράττοντά τε καὶ τὰ ἀποβαίνοντα ἀγαπῶντα.	"I don't know the modes," I said, "but leave that mode which would fittingly imitate the voice and the accents of a brave man engaged in warfare, or in any forced undertaking—a man who, when he fails, whether he's going to meet wounds or [399b] death or has fallen into some other misfortune, in all these cases wards off his fortune steadily and with endurance. And leave another for a man engaged in peaceful action, not forced but voluntary: persuading someone of something and making a request of them—a god in prayer, or a human being by teaching and advice—or, conversely, submitting himself to someone else who makes a request of him, or teaches him, or tries to change his mind; and who, having achieved what he intended as a result, doesn't become arrogant, but in all this [399c] acts with moderation and measure and is content with how things turn out.
399c	ταύτας δύο ἁρμονίας, βίαιον, ἑκούσιον, δυστυχούντων, εὐτυχούντων, σωφρόνων, ἀνδρείων ἁρμονίας αἵτινες φθόγγους μιμήσονται κάλλιστα, ταύτας λεῖπε.	"These two modes, the forced and the voluntary, which will best imitate the voices of men in misfortune and in good fortune, of the moderate and of the brave: leave these."
	ἀλλ', ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐκ ἄλλας αἰτεῖς λείπειν ἢ ἃς νυνδὴ ἐγὼ ἔλεγον.	"Well," he said, "the ones you're asking me to leave are none other than the ones I just mentioned."
	οὐκ ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πολυχορδίας γε οὐδὲ παναρμονίου ἡμῖν δεήσει ἐν ταῖς ᾠδαῖς τε καὶ μέλεσιν.	"Then," I said, "we won't need a multitude of strings, or instruments that play in every mode, for our songs and melodies."
	οὔ μοι, ἔφη, φαίνεται.	"It seems not to me," he said.
	τριγώνων ἄρα καὶ πηκτίδων καὶ πάντων ὀργάνων ὅσα [399d] πολύχορδα καὶ πολυαρμόνια, δημιουργοὺς οὐ θρέψομεν.	"Then we won't support craftsmen who make triangular harps and lutes and all the instruments that are [399d] many-stringed and many-moded."
	οὐ φαινόμεθα.	

16 Greek music used a number of modes (*harmoniai*), scales named after peoples or regions—Lydian, Ionian, Dorian, Phrygian—each thought to have its own emotional character.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τί δέ; αὐλοποιοὺς ἢ αὐλητὰς παραδέξῃ εἰς τὴν πόλιν; ἢ οὐ τοῦτο πολυχορδότατον, καὶ αὐτὰ τὰ παναρμόνια αὐλοῦ τυγχάνει ὄντα μίμημα;	"Apparently not."
	δῆλα δή, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Well then, will you admit pipe-makers or pipers into the city? Isn't the pipe the most 'many-stringed' of all, and aren't the all-mode instruments themselves really imitations of the pipe?"
		"Clearly," he said.[17]
399d	λύρα δή σοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ κιθάρα λείπεται καὶ κατὰ πόλιν χρήσιμα· καὶ αὖ κατ' ἀγροὺς τοῖς νομεῦσι σῦριγξ ἄν τις εἴη.	"So you're left with the lyre and the cithara, for use in the city," I said, "and in the countryside there might be some sort of panpipe for the shepherds."
	ὡς γοῦν, ἔφη, ὁ λόγος ἡμῖν σημαίνει. 399e	"That, at any rate, is what our argument indicates," he said. 399e
	οὐδέν γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καινὸν ποιοῦμεν, ὦ φίλε, κρίνοντες τὸν Ἀπόλλω καὶ τὰ τοῦ Ἀπόλλωνος ὄργανα πρὸ Μαρσύου τε καὶ τῶν ἐκείνου ὀργάνων.	"We're doing nothing new, my friend," I said, "in preferring Apollo and Apollo's instruments to Marsyas and his."
	μὰ Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὔ μοι φαινόμεθα.	"No, by Zeus," he said, "I don't think we are."
	καὶ νὴ τὸν κύνα, εἶπον, λελήθαμέν γε διακαθαίροντες πάλιν ἣν ἄρτι τρυφᾶν ἔφαμεν πόλιν.	"And by the dog," I said, "without noticing it we've been purging once again the city we called luxurious a little while ago."
	σωφρονοῦντές γε ἡμεῖς, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"That shows our moderation," he said.[18]
399e	ἴθι δή, ἔφην, καὶ τὰ λοιπὰ καθαίρωμεν.	"Come on, then," I said, "let's purge the rest too."
	ἑπόμενον γὰρ δὴ ταῖς ἁρμονίαις ἂν ἡμῖν εἴη τὸ περὶ ῥυθμούς, μὴ ποικίλους αὐτοὺς διώκειν μηδὲ παντοδαπὰς βάσεις, ἀλλὰ βίου ῥυθμοὺς ἰδεῖν κοσμίου τε καὶ ἀνδρείου τίνες εἰσίν· οὓς ἰδόντα τὸν 400a πόδα τῷ τοῦ τοιούτου λόγῳ ἀναγκάζειν ἕπεσθαι καὶ τὸ μέλος, ἀλλὰ μὴ λόγον ποδί τε καὶ μέλει. οἵτινες δ' ἂν εἶεν οὗτοι οἱ ῥυθμοί, σὸν ἔργον, ὥσπερ τὰς ἁρμονίας, φράσαι.	"Next after modes we'd have rhythms. We shouldn't go after intricate ones, or every kind of metrical foot, but should see which rhythms belong to an orderly and courageous life. Once we've seen them, we must make the 400a foot and the melody follow the words of such a life, not make the words follow the foot and the melody. As for which rhythms these are, it's your job to tell us, just as you did with the modes."
400a	ἀλλὰ μὰ Δί', ἔφη, οὐκ ἔχω λέγειν. ὅτι μὲν γὰρ τρί' ἄττα ἐστὶν εἴδη ἐξ ὧν αἱ βάσεις πλέκονται, ὥσπερ ἐν τοῖς φθόγγοις τέτταρα, ὅθεν αἱ πᾶσαι ἁρμονίαι, τεθεαμένος ἂν εἴποιμι· ποῖα δὲ ὁποίου βίου μιμήματα, λέγειν οὐκ ἔχω. 400b	"No, by Zeus," he said, "I can't tell you. That there are some three kinds from which the feet are woven, just as there are four among the notes from which all the modes arise—that I could tell you, since I've studied it. But which are imitations of which sort of life, I can't say." 400b
400b	ἀλλὰ ταῦτα μέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ μετὰ Δάμωνος βουλευσόμεθα, τίνες τε ἀνελευθερίας καὶ ὕβρεως ἢ μανίας καὶ ἄλλης κακίας πρέπουσαι βάσεις, καὶ τίνας τοῖς ἐναντίοις λειπτέον ῥυθμούς· οἶμαι δέ με ἀκηκοέναι οὐ σαφῶς ἐνόπλιόν τέ τινα ὀνομάζοντος αὐτοῦ σύνθετον καὶ δάκτυλον καὶ ἡρῷόν γε, οὐκ οἶδα ὅπως διακοσμοῦντος καὶ ἴσον ἄνω καὶ κάτω τιθέντος, εἰς βραχύ τε καὶ μακρὸν	"Well," I said, "we'll consult Damon about this too: which feet suit meanness and insolence, or madness and other badness, and which rhythms must be left for their opposites. I think I heard him—not clearly—naming a composite 'enoplion,' and a 'dactyl,' and a 'heroic,' arranging it in some way I don't understand, making it equal up and down as it

17 The pipe (*aulos*) was a reed instrument, usually played in pairs; its range and flexibility let a player move between many modes.
18 Marsyas, a satyr and piper, challenged Apollo, the lyre-player, to a musical contest and lost.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	γιγνόμενον, καί, ὡς ἐγὼ οἶμαι, ἴαμβον καί τιν' ἄλλον τροχαῖον ὠνόμαζε, μήκη δὲ καὶ 400c βραχύτητας προσῆπτε. καὶ τούτων τισὶν οἶμαι τὰς ἀγωγὰς τοῦ ποδὸς αὐτὸν οὐχ ἧττον ψέγειν τε καὶ ἐπαινεῖν ἢ τοὺς ῥυθμοὺς αὐτούς—ἤτοι συναμφότερόν τι· οὐ γὰρ ἔχω λέγειν —ἀλλὰ ταῦτα μέν, ὥσπερ εἶπον, εἰς Δάμωνα ἀναβεβλήσθω· διελέσθαι γὰρ οὐ σμικροῦ λόγου. ἢ σὺ οἴει;	passes into short and long; and, I think, he named an 'iamb,' and another a 'trochee,' and attached longs and 400c shorts to them. And in some of these, I think, he blamed or praised the tempo of the foot no less than the rhythms themselves—or some combination of the two; I can't say. But, as I said, let's refer these matters to Damon. Sorting them out would take no small discussion. Or do you think otherwise?"[19]
400c	μὰ Δί', οὐκ ἔγωγε.	"By Zeus, not I."
	ἀλλὰ τόδε γε, ὅτι τὸ τῆς εὐσχημοσύνης τε καὶ ἀσχημοσύνης τῷ εὐρύθμῳ τε καὶ ἀρρύθμῳ ἀκολουθεῖ, δύνασαι διελέσθαι;	"But this much you can determine: that grace and gracelessness follow good rhythm and bad rhythm?"
	πῶς δ' οὔ; 400d	"Of course." 400d
	ἀλλὰ μὴν τὸ εὔρυθμόν γε καὶ τὸ ἄρρυθμον τὸ μὲν τῇ καλῇ λέξει ἕπεται ὁμοιούμενον, τὸ δὲ τῇ ἐναντίᾳ, καὶ τὸ εὐάρμοστον καὶ ἀνάρμοστον ὡσαύτως, εἴπερ ῥυθμός γε καὶ ἁρμονία λόγῳ, ὥσπερ ἄρτι ἐλέγετο, ἀλλὰ μὴ λόγος τούτοις.	"And good rhythm follows fine style and becomes like it, and bad rhythm the opposite; and likewise with being in tune and out of tune—if, that is, rhythm and mode follow the words, as we were saying just now, and not the words them."
	ἀλλὰ μήν, ἦ δ' ὅς, ταῦτά γε λόγῳ ἀκολουθητέον.	"Yes, certainly," he said, "these must follow the words."
400d	τί δ' ὁ τρόπος τῆς λέξεως, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ ὁ λόγος; οὐ τῷ τῆς ψυχῆς ἤθει ἕπεται;	"What about the manner of the style," I said, "and the words? Don't they follow the character of the soul?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
	τῇ δὲ λέξει τὰ ἄλλα;	"And everything else follows the style?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	εὐλογία ἄρα καὶ εὐαρμοστία καὶ εὐσχημοσύνη καὶ εὐρυθμία 400e εὐηθείᾳ ἀκολουθεῖ, οὐχ ἣν ἄνοιαν οὖσαν ὑποκοριζόμενοι καλοῦμεν ὡς εὐήθειαν, ἀλλὰ τὴν ὡς ἀληθῶς εὖ τε καὶ καλῶς τὸ ἦθος κατεσκευασμένην διάνοιαν.	"So good speech, being in tune, grace and good rhythm 400e follow good-heartedness—not the kind that's really foolishness, which we politely call 'good-hearted,' but a mind that has truly been furnished with a good and fine character."
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
	ἆρ' οὖν οὐ πανταχοῦ ταῦτα διωκτέα τοῖς νέοις, εἰ μέλλουσι τὸ αὑτῶν πράττειν;	"Then mustn't the young pursue these qualities everywhere, if they're to do their own work?"
	διωκτέα μὲν οὖν.	"They must."[20]
401a	ἔστιν δέ γέ που πλήρης μὲν γραφικὴ αὐτῶν καὶ πᾶσα ἡ τοιαύτη δημιουργία, πλήρης δὲ ὑφαντικὴ καὶ ποικιλία καὶ οἰκοδομία καὶ πᾶσα αὖ ἡ τῶν ἄλλων σκευῶν ἐργασία, ἔτι δὲ ἡ τῶν σωμάτων φύσις καὶ ἡ τῶν ἄλλων φυτῶν· ἐν πᾶσι γὰρ τούτοις ἔνεστιν εὐσχημοσύνη ἢ ἀσχημοσύνη. καὶ ἡ μὲν ἀσχημοσύνη καὶ ἀρρυθμία καὶ ἀναρμοστία	"And surely painting is full of them, and every craft of that kind; so is weaving, and embroidery, and building, and all the manufacture of other furnishings; and so too is the nature of bodies and of other living things. In all of these there is grace or gracelessness. And gracelessness, bad rhythm and

19 Damon was an Athenian music theorist of the fifth century BC, associated with Pericles, who taught that music shapes character.
20 The Greek word here (*euētheia*) literally means "good character" but in everyday use meant "simple-mindedness"; Socrates plays on both senses.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	κακολογίας καὶ κακοηθείας ἀδελφά, τὰ δ' ἐναντία τοῦ ἐναντίου, σώφρονός τε καὶ ἀγαθοῦ ἤθους, ἀδελφά τε καὶ μιμήματα.	being out of tune are sisters of bad speech and bad character, while their opposites are sisters and imitations of the opposite—a moderate and good character."
	παντελῶς μὲν οὖν, ἔφη. [401b]	"Entirely so," he said. [401b]
401b	ἆρ' οὖν τοῖς ποιηταῖς ἡμῖν μόνον ἐπιστατητέον καὶ προσαναγκαστέον τὴν τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ εἰκόνα ἤθους ἐμποιεῖν τοῖς ποιήμασιν ἢ μὴ παρ' ἡμῖν ποιεῖν, ἢ καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις δημιουργοῖς ἐπιστατητέον καὶ διακωλυτέον τὸ κακόηθες τοῦτο καὶ ἀκόλαστον καὶ ἀνελεύθερον καὶ ἄσχημον μήτε ἐν εἰκόσι ζῴων μήτε ἐν οἰκοδομήμασι μήτε ἐν ἄλλῳ μηδενὶ δημιουργουμένῳ ἐμποιεῖν, ἢ ὁ μὴ οἷός τε ὢν οὐκ ἐατέος παρ' ἡμῖν δημιουργεῖν, ἵνα μὴ ἐν κακίας εἰκόσι τρεφόμενοι ἡμῖν οἱ [401c] φύλακες ὥσπερ ἐν κακῇ βοτάνῃ,	"Then is it only the poets we must supervise, compelling them to put the image of good character into their poems or else not compose among us? Or must we supervise the other craftsmen too, and prevent them from putting this bad character—licentious, mean and graceless—into images of living things, or into buildings, or into anything else they make, and not allow anyone who can't comply to practice his craft among us? That way our [401c] guardians won't be raised among images of badness, as if in bad pasture,
401c	πολλὰ ἑκάστης ἡμέρας κατὰ σμικρὸν ἀπὸ πολλῶν δρεπόμενοί τε καὶ νεμόμενοι, ἕν τι συνιστάντες λανθάνωσιν κακὸν μέγα ἐν τῇ αὑτῶν ψυχῇ, ἀλλ' ἐκείνους ζητητέον τοὺς δημιουργοὺς τοὺς εὐφυῶς δυναμένους ἰχνεύειν τὴν τοῦ καλοῦ τε καὶ εὐσχήμονος φύσιν, ἵνα ὥσπερ ἐν ὑγιεινῷ τόπῳ οἰκοῦντες οἱ νέοι ἀπὸ παντὸς ὠφελῶνται, ὁπόθεν ἂν αὐτοῖς ἀπὸ τῶν καλῶν ἔργων ἢ πρὸς ὄψιν ἢ πρὸς ἀκοήν τι προσβάλῃ, ὥσπερ αὔρα φέρουσα ἀπὸ [401d] χρηστῶν τόπων ὑγίειαν, καὶ εὐθὺς ἐκ παίδων λανθάνῃ εἰς ὁμοιότητά τε καὶ φιλίαν καὶ συμφωνίαν τῷ καλῷ λόγῳ ἄγουσα;	every day cropping and grazing a little from many plants, until without realizing it they build up one great evil in their own souls. Mustn't we seek out instead those craftsmen with a gift for tracking down the nature of what is fine and graceful, so that the young, as if living in a healthy place, will benefit from everything—from whatever part of fine works strikes their eyes or ears, like a breeze bringing health from [401d] wholesome places—and from childhood on, without their noticing, it will lead them into likeness, friendship and harmony with the beauty of reason?"
401d	πολὺ γὰρ ἄν, ἔφη, κάλλιστα οὕτω τραφεῖεν.	"Yes," he said, "that would be by far the finest way to raise them."
	ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Γλαύκων, τούτων ἕνεκα κυριωτάτη ἐν μουσικῇ τροφή, ὅτι μάλιστα καταδύεται εἰς τὸ ἐντὸς τῆς ψυχῆς ὅ τε ῥυθμὸς καὶ ἁρμονία, καὶ ἐρρωμενέστατα ἅπτεται αὐτῆς φέροντα τὴν εὐσχημοσύνην, καὶ ποιεῖ εὐσχήμονα, [401e] ἐάν τις ὀρθῶς τραφῇ, εἰ δὲ μή, τοὐναντίον;	"Then isn't that why, Glaucon," I said, "upbringing in music is most decisive? Because rhythm and mode sink deepest into the inner part of the soul and take the strongest hold on it, bringing grace with them and making a person graceful, [401e] if he's brought up rightly, and if not, the opposite?
401e	καὶ ὅτι αὖ τῶν παραλειπομένων καὶ μὴ καλῶς δημιουργηθέντων ἢ μὴ καλῶς φύντων ὀξύτατ' ἂν αἰσθάνοιτο ὁ ἐκεῖ τραφεὶς ὡς ἔδει, καὶ ὀρθῶς δὴ δυσχεραίνων τὰ μὲν καλὰ ἐπαινοῖ καὶ χαίρων καὶ καταδεχόμενος εἰς τὴν ψυχὴν τρέφοιτ' ἂν ἀπ' αὐτῶν καὶ [402a] γίγνοιτο καλός τε κἀγαθός, τὰ δ' αἰσχρὰ ψέγοι τ' ἂν ὀρθῶς καὶ μισοῖ ἔτι νέος ὤν, πρὶν λόγον δυνατὸς εἶναι λαβεῖν, ἐλθόντος δὲ τοῦ λόγου ἀσπάζοιτ' ἂν αὐτὸν γνωρίζων δι' οἰκειότητα μάλιστα ὁ οὕτω τραφείς;	"And also because someone brought up in it as he should be would be quickest to perceive what has been left out, or badly crafted, or has grown badly; and, feeling a proper distaste, he would praise fine things, and delight in them, and take them into his soul, and be nourished by them and [402a] become fine and good himself; while ugly things he would rightly blame and hate while he's still young, before he's able to grasp the reason. And when reason comes, the person brought up this way would
	ἐμοὶ γοῦν δοκεῖ, ἔφη, τῶν τοιούτων ἕνεκα ἐν μουσικῇ εἶναι ἡ τροφή.	

GREEK

ENGLISH

welcome it most of all, recognizing it through its kinship with him?"

"It seems to me, at least," he said, "that it's for reasons like these that upbringing is in music."

402a ὥσπερ ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, γραμμάτων πέρι τότε ἱκανῶς εἴχομεν, ὅτε τὰ στοιχεῖα μὴ λανθάνοι ἡμᾶς ὀλίγα ὄντα ἐν ἅπασιν οἷς ἔστιν περιφερόμενα, καὶ οὔτ' ἐν σμικρῷ οὔτ' ἐν 402b μεγάλῳ ἠτιμάζομεν αὐτά, ὡς οὐ δέοι αἰσθάνεσθαι, ἀλλὰ πανταχοῦ προυθυμούμεθα διαγιγνώσκειν, ὡς οὐ πρότερον ἐσόμενοι γραμματικοὶ πρὶν οὕτως ἔχοιμεν—

ἀληθῆ.

οὐκοῦν καὶ εἰκόνας γραμμάτων, εἴ που ἢ ἐν ὕδασιν ἢ ἐν κατόπτροις ἐμφαίνοιντο, οὐ πρότερον γνωσόμεθα, πρὶν ἂν αὐτὰ γνῶμεν, ἀλλ' ἔστιν τῆς αὐτῆς τέχνης τε καὶ μελέτης;

παντάπασι μὲν οὖν.

"Well," I said, "it's just as it was with learning to read. We were competent only when the letters didn't escape us—few as they are—in all the words where they turn up, and when we didn't dismiss them, in small words 402b or large, as not needing to be noticed, but were eager to recognize them everywhere, knowing we'd never be literate until we could do that—"

"True."

"And we won't recognize images of letters, either, if they appear in water or in mirrors, until we know the letters themselves—doesn't that belong to the same skill and practice?"

"Absolutely."

402b ἆρ' οὖν, ὃ λέγω, πρὸς θεῶν, οὕτως οὐδὲ μουσικοὶ πρότερον 402c ἐσόμεθα, οὔτε αὐτοὶ οὔτε οὓς φαμεν ἡμῖν παιδευτέον εἶναι τοὺς φύλακας, πρὶν ἂν τὰ τῆς σωφροσύνης εἴδη καὶ ἀνδρείας καὶ ἐλευθεριότητος καὶ μεγαλοπρεπείας καὶ ὅσα τούτων ἀδελφὰ καὶ τὰ τούτων αὖ ἐναντία πανταχοῦ περιφερόμενα γνωρίζωμεν καὶ ἐνόντα ἐν οἷς ἔνεστιν αἰσθανώμεθα καὶ αὐτὰ καὶ εἰκόνας αὐτῶν, καὶ μήτε ἐν σμικροῖς μήτε ἐν μεγάλοις ἀτιμάζωμεν, ἀλλὰ τῆς αὐτῆς οἰώμεθα τέχνης εἶναι καὶ μελέτης;

πολλὴ ἀνάγκη, ἔφη. 402d

"That's absolutely necessary," he said. 402d

402d οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτου ἂν συμπίπτῃ ἔν τε τῇ ψυχῇ καλὰ ἤθη ἐνόντα καὶ ἐν τῷ εἴδει ὁμολογοῦντα ἐκείνοις καὶ συμφωνοῦντα, τοῦ αὐτοῦ μετέχοντα τύπου, τοῦτ' ἂν εἴη κάλλιστον θέαμα τῷ δυναμένῳ θεᾶσθαι;

πολύ γε.

καὶ μὴν τό γε κάλλιστον ἐρασμιώτατον;

πῶς δ' οὔ;

τῶν δὴ ὅτι μάλιστα τοιούτων ἀνθρώπων ὅ γε μουσικὸς ἐρῴη ἄν· εἰ δὲ ἀσύμφωνος εἴη, οὐκ ἂν ἐρῴη.

οὐκ ἄν, εἴ γέ τι, ἔφη, κατὰ τὴν ψυχὴν ἐλλείποι· εἰ μέντοι τι κατὰ τὸ σῶμα, ὑπομείνειεν ἂν ὥστε ἐθέλειν 402e ἀσπάζεσθαι.

"Then," I said, "when someone has a fine character in his soul, and in his appearance features that agree and harmonize with it, sharing the same stamp, wouldn't that be the most beautiful sight for anyone able to see it?"

"By far."

"And what is most beautiful is most lovable?"

"Of course."

"Then the person educated in music would love people of this kind above all; but if someone were out of harmony, he wouldn't love him."

"Not if he were lacking something in his soul," he said. "But if it were something in his body, he'd put up with it and be willing 402e to embrace him."

402e

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	μανθάνω, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· ὅτι ἔστιν σοι ἢ γέγονεν παιδικὰ τοιαῦτα, καὶ συγχωρῶ. ἀλλὰ τόδε μοι εἰπέ· σωφροσύνῃ καὶ ἡδονῇ ὑπερβαλλούσῃ ἔστι τις κοινωνία;	"I understand," I said. "You have, or had, a beloved like that, and I'll grant the point. But tell me this: does moderation have anything in common with excessive pleasure?"
	καὶ πῶς; ἔφη, ἥ γε ἔκφρονα ποιεῖ οὐχ ἧττον ἢ λύπη;	"How could it," he said, "when such pleasure drives people out of their minds no less than pain does?"
	ἀλλὰ τῇ ἄλλῃ ἀρετῇ;	"With the rest of excellence, then?"
	οὐδαμῶς.	"Not at all."
	τί δέ; ὕβρει τε καὶ ἀκολασίᾳ;	"Well, with wantonness and licentiousness?"
	πάντων μάλιστα.	"More than anything."
	μείζω δέ τινα καὶ ὀξυτέραν ἔχεις εἰπεῖν ἡδονὴν τῆς περὶ τὰ ἀφροδίσια;	"Can you name any pleasure greater or keener than sexual pleasure?"
	οὐκ ἔχω, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐδέ γε μανικωτέραν.	"No," he said, "nor any more insane."
	ὁ δὲ ὀρθὸς ἔρως πέφυκε κοσμίου τε καὶ καλοῦ σωφρόνως τε καὶ μουσικῶς ἐρᾶν;	"And isn't right love, by its nature, a moderate and musical love of what is orderly and beautiful?"
403a	καὶ μάλα, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Very much so," he said.
	οὐδὲν ἄρα προσοιστέον μανικὸν οὐδὲ συγγενὲς ἀκολασίας τῷ ὀρθῷ ἔρωτι;	"Then nothing mad or akin to licentiousness should come near right love?"
	οὐ προσοιστέον. [403b]	"It shouldn't." [403b]
	οὐ προσοιστέον ἄρα αὕτη ἡ ἡδονή, οὐδὲ κοινωνητέον αὐτῆς ἐραστῇ τε καὶ παιδικοῖς ὀρθῶς ἐρῶσί τε καὶ ἐρωμένοις;	"Then this pleasure mustn't come near it, and lover and beloved who love and are loved rightly must have no part in it?"
	οὐ μέντοι μὰ Δί', ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, προσοιστέον.	"No, by Zeus, Socrates," he said, "it certainly mustn't come near it."
403b	οὕτω δή, ὡς ἔοικε, νομοθετήσεις ἐν τῇ οἰκιζομένῃ πόλει φιλεῖν μὲν καὶ συνεῖναι καὶ ἅπτεσθαι ὥσπερ υἱέος παιδικῶν ἐραστήν, τῶν καλῶν χάριν, ἐὰν πείθῃ, τὰ δ' ἄλλα οὕτως ὁμιλεῖν πρὸς ὅν τις σπουδάζοι, ὅπως μηδέποτε δόξει μακρότερα [403c] τούτων συγγίγνεσθαι· εἰ δὲ μή, ψόγον ἀμουσίας καὶ ἀπειροκαλίας ὑφέξοντα.	"So it seems you'll lay down a law in the city we're founding: a lover may kiss his beloved, spend time with him and touch him as he would a son, for the sake of what is fine, if the boy consents; but in all other respects he must associate with the one he cares for in such a way that he'll never seem to go further [403c] than this. Otherwise he'll be open to reproach for being unmusical and lacking in taste."
	οὕτως, ἔφη.	"Just so," he said.
	ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ σοὶ φαίνεται τέλος ἡμῖν ἔχειν ὁ περὶ μουσικῆς λόγος; οἷ γοῦν δεῖ τελευτᾶν, τετελεύτηκεν· δεῖ δέ που τελευτᾶν τὰ μουσικὰ εἰς τὰ τοῦ καλοῦ ἐρωτικά.	"Then does it seem to you as well," I said, "that our discussion of music has reached its end? It has ended, at any rate, where it ought to end, since music surely ought to end in the love of the beautiful."
	σύμφημι, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"I agree," he said.

PHYSICAL TRAINING AND MEDICINE

Socrates prescribes simple physical training and criticizes medicine that prolongs idle, sickly lives.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
403c	**SOCRATES** μετὰ δὴ μουσικὴν γυμναστικῇ θρεπτέοι οἱ νεανίαι.	**SOCRATES** "After music, the young men must be brought up on physical training."
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
	δεῖ μὲν δὴ καὶ ταύτῃ ἀκριβῶς τρέφεσθαι ἐκ παίδων διὰ [403d] βίου. ἔχει δέ πως, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, ὧδε· σκόπει δὲ καὶ σύ. ἐμοὶ μὲν γὰρ οὐ φαίνεται, ὃ ἂν χρηστὸν ᾖ σῶμα, τοῦτο τῇ αὑτοῦ ἀρετῇ ψυχὴν ἀγαθὴν ποιεῖν, ἀλλὰ τοὐναντίον ψυχὴ ἀγαθὴ τῇ αὑτῆς ἀρετῇ σῶμα παρέχειν ὡς οἷόν τε βέλτιστον· σοὶ δὲ πῶς φαίνεται;	"In this too they must be carefully trained, from childhood throughout [403d] their lives. And here's how it is, I think—but you consider it too. It doesn't seem to me that a sound body, by its own excellence, makes the soul good; it's the other way around: a good soul, by its own excellence, makes the body as good as it can be. How does it seem to you?"
	καὶ ἐμοί, ἔφη, οὕτως.	"The same to me," he said.
403d	οὐκοῦν εἰ τὴν διάνοιαν ἱκανῶς θεραπεύσαντες παραδοῖμεν αὐτῇ τὰ περὶ τὸ σῶμα ἀκριβολογεῖσθαι, ἡμεῖς δὲ ὅσον τοὺς [403e] τύπους ὑφηγησαίμεθα, ἵνα μὴ μακρολογῶμεν, ὀρθῶς ἂν ποιοῖμεν;	"Then if we took adequate care of the mind and handed over to it the detailed care of the body, while we ourselves only outlined the [403e] patterns, so as not to talk at length, would we be doing right?"
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
	μέθης μὲν δὴ εἴπομεν ὅτι ἀφεκτέον αὐτοῖς· παντὶ γάρ που μᾶλλον ἐγχωρεῖ ἢ φύλακι μεθυσθέντι μὴ εἰδέναι ὅπου γῆς ἐστιν.	"Now we said they must keep away from drunkenness. Anyone rather than a guardian can be allowed to get drunk and not know where on earth he is."
	γελοῖον γάρ, ἦ δ' ὅς, τόν γε φύλακα φύλακος δεῖσθαι.	"Yes," he said, "it would be ridiculous for a guardian to need a guardian."
	τί δὲ δὴ σίτων πέρι; ἀθληταὶ μὲν γὰρ οἱ ἄνδρες τοῦ μεγίστου ἀγῶνος. ἢ οὐχί;	"And what about food? These men are athletes in the greatest of contests, aren't they?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
404a	ἆρ' οὖν ἡ τῶνδε τῶν ἀσκητῶν ἕξις προσήκουσ' ἂν εἴη τούτοις;	"Then would the condition of today's athletes be suitable for them?"
	ἴσως.	"Perhaps."
	ἀλλ', ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὑπνώδης αὕτη γέ τις καὶ σφαλερὰ πρὸς ὑγίειαν. ἢ οὐχ ὁρᾷς ὅτι καθεύδουσί τε τὸν βίον καί, ἐὰν σμικρὰ ἐκβῶσιν τῆς τεταγμένης διαίτης, μεγάλα καὶ σφόδρα νοσοῦσιν οὗτοι οἱ ἀσκηταί;	"But," I said, "it's a sleepy sort of condition, and precarious for health. Don't you see that these athletes sleep their lives away, and if they depart even a little from their prescribed regimen, they fall seriously and violently ill?"
	ὁρῶ.	"I do see that."
	κομψοτέρας δή τινος, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀσκήσεως δεῖ τοῖς πολεμικοῖς ἀθληταῖς, οὕς γε ὥσπερ κύνας ἀγρύπνους τε ἀνάγκη εἶναι καὶ ὅτι μάλιστα ὀξὺ ὁρᾶν καὶ ἀκούειν καὶ πολλὰς μεταβολὰς ἐν ταῖς στρατείαις μεταβάλλοντας	"Then our warrior-athletes need a more refined kind of training," I said. "Like dogs, they must be wakeful and see and hear as sharply as possible; and on campaign, going through many changes of water [404b] and other food, of summer heat and

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ὑδάτων 404b τε καὶ τῶν ἄλλων σίτων καὶ εἰλήσεων καὶ χειμώνων μὴ ἀκροσφαλεῖς εἶναι πρὸς ὑγίειαν.	winter storms, they mustn't be precariously balanced in their health."
	φαίνεταί μοι.	"So it seems to me."
	ἆρ' οὖν ἡ βελτίστη γυμναστικὴ ἀδελφή τις ἂν εἴη τῆς ἁπλῆς μουσικῆς ἣν ὀλίγον πρότερον διῇμεν;	"Then would the best physical training be a sister of the simple music we described a little earlier?"
	πῶς λέγεις;	"What do you mean?"
	ἁπλῆ που καὶ ἐπιεικὴς γυμναστική, καὶ μάλιστα ἡ τῶν περὶ τὸν πόλεμον.	"A simple and decent physical training, especially the kind for war."
	πῇ δή;	"How so?"
404b	καὶ παρ' Ὁμήρου, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τά γε τοιαῦτα μάθοι ἄν τις. οἶσθα γὰρ ὅτι ἐπὶ στρατιᾶς ἐν ταῖς τῶν ἡρώων ἑστιάσεσιν οὔτε ἰχθύσιν αὐτοὺς ἑστιᾷ, καὶ ταῦτα ἐπὶ 404c θαλάττῃ ἐν Ἑλλησπόντῳ ὄντας, οὔτε ἑφθοῖς κρέασιν ἀλλὰ μόνον ὀπτοῖς, ἃ δὴ μάλιστ' ἂν εἴη στρατιώταις εὔπορα· πανταχοῦ γὰρ ὡς ἔπος εἰπεῖν αὐτῷ τῷ πυρὶ χρῆσθαι εὐπορώτερον ἢ ἀγγεῖα συμπεριφέρειν.	"One could learn such things even from Homer," I said. "You know that when his heroes feast on campaign he doesn't treat them to fish, even though they're 404c by the sea at the Hellespont, or to boiled meat, but only to roasted, which is what soldiers could most easily come by. Just about everywhere it's easier to use the fire itself than to carry pots around."
	καὶ μάλα.	"Very much so."
	οὐδὲ μὴν ἡδυσμάτων, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, Ὅμηρος πώποτε ἐμνήσθη. ἢ τοῦτο μὲν καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι ἀσκηταὶ ἴσασιν, ὅτι τῷ μέλλοντι σώματι εὖ ἕξειν ἀφεκτέον τῶν τοιούτων ἁπάντων;	"Nor, I think, did Homer ever mention sauces. Or is this something even other athletes know, that a body meant to be in good condition must keep away from all such things?"
404c	καὶ ὀρθῶς γε, ἔφη, ἴσασί τε καὶ ἀπέχονται. 404d	"Yes," he said, "and they're right to know it and keep away." 404d
	Συρακοσίαν δέ, ὦ φίλε, τράπεζαν καὶ Σικελικὴν ποικιλίαν ὄψου, ὡς ἔοικας, οὐκ αἰνεῖς, εἴπερ σοι ταῦτα δοκεῖ ὀρθῶς ἔχειν.	"Then it seems you don't approve, my friend, of a Syracusan table and the Sicilian variety of dishes, if you think this is right."
	οὔ μοι δοκῶ.	"I don't think I do."
	ψέγεις ἄρα καὶ Κορινθίαν κόρην φίλην εἶναι ἀνδράσιν μέλλουσιν εὖ σώματος ἕξειν.	"Then you also disapprove of men who mean to be in good physical condition having a Corinthian girl as a mistress."
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν.	"Absolutely."
	οὐκοῦν καὶ Ἀττικῶν πεμμάτων τὰς δοκούσας εἶναι εὐπαθείας;	"And of the supposed delights of Attic pastries?"
	ἀνάγκη.	"Necessarily."
	ὅλην γὰρ οἶμαι τὴν τοιαύτην σίτησιν καὶ δίαιταν τῇ μελοποιίᾳ τε καὶ ᾠδῇ τῇ ἐν τῷ παναρμονίῳ καὶ ἐν πᾶσι 404e ῥυθμοῖς πεποιημένῃ ἀπεικάζοντες ὀρθῶς ἂν ἀπεικάζοιμεν.	"Yes, for I think we'd be right to compare such food and such a way of life as a whole to melody and song composed in every mode and in every 404e rhythm."[21]
404e	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
	οὐκοῦν ἐκεῖ μὲν ἀκολασίαν ἡ ποικιλία ἐνέτικτεν, ἐνταῦθα δὲ νόσον, ἡ δὲ ἁπλότης κατὰ μὲν μουσικὴν ἐν	"There, variety bred licentiousness, and here it breeds disease; whereas simplicity in music pro-

21 Syracuse and Sicily were bywords for luxurious cooking, and Corinth was famous for its courtesans.

GREEK

ψυχαῖς σωφροσύνην, κατὰ δὲ γυμναστικὴν ἐν σώμασιν ὑγίειαν;

ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη.

ἀκολασίας δὲ καὶ νόσων πληθυουσῶν ἐν πόλει ἆρ' οὐ δικαστήριά τε καὶ ἰατρεῖα πολλὰ ἀνοίγεται, καὶ δικανική τε καὶ ἰατρικὴ σεμνύνονται, ὅταν δὴ καὶ ἐλεύθεροι πολλοὶ καὶ σφόδρα περὶ αὐτὰ σπουδάζωσιν;

τί γὰρ οὐ μέλλει;

405a τῆς δὲ κακῆς τε καὶ αἰσχρᾶς παιδείας ἐν πόλει ἆρα μή τι μεῖζον ἕξεις λαβεῖν τεκμήριον ἢ τὸ δεῖσθαι ἰατρῶν καὶ δικαστῶν ἄκρων μὴ μόνον τοὺς φαύλους τε καὶ χειροτέχνας, ἀλλὰ καὶ τοὺς ἐν ἐλευθέρῳ σχήματι προσποιουμένους τεθράφθαι; 405b ἢ οὐκ αἰσχρὸν δοκεῖ καὶ ἀπαιδευσίας μέγα τεκμήριον τὸ ἐπακτῷ παρ' ἄλλων, ὡς δεσποτῶν τε καὶ κριτῶν, τῷ δικαίῳ ἀναγκάζεσθαι χρῆσθαι, καὶ ἀπορίᾳ οἰκείων;

πάντων μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, αἴσχιστον.

405b ἦ δοκεῖ σοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τούτου αἴσχιον εἶναι τοῦτο, ὅταν δή τις μὴ μόνον τὸ πολὺ τοῦ βίου ἐν δικαστηρίοις φεύγων τε καὶ διώκων κατατρίβηται, ἀλλὰ καὶ ὑπὸ ἀπειροκαλίας ἐπ' αὐτῷ δὴ τούτῳ πεισθῇ καλλωπίζεσθαι, ὡς δεινὸς 405c ὢν περὶ τὸ ἀδικεῖν καὶ ἱκανὸς πάσας μὲν στροφὰς στρέφεσθαι, πάσας δὲ διεξόδους διεξελθὼν ἀποστραφῆναι λυγιζόμενος, ὥστε μὴ παρασχεῖν δίκην, καὶ ταῦτα σμικρῶν τε καὶ οὐδενὸς ἀξίων ἕνεκα, ἀγνοῶν ὅσῳ κάλλιον καὶ ἄμεινον τὸ παρασκευάζειν τὸν βίον αὐτῷ μηδὲν δεῖσθαι νυστάζοντος δικαστοῦ;

οὔκ, ἀλλὰ τοῦτ', ἔφη, ἐκείνου ἔτι αἴσχιον.

405c τὸ δὲ ἰατρικῆς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δεῖσθαι ὅτι μὴ τραυμάτων ἕνεκα ἢ τινων ἐπετείων νοσημάτων ἐπιπεσόντων, ἀλλὰ δι' 405d ἀργίαν τε καὶ δίαιταν οἵαν διήλθομεν, ῥευμάτων τε καὶ πνευμάτων ὥσπερ λίμνας ἐμπιμπλαμένους φύσας τε καὶ κατάρρους νοσήμασιν ὀνόματα τίθεσθαι ἀναγκάζειν τοὺς κομψοὺς Ἀσκληπιάδας, οὐκ αἰσχρὸν δοκεῖ;

καὶ μάλ', ἔφη· ὡς ἀληθῶς καινὰ ταῦτα καὶ ἄτοπα νοσημάτων ὀνόματα.

405d οἷα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὡς οἶμαι, οὐκ ἦν ἐπ' Ἀσκληπιοῦ. 405e τεκμαίρομαι δέ, ὅτι αὐτοῦ οἱ ὑεῖς ἐν Τροίᾳ Εὐρυπύλῳ

ENGLISH

duces moderation in souls, and in physical training, health in bodies?"

"Very true," he said.

"And when licentiousness and diseases multiply in a city, don't many law courts and doctors' offices open up, and don't the arts of the courtroom and of medicine give themselves airs, once even many free men take them very seriously?"

"How could they not?"

"And could you find any greater proof of bad and shameful education in a city than the need for first-rate doctors and judges, not only among the lowly and the manual workers, but also among those who pretend to have been brought up as free men? 405b Don't you think it shameful, and a great proof of lack of education, to be forced to rely on a justice imported from others, as if they were your masters and judges, for lack of any of your own?"

"That's the most shameful thing of all," he said.

"Or do you think this is even more shameful," I said, "when someone not only wears away the greater part of his life in the courts, as defendant and prosecutor, but through lack of taste is even persuaded to pride himself on this very thing—on being clever 405c at doing wrong and able to twist through every turn, slip out through every loophole and wriggle his way free, so as not to pay the penalty—and all for small and worthless things, not knowing how much finer and better it is to arrange his life so that he has no need of a drowsy juror?"

"No, the other isn't the most shameful," he said. "This is more shameful still."

"And needing medicine," I said, "not for wounds, or because some seasonal illness has come along, but because of 405d idleness and the sort of regimen we described, filling up with fluids and gases like a marsh, and forcing the clever sons of Asclepius to give diseases names like 'flatulence' and 'catarrh'—don't you think that's shameful?"

"Very," he said. "Those really are strange, newfangled names for diseases."[22]

"The kind that didn't exist in Asclepius' day, I think," I said. 405e "My evidence is that at Troy his

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τετρωμένῳ ἐπ᾽ οἶνον Πράμνειον ἄλφιτα πολλὰ ἐπιπασθέντα [406a] καὶ τυρὸν ἐπιξυσθέντα, ἃ δὴ δοκεῖ φλεγματώδη εἶναι, οὐκ ἐμέμψαντο τῇ δούσῃ πιεῖν, οὐδὲ Πατρόκλῳ τῷ ἰωμένῳ ἐπετίμησαν.	sons didn't find fault with the woman who gave the wounded Eurypylus Pramnian wine to drink, with plenty of barley meal sprinkled on it [406a] and cheese grated over it—things thought to produce phlegm—nor did they criticize Patroclus, who was treating him."
	καὶ μὲν δή, ἔφη, ἄτοπόν γε τὸ πῶμα οὕτως ἔχοντι.	"It certainly is a strange drink for someone in that state," he said.[23]
406a	οὔκ, εἴ γ᾽ ἐννοεῖς, εἶπον, ὅτι τῇ παιδαγωγικῇ τῶν νοσημάτων ταύτῃ τῇ νῦν ἰατρικῇ πρὸ τοῦ Ἀσκληπιάδαι οὐκ ἐχρῶντο, ὥς φασι, πρὶν Ἡρόδικον γενέσθαι· Ἡρόδικος δὲ παιδοτρίβης ὢν καὶ νοσώδης γενόμενος, μείξας γυμναστικὴν [406b] ἰατρικῇ, ἀπέκναισε πρῶτον μὲν καὶ μάλιστα ἑαυτόν, ἔπειτ᾽ ἄλλους ὕστερον πολλούς.	"Not if you bear in mind," I said, "that before Herodicus came along, the sons of Asclepius, so they say, made no use of today's medicine, which tends diseases like a child's attendant. Herodicus was a physical trainer who became sickly, and by mixing physical training [406b] with medicine he wore out first and foremost himself, and later many others as well."
	πῇ δή; ἔφη.	"How so?" he said.[24]
406b	μακρόν, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, τὸν θάνατον αὐτῷ ποιήσας. παρακολουθῶν γὰρ τῷ νοσήματι θανασίμῳ ὄντι οὔτε ἰάσασθαι οἶμαι οἷός τ᾽ ἦν ἑαυτόν, ἐν ἀσχολίᾳ τε πάντων ἰατρευόμενος διὰ βίου ἔζη, ἀποκναιόμενος εἴ τι τῆς εἰωθυίας διαίτης ἐκβαίη, δυσθανατῶν δὲ ὑπὸ σοφίας εἰς γῆρας ἀφίκετο.	"By making his death a long one," I said. "He dogged his disease, which was fatal, but I don't think he was able to cure himself. So he spent his whole life doctoring himself, with no time for anything else, in torment whenever he departed at all from his usual regimen; and, finding it hard to die thanks to his wisdom, he reached old age."
	καλὸν ἄρα τὸ γέρας, ἔφη, τῆς τέχνης ἠνέγκατο. [406c]	"A fine prize his skill won him, then," he said. [406c]
406c	οἷον εἰκός, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, τὸν μὴ εἰδότα ὅτι Ἀσκληπιὸς οὐκ ἀγνοίᾳ οὐδὲ ἀπειρίᾳ τούτου τοῦ εἴδους τῆς ἰατρικῆς τοῖς ἐκγόνοις οὐ κατέδειξεν αὐτό, ἀλλ᾽ εἰδὼς ὅτι πᾶσι τοῖς εὐνομουμένοις ἔργον τι ἑκάστῳ ἐν τῇ πόλει προστέτακται, ὃ ἀναγκαῖον ἐργάζεσθαι, καὶ οὐδενὶ σχολὴ διὰ βίου κάμνειν ἰατρευομένῳ. ὃ ἡμεῖς γελοίως ἐπὶ μὲν τῶν δημιουργῶν αἰσθανόμεθα, ἐπὶ δὲ τῶν πλουσίων τε καὶ εὐδαιμόνων δοκούντων εἶναι οὐκ αἰσθανόμεθα.	"A fitting one," I said, "for someone who didn't know that it wasn't out of ignorance or inexperience of this kind of medicine that Asclepius didn't reveal it to his descendants. It was because he knew that among all well-governed peoples each person has been assigned a particular task in the city, which he has to do, and nobody has the leisure to spend his life being ill and doctoring himself. Ridiculously, we recognize this in the case of craftsmen, but don't recognize it in the case of the rich and supposedly happy."
	πῶς; ἔφη. [406d]	"How so?" he said. [406d]
406d	τέκτων μέν, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, κάμνων ἀξιοῖ παρὰ τοῦ ἰατροῦ φάρμακον πιὼν ἐξεμέσαι τὸ νόσημα, ἢ κάτω καθαρθεὶς ἢ καύσει ἢ τομῇ χρησάμενος ἀπηλλάχθαι· ἐὰν δέ τις αὐτῷ μακρὰν δίαιταν προστάττῃ, πιλίδιά τε περὶ τὴν κεφαλὴν	"A carpenter," I said, "when he's ill, expects the doctor to give him a drug to drink so he can vomit up the illness, or else to be purged from below, or to be rid of it by cautery or surgery. But if

22 Asclepius was the god of healing; doctors were called "Asclepiads," sons of Asclepius, as members of a guild claiming descent from him.
23 In the *Iliad* (Book 11) this drink is actually given to Machaon, one of Asclepius' sons, while Patroclus tends Eurypylus elsewhere; Plato merges the two scenes.
24 Herodicus of Selymbria, a fifth-century BC trainer and physician, treated illness with exercise and strict regimen.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	περιτιθεὶς καὶ τὰ τούτοις ἑπόμενα, ταχὺ εἶπεν ὅτι οὐ σχολὴ κάμνειν οὐδὲ λυσιτελεῖ οὕτω ζῆν, νοσήματι τὸν νοῦν προσέχοντα, τῆς δὲ προκειμένης ἐργασίας ἀμελοῦντα. καὶ μετὰ ταῦτα χαίρειν [406e] εἰπὼν τῷ τοιούτῳ ἰατρῷ, εἰς τὴν εἰωθυῖαν δίαιταν ἐμβάς, ὑγιὴς γενόμενος ζῇ τὰ ἑαυτοῦ πράττων· ἐὰν δὲ μὴ ἱκανὸν ᾖ τὸ σῶμα ὑπενεγκεῖν, τελευτήσας πραγμάτων ἀπηλλάγη.	someone prescribes a long regimen for him, putting little felt caps on his head and all that goes with them, he quickly says he has no time to be ill, and that it doesn't pay to live like that, paying attention to an illness and neglecting the work in front of him. And after that he says goodbye [406e] to that sort of doctor, goes back to his usual regimen, gets healthy and lives doing his own work. Or if his body can't bear up, he dies and is rid of his troubles."
406e	καὶ τῷ τοιούτῳ μέν γ', ἔφη, δοκεῖ πρέπειν οὕτω ἰατρικῇ χρῆσθαι. ἆρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι ἦν τι αὐτῷ ἔργον, ὃ εἰ μὴ πράττοι, οὐκ ἐλυσιτέλει ζῆν; δῆλον, ἔφη. ὁ δὲ δὴ πλούσιος, ὥς φαμεν, οὐδὲν ἔχει τοιοῦτον ἔργον προκείμενον, οὗ ἀναγκαζομένῳ ἀπέχεσθαι ἀβίωτον. οὔκουν δὴ λέγεταί γε. Φωκυλίδου γάρ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐκ ἀκούεις πῶς φησι δεῖν, ὅταν τῳ ἤδη βίος ᾖ, ἀρετὴν ἀσκεῖν. οἶμαι δέ γε, ἔφη, καὶ πρότερον.	"Yes," he said, "and for a person like that it seems fitting to use medicine in this way." "Is that because," I said, "he had some work to do, and if he didn't do it, life wasn't worth living?" "Obviously," he said. "But the rich man, we say, has no such work set before him that would make life unlivable if he were forced to keep away from it." "So it's said, at any rate." "That's because you haven't been listening to Phocylides," I said, "who says that once a person has a livelihood, he ought to practice excellence." "I think he ought to before that too," he said.[25]
407a	μηδέν, εἶπον, περὶ τούτου αὐτῷ μαχώμεθα, ἀλλ' ἡμᾶς αὐτοὺς διδάξωμεν πότερον μελετητέον τοῦτο τῷ πλουσίῳ [407b] καὶ ἀβίωτον τῷ μὴ μελετῶντι, ἢ νοσοτροφία τεκτονικῇ μὲν καὶ ταῖς ἄλλαις τέχναις ἐμπόδιον τῇ προσέξει τοῦ νοῦ, τὸ δὲ Φωκυλίδου παρακέλευμα οὐδὲν ἐμποδίζει. ναὶ μὰ τὸν Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς. σχεδόν γέ τι πάντων μάλιστα ἥ γε περαιτέρω γυμναστικῆς ἡ περιττὴ αὕτη ἐπιμέλεια τοῦ σώματος· καὶ γὰρ πρὸς οἰκονομίας καὶ πρὸς στρατείας καὶ πρὸς ἑδραίους ἐν πόλει ἀρχὰς δύσκολος.	"Let's not fight with him about that," I said, "but let's teach ourselves whether the rich man must practice this, and whether life is unlivable for one who doesn't, [407b] or whether nursing illness is a hindrance to attending to carpentry and the other crafts, but no hindrance at all to following Phocylides' advice." "Yes, by Zeus," he said. "Just about the greatest hindrance of all is this excessive care of the body that goes beyond physical training. It's a nuisance for running a household, for going on campaign, and for holding a settled office in the city."
407b	τὸ δὲ δὴ μέγιστον, ὅτι καὶ πρὸς μαθήσεις ἀστινασοῦν καὶ [407c] ἐννοήσεις τε καὶ μελέτας πρὸς ἑαυτὸν χαλεπή, κεφαλῆς τινας ἀεὶ διατάσεις καὶ ἰλίγγους ὑποπτεύουσα καὶ αἰτιωμένη ἐκ φιλοσοφίας ἐγγίγνεσθαι, ὥστε, ὅπῃ ταύτῃ ἀρετὴ ἀσκεῖται καὶ δοκιμάζεται, πάντῃ ἐμπόδιος· κάμνειν γὰρ οἴεσθαι ποιεῖ ἀεὶ καὶ ὠδίνοντα μήποτε λήγειν περὶ τοῦ σώματος. εἰκός γε, ἔφη.	"And most important of all, it makes any kind of learning, [407c] reflection or private study difficult. It's always suspecting headaches and dizziness and blaming philosophy for them, so that wherever excellence is practiced and tested in this way, it's a hindrance in every respect. It makes a person always think he's ill, and never stop agonizing over his body." "Likely enough," he said.

25 Phocylides of Miletus was a sixth-century BC poet known for short moral maxims.

GREEK	ENGLISH
407c οὐκοῦν ταῦτα γιγνώσκοντα φῶμεν καὶ Ἀσκληπιὸν τοὺς μὲν φύσει τε καὶ διαίτῃ ὑγιεινῶς ἔχοντας τὰ σώματα, 407d νόσημα δέ τι ἀποκεκριμένον ἴσχοντας ἐν αὐτοῖς, τούτοις μὲν καὶ ταύτῃ τῇ ἕξει καταδεῖξαι ἰατρικήν, φαρμάκοις τε καὶ τομαῖς τὰ νοσήματα ἐκβάλλοντα αὐτῶν τὴν εἰωθυῖαν προστάττειν δίαιταν, ἵνα μὴ τὰ πολιτικὰ βλάπτοι, τὰ δ' εἴσω διὰ παντὸς νενοσηκότα σώματα οὐκ ἐπιχειρεῖν διαίταις κατὰ σμικρὸν ἀπαντλοῦντα καὶ ἐπιχέοντα μακρὸν καὶ κακὸν βίον ἀνθρώπῳ ποιεῖν, καὶ ἔκγονα αὐτῶν, ὡς τὸ εἰκός, ἕτερα τοιαῦτα φυτεύειν, ἀλλὰ τὸν μὴ δυνάμενον ἐν τῇ καθεστηκυίᾳ 407e περιόδῳ ζῆν μὴ οἴεσθαι δεῖν θεραπεύειν, ὡς οὔτε αὐτῷ οὔτε πόλει λυσιτελῆ;	"Then shall we say that Asclepius knew this too? For people whose bodies were healthy by nature and regimen, 407d but who had some specific disease in them—for them and for this condition he revealed the art of medicine, driving out their diseases with drugs and surgery and prescribing their usual regimen, so as not to harm their life as citizens. But with bodies diseased through and through inside, he didn't try, by regimens that drain off and pour in a little at a time, to make a long and miserable life for the person, and to let him father offspring likely to be the same. Instead, he thought that someone unable to live in the established 407e course of life shouldn't be treated, since he's of no use either to himself or to the city?"
407e πολιτικόν, ἔφη, λέγεις Ἀσκληπιόν.	"You're making Asclepius a statesman," he said.
δῆλον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· καὶ οἱ παῖδες αὐτοῦ, ὅτι τοιοῦτος ἦν, 408a οὐχ ὁρᾷς ὡς καὶ ἐν Τροίᾳ ἀγαθοὶ πρὸς τὸν πόλεμον ἐφάνησαν, καὶ τῇ ἰατρικῇ, ὡς ἐγὼ λέγω, ἐχρῶντο; ἢ οὐ μέμνησαι ὅτι καὶ τῷ Μενέλεῳ ἐκ τοῦ τραύματος οὖ ὁ Πάνδαρος ἔβαλεν— αἷμ' ἐκμυζήσαντες ἐπ' ἤπια φάρμακ' ἔπασσον, ὅτι δ' ἐχρῆν μετὰ τοῦτο ἢ πιεῖν ἢ φαγεῖν οὐδὲν μᾶλλον ἢ τῷ Εὐρυπύλῳ προσέταττον, ὡς ἱκανῶν ὄντων τῶν φαρμάκων ἰάσασθαι ἄνδρας πρὸ τῶν τραυμάτων ὑγιεινούς τε καὶ 408b κοσμίους ἐν διαίτῃ, κἂν εἰ τύχοιεν ἐν τῷ παραχρῆμα κυκεῶνα πιόντες, νοσώδη δὲ φύσει τε καὶ ἀκόλαστον οὔτε αὐτοῖς οὔτε τοῖς ἄλλοις ᾤοντο λυσιτελεῖν ζῆν, οὐδ' ἐπὶ τούτοις τὴν τέχνην δεῖν εἶναι, οὐδὲ θεραπευτέον αὐτούς, οὐδ' εἰ Μίδου πλουσιώτεροι εἶεν.	"Clearly," I said. "And his sons, because he was that kind of man— 408a don't you see how they too proved good at war at Troy, and practiced medicine the way I describe? Don't you remember how, with the wound Pandarus gave Menelaus, 'they sucked out the blood and sprinkled soothing drugs on it'? But what he should drink or eat afterward they no more prescribed for him than for Eurypylus, since they thought drugs were enough to heal men who before their wounds had been healthy and 408b orderly in their way of life, even if they happened to drink a heavy mixed drink on the spot. But a man sickly by nature and undisciplined, they thought, profited neither himself nor anyone else by living. Their art wasn't meant for such people, and they shouldn't be treated, not even if they were richer than Midas."[26]
408b πάνυ κομψούς, ἔφη, λέγεις Ἀσκληπιοῦ παῖδας.	"They were very sophisticated, these sons of Asclepius you describe," he said.
πρέπει, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καίτοι ἀπειθοῦντές γε ἡμῖν οἱ τραγῳδοποιοί τε καὶ Πίνδαρος Ἀπόλλωνος μέν φασιν Ἀσκληπιὸν εἶναι, ὑπὸ δὲ χρυσοῦ πεισθῆναι πλούσιον ἄνδρα θανάσιμον 408c ἤδη ὄντα ἰάσασθαι, ὅθεν δὴ καὶ κεραυνωθῆναι αὐτόν. ἡμεῖς δὲ κατὰ τὰ προειρημένα οὐ πεισόμεθα αὐτοῖς ἀμφότερα, ἀλλ' εἰ μὲν θεοῦ ἦν, οὐκ ἦν, φήσομεν, αἰσχροκερδής· εἰ δ' αἰσχροκερδής, οὐκ ἦν θεοῦ.	"As was fitting," I said. "And yet the tragic poets and Pindar, refusing to obey us, say that Asclepius was the son of Apollo, and that he was bribed with gold to heal a rich man who was already 408c dying, and that this is why he was struck by lightning. But we, in keeping with what we said before, won't believe them on both counts. If he was the son of a god, we'll say, he wasn't greedy for gain; and if he was greedy for gain, he wasn't the son of a god."

26 Eurypylus is the wounded hero of 405e–406a, given the heavy drink of wine, barley and cheese.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
408c	ὀρθότατα, ἦ δ' ὅς, ταῦτά γε. ἀλλὰ περὶ τοῦδε τί λέγεις, ὦ Σώκρατες; ἆρ' οὐκ ἀγαθοὺς δεῖ ἐν τῇ πόλει κεκτῆσθαι ἰατρούς; εἶεν δ' ἄν που μάλιστα τοιοῦτοι ὅσοι 408d πλείστους μὲν ὑγιεινούς, πλείστους δὲ νοσώδεις μετεχειρίσαντο, καὶ δικασταὶ αὖ ὡσαύτως οἱ παντοδαπαῖς φύσεσιν ὡμιληκότες.	"That much is quite right," he said. "But what do you say about this, Socrates? Don't we need to have good doctors in our city? And the best would presumably be those who 408d have handled the most healthy people and the most sick ones; and likewise with judges, those who have dealt with every sort of nature."
	καὶ μάλα, εἶπον, ἀγαθοὺς λέγω. ἀλλ' οἶσθα οὓς ἡγοῦμαι τοιούτους;	"Good ones, certainly," I said. "But do you know whom I consider such?"
	ἂν εἴπῃς, ἔφη.	"If you tell me," he said.
	ἀλλὰ πειράσομαι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· σὺ μέντοι οὐχ ὅμοιον πρᾶγμα τῷ αὐτῷ λόγῳ ἤρου.	"I'll try," I said. "But you asked about two dissimilar things in the same question."
	πῶς; ἔφη.	"How so?" he said.
408d	ἰατροὶ μέν, εἶπον, δεινότατοι ἂν γένοιντο, εἰ ἐκ παίδων ἀρξάμενοι πρὸς τῷ μανθάνειν τὴν τέχνην ὡς πλείστοις τε καὶ πονηροτάτοις σώμασιν ὁμιλήσειαν καὶ αὐτοὶ πάσας 408e νόσους κάμοιεν καὶ εἶεν μὴ πάνυ ὑγιεινοὶ φύσει. οὐ γὰρ οἶμαι σώματι σῶμα θεραπεύουσιν—οὐ γὰρ ἂν αὐτὰ ἐνεχώρει κακὰ εἶναί ποτε καὶ γενέσθαι—ἀλλὰ ψυχῇ σῶμα, ᾗ οὐκ ἐγχωρεῖ κακὴν γενομένην τε καὶ οὖσαν εὖ τι θεραπεύειν.	"Doctors," I said, "would become most skilled if, starting from childhood, besides learning their art, they had dealings with as many bodies as possible, and the most unhealthy ones, and if they themselves suffered every 408e disease and weren't very healthy by nature. For it's not with the body, I think, that they treat the body—if it were, their own bodies could never be allowed to be or become bad—but with the soul; and a soul that has become bad, and is bad, can't treat anything well."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.	"Right," he said.
409a	δικαστὴς δέ γε, ὦ φίλε, ψυχῇ ψυχῆς ἄρχει, ᾗ οὐκ ἐγχωρεῖ ἐκ νέας ἐν πονηραῖς ψυχαῖς τεθράφθαι τε καὶ ὡμιληκέναι καὶ πάντα ἀδικήματα αὐτὴν ἠδικηκυῖαν διεξεληλυθέναι, ὥστε ὀξέως ἀφ' αὑτῆς τεκμαίρεσθαι τὰ τῶν ἄλλων ἀδικήματα οἷον κατὰ σῶμα νόσους· ἀλλ' ἄπειρον αὐτὴν καὶ ἀκέραιον δεῖ κακῶν ἠθῶν νέαν οὖσαν γεγονέναι, εἰ μέλλει καλὴ κἀγαθὴ οὖσα κρινεῖν ὑγιῶς τὰ δίκαια. διὸ δὴ καὶ εὐήθεις νέοι ὄντες οἱ ἐπιεικεῖς φαίνονται καὶ εὐεξαπάτητοι 409b ὑπὸ τῶν ἀδίκων, ἅτε οὐκ ἔχοντες ἐν ἑαυτοῖς παραδείγματα ὁμοιοπαθῆ τοῖς πονηροῖς.	"But a judge, my friend, rules soul with soul. And it won't do for his soul to have been brought up from youth among wicked souls, to have kept company with them, and to have gone through every kind of wrongdoing itself, so that it can sharply infer other people's wrongdoings from its own, as one infers diseases in the body. No: if it's to be fine and good and judge soundly what is just, it must have been inexperienced in bad characters and untouched by them while young. That's why decent people seem simple when they're young, and are easily deceived 409b by the unjust: they have no models within themselves of what the wicked feel."
409b	καὶ μὲν δή, ἔφη, σφόδρα γε αὐτὸ πάσχουσι.	"Yes," he said, "that's certainly what happens to them."
	τῷ τοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐ νέον ἀλλὰ γέροντα δεῖ τὸν ἀγαθὸν δικαστὴν εἶναι, ὀψιμαθῆ γεγονότα τῆς ἀδικίας οἷόν ἐστιν, οὐκ οἰκείαν ἐν τῇ αὑτοῦ ψυχῇ ἐνοῦσαν ᾐσθημένον, ἀλλ' ἀλλοτρίαν ἐν ἀλλοτρίαις μεμελετηκότα ἐν πολλῷ χρόνῳ διαισθάνεσθαι οἷον πέφυκε κακόν, ἐπιστήμῃ, οὐκ 409c ἐμπειρίᾳ οἰκείᾳ κεχρημένον.	"That's why," I said, "a good judge must be not young but old. He must have learned late what injustice is like, not perceiving it as something of his own, present in his own soul, but having studied it for a long time as something alien in the souls of others, so as to discern what sort of evil it natur-

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	γενναιότατος γοῦν, ἔφη, ἔοικεν εἶναι ὁ τοιοῦτος δικαστής.	ally is—using knowledge, not [409c] his own experience." "Such a judge, at any rate, seems the most noble," he said.
409c	καὶ ἀγαθός γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὃ σὺ ἠρώτας· ὁ γὰρ ἔχων ψυχὴν ἀγαθὴν ἀγαθός. ὁ δὲ δεινὸς ἐκεῖνος καὶ καχύποπτος, ὁ πολλὰ αὐτὸς ἠδικηκὼς καὶ πανοῦργός τε καὶ σοφὸς οἰόμενος εἶναι, ὅταν μὲν ὁμοίοις ὁμιλῇ, δεινὸς φαίνεται ἐξευλαβούμενος, πρὸς τὰ ἐν αὑτῷ παραδείγματα ἀποσκοπῶν· ὅταν δὲ ἀγαθοῖς καὶ πρεσβυτέροις ἥδη πλησιάσῃ, ἀβέλτερος [409d] αὖ φαίνεται, ἀπιστῶν παρὰ καιρὸν καὶ ἀγνοῶν ὑγιὲς ἦθος, ἅτε οὐκ ἔχων παράδειγμα τοῦ τοιούτου. πλεονάκις δὲ πονηροῖς ἢ χρηστοῖς ἐντυγχάνων σοφώτερος ἢ ἀμαθέστερος δοκεῖ εἶναι αὐτῷ τε καὶ ἄλλοις. παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, ἀληθῆ.	"And good as well," I said, "which is what you were asking, since the man with a good soul is good. But that clever, suspicious man, who has done much wrong himself and thinks himself cunning and wise, seems clever when he associates with his own kind, because he's on his guard, looking to the models within himself. But when he comes among good people and his elders, he looks foolish [409d] in his turn, distrusting them at the wrong moment and failing to recognize a sound character, since he has no model of one. Yet because he meets the wicked more often than the decent, he seems wise rather than ignorant, both to himself and to others." "That's entirely true," he said.
409d	οὐ τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοιοῦτον χρὴ τὸν δικαστὴν ζητεῖν τὸν ἀγαθόν τε καὶ σοφόν, ἀλλὰ τὸν πρότερον· πονηρία μὲν γὰρ ἀρετήν τε καὶ αὐτὴν οὔποτ' ἂν γνοίη, ἀρετὴ δὲ φύσεως παιδευομένης χρόνῳ ἅμα αὐτῆς τε καὶ πονηρίας ἐπιστήμην [409e] λήψεται. σοφὸς οὖν οὗτος, ὥς μοι δοκεῖ, ἀλλ' οὐχ ὁ κακὸς γίγνεται. καὶ ἐμοί, ἔφη, συνδοκεῖ.	"Then it's not this sort of man," I said, "that we should look for as the good and wise judge, but the earlier one. For wickedness could never know both excellence and itself, whereas excellence, in a nature educated over time, will come to have knowledge [409e] of both itself and wickedness. So it's this man, in my view, who becomes wise, and not the bad one." "I agree," he said.
409e	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἰατρικήν, οἵαν εἴπομεν, μετὰ τῆς τοιαύτης δικαστικῆς κατὰ πόλιν νομοθετήσεις, αἳ τῶν πολιτῶν σοι [410a] τοὺς μὲν εὐφυεῖς τὰ σώματα καὶ τὰς ψυχὰς θεραπεύσουσι, τοὺς δὲ μή, ὅσοι μὲν κατὰ σῶμα τοιοῦτοι, ἀποθνῄσκειν ἐάσουσιν, τοὺς δὲ κατὰ τὴν ψυχὴν κακοφυεῖς καὶ ἀνιάτους αὐτοὶ ἀποκτενοῦσιν; τὸ γοῦν ἄριστον, ἔφη, αὐτοῖς τε τοῖς πάσχουσιν καὶ τῇ πόλει οὕτω πέφανται. οἱ δὲ δὴ νέοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δῆλον ὅτι εὐλαβήσονταί σοι δικαστικῆς εἰς χρείαν ἰέναι, τῇ ἁπλῇ ἐκείνῃ μουσικῇ χρώμενοι ἣν δὴ ἔφαμεν σωφροσύνην ἐντίκτειν. τί μήν; ἔφη. [410b]	"Then will you establish by law in the city both medicine of the kind we described and judging of this kind? They will care for [410a] those of your citizens whose bodies and souls are naturally good; as for those who aren't, they'll let die those whose bodies are that way, while those whose souls are naturally bad and incurable they'll put to death themselves." "That at least has been shown to be best," he said, "both for those who suffer it and for the city." "And your young people," I said, "will obviously be careful not to need the law courts, since they'll practice that simple music which, we said, engenders moderation." "Of course," he said. [410b]
410b	ἆρ' οὖν οὐ κατὰ ταὐτὰ ἴχνη ταῦτα ὁ μουσικὸς γυμναστικὴν διώκων, ἐὰν ἐθέλῃ, αἱρήσει, ὥστε μηδὲν ἰατρικῆς δεῖσθαι ὅτι μὴ ἀνάγκη;	"And won't the musical man, following these same tracks, pursue physical training and catch it, if he

GREEK

ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ.

αὐτά γε μὴν τὰ γυμνάσια καὶ τοὺς πόνους πρὸς τὸ θυμοειδὲς τῆς φύσεως βλέπων κἀκεῖνο ἐγείρων πονήσει μᾶλλον ἢ πρὸς ἰσχύν, οὐχ ὥσπερ οἱ ἄλλοι ἀθληταὶ ῥώμης ἕνεκα σιτία καὶ πόνους μεταχειριεῖται.

ὀρθότατα, ἦ δ' ὅς.

ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Γλαύκων, καὶ οἱ καθιστάντες 410c μουσικῇ καὶ γυμναστικῇ παιδεύειν οὐχ οὗ ἕνεκά τινες οἴονται καθιστᾶσιν, ἵνα τῇ μὲν τὸ σῶμα θεραπεύοιντο, τῇ δὲ τὴν ψυχήν;

ἀλλὰ τί μήν; ἔφη.

κινδυνεύουσιν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀμφότερα τῆς ψυχῆς ἕνεκα τὸ μέγιστον καθιστάναι.

πῶς δή;

οὐκ ἐννοεῖς, εἶπον, ὡς διατίθενται αὐτὴν τὴν διάνοιαν οἳ ἂν γυμναστικῇ μὲν διὰ βίου ὁμιλήσωσιν, μουσικῆς δὲ μὴ ἅψωνται; ἢ αὖ ὅσοι ἂν τοὐναντίον διατεθῶσιν;

τίνος δέ, ἦ δ' ὅς, πέρι λέγεις; 410d

410d ἀγριότητός τε καὶ σκληρότητος, καὶ αὖ μαλακίας τε καὶ ἡμερότητος, ἦν δ' ἐγώ—

ἔγωγε, ἔφη· ὅτι οἱ μὲν γυμναστικῇ ἀκράτῳ χρησάμενοι ἀγριώτεροι τοῦ δέοντος ἀποβαίνουσιν, οἱ δὲ μουσικῇ μαλακώτεροι αὖ γίγνονται ἢ ὡς κάλλιον αὐτοῖς.

καὶ μήν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τό γε ἄγριον τὸ θυμοειδὲς ἂν τῆς φύσεως παρέχοιτο, καὶ ὀρθῶς μὲν τραφὲν ἀνδρεῖον ἂν εἴη, μᾶλλον δ' ἐπιταθὲν τοῦ δέοντος σκληρόν τε καὶ χαλεπὸν γίγνοιτ' ἄν, ὡς τὸ εἰκός.

δοκεῖ μοι, ἔφη. 410e

410e τί δέ; τὸ ἥμερον οὐχ ἡ φιλόσοφος ἂν ἔχοι φύσις, καὶ μᾶλλον μὲν ἀνεθέντος αὐτοῦ μαλακώτερον εἴη τοῦ δέοντος, καλῶς δὲ τραφέντος ἥμερόν τε καὶ κόσμιον;

ἔστι ταῦτα.

δεῖν δέ γέ φαμεν τοὺς φύλακας ἀμφοτέρα ἔχειν τούτω τὼ φύσει.

δεῖ γάρ.

οὐκοῦν ἡρμόσθαι δεῖ αὐτὰς πρὸς ἀλλήλας;

πῶς δ' οὔ;

ENGLISH

wants to, so that he won't need medicine except when he must?"

"I think so."

"And in his exercises and exertions themselves he'll look to the spirited part of his nature and work to rouse it, rather than to strength. He won't manage his diet and his exertions for the sake of strength, as other athletes do."

"Quite right," he said.

"Then, Glaucon," I said, "those who established 410c education in music and physical training didn't do it for the reason some people suppose, did they—to care for the body with the one and the soul with the other?"

"What was it for, then?" he said.

"It looks as if they established both mainly for the sake of the soul," I said.

"How so?"

"Haven't you noticed," I said, "the cast of mind of those who spend their lives in physical training and never touch music? Or of those who are disposed the opposite way?"

"What are you talking about?" he said. 410d

"Savagery and harshness," I said, "and on the other side softness and gentleness—"

"I have noticed," he said. "Those who practice physical training unmixed turn out more savage than they should, while those who practice only music become softer than is good for them."

"And yet," I said, "the savagery would come from the spirited part of their nature. Rightly nurtured, it would be courage; but strung tighter than it should be, it would likely become harsh and difficult."

"I think so," he said. 410e

"And what about gentleness? Wouldn't the philosophic nature have it? If it were relaxed too much it would be softer than it should be, but if well nurtured it would be gentle and orderly."

"That's so."

"And we say the guardians must have both these natures."

"They must."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καὶ τοῦ μὲν ἡρμοσμένου σώφρων τε καὶ ἀνδρεία ἡ 411a ψυχή;	"Then mustn't the two be harmonized with each other?"
	πάνυ γε.	"Of course."
	τοῦ δὲ ἀναρμόστου δειλὴ καὶ ἄγροικος;	"And when they're harmonized, the 411a soul is moderate and courageous?"
	καὶ μάλα.	"Certainly."
		"And when they aren't, it's cowardly and boorish?"
		"Very much so."
411a	οὐκοῦν ὅταν μέν τις μουσικῇ παρέχῃ καταυλεῖν καὶ καταχεῖν τῆς ψυχῆς διὰ τῶν ὤτων ὥσπερ διὰ χώνης ἃς νυνδὴ ἡμεῖς ἐλέγομεν τὰς γλυκείας τε καὶ μαλακὰς καὶ θρηνώδεις ἁρμονίας, καὶ μινυρίζων τε καὶ γεγανωμένος ὑπὸ τῆς ᾠδῆς διατελῇ τὸν βίον ὅλον, οὗτος τὸ μὲν πρῶτον, εἴ τι θυμοειδὲς εἶχεν, ὥσπερ σίδηρον ἐμάλαξεν καὶ χρήσιμον 411b ἐξ ἀχρήστου καὶ σκληροῦ ἐποίησεν· ὅταν δ' ἐπέχων μὴ ἀνιῇ ἀλλὰ κηλῇ, τὸ δὴ μετὰ τοῦτο ἤδη τήκει καὶ λείβει, ἕως ἂν ἐκτήξῃ τὸν θυμὸν καὶ ἐκτέμῃ ὥσπερ νεῦρα ἐκ τῆς ψυχῆς καὶ ποιήσῃ "μαλθακὸν αἰχμητήν."	"Now when someone lets music play the pipe over him and pour into his soul through his ears, as through a funnel, those sweet, soft, mournful modes we were just speaking of, and he spends his whole life humming and bright with the delight of song, at first, if he had any spirit, he softens it like iron and makes it useful 411b instead of useless and brittle. But when he keeps at it without letting up and is spellbound, then he begins to melt and dissolve it, until he has melted his spirit away, cut it out of his soul like a sinew, and made himself 'a feeble spearman.'"[27]
411b	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Certainly," he said.
	καὶ ἐὰν μέν γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐξ ἀρχῆς φύσει ἄθυμον λάβῃ, ταχὺ τοῦτο διεπράξατο· ἐὰν δὲ θυμοειδῆ, ἀσθενῆ ποιήσας τὸν θυμὸν ὀξύρροπον ἀπηργάσατο, ἀπὸ σμικρῶν ταχὺ ἐρεθιζόμενόν 411c τε καὶ κατασβεννύμενον. ἀκράχολοι οὖν καὶ ὀργίλοι ἀντὶ θυμοειδοῦς γεγένηνται, δυσκολίας ἔμπλεῳ.	"And if," I said, "he was spiritless by nature from the start, this happens quickly. But if he was spirited, it weakens his spirit and makes it volatile, quickly roused by small things 411c and quickly quenched. Such people become irritable and quick-tempered instead of spirited, full of bad temper."
	κομιδῇ μὲν οὖν.	"Exactly."
	τί δὲ ἂν αὖ γυμναστικῇ πολλὰ πονῇ καὶ εὐωχῆται εὖ μάλα, μουσικῆς δὲ καὶ φιλοσοφίας μὴ ἅπτηται; οὐ πρῶτον μὲν εὖ ἴσχων τὸ σῶμα φρονήματός τε καὶ θυμοῦ ἐμπίμπλαται καὶ ἀνδρειότερος γίγνεται αὐτὸς αὑτοῦ;	"And what if, instead, he works hard at physical training and eats very well, but never touches music or philosophy? First, being in good bodily condition, won't he be filled with confidence and spirit, and become braver than he was?"
	καὶ μάλα γε.	"Very much so."
411c	τί δὲ ἐπειδὰν ἄλλο μηδὲν πράττῃ μηδὲ κοινωνῇ Μούσης 411d μηδαμῇ; οὐκ εἴ τι καὶ ἐνῆν αὐτοῦ φιλομαθὲς ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ, ἅτε οὔτε μαθήματος γευόμενον οὐδενὸς οὔτε ζητήματος, οὔτε λόγου μετίσχον οὔτε τῆς ἄλλης μουσικῆς, ἀσθενές τε καὶ κωφὸν καὶ τυφλὸν γίγνεται, ἅτε οὐκ ἐγειρόμενον οὐδὲ τρεφόμενον οὐδὲ διακαθαιρομένων τῶν αἰσθήσεων αὐτοῦ;	"And what if he does nothing else and has nothing to do with the Muse 411d at all? Even if there was some love of learning in his soul, since it never tastes any learning or inquiry, and never takes part in discussion or the rest of music, doesn't it become weak, deaf and blind, because it's never awakened or nourished and its perceptions are never purified?"
	οὕτως, ἔφη.	

27 "A feeble spearman" is Homer's taunt at Menelaus (*Iliad* 17.588).

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"Just so," he said.
411d	μισόλογος δὴ οἶμαι ὁ τοιοῦτος γίγνεται καὶ ἄμουσος, καὶ πειθοῖ μὲν διὰ λόγων οὐδὲν ἔτι χρῆται, βίᾳ δὲ καὶ [411e] ἀγριότητι ὥσπερ θηρίον πρὸς πάντα διαπράττεται, καὶ ἐν ἀμαθίᾳ καὶ σκαιότητι μετὰ ἀρρυθμίας τε καὶ ἀχαριστίας ζῇ.	"Such a man, I think, becomes a hater of argument and unmusical. He no longer makes any use of persuasion through words, but gets everything done by force and [411e] savagery, like a wild beast, and lives in ignorance and clumsiness, without rhythm or grace."
	παντάπασιν, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὕτως ἔχει.	"That's exactly how it is," he said.
411e	ἐπὶ δὴ δύ' ὄντε τούτω, ὡς ἔοικε, δύο τέχνα θεὸν ἔγωγ' ἄν τινα φαίην δεδωκέναι τοῖς ἀνθρώποις, μουσικήν τε καὶ γυμναστικὴν ἐπὶ τὸ θυμοειδὲς καὶ τὸ φιλόσοφον, οὐκ ἐπὶ ψυχὴν καὶ σῶμα, εἰ μὴ εἰ πάρεργον, ἀλλ' ἐπ' ἐκείνω, ὅπως [412a] ἂν ἀλλήλοιν συναρμοσθῆτον ἐπιτεινομένω καὶ ἀνιεμένω μέχρι τοῦ προσήκοντος.	"So it seems that for these two things, I for one would say, some god has given human beings two arts, music and physical training—for the spirited part and the philosophic part, not for the soul and the body, except incidentally, but for those two, so that [412a] they may be harmonized with each other, tightened and relaxed to the proper degree."
	καὶ γὰρ ἔοικεν, ἔφη.	"So it seems," he said.
	τὸν κάλλιστ' ἄρα μουσικῇ γυμναστικὴν κεραννύντα καὶ μετριώτατα τῇ ψυχῇ προσφέροντα, τοῦτον ὀρθότατ' ἂν φαῖμεν εἶναι τελέως μουσικώτατον καὶ εὐαρμοστότατον, πολὺ μᾶλλον ἢ τὸν τὰς χορδὰς ἀλλήλαις συνιστάντα.	"Then the one who blends physical training with music most finely and applies them to the soul in the best measure is the one we'd most rightly call perfectly musical and well harmonized—far more than the man who tunes strings to one another."
	εἰκότως γ', ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες.	"Reasonably so, Socrates," he said.
412a	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἐν τῇ πόλει ἡμῖν, ὦ Γλαύκων, δεήσει τοῦ τοιούτου τινὸς ἀεὶ ἐπιστάτου, εἰ μέλλει ἡ πολιτεία σῴζεσθαι; [412b]	"Then in our city too, Glaucon, won't we always need some such overseer, if the constitution is to be preserved?" [412b]
	δεήσει μέντοι ὡς οἷόν τέ γε μάλιστα.	"We certainly will, as much as possible."
	οἱ μὲν δὴ τύποι τῆς παιδείας τε καὶ τροφῆς οὗτοι ἂν εἶεν. χορείας γὰρ τί ἄν τις διεξίοι τῶν τοιούτων καὶ θήρας τε καὶ κυνηγέσια καὶ γυμνικοὺς ἀγῶνας καὶ ἱππικούς; σχεδὸν γάρ τι δῆλα δὴ ὅτι τούτοις ἑπόμενα δεῖ αὐτὰ εἶναι, καὶ οὐκέτι χαλεπὰ εὑρεῖν.	"These, then, would be the outlines of their education and upbringing. Why go through their dances, their hunting, their chasing with hounds, their athletic contests and horse races? It's pretty clear that these must follow the outlines, and they're no longer hard to discover."
	ἴσως, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐ χαλεπά.	"Perhaps," he said, "they aren't hard."

CHOOSING THE RULERS

Socrates selects rulers from the most devoted guardians and proposes the myth of the metals.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
412b	**SOCRATES** εἶεν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· τὸ δὴ μετὰ τοῦτο τί ἂν ἡμῖν διαιρετέον εἴη; ἆρ' οὐκ αὐτῶν τούτων οἵτινες ἄρξουσί τε καὶ ἄρξονται; [412c]	**SOCRATES** "Very well," I said. "What's the next thing we must determine? Isn't it which of these people will rule and which be ruled?" [412c]
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
	οὐκοῦν ὅτι μὲν πρεσβυτέρους τοὺς ἄρχοντας δεῖ εἶναι, νεωτέρους δὲ τοὺς ἀρχομένους, δῆλον;	"Isn't it clear that the rulers must be older and the ruled younger?"
	δῆλον.	"It's clear."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καὶ ὅτι γε τοὺς ἀρίστους αὐτῶν;	"And that they must be the best of them?"
	καὶ τοῦτο.	"That too."
	οἱ δὲ γεωργῶν ἄριστοι ἆρ' οὐ γεωργικώτατοι γίγνονται;	"And the best farmers are the ones most skilled at farming, aren't they?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	νῦν δ', ἐπειδὴ φυλάκων αὐτοὺς ἀρίστους δεῖ εἶναι, ἆρ' οὐ φυλακικωτάτους πόλεως;	"And now, since they must be the best of the guardians, mustn't they be the most skilled at guarding the city?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
412c	οὐκοῦν φρονίμους τε εἰς τοῦτο δεῖ ὑπάρχειν καὶ δυνατοὺς καὶ ἔτι κηδεμόνας τῆς πόλεως; 412d	"Then for this they must be sensible and capable, and must also care for the city?" 412d
	ἔστι ταῦτα.	"That's so."
	κήδοιτο δέ γ' ἄν τις μάλιστα τούτου ὃ τυγχάνοι φιλῶν.	"And one cares most for what one happens to love."
	ἀνάγκη.	"Necessarily."
	καὶ μὴν τοῦτό γ' ἂν μάλιστα φιλοῖ, ᾧ συμφέρειν ἡγοῖτο τὰ αὐτὰ καὶ ἑαυτῷ καὶ ὅταν μάλιστα ἐκείνου μὲν εὖ πράττοντος ο�οἴοιτο συμβαίνειν καὶ ἑαυτῷ εὖ πράττειν, μὴ δέ, τοὐναντίον.	"And one would love something most when one believes that the same things benefit it and oneself, and thinks that when it does well one does well oneself, and when it doesn't, the opposite."
	οὕτως, ἔφη.	"Just so," he said.
412d	ἐκλεκτέον ἄρ' ἐκ τῶν ἄλλων φυλάκων τοιούτους ἄνδρας, οἳ ἂν σκοποῦσιν ἡμῖν μάλιστα φαίνωνται παρὰ πάντα τὸν 412e βίον, ὃ μὲν ἂν τῇ πόλει ἡγήσωνται συμφέρειν, πάσῃ προθυμίᾳ ποιεῖν, ὃ δ' ἂν μή, μηδενὶ τρόπῳ πρᾶξαι ἂν ἐθέλειν.	"Then we must select from among the other guardians men of this sort: men who, when we examine them, appear most of all, throughout their 412e lives, to do with complete eagerness whatever they think benefits the city, and to be unwilling by any means to do what doesn't."
	ἐπιτήδειοι γάρ, ἔφη.	"Yes, they'd be the suitable ones," he said.
	δοκεῖ δή μοι τηρητέον αὐτοὺς εἶναι ἐν ἁπάσαις ταῖς ἡλικίαις, εἰ φυλακικοί εἰσι τούτου τοῦ δόγματος καὶ μήτε γοητευόμενοι μήτε βιαζόμενοι ἐκβάλλουσιν ἐπιλανθανόμενοι δόξαν τὴν τοῦ ποιεῖν δεῖν ἃ τῇ πόλει βέλτιστα.	"Then I think they must be watched at every age, to see whether they guard this conviction, and never, under bewitchment or force, forget and cast out the opinion that they must do what is best for the city."
	τίνα, ἔφη, λέγεις τὴν ἐκβολήν;	"What do you mean by casting out?" he said.
412e	ἐγώ σοι, ἔφην, ἐρῶ. φαίνεταί μοι δόξα ἐξιέναι ἐκ διανοίας ἢ ἑκουσίως ἢ ἀκουσίως, ἑκουσίως μὲν ἡ ψευδὴς 413a τοῦ μεταμανθάνοντος, ἀκουσίως δὲ πᾶσα ἡ ἀληθής.	"I'll tell you," I said. "It seems to me that an opinion departs from the mind either willingly or unwillingly: willingly, when it's a false one 413a and a person learns better; unwillingly, whenever it's a true one."
	τὸ μὲν τῆς ἑκουσίου, ἔφη, μανθάνω, τὸ δὲ τῆς ἀκουσίου δέομαι μαθεῖν.	"I understand the willing case," he said, "but I need to learn about the unwilling one."
	τί δέ; οὐ καὶ σὺ ἡγῇ, ἔφην ἐγώ, τῶν μὲν ἀγαθῶν ἀκουσίως στέρεσθαι τοὺς ἀνθρώπους, τῶν δὲ κακῶν ἑκουσίως; ἢ οὐ τὸ μὲν ἐψεῦσθαι τῆς ἀληθείας κακόν, τὸ δὲ ἀληθεύειν ἀγαθόν; ἢ οὐ τὸ τὰ ὄντα δοξάζειν ἀληθεύειν δοκεῖ σοι εἶναι;	"What? Don't you too believe," I said, "that people are deprived of good things unwillingly and of bad things willingly? Isn't being deceived about the truth a bad thing, and having the truth a good one?

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		Or don't you think that believing what is, is having the truth?"
413a	ἀλλ', ἦ δ' ὅς, ὀρθῶς λέγεις, καί μοι δοκοῦσιν ἄκοντες ἀληθοῦς δόξης στερίσκεσθαι. 413b	"You're right," he said, "and I do think people are deprived of true opinion unwillingly." 413b
	οὐκοῦν κλαπέντες ἢ γοητευθέντες ἢ βιασθέντες τοῦτο πάσχουσιν;	"And don't they suffer this by being robbed, bewitched, or forced?"
	οὐδὲ νῦν, ἔφη, μανθάνω.	"I don't understand this either," he said.
	τραγικῶς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, κινδυνεύω λέγειν. κλαπέντας μὲν γὰρ τοὺς μεταπεισθέντας λέγω καὶ τοὺς ἐπιλανθανομένους, ὅτι τῶν μὲν χρόνος, τῶν δὲ λόγος ἐξαιρούμενος λανθάνει· νῦν γάρ που μανθάνεις;	"I'm afraid I'm talking like a tragedian," I said. "By 'robbed' I mean those who are talked out of their opinions and those who forget: in the one case argument, in the other time, takes the opinion away without their noticing. Now I take it you understand?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	τοὺς τοίνυν βιασθέντας λέγω οὓς ἂν ὀδύνη τις ἢ ἀλγηδὼν μεταδοξάσαι ποιήσῃ.	"And by 'forced' I mean those whom some pain or suffering makes change their opinion."
	καὶ τοῦτ', ἔφη, ἔμαθον, καὶ ὀρθῶς λέγεις. 413c	"I understand that too," he said, "and you're right." 413c
413c	τοὺς μὴν γοητευθέντας, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, κἂν σὺ φαίης εἶναι οἳ ἂν μεταδοξάσωσιν ἢ ὑφ' ἡδονῆς κηληθέντες ἢ ὑπὸ φόβου τι δείσαντες.	"And the 'bewitched,' I think you'd agree, are those who change their opinion because they're charmed by pleasure or frightened by some fear."
	ἔοικε γάρ, ἦ δ' ὅς, γοητεύειν πάντα ὅσα ἀπατᾷ.	"Yes," he said, "everything that deceives seems to bewitch."
	ὃ τοίνυν ἄρτι ἔλεγον, ζητητέον τίνες ἄριστοι φύλακες τοῦ παρ' αὑτοῖς δόγματος, τοῦτο ὡς ποιητέον ὃ ἂν τῇ πόλει ἀεὶ δοκῶσι βέλτιστον εἶναι αὑτοῖς ποιεῖν. τηρητέον δὴ εὐθὺς ἐκ παίδων προθεμένοις ἔργα ἐν οἷς ἄν τις τὸ τοιοῦτον μάλιστα ἐπιλανθάνοιτο καὶ ἐξαπατῷτο, καὶ τὸν μὲν μνήμονα 413d καὶ δυσεξαπάτητον ἐγκριτέον, τὸν δὲ μὴ ἀποκριτέον. ἦ γάρ;	"Well then, as I was saying just now, we must look for those who are the best guardians of their own conviction that they must do whatever they think, at any time, is best for the city. We must watch them right from childhood, setting them tasks in which a person would be most likely to forget such a conviction or be deceived out of it. The one who remembers 413d and is hard to deceive we must select; the one who isn't, we must reject. Isn't that so?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
413d	καὶ πόνους γε αὖ καὶ ἀλγηδόνας καὶ ἀγῶνας αὐτοῖς θετέον, ἐν οἷς ταὐτὰ ταῦτα τηρητέον.	"And again, we must set them labors, pains and contests, and watch for these same things in them."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.	"Right," he said.
	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ τρίτου εἴδους τούτοις γοητείας ἅμιλλαν ποιητέον, καὶ θεατέον—ὥσπερ τοὺς πώλους ἐπὶ τοὺς ψόφους τε καὶ θορύβους ἄγοντες σκοποῦσιν εἰ φοβεροί, οὕτω νέους ὄντας εἰς δείματ' ἄττα κομιστέον καὶ εἰς ἡδονὰς 413e αὖ μεταβλητέον, βασανίζοντας πολὺ μᾶλλον ἢ χρυσὸν ἐν πυρί—εἰ δυσγοήτευτος καὶ εὐσχήμων ἐν πᾶσι φαίνεται, φύλαξ αὑτοῦ ὢν ἀγαθὸς καὶ μουσικῆς	"Then," I said, "we must also hold a contest for them in the third kind, bewitchment, and watch them. Just as people lead colts into noise and commotion to see whether they're skittish, so we must bring these while they're young among terrors, and then switch 413e them to pleasures, testing them much more thoroughly than gold is tested in

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἧς ἐμάνθανεν, εὔρυθμόν τε καὶ εὐάρμοστον ἑαυτὸν ἐν πᾶσι τούτοις παρέχων, οἷος δὴ ἂν ὢν καὶ ἑαυτῷ καὶ πόλει χρησιμώτατος εἴη.	fire, to see whether someone proves hard to bewitch and graceful in everything, a good guardian of himself and of the music he learned, showing himself rhythmical and harmonious in all these things—the kind of man who would be most useful both to himself and to the city.
413e	καὶ τὸν ἀεὶ ἔν τε παισὶ καὶ νεανίσκοις καὶ ἐν ἀνδράσι βασανιζόμενον [414a] καὶ ἀκήρατον ἐκβαίνοντα καταστατέον ἄρχοντα τῆς πόλεως καὶ φύλακα, καὶ τιμὰς δοτέον καὶ ζῶντι καὶ τελευτήσαντι, τάφων τε καὶ τῶν ἄλλων μνημείων μέγιστα γέρα λαγχάνοντα· τὸν δὲ μὴ τοιοῦτον ἀποκριτέον. τοιαύτη τις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δοκεῖ μοι, ὦ Γλαύκων, ἡ ἐκλογὴ εἶναι καὶ κατάστασις τῶν ἀρχόντων τε καὶ φυλάκων, ὡς ἐν τύπῳ, μὴ δι' ἀκριβείας, εἰρῆσθαι.	"And the one who is tested again and again, as a child, as a youth and as a man, [414a] and comes through unblemished, must be appointed ruler and guardian of the city and be given honors both in life and after death, receiving the greatest privileges of tombs and other memorials. The one who isn't like that must be rejected. Something like this, Glaucon," I said, "seems to me to be how the rulers and guardians are to be selected and appointed—described in outline, not in precise detail."
	καὶ ἐμοί, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὕτως πῃ φαίνεται. [414b]	"It seems that way to me too, more or less," he said. [414b]
414b	ἆρ' οὖν ὡς ἀληθῶς ὀρθότατον καλεῖν τούτους μὲν φύλακας παντελεῖς τῶν τε ἔξωθεν πολεμίων τῶν τε ἐντὸς φιλίων, ὅπως οἱ μὲν μὴ βουλήσονται, οἱ δὲ μὴ δυνήσονται κακουργεῖν, τοὺς δὲ νέους, οὓς δὴ νῦν φύλακας ἐκαλοῦμεν, ἐπικούρους τε καὶ βοηθοὺς τοῖς τῶν ἀρχόντων δόγμασιν;	"Then wouldn't it truly be most correct to call these people complete guardians—against enemies outside and friends within, so that the friends won't want to do harm and the enemies won't be able to—and to call the young, whom we were just now calling guardians, auxiliaries and supporters of the rulers' convictions?"
	ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ, ἔφη.	"I think so," he said.
	τίς ἂν οὖν ἡμῖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μηχανὴ γένοιτο τῶν ψευδῶν τῶν ἐν δέοντι γιγνομένων, ὧν δὴ νῦν ἐλέγομεν, γενναῖόν [414c] τι ἓν ψευδομένους πεῖσαι μάλιστα μὲν καὶ αὐτοὺς τοὺς ἄρχοντας, εἰ δὲ μή, τὴν ἄλλην πόλιν;	"Then how," I said, "might we devise one of those falsehoods that come about in case of need, which we were talking about just now—one noble [414c] falsehood—to persuade above all the rulers themselves, or failing that, the rest of the city?"
	ποῖόν τι; ἔφη.	"What sort of thing?" he said.
414c	μηδὲν καινόν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀλλὰ Φοινικικόν τι, πρότερον μὲν ἤδη πολλαχοῦ γεγονός, ὥς φασιν οἱ ποιηταὶ καὶ πεπείκασιν, ἐφ' ἡμῶν δὲ οὐ γεγονὸς οὐδ' οἶδα εἰ γενόμενον ἄν, πεῖσαι δὲ συχνῆς πειθοῦς.	"Nothing new," I said, "but a sort of Phoenician tale—something that has happened in many places before, as the poets say, and they've made people believe it; but it hasn't happened in our time, and I don't know if it could, and it would take a lot of persuasion to make it believed."
	ὡς ἔοικας, ἔφη, ὀκνοῦντι λέγειν.	"You seem reluctant to tell it," he said.
	δόξω δέ σοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ μάλ' εἰκότως ὀκνεῖν, ἐπειδὰν εἴπω.	"You'll think my reluctance quite reasonable," I said, "once I've told it."
	λέγ', ἔφη, καὶ μὴ φοβοῦ. [414d]	"Tell it," he said, "and don't be afraid." [414d] [28]

28 The "Phoenician tale" probably alludes to Cadmus, the Phoenician founder of Thebes, who sowed a dragon's teeth from which armed men sprang up out of the earth.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
414d	λέγω δή—καίτοι οὐκ οἶδα ὁποίᾳ τόλμῃ ἢ ποίοις λόγοις χρώμενος ἐρῶ—καὶ ἐπιχειρήσω πρῶτον μὲν αὐτοὺς τοὺς ἄρχοντας πείθειν καὶ τοὺς στρατιώτας, ἔπειτα δὲ καὶ τὴν ἄλλην πόλιν, ὡς ἄρ' ἃ ἡμεῖς αὐτοὺς ἐτρέφομέν τε καὶ ἐπαιδεύομεν, ὥσπερ ὀνείρατα ἐδόκουν ταῦτα πάντα πάσχειν τε καὶ γίγνεσθαι περὶ αὐτούς, ἦσαν δὲ τότε τῇ ἀληθείᾳ ὑπὸ γῆς ἐντὸς πλαττόμενοι καὶ τρεφόμενοι καὶ αὐτοὶ καὶ τὰ [414e] ὅπλα αὐτῶν καὶ ἡ ἄλλη σκευὴ δημιουργουμένη, ἐπειδὴ δὲ παντελῶς ἐξειργασμένοι ἦσαν, καὶ ἡ γῆ αὐτοὺς μήτηρ οὖσα ἀνῆκεν, καὶ νῦν δεῖ ὡς περὶ μητρὸς καὶ τροφοῦ τῆς χώρας ἐν ᾗ εἰσι βουλεύεσθαί τε καὶ ἀμύνειν αὐτούς, ἐάν τις ἐπ' αὐτὴν ἴῃ, καὶ ὑπὲρ τῶν ἄλλων πολιτῶν ὡς ἀδελφῶν ὄντων καὶ γηγενῶν διανοεῖσθαι.	"I'll tell it, then—though I don't know what daring or what words I'll use in the telling. I'll try to persuade first the rulers themselves and the soldiers, and then the rest of the city, that the upbringing and education we gave them—all of it—they only seemed to experience and undergo, as in dreams; that in truth they were at that time under the earth, being formed and nurtured within it, themselves and their [414e] weapons, and the rest of their equipment being crafted; and that when they were completely finished, the earth, being their mother, sent them up. And now they must plan for and defend the land they live in as their mother and nurse, if anyone attacks it, and think of the other citizens as their brothers, born of the earth."
414e	οὐκ ἐτός, ἔφη, πάλαι ᾐσχύνου τὸ ψεῦδος λέγειν.	"No wonder," he said, "you were so ashamed all this time to tell the falsehood."
415a	πάνυ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἰκότως· ἀλλ' ὅμως ἄκουε καὶ τὸ λοιπὸν τοῦ μύθου. ἐστὲ μὲν γὰρ δὴ πάντες οἱ ἐν τῇ πόλει ἀδελφοί, ὡς φήσομεν πρὸς αὐτοὺς μυθολογοῦντες, ἀλλ' ὁ θεὸς πλάττων, ὅσοι μὲν ὑμῶν ἱκανοὶ ἄρχειν, χρυσὸν ἐν τῇ γενέσει συνέμειξεν αὐτοῖς, διὸ τιμιώτατοί εἰσιν· ὅσοι δ' ἐπίκουροι, ἄργυρον· σίδηρον δὲ καὶ χαλκὸν τοῖς τε γεωργοῖς καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις δημιουργοῖς. ἅτε οὖν συγγενεῖς ὄντες πάντες τὸ μὲν πολὺ ὁμοίους ἂν ὑμῖν αὐτοῖς γεννῷτε, [415b] ἔστι δ' ὅτε ἐκ χρυσοῦ γεννηθείη ἂν ἀργυροῦν καὶ ἐξ ἀργύρου χρυσοῦν ἔκγονον καὶ τἆλλα πάντα οὕτως ἐξ ἀλλήλων.	"With good reason," I said. "But still, hear the rest of the story. 'All of you in the city are brothers,' we'll tell them in our tale, 'but the god, when he formed you, mixed gold into the making of those of you who are fit to rule, which is why they are the most honored; silver into the auxiliaries; and iron and bronze into the farmers and the other craftsmen. Since you're all related, you'll mostly beget children like yourselves, [415b] but sometimes a silver child may be born from gold, or a golden one from silver, and so on, all of them from one another.
415b	τοῖς οὖν ἄρχουσι καὶ πρῶτον καὶ μάλιστα παραγγέλλει ὁ θεός, ὅπως μηδενὸς οὕτω φύλακες ἀγαθοὶ ἔσονται μηδ' οὕτω σφόδρα φυλάξουσι μηδὲν ὡς τοὺς ἐκγόνους, ὅτι αὐτοῖς τούτων ἐν ταῖς ψυχαῖς παραμέμεικται, καὶ ἐάν τε σφέτερος ἔκγονος ὑπόχαλκος ἢ ὑποσίδηρος γένηται, μηδενὶ [415c] τρόπῳ κατελεήσουσιν, ἀλλὰ τὴν τῇ φύσει προσήκουσαν τιμὴν ἀποδόντες ὥσουσιν εἰς δημιουργοὺς ἢ εἰς γεωργούς, καὶ ἂν αὖ ἐκ τούτων τις ὑπόχρυσος ἢ ὑπάργυρος φυῇ, τιμήσαντες ἀνάξουσι τοὺς μὲν εἰς φυλακήν, τοὺς δὲ εἰς ἐπικουρίαν, ὡς χρησμοῦ ὄντος τότε τὴν πόλιν διαφθαρῆναι, ὅταν αὐτὴν ὁ σιδηροῦς φύλαξ ἢ ὁ χαλκοῦς φυλάξῃ. τοῦτον οὖν τὸν μῦθον ὅπως ἂν πεισθεῖεν, ἔχεις τινὰ μηχανήν; [415d]	"'So upon the rulers, first and above all, the god lays this command: there is nothing they are to guard so well, or watch so closely, as their offspring, to see which of these metals has been mixed into their souls. And if a child of their own is born with bronze or iron in it, they must by no [415c] means pity it, but give it the rank proper to its nature and thrust it out among the craftsmen or farmers. And if, again, a child with gold or silver in it is born among these, they must honor it and raise it up, some to guardianship and others to the auxiliaries, since there is an oracle that the city will be destroyed when an iron or bronze guardian guards it.' So do you have any way of getting them to believe this tale?" [415d]
415d	οὐδαμῶς, ἔφη, ὅπως γ' ἂν αὐτοὶ οὗτοι· ὅπως μεντἂν οἱ τούτων ὑεῖς καὶ οἱ ἔπειτα οἵ τ' ἄλλοι ἄνθρωποι οἱ ὕστερον.	"None," he said, "for these people themselves; but for their sons, and those who come after, and the rest of humanity later on, perhaps."

GREEK	ENGLISH
ἀλλὰ καὶ τοῦτο, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εὖ ἂν ἔχοι πρὸς τὸ μᾶλλον αὐτοὺς τῆς πόλεώς τε καὶ ἀλλήλων κήδεσθαι· σχεδὸν γάρ τι μανθάνω ὃ λέγεις.	"Well, even that," I said, "would do some good in making them care more for the city and for one another. I think I pretty much understand what you mean.

HOW THE GUARDIANS ARE TO LIVE

The guardians live in common without private property, and Adeimantus asks if they will be happy.

GREEK	ENGLISH
SOCRATES καὶ τοῦτο μὲν δὴ ἕξει ὅπῃ ἂν αὐτὸ ἡ φήμη ἀγάγῃ· ἡμεῖς δὲ τούτους τοὺς γηγενεῖς ὁπλίσαντες προάγωμεν ἡγουμένων τῶν ἀρχόντων. ἐλθόντες δὲ θεασάσθων τῆς πόλεως ὅπου κάλλιστον στρατοπεδεύσασθαι, ὅθεν τούς τε 415e ἔνδον μάλιστ' ἂν κατέχοιεν, εἴ τις μὴ ἐθέλοι τοῖς νόμοις πείθεσθαι, τούς τε ἔξωθεν ἀπαμύνοιεν, εἰ πολέμιος ὥσπερ λύκος ἐπὶ ποίμνην τις ἴοι· στρατοπεδευσάμενοι δέ, θύσαντες οἷς χρή, εὐνὰς ποιησάσθων. ἢ πῶς;	**SOCRATES** "Now this will go wherever rumor carries it. But let's arm these earthborn men and lead them forward, with the rulers at their head. When they get there, let them look for the best place in the city to make camp, from which they could best 415e restrain those within, if anyone refused to obey the laws, and ward off those without, if an enemy should come like a wolf upon the flock. And when they've made camp and sacrificed to the proper gods, let them make their beds. Or how should it be?"
οὕτως, ἔφη.	"Like that," he said.
οὐκοῦν τοιαύτας, οἵας χειμῶνός τε στέγειν καὶ θέρους ἱκανὰς εἶναι;	"And these must be adequate to shelter them in winter and summer?"
πῶς γὰρ οὐχί; οἰκήσεις γάρ, ἔφη, δοκεῖς μοι λέγειν.	"Of course. You seem to me to mean dwellings," he said.
415e ναί, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, στρατιωτικάς γε, ἀλλ' οὐ χρηματιστικάς.	"Yes," I said, "soldiers' dwellings, not money-makers'."
πῶς, ἔφη, αὖ τοῦτο λέγεις διαφέρειν ἐκείνου;	"And what difference do you mean between them?" he said.
ἐγώ σοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πειράσομαι εἰπεῖν. δεινότατον γάρ που πάντων καὶ αἴσχιστον ποιμέσι τοιούτους γε καὶ οὕτω τρέφειν κύνας ἐπικούρους ποιμνίων, ὥστε ὑπὸ ἀκολασίας ἢ λιμοῦ ἤ τινος ἄλλου κακοῦ ἔθους αὐτοὺς τοὺς κύνας ἐπιχειρῆσαι τοῖς προβάτοις κακουργεῖν καὶ ἀντὶ κυνῶν λύκοις ὁμοιωθῆναι.	"I'll try to tell you," I said. "Surely the most terrible and shameful thing of all is for shepherds to rear dogs to help guard their flocks in such a way, and of such a kind, that from lack of discipline, or hunger, or some other bad habit, the dogs themselves set about harming the sheep and become like wolves instead of dogs."
δεινόν, ἦ δ' ὅς· πῶς δ' οὔ; 416b	"Terrible," he said. "Of course it is." 416b
416b οὐκοῦν φυλακτέον παντὶ τρόπῳ μὴ τοιοῦτον ἡμῖν οἱ ἐπίκουροι ποιήσωσι πρὸς τοὺς πολίτας, ἐπειδὴ αὐτῶν κρείττους εἰσίν, ἀντὶ συμμάχων εὐμενῶν δεσπόταις ἀγρίοις ἀφομοιωθῶσιν;	"Then mustn't we guard in every way against our auxiliaries doing anything like that to the citizens, since they're stronger than them, and becoming like savage masters instead of kindly allies?"
φυλακτέον, ἔφη.	"We must," he said.
οὐκοῦν τὴν μεγίστην τῆς εὐλαβείας παρεσκευασμένοι ἂν εἶεν, εἰ τῷ ὄντι καλῶς πεπαιδευμένοι εἰσίν;	"And wouldn't they have the greatest safeguard in place, if they've really been finely educated?"
ἀλλὰ μὴν εἰσίν γ', ἔφη.	"But they have been," he said.

GREEK

καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον· τοῦτο μὲν οὐκ ἄξιον διισχυρίζεσθαι, ὦ φίλε Γλαύκων· ὃ μέντοι ἄρτι ἐλέγομεν, ἄξιον, ὅτι δεῖ 416c αὐτοὺς τῆς ὀρθῆς τυχεῖν παιδείας, ἥτις ποτέ ἐστιν, εἰ μέλλουσι τὸ μέγιστον ἔχειν πρὸς τὸ ἥμεροι εἶναι αὐτοῖς τε καὶ τοῖς φυλαττομένοις ὑπ' αὐτῶν.

416c καὶ ὀρθῶς γε, ἦ δ' ὅς.

πρὸς τοίνυν τῇ παιδείᾳ ταύτῃ φαίη ἄν τις νοῦν ἔχων δεῖν καὶ τὰς οἰκήσεις καὶ τὴν ἄλλην οὐσίαν τοιαύτην αὐτοῖς παρεσκευάσθαι, ἥτις μήτε τοῦ φύλακας ὡς ἀρίστους εἶναι παύσει 416d αὐτούς, κακουργεῖν τε μὴ ἐπαρεῖ περὶ τοὺς ἄλλους πολίτας.

καὶ ἀληθῶς γε φήσει.

416d ὅρα δή, εἶπον ἐγώ, εἰ τοιόνδε τινὰ τρόπον δεῖ αὐτοὺς ζῆν τε καὶ οἰκεῖν, εἰ μέλλουσι τοιοῦτοι ἔσεσθαι· πρῶτον μὲν οὐσίαν κεκτημένον μηδεμίαν μηδένα ἰδίαν, ἂν μὴ πᾶσα ἀνάγκη· ἔπειτα οἴκησιν καὶ ταμιεῖον μηδενὶ εἶναι μηδὲν τοιοῦτον, εἰς ὃ οὐ πᾶς ὁ βουλόμενος εἴσεισι· τὰ δ' ἐπιτήδεια, ὅσων δέονται ἄνδρες ἀθληταὶ πολέμου σώφρονές τε καὶ 416e ἀνδρεῖοι, ταξαμένους παρὰ τῶν ἄλλων πολιτῶν δέχεσθαι μισθὸν τῆς φυλακῆς τοσοῦτον ὅσον μήτε περιεῖναι αὐτοῖς εἰς τὸν ἐνιαυτὸν μήτε ἐνδεῖν· φοιτῶντας δὲ εἰς συσσίτια ὥσπερ ἐστρατοπεδευμένους κοινῇ ζῆν·

416e χρυσίον δὲ καὶ ἀργύριον εἰπεῖν αὐτοῖς ὅτι θεῖον παρὰ θεῶν ἀεὶ ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ ἔχουσι καὶ οὐδὲν προσδέονται τοῦ ἀνθρωπείου, οὐδὲ ὅσια τὴν ἐκείνου κτῆσιν τῇ τοῦ θνητοῦ χρυσοῦ κτήσει συμμειγνύντας μιαίνειν, διότι πολλὰ καὶ ἀνόσια περὶ τὸ τῶν 417a πολλῶν νόμισμα γέγονεν, τὸ παρ' ἐκείνοις δὲ ἀκήρατον· ἀλλὰ μόνοις αὐτοῖς τῶν ἐν τῇ πόλει μεταχειρίζεσθαι καὶ ἅπτεσθαι χρυσοῦ καὶ ἀργύρου οὐ θέμις, οὐδ' ὑπὸ τὸν αὐτὸν ὄροφον ἰέναι οὐδὲ περιάψασθαι οὐδὲ πίνειν ἐξ ἀργύρου ἢ χρυσοῦ.

417a καὶ οὕτω μὲν σῴζοιντό τ' ἂν καὶ σῴζοιεν τὴν πόλιν· ὁπότε δ' αὐτοὶ γῆν τε ἰδίαν καὶ οἰκίας καὶ νομίσματα κτήσονται, οἰκονόμοι μὲν καὶ γεωργοὶ ἀντὶ φυλάκων ἔσονται, 417b δεσπόται δ' ἐχθροὶ ἀντὶ συμμάχων τῶν ἄλλων πολιτῶν γενήσονται, μισοῦντες δὲ δὴ καὶ μισούμενοι καὶ ἐπιβουλεύοντες καὶ ἐπιβουλευόμενοι διάξουσι πάντα τὸν βίον, πολὺ πλείω καὶ μᾶλλον δεδιότες τοὺς ἔνδον ἢ τοὺς ἔξωθεν πολεμίους, θέοντες ἤδη τότε ἐγγύτατα ὀλέθρου αὐτοί τε καὶ ἡ ἄλλη πόλις. τούτων οὖν πάντων ἕνεκα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, φῶμεν οὕτω δεῖν κατεσκευάσθαι τοὺς φύλακας

ENGLISH

And I said, "That's not worth insisting on, my dear Glaucon. What is worth insisting on is what we were saying just now: that they must 416c get the right education, whatever it is, if they're to have what matters most for being gentle toward one another and toward those they guard."

"Quite right," he said.

"Now anyone with sense would say that, besides this education, their dwellings and other property must be arranged so as not to stop them from being the best possible guardians 416d or provoke them to do harm to the other citizens."

"And he'd be right to say so."

"Then see," I said, "whether they should live and dwell in some such way as this, if they're to be the kind of people we said. First, none of them is to own any private property unless it's absolutely necessary. Next, no one is to have any dwelling or storeroom that anyone who wishes can't enter. As for provisions—whatever moderate and 416e courageous athletes of war need—they are to receive them from the other citizens by agreed assessment, as wages for their guardianship, in such amount that they have neither surplus at the end of the year nor shortfall. They are to go to common meals and live together, like soldiers in camp.

"As for gold and silver, we'll tell them that they have divine gold and silver from the gods always in their souls and have no further need of the human kind; and that it isn't holy to pollute their possession of the divine by mixing it with the possession of mortal gold, because many unholy deeds have been done over the 417a currency of the many, while theirs is pure. For them alone of all in the city it is forbidden to handle or touch gold and silver, or to go under the same roof with it, or wear it as an ornament, or drink from silver or gold.

"In this way they would be saved and would save the city. But whenever they acquire private land, houses and money, they'll be householders and farmers instead of guardians, 417b and hostile masters instead of allies of the other citizens. They'll spend their whole lives hating and being hated, plotting and being plotted against, far more afraid, and more often, of the enemies within than of those outside; and by then they and the rest of the city will be racing very close to ruin. So for all

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	οἰκήσεώς τε πέρι καὶ τῶν ἄλλων, καὶ ταῦτα νομοθετήσωμεν, ἢ μή;	these reasons," I said, "shall we say that the guardians must be provided for in this way, with regard to housing and the rest, and shall we make these our laws, or not?"
417b	πάνυ γε, ἦ δ' ὃς ὁ Γλαύκων.	"Certainly," said Glaucon.

Book IV

Justice in the city and in the soul.

GREEK

ENGLISH

419a **SOCRATES** καὶ ὁ Ἀδείμαντος ὑπολαβών, τί οὖν, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἀπολογήσῃ, ἐάν τίς σε φῇ μὴ πάνυ τι εὐδαίμονας ποιεῖν τούτους τοὺς ἄνδρας, καὶ ταῦτα δι' ἑαυτούς, ὧν ἔστι μὲν ἡ πόλις τῇ ἀληθείᾳ, οἱ δὲ μηδὲν ἀπολαύουσιν ἀγαθὸν τῆς πόλεως, οἷον ἄλλοι ἀγρούς τε κεκτημένοι καὶ οἰκίας οἰκοδομούμενοι καλὰς καὶ μεγάλας, καὶ ταύταις πρέπουσαν κατασκευὴν κτώμενοι, καὶ θυσίας θεοῖς ἰδίας θύοντες, καὶ ξενοδοκοῦντες, καὶ δὴ καὶ ἃ νυνδὴ σὺ ἔλεγες, χρυσόν τε καὶ ἄργυρον κεκτημένοι καὶ πάντα ὅσα νομίζεται τοῖς μέλλουσιν μακαρίοις εἶναι;

SOCRATES Adeimantus broke in here. "What will you say in your defense, Socrates," he said, "if someone says you're not making these men very happy at all, and that it's their own doing? The city really belongs to them, and yet they enjoy nothing good from it, as others do who own lands, build fine big houses and acquire furnishings to match, offer private sacrifices to the gods, entertain guests, and, above all, as you were just saying, own gold and silver and everything that's thought necessary for anyone who is going to be blessed.

ἀλλ' ἀτεχνῶς, φαίη ἄν, ὥσπερ ἐπίκουροι μισθωτοὶ ἐν 420a τῇ πόλει φαίνονται καθῆσθαι οὐδὲν ἄλλο ἢ φρουροῦντες.

"Instead, he might say, they seem simply to sit around like hired auxiliaries in 420a the city, doing nothing but standing guard."

ναί, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ ταῦτά γε ἐπισίτιοι καὶ οὐδὲ μισθὸν πρὸς τοῖς σιτίοις λαμβάνοντες ὥσπερ οἱ ἄλλοι, ὥστε οὐδ' ἂν ἀποδημῆσαι βούλωνται ἰδίᾳ, ἐξέσται αὐτοῖς, οὐδ' ἑταίραις διδόναι, οὐδ' ἀναλίσκειν ἄν ποι βούλωνται ἄλλοσε, οἷα δὴ οἱ εὐδαίμονες δοκοῦντες εἶναι ἀναλίσκουσι. ταῦτα καὶ ἄλλα τοιαῦτα συχνὰ τῆς κατηγορίας ἀπολείπεις.

"Yes," I said, "and for their keep alone, without even getting wages on top of their food like the others, so that they can't travel abroad privately if they want to, or give gifts to courtesans, or spend money wherever else they might wish, the way people who are thought happy spend it. These and many other points like them you're leaving out of the charge."

ἀλλ', ἦ δ' ὅς, ἔστω καὶ ταῦτα κατηγορημένα. 420b

"Well," he said, "let these be added to the charge too." 420b

τί οὖν δὴ ἀπολογησόμεθα, φῄς;

"Then you're asking what our defense will be?"

ναί.

"Yes."

420b τὸν αὐτὸν οἶμον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πορευόμενοι εὑρήσομεν, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, ἃ λεκτέα. ἐροῦμεν γὰρ ὅτι θαυμαστὸν μὲν ἂν οὐδὲν εἴη εἰ καὶ οὗτοι οὕτως εὐδαιμονέστατοί εἰσιν, οὐ μὴν πρὸς τοῦτο βλέποντες τὴν πόλιν οἰκίζομεν, ὅπως ἕν τι ἡμῖν ἔθνος ἔσται διαφερόντως εὔδαιμον, ἀλλ' ὅπως ὅτι μάλιστα ὅλη ἡ πόλις. ᾠήθημεν γὰρ ἐν τῇ τοιαύτῃ μάλιστα ἂν εὑρεῖν δικαιοσύνην καὶ αὖ ἐν τῇ κάκιστα οἰκουμένῃ 420c ἀδικίαν, κατιδόντες δὲ κρῖναι ἂν ὃ πάλαι ζητοῦμεν. νῦν μὲν οὖν, ὡς οἰόμεθα, τὴν εὐδαίμονα πλάττομεν οὐκ ἀπολαβόντες ὀλίγους ἐν αὐτῇ τοιούτους τινὰς τιθέντες, ἀλλ' ὅλην· αὐτίκα δὲ τὴν ἐναντίαν σκεψόμεθα.

"If we follow the same path," I said, "we'll find, I think, what to say. We'll say that it wouldn't be surprising if these men too were happiest as they are; but that we aren't founding the city with an eye to making any one group in it exceptionally happy, but the whole city as happy as possible. For we thought that we'd be most likely to find justice in a city like this, and injustice, again, in the worst-governed 420c one, and that by observing them we could decide what we've long been looking for. For now, then, we're shaping what we take to be the happy city—not picking out a few people in it and

GREEK

ENGLISH

making them happy, but the whole. Shortly we'll look at its opposite.

420c ὥσπερ οὖν ἂν εἰ ἡμᾶς ἀνδριάντα γράφοντας προσελθών τις ἔψεγε λέγων ὅτι οὐ τοῖς καλλίστοις τοῦ ζῴου τὰ κάλλιστα φάρμακα προστίθεμεν—οἱ γὰρ ὀφθαλμοὶ κάλλιστον ὂν οὐκ ὀστρείῳ ἐναληλιμμένοι εἶεν ἀλλὰ μέλανι—μετρίως ἂν ἐδοκοῦμεν [420d] πρὸς αὐτὸν ἀπολογεῖσθαι λέγοντες· "ὦ θαυμάσιε, μὴ οἷου δεῖν ἡμᾶς οὕτω καλοὺς ὀφθαλμοὺς γράφειν, ὥστε μηδὲ ὀφθαλμοὺς φαίνεσθαι, μηδ' αὖ τἆλλα μέρη, ἀλλ' ἄθρει εἰ τὰ προσήκοντα ἑκάστοις ἀποδιδόντες τὸ ὅλον καλὸν ποιοῦμεν· καὶ δὴ καὶ νῦν μὴ ἀνάγκαζε ἡμᾶς τοιαύτην εὐδαιμονίαν τοῖς φύλαξι προσάπτειν, ἣ ἐκείνους πᾶν μᾶλλον [420e] ἀπεργάσεται ἢ φύλακας.

"It's as if we were painting a statue and someone came up and criticized us, saying that we weren't putting the most beautiful colors on the most beautiful parts of the figure—the eyes, the most beautiful part, had been painted not purple but black. We'd think it a reasonable defense [420d] to say to him: 'My dear fellow, don't think we should paint the eyes so beautifully that they don't even look like eyes, or the other parts either. Look instead at whether, by giving each part what belongs to it, we make the whole beautiful. And so now, too, don't force us to attach to the guardians the kind of happiness that will make them anything rather [420e] than guardians.

420e ἐπιστάμεθα γὰρ καὶ τοὺς γεωργοὺς ξυστίδας ἀμφιέσαντες καὶ χρυσὸν περιθέντες πρὸς ἡδονὴν ἐργάζεσθαι κελεύειν τὴν γῆν, καὶ τοὺς κεραμέας κατακλίναντες ἐπὶ δεξιὰ πρὸς τὸ πῦρ διαπίνοντάς τε καὶ εὐωχουμένους, τὸν τροχὸν παραθεμένους, ὅσον ἂν ἐπιθυμῶσι κεραμεύειν, καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους πάντας τοιούτῳ τρόπῳ μακαρίους ποιεῖν, ἵνα δὴ ὅλη ἡ πόλις εὐδαιμονῇ."

"'We know how to dress the farmers in fine robes, hang gold on them, and tell them to work the land only as their pleasure dictates; and how to have the potters recline on couches by the fire, passing the cup to the right and feasting, with their wheel set beside them for doing as much pottery as they like; and how to make everyone else blessed in the same way, so that the whole city may be happy.

" ἀλλ' ἡμᾶς μὴ οὕτω νουθέτει· ὡς, ἄν σοι πειθώμεθα, οὔτε ὁ γεωργὸς γεωργὸς [421a] ἔσται οὔτε ὁ κεραμεὺς κεραμεὺς οὔτε ἄλλος οὐδεὶς οὐδὲν ἔχων σχῆμα ἐξ ὧν πόλις γίγνεται. ἀλλὰ τῶν μὲν ἄλλων ἐλάττων λόγος· νευρορράφοι γὰρ φαῦλοι γενόμενοι καὶ διαφθαρέντες καὶ προσποιησάμενοι εἶναι μὴ ὄντες πόλει οὐδὲν δεινόν, φύλακες δὲ νόμων τε καὶ πόλεως μὴ ὄντες ἀλλὰ δοκοῦντες ὁρᾷς δὴ ὅτι πᾶσαν ἄρδην πόλιν ἀπολλύασιν, καὶ αὖ τοῦ εὖ οἰκεῖν καὶ εὐδαιμονεῖν μόνοι τὸν καιρὸν ἔχουσιν." εἰ μὲν οὖν ἡμεῖς μὲν φύλακας ὡς ἀληθῶς [421b] ποιοῦμεν ἥκιστα κακούργους τῆς πόλεως, ὁ δ' ἐκεῖνο λέγων γεωργούς τινας καὶ ὥσπερ ἐν πανηγύρει ἀλλ' οὐκ ἐν πόλει ἑστιάτορας εὐδαίμονας, ἄλλο ἄν τι ἢ πόλιν λέγοι.

"'But don't advise us to do that. For if we listen to you, the farmer won't be a farmer, [421a] nor the potter a potter, nor will anyone else keep any of the roles that make up a city. With the others it matters less: if cobblers become bad and corrupt and pretend to be what they aren't, it's nothing terrible for a city. But guardians of the laws and of the city who aren't really guardians but only seem to be—you see that they destroy the whole city utterly, while they alone, in turn, hold the key to its being well governed and happy.' Now if we are making true guardians, [421b] the least likely to harm the city, while the one who says that other thing is talking about some sort of farmers, happy banqueters as if at a festival rather than in a city, he'd be talking about something other than a city.

421b σκεπτέον οὖν πότερον πρὸς τοῦτο βλέποντες τοὺς φύλακας καθιστῶμεν, ὅπως ὅτι πλείστη αὐτοῖς εὐδαιμονία ἐγγενήσεται, ἢ τοῦτο μὲν εἰς τὴν πόλιν ὅλην βλέποντας θεατέον εἰ ἐκείνῃ ἐγγίγνεται, τοὺς δ' ἐπικούρους τούτους καὶ τοὺς [421c] φύλακας ἐκεῖνο ἀναγκαστέον ποιεῖν καὶ πειστέον, ὅπως ὅτι ἄριστοι δημιουργοὶ τοῦ ἑαυτῶν ἔργου ἔσονται, καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους ἅπαντας ὡσαύτως, καὶ οὕτω συμπάσης τῆς πόλεως

"So we must consider whether, in establishing the guardians, we're aiming at this—that the greatest possible happiness should arise in them—or whether we should look to the city as a whole and see whether happiness arises in it, and compel and persuade these auxiliaries and [421c] guardians to do the other thing: to be the best possible craftsmen at their own work, and the same for everyone

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	αὐξανομένης καὶ καλῶς οἰκιζομένης ἐατέον ὅπως ἑκάστοις τοῖς ἔθνεσιν ἡ φύσις ἀποδίδωσι τοῦ μεταλαμβάνειν εὐδαιμονίας.	else. And so, as the whole city grows and is well founded, we must leave it to nature to give each class its share of happiness."
421c	ἀλλ', ἦ δ' ὅς, καλῶς μοι δοκεῖς λέγειν.	"Well," he said, "I think you put that well."
	ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ τὸ τούτου ἀδελφὸν δόξω σοι μετρίως λέγειν;	"Then will you think I'm speaking reasonably," I said, "if I say something closely related to this as well?"
	τί μάλιστα; 421d	"What exactly?" 421d
	τοὺς ἄλλους αὖ δημιουργοὺς σκόπει εἰ τάδε διαφθείρει, ὥστε καὶ κακοὺς γίγνεσθαι.	"Consider whether the following things corrupt the other craftsmen too, so that they actually become bad."
	τὰ ποῖα δὴ ταῦτα;	"What things are these?"
	πλοῦτος, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ πενία.	"Wealth," I said, "and poverty."
	πῶς δή;	"How so?"
	ὧδε. πλουτήσας χυτρεὺς δοκεῖ σοι ἔτ' ἐθελήσειν ἐπιμελεῖσθαι τῆς τέχνης;	"Like this. Once a potter gets rich, do you think he'll still be willing to attend to his craft?"
	οὐδαμῶς, ἔφη.	"Not at all," he said.
	Ἀργὸς δὲ καὶ ἀμελὴς γενήσεται μᾶλλον αὐτὸς αὑτοῦ;	"Won't he become lazier and more careless than he used to be?"
	πολύ γε.	"Much."
	οὐκοῦν κακίων χυτρεὺς γίγνεται;	"So he becomes a worse potter?"
	καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφη, πολύ.	"Yes," he said, "much worse."
421d	καὶ μὴν καὶ ὄργανά γε μὴ ἔχων παρέχεσθαι ὑπὸ πενίας ἤ τι ἄλλο τῶν εἰς τὴν τέχνην τά τε ἔργα πονηρότερα 421e ἐργάσεται καὶ τοὺς υἱεῖς ἢ ἄλλους οὓς ἂν διδάσκῃ χείρους δημιουργοὺς διδάξεται.	"And then again, if poverty leaves him unable to provide himself with tools or anything else his craft needs, the work he turns out will be shoddier, 421e and he'll teach his sons, or whoever else he teaches, to be worse craftsmen."
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	ὑπ' ἀμφοτέρων δή, πενίας τε καὶ πλούτου, χείρω μὲν τὰ τῶν τεχνῶν ἔργα, χείρους δὲ αὐτοί.	"So from both of them, poverty and wealth, the products of the crafts get worse, and so do the craftsmen themselves."
	φαίνεται.	"Evidently."
	ἕτερα δή, ὡς ἔοικε, τοῖς φύλαξιν ηὑρήκαμεν, ἃ παντὶ τρόπῳ φυλακτέον ὅπως μήποτε αὐτοὺς λήσει εἰς τὴν πόλιν παραδύντα.	"Then it seems we've found other things for the guardians, which they must guard against in every way, so that these never slip into the city without their noticing."
	τὰ ποῖα ταῦτα;	"What are they?"

WEALTH, POVERTY AND THE UNITY OF THE CITY

Socrates says the city must avoid both wealth and poverty, stay unified and protect its education.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
422a		**SOCRATES** "Wealth," I said, "and poverty. The one produces luxury, idleness, and revolution; the oth-

GREEK	ENGLISH
SOCRATES πλοῦτός τε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ πενία· ὡς τοῦ μὲν τρυφὴν καὶ ἀργίαν καὶ νεωτερισμὸν ἐμποιοῦντος, τῆς δὲ ἀνελευθερίαν καὶ κακοεργίαν πρὸς τῷ νεωτερισμῷ.	er, meanness and bad workmanship, as well as revolution."
πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη. τόδε μέντοι, ὦ Σώκρατες, σκόπει, πῶς ἡμῖν ἡ πόλις οἵα τ' ἔσται πολεμεῖν, ἐπειδὰν χρήματα μὴ κεκτημένη ᾖ, ἄλλως τε κἂν πρὸς μεγάλην τε καὶ πλουσίαν ἀναγκασθῇ πολεμεῖν.	"Certainly," he said. "But consider this, Socrates. How will our city be able to wage war when it has no money, especially if it's forced to fight a large and wealthy city?"
δῆλον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι πρὸς μὲν μίαν χαλεπώτερον, 422b πρὸς δὲ δύο τοιαύτας ῥᾷον.	"Clearly," I said, "against one such city it's harder, 422b but against two it's easier."
πῶς εἶπες; ἦ δ' ὅς.	"What do you mean?" he said.
422b πρῶτον μέν που, εἶπον, ἐὰν δέῃ μάχεσθαι, ἆρα οὐ πλουσίοις ἀνδράσι μαχοῦνται αὐτοὶ ὄντες πολέμου ἀθληταί;	"First of all," I said, "if they have to fight, won't they be fighting against rich men, while they themselves are athletes of war?"
ναὶ τοῦτό γε, ἔφη.	"Yes, that much is true," he said.
τί οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Ἀδείμαντε; εἷς πύκτης ὡς οἷόν τε κάλλιστα ἐπὶ τοῦτο παρεσκευασμένος δυοῖν μὴ πύκταιν, πλουσίοιν δὲ καὶ πιόνοιν, οὐκ ἂν δοκεῖ σοι ῥᾳδίως μάχεσθαι;	"Well then, Adeimantus," I said, "don't you think one boxer, trained as well as possible for the job, could easily fight two men who aren't boxers but are rich and fat?"
οὐκ ἂν ἴσως, ἔφη, ἅμα γε.	"Maybe not both at once," he said.
οὐδ' εἰ ἐξείη, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὑποφεύγοντι τὸν πρότερον ἀεὶ 422c προσφερόμενον ἀναστρέφοντα κρούειν, καὶ τοῦτο ποιοῖ πολλάκις ἐν ἡλίῳ τε καὶ πνίγει; ἆρά γε οὐ καὶ πλείους χειρώσαιτ' ἂν τοιούτους ὁ τοιοῦτος;	"Not even," I said, "if he could retreat and then turn and strike whichever one 422c came at him first, and did this again and again in the blazing sun and stifling heat? Wouldn't a man like that overpower even more than two of them?"
ἀμέλει, ἔφη, οὐδὲν ἂν γένοιτο θαυμαστόν.	"No doubt," he said. "That would be nothing surprising."
ἀλλ' οὐκ οἴει πυκτικῆς πλέον μετέχειν τοὺς πλουσίους ἐπιστήμῃ τε καὶ ἐμπειρίᾳ ἢ πολεμικῆς;	"And don't you think the rich have more share, in knowledge and experience, in boxing than in warfare?"
ἔγωγ', ἔφη.	"I do," he said.
ῥᾳδίως ἄρα ἡμῖν οἱ ἀθληταὶ ἐκ τῶν εἰκότων διπλασίοις τε καὶ τριπλασίοις αὑτῶν μαχοῦνται.	"Then in all likelihood our athletes will easily fight twice or three times their own number."
συγχωρήσομαί σοι, ἔφη· δοκεῖς γάρ μοι ὀρθῶς λέγειν. 422d	"I'll grant you that," he said, "since I think you're right." 422d
422d τί δ' ἂν πρεσβείαν πέμψαντες εἰς τὴν ἑτέραν πόλιν τἀληθῆ εἴπωσιν, ὅτι "ἡμεῖς μὲν οὐδὲν χρυσίῳ οὐδ' ἀργυρίῳ χρώμεθα, οὐδ' ἡμῖν θέμις, ὑμῖν δέ· συμπολεμήσαντες οὖν μεθ' ἡμῶν ἔχετε τὰ τῶν ἑτέρων;" οἴει τινὰς ἀκούσαντας ταῦτα αἱρήσεσθαι κυσὶ πολεμεῖν στερεοῖς τε καὶ ἰσχνοῖς μᾶλλον ἢ μετὰ κυνῶν προβάτοις πίοσί τε καὶ ἁπαλοῖς;	"And what if they send an embassy to the other city and tell the truth: 'We have no use for gold or silver, nor is it lawful for us, though it is for you. So join us in the war, and keep what belongs to the other side'? Do you think anyone who heard that would choose to make war on hard, lean dogs rather than join the dogs against fat, tender sheep?"
οὔ μοι δοκεῖ. ἀλλ' ἐὰν εἰς μίαν, ἔφη, πόλιν συναθροισθῇ 422e τὰ τῶν ἄλλων χρήματα, ὅρα μὴ κίνδυνον φέρῃ τῇ μὴ πλουτούσῃ.	"I don't think so. But if the wealth of all the others," he said, "is gathered into a single city, 422e

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		watch out that it doesn't pose a danger to the city that isn't wealthy."
422e	εὐδαίμων εἶ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι οἴει ἄξιον εἶναι ἄλλην τινὰ προσειπεῖν πόλιν ἢ τὴν τοιαύτην οἵαν ἡμεῖς κατεσκευάζομεν.	"How fortunate you are," I said, "to think anything deserves to be called a city other than the sort we've been founding."
	ἀλλὰ τί μήν; ἔφη.	"Why, what else?" he said.
	μειζόνως, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, χρὴ προσαγορεύειν τὰς ἄλλας· ἑκάστη γὰρ αὐτῶν πόλεις εἰσὶ πάμπολλαι ἀλλ' οὐ πόλις, τὸ τῶν παιζόντων.	"The others," I said, "need a bigger name. Each of them is a great many cities, not a city, as in the game.[1]
	δύο μέν, κἂν ὁτιοῦν ᾖ, πολεμία ἀλλήλαις, [423a] ἡ μὲν πενήτων, ἡ δὲ πλουσίων· τούτων δ' ἐν ἑκατέρᾳ πάνυ πολλαί, αἷς ἐὰν μὲν ὡς μιᾷ προσφέρῃ, παντὸς ἂν ἁμάρτοις, ἐὰν δὲ ὡς πολλαῖς, διδοὺς τὰ τῶν ἑτέρων τοῖς ἑτέροις χρήματά τε καὶ δυνάμεις ἢ καὶ αὐτούς, συμμάχοις μὲν ἀεὶ πολλοῖς χρήσῃ, πολεμίοις δ' ὀλίγοις. καὶ ἕως ἂν ἡ πόλις σοι οἰκῇ σωφρόνως ὡς ἄρτι ἐτάχθη, μεγίστη ἔσται, οὐ τῷ εὐδοκιμεῖν λέγω, ἀλλ' ὡς ἀληθῶς μεγίστη, καὶ ἐὰν μόνον ᾖ χιλίων τῶν προπολεμούντων· οὕτω γὰρ μεγάλην πόλιν μίαν οὐ ῥᾳδίως οὔτε ἐν Ἕλλησιν οὔτε ἐν βαρβάροις [423b] εὑρήσεις, δοκούσας δὲ πολλὰς καὶ πολλαπλασίας τῆς τηλικαύτης. ἢ ἄλλως οἴει;	"Whatever else is true, each contains two, at war with each other, [423a] one of the poor and one of the rich, and within each of these there are a great many. If you treat them as one, you'll miss the mark entirely; but if you treat them as many, handing over the money and power, or even the persons, of one group to the others, you'll always have many allies and few enemies. And as long as your city is governed with moderation, in the way it was just now arranged, it will be the greatest—I don't mean in reputation, but truly the greatest—even if it has only a thousand men to fight for it. You won't easily find a single city so great among either Greeks or non-Greeks, [423b] though you'll find many that seem to be, and many times its size. Or do you think otherwise?"
423b	οὐ μὰ τὸν Δί', ἔφη.	"No, by Zeus," he said.
	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὗτος ἂν εἴη καὶ κάλλιστος ὅρος τοῖς ἡμετέροις ἄρχουσιν, ὅσην δεῖ τὸ μέγεθος τὴν πόλιν ποιεῖσθαι καὶ ἡλίκῃ οὔσῃ ὅσην χώραν ἀφορισαμένους τὴν ἄλλην χαίρειν ἐᾶν.	"Then this would also be the best limit for our rulers," I said, "on how large they should make the city, and how much land they should mark off for a city of that size, letting the rest go."
	τίς, ἔφη, ὅρος;	"What limit?" he said.
	οἶμαι μέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τόνδε· μέχρι οὗ ἂν ἐθέλῃ αὐξομένη εἶναι μία, μέχρι τούτου αὔξειν, πέρα δὲ μή. [423c]	"I think," I said, "this one: let it grow as far as it can while still being one, and no further." [423c]
	καὶ καλῶς γ', ἔφη.	"And a fine one," he said.
423c	οὐκοῦν καὶ τοῦτο αὖ ἄλλο πρόσταγμα τοῖς φύλαξι προστάξομεν, φυλάττειν παντὶ τρόπῳ ὅπως μήτε σμικρὰ ἡ πόλις ἔσται μήτε μεγάλη δοκοῦσα, ἀλλά τις ἱκανὴ καὶ μία.	"Then we'll give the guardians this further order as well: to guard in every way against the city's being either small or great in appearance only; it must be adequate, and one."
	καὶ φαῦλόν γ', ἔφη, ἴσως αὐτοῖς προστάξομεν.	"And a trivial order, I suppose," he said, "that we'll be giving them."
	καὶ τούτου γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἔτι φαυλότερον τόδε, οὗ καὶ ἐν τῷ πρόσθεν ἐπεμνήσθημεν λέγοντες ὡς δέοι, ἐάντε τῶν φυλάκων τις φαῦλος ἔκγονος γένηται, εἰς τοὺς ἄλλους	"And here's one still more trivial," I said, "which we mentioned earlier, when we said that if an inferior child is born to the guardians, it must be

1 Probably an allusion to a board game called "Cities," whose board was divided into many small "cities."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	[423d] αὐτὸν ἀποπέμπεσθαι, ἐάντ' ἐκ τῶν ἄλλων σπουδαῖος, εἰς τοὺς φύλακας. τοῦτο δ' ἐβούλετο δηλοῦν ὅτι καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους πολίτας, πρὸς ὅ τις πέφυκεν, πρὸς τοῦτο ἕνα πρὸς ἓν ἕκαστον ἔργον δεῖ κομίζειν, ὅπως ἂν ἓν τὸ αὑτοῦ ἐπιτηδεύων ἕκαστος μὴ πολλοὶ ἀλλ' εἷς γίγνηται, καὶ οὕτω δὴ σύμπασα ἡ πόλις μία φύηται ἀλλὰ μὴ πολλαί.	sent off [423d] to the others, and if a good one is born to the others, it must go to the guardians. This was meant to show that the other citizens too must each be brought to the one job each is naturally suited for, so that each, practicing his own single pursuit, may become not many but one, and so the whole city may grow to be one and not many."
	ἔστι γάρ, ἔφη, τοῦτο ἐκείνου σμικρότερον.	"Yes," he said, "that's a smaller matter than the other."
423d	οὗτοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ ἀγαθὲ Ἀδείμαντε, ὡς δόξειεν ἄν τις, ταῦτα πολλὰ καὶ μεγάλα αὐτοῖς προστάττομεν ἀλλὰ [423e] πάντα φαῦλα, ἐὰν τὸ λεγόμενον ἓν μέγα φυλάττωσι, μᾶλλον δ' ἀντὶ μεγάλου ἱκανόν.	"Really, my good Adeimantus," I said, "these orders we're giving them aren't, as someone might think, many and great; [423e] they're all trivial, provided they guard the one great thing, as the saying goes—or rather, not great but sufficient."
	τί τοῦτο; ἔφη.	"What's that?" he said.
	τὴν παιδείαν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ τροφήν· ἐὰν γὰρ εὖ παιδευόμενοι μέτριοι ἄνδρες γίγνωνται, πάντα ταῦτα ῥᾳδίως διόψονται, καὶ ἄλλα γε ὅσα νῦν ἡμεῖς παραλείπομεν, τήν τε τῶν γυναικῶν κτῆσιν καὶ γάμων καὶ παιδοποιίας, ὅτι [424a] δεῖ ταῦτα κατὰ τὴν παροιμίαν πάντα ὅτι μάλιστα κοινὰ τὰ φίλων ποιεῖσθαι.	"Education," I said, "and upbringing. If they're well educated and become reasonable men, they'll easily see through all this, and other things we're passing over now: the possession of women, marriage, and having children—that [424a] all these must be made, as far as possible, 'common among friends,' as the proverb has it."
	ὀρθότατα γάρ, ἔφη, γίγνοιτ' ἄν.	"Yes," he said, "that would be the most correct way."
424a	καὶ μήν, εἶπον, πολιτεία ἐάνπερ ἅπαξ ὁρμήσῃ εὖ, ἔρχεται ὥσπερ κύκλος αὐξανομένη· τροφὴ γὰρ καὶ παίδευσις χρηστὴ σῳζομένη φύσεις ἀγαθὰς ἐμποιεῖ, καὶ αὖ φύσεις χρησταὶ τοιαύτης παιδείας ἀντιλαμβανόμεναι ἔτι βελτίους τῶν προτέρων φύονται, εἴς τε τἆλλα καὶ εἰς τὸ [424b] γεννᾶν, ὥσπερ καὶ ἐν τοῖς ἄλλοις ζῴοις.	"What's more," I said, "once a constitution gets off to a good start, it keeps growing, like a circle. Good upbringing and education, when preserved, produce good natures, and good natures in turn, taking hold of such an education, grow up better than those before them, in other respects and also in [424b] producing offspring, just as with other animals."
	εἰκός γ', ἔφη.	"That's likely," he said.
424b	ὡς τοίνυν διὰ βραχέων εἰπεῖν, τούτου ἀνθεκτέον τοῖς ἐπιμεληταῖς τῆς πόλεως, ὅπως ἂν αὐτοὺς μὴ λάθῃ διαφθαρὲν ἀλλὰ παρὰ πάντα αὐτὸ φυλάττωσι, τὸ μὴ νεωτερίζειν περὶ γυμναστικήν τε καὶ μουσικὴν παρὰ τὴν τάξιν, ἀλλ' ὡς οἷόν τε μάλιστα φυλάττειν, φοβουμένους ὅταν τις λέγῃ ὡς τὴν ἀοιδὴν μᾶλλον ἐπιφρονέουσ' ἄνθρωποι, ἥτις ἀειδόντεσσι νεωτάτη ἀμφιπέληται, [424c] μὴ πολλάκις τὸν ποιητήν τις οἴηται λέγειν οὐκ ᾄσματα νέα ἀλλὰ τρόπον ᾠδῆς νέον, καὶ τοῦτο ἐπαινῇ. δεῖ δ' οὔτ' ἐπαινεῖν τὸ τοιοῦτον οὔτε ὑπολαμβάνειν. εἶδος γὰρ καινὸν μουσικῆς μεταβάλλειν εὐλαβητέον ὡς ἐν ὅλῳ κινδυνεύοντα· οὐδαμοῦ γὰρ κινοῦνται μουσικῆς τρόποι ἄνευ πολιτικῶν νόμων τῶν μεγίστων, ὥς φησί τε Δάμων καὶ ἐγὼ πείθομαι.	"To put it briefly, then, those in charge of the city must hold fast to this, and guard it above everything, so that it isn't corrupted without their noticing: there must be no innovation in gymnastics and music contrary to the established order; they must guard it as closely as they can. And whenever someone says that people care most for the song 'that circles newest among the singers,' they must be afraid [424c] that people may take the poet to mean not new songs but a new manner of song, and praise that. One shouldn't praise such a thing, or take the poet that way. For one must beware of changing to a new form of music, since

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		this puts everything at risk: the modes of music are never disturbed without the greatest laws of the city being disturbed too, as Damon says and as I'm convinced."[2]
424c	καὶ ἐμὲ τοίνυν, ἔφη ὁ Ἀδείμαντος, θὲς τῶν πεπεισμένων. 424d	"Count me among the convinced as well," said Adeimantus. 424d
	τὸ δὴ φυλακτήριον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἐνταῦθά που οἰκοδομητέον τοῖς φύλαξιν, ἐν μουσικῇ.	"So it seems," I said, "that the guardians must build their guardhouse somewhere here, in music."
	ἡ γοῦν παρανομία, ἔφη, ῥᾳδίως αὕτη λανθάνει παραδυομένη.	"Lawlessness of this kind, anyway," he said, "easily slips in unnoticed."
	ναί, ἔφην, ὡς ἐν παιδιᾶς γε μέρει καὶ ὡς κακὸν οὐδὲν ἐργαζομένη.	"Yes," I said, "as if it were just a form of play and did no harm."
424d	οὐδὲ γὰρ ἐργάζεται, ἔφη, ἄλλο γε ἢ κατὰ σμικρὸν εἰσοικισαμένη ἠρέμα ὑπορρεῖ πρὸς τὰ ἤθη τε καὶ τὰ ἐπιτηδεύματα· ἐκ δὲ τούτων εἰς τὰ πρὸς ἀλλήλους συμβόλαια μείζων ἐκβαίνει, ἐκ δὲ δὴ τῶν συμβολαίων ἔρχεται ἐπὶ 424e τοὺς νόμους καὶ πολιτείας σὺν πολλῇ, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἀσελγείᾳ, ἕως ἂν τελευτῶσα πάντα ἰδίᾳ καὶ δημοσίᾳ ἀνατρέψῃ.	"And it doesn't do any," he said, "except that, having settled in little by little, it quietly seeps into people's characters and ways of life. From these it emerges, grown larger, into their dealings with one another; and from their dealings, Socrates, it advances on 424e the laws and constitutions with great insolence, until in the end it overturns everything, private and public."
	εἶεν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· οὕτω τοῦτ' ἔχει;	"Well," I said, "is that really how it is?"
	δοκεῖ μοι, ἔφη.	"I think so," he said.
424e	οὐκοῦν, ὃ ἐξ ἀρχῆς ἐλέγομεν, τοῖς ἡμετέροις παισὶν ἐννομωτέρου εὐθὺς παιδιᾶς μεθεκτέον, ὡς παρανόμου γιγνομένης αὐτῆς καὶ παίδων τοιούτων ἐννόμους τε καὶ σπουδαίους 425a ἐξ αὐτῶν ἄνδρας αὐξάνεσθαι ἀδύνατον ὄν;	"Then, as we said at the start, mustn't our children take part in more lawful play right from the beginning, since if play becomes lawless, and the children too, it's impossible for them to grow up into law-abiding and serious 425a men?"
	πῶς δ' οὐχί; ἔφη.	"Of course," he said.
	ὅταν δὴ ἄρα καλῶς ἀρξάμενοι παῖδες παίζειν εὐνομίαν διὰ τῆς μουσικῆς εἰσδέξωνται, πάλιν τοὐναντίον ἢ ἐκεῖνοις εἰς πάντα συνέπεταί τε καὶ αὔξει, ἐπανορθοῦσα εἴ τι καὶ πρότερον τῆς πόλεως ἔκειτο.	"So when children make a good start in their play and take in good order through music, then—the reverse of the others—it goes with them in everything and makes them grow, setting right anything in the city that had fallen before."
	ἀληθῆ μέντοι, ἔφη.	"That's true," he said.
	καὶ τὰ σμικρὰ ἄρα, εἶπον, δοκοῦντα εἶναι νόμιμα ἐξευρίσκουσιν οὗτοι, ἃ οἱ πρότερον ἀπώλλυσαν πάντα.	"And so these people also rediscover the seemingly minor customs that their predecessors had entirely lost."
	τὰ ποῖα; 425b	"What sort?" 425b
425b	τὰ τοιάδε· σιγάς τε τῶν νεωτέρων παρὰ πρεσβυτέροις ἃς πρέπει, καὶ κατακλίσεις καὶ ὑπαναστάσεις καὶ γονέων θεραπείας, καὶ κουράς γε καὶ ἀμπεχόνας καὶ ὑποδέσεις	"Things like these: the silence the young should keep in the presence of their elders; giving up their places to them and standing up when they come in; taking care of parents; and also haircuts,

2 The verse adapts Homer, *Odyssey* 1.351–2.

GREEK	ENGLISH
καὶ ὅλον τὸν τοῦ σώματος σχηματισμὸν καὶ τἆλλα ὅσα τοιαῦτα. ἢ οὐκ οἴει;	clothes, shoes, and the whole bearing of the body, and everything else of the kind. Don't you think so?"
ἔγωγε.	"I do."
νομοθετεῖν δ' αὐτὰ οἶμαι εὔηθες· οὔτε γάρ που γίγνεται οὔτ' ἂν μείνειεν λόγῳ τε καὶ γράμμασιν νομοθετηθέντα.	"But I think it's naive to legislate about them. Such rules surely don't come about, and wouldn't last, if they're laid down in words and in writing."
πῶς γάρ;	"How could they?"
κινδυνεύει γοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Ἀδείμαντε, ἐκ τῆς παιδείας [425c] ὅποι ἄν τις ὁρμήσῃ, τοιαῦτα καὶ τὰ ἑπόμενα εἶναι. ἢ οὐκ ἀεὶ τὸ ὅμοιον ὂν ὁμοίου παρακαλεῖ;	"It looks, at any rate, Adeimantus," I said, "as if the direction someone sets out in from education [425c] determines what follows. Doesn't like always summon like?"
425c τί μήν;	"Of course."
καὶ τελευτῶν δὴ οἶμαι φαῖμεν ἂν εἰς ἕν τι τέλεον καὶ νεανικὸν ἀποβαίνειν αὐτὸ ἢ ἀγαθὸν ἢ καὶ τοὐναντίον.	"And in the end, I think, we'd say it turns out as one complete and vigorous whole, either good or the opposite."
τί γὰρ οὔκ; ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Why not?" he said.
ἐγὼ μὲν τοίνυν, εἶπον, διὰ ταῦτα οὐκ ἂν ἔτι τὰ τοιαῦτα ἐπιχειρήσαιμι νομοθετεῖν.	"That's why," I said, "I wouldn't try any longer to legislate about such things."
εἰκότως γ', ἔφη.	"Reasonably enough," he said.
τί δέ, ὦ πρὸς θεῶν, ἔφην, τάδε τὰ ἀγοραῖα, συμβολαίων τε πέρι κατ' ἀγορὰν ἕκαστοι ἃ πρὸς ἀλλήλους συμβάλλουσιν, [425d] εἰ δὲ βούλει, καὶ χειροτεχνικῶν περὶ συμβολαίων καὶ λοιδοριῶν καὶ αἰκίας καὶ δικῶν λήξεως καὶ δικαστῶν καταστάσεως, καὶ εἴ που τελῶν τινες ἢ πράξεις ἢ θέσεις ἀναγκαῖοί εἰσιν ἢ κατ' ἀγορὰς ἢ λιμένας, ἢ καὶ τὸ παράπαν ἀγορανομικὰ ἄττα ἢ ἀστυνομικὰ ἢ ἐλλιμενικὰ ἢ ὅσα ἄλλα τοιαῦτα, τούτων τολμήσομέν τι νομοθετεῖν;	"And, for heaven's sake," I said, "what about business matters: the contracts people make with one another in the marketplace, [425d] and, if you like, contracts for manual work, slander and assault, the filing of lawsuits and the appointment of jurors, and any tolls that may need to be collected or imposed in markets or harbors, and in general all the regulations of markets, city, and harbors, and everything else of the kind—shall we venture to legislate about any of that?"
ἀλλ' οὐκ ἄξιον, ἔφη, ἀνδράσι καλοῖς κἀγαθοῖς ἐπιτάττειν· [425e] τὰ πολλὰ γὰρ αὐτῶν, ὅσα δεῖ νομοθετήσασθαι, ῥᾳδίως που εὑρήσουσιν.	"No," he said, "it isn't worth dictating to men who are fine and good. [425e] They'll easily find out for themselves, I imagine, most of what needs to be legislated."
425e ναί, ὦ φίλε, εἶπον, ἐάν γε θεὸς αὐτοῖς διδῷ σωτηρίαν τῶν νόμων ὧν ἔμπροσθεν διήλθομεν.	"Yes, my friend," I said, "if a god grants them the preservation of the laws we went through before."
εἰ δὲ μή γε, ἦ δ' ὅς, πολλὰ τοιαῦτα τιθέμενοι ἀεὶ καὶ ἐπανορθούμενοι τὸν βίον διατελοῦσιν, οἰόμενοι ἐπιλήψεσθαι τοῦ βελτίστου.	"If not," he said, "they'll spend their lives constantly laying down many such rules and amending them, thinking they'll hit on the best."
λέγεις, ἔφην ἐγώ, βιώσεσθαι τοὺς τοιούτους ὥσπερ τοὺς κάμνοντάς τε καὶ οὐκ ἐθέλοντας ὑπὸ ἀκολασίας ἐκβῆναι πονηρᾶς διαίτης.	"You mean," I said, "that such people will live like those who are sick but, from intemperance, unwilling to give up a bad way of life."
πάνυ μὲν οὖν. [426a]	"Exactly." [426a]
καὶ μὴν οὗτοί γε χαριέντως διατελοῦσιν· ἰατρευόμενοι γὰρ οὐδὲν περαίνουσιν, πλήν γε ποικιλώτερα καὶ μείζω	"And a charming life they lead! For all their doctoring they achieve nothing, except to make their

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ποιοῦσι τὰ νοσήματα, καὶ ἀεὶ ἐλπίζοντες, ἐάν τις φάρμακον συμβουλεύσῃ, ὑπὸ τούτου ἔσεσθαι ὑγιεῖς.	illnesses more complicated and worse, and they're always hoping that whatever drug someone recommends will make them healthy."
426a	πάνυ γάρ, ἔφη, τῶν οὕτω καμνόντων τὰ τοιαῦτα πάθη.	"Yes," he said, "that's just how people ill in that way behave."
	τί δέ; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· τόδε αὐτῶν οὐ χαρίεν, τὸ πάντων ἔχθιστον ἡγεῖσθαι τὸν τἀληθῆ λέγοντα, ὅτι πρὶν ἂν μεθύων καὶ ἐμπιμπλάμενος καὶ ἀφροδισιάζων καὶ ἀργῶν παύσηται, [426b] οὔτε φάρμακα οὔτε καύσεις οὔτε τομαὶ οὐδ' αὖ ἐπῳδαὶ αὐτὸν οὐδὲ περίαπτα οὐδὲ ἄλλο τῶν τοιούτων οὐδὲν ὀνήσει;	"Well," I said, "and isn't this charming of them: they regard as their worst enemy the person who tells them the truth—that until they stop drinking, gorging, indulging in sex, and idling, [426b] neither drugs nor cautery nor surgery, nor spells or amulets or anything else of the kind, will do them any good?"
	οὐ πάνυ χαρίεν, ἔφη· τὸ γὰρ τῷ εὖ λέγοντι χαλεπαίνειν οὐκ ἔχει χάριν.	"Not charming at all," he said. "There's nothing charming about being angry with someone who gives good advice."
	οὐκ ἐπαινέτης εἶ, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὡς ἔοικας, τῶν τοιούτων ἀνδρῶν.	"You don't seem to be an admirer of such men," I said.
	οὐ μέντοι μὰ Δία.	"No, by Zeus, I'm not."
426b	οὐδ' ἂν ἡ πόλις ἄρα, ὅπερ ἄρτι ἐλέγομεν, ὅλη τοιοῦτον ποιῇ, οὐκ ἐπαινέσῃ. ἢ οὐ φαίνονταί σοι ταὐτὸν ἐργάζεσθαι τούτοις τῶν πόλεων ὅσαι κακῶς πολιτευόμεναι προαγορεύουσι [426c] τοῖς πολίταις τὴν μὲν κατάστασιν τῆς πόλεως ὅλην μὴ κινεῖν, ὡς ἀποθανουμένους, ὃς ἂν τοῦτο δρᾷ· ὃς δ' ἂν σφᾶς οὕτω πολιτευομένους ἥδιστα θεραπεύῃ καὶ χαρίζηται ὑποτρέχων καὶ προγιγνώσκων τὰς σφετέρας βουλήσεις καὶ ταύτας δεινὸς ᾖ ἀποπληροῦν, οὗτος ἆρα ἀγαθός τε ἔσται ἀνὴρ καὶ σοφὸς τὰ μεγάλα καὶ τιμήσεται ὑπὸ σφῶν;	"Then you won't admire the city either, as we were just saying, if as a whole it does this sort of thing. Or don't you think the badly governed cities are doing the same as these men, when they warn [426c] their citizens not to disturb the city's whole established order, on pain of death for anyone who does, while whoever serves them most pleasantly as they're governed this way, and gratifies them by fawning on them, anticipating their wishes and being clever at fulfilling them—he's the one who'll be a good man and wise in great matters, and honored by them?"
	ταὐτὸν μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, ἔμοιγε δοκοῦσι δρᾶν, καὶ οὐδ' ὁπωστιοῦν ἐπαινῶ. [426d]	"Yes," he said, "I think they do the same, and I don't approve of it in the least." [426d]
426d	τί δ' αὖ τοὺς ἐθέλοντας θεραπεύειν τὰς τοιαύτας πόλεις καὶ προθυμουμένους; οὐκ ἄγασαι τῆς ἀνδρείας τε καὶ εὐχερείας;	"And what about those who are willing, even eager, to serve such cities? Don't you admire their courage and readiness?"
	ἔγωγ', ἔφη, πλήν γ' ὅσοι ἐξηπάτηνται ὑπ' αὐτῶν καὶ οἴονται τῇ ἀληθείᾳ πολιτικοὶ εἶναι, ὅτι ἐπαινοῦνται ὑπὸ τῶν πολλῶν.	"I do," he said, "except for those who've been taken in by them and think they're truly statesmen because the many praise them."
	πῶς λέγεις; οὐ συγγιγνώσκεις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοῖς ἀνδράσιν; ἢ οἴει οἷόν τ' εἶναι ἀνδρὶ μὴ ἐπισταμένῳ μετρεῖν, ἑτέρων [426e] τοιούτων πολλῶν λεγόντων ὅτι τετράπηχύς ἐστιν, αὐτὸν ταῦτα μὴ ἡγεῖσθαι περὶ αὑτοῦ;	"What do you mean? Don't you forgive the men?" I said. "Or do you think it's possible for a man who doesn't know how to measure, when many others [426e] like him tell him he's six feet tall, not to believe it about himself?"
	οὐκ αὖ, ἔφη, τοῦτό γε.	"No," he said, "not that, anyway."
426e		

GREEK

μὴ τοίνυν χαλέπαινε· καὶ γάρ πού εἰσι πάντων χαριέστατοι οἱ τοιοῦτοι, νομοθετοῦντές τε οἷα ἄρτι διήλθομεν καὶ ἐπανορθοῦντες, ἀεὶ οἰόμενοί τι πέρας εὑρήσειν περὶ τὰ ἐν τοῖς συμβολαίοις κακουργήματα καὶ περὶ ἃ νυνδὴ ἐγὼ ἔλεγον, ἀγνοοῦντες ὅτι τῷ ὄντι ὥσπερ Ὕδραν τέμνουσιν.

καὶ μήν, ἔφη, οὐκ ἄλλο γέ τι ποιοῦσιν.

427a ἐγὼ μὲν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ τοιοῦτον εἶδος νόμων πέρι καὶ πολιτείας οὔτ' ἐν κακῶς οὔτ' ἐν εὖ πολιτευομένῃ πόλει ᾤμην ἂν δεῖν τὸν ἀληθινὸν νομοθέτην πραγματεύεσθαι, ἐν τῇ μὲν ὅτι ἀνωφελῆ καὶ πλέον οὐδέν, ἐν δὲ τῇ ὅτι τὰ μὲν αὐτῶν κἂν ὁστισοῦν εὕροι, τὰ δὲ ὅτι αὐτόματα ἕπεισιν ἐκ τῶν ἔμπροσθεν ἐπιτηδευμάτων. 427b

τί οὖν, ἔφη, ἔτι ἂν ἡμῖν λοιπὸν τῆς νομοθεσίας εἴη;

καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον ὅτι ἡμῖν μὲν οὐδέν, τῷ μέντοι Ἀπόλλωνι τῷ ἐν Δελφοῖς τά γε μέγιστα καὶ κάλλιστα καὶ πρῶτα τῶν νομοθετημάτων.

427b τὰ ποῖα; ἦ δ' ὅς.

ἱερῶν τε ἱδρύσεις καὶ θυσίαι καὶ ἄλλαι θεῶν τε καὶ δαιμόνων καὶ ἡρώων θεραπεῖαι· τελευτησάντων τε αὖ θῆκαι καὶ ὅσα τοῖς ἐκεῖ δεῖ ὑπηρετοῦντας ἵλεως αὐτοὺς ἔχειν. τὰ γὰρ δὴ τοιαῦτα οὔτ' ἐπιστάμεθα ἡμεῖς οἰκίζοντές τε πόλιν 427c οὐδενὶ ἄλλῳ πεισόμεθα, ἐὰν νοῦν ἔχωμεν, οὐδὲ χρησόμεθα ἐξηγητῇ ἀλλ' ἢ τῷ πατρίῳ· οὗτος γὰρ δήπου ὁ θεὸς περὶ τὰ τοιαῦτα πᾶσιν ἀνθρώποις πάτριος ἐξηγητὴς ἐν μέσῳ τῆς γῆς ἐπὶ τοῦ ὀμφαλοῦ καθήμενος ἐξηγεῖται.

καὶ καλῶς γ', ἔφη, λέγεις· καὶ ποιητέον οὕτω.

ENGLISH

"Then don't be hard on them. Surely such people are the most charming of all: they legislate on the sort of things we just went through and keep amending them, always thinking they'll find some end to the wrongdoing in contracts and the other things I was just talking about, not knowing that in reality they're cutting at a Hydra."

"Yes," he said, "that's exactly what they're doing."

"So I, for my part," I said, "wouldn't have thought the true lawgiver should trouble himself with this kind of law and constitution, whether the city is badly governed or well—in the one because it's useless and achieves nothing, in the other because some of it anyone at all could discover, and the rest follows of its own accord from the practices already established." 427b

"Then what," he said, "would still be left for us in the way of legislation?"

And I said, "For us, nothing; but for Apollo at Delphi, the greatest, finest, and first of laws."

"What are they?" he said.

"The founding of temples, sacrifices, and other forms of service to gods, divinities, and heroes; and again, the burial of the dead, and all the services we must render to those in the other world to keep them gracious. We ourselves know nothing about such things, and in founding a city 427c we won't trust anyone else, if we have any sense, or use any interpreter but our ancestral one. For surely this god is the ancestral interpreter of such matters for all mankind, and he gives his interpretations seated at the navel, in the center of the earth."

"You're right," he said, "and that's what we must do."[3]

WISDOM, COURAGE AND MODERATION IN THE CITY

Socrates locates wisdom in the rulers, courage in the soldiers and moderation in the whole city.

GREEK

427c **SOCRATES** ὠικισμένη μὲν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἤδη ἄν σοι εἴη, ὦ παῖ 427d Ἀρίστωνος, ἡ πόλις· τὸ δὲ δὴ μετὰ τοῦτο σκόπει ἐν αὐτῇ, φῶς ποθὲν πορισάμενος ἱκανόν, αὐτός τε καὶ τὸν ἀδελφὸν παρακάλει καὶ Πολέμαρχον καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους, ἐάν πως ἴδωμεν ποῦ ποτ' ἂν εἴη ἡ δικαιοσύνη καὶ

ENGLISH

SOCRATES "Well, son of Ariston," I said, "your city 427d may now be considered founded. Next, get yourself enough light from somewhere and look inside it—you yourself, and call in your brother and Polemarchus and the others—to see if we can

3 Delphi was held to be the center of the earth, marked by a sacred stone called the navel (*omphalos*).

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ποῦ ἡ ἀδικία, καὶ τί ἀλλήλοιν διαφέρετον, καὶ πότερον δεῖ κεκτῆσθαι τὸν μέλλοντα εὐδαίμονα εἶναι, ἐάντε λανθάνῃ ἐάντε μὴ πάντας θεούς τε καὶ ἀνθρώπους.	somehow discover where justice might be and where injustice, how they differ from each other, and which of the two a person must have if he's going to be happy, whether or not all gods and men are aware of it."
427d	οὐδὲν λέγεις, ἔφη ὁ Γλαύκων· σὺ γὰρ ὑπέσχου ζητήσειν, [427e] ὡς οὐχ ὅσιόν σοι ὂν μὴ οὐ βοηθεῖν δικαιοσύνῃ εἰς δύναμιν παντὶ τρόπῳ.	"Nonsense," said Glaucon. "You promised to search yourself, [427e] saying it would be impious of you not to come to justice's aid in every way you could."
	ἀληθῆ, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὑπομιμνῄσκεις, καὶ ποιητέον μέν γε οὕτως, χρὴ δὲ καὶ ὑμᾶς συλλαμβάνειν.	"That's a true reminder," I said, "and I must do so; but you must all help too."
	ἀλλ', ἔφη, ποιήσομεν οὕτω.	"We will," he said.
	ἐλπίζω τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εὑρήσειν αὐτὸ ὧδε. οἶμαι ἡμῖν τὴν πόλιν, εἴπερ ὀρθῶς γε ᾠκισται, τελέως ἀγαθὴν εἶναι.	"Then I hope," I said, "to find it this way. I think our city, if it's been rightly founded, is completely good."
	ἀνάγκη γ', ἔφη.	"It must be," he said.
	δῆλον δὴ ὅτι σοφή τ' ἐστὶ καὶ ἀνδρεία καὶ σώφρων καὶ δικαία.	"Clearly, then, it is wise, courageous, moderate, and just."
	δῆλον.	"Clearly."
427e	οὐκοῦν ὅτι ἂν αὐτῶν εὕρωμεν ἐν αὐτῇ, τὸ ὑπόλοιπον ἔσται τὸ οὐχ ηὑρημένον;	"Then whichever of these we find in it, what's left will be the one not yet found?"
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
	ὥσπερ τοίνυν ἄλλων τινῶν τεττάρων, εἰ ἕν τι ἐζητοῦμεν αὐτῶν ἐν ὁτῳοῦν, ὁπότε πρῶτον ἐκεῖνο ἔγνωμεν, ἱκανῶς ἂν εἶχεν ἡμῖν, εἰ δὲ τὰ τρία πρότερον ἐγνωρίσαμεν, αὐτῷ ἂν τούτῳ ἐγνώριστο τὸ ζητούμενον· δῆλον γὰρ ὅτι οὐκ ἄλλο ἔτι ἦν ἢ τὸ ὑπολειφθέν.	"It's as with any other four things: if we were looking for one of them in something, and recognized that one first, that would be enough for us; but if we recognized the other three first, by that very fact the one we were looking for would have been identified, since clearly it could be nothing but the one left over."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"You're right," he said.
	οὐκοῦν καὶ περὶ τούτων, ἐπειδὴ τέτταρα ὄντα τυγχάνει, ὡσαύτως ζητητέον;	"So with these too, since there happen to be four, we should search in the same way?"
	δῆλα δή.	"Clearly."
428a	καὶ μὲν δὴ πρῶτόν γέ μοι δοκεῖ ἐν αὐτῷ κατάδηλον εἶναι [428b] ἡ σοφία· καί τι ἄτοπον περὶ αὐτὴν φαίνεται.	"Well, the first thing I think is plainly visible in it [428b] is wisdom, and there's something odd about it."
	τί; ἦ δ' ὅς.	"What?" he said.
	σοφὴ μὲν τῷ ὄντι δοκεῖ μοι ἡ πόλις εἶναι ἣν διήλθομεν· εὔβουλος γάρ, οὐχί;	"The city we've described really does seem wise to me, since it's good at deliberating, isn't it?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	καὶ μὴν τοῦτό γε αὐτό, ἡ εὐβουλία, δῆλον ὅτι ἐπιστήμη τίς ἐστιν· οὐ γάρ που ἀμαθίᾳ γε ἀλλ' ἐπιστήμῃ εὖ βουλεύονται.	"And this very thing, good deliberation, is clearly a kind of knowledge, since it's surely not by ignorance but by knowledge that people deliberate well."
	δῆλον.	
	πολλαὶ δέ γε καὶ παντοδαπαὶ ἐπιστῆμαι ἐν τῇ πόλει εἰσίν.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Clearly."
		"But there are many kinds of knowledge, of every sort, in the city."
		"Of course."
428b	ἆρ' οὖν διὰ τὴν τῶν τεκτόνων ἐπιστήμην σοφὴ καὶ εὔβουλος ἡ πόλις προσρητέα; 428c	"Then is it because of the carpenters' knowledge that the city should be called wise and good at deliberating?" 428c
	οὐδαμῶς, ἔφη, διά γε ταύτην, ἀλλὰ τεκτονική.	"Not at all," he said. "Because of that it would be called good at carpentry."
	οὐκ ἄρα διὰ τὴν ὑπὲρ τῶν ξυλίνων σκευῶν ἐπιστήμην, βουλευομένη ὡς ἂν ἔχοι βέλτιστα, σοφὴ κλητέα πόλις.	"So it isn't because of its knowledge about wooden articles, when it deliberates how they'd be best, that a city should be called wise."
	οὐ μέντοι.	"Certainly not."
	τί δέ; τὴν ὑπὲρ τῶν ἐκ τοῦ χαλκοῦ ἤ τινα ἄλλην τῶν τοιούτων;	"What about knowledge of bronze articles, or anything else of that kind?"
	οὐδ' ἡντινοῦν, ἔφη.	"None of them," he said.
	οὐδὲ τὴν ὑπὲρ τοῦ καρποῦ τῆς γενέσεως ἐκ τῆς γῆς, ἀλλὰ γεωργική.	"Nor the knowledge of growing crops from the earth: because of that it's good at farming."
	δοκεῖ μοι.	"I think so."
428c	τί δ'; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· ἔστι τις ἐπιστήμη ἐν τῇ ἄρτι ὑφ' ἡμῶν οἰκισθείσῃ παρά τισι τῶν πολιτῶν, ᾗ οὐχ ὑπὲρ τῶν 428d ἐν τῇ πόλει τινὸς βουλεύεται, ἀλλ' ὑπὲρ αὐτῆς ὅλης, ὅντινα τρόπον αὐτή τε πρὸς αὑτὴν καὶ πρὸς τὰς ἄλλας πόλεις ἄριστα ὁμιλοῖ;	"Well then," I said, "is there some knowledge in the city we've just founded, among some of the citizens, by which it deliberates not about some particular thing 428d in the city, but about the city itself as a whole, how it can best conduct its relations both with itself and with other cities?"
	ἔστι μέντοι.	"There certainly is."
	τίς, ἔφην ἐγώ, καὶ ἐν τίσιν;	"What is it," I said, "and in whom?"
	αὕτη, ᾗ δ' ὅς, ἡ φυλακική, καὶ ἐν τούτοις τοῖς ἄρχουσιν οὓς νυνδὴ τελέους φύλακας ὠνομάζομεν.	"It's guardianship," he said, "and it's in those rulers we just now called complete guardians."
	διὰ ταύτην οὖν τὴν ἐπιστήμην τί τὴν πόλιν προσαγορεύεις;	"Then because of this knowledge, what do you call the city?"
	εὔβουλον, ἔφη, καὶ τῷ ὄντι σοφήν.	"Good at deliberating," he said, "and truly wise."
428d	πότερον οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐν τῇ πόλει οἴει ἡμῖν χαλκέας 428e πλείους ἐνέσεσθαι ἢ τοὺς ἀληθινοὺς φύλακας τούτους;	"Now do you think," I said, "there'll be more smiths 428e in our city, or more of these true guardians?"
	πολύ, ἔφη, χαλκέας.	"Far more smiths," he said.
	οὐκοῦν, ἔφην, καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ὅσοι ἐπιστήμας ἔχοντες ὀνομάζονταί τινες εἶναι, πάντων τούτων οὗτοι ἂν εἶεν ὀλίγιστοι;	"And of all the others who have some knowledge and get a name from it, these would be the fewest?"
	πολύ γε.	"By far."
428e	τῷ σμικροτάτῳ ἄρα ἔθνει καὶ μέρει ἑαυτῆς καὶ τῇ ἐν τούτῳ ἐπιστήμῃ, τῷ προεστῶτι καὶ ἄρχοντι, ὅλη σοφὴ ἂν εἴη κατὰ φύσιν οἰκισθεῖσα πόλις· καὶ τοῦτο, ὡς ἔοικε,	"So it's because of its smallest group and part, and the knowledge in it—the part that leads and rules—that a city founded according to nature would be

GREEK

φύσει [429a] ὀλίγιστον γίγνεται γένος, ᾧ προσήκει ταύτης τῆς ἐπιστήμης μεταλαγχάνειν ἣν μόνην δεῖ τῶν ἄλλων ἐπιστημῶν σοφίαν καλεῖσθαι.

ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη, λέγεις.

τοῦτο μὲν δὴ ἓν τῶν τεττάρων οὐκ οἶδα ὅντινα τρόπον ηὑρήκαμεν, αὐτό τε καὶ ὅπου τῆς πόλεως ἵδρυται.

ἐμοὶ γοῦν δοκεῖ, ἔφη, ἀποχρώντως ηὑρῆσθαι.

429a ἀλλὰ μὴν ἀνδρεία γε αὐτή τε καὶ ἐν ᾧ κεῖται τῆς πόλεως, δι' ὃ τοιαύτη κλητέα ἡ πόλις, οὐ πάνυ χαλεπὸν ἰδεῖν.

πῶς δή; [429b]

τίς ἄν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἰς ἄλλο τι ἀποβλέψας ἢ δειλὴν ἢ ἀνδρείαν πόλιν εἴποι ἀλλ' ἢ εἰς τοῦτο τὸ μέρος ὃ προπολεμεῖ τε καὶ στρατεύεται ὑπὲρ αὐτῆς;

οὐδ' ἂν εἷς, ἔφη, εἰς ἄλλο τι.

οὐ γὰρ οἶμαι, εἶπον, οἵ γε ἄλλοι ἐν αὐτῇ ἢ δειλοὶ ἢ ἀνδρεῖοι ὄντες κύριοι ἂν εἶεν ἢ τοίαν αὐτὴν εἶναι ἢ τοίαν.

οὐ γάρ.

429b καὶ ἀνδρεία ἄρα πόλις μέρει τινὶ ἑαυτῆς ἐστι, διὰ τὸ ἐν ἐκείνῳ ἔχειν δύναμιν τοιαύτην ἣ διὰ παντὸς σώσει τὴν περὶ [429c] τῶν δεινῶν δόξαν, ταῦτά τε αὐτὰ εἶναι καὶ τοιαῦτα, ἅ τε καὶ οἷα ὁ νομοθέτης παρήγγελλεν ἐν τῇ παιδείᾳ. ἢ οὐ τοῦτο ἀνδρείαν καλεῖς;

οὐ πάνυ, ἔφη, ἔμαθον ὃ εἶπες, ἀλλ' αὖθις εἰπέ.

σωτηρίαν ἔγωγ', εἶπον, λέγω τινὰ εἶναι τὴν ἀνδρείαν.

ποίαν δὴ σωτηρίαν;

429c τὴν τῆς δόξης τῆς ὑπὸ νόμου διὰ τῆς παιδείας γεγονυίας περὶ τῶν δεινῶν ἅ τέ ἐστι καὶ οἷα· διὰ παντὸς δὲ ἔλεγον αὐτῆς σωτηρίαν τὸ ἔν τε λύπαις ὄντα διασῴζεσθαι αὐτὴν καὶ ἐν [429d] ἡδοναῖς καὶ ἐν ἐπιθυμίαις καὶ ἐν φόβοις καὶ μὴ ἐκβάλλειν. ᾧ δέ μοι δοκεῖ ὅμοιον εἶναι ἐθέλω ἀπεικάσαι, εἰ βούλει.

ἀλλὰ βούλομαι.

429d οὐκοῦν οἶσθα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι οἱ βαφῆς, ἐπειδὰν βουληθῶσι βάψαι ἔρια ὥστ' εἶναι ἁλουργά, πρῶτον μὲν

ENGLISH

wise as a whole. And this, it seems, is by nature [429a] the smallest class, the one whose place it is to share in this knowledge, which alone of all kinds of knowledge should be called wisdom."

"Very true," he said.

"So we've found—I don't know quite how—this one of the four, both what it is and where in the city it has its seat."

"I think, anyway," he said, "it's been found well enough."

"And courage, too—both what it is and where in the city it lies, making the city deserve to be called courageous—isn't very hard to see."

"How so?" [429b]

"Who," I said, "would call a city cowardly or courageous by looking to anything but the part that fights for it and goes to war on its behalf?"

"No one," he said, "would look to anything else."

"No, for I don't think," I said, "that the others in it, whether cowardly or courageous, would decide whether it is one or the other."

"No, they wouldn't."

"So a city is courageous, too, by a certain part of itself, because in that part it has a power that will preserve through everything its opinion about [429c] what is to be feared: that these are the things, and things of this kind, that the lawgiver proclaimed in their education. Or don't you call this courage?"

"I didn't quite understand what you said," he said. "Say it again."

"I'm saying," I said, "that courage is a kind of preservation."

"What kind of preservation?"

"Preservation of the opinion, produced by law through education, about what things, and what kinds of things, are to be feared. And by preserving it 'through everything' I meant keeping it safe and not throwing it out, whether one is in pains or in [429d] pleasures, in desires or in fears. If you like, I'm willing to show you what I think it resembles."

"I'd like that."

"You know," I said, "that dyers, when they want to dye wool purple, first pick out, from all the many

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἐκλέγονται ἐκ τοσούτων χρωμάτων μίαν φύσιν τὴν τῶν λευκῶν, ἔπειτα προπαρασκευάζουσιν, οὐκ ὀλίγῃ παρασκευῇ θεραπεύσαντες ὅπως δέξεται ὅτι μάλιστα τὸ ἄνθος, καὶ οὕτω δὴ βάπτουσι. 429e καὶ ὃ μὲν ἂν τούτῳ τῷ τρόπῳ βαφῇ, δευσοποιὸν γίγνεται τὸ βαφέν, καὶ ἡ πλύσις οὔτ' ἄνευ ῥυμμάτων οὔτε μετὰ ῥυμμάτων δύναται αὐτῶν τὸ ἄνθος ἀφαιρεῖσθαι· ἃ δ' ἂν μή, οἶσθα οἷα δὴ γίγνεται, ἐάντέ τις ἄλλα χρώματα βάπτῃ ἐάντε καὶ ταῦτα μὴ προθεραπεύσας.	colors, the one kind that is white; then they prepare it beforehand, treating it with no small preparation so that it will take the color as well as possible, and only then do they dye it. 429e Whatever is dyed in this way becomes colorfast, and no washing, with cleansers or without, can take the color out of it. But you know what happens to things that aren't, whether someone dyes other colors or dyes these without treating them first."
429e	οἶδα, ἔφη, ὅτι καὶ ἔκπλυτα καὶ γελοῖα.	"I know," he said. "They wash out and look ridiculous."
	τοιοῦτον τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὑπόλαβε κατὰ δύναμιν ἐργάζεσθαι καὶ ἡμᾶς, ὅτε ἐξελεγόμεθα τοὺς στρατιώτας καὶ 430a ἐπαιδεύομεν μουσικῇ καὶ γυμναστικῇ· μηδὲν οἰου ἄλλο μηχανᾶσθαι ἢ ὅπως ἡμῖν ὅτι κάλλιστα τοὺς νόμους πεισθέντες δέξοιντο ὥσπερ βαφήν, ἵνα δευσοποιὸς αὐτῶν ἡ δόξα γίγνοιτο καὶ περὶ δεινῶν καὶ περὶ τῶν ἄλλων διὰ τὸ τήν τε φύσιν καὶ τὴν τροφὴν ἐπιτηδείαν ἐσχηκέναι, καὶ μὴ αὐτῶν ἐκπλύναι τὴν βαφὴν τὰ ῥύμματα ταῦτα, δεινὰ ὄντα ἐκκλύζειν, ἥ τε ἡδονή, παντὸς χαλεστραίου δεινοτέρα οὖσα τοῦτο δρᾶν 430b καὶ κονίας, λύπη τε καὶ φόβος καὶ ἐπιθυμία, παντὸς ἄλλου ῥύμματος. τὴν δὴ τοιαύτην δύναμιν καὶ σωτηρίαν διὰ παντὸς δόξης ὀρθῆς τε καὶ νομίμου δεινῶν τε πέρι καὶ μὴ ἀνδρείαν ἔγωγε καλῶ καὶ τίθεμαι, εἰ μή τι σὺ ἄλλο λέγεις.	"Then suppose," I said, "that we too were doing something like this, as far as we could, when we selected our soldiers and 430a educated them in music and gymnastics. Don't think we were contriving anything but this: that, persuaded by us, they would take in the laws as well as possible, like a dye, so that their opinion about what is to be feared, and about everything else, would become colorfast, because they had the right nature and upbringing; and so that those cleansers wouldn't wash the dye out of them, formidable as they are at scouring—pleasure, more formidable at this than any soda 430b or lye, and pain, fear, and desire, more than any other cleanser. This power, then, this preservation through everything of right and lawful opinion about what is and isn't to be feared, is what I call courage, and set down as such, unless you have something else to say."
430b	ἀλλ' οὐδέν, ἦ δ' ὅς, λέγω· δοκεῖς γάρ μοι τὴν ὀρθὴν δόξαν περὶ τῶν αὐτῶν τούτων ἄνευ παιδείας γεγονυῖαν, τήν τε θηριώδη καὶ ἀνδραποδώδη, οὔτε πάνυ νόμιμον ἡγεῖσθαι, ἄλλο τέ τι ἢ ἀνδρείαν καλεῖν. 430c	"No, I have nothing else to say," he said. "For I take it that right opinion about these same things that arises without education—the kind found in beasts and slaves—you don't consider altogether lawful, and you call it something other than courage." 430c
	ἀληθέστατα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λέγεις.	"Very true," I said.
	ἀποδέχομαι τοίνυν τοῦτο ἀνδρείαν εἶναι.	"Then I accept that this is courage."
	καὶ γὰρ ἀποδέχου, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πολιτικήν γε, καὶ ὀρθῶς ἀποδέξῃ· αὖθις δὲ περὶ αὐτοῦ, ἐὰν βούλῃ, ἔτι κάλλιον δίιμεν. νῦν γὰρ οὐ τοῦτο ἐζητοῦμεν, ἀλλὰ δικαιοσύνην· πρὸς οὖν τὴν ἐκείνου ζήτησιν, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, ἱκανῶς ἔχει.	"Yes, accept it," I said, "as civic courage, anyway, and you'll be right to. We'll go through it more thoroughly another time, if you like. At present it isn't this we're looking for, but justice; and for the search for that, I think, this is enough."
	ἀλλὰ καλῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"You're right," he said.
430c	δύο μήν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἔτι λοιπὰ ἃ δεῖ κατιδεῖν ἐν τῇ 430d πόλει, ἥ τε σωφροσύνη καὶ οὗ δὴ ἕνεκα πάντα ζητοῦμεν, δικαιοσύνη.	"Now two things are still left," I said, "that we must make out in the 430d city: moderation, and the

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	thing for whose sake we're looking for them all, justice."
	πῶς οὖν ἂν τὴν δικαιοσύνην εὕροιμεν, ἵνα μηκέτι πραγματευώμεθα περὶ σωφροσύνης;	"Certainly."
	ἐγὼ μὲν τοίνυν, ἔφη, οὔτε οἶδα οὔτ' ἂν βουλοίμην αὐτὸ πρότερον φανῆναι, εἴπερ μηκέτι ἐπισκεψόμεθα σωφροσύνην· ἀλλ' εἰ ἔμοιγε βούλει χαρίζεσθαι, σκόπει πρότερον τοῦτο ἐκείνου. [430e]	"How could we find justice, so as not to have to bother any more about moderation?"
		"Well, I don't know," he said, "and I wouldn't want justice to come to light first, if we're not going to look into moderation after all. If you want to do me a favor, look at this one before that one." [430e]
	ἀλλὰ μέντοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, βούλομαί γε, εἰ μὴ ἀδικῶ.	"I'm certainly willing," I said, "unless it would be wrong of me."
	σκόπει δή, ἔφη.	"Then look," he said.
430e	σκεπτέον, εἶπον· καὶ ὥς γε ἐντεῦθεν ἰδεῖν, συμφωνίᾳ τινὶ καὶ ἁρμονίᾳ προσέοικεν μᾶλλον ἢ τὰ πρότερον.	"We must look," I said. "And seen from here, it resembles a kind of concord and harmony more than the others did."
	πῶς;	"How?"
	κόσμος πού τις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἡ σωφροσύνη ἐστὶν καὶ ἡδονῶν τινων καὶ ἐπιθυμιῶν ἐγκράτεια, ὥς φασι κρείττω δὴ αὐτοῦ ἀποφαίνοντες οὐκ οἶδ' ὅντινα τρόπον, καὶ ἄλλα ἅττα τοιαῦτα ὥσπερ ἴχνη αὐτῆς λέγεται. ἦ γάρ;	"Moderation," I said, "is surely a kind of order, a mastery of certain pleasures and desires. People speak of someone as 'stronger than himself,' though I don't know quite what they mean by it, and other such expressions are used that are like traces of it. Isn't that so?"
	πάντων μάλιστα, ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
	οὐκοῦν τὸ μὲν κρείττω αὑτοῦ γελοῖον; ὁ γὰρ ἑαυτοῦ κρείττων καὶ ἥττων δήπου ἂν αὐτοῦ εἴη καὶ ὁ ἥττων κρείττων· [431a] ὁ αὐτὸς γὰρ ἐν ἅπασιν τούτοις προσαγορεύεται.	"But isn't 'stronger than himself' ridiculous? The one who is stronger than himself would also, I suppose, be weaker than himself, and the weaker would be stronger, [431a] since it's the same person spoken of in all these expressions."
	τί δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
431a	ἀλλ', ἦν δ' ἐγώ, φαίνεταί μοι βούλεσθαι λέγειν οὗτος ὁ λόγος ὥς τι ἐν αὐτῷ τῷ ἀνθρώπῳ περὶ τὴν ψυχὴν τὸ μὲν βέλτιον ἔνι, τὸ δὲ χεῖρον, καὶ ὅταν μὲν τὸ βέλτιον φύσει τοῦ χείρονος ἐγκρατὲς ᾖ, τοῦτο λέγειν τὸ κρείττω αὐτοῦ —ἐπαινεῖ γοῦν—ὅταν δὲ ὑπὸ τροφῆς κακῆς ἤ τινος ὁμιλίας κρατηθῇ ὑπὸ πλήθους τοῦ χείρονος σμικρότερον τὸ βέλτιον [431b] ὄν, τοῦτο δὲ ὡς ἐν ὀνείδει ψέγειν τε καὶ καλεῖν ἥττω ἑαυτοῦ καὶ ἀκόλαστον τὸν οὕτω διακείμενον.	"But it seems to me," I said, "that this expression means that in the person himself, in his soul, there's a better part and a worse; and when the naturally better part is in control of the worse, that's what is meant by 'stronger than himself'—it's praise, at any rate. But when, through bad upbringing or bad company, the better part, being smaller, [431b] is overpowered by the mass of the worse, this is criticized as something shameful, and the person in that condition is called weaker than himself and undisciplined."
	καὶ γὰρ ἔοικεν, ἔφη.	"Yes, that seems right," he said.
431b	ἀπόβλεπε τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πρὸς τὴν νέαν ἡμῖν πόλιν, καὶ εὑρήσεις ἐν αὐτῇ τὸ ἕτερον τούτων ἐνόν· κρείττω γὰρ αὐτὴν αὐτῆς δικαίως φήσεις προσαγορεύεσθαι, εἴπερ οὗ	"Now look at our new city," I said, "and you'll find the first of these in it. You'll say it's rightly called stronger than itself, if what has its better part rul-

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τὸ ἄμεινον τοῦ χείρονος ἄρχει σῶφρον κλητέον καὶ κρεῖττον αὑτοῦ.	ing its worse is to be called moderate and stronger than itself."
	ἀλλ' ἀποβλέπω, ἔφη, καὶ ἀληθῆ λέγεις.	"I'm looking," he said, "and what you say is true."
	καὶ μὴν καὶ τάς γε πολλὰς καὶ παντοδαπὰς ἐπιθυμίας καὶ [431c] ἡδονάς τε καὶ λύπας ἐν παισὶ μάλιστα ἄν τις εὕροι καὶ γυναιξὶ καὶ οἰκέταις καὶ τῶν ἐλευθέρων λεγομένων ἐν τοῖς πολλοῖς τε καὶ φαύλοις.	"And again, the many desires of every kind, [431c] and pleasures and pains, are found above all in children, women, and household slaves, and, among the so-called free, in the many and inferior."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
431c	τὰς δέ γε ἁπλᾶς τε καὶ μετρίας, αἳ δὴ μετὰ νοῦ τε καὶ δόξης ὀρθῆς λογισμῷ ἄγονται, ἐν ὀλίγοις τε ἐπιτεύξῃ καὶ τοῖς βέλτιστα μὲν φῦσιν, βέλτιστα δὲ παιδευθεῖσιν.	"But the simple and measured ones, which are guided by reasoning with the help of intelligence and right opinion, you'll meet only in a few, those with the best natures and the best education."
	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη.	"True," he said.
	οὐκοῦν καὶ ταῦτα ὁρᾷς ἐνόντα σοι ἐν τῇ πόλει καὶ κρατουμένας αὐτόθι τὰς ἐπιθυμίας τὰς ἐν τοῖς πολλοῖς τε [431d] καὶ φαύλοις ὑπό τε τῶν ἐπιθυμιῶν καὶ τῆς φρονήσεως τῆς ἐν τοῖς ἐλάττοσί τε καὶ ἐπιεικεστέροις;	"And don't you see that these too are present in your city, and that there the desires in the many and [431d] inferior are mastered by the desires and the understanding in the fewer and more decent?"
	ἔγωγ', ἔφη.	"I do," he said.
	εἰ ἄρα δεῖ τινα πόλιν προσαγορεύειν κρείττω ἡδονῶν τε καὶ ἐπιθυμιῶν καὶ αὐτὴν αὑτῆς, καὶ ταύτην προσρητέον.	"So if any city is to be called stronger than its pleasures and desires, and than itself, this one should be."
431d	παντάπασιν μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
	ἆρ' οὖν οὐ καὶ σώφρονα κατὰ πάντα ταῦτα;	"And isn't it also moderate, on all these counts?"
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
	καὶ μὴν εἴπερ αὖ ἐν ἄλλῃ πόλει ἡ αὐτὴ δόξα ἔνεστι τοῖς [431e] τε ἄρχουσι καὶ ἀρχομένοις περὶ τοῦ οὕστινας δεῖ ἄρχειν, καὶ ἐν ταύτῃ ἂν εἴη τοῦτο ἐνόν. ἢ οὐ δοκεῖ;	"And again, if in any other city rulers [431e] and ruled share the same opinion about who should rule, that would be present in this one too. Don't you think so?"
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, σφόδρα.	"Very much so," he said, "absolutely."
	ἐν ποτέροις οὖν φήσεις τῶν πολιτῶν τὸ σωφρονεῖν ἐνεῖναι ὅταν οὕτως ἔχωσιν; ἐν τοῖς ἄρχουσιν ἢ ἐν τοῖς ἀρχομένοις;	"Then in which of the citizens will you say moderation is present, when they're in this condition? In the rulers or the ruled?"
	ἐν ἀμφοτέροις που, ἔφη.	"In both, I suppose," he said.
431e	ὁρᾷς οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι ἐπιεικῶς ἐμαντευόμεθα ἄρτι ὡς ἁρμονίᾳ τινὶ ἡ σωφροσύνη ὡμοίωται;	"So do you see," I said, "that we guessed pretty well just now when we said moderation resembles a kind of harmony?"
	τί δή;	"Why is that?"
	ὅτι οὐχ ὥσπερ ἡ ἀνδρεία καὶ ἡ σοφία ἐν μέρει τινὶ [432a] ἑκατέρα ἐνοῦσα ἡ μὲν σοφήν, ἡ δὲ ἀνδρείαν τὴν πόλιν παρείχετο, οὐχ οὕτω ποιεῖ αὕτη, ἀλλὰ δι' ὅλης ἀτεχνῶς τέταται διὰ πασῶν παρεχομένη συνᾴδοντας τούς τε ἀσθενεστάτους ταὐτὸν καὶ τοὺς ἰσχυροτάτους καὶ τοὺς μέσους, εἰ μὲν βούλει, φρονήσει, εἰ δὲ βούλει, ἰσχύι, εἰ δέ,	"Because it doesn't work the way courage and wisdom do. Each of those resided in one part of the city [432a] and made it wise or courageous respectively. Moderation doesn't act like that. It stretches straight through the whole city, across the entire scale, and makes the weakest, the strongest and

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καὶ πλήθει ἢ χρήμασιν ἢ ἄλλῳ ὁτῳοῦν τῶν τοιούτων· ὥστε ὀρθότατ᾽ ἂν φαῖμεν ταύτην τὴν ὁμόνοιαν σωφροσύνην εἶναι, χείρονός τε καὶ ἀμείνονος κατὰ φύσιν συμφωνίαν ὁπότερον δεῖ ἄρχειν καὶ ἐν πόλει καὶ ἐν ἑνὶ ἑκάστῳ. 432b	those in between all sing the same tune together—whether you rank them by understanding, or by strength, or, if you like, by numbers or wealth or anything else of the sort. So we'd be quite right to say that this unanimity is moderation: the natural concord between worse and better about which of them should rule, both in a city and in each individual." 432b
432b	πάνυ μοι, ἔφη, συνδοκεῖ.	"I entirely agree," he said.
	εἶεν, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ· τὰ μὲν τρία ἡμῖν ἐν τῇ πόλει κατῶπται, ὡς γε οὐτωσὶ δόξαι· τὸ δὲ δὴ λοιπὸν εἶδος, δι᾽ ὃ ἂν ἔτι ἀρετῆς μετέχοι πόλις, τί ποτ᾽ ἂν εἴη; δῆλον γὰρ ὅτι τοῦτ᾽ ἐστὶν ἡ δικαιοσύνη.	"Well then," I said, "we've spotted three of them in our city, at least as far as it looks at this stage. So what could the remaining form be, the one that would give the city a further share in excellence? Obviously it's justice."
	δῆλον.	"Obviously."
	οὐκοῦν, ὦ Γλαύκων, νῦν δὴ ἡμᾶς δεῖ ὥσπερ κυνηγέτας τινὰς θάμνον κύκλῳ περιίστασθαι προσέχοντας τὸν νοῦν, μή πῃ διαφύγῃ ἡ δικαιοσύνη καὶ ἀφανισθεῖσα ἄδηλος γένηται. 432c φανερὸν γὰρ δὴ ὅτι ταύτῃ πῃ ἔστιν· ὅρα οὖν καὶ προθυμοῦ κατιδεῖν, ἐάν πως πρότερος ἐμοῦ ἴδῃς καὶ ἐμοὶ φράσῃς.	"Well, Glaucon, now's the time for us to station ourselves in a circle around the thicket like hunters, and keep our wits about us, so that justice doesn't slip away somewhere and vanish from sight. 432c It's clearly somewhere around here. So look, and do your best to catch sight of it—maybe you'll see it before I do and can point it out to me."
	εἰ γὰρ ὤφελον, ἔφη. ἀλλὰ μᾶλλον, ἐάν μοι ἑπομένῳ χρῇ καὶ τὰ δεικνύμενα δυναμένῳ καθορᾶν, πάνυ μοι μετρίως χρήσῃ.	"If only I could," he said. "But you'll be making quite reasonable use of me if you treat me as a follower who can see what's pointed out to him."
	ἕπου, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, εὐξάμενος μετ᾽ ἐμοῦ.	"Follow, then," I said, "once you've said a prayer with me."
	ποιήσω ταῦτα, ἀλλὰ μόνον, ἦ δ᾽ ὅς, ἡγοῦ.	"I will," he said. "Just lead the way."
432c	καὶ μήν, εἶπον ἐγώ, δύσβατός γέ τις ὁ τόπος φαίνεται καὶ ἐπίσκιος· ἔστι γοῦν σκοτεινὸς καὶ δυσδιερεύνητος. ἀλλὰ γὰρ ὅμως ἰτέον. 432d	"The place certainly looks hard going," I said, "and overgrown. It's dark, at any rate, and difficult to search. Still, we have to go on." 432d
	ἰτέον γάρ, ἔφη.	"We do," he said.
	καὶ ἐγὼ κατιδών, ἰοὺ ἰού, εἶπον, ὦ Γλαύκων· κινδυνεύομέν τι ἔχειν ἴχνος, καί μοι δοκεῖ οὐ πάνυ τι ἐκφευξεῖσθαι ἡμᾶς.	Then I caught sight of something. "Aha! Aha, Glaucon!" I said. "It looks as though we've found a track, and I don't think it's going to get away from us now."
	εὖ ἀγγέλλεις, ἦ δ᾽ ὅς.	"Good news," he said.
	ἦ μήν, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, βλακικόν γε ἡμῶν τὸ πάθος.	"Honestly," I said, "we've been behaving like dullards."
	τὸ ποῖον;	"How so?"
432d	πάλαι, ὦ μακάριε, φαίνεται πρὸ ποδῶν ἡμῖν ἐξ ἀρχῆς κυλινδεῖσθαι, καὶ οὐχ ἑωρῶμεν ἄρ᾽ αὐτό, ἀλλ᾽ ἦμεν καταγελαστότατοι· ὥσπερ οἱ ἐν ταῖς χερσὶν ἔχοντες ζητοῦσιν 432e ἐνίοτε ὃ ἔχουσιν, καὶ ἡμεῖς εἰς αὐτὸ μὲν οὐκ	"It's been rolling around at our feet all along, my dear fellow, right from the start, and we never saw it. We were utterly ridiculous. Like people who sometimes go looking for what they're holding 432e in their hands, we didn't look at the thing itself but

GREEK	ENGLISH
ἀπεβλέπομεν, πόρρω δέ ποι ἀπεσκοποῦμεν, ᾗ δὴ καὶ ἐλάνθανεν ἴσως ἡμᾶς.	gazed off somewhere into the distance—which is probably just why it escaped us."
πῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις;	"What do you mean?" he said.
οὕτως, εἶπον, ὡς δοκοῦμέν μοι καὶ λέγοντες αὐτὸ καὶ ἀκούοντες πάλαι οὐ μανθάνειν ἡμῶν αὐτῶν, ὅτι ἐλέγομεν τρόπον τινὰ αὐτό.	"This," I said: "I think we've been talking about it and hearing about it for a long time without realizing that we ourselves were, in a way, describing it."
μακρόν, ἔφη, τὸ προοίμιον τῷ ἐπιθυμοῦντι ἀκοῦσαι.	"That's a long preamble," he said, "for someone who's eager to hear."

JUSTICE IN THE CITY: DOING ONE'S OWN

Socrates defines justice in the city as each class doing its own work.

GREEK	ENGLISH
433a **SOCRATES** ἀλλ', ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἄκουε εἴ τι ἄρα λέγω. ὃ γὰρ ἐξ ἀρχῆς ἐθέμεθα δεῖν ποιεῖν διὰ παντός, ὅτε τὴν πόλιν κατῳκίζομεν, τοῦτό ἐστιν, ὡς ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ, ἤτοι τούτου τι εἶδος ἡ δικαιοσύνη. ἐθέμεθα δὲ δήπου καὶ πολλάκις ἐλέγομεν, εἰ μέμνησαι, ὅτι ἕνα ἕκαστον ἓν δέοι ἐπιτηδεύειν τῶν περὶ τὴν πόλιν, εἰς ὃ αὐτοῦ ἡ φύσις ἐπιτηδειοτάτη πεφυκυῖα εἴη.	**SOCRATES** "Listen, then," I said, "and see whether I'm making sense. What we laid down at the start as something that had to be done in every case, when we were founding the city—that, I think, or some form of it, is justice. We laid down, surely, and said often, if you remember, that each person must practice one of the city's occupations, the one for which his nature is best suited."
ἐλέγομεν γάρ.	"Yes, we said that."
καὶ μὴν ὅτι γε τὸ τὰ αὑτοῦ πράττειν καὶ μὴ πολυπραγμονεῖν δικαιοσύνη ἐστί, καὶ τοῦτο ἄλλων τε πολλῶν 433b ἀκηκόαμεν καὶ αὐτοὶ πολλάκις εἰρήκαμεν.	"And further, that doing one's own work and not meddling is justice—we've heard that from many 433b others and have often said it ourselves."
εἰρήκαμεν γάρ.	"We have said it."
433b τοῦτο τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ φίλε, κινδυνεύει τρόπον τινὰ γιγνόμενον ἡ δικαιοσύνη εἶναι, τὸ τὰ αὑτοῦ πράττειν. οἶσθα ὅθεν τεκμαίρομαι;	"Then this, my friend," I said, "doing one's own work, when it comes about in a certain way, looks as if it's justice. Do you know what my evidence is?"
οὐκ, ἀλλὰ λέγ', ἔφη.	"No—tell me," he said.
δοκεῖ μοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ ὑπόλοιπον ἐν τῇ πόλει ὧν ἐσκέμμεθα, σωφροσύνης καὶ ἀνδρείας καὶ φρονήσεως, τοῦτο εἶναι, ὃ πᾶσιν ἐκείνοις τὴν δύναμιν παρέσχεν ὥστε ἐγγενέσθαι, καὶ ἐγγενομένοις γε σωτηρίαν παρέχειν, ἕωσπερ ἂν 433c ἐνῇ. καίτοι ἔφαμεν δικαιοσύνην ἔσεσθαι τὸ ὑπολειφθὲν ἐκείνων, εἰ τὰ τρία εὕροιμεν.	"I think," I said, "that what's left in the city, beyond the things we've examined—moderation, courage and understanding—is the thing that gave all of them the power to arise in the first place, and that preserves them once they've arisen, as long as it's 433c present. And we did say that justice would be what was left over once we'd found the three."
καὶ γὰρ ἀνάγκη, ἔφη.	"It must be," he said.
433c ἀλλὰ μέντοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἰ δέοι γε κρῖναι τί τὴν πόλιν ἡμῖν τούτων μάλιστα ἀγαθὴν ἀπεργάσεται ἐγγενόμενον, δύσκριτον ἂν εἴη πότερον ἡ ὁμοδοξία τῶν ἀρχόντων τε καὶ ἀρχομένων, ἢ ἡ περὶ δεινῶν τε καὶ μή, ἅττα ἐστί, δόξης ἐννόμου σωτηρία ἐν τοῖς στρατιώταις ἐγγενομένη, ἢ ἡ ἐν 433d τοῖς ἄρχουσι φρόνησίς τε καὶ φυλακὴ ἐνοῦσα,	"And yet," I said, "if we had to decide which of these would do most to make our city good by its presence, it would be hard to judge. Is it the agreement in opinion between rulers and ruled? Or the preservation, in the soldiers, of the lawful opinion about what is and isn't to be feared? Or the under-

GREEK	ENGLISH
ἢ τοῦτο μάλιστα ἀγαθὴν αὐτὴν ποιεῖ ἐνὸν καὶ ἐν παιδὶ καὶ ἐν γυναικὶ καὶ δούλῳ καὶ ἐλευθέρῳ καὶ δημιουργῷ καὶ ἄρχοντι καὶ ἀρχομένῳ, ὅτι τὸ αὑτοῦ ἕκαστος εἷς ὢν ἔπραττε καὶ οὐκ ἐπολυπραγμόνει.	standing and vigilance present in [433d] the rulers? Or is what most makes the city good the fact, present in child and woman, slave and free, craftsman, ruler and ruled, that each did his own work as one person and didn't meddle?"
433d δύσκριτον, ἔφη· πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Hard to judge," he said. "Of course it is."
ἐνάμιλλον ἄρα, ὡς ἔοικε, πρὸς ἀρετὴν πόλεως τῇ τε σοφίᾳ αὐτῆς καὶ τῇ σωφροσύνῃ καὶ τῇ ἀνδρείᾳ ἡ τοῦ ἕκαστον ἐν αὐτῇ τὰ αὑτοῦ πράττειν δύναμις.	"So it seems that, when it comes to a city's excellence, the power of each person in it to do his own work rivals its wisdom, moderation and courage."
καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
οὐκοῦν δικαιοσύνην τό γε τούτοις ἐνάμιλλον ἂν εἰς ἀρετὴν [433e] πόλεως θείης;	"Then wouldn't you count justice as the thing that rivals these in contributing to the excellence [433e] of a city?"
παντάπασι μὲν οὖν.	"Absolutely."
σκόπει δὴ καὶ τῇδε εἰ οὕτω δόξει· ἆρα τοῖς ἄρχουσιν ἐν τῇ πόλει τὰς δίκας προστάξεις δικάζειν;	"Now look at it this way too and see whether you'll agree. Will you assign the rulers in the city to judge lawsuits?"
τί μήν;	"Of course."
433e ἦ ἄλλου οὑτινοσοῦν μᾶλλον ἐφιέμενοι δικάσουσιν ἢ τούτου, ὅπως ἂν ἕκαστοι μήτ' ἔχωσι τἀλλότρια μήτε τῶν αὑτῶν στέρωνται;	"And will their aim in judging be anything other than this: that no one should have what belongs to others or be deprived of what's his own?"
οὔκ, ἀλλὰ τούτου.	"No, just that."
ὡς δικαίου ὄντος;	"Because that's just?"
ναί.	"Yes."
καὶ ταύτῃ ἄρα πῃ ἡ τοῦ οἰκείου τε καὶ ἑαυτοῦ ἕξις τε καὶ [434a] πρᾶξις δικαιοσύνη ἂν ὁμολογοῖτο.	"So in this way too, the having and [434a] doing of what is one's own and belongs to oneself would be agreed to be justice."
ἔστι ταῦτα.	"That's right."
ἰδὲ δὴ ἐὰν σοὶ ὅπερ ἐμοὶ συνδοκῇ. τέκτων σκυτοτόμου ἐπιχειρῶν ἔργα ἐργάζεσθαι ἢ σκυτοτόμος τέκτονος, ἢ τὰ ὄργανα μεταλαμβάνοντες τἀλλήλων ἢ τιμάς, ἢ καὶ ὁ αὐτὸς ἐπιχειρῶν ἀμφότερα πράττειν, πάντα τἆλλα μεταλλαττόμενα, ἆρά σοι ἄν τι δοκεῖ μέγα βλάψαι πόλιν;	"Now see whether you agree with me. Suppose a carpenter tries to do a shoemaker's work, or a shoemaker a carpenter's; or they swap tools or honors; or the same man tries to do both jobs—with all the rest swapped around like that, do you think it would do the city much harm?"
434a οὐ πάνυ, ἔφη.	"Not much," he said.
ἀλλ' ὅταν γε οἶμαι δημιουργὸς ὢν ἤ τις ἄλλος χρηματιστὴς [434b] φύσει, ἔπειτα ἐπαιρόμενος ἢ πλούτῳ ἢ πλήθει ἢ ἰσχύι ἢ ἄλλῳ τῳ τοιούτῳ εἰς τὸ τοῦ πολεμικοῦ εἶδος ἐπιχειρῇ ἰέναι, ἢ τῶν πολεμικῶν τις εἰς τὸ τοῦ βουλευτικοῦ καὶ φύλακος ἀνάξιος ὤν, καὶ τὰ ἀλλήλων οὗτοι ὄργανα μεταλαμβάνωσι καὶ τὰς τιμάς, ἢ ὅταν ὁ αὐτὸς πάντα ταῦτα ἅμα ἐπιχειρῇ πράττειν, τότε οἶμαι καὶ σοὶ δοκεῖν ταύτην τὴν τούτων μεταβολὴν καὶ πολυπραγμοσύνην ὄλεθρον εἶναι τῇ πόλει.	"But when someone who is by nature a craftsman or some other kind of moneymaker [434b] gets carried away by wealth or numbers or strength or something like that and tries to move into the class of warriors, or one of the warriors tries to move into the class of counselors and guardians when he's unworthy of it, and these people swap each other's tools and honors—or when the same man tries to do all these things at once—then, I
παντάπασι μὲν οὖν.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		think you'll agree too, this interchange and meddling among them is the ruin of the city." "Absolutely."
434b	ἡ τριῶν ἄρα ὄντων γενῶν πολυπραγμοσύνη καὶ μεταβολὴ [434c] εἰς ἄλληλα μεγίστη τε βλάβη τῇ πόλει καὶ ὀρθότατ' ἂν προσαγορεύοιτο μάλιστα κακουργία. κομιδῇ μὲν οὖν. κακουργίαν δὲ τὴν μεγίστην τῆς ἑαυτοῦ πόλεως οὐκ ἀδικίαν φήσεις εἶναι; πῶς δ' οὔ; τοῦτο μὲν ἄρα ἀδικία. πάλιν δὲ ὧδε λέγωμεν· χρηματιστικοῦ, ἐπικουρικοῦ, φυλακικοῦ γένους οἰκειοπραγία, ἑκάστου τούτων τὸ αὑτοῦ πράττοντος ἐν πόλει, τοὐναντίον ἐκείνου δικαιοσύνη τ' ἂν εἴη καὶ τὴν πόλιν δικαίαν παρέχοι; [434d] οὐκ ἄλλῃ ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἔχειν ἢ ταύτῃ.	"So when there are three classes, meddling among them and interchange from one [434c] to another is the greatest harm to the city, and would quite rightly be called the worst of crimes." "Exactly." "And won't you say that the worst crime against one's own city is injustice?" "Of course." "So that is injustice. Now let's put it the other way round. The opposite of that—when the moneymaking, auxiliary and guardian classes each mind their own business, each doing its own work in the city—wouldn't that be justice, and make the city just?" [434d] "I think it's that," he said, "and nothing else."
434d	μηδέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πω πάνυ παγίως αὐτὸ λέγωμεν, ἀλλ' ἐὰν μὲν ἡμῖν καὶ εἰς ἕνα ἕκαστον τῶν ἀνθρώπων ἰὸν τὸ εἶδος τοῦτο ὁμολογῆται καὶ ἐκεῖ δικαιοσύνη εἶναι, συγχωρησόμεθα ἤδη—τί γὰρ καὶ ἐροῦμεν; —εἰ δὲ μή, τότε ἄλλο τι σκεψόμεθα. νῦν δ' ἐκτελέσωμεν τὴν σκέψιν ἣν ᾠήθημεν, εἰ ἐν μείζονί τινι τῶν ἐχόντων δικαιοσύνην πρότερον ἢ ἐκεῖ ἐπιχειρήσαιμεν θεάσασθαι, ῥᾷον ἂν ἐν ἑνὶ ἀνθρώπῳ κατιδεῖν οἷόν ἐστιν. καὶ [434e] ἔδοξε δὴ ἡμῖν τοῦτο εἶναι πόλις, καὶ οὕτω ᾠκίζομεν ὡς ἐδυνάμεθα ἀρίστην, εὖ εἰδότες ὅτι ἔν γε τῇ ἀγαθῇ ἂν εἴη. ὃ οὖν ἡμῖν ἐκεῖ ἐφάνη, ἐπαναφέρωμεν εἰς τὸν ἕνα, κἂν μὲν ὁμολογῆται, καλῶς ἕξει·	"Let's not state it with complete confidence just yet," I said. "If this form, when we apply it to each individual human being as well, is agreed to be justice there too, then we'll grant it—what else could we say? If not, we'll look into something else. For now, let's finish the inquiry we undertook in the belief that, if we first tried to observe justice in some larger thing that has it, it would be easier to see what it's like in a single person. And [434e] we decided that this larger thing was a city, and so we founded the best one we could, knowing well that justice would be found in the good one, at any rate. So let's apply what came to light there to the individual. If it agrees, well and good.
434e	ἐὰν δέ τι ἄλλο ἐν τῷ ἑνὶ ἐμφαίνηται, πάλιν ἐπανιόντες ἐπὶ τὴν πόλιν βασανιοῦμεν, καὶ [435a] τάχ' ἂν παρ' ἄλληλα σκοποῦντες καὶ τρίβοντες, ὥσπερ ἐκ πυρείων ἐκλάμψαι ποιήσαιμεν τὴν δικαιοσύνην· καὶ φανερὰν γενομένην βεβαιωσόμεθα αὐτὴν παρ' ἡμῖν αὐτοῖς. ἀλλ', ἔφη, καθ' ὁδόν τε λέγεις καὶ ποιεῖν χρὴ οὕτως. ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅ γε ταὐτὸν ἄν τις προσείποι μεῖζόν τε καὶ ἔλαττον, ἀνόμοιον τυγχάνει ὂν ταύτῃ ᾗ ταὐτὸν προσαγορεύεται, ἢ ὅμοιον; ὅμοιον, ἔφη. [435b]	"But if something different shows up in the individual, we'll go back to the city and test it there, and [435a] perhaps, by looking at the two side by side and rubbing them together, we might make justice blaze out, as fire does from fire-sticks. And once it's come to light, we'll confirm it for ourselves." "Well," he said, "that's a sound way to proceed, and we should do it." "Now," I said, "when you call two things, one bigger and one smaller, by the same name, are they unlike in the respect in which they're called the same, or alike?" "Alike," he said. [435b]

GREEK

ENGLISH

435b καὶ δίκαιος ἄρα ἀνὴρ δικαίας πόλεως κατ᾽ αὐτὸ τὸ τῆς δικαιοσύνης εἶδος οὐδὲν διοίσει, ἀλλ᾽ ὅμοιος ἔσται.

ὅμοιος, ἔφη.

ἀλλὰ μέντοι πόλις γε ἔδοξεν εἶναι δικαία ὅτε ἐν αὐτῇ τριττὰ γένη φύσεων ἐνόντα τὸ αὑτῶν ἕκαστον ἔπραττεν, σώφρων δὲ αὖ καὶ ἀνδρεία καὶ σοφὴ διὰ τῶν αὐτῶν τούτων γενῶν ἄλλ᾽ ἄττα πάθη τε καὶ ἕξεις.

ἀληθῆ, ἔφη.

καὶ τὸν ἕνα ἄρα, ὦ φίλε, οὕτως ἀξιώσομεν, τὰ αὐτὰ ταῦτα 435c εἴδη ἐν τῇ αὑτοῦ ψυχῇ ἔχοντα, διὰ τὰ αὐτὰ πάθη ἐκείνοις τῶν αὐτῶν ὀνομάτων ὀρθῶς ἀξιοῦσθαι τῇ πόλει.

"Then a just man won't differ at all from a just city with respect to the form of justice itself; he'll be like it."

"Like it," he said.

"But the city seemed to be just when the three kinds of natures present in it each did their own work; and it was moderate, courageous and wise because of certain other conditions and states of those same classes."

"True," he said.

"In that case, my friend, we'll expect the individual to have these same 435c forms in his own soul, and to be rightly called by the same names as the city because they're in the same conditions."

435c πᾶσα ἀνάγκη, ἔφη.

εἰς φαῦλόν γε αὖ, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, ὦ θαυμάσιε, σκέμμα ἐμπεπτώκαμεν περὶ ψυχῆς, εἴτε ἔχει τὰ τρία εἴδη ταῦτα ἐν αὐτῇ εἴτε μή.

οὐ πάνυ μοι δοκοῦμεν, ἔφη, εἰς φαῦλον· ἴσως γάρ, ὦ Σώκρατες, τὸ λεγόμενον ἀληθές, ὅτι χαλεπὰ τὰ καλά.

"It has to be so," he said.

"Well, my remarkable friend," I said, "here we've stumbled on another trivial little question about the soul: does it have these three forms in it or not?"

"It doesn't look trivial to me at all," he said. "Perhaps the saying is true, Socrates, that fine things are hard."

φαίνεται, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ. καὶ εὖ γ᾽ ἴσθι, ὦ Γλαύκων, ὡς ἡ 435d ἐμὴ δόξα, ἀκριβῶς μὲν τοῦτο ἐκ τοιούτων μεθόδων, οἵαις νῦν ἐν τοῖς λόγοις χρώμεθα, οὐ μή ποτε λάβωμεν— ἄλλη γὰρ μακροτέρα καὶ πλείων ὁδὸς ἡ ἐπὶ τοῦτο ἄγουσα — ἴσως μέντοι τῶν γε προειρημένων τε καὶ προεσκεμμένων ἀξίως.

οὐκοῦν ἀγαπητόν; ἔφη· ἐμοὶ μὲν γὰρ ἔν γε τῷ παρόντι ἱκανῶς ἂν ἔχοι.

ἀλλὰ μέντοι, εἶπον, ἔμοιγε καὶ πάνυ ἐξαρκέσει.

μὴ τοίνυν ἀποκάμῃς, ἔφη, ἀλλὰ σκόπει. 435e

"Evidently," I said. "And you should know, Glaucon, that in my 435d opinion we'll never get an exact grasp of this by methods like the ones we're now using in our discussion—the road that leads there is a different one, longer and fuller. But perhaps we can manage it in a way that lives up to what we've already said and examined."

"Isn't that enough to be content with?" he said. "For me, at present anyway, it would be enough."

"Well," I said, "it will certainly do for me too."

"Then don't lose heart," he said. "Carry on with the inquiry." 435e

435e ἆρ᾽ οὖν ἡμῖν, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, πολλὴ ἀνάγκη ὁμολογεῖν ὅτι γε τὰ αὐτὰ ἐν ἑκάστῳ ἔνεστιν ἡμῶν εἴδη τε καὶ ἤθη ἅπερ ἐν τῇ πόλει; οὐ γάρ που ἄλλοθεν ἐκεῖσε ἀφῖκται.

"Well," I said, "aren't we absolutely bound to agree that the same forms and characteristics are present in each of us as in the city? They surely didn't get there from anywhere else.

γελοῖον γὰρ ἂν εἴη εἴ τις οἰηθείη τὸ θυμοειδὲς μὴ ἐκ τῶν ἰδιωτῶν ἐν ταῖς πόλεσιν ἐγγεγονέναι, οἳ δὴ καὶ ἔχουσι ταύτην τὴν αἰτίαν, οἷον οἱ κατὰ τὴν Θρᾴκην τε καὶ Σκυθικὴν καὶ σχεδόν τι κατὰ τὸν ἄνω τόπον, ἢ τὸ φιλομαθές, ὃ δὴ τὸν παρ᾽ ἡμῖν 436a μάλιστ᾽ ἄν τις αἰτιάσαιτο τόπον, ἢ τὸ φιλοχρήματον τὸ περὶ τούς τε

"It would be absurd for anyone to think that the spirited part didn't come into cities from the individuals who are credited with it—the people of Thrace and Scythia, for instance, and pretty much the whole northern region—or the love of learning, which one would chiefly credit to our part 436a

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	Φοίνικας εἶναι καὶ τοὺς κατὰ Αἴγυπτον φαίη τις ἂν οὐχ ἥκιστα.	of the world, or the love of money, which one might say is found especially among the Phoenicians and the people of Egypt."
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
	τοῦτο μὲν δὴ οὕτως ἔχει, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ οὐδὲν χαλεπὸν γνῶναι.	"So that's how that is," I said, "and it's not hard to recognize."
	οὐ δῆτα.	"Certainly not."[4]
436a	τόδε δὲ ἤδη χαλεπόν, εἰ τῷ αὐτῷ τούτῳ ἕκαστα πράττομεν ἢ τρισὶν οὖσιν ἄλλο ἄλλῳ· μανθάνομεν μὲν ἑτέρῳ, θυμούμεθα δὲ ἄλλῳ τῶν ἐν ἡμῖν, ἐπιθυμοῦμεν δ' αὖ τρίτῳ τινὶ τῶν περὶ τὴν τροφήν τε καὶ γέννησιν ἡδονῶν καὶ ὅσα τούτων [436b] ἀδελφά, ἢ ὅλῃ τῇ ψυχῇ καθ' ἕκαστον αὐτῶν πράττομεν, ὅταν ὁρμήσωμεν. ταῦτ' ἔσται τὰ χαλεπὰ διορίσασθαι ἀξίως λόγου.	"But this is hard: whether we do each of these things with the same thing, or with three different things, one for each. Do we learn with one of the things in us, get angry with another, and with a third have appetites for the pleasures of food and procreation and whatever is akin to [436b] them? Or do we act with the whole soul in each case, whenever we set about them? That's what will be hard to determine in a way that does the question justice."
	καὶ ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ, ἔφη.	"I think so too," he said.
	ὧδε τοίνυν ἐπιχειρῶμεν αὐτὰ ὁρίζεσθαι, εἴτε τὰ αὐτὰ ἀλλήλοις εἴτε ἕτερά ἐστι.	"Then let's try to settle whether they're the same as one another or different, in this way."
	πῶς;	"How?"

THE THREE PARTS OF THE SOUL

Socrates argues that the soul has three parts: reason, spirit and appetite.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
436b	**SOCRATES** δῆλον ὅτι ταὐτὸν τἀναντία ποιεῖν ἢ πάσχειν κατὰ ταὐτόν γε καὶ πρὸς ταὐτὸν οὐκ ἐθελήσει ἅμα, ὥστε ἄν που εὑρίσκωμεν ἐν αὐτοῖς ταῦτα γιγνόμενα, εἰσόμεθα ὅτι οὐ ταὐτὸν [436c] ἦν ἀλλὰ πλείω.	**SOCRATES** "It's clear that the same thing won't be willing to do or undergo opposite things at the same time, in the same respect and in relation to the same thing. So if we find this happening among these things, we'll know that there wasn't one thing [436c] but more."
	εἶεν.	"Very well."
	σκόπει δὴ ὃ λέγω.	"Then consider what I'm about to say."
	λέγε, ἔφη.	"Go on," he said.
	ἑστάναι, εἶπον, καὶ κινεῖσθαι τὸ αὐτὸ ἅμα κατὰ τὸ αὐτὸ ἆρα δυνατόν;	"Is it possible," I said, "for the same thing to stand still and move at the same time in the same respect?"
	οὐδαμῶς.	"Not at all."
436c	ἔτι τοίνυν ἀκριβέστερον ὁμολογησώμεθα, μή πῃ προϊόντες ἀμφισβητήσωμεν. εἰ γάρ τις λέγοι ἄνθρωπον ἑστηκότα, κινοῦντα δὲ τὰς χεῖράς τε καὶ τὴν κεφαλήν, ὅτι ὁ αὐτὸς ἕστηκέ τε καὶ κινεῖται ἅμα, οὐκ ἂν οἶμαι ἀξιοῖμεν	"Let's make our agreement still more precise, so that we don't end up disputing it as we go on. If someone said of a man who is standing still but moving his hands and head that the same man is

4 Thrace and Scythia lay to the north and north-east of Greece; the Greeks thought of their peoples as warlike.

GREEK

οὕτω [436d] λέγειν δεῖν, ἀλλ' ὅτι τὸ μέν τι αὐτοῦ ἕστηκε, τὸ δὲ κινεῖται. οὐχ οὕτω;

οὕτω.

436d οὐκοῦν καὶ εἰ ἔτι μᾶλλον χαριεντίζοιτο ὁ ταῦτα λέγων, κομψευόμενος ὡς οἵ γε στρόβιλοι ὅλοι ἑστᾶσί τε ἅμα καὶ κινοῦνται, ὅταν ἐν τῷ αὐτῷ πήξαντες τὸ κέντρον περιφέρωνται, ἢ καὶ ἄλλο τι κύκλῳ περιιὸν ἐν τῇ αὐτῇ ἕδρᾳ τοῦτο δρᾷ, οὐκ ἂν ἀποδεχοίμεθα, ὡς οὐ κατὰ ταὐτὰ ἑαυτῶν [436e] τὰ τοιαῦτα τότε μενόντων τε καὶ φερομένων, ἀλλὰ φαῖμεν ἂν ἔχειν αὐτὰ εὐθύ τε καὶ περιφερὲς ἐν αὑτοῖς, καὶ κατὰ μὲν τὸ εὐθὺ ἑστάναι—οὐδαμῇ γὰρ ἀποκλίνειν—κατὰ δὲ τὸ περιφερὲς κύκλῳ κινεῖσθαι, καὶ ὅταν δὲ τὴν εὐθυωρίαν ἢ εἰς δεξιὰν ἢ εἰς ἀριστερὰν ἢ εἰς τὸ πρόσθεν ἢ εἰς τὸ ὄπισθεν ἐγκλίνῃ ἅμα περιφερόμενον, τότε οὐδαμῇ ἔστιν ἑστάναι.

436e καὶ ὀρθῶς γε, ἔφη.

οὐδὲν ἄρα ἡμᾶς τῶν τοιούτων λεγόμενον ἐκπλήξει, οὐδὲ μᾶλλόν τι πείσει ὡς ποτέ τι ἂν τὸ αὐτὸ ὂν ἅμα κατὰ [437a] τὸ αὐτὸ πρὸς τὸ αὐτὸ τἀναντία πάθοι ἢ καὶ εἴη ἢ καὶ ποιήσειεν.

οὔκουν ἐμέ γε, ἔφη.

ἀλλ' ὅμως, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἵνα μὴ ἀναγκαζώμεθα πάσας τὰς τοιαύτας ἀμφισβητήσεις ἐπεξιόντες καὶ βεβαιούμενοι ὡς οὐκ ἀληθεῖς οὔσας μηκύνειν, ὑποθέμενοι ὡς τούτου οὕτως ἔχοντος εἰς τὸ πρόσθεν προΐωμεν, ὁμολογήσαντες, ἐάν ποτε ἄλλῃ φανῇ ταῦτα ἢ ταύτῃ, πάντα ἡμῖν τὰ ἀπὸ τούτου συμβαίνοντα λελυμένα ἔσεσθαι.

437a ἀλλὰ χρή, ἔφη, ταῦτα ποιεῖν. [437b]

ἆρ' ἂν οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ ἐπινεύειν τῷ ἀνανεύειν καὶ τὸ ἐφίεσθαί τινος λαβεῖν τῷ ἀπαρνεῖσθαι καὶ τὸ προσάγεσθαι τῷ ἀπωθεῖσθαι, πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα τῶν ἐναντίων ἀλλήλοις θείης εἴτε ποιημάτων εἴτε παθημάτων; οὐδὲν γὰρ ταύτῃ διοίσει.

ἀλλ', ἦ δ' ὅς, τῶν ἐναντίων.

437b τί οὖν; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· διψῆν καὶ πεινῆν καὶ ὅλως τὰς ἐπιθυμίας, καὶ αὖ τὸ ἐθέλειν καὶ τὸ βούλεσθαι, οὐ πάντα ταῦτα [437c] εἰς ἐκεῖνά ποι ἂν θείης τὰ εἴδη τὰ νυνδὴ λεχθέντα; οἷον ἀεὶ τὴν τοῦ ἐπιθυμοῦντος ψυχὴν οὐχὶ ἤτοι ἐφίεσθαι φήσεις ἐκείνου οὗ ἂν ἐπιθυμῇ, ἢ προσάγεσθαι

ENGLISH

standing still and moving at the same time, we wouldn't, I think, accept that as the right [436d] way to put it; we'd say that one part of him is standing still and another part is moving. Isn't that so?"

"It is."

"And if the person saying this got even more playful and argued ingeniously that spinning tops, at least, stand still and move as wholes at the same time, when they spin with the peg fixed in one spot—or that anything else that goes around in a circle in the same place does the same—we wouldn't accept it, since in such cases it isn't in the same parts [436e] of themselves that they're at rest and in motion. We'd say they have in them an axis and a circumference, and that with respect to the axis they're standing still, since it doesn't tilt at all, while with respect to the circumference they're moving in a circle; and when the axis tilts to the right or the left, forward or backward, while it's spinning, then it isn't standing still in any way."

"Quite right," he said.

"So none of these objections will throw us, or do anything more to persuade us that the same thing could ever, at the same time, in the same [437a] respect and in relation to the same thing, undergo or be or do opposite things."

"They won't persuade me, anyway," he said.

"All the same," I said, "so that we're not forced to spend a long time going through all these objections and proving them false, let's assume that this is so and move on—agreeing that if it ever turns out otherwise, everything we've concluded from it will be void."

"Yes, that's what we should do," he said. [437b]

"Then would you put nodding yes and shaking one's head no, reaching out to take something and refusing it, drawing something toward oneself and pushing it away—all such things—among opposites, whether as things one does or things one undergoes? That won't make any difference here."

"Yes," he said, "among opposites."

"Well then," I said, "thirst and hunger and the appetites in general, and again wishing and wanting —wouldn't you put all these [437c] somewhere among the kinds we just mentioned? For instance, won't you say that the soul of someone with an appetite

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τοῦτο ὃ ἂν βούληταί οἱ γενέσθαι, ἢ αὖ, καθ' ὅσον ἐθέλει τί οἱ πορισθῆναι, ἐπινεύειν τοῦτο πρὸς αὑτὴν ὥσπερ τινὸς ἐρωτῶντος, ἐπορεγομένην αὐτοῦ τῆς γενέσεως;	always either reaches out for what it has an appetite for, or draws toward itself what it wants to have; or again, insofar as it wishes something to be provided for it, nods yes to it, as if someone had asked, in its longing for it to come about?
	ἔγωγε.	"I will."
437c	τί δέ; τὸ ἀβουλεῖν καὶ μὴ ἐθέλειν μηδ' ἐπιθυμεῖν οὐκ εἰς τὸ ἀπωθεῖν καὶ ἀπελαύνειν ἀπ' αὐτῆς καὶ εἰς ἅπαντα τἀναντία ἐκείνοις θήσομεν; 437d	"And what about not wanting, not wishing and not having an appetite? Won't we put these under pushing away and driving off from the soul, and among all the opposites of the others?" 437d
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
	τούτων δὴ οὕτως ἐχόντων ἐπιθυμιῶν τι φήσομεν εἶναι εἶδος, καὶ ἐναργεστάτας αὐτῶν τούτων ἥν τε δίψαν καλοῦμεν καὶ ἣν πεῖναν;	"Since that's so, shall we say that the appetites form a kind, and that the most conspicuous of them are what we call thirst and hunger?"
	φήσομεν, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"We shall," he said.
	οὐκοῦν τὴν μὲν ποτοῦ, τὴν δ' ἐδωδῆς;	"One for drink, the other for food?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
437d	ἆρ' οὖν, καθ' ὅσον δίψα ἐστί, πλέονος ἄν τινος ἢ οὗ λέγομεν ἐπιθυμία ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ εἴη, οἷον δίψα ἐστὶ δίψα ἆρά γε θερμοῦ ποτοῦ ἢ ψυχροῦ, ἢ πολλοῦ ἢ ὀλίγου, ἢ καὶ ἑνὶ λόγῳ ποιοῦ τινος πώματος; ἢ ἐὰν μέν τις θερμότης τῷ 437e δίψει προσῇ, τὴν τοῦ ψυχροῦ ἐπιθυμίαν προσπαρέχοιτ' ἄν, ἐὰν δὲ ψυχρότης, τὴν τοῦ θερμοῦ; ἐὰν δὲ διὰ πλήθους παρουσίαν πολλὴ ἡ δίψα ᾖ, τὴν τοῦ πολλοῦ παρέξεται, ἐὰν δὲ ὀλίγη, τὴν τοῦ ὀλίγου; αὐτὸ δὲ τὸ διψῆν οὐ μή ποτε ἄλλου γένηται ἐπιθυμία ἢ οὗπερ πέφυκεν, αὐτοῦ πώματος, καὶ αὖ τὸ πεινῆν βρώματος;	"Now insofar as it's thirst, would it be an appetite in the soul for anything more than what we've said? For instance, is thirst thirst for hot drink or cold, or much or little—in a word, for some particular kind of drink? Or rather, if some heat is added to 437e the thirst, that would bring in an appetite for something cold as well, and if coldness, for something hot; and if the thirst is great because greatness is present, it will bring in the appetite for a lot, and if small, for a little? But thirst itself will never be an appetite for anything other than its natural object, drink itself—and hunger, likewise, for food?"
437e	οὕτως, ἔφη, αὐτή γε ἡ ἐπιθυμία ἑκάστη αὐτοῦ μόνον ἑκάστου οὗ πέφυκεν, τοῦ δὲ τοίου ἢ τοίου τὰ προσγιγνόμενα.	"Yes," he said, "each appetite itself is only for its own natural object, and it's what is added that makes it for this or that kind."
	μήτοι τις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀσκέπτους ἡμᾶς ὄντας θορυβήσῃ, ὡς οὐδεὶς ποτοῦ ἐπιθυμεῖ ἀλλὰ χρηστοῦ ποτοῦ, καὶ οὐ σίτου ἀλλὰ χρηστοῦ σίτου. πάντες γὰρ ἄρα τῶν ἀγαθῶν ἐπιθυμοῦσιν· εἰ οὖν ἡ δίψα ἐπιθυμία ἐστί, χρηστοῦ ἂν εἴη εἴτε πώματος εἴτε ἄλλου ὅτου ἐστὶν ἐπιθυμία, καὶ αἱ ἄλλαι οὕτω.	"Then let no one catch us off our guard," I said, "and throw us into confusion by saying that nobody has an appetite for drink but for good drink, and not for food but for good food—since everyone, after all, has an appetite for good things; so if thirst is an appetite, it would be for good drink, or good whatever it's an appetite for, and the same with the others."
	ἴσως γὰρ ἄν, ἔφη, δοκοῖ τι λέγειν ὁ ταῦτα λέγων.	"Well," he said, "the person who says that might seem to have a point."
438a		"All the same," I said, "among things that are such as to be relative to 438b something, those of a partic-

GREEK

ἀλλὰ μέντοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅσα γ' ἐστὶ τοιαῦτα οἷα εἶναί [438b] του, τὰ μὲν ποιὰ ἄττα ποιοῦ τινός ἐστιν, ὡς ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ, τὰ δ' αὐτὰ ἕκαστα αὐτοῦ ἑκάστου μόνον.

οὐκ ἔμαθον, ἔφη.

οὐκ ἔμαθες, ἔφην, ὅτι τὸ μεῖζον τοιοῦτόν ἐστιν οἷον τινὸς εἶναι μεῖζον;

πάνυ γε.

οὐκοῦν τοῦ ἐλάττονος;

ναί.

τὸ δέ γε πολὺ μεῖζον πολὺ ἐλάττονος. ἦ γάρ;

ναί.

ἆρ' οὖν καὶ τὸ ποτὲ μεῖζον ποτὲ ἐλάττονος, καὶ τὸ ἐσόμενον μεῖζον ἐσομένου ἐλάττονος;

ἀλλὰ τί μήν; ἦ δ' ὅς. [438c]

ENGLISH

ular kind are relative to something of a particular kind, it seems to me, while those that are just themselves are relative only to things that are just themselves."

"I don't follow," he said.

"Don't you follow," I said, "that the greater is such as to be greater than something?"

"Certainly."

"Than the less?"

"Yes."

"And the much greater than the much less, right?"

"Yes."

"And the once greater than the once less, and what will be greater than what will be less?"

"What else?" he said. [438c]

438c καὶ τὰ πλείω δὴ πρὸς τὰ ἐλάττω καὶ τὰ διπλάσια πρὸς τὰ ἡμίσεα καὶ πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα, καὶ αὖ βαρύτερα πρὸς κουφότερα καὶ θάττω πρὸς τὰ βραδύτερα, καὶ ἔτι γε τὰ θερμὰ πρὸς τὰ ψυχρὰ καὶ πάντα τὰ τούτοις ὅμοια ἆρ' οὐχ οὕτως ἔχει;

πάνυ μὲν οὖν.

"And more in relation to fewer, double to half, and everything of that sort; and again heavier to lighter, faster to slower, and hot to cold as well, and everything like them—isn't it the same with them?"

"Certainly."

τί δὲ τὰ περὶ τὰς ἐπιστήμας; οὐχ ὁ αὐτὸς τρόπος; ἐπιστήμη μὲν αὐτὴ μαθήματος αὐτοῦ ἐπιστήμη ἐστὶν ἢ ὅτου δὴ δεῖ θεῖναι τὴν ἐπιστήμην, ἐπιστήμη δέ τις καὶ ποιά τις [438d] ποιοῦ τινος καὶ τινός. λέγω δὲ τὸ τοιόνδε· οὐκ ἐπειδὴ οἰκίας ἐργασίας ἐπιστήμη ἐγένετο, διήνεγκε τῶν ἄλλων ἐπιστημῶν, ὥστε οἰκοδομικὴ κληθῆναι;

τί μήν;

ἆρ' οὐ τῷ ποιά τις εἶναι, οἵα ἑτέρα οὐδεμία τῶν ἄλλων;

ναί.

οὐκοῦν ἐπειδὴ ποιοῦ τινος, καὶ αὐτὴ ποιά τις ἐγένετο; καὶ αἱ ἄλλαι οὕτω τέχναι τε καὶ ἐπιστῆμαι;

ἔστιν οὕτω.

"And what about the kinds of knowledge? Isn't it the same pattern? Knowledge itself is knowledge of learning itself, or of whatever it is we should take knowledge to be of; whereas a particular kind of knowledge [438d] is of a particular kind of thing. I mean something like this. When there came to be a knowledge of making houses, didn't it differ from the other kinds of knowledge, so that it was called housebuilding?"

"Of course."

"Wasn't that because it was of a particular kind, as none of the others was?"

"Yes."

"And it became of a particular kind itself because it was of something of a particular kind? And the same goes for the other crafts and kinds of knowledge?"

"That's so."

438d τοῦτο τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, φάθι με τότε βούλεσθαι λέγειν, εἰ ἄρα νῦν ἔμαθες, ὅτι ὅσα ἐστὶν οἷα εἶναί του, αὐτὰ μὲν μόνα αὐτῶν μόνων ἐστίν, τῶν δὲ ποιῶν τινων ποιὰ ἄττα. [438e] καὶ οὔ τι λέγω, ὡς, οἵων ἂν ᾖ, τοιαῦτα καὶ ἔστιν, ὡς ἄρα καὶ τῶν ὑγιεινῶν καὶ νοσωδῶν ἡ ἐπιστήμη ὑγιεινὴ

"Then take this," I said, "to be what I meant earlier, if you've understood it now: of things that are relative to something, those that are just themselves are relative only to things that are just themselves, while things of a particular kind are relative to

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καὶ νοσώδης καὶ τῶν κακῶν καὶ τῶν ἀγαθῶν κακὴ καὶ ἀγαθή· ἀλλ' ἐπειδὴ οὐκ αὐτοῦ οὗπερ ἐπιστήμη ἐστὶν ἐγένετο ἐπιστήμη, ἀλλὰ ποιοῦ τινος, τοῦτο δ' ἦν ὑγιεινὸν καὶ νοσῶδες, ποιὰ δή τις συνέβη καὶ αὐτὴ γενέσθαι, καὶ τοῦτο αὐτὴν ἐποίησεν μηκέτι ἐπιστήμην ἁπλῶς καλεῖσθαι, ἀλλὰ τοῦ ποιοῦ τινος προσγενομένου ἰατρικήν.	things of a particular kind. [438e] And I don't mean that they're of the same kind as the things they're relative to—as if knowledge of what's healthy and diseased were itself healthy and diseased, or knowledge of bad and good things were itself bad and good. I mean that when knowledge came to be not of the very thing knowledge is of, but of something of a particular kind—in this case the healthy and the diseased—it turned out to be of a particular kind itself; and that made it no longer be called simply knowledge but, with the particular kind added, medicine."
438e	ἔμαθον, ἔφη, καί μοι δοκεῖ οὕτως ἔχειν.	"I understand," he said, "and I think that's so."
	τὸ δὲ δὴ δίψος, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐ τούτων θήσεις τῶν τινὸς εἶναι τοῦτο ὅπερ ἐστίν; ἔστι δὲ δήπου δίψος—	"Then what about thirst?" I said. "Won't you put it among the things that are what they are by being relative to something? Thirst is surely thirst for—"
	ἔγωγε, ἦ δ' ὅς· πώματός γε.	"I will," he said. "For drink."
	οὐκοῦν ποιοῦ μέν τινος πώματος ποιόν τι καὶ δίψος, δίψος δ' οὖν αὐτὸ οὔτε πολλοῦ οὔτε ὀλίγου, οὔτε ἀγαθοῦ οὔτε κακοῦ, οὐδ' ἑνὶ λόγῳ ποιοῦ τινος, ἀλλ' αὐτοῦ πώματος μόνον αὐτὸ δίψος πέφυκεν;	"So for a particular kind of drink there's a particular kind of thirst; but thirst itself isn't for much or little, or good or bad, or in a word for any particular kind, but thirst itself is naturally only for drink itself?"
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν.	"Absolutely."
439a	τοῦ διψῶντος ἄρα ἡ ψυχή, καθ' ὅσον διψῇ, οὐκ ἄλλο [439b] τι βούλεται ἢ πιεῖν, καὶ τούτου ὀρέγεται καὶ ἐπὶ τοῦτο ὁρμᾷ.	"So the soul of someone who is thirsty, insofar as it's thirsty, wants nothing other [439b] than to drink; that's what it longs for and strives toward."
	δῆλον δή.	"Clearly."
	οὐκοῦν εἴ ποτέ τι αὐτὴν ἀνθέλκει διψῶσαν, ἕτερον ἄν τι ἐν αὐτῇ εἴη αὐτοῦ τοῦ διψῶντος καὶ ἄγοντος ὥσπερ θηρίον ἐπὶ τὸ πιεῖν; οὐ γὰρ δή, φαμέν, τό γε αὐτὸ τῷ αὐτῷ ἑαυτοῦ περὶ τὸ αὐτὸ ἅμ' ἂν τἀναντία πράττοι.	"Then if something ever pulls it back when it's thirsty, that would be something in it different from the thing that's thirsty and drives it like a beast to drink? Because, we say, the same thing can't do opposite things with the same part of itself, concerning the same thing, at the same time."
	οὐ γὰρ οὖν.	"No, it can't."
439b	ὥσπερ γε οἶμαι τοῦ τοξότου οὐ καλῶς ἔχει λέγειν ὅτι αὐτοῦ ἅμα αἱ χεῖρες τὸ τόξον ἀπωθοῦνταί τε καὶ προσέλκονται, ἀλλ' ὅτι ἄλλη μὲν ἡ ἀπωθοῦσα χείρ, ἑτέρα δὲ ἡ προσαγομένη. [439c]	"In the same way, I think, it isn't right to say of an archer that his hands push the bow away and pull it toward him at the same time; rather, one hand pushes it away and the other draws it in." [439c]
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
	πότερον δὴ φῶμέν τινας ἔστιν ὅτε διψῶντας οὐκ ἐθέλειν πιεῖν;	"Now, shall we say that some people are sometimes thirsty and yet unwilling to drink?"
	καὶ μάλα γ', ἔφη, πολλοὺς καὶ πολλάκις.	"Certainly," he said, "many people, and often."
	τί οὖν, ἔφην ἐγώ, φαίη τις ἂν τούτων πέρι; οὐκ ἐνεῖναι μὲν ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ αὐτῶν τὸ κελεῦον, ἐνεῖναι δὲ τὸ κωλῦον πιεῖν, ἄλλο ὂν καὶ κρατοῦν τοῦ κελεύοντος;	"Then what should one say about them?" I said. "Isn't it that there's something in their soul urging them to drink and something forbidding them,

GREEK

ENGLISH

ἔμοιγε, ἔφη, δοκεῖ.

something different that overpowers what's urging them?"

"I think so," he said.

439c ἆρ' οὖν οὐ τὸ μὲν κωλῦον τὰ τοιαῦτα ἐγγίγνεται, ὅταν 439d ἐγγένηται, ἐκ λογισμοῦ, τὰ δὲ ἄγοντα καὶ ἕλκοντα διὰ παθημάτων τε καὶ νοσημάτων παραγίγνεται;

φαίνεται.

οὐ δὴ ἀλόγως, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀξιώσομεν αὐτὰ διττά τε καὶ ἕτερα ἀλλήλων εἶναι, τὸ μὲν ᾧ λογίζεται λογιστικὸν προσαγορεύοντες τῆς ψυχῆς, τὸ δὲ ᾧ ἐρᾷ τε καὶ πεινῇ καὶ διψῇ καὶ περὶ τὰς ἄλλας ἐπιθυμίας ἐπτόηται ἀλόγιστόν τε καὶ ἐπιθυμητικόν, πληρώσεών τινων καὶ ἡδονῶν ἑταῖρον. 439e

οὔκ, ἀλλ' εἰκότως, ἔφη, ἡγοίμεθ' ἂν οὕτως.

"And doesn't what forbids such things arise, when 439d it does arise, from reasoning, while what drives and drags them on comes through feelings and diseased states?"

"Evidently."

"Then it won't be unreasonable," I said, "for us to claim that they are two, and different from each other, calling the part of the soul with which it reasons the reasoning part, and the part with which it loves and hungers and thirsts and is stirred up by the other appetites the unreasoning and appetitive part, companion of certain satisfactions and pleasures." 439e

"No," he said, "it would be quite reasonable for us to think so."

439e ταῦτα μὲν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δύο ἡμῖν ὡρίσθω εἴδη ἐν ψυχῇ ἐνόντα· τὸ δὲ δὴ τοῦ θυμοῦ καὶ ᾧ θυμούμεθα πότερον τρίτον, ἢ τούτων ποτέρῳ ἂν εἴη ὁμοφυές;

ἴσως, ἔφη, τῷ ἑτέρῳ, τῷ ἐπιθυμητικῷ.

"Well then," I said, "let's take it that these two forms present in the soul have been marked off. But what about spirit, the thing with which we get angry? Is it a third, or would it be of the same nature as one of these two?"

"Perhaps," he said, "as one of them—the appetitive part."

ἀλλ', ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ποτὲ ἀκούσας τι πιστεύω τούτῳ· ὡς ἄρα Λεόντιος ὁ Ἀγλαΐωνος ἀνιὼν ἐκ Πειραιῶς ὑπὸ τὸ βόρειον τεῖχος ἐκτός, αἰσθόμενος νεκροὺς παρὰ τῷ δημίῳ κειμένους, ἅμα μὲν ἰδεῖν ἐπιθυμοῖ, ἅμα δὲ αὖ δυσχεραίνοι καὶ ἀποτρέποι ἑαυτόν, καὶ τέως μὲν μάχοιτό τε καὶ παρακαλύπτοιτο, 440a κρατούμενος δ' οὖν ὑπὸ τῆς ἐπιθυμίας, διελκύσας τοὺς ὀφθαλμούς, προσδραμὼν πρὸς τοὺς νεκρούς, "ἰδοὺ ὑμῖν," ἔφη, "ὦ κακοδαίμονες, ἐμπλήσθητε τοῦ καλοῦ θεάματος."

ἤκουσα, ἔφη, καὶ αὐτός.

οὗτος μέντοι, ἔφην, ὁ λόγος σημαίνει τὴν ὀργὴν πολεμεῖν ἐνίοτε ταῖς ἐπιθυμίαις ὡς ἄλλο ὂν ἄλλῳ.

"But I once heard a story," I said, "and I believe it. Leontius son of Aglaion was coming up from the Piraeus, along the outside of the North Wall, when he noticed corpses lying by the executioner. He had an appetite to look at them, but at the same time he was disgusted and tried to turn himself away. For a while he struggled and covered his face, 440a but in the end, overcome by the appetite, he forced his eyes wide open, ran up to the corpses and said, 'There you are, you wretches—take your fill of the fine sight!'"

"I've heard it myself," he said.

"Yet this story," I said, "shows that anger sometimes makes war on the appetites, as one thing against another."[5]

440a σημαίνει γάρ, ἔφη.

οὐκοῦν καὶ ἄλλοθι, ἔφην, πολλαχοῦ αἰσθανόμεθα, ὅταν 440b βιάζωνταί τινα παρὰ τὸν λογισμὸν ἐπιθυμίαι,

"Yes, it does," he said.

"And in many other cases," I said, "don't we notice that when appetites 440b force someone against his

5 The North Wall was one of the Long Walls joining Athens to the Piraeus.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	λοιδοροῦντά τε αὐτὸν καὶ θυμούμενον τῷ βιαζομένῳ ἐν αὐτῷ, καὶ ὥσπερ δυοῖν στασιαζόντοιν σύμμαχον τῷ λόγῳ γιγνόμενον τὸν θυμὸν τοῦ τοιούτου; ταῖς δ' ἐπιθυμίαις αὐτὸν κοινωνήσαντα, αἰροῦντος λόγου μὴ δεῖν ἀντιπράττειν, οἶμαί σε οὐκ ἂν φάναι γενομένου ποτὲ ἐν σαυτῷ τοῦ τοιούτου αἰσθέσθαι, οἶμαι δ' οὐδ' ἐν ἄλλῳ.	reasoning, he reproaches himself and is angry at the thing in him that's forcing him, and that, as if two factions were at war, the spirit of such a person becomes the ally of reason? But spirit making common cause with the appetites when reason has decided it mustn't be opposed—I don't think you'd say you had ever noticed that sort of thing happening in yourself, or, I imagine, in anyone else."
	οὐ μὰ τὸν Δία, ἔφη. 440c	"No, by Zeus," he said. 440c
440c	τί δέ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅταν τις οἴηται ἀδικεῖν; οὐχ ὅσῳ ἂν γενναιότερος ᾖ, τοσούτῳ ἧττον δύναται ὀργίζεσθαι καὶ πεινῶν καὶ ῥιγῶν καὶ ἄλλο ὁτιοῦν τῶν τοιούτων πάσχων ὑπ' ἐκείνου ὃν ἂν οἴηται δικαίως ταῦτα δρᾶν, καί, ὃ λέγω, οὐκ ἐθέλει πρὸς τοῦτον αὐτοῦ ἐγείρεσθαι ὁ θυμός;	"And what about when someone thinks he's in the wrong?" I said. "Isn't it true that the nobler he is, the less able he is to be angry at suffering hunger or cold or anything else of the kind at the hands of someone he thinks is justly doing this to him—and his spirit, as I say, refuses to be roused against that person?"
	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη.	"True," he said.
	τί δὲ ὅταν ἀδικεῖσθαί τις ἡγῆται; οὐκ ἐν τούτῳ ζεῖ τε καὶ χαλεπαίνει καὶ συμμαχεῖ τῷ δοκοῦντι δικαίῳ καί, διὰ τὸ πεινῆν καὶ διὰ τὸ ῥιγοῦν καὶ πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα πάσχειν, 440d ὑπομένων καὶ νικᾷ καὶ οὐ λήγει τῶν γενναίων, πρὶν ἂν ἢ διαπράξηται ἢ τελευτήσῃ ἢ ὥσπερ κύων ὑπὸ νομέως ὑπὸ τοῦ λόγου τοῦ παρ' αὐτῷ ἀνακληθεὶς πραϋνθῇ;	"And what about when someone thinks he's being wronged? Doesn't he seethe and chafe in that case, and fight on the side of what seems just? And through hunger and cold and every suffering of that kind, 440d doesn't he hold out and win, and not give up his noble efforts until he either succeeds, or dies, or is called back by the reason within him and calmed, like a dog by a shepherd?"
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, ἔοικε τούτῳ ᾧ λέγεις· καίτοι γ' ἐν τῇ ἡμετέρᾳ πόλει τοὺς ἐπικούρους ὥσπερ κύνας ἐθέμεθα ὑπηκόους τῶν ἀρχόντων ὥσπερ ποιμένων πόλεως.	"It's very like what you describe," he said. "And in fact in our city we made the auxiliaries like dogs, obedient to the rulers, who are like the city's shepherds."
440d	καλῶς γάρ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, νοεῖς ὃ βούλομαι λέγειν. ἀλλ' ἦ πρὸς τούτῳ καὶ τόδε ἐνθυμῇ; 440e	"You've understood very well what I mean," I said. "But have you also taken note of this?" 440e
	τὸ ποῖον;	"What?"
	ὅτι τοὐναντίον ἢ ἀρτίως ἡμῖν φαίνεται περὶ τοῦ θυμοειδοῦς. τότε μὲν γὰρ ἐπιθυμητικόν τι αὐτὸ ᾠόμεθα εἶναι, νῦν δὲ πολλοῦ δεῖν φαμεν, ἀλλὰ πολὺ μᾶλλον αὐτὸ ἐν τῇ τῆς ψυχῆς στάσει τίθεσθαι τὰ ὅπλα πρὸς τὸ λογιστικόν.	"That what we're now seeing about the spirited part is the opposite of what we thought just now. Then we supposed it was something appetitive; now we say it's far from that, and that in the soul's civil war it much rather takes up arms on the side of the reasoning part."
	παντάπασιν, ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
440e	ἆρ' οὖν ἕτερον ὂν καὶ τούτου, ἢ λογιστικοῦ τι εἶδος, ὥστε μὴ τρία ἀλλὰ δύο εἴδη εἶναι ἐν ψυχῇ, λογιστικὸν καὶ ἐπιθυμητικόν; ἢ καθάπερ ἐν τῇ πόλει συνεῖχεν αὐτὴν τρία 441a ὄντα γένη, χρηματιστικόν, ἐπικουρητικόν, βουλευτικόν, οὕτως καὶ ἐν ψυχῇ τρίτον τοῦτό ἐστι τὸ	"Then is it different from that as well, or a form of the reasoning part, so that there are two forms in the soul, not three—the reasoning and the appetitive? Or, just as three 441a classes held the city together—moneymaking, auxiliary and deliberative—is the spirited part a third thing in the soul too,

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	θυμοειδές, ἐπίκουρον ὂν τῷ λογιστικῷ φύσει, ἐὰν μὴ ὑπὸ κακῆς τροφῆς διαφθαρῇ;	by nature the auxiliary of the reasoning part, unless it's corrupted by a bad upbringing?"
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, τρίτον.	"It must be a third," he said.
	ναί, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἄν γε τοῦ λογιστικοῦ ἄλλο τι φανῇ, ὥσπερ τοῦ ἐπιθυμητικοῦ ἐφάνη ἕτερον ὄν.	"Yes," I said, "provided it turns out to be something other than the reasoning part, as it turned out to be different from the appetitive."
441a	ἀλλ' οὐ χαλεπόν, ἔφη, φανῆναι· καὶ γὰρ ἐν τοῖς παιδίοις τοῦτό γ' ἄν τις ἴδοι, ὅτι θυμοῦ μὲν εὐθὺς γενόμενα μεστά ἐστι, λογισμοῦ δ' ἔνιοι μὲν ἔμοιγε δοκοῦσιν οὐδέποτε μεταλαμβάνειν, [441b] οἱ δὲ πολλοὶ ὀψέ ποτε.	"But that's not hard to show," he said. "You can see it even in small children: they're full of spirit right from birth, whereas some of them, it seems to me, never get a share of reason, [441b] and most get one only late."
441b	ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καλῶς γε εἶπες. ἔτι δὲ ἐν τοῖς θηρίοις ἄν τις ἴδοι ὃ λέγεις, ὅτι οὕτως ἔχει. πρὸς δὲ τούτοις καὶ ὃ ἄνω που ἐκεῖ εἴπομεν, τὸ τοῦ Ὁμήρου μαρτυρήσει, τὸ— στῆθος δὲ πλήξας κραδίην ἠνίπαπε μύθῳ· ἐνταῦθα γὰρ δὴ σαφῶς ὡς ἕτερον ἑτέρῳ ἐπιπλῆττον πεποίηκεν [441c] Ὅμηρος τὸ ἀναλογισάμενον περὶ τοῦ βελτίονός τε καὶ χείρονος τῷ ἀλογίστως θυμουμένῳ.	"Yes, by Zeus," I said, "well put. And you could also see in animals that what you say is so. Besides, the line of Homer that we quoted somewhere back there will bear witness: 'He struck his breast and rebuked his heart with words.' For here Homer has clearly represented [441c] the part that has reasoned about better and worse as something different, rebuking the part that is unreasoningly angry."
	κομιδῇ, ἔφη, ὀρθῶς λέγεις.	"You're quite right," he said.[6]

JUSTICE IN THE SOUL

Justice in the soul is each part doing its own work, with reason ruling, like health in the body.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
441c	**SOCRATES** ταῦτα μὲν ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μόγις διανενεύκαμεν, καὶ ἡμῖν ἐπιεικῶς ὡμολόγηται τὰ αὐτὰ μὲν ἐν πόλει, τὰ αὐτὰ δ' ἐν ἑνὸς ἑκάστου τῇ ψυχῇ γένη ἐνεῖναι καὶ ἴσα τὸν ἀριθμόν.	**SOCRATES** "So we've managed to swim through that, though barely," I said, "and we've reached reasonable agreement that the same classes are present in the city and in the soul of each individual, and equal in number."
	ἔστι ταῦτα.	"That's so."
	οὐκοῦν ἐκεῖνό γε ἤδη ἀναγκαῖον, ὡς πόλις ἦν σοφὴ καὶ ᾗ, οὕτω καὶ τὸν ἰδιώτην καὶ τούτῳ σοφὸν εἶναι;	"Then doesn't it follow necessarily that the individual is wise in the same way, and by the same part, as the city was wise?"
	τί μήν; [441d]	"Of course." [441d]
	καὶ ᾗ δὴ ἀνδρεῖος ἰδιώτης καὶ ᾗς, τούτῳ καὶ πόλιν ἀνδρείαν καὶ οὕτως, καὶ τἆλλα πάντα πρὸς ἀρετὴν ὡσαύτως ἀμφότερα ἔχειν;	"And that the city is courageous by the same part and in the same way as the individual is courageous, and that both stand alike in everything else that has to do with excellence?"
	ἀνάγκη.	"Necessarily."
441d	καὶ δίκαιον δή, ᾧ Γλαύκων, οἶμαι φήσομεν ἄνδρα εἶναι τῷ αὐτῷ τρόπῳ ᾧπερ καὶ πόλις ἦν δικαία.	"And so, Glaucon, I think we'll say that a man is just in the same way that the city was just."

6 The line is *Odyssey* 20.17: Odysseus, back home in disguise, restrains his anger at the disloyal maids. It was quoted earlier, in Book 3.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καὶ τοῦτο πᾶσα ἀνάγκη.	"That too is entirely necessary."
	ἀλλ' οὔ πῃ μὴν τοῦτό γε ἐπιλελήσμεθα, ὅτι ἐκείνη γε τῷ τὸ ἑαυτοῦ ἕκαστον ἐν αὐτῇ πράττειν τριῶν ὄντων γενῶν δικαία ἦν.	"But surely we haven't forgotten that the city was just because each of the three classes in it did its own work."
	οὔ μοι δοκοῦμεν, ἔφη, ἐπιλελῆσθαι.	"I don't think we've forgotten," he said.
	μνημονευτέον ἄρα ἡμῖν ὅτι καὶ ἡμῶν ἕκαστος, ὅτου ἂν [441e] τὰ αὑτοῦ ἕκαστον τῶν ἐν αὐτῷ πράττῃ, οὗτος δίκαιός τε ἔσται καὶ τὰ αὑτοῦ πράττων.	"Then we must remember that each of us, too, will be just and do his own work when each of the parts [441e] within him does its own work."
	καὶ μάλα, ἦ δ' ὅς, μνημονευτέον.	"Yes," he said, "we must remember that."
441e	οὐκοῦν τῷ μὲν λογιστικῷ ἄρχειν προσήκει, σοφῷ ὄντι καὶ ἔχοντι τὴν ὑπὲρ ἁπάσης τῆς ψυχῆς προμήθειαν, τῷ δὲ θυμοειδεῖ ὑπηκόῳ εἶναι καὶ συμμάχῳ τούτου;	"So isn't it fitting for the reasoning part to rule, since it's wise and exercises foresight on behalf of the whole soul, and for the spirited part to obey it and be its ally?"
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
	ἆρ' οὖν οὐχ, ὥσπερ ἐλέγομεν, μουσικῆς καὶ γυμναστικῆς κρᾶσις σύμφωνα αὐτὰ ποιήσει, τὸ μὲν ἐπιτείνουσα καὶ [442a] τρέφουσα λόγοις τε καλοῖς καὶ μαθήμασιν, τὸ δὲ ἀνιεῖσα παραμυθουμένη, ἡμεροῦσα ἁρμονίᾳ τε καὶ ῥυθμῷ;	"Then, as we were saying, won't a blend of music and gymnastics bring them into harmony, tightening the one and [442a] nourishing it with fine words and studies, and loosening the other, soothing it and taming it with harmony and rhythm?"
	κομιδῇ γε, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Exactly," he said.
442a	καὶ τούτω δὴ οὕτω τραφέντε καὶ ὡς ἀληθῶς τὰ αὑτῶν μαθόντε καὶ παιδευθέντε προστήσεσθον τοῦ ἐπιθυμητικοῦ—ὃ δὴ πλεῖστον τῆς ψυχῆς ἐν ἑκάστῳ ἐστὶ καὶ χρημάτων φύσει ἀπληστότατον—ὃ τηρήσετον μὴ τῷ πίμπλασθαι τῶν περὶ τὸ σῶμα καλουμένων ἡδονῶν πολὺ καὶ ἰσχυρὸν γενόμενον [442b] οὐκ αὖ τὰ αὑτοῦ πράττῃ, ἀλλὰ καταδουλώσασθαι καὶ ἄρχειν ἐπιχειρήσῃ ὧν οὐ προσῆκον αὐτῷ γένει, καὶ σύμπαντα τὸν βίον πάντων ἀνατρέψῃ.	"And once these two have been reared like this, and have truly learned their own work and been educated in it, they will be put in charge of the appetitive part—which is the largest part of the soul in each of us, and by nature the most insatiable for money. They will watch over it, so that it doesn't get filled up with the so-called pleasures of the body, grow large and strong, and then [442b] stop doing its own work, and instead try to enslave and rule over things its kind has no business ruling, and so overturn the whole life of all of them."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
442b	ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ τοὺς ἔξωθεν πολεμίους τούτω ἂν κάλλιστα φυλαττοίτην ὑπὲρ ἁπάσης τῆς ψυχῆς τε καὶ τοῦ σώματος, τὸ μὲν βουλευόμενον, τὸ δὲ προπολεμοῦν, ἑπόμενον δὲ τῷ ἄρχοντι καὶ τῇ ἀνδρείᾳ ἐπιτελοῦν τὰ βουλευθέντα;	"And wouldn't these two," I said, "also do the finest job of guarding against enemies from outside, on behalf of the whole soul and body—the one by deliberating, the other by fighting in front of it, following the ruler and carrying out its decisions through its courage?"
	ἔστι ταῦτα.	"That's right."
	καὶ ἀνδρεῖον δὴ οἶμαι τούτῳ τῷ μέρει καλοῦμεν ἕνα [442c] ἕκαστον, ὅταν αὐτοῦ τὸ θυμοειδὲς διασῴζῃ διά τε λυπῶν καὶ ἡδονῶν τὸ ὑπὸ τῶν λόγων παραγγελθὲν δεινόν τε καὶ μή.	"And I think we call each individual [442c] courageous because of this part, when his spirited part preserves, through pains and pleasures alike, what reason has declared is to be feared and what is not."
	ὀρθῶς γ', ἔφη.	"Rightly," he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
442c	σοφὸν δέ γε ἐκείνῳ τῷ σμικρῷ μέρει, τῷ ὃ ἦρχέν τ᾽ ἐν αὐτῷ καὶ ταῦτα παρήγγελλεν, ἔχον αὖ κἀκεῖνο ἐπιστήμην ἐν αὐτῷ τὴν τοῦ συμφέροντος ἑκάστῳ τε καὶ ὅλῳ τῷ κοινῷ σφῶν αὐτῶν τριῶν ὄντων.	"And wise because of that small part, the one that ruled in him and issued those declarations—the part which, for its own share, has within it the knowledge of what benefits each part and the whole community of all three."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
	τί δέ; σώφρονα οὐ τῇ φιλίᾳ καὶ συμφωνίᾳ τῇ αὐτῶν τούτων, ὅταν τό τε ἄρχον καὶ τὼ ἀρχομένω τὸ λογιστικὸν 442d ὁμοδοξῶσι δεῖν ἄρχειν καὶ μὴ στασιάζωσιν αὐτῷ;	"And what about this: isn't he moderate because of the friendship and concord of these same parts, when the ruling part and the two that are ruled 442d share the opinion that the reasoning part should rule, and don't rebel against it?"
	σωφροσύνη γοῦν, ἦ δ᾽ ὅς, οὐκ ἄλλο τί ἐστιν ἢ τοῦτο, πόλεώς τε καὶ ἰδιώτου.	"Moderation, at any rate," he said, "is nothing other than that, in a city and in an individual."
442d	ἀλλὰ μὲν δὴ δίκαιός γε, ᾧ πολλάκις λέγομεν, τούτῳ καὶ οὕτως ἔσται.	"And he'll be just, surely, in the way and by the means we keep describing."
	πολλὴ ἀνάγκη.	"He has to be."
	τί οὖν; εἶπον ἐγώ· μή πῃ ἡμῖν ἀπαμβλύνεται ἄλλο τι δικαιοσύνη δοκεῖν εἶναι ἢ ὅπερ ἐν τῇ πόλει ἐφάνη;	"Well then," I said, "is our picture of justice getting blurred at all, so that it seems to be something other than what it turned out to be in the city?"
	οὐκ ἔμοιγε, ἔφη, δοκεῖ.	"Not to me, it doesn't," he said.
	ὧδε γάρ, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, παντάπασιν ἂν βεβαιωσαίμεθα 442e εἴ τι ἡμῶν ἔτι ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ ἀμφισβητεῖ, τὰ φορτικὰ αὐτῷ προσφέροντες.	"Here's how we could make completely sure," I said, 442e "if anything in our soul still has doubts: by testing it against commonplace cases."
	ποῖα δή;	"What sort of cases?"
442e	οἷον εἰ δέοι ἡμᾶς ἀνομολογεῖσθαι περί τε ἐκείνης τῆς πόλεως καὶ τοῦ ἐκείνῃ ὁμοίως πεφυκότος τε καὶ τεθραμμένου ἀνδρός, εἰ δοκεῖ ἂν παρακαταθήκην χρυσίου ἢ ἀργυρίου δεξάμενος ὁ τοιοῦτος ἀποστερῆσαι, τίν᾽ ἂν οἴει οἰηθῆναι 443a τοῦτον αὐτὸ δρᾶσαι μᾶλλον ἢ ὅσοι μὴ τοιοῦτοι;	"For instance, suppose we had to agree about that city, and about the man who resembles it by nature and upbringing, whether such a man, if entrusted with a deposit of gold or silver, would make off with it. Who do you think would suppose 443a that he would do it, rather than people who aren't like him?"
	οὐδέν᾽ ἄν, ἔφη.	"No one would," he said.
	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἱεροσυλιῶν καὶ κλοπῶν καὶ προδοσιῶν, ἢ ἰδίᾳ ἑταίρων ἢ δημοσίᾳ πόλεων, ἐκτὸς ἂν οὗτος εἴη;	"And wouldn't he have nothing to do with temple robbery, theft and betrayal, whether of friends in private life or of cities in public life?"
	ἐκτός.	"Nothing to do with them."
	καὶ μὴν οὐδ᾽ ὁπωστιοῦν γ᾽ ἂν ἄπιστος ἢ κατὰ ὅρκους ἢ κατὰ τὰς ἄλλας ὁμολογίας.	"And he wouldn't break faith in any way at all, either over oaths or over any other agreements."
	πῶς γὰρ ἄν;	"How could he?"
443a	μοιχεῖαί γε μὴν καὶ γονέων ἀμέλειαι καὶ θεῶν ἀθεραπευσίαι παντὶ ἄλλῳ μᾶλλον ἢ τῷ τοιούτῳ προσήκουσι.	"And adultery, neglect of parents, and failure to serve the gods are more typical of anyone else than of a man like this."
	παντὶ μέντοι, ἔφη. 443b	"Of anyone at all," he said. 443b

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	οὐκοῦν τούτων πάντων αἴτιον ὅτι αὐτοῦ τῶν ἐν αὐτῷ ἕκαστον τὰ αὑτοῦ πράττει ἀρχῆς τε πέρι καὶ τοῦ ἄρχεσθαι;	"And isn't the cause of all this that each of the parts within him does its own work, in ruling and in being ruled?"
	τοῦτο μὲν οὖν, καὶ οὐδὲν ἄλλο.	"That's the cause, and nothing else."
	ἔτι τι οὖν ἕτερον ζητεῖς δικαιοσύνην εἶναι ἢ ταύτην τὴν δύναμιν ἣ τοὺς τοιούτους ἄνδρας τε παρέχεται καὶ πόλεις;	"Then are you still looking for justice to be anything other than this power, which produces men and cities like these?"
	μὰ Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐκ ἔγωγε.	"No, by Zeus," he said, "I'm not."
443b	τέλεον ἄρα ἡμῖν τὸ ἐνύπνιον ἀποτετέλεσται, ὃ ἔφαμεν ὑποπτεῦσαι ὡς εὐθὺς ἀρχόμενοι τῆς πόλεως οἰκίζειν κατὰ [443c] θεόν τινα εἰς ἀρχήν τε καὶ τύπον τινὰ τῆς δικαιοσύνης κινδυνεύομεν ἐμβεβηκέναι.	"So our dream has come completely true—our suspicion, as we said, that right at the start of founding the city, [443c] with some god's help, we had probably hit upon a first principle and a kind of outline of justice."
	παντάπασιν μὲν οὖν.	"Absolutely."
	τὸ δέ γε ἦν ἄρα, ὦ Γλαύκων—δι' ὃ καὶ ὠφελεῖ—εἴδωλόν τι τῆς δικαιοσύνης, τὸ τὸν μὲν σκυτοτομικὸν φύσει ὀρθῶς ἔχειν σκυτοτομεῖν καὶ ἄλλο μηδὲν πράττειν, τὸν δὲ τεκτονικὸν τεκταίνεσθαι, καὶ τἆλλα δὴ οὕτως.	"In fact, Glaucon, that principle—and this is why it was useful—was a kind of image of justice: that the man who is by nature a shoemaker should rightly make shoes and do nothing else, the carpenter do carpentry, and so on."
	φαίνεται.	"Evidently."
443c	τὸ δέ γε ἀληθές, τοιοῦτόν τι ἦν, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἡ δικαιοσύνη ἀλλ' οὐ περὶ τὴν ἔξω πρᾶξιν τῶν αὑτοῦ, ἀλλὰ περὶ τὴν [443d] ἐντός, ὡς ἀληθῶς περὶ ἑαυτὸν καὶ τὰ ἑαυτοῦ, μὴ ἐάσαντα τἀλλότρια πράττειν ἕκαστον ἐν αὑτῷ μηδὲ πολυπραγμονεῖν πρὸς ἄλληλα τὰ ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ γένη, ἀλλὰ τῷ ὄντι τὰ οἰκεῖα εὖ θέμενον καὶ ἄρξαντα αὐτὸν αὑτοῦ καὶ κοσμήσαντα καὶ φίλον γενόμενον ἑαυτῷ καὶ συναρμόσαντα τρία ὄντα, ὥσπερ ὅρους τρεῖς ἁρμονίας ἀτεχνῶς, νεάτης τε καὶ ὑπάτης καὶ μέσης, καὶ εἰ ἄλλα ἄττα μεταξὺ τυγχάνει ὄντα,	"But the truth, it seems, is that justice was something like this, though not concerned with someone's outward doing of his own work but with [443d] the inward: with what truly concerns himself and what is his own. The just man doesn't allow each part within him to do the work of another, or the kinds in his soul to meddle with one another. Instead he truly puts his own house in good order, rules himself, sets himself in order and becomes his own friend. He harmonizes the three parts exactly like the three fixed notes of a musical scale—highest, lowest and middle—and any others that happen to lie in between.
443d	πάντα ταῦτα [443e] συνδήσαντα καὶ παντάπασιν ἕνα γενόμενον ἐκ πολλῶν, σώφρονα καὶ ἡρμοσμένον, οὕτω δὴ πράττειν ἤδη, ἐάν τι πράττῃ ἢ περὶ χρημάτων κτῆσιν ἢ περὶ σώματος θεραπείαν ἢ καὶ πολιτικόν τι ἢ περὶ τὰ ἴδια συμβόλαια, ἐν πᾶσι τούτοις ἡγούμενον καὶ ὀνομάζοντα δικαίαν μὲν καὶ καλὴν πρᾶξιν ἣ ἂν ταύτην τὴν ἕξιν σῴζῃ τε καὶ συναπεργάζηται, σοφίαν δὲ τὴν ἐπιστατοῦσαν ταύτῃ τῇ πράξει ἐπιστήμην, ἄδικον δὲ [444a] πρᾶξιν ἣ ἂν ἀεὶ ταύτην λύῃ, ἀμαθίαν δὲ τὴν ταύτῃ αὖ ἐπιστατοῦσαν δόξαν.	"He binds all of these [443e] together and becomes entirely one instead of many, moderate and harmonized. Only then does he act, if he acts at all—whether in making money, caring for his body, doing something political, or in private contracts. In all these he believes and calls just and fine the action that preserves and helps to produce this condition, and wisdom the knowledge that oversees that action; and he believes and calls unjust [444a] whatever action tends to destroy this condition, and ignorance the opinion that in turn oversees that."
444a	παντάπασιν, ἦ δ' ὅς, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἀληθῆ λέγεις.	"What you say is entirely true, Socrates," he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	εἶεν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· τὸν μὲν δίκαιον καὶ ἄνδρα καὶ πόλιν καὶ δικαιοσύνην, ὃ τυγχάνει ἐν αὐτοῖς ὄν, εἰ φαῖμεν ηὑρηκέναι, οὐκ ἂν πάνυ τι οἶμαι δόξαιμεν ψεύδεσθαι.	"Very well," I said. "If we claimed to have found the just man, the just city, and what justice actually is in them, I don't think we'd seem to be lying at all."
	μὰ Δία οὐ μέντοι, ἔφη.	"By Zeus, we certainly wouldn't," he said.
	φῶμεν ἄρα;	"Shall we claim it, then?"
	φῶμεν.	"Let's claim it."
	ἔστω δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· μετὰ γὰρ τοῦτο σκεπτέον οἶμαι ἀδικίαν.	"So be it," I said. "Next, I think, we have to examine injustice."
	δῆλον. 444b	"Clearly." 444b
444b	οὐκοῦν στάσιν τινὰ αὖ τριῶν ὄντων τούτων δεῖ αὐτὴν εἶναι καὶ πολυπραγμοσύνην καὶ ἀλλοτριοπραγμοσύνην καὶ ἐπανάστασιν μέρους τινὸς τῷ ὅλῳ τῆς ψυχῆς, ἵν' ἄρχῃ ἐν αὐτῇ οὐ προσῆκον, ἀλλὰ τοιούτου ὄντος φύσει οἵου πρέπειν αὐτῷ δουλεύειν, τῷ δ' οὐ δουλεύειν ἀρχικοῦ γένους ὄντι; τοιαῦτ' ἄττα οἶμαι φήσομεν καὶ τὴν τούτων ταραχὴν καὶ πλάνην εἶναι τήν τε ἀδικίαν καὶ ἀκολασίαν καὶ δειλίαν καὶ ἀμαθίαν καὶ συλλήβδην πᾶσαν κακίαν.	"Mustn't it, in turn, be a kind of civil war among these three parts—meddling, doing what belongs to others, the rebellion of one part against the whole of the soul so that it can rule in it when that isn't its place? For that part is by nature fit to be a slave, while the other, belonging to the ruling kind, is fit not to be a slave. Something like this, I think, is what we'll say: that the turmoil and wandering of these parts is injustice, and licentiousness, and cowardice, and ignorance—in a word, badness of every kind."
	αὐτὰ μὲν οὖν ταῦτα, ἔφη. 444c	"That's exactly it," he said. 444c
444c	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ τὸ ἄδικα πράττειν καὶ τὸ ἀδικεῖν καὶ αὖ τὸ δίκαια ποιεῖν, ταῦτα πάντα τυγχάνει ὄντα κατάδηλα ἤδη σαφῶς, εἴπερ καὶ ἡ ἀδικία τε καὶ δικαιοσύνη;	"Then," I said, "doing unjust things and doing wrong, and again doing just things—aren't all these perfectly clear by now, if injustice and justice are?"
	πῶς δή;	"How so?"
	ὅτι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τυγχάνει οὐδὲν διαφέροντα τῶν ὑγιεινῶν τε καὶ νοσωδῶν, ὡς ἐκεῖνα ἐν σώματι, ταῦτα ἐν ψυχῇ.	"Because," I said, "they're no different from healthy and unhealthy things: what those are in the body, these are in the soul."
	πῇ; ἔφη.	"In what way?" he said.
	τὰ μέν που ὑγιεινὰ ὑγίειαν ἐμποιεῖ, τὰ δὲ νοσώδη νόσον.	"Healthy things, I take it, produce health, and unhealthy things disease."
	ναί.	"Yes."
	οὐκοῦν καὶ τὸ μὲν δίκαια πράττειν δικαιοσύνην ἐμποιεῖ, 444d τὸ δ' ἄδικα ἀδικίαν;	"And doesn't doing just things produce justice, 444d and doing unjust things injustice?"
	ἀνάγκη.	"Necessarily."
444d	ἔστι δὲ τὸ μὲν ὑγίειαν ποιεῖν τὰ ἐν τῷ σώματι κατὰ φύσιν καθιστάναι κρατεῖν τε καὶ κρατεῖσθαι ὑπ' ἀλλήλων, τὸ δὲ νόσον παρὰ φύσιν ἄρχειν τε καὶ ἄρχεσθαι ἄλλο ὑπ' ἄλλου.	"To produce health is to arrange the parts of the body so that they master and are mastered by one another in accordance with nature, while to produce disease is to arrange them so that one rules and another is ruled contrary to nature."
	ἔστι γάρ.	"So it is."
	οὐκοῦν αὖ, ἔφην, τὸ δικαιοσύνην ἐμποιεῖν τὰ ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ κατὰ φύσιν καθιστάναι κρατεῖν τε καὶ κρατεῖσθαι ὑπ'	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἀλλήλων, τὸ δὲ ἀδικίαν παρὰ φύσιν ἄρχειν τε καὶ ἄρχεσθαι ἄλλο ὑπ᾽ ἄλλου;	"Then again," I said, "to produce justice is to arrange the parts of the soul so that they master and are mastered by one another in accordance with nature, and to produce injustice is to arrange them so that one rules and another is ruled contrary to nature?"
	κομιδῇ, ἔφη.	"Exactly," he said.
	ἀρετὴ μὲν ἄρα, ὡς ἔοικεν, ὑγίειά τέ τις ἂν εἴη καὶ [444e] κάλλος καὶ εὐεξία ψυχῆς, κακία δὲ νόσος τε καὶ αἶσχος καὶ ἀσθένεια.	"Excellence, then, it seems, would be a kind of health, [444e] beauty and good condition of the soul, and badness a disease, ugliness and weakness."
	ἔστιν οὕτω.	"That's so."
	ἆρ᾽ οὖν οὐ καὶ τὰ μὲν καλὰ ἐπιτηδεύματα εἰς ἀρετῆς κτῆσιν φέρει, τὰ δ᾽ αἰσχρὰ εἰς κακίας;	"And don't fine practices lead to the acquisition of excellence, and shameful ones to badness?"
	ἀνάγκη.	"Necessarily."
	τὸ δὴ λοιπὸν ἤδη, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἡμῖν ἐστι σκέψασθαι [445a] πότερον αὖ λυσιτελεῖ δίκαιά τε πράττειν καὶ καλὰ ἐπιτηδεύειν καὶ εἶναι δίκαιον, ἐάντε λανθάνῃ ἐάντε μὴ τοιοῦτος ὤν, ἢ ἀδικεῖν τε καὶ ἄδικον εἶναι, ἐάνπερ μὴ διδῷ δίκην μηδὲ βελτίων γίγνηται κολαζόμενος.	"So what remains for us to examine now, it seems, is [445a] whether it pays to do just things, practice fine ones and be just, whether or not anyone knows you're like that; or to do wrong and be unjust, provided you don't pay the penalty and aren't made better by being punished."
445a	ἀλλ᾽, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, γελοῖον ἔμοιγε φαίνεται τὸ σκέμμα γίγνεσθαι ἤδη, εἰ τοῦ μὲν σώματος τῆς φύσεως διαφθειρομένης δοκεῖ οὐ βιωτὸν εἶναι οὐδὲ μετὰ πάντων σιτίων τε καὶ ποτῶν καὶ παντὸς πλούτου καὶ πάσης ἀρχῆς, τῆς δὲ αὐτοῦ τούτου ᾧ ζῶμεν φύσεως ταραττομένης καὶ [445b] διαφθειρομένης βιωτὸν ἄρα ἔσται, ἐάνπερ τις ποιῇ ὃ ἂν βουληθῇ ἄλλο πλὴν τοῦτο ὁπόθεν κακίας μὲν καὶ ἀδικίας ἀπαλλαγήσεται, δικαιοσύνην δὲ καὶ ἀρετὴν κτήσεται, ἐπειδήπερ ἐφάνη γε ὄντα ἑκάτερα οἷα ἡμεῖς διεληλύθαμεν.	"But Socrates," he said, "to me the inquiry is starting to look ridiculous at this point. When the body's nature is ruined, life doesn't seem worth living, not even with every kind of food and drink and all the wealth and power in the world. Yet when the nature of the very thing we live by is thrown into turmoil and [445b] ruined, is life going to be worth living—so long as a person can do whatever he likes, except the one thing that will rid him of badness and injustice and win him justice and excellence? That is, now that each of them has turned out to be the sort of thing we've described."
445b	γελοῖον γάρ, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ· ἀλλ᾽ ὅμως ἐπείπερ ἐνταῦθα ἐληλύθαμεν, ὅσον οἷόν τε σαφέστατα κατιδεῖν ὅτι ταῦτα οὕτως ἔχει οὐ χρὴ ἀποκάμνειν.	"It is ridiculous," I said. "But still, since we've come this far, we mustn't grow weary before we see as clearly as we can that this is how things are."
	ἥκιστα, νὴ τὸν Δία, ἔφη, πάντων ἀποκμητέον. [445c]	"By Zeus," he said, "growing weary is the last thing we should do." [445c]
	δεῦρό νυν, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, ἵνα καὶ ἴδῃς ὅσα καὶ εἴδη ἔχει ἡ κακία, ὡς ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ, ἅ γε δὴ καὶ ἄξια θέας.	"Come along, then," I said, "so that you can see how many forms badness has, as I see it—the ones, at least, that are worth looking at."
	ἕπομαι, ἔφη· μόνον λέγε.	"I'm following," he said. "Just tell me."
445c	καὶ μήν, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, ὥσπερ ἀπὸ σκοπιᾶς μοι φαίνεται, ἐπειδὴ ἐνταῦθα ἀναβεβήκαμεν τοῦ λόγου, ἓν μὲν εἶναι	"Well," I said, "now that we've climbed this high in the argument, I seem to see, as if from a lookout,

GREEK

εἶδος τῆς ἀρετῆς, ἄπειρα δὲ τῆς κακίας, τέτταρα δ' ἐν αὐτοῖς ἄττα ὧν καὶ ἄξιον ἐπιμνησθῆναι.

πῶς λέγεις; ἔφη.

ὅσοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πολιτειῶν τρόποι εἰσὶν εἴδη ἔχοντες, τοσοῦτοι κινδυνεύουσι καὶ ψυχῆς τρόποι εἶναι.

πόσοι δή; 445d

πέντε μέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πολιτειῶν, πέντε δὲ ψυχῆς.

λέγε, ἔφη, τίνες.

445d λέγω, εἶπον, ὅτι εἷς μὲν οὗτος ὃν ἡμεῖς διεληλύθαμεν πολιτείας εἴη ἂν τρόπος, ἐπονομασθείη δ' ἂν καὶ διχῇ· ἐγγενομένου μὲν γὰρ ἀνδρὸς ἑνὸς ἐν τοῖς ἄρχουσι διαφέροντος βασιλεία ἂν κληθείη, πλειόνων δὲ ἀριστοκρατία.

ἀληθῆ, ἔφη.

τοῦτο μὲν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἓν εἶδος λέγω· οὔτε γὰρ ἂν 445e πλείους οὔτε εἷς ἐγγενόμενοι κινήσειεν ἂν τῶν ἀξίων λόγου νόμων τῆς πόλεως, τροφῇ τε καὶ παιδείᾳ χρησάμενος ᾗ διήλθομεν.

οὐ γὰρ εἰκός, ἔφη.

ENGLISH

that there is one form of excellence but countless forms of badness, and among them four worth mentioning."

"What do you mean?" he said.

"There are probably as many types of soul," I said, "as there are types of constitution with distinct forms."

"How many is that?" 445d

"Five types of constitution," I said, "and five of soul."

"Tell me which they are," he said.

"I say," I said, "that one type of constitution is the one we've described, though it could be called by two names: if one outstanding man arises among the rulers, it would be called kingship; if more than one, aristocracy."

"True," he said.

"So I count this as one form," I said. "Whether 445e there were several such men or one, none of them would alter any of the city's laws worth mentioning, if they had the upbringing and education we described."

"Not likely," he said.

Book V

Women, the family, and philosopher-kings.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
449a	**SOCRATES** ἀγαθὴν μὲν τοίνυν τὴν τοιαύτην πόλιν τε καὶ πολιτείαν καὶ ὀρθὴν καλῶ, καὶ ἄνδρα τὸν τοιοῦτον· κακὰς δὲ τὰς ἄλλας καὶ ἡμαρτημένας, εἴπερ αὕτη ὀρθή, περί τε πόλεων διοικήσεις καὶ περὶ ἰδιωτῶν ψυχῆς τρόπου κατασκευήν, ἐν τέτταρσι πονηρίας εἴδεσιν οὔσας.	**SOCRATES** "So I call a city and constitution like this good and correct, and a man like this too. And if this one is correct, I call the others bad and mistaken, both in how they manage cities and in how they shape the character of individual souls. They fall into four forms of badness."
	ποίας δὴ ταύτας; ἔφη.	"Which ones are those?" he said.
	καὶ ἐγὼ μὲν ἦα τὰς ἐφεξῆς ἐρῶν, ὡς μοι ἐφαίνοντο 449b ἕκασται ἐξ ἀλλήλων μεταβαίνειν· ὁ δὲ Πολέμαρχος—σμικρὸν γὰρ ἀπωτέρω τοῦ Ἀδειμάντου καθῆστο—ἐκτείνας τὴν χεῖρα καὶ λαβόμενος τοῦ ἱματίου ἄνωθεν αὐτοῦ παρὰ τὸν ὦμον, ἐκεῖνόν τε προσηγάγετο καὶ προτείνας ἑαυτὸν ἔλεγεν ἄττα προσκεκυφώς, ὧν ἄλλο μὲν οὐδὲν κατηκούσαμεν, τόδε δέ· Ἀφήσομεν οὖν, ἔφη, ἢ τί δράσομεν;	I was about to list them in order, as each seemed to me to develop 449b out of the one before. But Polemarchus—who was sitting a little way from Adeimantus—reached out his hand and took hold of Adeimantus' cloak at the top, by the shoulder, drew him close, and leaning forward himself said something to him in a low voice. We didn't catch any of it except this: "Shall we let it go," he said, "or what shall we do?"
	ἥκιστά γε, ἔφη ὁ Ἀδείμαντος μέγα ἤδη λέγων.	"Certainly not," said Adeimantus, speaking aloud now.
	καὶ ἐγώ, τί μάλιστα, ἔφην, ὑμεῖς οὐκ ἀφίετε;	And I said, "What exactly is it you're not letting go?"
	σέ, ἦ δ' ὅς. 449c	"You," he said. 449c
	ὅτι, ἐγὼ εἶπον, τί μάλιστα;	"Why me," I said, "exactly?"
449c	ἀπορρᾳθυμεῖν ἡμῖν δοκεῖς, ἔφη, καὶ εἶδος ὅλον οὐ τὸ ἐλάχιστον ἐκκλέπτειν τοῦ λόγου ἵνα μὴ διέλθῃς, καὶ λήσειν οἰηθῆναι εἰπὼν αὐτὸ φαύλως, ὡς ἄρα περὶ γυναικῶν τε καὶ παίδων παντὶ δῆλον ὅτι κοινὰ τὰ φίλων ἔσται.	"We think you're shirking," he said, "and cheating us out of a whole part of the argument, and not the smallest part, to avoid going through it. You thought you'd get away with it by saying, offhandedly, that where women and children are concerned it's obvious to everyone that 'what friends have will be held in common.'"
	οὐκοῦν ὀρθῶς, ἔφην, ὦ Ἀδείμαντε;	"Well, wasn't that right, Adeimantus?" I said.[1]
	ναί, ἦ δ' ὅς. ἀλλὰ τὸ ὀρθῶς τοῦτο, ὥσπερ τἆλλα, λόγου δεῖται τίς ὁ τρόπος τῆς κοινωνίας· πολλοὶ γὰρ ἂν γένοιντο. 449d μὴ οὖν παρῇς ὅντινα σὺ λέγεις· ὡς ἡμεῖς πάλαι περιμένομεν οἰόμενοί σέ που μνησθήσεσθαι παιδοποιίας τε πέρι, πῶς παιδοποιήσονται, καὶ γενομένους πῶς θρέψουσιν, καὶ ὅλην ταύτην ἣν λέγεις	"Yes," he said. "But this 'right,' like everything else, needs explaining: what form will this sharing take? There could be many. 449d So don't pass over the one you mean. We've been waiting a long time, expecting you to say something about producing children—how they'll produce them, and how

1 A Greek proverb, "friends have all things in common," which Socrates applied to women and children in Book IV (423e–424a).

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	κοινωνίαν γυναικῶν τε καὶ παίδων· μέγα γάρ τι οἰόμεθα φέρειν καὶ ὅλον εἰς πολιτείαν ὀρθῶς ἢ μὴ ὀρθῶς γιγνόμενον.	they'll raise them once they're born—and about this whole sharing of women and children you speak of. We think it makes a great difference, all the difference, to a constitution whether this is done rightly or not.
449d	νῦν οὖν, ἐπειδὴ ἄλλης ἐπιλαμβάνῃ πολιτείας πρὶν ταῦτα ἱκανῶς διελέσθαι, δέδοκται ἡμῖν τοῦτο [450a] ὃ σὺ ἤκουσας, τὸ σὲ μὴ μεθιέναι πρὶν ἂν ταῦτα πάντα ὥσπερ τἆλλα διέλθῃς.	"So now, since you're taking up another constitution before you've dealt with this adequately, we've decided what [450a] you heard: not to let you go until you've gone through all of it, just as you did the rest."
	καὶ ἐμὲ τοίνυν, ὁ Γλαύκων ἔφη, κοινωνὸν τῆς ψήφου ταύτης τίθετε.	"Count me in on this vote too," said Glaucon.
	ἀμέλει, ἔφη ὁ Θρασύμαχος, πᾶσι ταῦτα δεδογμένα ἡμῖν νόμιζε, ὦ Σώκρατες.	"Don't worry, Socrates," said Thrasymachus. "Take it that we've all decided this."
450a	οἷον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἰργάσασθε ἐπιλαβόμενοί μου. ὅσον λόγον πάλιν, ὥσπερ ἐξ ἀρχῆς, κινεῖτε περὶ τῆς πολιτείας· ἣν ὡς ἤδη διεληλυθὼς ἔγωγε ἔχαιρον, ἀγαπῶν εἴ τις ἐάσοι ταῦτα ἀποδεξάμενος ὡς τότε ἐρρήθη. ἃ νῦν ὑμεῖς παρακαλοῦντες [450b] οὐκ ἴστε ὅσον ἐσμὸν λόγων ἐπεγείρετε· ὃν ὁρῶν ἐγὼ παρῆκα τότε, μὴ παράσχοι πολὺν ὄχλον.	"What a thing you've done," I said, "seizing on me like this! What a huge argument about the constitution you're starting up again, as if from the beginning. I was delighted to think I'd already finished with it, and glad if anyone would let it be and accept what was said at the time. By calling for it now, [450b] you don't know what a swarm of arguments you're stirring up. I saw it then and passed it by, so as not to cause a great deal of trouble."
	τί δέ; ἦ δ' ὃς ὁ Θρασύμαχος· χρυσοχοήσοντας οἴει τούσδε νῦν ἐνθάδε ἀφῖχθαι, ἀλλ' οὐ λόγων ἀκουσομένους;	"What?" said Thrasymachus. "Do you think these people came here to go prospecting for gold, and not to listen to arguments?"
	ναί, εἶπον, μετρίων γε.	"Yes," I said, "but in moderate measure."[2]
450b	μέτρον δέ γ', ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, ὁ Γλαύκων, τοιούτων λόγων ἀκούειν ὅλος ὁ βίος νοῦν ἔχουσιν. ἀλλὰ τὸ μὲν ἡμέτερον ἔα· σὺ δὲ περὶ ὧν ἐρωτῶμεν μηδαμῶς ἀποκάμῃς ᾗ [450c] σοι δοκεῖ διεξιών, τίς ἡ κοινωνία τοῖς φύλαξιν ἡμῖν παίδων τε πέρι καὶ γυναικῶν ἔσται καὶ τροφῆς νέων ἔτι ὄντων, τῆς ἐν τῷ μεταξὺ χρόνῳ γιγνομένης γενέσεώς τε καὶ παιδείας, ἣ δὴ ἐπιπονωτάτη δοκεῖ εἶναι. πειρῶ οὖν εἰπεῖν τίνα τρόπον δεῖ γίγνεσθαι αὐτήν.	"For people with sense, Socrates," said Glaucon, "the measure for listening to arguments like these is a whole lifetime. But never mind about us. Don't grow weary of going through, in the way [450c] that seems best to you, what we're asking: what sharing of children and women there will be among our guardians, and how the children will be raised while they're still young, in the period between birth and education, which seems to be the most demanding of all. So try to tell us how it should be done."
450c	οὐ ῥᾴδιον, ὦ εὔδαιμον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, διελθεῖν· πολλὰς γὰρ ἀπιστίας ἔχει ἔτι μᾶλλον τῶν ἔμπροσθεν ὧν διήλθομεν. καὶ γὰρ ὡς δυνατὰ λέγεται, ἀπιστοῖτ' ἄν, καὶ εἰ ὅτι μάλιστα γένοιτο, ὡς ἄριστ' ἂν εἴη ταῦτα, καὶ ταύτῃ ἀπιστήσεται. [450d] διὸ δὴ καὶ ὄκνος τις αὐτῶν ἅπτεσθαι, μὴ εὐχὴ δοκῇ εἶναι ὁ λόγος, ὦ φίλε ἑταῖρε.	"It isn't easy to go through, my fortunate friend," I said. "It raises many doubts, even more than what we discussed before. People might doubt that what's proposed is possible; and even if it could be done perfectly, they'll doubt, on that score too, that it would be for the best. [450d] That's why I hesit-

2 "Prospecting for gold" was a proverbial phrase for being lured away from the business at hand by hopes of a fortune.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	μηδέν, ἦ δ' ὅς, ὄκνει· οὔτε γὰρ ἀγνώμονες οὔτε ἄπιστοι οὔτε δύσνοι οἱ ἀκουσόμενοι.	ate to touch on it, my dear friend: I'm afraid the argument may seem to be mere wishful thinking."
	καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον· ὦ ἄριστε, ἦ που βουλόμενός με παραθαρρύνειν λέγεις;	"Don't hesitate," he said. "Your audience won't be unreasonable, or distrustful, or ill-disposed."
	ἔγωγ', ἔφη.	And I said, "My excellent friend, are you saying that to encourage me?"
		"I am," he said.
450d	πᾶν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοὐναντίον ποιεῖς. πιστεύοντος μὲν γὰρ ἐμοῦ ἐμοὶ εἰδέναι ἃ λέγω, καλῶς εἶχεν ἡ παραμυθία· ἐν γὰρ φρονίμοις τε καὶ φίλοις περὶ τῶν μεγίστων τε καὶ 450e φίλων τἀληθῆ εἰδότα λέγειν ἀσφαλὲς καὶ θαρραλέον,	"Then you're doing just the opposite," I said. "If I were confident that I knew what I was talking about, your encouragement would be fine. When you're among sensible people who are your friends, it's safe and reassuring to speak the truth you know about the most important and 450e dearest things;
450e	ἀπιστοῦντα δὲ καὶ ζητοῦντα ἅμα τοὺς λόγους ποιεῖσθαι, ὃ δὴ 451a ἐγὼ δρῶ, φοβερόν τε καὶ σφαλερόν, οὔ τι γέλωτα ὀφλεῖν— παιδικὸν γὰρ τοῦτό γε—ἀλλὰ μὴ σφαλεὶς τῆς ἀληθείας οὐ μόνον αὐτὸς ἀλλὰ καὶ τοὺς φίλους συνεπισπασάμενος κείσομαι περὶ ἃ ἥκιστα δεῖ σφάλλεσθαι. προσκυνῶ δὲ Ἀδράστειαν, ὦ Γλαύκων, χάριν οὗ μέλλω λέγειν· ἐλπίζω γὰρ οὖν ἔλαττον ἁμάρτημα ἀκουσίως τινὸς φονέα γενέσθαι ἢ ἀπατεῶνα καλῶν τε καὶ ἀγαθῶν καὶ δικαίων νομίμων πέρι. τοῦτο οὖν τὸ κινδύνευμα κινδυνεύειν ἐν ἐχθροῖς κρεῖττον ἢ 451b φίλοις, ὥστε εὖ με παραμυθῇ.	but to make arguments while you're still in doubt and searching, as 451a I'm doing, is frightening and risky. It isn't that I'm afraid of being laughed at—that would be childish—but that I'll slip from the truth and lie there fallen, dragging my friends down with me, in matters where slipping matters most. I bow to Adrasteia, Glaucon, for what I'm about to say. I really do think it a lesser offense to kill someone unintentionally than to deceive people about what is fine, good and just in laws and customs. That's a risk better run among enemies than 451b among friends. So you're a fine one to encourage me!"[3]
451b	καὶ ὁ Γλαύκων γελάσας, ἀλλ', ὦ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, ἐάν τι πάθωμεν πλημμελὲς ὑπὸ τοῦ λόγου, ἀφιεμέν σε ὥσπερ φόνου καὶ καθαρὸν εἶναι καὶ μὴ ἀπατεῶνα ἡμῶν. ἀλλὰ θαρρήσας λέγε.	Glaucon laughed and said, "Well, Socrates, if the argument does us any harm, we'll release you, as in a case of homicide: you'll be clean, and not our deceiver. So take heart and speak."
	ἀλλὰ μέντοι, εἶπον, καθαρός γε καὶ ἐκεῖ ὁ ἀφεθείς, ὡς ὁ νόμος λέγει· εἰκὸς δέ γε, εἴπερ ἐκεῖ, κἀνθάδε.	"Well," I said, "in that case, too, the one who is released is clean, as the law says; and if it holds there, it likely holds here as well."
	λέγε τοίνυν, ἔφη, τούτου γ' ἕνεκα.	"Then speak," he said, "as far as that's concerned."

THE FIRST WAVE: WOMEN AS GUARDIANS

Socrates argues that women with the right natures should be educated and serve as guardians like men.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	SOCRATES λέγειν δή, ἔφην ἐγώ, χρὴ ἀνάπαλιν αὖ νῦν, ἃ τότε ἴσως 451c ἔδει ἐφεξῆς λέγειν· τάχα δὲ οὕτως ἂν ὀρθῶς ἔχοι, μετὰ ἀνδρεῖον δρᾶμα παντελῶς διαπεραν θὲν	**SOCRATES** "I have to go back now, then," I said, "and say what perhaps 451c should have been said in its proper place earlier. But maybe this is the right way: after the men's drama has been played

3 Adrasteia ("the Inescapable") was a goddess of retribution; people bowed to her to avert punishment for a bold remark.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τὸ γυναικεῖον αὖ περαίνειν, ἄλλως τε καὶ ἐπειδὴ σὺ οὕτω προκαλῇ.	through to the end, to play the women's in turn, especially since you're calling for it like this.
	ἀνθρώποις γὰρ φῦσι καὶ παιδευθεῖσιν ὡς ἡμεῖς διήλθομεν, κατ' ἐμὴν δόξαν οὐκ ἔστ' ἄλλη ὀρθὴ παίδων τε καὶ γυναικῶν κτῆσίς τε καὶ χρεία ἢ κατ' ἐκείνην τὴν ὁρμὴν ἰοῦσιν, ἥνπερ τὸ πρῶτον ὡρμήσαμεν· ἐπεχειρήσαμεν δέ που ὡς ἀγέλης φύλακας τοὺς ἄνδρας καθιστάναι τῷ λόγῳ.	"For people born and educated as we described, in my view there's no right way to acquire and deal with children and women except by following the path on which we first set out. We tried, I think, in our argument, to make the men guardians of a flock."
	ναί. 451d	"Yes." 451d **4**
451d	ἀκολουθῶμεν τοίνυν καὶ τὴν γένεσιν καὶ τροφὴν παραπλησίαν ἀποδιδόντες, καὶ σκοπῶμεν εἰ ἡμῖν πρέπει ἢ οὔ.	"Then let's follow that up by giving them a birth and upbringing to match, and see whether it suits us or not."
	πῶς; ἔφη.	"How?" he said.
	ὧδε. τὰς θηλείας τῶν φυλάκων κυνῶν πότερα συμφυλάττειν οἰόμεθα δεῖν ἅπερ ἂν οἱ ἄρρενες φυλάττωσι καὶ συνθηρεύειν καὶ τἆλλα κοινῇ πράττειν, ἢ τὰς μὲν οἰκουρεῖν ἔνδον ὡς ἀδυνάτους διὰ τὸν τῶν σκυλάκων τόκον τε καὶ τροφήν, τοὺς δὲ πονεῖν τε καὶ πᾶσαν ἐπιμέλειαν ἔχειν περὶ τὰ ποίμνια; 451e	"Like this. Do we think the female guard dogs should guard what the males guard, hunt with them, and do everything else in common? Or should the females stay indoors, as if they were unfit because they bear and rear the puppies, while the males work and have the whole care of the flocks?" 451e
	κοινῇ, ἔφη, πάντα· πλὴν ὡς ἀσθενεστέραις χρώμεθα, τοῖς δὲ ὡς ἰσχυροτέροις.	"Everything in common," he said, "except that we treat the females as weaker and the males as stronger."
451e	οἷόν τ' οὖν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἐπὶ τὰ αὐτὰ χρῆσθαί τινι ζῴῳ, ἂν μὴ τὴν αὐτὴν τροφήν τε καὶ παιδείαν ἀποδιδῷς;	"Is it possible," I said, "to use any animal for the same things, if you don't give it the same upbringing and education?"
	οὐχ οἷόν τε.	"It isn't possible."
	εἰ ἄρα ταῖς γυναιξὶν ἐπὶ ταὐτὰ χρησόμεθα καὶ τοῖς ἀνδράσι, ταὐτὰ καὶ διδακτέον αὐτάς. 452a	"So if we're going to use the women for the same things as the men, we have to teach them the same things too." 452a
	ναί.	"Yes."
	μουσικὴ μὴν ἐκείνοις γε καὶ γυμναστικὴ ἐδόθη.	"Now, the men were given music and physical training."
	ναί.	"Yes."
	καὶ ταῖς γυναιξὶν ἄρα τούτω τὼ τέχνα καὶ τὰ περὶ τὸν πόλεμον ἀποδοτέον καὶ χρηστέον κατὰ ταὐτά.	"Then the women too must be given these two arts, and what pertains to war, and must be used in the same ways."
	εἰκὸς ἐξ ὧν λέγεις, ἔφη.	"That's what follows from what you say," he said.
452a	ἴσως δή, εἶπον, παρὰ τὸ ἔθος γελοῖα ἂν φαίνοιτο πολλὰ περὶ τὰ νῦν λεγόμενα, εἰ πράξεται ᾗ λέγεται.	"Perhaps," I said, "since it goes against custom, a lot of what we're now saying would look ridiculous if it were carried out as we describe."
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
	τί, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, γελοιότατον αὐτῶν ὁρᾷς; ἢ δῆλα δὴ ὅτι γυμνὰς τὰς γυναῖκας ἐν ταῖς παλαίστραις γυμναζομένας	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	μετὰ [452b] τῶν ἀνδρῶν, οὐ μόνον τὰς νέας, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἤδη τὰς πρεσβυτέρας, ὥσπερ τοὺς γέροντας ἐν τοῖς γυμνασίοις, ὅταν ῥυσοὶ καὶ μὴ ἡδεῖς τὴν ὄψιν ὅμως φιλογυμναστῶσιν;	"What do you see as the most ridiculous part of it?" I said. "Isn't it obviously the women exercising naked in the wrestling schools alongside [452b] the men—not only the young ones, but the older ones too, like the old men in the gymnasiums who, wrinkled and unpleasant to look at, still love their exercise?"
	νὴ τὸν Δία, ἔφη· γελοῖον γὰρ ἄν, ὥς γε ἐν τῷ παρεστῶτι, φανείη.	"By Zeus, yes," he said. "That would look ridiculous, at least as things are now."
452b	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐπείπερ ὡρμήσαμεν λέγειν, οὐ φοβητέον τὰ τῶν χαριέντων σκώμματα, ὅσα καὶ οἷα ἂν εἴποιεν εἰς τὴν τοιαύτην μεταβολὴν γενομένην καὶ περὶ τὰ γυμνάσια [452c] καὶ περὶ μουσικὴν καὶ οὐκ ἐλάχιστα περὶ τὴν τῶν ὅπλων σχέσιν καὶ ἵππων ὀχήσεις.	"Still," I said, "since we've set out to speak, we mustn't be afraid of the jokes of the wits—all the many things they'd say about such a change in physical training [452c] and in music, and not least about women bearing arms and riding horses."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"You're right," he said.
452c	ἀλλ' ἐπείπερ λέγειν ἠρξάμεθα, πορευτέον πρὸς τὸ τραχὺ τοῦ νόμου, δεηθεῖσίν τε τούτων μὴ τὰ αὑτῶν πράττειν ἀλλὰ σπουδάζειν, καὶ ὑπομνήσασιν ὅτι οὐ πολὺς χρόνος ἐξ οὗ τοῖς Ἕλλησιν ἐδόκει αἰσχρὰ εἶναι καὶ γελοῖα ἅπερ νῦν τοῖς πολλοῖς τῶν βαρβάρων, γυμνοὺς ἄνδρας ὁρᾶσθαι, καὶ ὅτε ἤρχοντο τῶν γυμνασίων πρῶτοι μὲν Κρῆτες, ἔπειτα Λακεδαιμόνιοι, [452d] ἐξῆν τοῖς τότε ἀστείοις πάντα ταῦτα κωμῳδεῖν. ἢ οὐκ οἴει;	"But since we've begun to speak, we must press on to the rough part of the law. We'll ask the wits to give up their usual business for once and be serious, and we'll remind them that it wasn't long ago that the Greeks thought it shameful and ridiculous, as most non-Greeks still do now, for men to be seen naked. When first the Cretans and then the Spartans began exercising naked, [452d] the wits of that time were free to make a comedy of the whole thing. Don't you think so?"
	ἔγωγε.	"I do."
452d	ἀλλ' ἐπειδὴ οἶμαι χρωμένοις ἄμεινον τὸ ἀποδύεσθαι τοῦ συγκαλύπτειν πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα ἐφάνη, καὶ τὸ ἐν τοῖς ὀφθαλμοῖς δὴ γελοῖον ἐξερρύη ὑπὸ τοῦ ἐν τοῖς λόγοις μηνυθέντος ἀρίστου· καὶ τοῦτο ἐνεδείξατο, ὅτι μάταιος ὃς γελοῖον ἄλλο τι ἡγεῖται ἢ τὸ κακόν, καὶ ὁ γελωτοποιεῖν ἐπιχειρῶν πρὸς ἄλλην τινὰ ὄψιν ἀποβλέπων ὡς γελοίου ἢ τὴν τοῦ ἄφρονός [452e] τε καὶ κακοῦ, καὶ καλοῦ αὖ σπουδάζει πρὸς ἄλλον τινὰ σκοπὸν στησάμενος ἢ τὸν τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ.	"But once it became clear, I think, to those who practiced it that stripping was better than covering up all such parts, what looked ridiculous to the eye melted away before what reason had shown to be best. And this showed that anyone is foolish who thinks anything ridiculous except what is bad; who tries to raise a laugh by looking to any sight as ridiculous except that of folly [452e] and badness; and who, again, earnestly pursues the fine with his eye on any target other than the good."
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
452e	ἆρ' οὖν οὐ πρῶτον μὲν τοῦτο περὶ αὐτῶν ἀνομολογητέον, εἰ δυνατὰ ἢ οὔ, καὶ δοτέον ἀμφισβήτησιν εἴτε τις φιλοπαίσμων εἴτε σπουδαστικὸς ἐθέλει ἀμφισβητῆσαι, πότερον [453a] δυνατὴ φύσις ἡ ἀνθρωπίνη ἡ θήλεια τῇ τοῦ ἄρρενος γένους κοινωνῆσαι εἰς ἅπαντα τὰ ἔργα ἢ οὐδ' εἰς ἕν, ἢ εἰς τὰ μὲν οἷά τε, εἰς δὲ τὰ οὔ, καὶ τοῦτο δὴ τὸ περὶ	"Then mustn't we first reach agreement on whether these things are possible or not, and let anyone who wants to dispute it, whether in jest or in earnest, argue the question: [453a] is female human nature capable of sharing in all the tasks of the male kind, or in none, or in some but not others? And which group does war belong to? Isn't that the

4 Possibly an allusion to the mimes of the Sicilian writer Sophron, which were grouped as "men's mimes" and "women's mimes."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τὸν πόλεμον ποτέρων ἐστίν; ἆρ' οὐχ οὕτως ἂν κάλλιστά τις ἀρχόμενος ὡς τὸ εἰκὸς καὶ κάλλιστα τελευτήσειεν;	finest way to start, and so, most likely, the finest way to finish?"
	πολύ γε, ἔφη.	"By far," he said.
453a	βούλει οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἡμεῖς πρὸς ἡμᾶς αὐτοὺς ὑπὲρ τῶν ἄλλων ἀμφισβητήσωμεν, ἵνα μὴ ἔρημα τὰ τοῦ ἑτέρου λόγου πολιορκῆται; 453b	"Would you like us, then," I said, "to argue against ourselves on the others' behalf, so that the opposing case doesn't fall to a siege undefended?" 453b
	οὐδέν, ἔφη, κωλύει.	"Nothing's stopping us," he said.
	λέγωμεν δὴ ὑπὲρ αὐτῶν ὅτι "ὦ Σώκρατές τε καὶ Γλαύκων, οὐδὲν δεῖ ὑμῖν ἄλλους ἀμφισβητεῖν· αὐτοὶ γὰρ ἐν ἀρχῇ τῆς κατοικίσεως, ἣν ᾠκίζετε πόλιν, ὡμολογεῖτε δεῖν κατὰ φύσιν ἕκαστον ἕνα ἓν τὸ αὑτοῦ πράττειν."	"Then let's say on their behalf: 'Socrates and Glaucon, there's no need for anyone else to dispute with you. You yourselves, at the start of founding the city you were founding, agreed that each person must do the one job that is his own by nature.'"
	ὡμολογήσαμεν οἶμαι· πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"We did agree, I think. Of course we did."
	"ἔστιν οὖν ὅπως οὐ πάμπολυ διαφέρει γυνὴ ἀνδρὸς τὴν φύσιν;"	"'Can it be that a woman doesn't differ enormously from a man in nature?'"
	πῶς δ' οὐ διαφέρει;	"Of course she differs."
453b	"οὐκοῦν ἄλλο καὶ ἔργον ἑκατέρῳ προσήκει προστάττειν" 453c "τὸ κατὰ τὴν αὑτοῦ φύσιν;"	"'Then isn't it right to assign each of them a different job too, 453c the one that suits its own nature?'"
	τί μήν;	"Certainly."
	"πῶς οὖν οὐχ ἁμαρτάνετε νυνὶ καὶ τἀναντία ὑμῖν αὐτοῖς λέγετε φάσκοντες αὖ τοὺς ἄνδρας καὶ τὰς γυναῖκας δεῖν τὰ αὐτὰ πράττειν, πλεῖστον κεχωρισμένην φύσιν ἔχοντας;" ἔξεις τι, ὦ θαυμάσιε, πρὸς ταῦτ' ἀπολογεῖσθαι;	"'Then how can you not be making a mistake now, and contradicting yourselves, when you say that men and women must do the same things, though their natures are as far apart as can be?' Will you have any defense to offer against that, my remarkable friend?"
	ὡς μὲν ἐξαίφνης, ἔφη, οὐ πάνυ ῥᾴδιον· ἀλλὰ σοῦ δεήσομαί τε καὶ δέομαι καὶ τὸν ὑπὲρ ἡμῶν λόγον, ὅστις ποτ' ἐστίν, ἑρμηνεῦσαι.	"Not very easily, on the spur of the moment," he said. "But I'll ask you—I'm asking you now—to set out the argument on our side too, whatever it is."
453c	ταῦτ' ἐστίν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Γλαύκων, καὶ ἄλλα πολλὰ 453d τοιαῦτα, ἃ ἐγὼ πάλαι προορῶν ἐφοβούμην τε καὶ ὤκνουν ἅπτεσθαι τοῦ νόμου τοῦ περὶ τὴν τῶν γυναικῶν καὶ παίδων κτῆσιν καὶ τροφήν.	"These are the things, Glaucon," I said, "and many others 453d like them, that I foresaw long ago; they're why I was afraid and hesitated to touch the law about acquiring and raising women and children."
	οὐ μὰ τὸν Δία, ἔφη· οὐ γὰρ εὐκόλῳ ἔοικεν.	"No, by Zeus," he said, "it doesn't look like an easy one."
	οὐ γάρ, εἶπον. ἀλλὰ δὴ ὧδ' ἔχει· ἄντε τις εἰς κολυμβήθραν μικρὰν ἐμπέσῃ ἄντε εἰς τὸ μέγιστον πέλαγος μέσον, ὅμως γε νεῖ οὐδὲν ἧττον.	"It isn't," I said. "But here's how things stand: whether you fall into a little swimming pool or into the middle of the vast sea, you have to swim all the same."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
453d	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἡμῖν νευστέον καὶ πειρατέον σῴζεσθαι ἐκ τοῦ λόγου, ἤτοι δελφῖνά τινα ἐλπίζοντας ἡμᾶς ὑπολαβεῖν ἂν ἤ τινα ἄλλην ἄπορον σωτηρίαν. 453e	"Then we too must swim and try to get safely out of the argument, hoping that a dolphin might pick us up, or for some other unlikely rescue." 453e

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἔοικεν, ἔφη.	"So it seems," he said.
	φέρε δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐάν πῃ εὕρωμεν τὴν ἔξοδον. ὁμολογοῦμεν γὰρ δὴ ἄλλην φύσιν ἄλλο δεῖν ἐπιτηδεύειν, γυναικὸς δὲ καὶ ἀνδρὸς ἄλλην εἶναι· τὰς δὲ ἄλλας φύσεις τὰ αὐτά φαμεν νῦν δεῖν ἐπιτηδεῦσαι. ταῦτα ἡμῶν κατηγορεῖται;	"Come on, then," I said, "let's see if we can find a way out. We agree that different natures should pursue different occupations, and that a woman's nature and a man's are different. Yet now we say that these different natures should pursue the same occupations. Is that the charge against us?"
	κομιδῇ γε.	"Exactly."
	ἦ γενναία, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Γλαύκων, ἡ δύναμις τῆς ἀντιλογικῆς τέχνης.	"What a splendid power the art of contradiction has, Glaucon!" I said.
	τί δή;	"Why do you say that?"[5]
454a	ὅτι, εἶπον, δοκοῦσί μοι εἰς αὐτὴν καὶ ἄκοντες πολλοὶ ἐμπίπτειν καὶ οἴεσθαι οὐκ ἐρίζειν ἀλλὰ διαλέγεσθαι, διὰ τὸ μὴ δύνασθαι κατ' εἴδη διαιρούμενοι τὸ λεγόμενον ἐπισκοπεῖν, ἀλλὰ κατ' αὐτὸ τὸ ὄνομα διώκειν τοῦ λεχθέντος τὴν ἐναντίωσιν, ἔριδι, οὐ διαλέκτῳ πρὸς ἀλλήλους χρώμενοι.	"Because," I said, "many people seem to me to fall into it even against their will, and to think they're having a discussion, not a quarrel. That's because they can't examine what is said by dividing it into its kinds; instead they chase after contradictions of what was said by fastening on the mere word, and they use quarreling, not discussion, with one another."
	ἔστι γὰρ δή, ἔφη, περὶ πολλοὺς τοῦτο τὸ πάθος· ἀλλὰ μῶν καὶ πρὸς ἡμᾶς τοῦτο τείνει ἐν τῷ παρόντι; 454b	"That does happen to many people," he said. "But surely it doesn't apply to us at the moment?" 454b
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· κινδυνεύομεν γοῦν ἄκοντες ἀντιλογίας ἅπτεσθαι.	"It certainly does," I said. "At any rate, we're in danger of getting into contradiction without meaning to."
	πῶς;	"How?"
454b	τὸ μὴ τὴν αὐτὴν φύσιν ὅτι οὐ τῶν αὐτῶν δεῖ ἐπιτηδευμάτων τυγχάνειν πάνυ ἀνδρείως τε καὶ ἐριστικῶς κατὰ τὸ ὄνομα διώκομεν, ἐπεσκεψάμεθα δὲ οὐδ' ὁπηοῦν τί εἶδος τὸ τῆς ἑτέρας τε καὶ τῆς αὐτῆς φύσεως καὶ πρὸς τί τεῖνον ὡριζόμεθα τότε, ὅτε τὰ ἐπιτηδεύματα ἄλλῃ φύσει ἄλλα, τῇ δὲ αὐτῇ τὰ αὐτὰ ἀπεδίδομεν.	"We're very bravely and contentiously chasing after the literal words of the claim that a nature that isn't the same shouldn't have the same occupations. But we didn't examine at all what kind of sameness or difference of nature we meant, or what it bore on, when we defined things back then, assigning different occupations to a different nature and the same ones to the same nature."
	οὐ γὰρ οὖν, ἔφη, ἐπεσκεψάμεθα. 454c	"No," he said, "we didn't examine that." 454c
454c	τοιγάρτοι, εἶπον, ἔξεστιν ἡμῖν, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἀνερωτᾶν ἡμᾶς αὐτοὺς εἰ ἡ αὐτὴ φύσις φαλακρῶν καὶ κομητῶν καὶ οὐχ ἡ ἐναντία, καὶ ἐπειδὰν ὁμολογῶμεν ἐναντίαν εἶναι, ἐὰν φαλακροὶ σκυτοτομῶσιν, μὴ ἐᾶν κομήτας, ἐὰν δ' αὖ κομῆται, μὴ τοὺς ἑτέρους.	"So it seems," I said, "we might as well ask ourselves whether bald men and long-haired men have the same nature and not opposite ones; and then, once we agree that they're opposite, if bald men are shoemakers, not to allow long-haired men to be, or if long-haired men are, not to allow the others."
	γελοῖον μεντἂν εἴη, ἔφη.	"That would be ridiculous," he said.
	ἆρα κατ' ἄλλο τι, εἶπον ἐγώ, γελοῖον, ἢ ὅτι τότε οὐ πάντως τὴν αὐτὴν καὶ τὴν ἑτέραν φύσιν ἐτιθέμεθα, ἀλλ'	"And is it ridiculous for any other reason," I said, "than that back then we weren't positing sameness

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἐκεῖνο τὸ εἶδος τῆς ἀλλοιώσεώς τε καὶ ὁμοιώσεως μόνον [454d] ἐφυλάττομεν τὸ πρὸς αὐτὰ τεῖνον τὰ ἐπιτηδεύματα; οἷον ἰατρικὸν μὲν καὶ ἰατρικὴν τὴν ψυχὴν ὄντα τὴν αὐτὴν φύσιν ἔχειν ἐλέγομεν· ἢ οὐκ οἴει;	and difference of nature in every sense, but were attending only to the kind of difference and likeness [454d] that bears on the occupations themselves? For instance, we said that a man and a woman who both have a doctor's soul have the same nature. Or don't you think so?"
	ἔγωγε.	"I do."
	ἰατρικὸν δέ γε καὶ τεκτονικὸν ἄλλην;	"But that a doctor and a carpenter have different natures?"
	πάντως που.	"Of course."
454d	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ τὸ τῶν ἀνδρῶν καὶ τὸ τῶν γυναικῶν γένος, ἐὰν μὲν πρὸς τέχνην τινὰ ἢ ἄλλο ἐπιτήδευμα διαφέρον φαίνηται, τοῦτο δὴ φήσομεν ἑκατέρῳ δεῖν ἀποδιδόναι· ἐὰν δ' αὐτῷ τούτῳ φαίνηται διαφέρειν, τῷ τὸ μὲν θῆλυ τίκτειν, [454e] τὸ δὲ ἄρρεν ὀχεύειν, οὐδέν τί πω φήσομεν μᾶλλον ἀποδεδεῖχθαι ὡς πρὸς ὃ ἡμεῖς λέγομεν διαφέρει γυνὴ ἀνδρός, ἀλλ' ἔτι οἰησόμεθα δεῖν τὰ αὐτὰ ἐπιτηδεύειν τούς τε φύλακας ἡμῖν καὶ τὰς γυναῖκας αὐτῶν.	"So too," I said, "with the male kind and the female kind: if either turns out to differ from the other with respect to some art or other occupation, we'll say that occupation should be assigned to the one suited to it. But if they turn out to differ only in this, that the female bears children [454e] and the male begets them, we'll say it hasn't yet been shown at all that a woman differs from a man with respect to what we're talking about, and we'll go on thinking that our guardians and their women should pursue the same occupations."
	καὶ ὀρθῶς γ', ἔφη.	"And rightly," he said.
454e	οὐκοῦν μετὰ τοῦτο κελεύομεν τὸν τὰ ἐναντία λέγοντα [455a] τοῦτο αὐτὸ διδάσκειν ἡμᾶς, πρὸς τίνα τέχνην ἢ τί ἐπιτήδευμα τῶν περὶ πόλεως κατασκευὴν οὐχ ἡ αὐτὴ ἀλλὰ ἑτέρα φύσις γυναικός τε καὶ ἀνδρός;	"Next, then, we'll ask the person who says the opposite [455a] to teach us just this: in what art or occupation concerned with the organization of a city is the nature of a woman and of a man not the same but different?"
	δίκαιον γοῦν.	"That's fair, anyway."
	τάχα τοίνυν ἄν, ὅπερ σὺ ὀλίγον πρότερον ἔλεγες, εἴποι ἂν καὶ ἄλλος, ὅτι ἐν μὲν τῷ παραχρῆμα ἱκανῶς εἰπεῖν οὐ ῥᾴδιον, ἐπισκεψαμένῳ δὲ οὐδὲν χαλεπόν.	"Well, perhaps someone else might say what you said a little earlier: that it's not easy to give an adequate answer on the spot, but not at all hard after some thought."
	εἴποι γὰρ ἄν.	"He might."
	βούλει οὖν δεώμεθα τοῦ τὰ τοιαῦτα ἀντιλέγοντος ἀκολουθῆσαι [455b] ἡμῖν, ἐάν πως ἡμεῖς ἐκείνῳ ἐνδειξώμεθα ὅτι οὐδέν ἐστιν ἐπιτήδευμα ἴδιον γυναικὶ πρὸς διοίκησιν πόλεως;	"Then shall we ask the person who raises this objection to follow [455b] us, and see whether we can somehow show him that there is no occupation concerned with running a city that is peculiar to women?"
455b	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
	ἴθι δή, φήσομεν πρὸς αὐτόν, ἀποκρίνου· ἆρα οὕτως ἔλεγες τὸν μὲν εὐφυῆ πρός τι εἶναι, τὸν δὲ ἀφυῆ, ἐν ᾧ ὁ μὲν ῥᾳδίως τι μανθάνοι, ὁ δὲ χαλεπῶς; καὶ ὁ μὲν ἀπὸ βραχείας μαθήσεως ἐπὶ πολὺ εὑρετικὸς εἴη οὗ ἔμαθεν, ὁ δὲ πολλῆς μαθήσεως τυχὼν καὶ μελέτης μηδ' ἃ ἔμαθε	"'Come on then,' we'll say to him, 'answer this. Is this what you meant when you said that one person is naturally gifted for something and another isn't: that the one learns it easily, the other with difficulty? That the one, after a little learning, can

5 The legendary singer Arion was said to have been carried safely to shore on a dolphin's back after being thrown overboard.

GREEK

σῴζοιτο; καὶ τῷ μὲν τὰ τοῦ σώματος ἱκανῶς ὑπηρετοῖ τῇ διανοίᾳ, τῷ [455c] δὲ ἐναντιοῖτο; ἆρ' ἄλλα ἄττα ἐστὶν ἢ ταῦτα, οἷς τὸν εὐφυῆ πρὸς ἕκαστα καὶ τὸν μὴ ὠρίζου;

οὐδείς, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἄλλα φήσει.

455c οἶσθά τι οὖν ὑπὸ ἀνθρώπων μελετώμενον, ἐν ᾧ οὐ πάντα ταῦτα τὸ τῶν ἀνδρῶν γένος διαφερόντως ἔχει ἢ τὸ τῶν γυναικῶν; ἢ μακρολογῶμεν τήν τε ὑφαντικὴν λέγοντες καὶ τὴν τῶν ποπάνων τε καὶ ἐψημάτων θεραπείαν, ἐν οἷς δή τι δοκεῖ τὸ γυναικεῖον γένος εἶναι, οὗ καὶ καταγελαστότατόν [455d] ἐστι πάντων ἡττώμενον;

ἀληθῆ, ἔφη, λέγεις, ὅτι πολὺ κρατεῖται ἐν ἅπασιν ὡς ἔπος εἰπεῖν τὸ γένος τοῦ γένους. γυναῖκες μέντοι πολλαὶ πολλῶν ἀνδρῶν βελτίους εἰς πολλά· τὸ δὲ ὅλον ἔχει ὡς σὺ λέγεις.

455d οὐδὲν ἄρα ἐστίν, ὦ φίλε, ἐπιτήδευμα τῶν πόλιν διοικούντων γυναικὸς διότι γυνή, οὐδ' ἀνδρὸς διότι ἀνήρ, ἀλλ' ὁμοίως διεσπαρμέναι αἱ φύσεις ἐν ἀμφοῖν τοῖν ζῴοιν, καὶ πάντων μὲν μετέχει γυνὴ ἐπιτηδευμάτων κατὰ [455e] φύσιν, πάντων δὲ ἀνήρ, ἐπὶ πᾶσι δὲ ἀσθενέστερον γυνὴ ἀνδρός.

πάνυ γε.

ἦ οὖν ἀνδράσι πάντα προστάξομεν, γυναικὶ δ' οὐδέν;

καὶ πῶς;

ἀλλ' ἔστι γὰρ οἶμαι, ὡς φήσομεν, καὶ γυνὴ ἰατρική, ἡ δ' οὔ, καὶ μουσική, ἡ δ' ἄμουσος φύσει.

τί μήν;

456a καὶ γυμναστικὴ δ' ἄρα οὔ, οὐδὲ πολεμική, ἡ δὲ ἀπόλεμος καὶ οὐ φιλογυμναστική;

οἶμαι ἔγωγε.

τί δέ; φιλόσοφός τε καὶ μισόσοφος; καὶ θυμοειδής, ἡ δ' ἄθυμός ἐστι;

καὶ ταῦτα.

ἔστιν ἄρα καὶ φυλακικὴ γυνή, ἡ δ' οὔ. ἢ οὐ τοιαύτην καὶ τῶν ἀνδρῶν τῶν φυλακικῶν φύσιν ἐξελεξάμεθα;

τοιαύτην μὲν οὖν.

ENGLISH

discover much more beyond what he learned, while the other, after much learning and practice, can't even hold on to what he learned? And that in the one the body adequately serves the mind, while in [455c] the other it works against it? Are there any other marks than these by which you distinguished the naturally gifted from the ungifted in each field?'"

"No one," he said, "will say there are any others."

"Then do you know of anything that human beings practice in which the male kind doesn't surpass the female in all these respects? Or should we go on at length about weaving, and looking after the cakes and the stews—where women do seem to count for something, and where it's most laughable of all [455d] for them to be beaten?"

"What you say is true," he said: "the one kind is far outdone by the other in practically everything. Many women, it's true, are better than many men at many things; but on the whole it is as you say."

"So, my friend, there's no occupation among those who run a city that belongs to a woman because she's a woman, or to a man because he's a man. The natural gifts are distributed alike in both creatures. By [455e] nature a woman shares in every occupation, and so does a man, but in all of them a woman is weaker than a man."

"Certainly."

"Then shall we assign everything to men and nothing to women?"

"How could we?"

"No: there is, I think, as we'll say, one woman with a gift for medicine and another without, one who is musical by nature and another unmusical."

"Of course."

"And isn't there one woman who is athletic and warlike, and another who is unwarlike and no lover of physical training?"

"I think so."

"And what about this: one a lover of wisdom and another a hater of wisdom? One spirited and another spiritless?"

"That too."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καὶ γυναικὸς ἄρα καὶ ἀνδρὸς ἡ αὐτὴ φύσις εἰς φυλακὴν πόλεως, πλὴν ὅσα ἀσθενεστέρα, ἡ δὲ ἰσχυροτέρα ἐστίν.	"So one woman is fit to be a guardian, and another isn't. Or wasn't this the sort of nature we selected in the men, too, who were fit to be guardians?"
	φαίνεται. 456b	"It was."
		"So for guarding the city, a woman and a man have the same nature, except insofar as hers is weaker and his stronger."
		"Evidently." 456b
456b	καὶ γυναῖκες ἄρα αἱ τοιαῦται τοῖς τοιούτοις ἀνδράσιν ἐκλεκτέαι συνοικεῖν τε καὶ συμφυλάττειν, ἐπείπερ εἰσὶν ἱκαναὶ καὶ συγγενεῖς αὐτοῖς τὴν φύσιν.	"Then women of this sort must be selected to live with men of this sort and to guard alongside them, since they're capable and akin to them in nature."
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
	τὰ δ' ἐπιτηδεύματα οὐ τὰ αὐτὰ ἀποδοτέα ταῖς αὐταῖς φύσεσιν;	"And mustn't the same natures be assigned the same pursuits?"
	τὰ αὐτά.	"The same."
	ἥκομεν ἄρα εἰς τὰ πρότερα περιφερόμενοι, καὶ ὁμολογοῦμεν μὴ παρὰ φύσιν εἶναι ταῖς τῶν φυλάκων γυναιξὶ μουσικήν τε καὶ γυμναστικὴν ἀποδιδόναι.	"So we've come round in a circle to where we were before, and we agree that it isn't contrary to nature to give music and physical training to the women among the guardians."
	παντάπασιν μὲν οὖν.	"Absolutely."
	οὐκ ἄρα ἀδύνατά γε οὐδὲ εὐχαῖς ὅμοια ἐνομοθετοῦμεν, 456c ἐπείπερ κατὰ φύσιν ἐτίθεμεν τὸν νόμον· ἀλλὰ τὰ νῦν παρὰ ταῦτα γιγνόμενα παρὰ φύσιν μᾶλλον, ὡς ἔοικε, γίγνεται.	"So the laws we were making weren't impossible, or like mere wishful prayers, 456c since the law we laid down was in accordance with nature. It's rather the present practice, which runs counter to it, that turns out, it seems, to be against nature."
	ἔοικεν.	"So it seems."
	οὐκοῦν ἡ ἐπίσκεψις ἡμῖν ἦν εἰ δυνατά γε καὶ βέλτιστα λέγοιμεν;	"Now, wasn't our inquiry whether what we were proposing was possible, and whether it was best?"
	ἦν γάρ.	"It was."
	καὶ ὅτι μὲν δὴ δυνατά, διωμολόγηται;	"And it's been agreed that it's possible?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	ὅτι δὲ δὴ βέλτιστα, τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο δεῖ διομολογηθῆναι;	"And next we have to reach agreement that it's best?"
	δῆλον.	"Clearly."
	οὐκοῦν πρός γε τὸ φυλακικὴν γυναῖκα γενέσθαι, οὐκ ἄλλη μὲν ἡμῖν ἄνδρας ποιήσει παιδεία, ἄλλη δὲ γυναῖκας, ἄλλως 456d τε καὶ τὴν αὐτὴν φύσιν παραλαβοῦσα;	"Well then, when it comes to making a woman a guardian, we won't have one education to make our men and another to make our women, 456d especially since it's taking over the same nature?"
456d	οὐκ ἄλλη.	"No, not a different one."
	πῶς οὖν ἔχεις δόξης τοῦ τοιοῦδε πέρι;	"Then what's your opinion about this?"
	τίνος δή;	"About what?"
	τοῦ ὑπολαμβάνειν παρὰ σεαυτῷ τὸν μὲν ἀμείνω ἄνδρα, τὸν δὲ χείρω· ἢ πάντας ὁμοίους ἡγῇ;	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	οὐδαμῶς.	"About supposing, in your own mind, that one man is better and another worse. Or do you think they're all alike?"
	ἐν οὖν τῇ πόλει ἣν ᾠκίζομεν, πότερον οἴει ἡμῖν ἀμείνους ἄνδρας ἐξειργάσθαι τοὺς φύλακας, τυχόντας ἧς διήλθομεν παιδείας, ἢ τοὺς σκυτοτόμους, τῇ σκυτικῇ παιδευθέντας;	"Not at all."
	γελοῖον, ἔφη, ἐρωτᾷς.	"Then in the city we were founding, which do you think we've turned into better men: the guardians, who received the education we described, or the shoemakers, who were educated in shoemaking?"
	μανθάνω, ἔφην. τί δέ; τῶν ἄλλων πολιτῶν οὐχ οὗτοι [456e] ἄριστοι;	"That's a ridiculous question," he said.
	πολύ γε.	"I understand," I said. "Well, of all the other citizens, aren't these [456e] the best?"
	τί δέ; αἱ γυναῖκες τῶν γυναικῶν οὐχ αὗται ἔσονται βέλτισται;	"By far."
	καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφη, πολύ.	"And won't these women be the best of the women?"
		"That too," he said, "by far."
456e	ἔστι δέ τι πόλει ἄμεινον ἢ γυναῖκάς τε καὶ ἄνδρας ὡς ἀρίστους ἐγγίγνεσθαι;	"Is there anything better for a city than that it should come to have the best possible women and men?"
	οὐκ ἔστιν.	"There isn't."
	τοῦτο δὲ μουσική τε καὶ γυμναστικὴ παραγιγνόμεναι, ὡς [457a] ἡμεῖς διήλθομεν, ἀπεργάσονται;	"And music and physical training, applied as [457a] we described, will bring this about?"
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	οὐ μόνον ἄρα δυνατὸν ἀλλὰ καὶ ἄριστον πόλει νόμιμον ἐτίθεμεν.	"So the practice we were laying down is not only possible but also best for the city."
	οὕτως.	"Yes."
457a	ἀποδυτέον δὴ ταῖς τῶν φυλάκων γυναιξίν, ἐπείπερ ἀρετὴν ἀντὶ ἱματίων ἀμφιέσονται, καὶ κοινωνητέον πολέμου τε καὶ τῆς ἄλλης φυλακῆς τῆς περὶ τὴν πόλιν, καὶ οὐκ ἄλλα πρακτέον· τούτων δ' αὐτῶν τὰ ἐλαφρότερα ταῖς γυναιξὶν ἢ τοῖς ἀνδράσι δοτέον διὰ τὴν τοῦ γένους ἀσθένειαν. ὁ [457b] δὲ γελῶν ἀνὴρ ἐπὶ γυμναῖς γυναιξί, τοῦ βελτίστου ἕνεκα γυμναζομέναις, ἀτελῆ τοῦ γελοίου σοφίας δρέπων καρπόν, οὐδὲν οἶδεν, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἐφ' ᾧ γελᾷ οὐδ' ὅτι πράττει· κάλλιστα γὰρ δὴ τοῦτο καὶ λέγεται καὶ λελέξεται, ὅτι τὸ μὲν ὠφέλιμον καλόν, τὸ δὲ βλαβερὸν αἰσχρόν.	"Then the guardians' women must strip for exercise, since they'll be clothed in excellence instead of cloaks, and they must share in war and in the rest of the guarding of the city, and do nothing else; but of these same tasks the lighter ones must be given to the women rather than to the men, because of the weakness of their sex. As [457b] for the man who laughs at naked women exercising for the sake of what's best, he 'plucks the unripe fruit' of wisdom with his laughter. He doesn't know, it seems, what he's laughing at or what he's doing. For this is the finest thing that is said, and ever will be said: that what is beneficial is fine, and what is harmful is shameful."[6]
457b	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν.	"Absolutely."
	τοῦτο μὲν τοίνυν ἓν ὥσπερ κῦμα φῶμεν διαφεύγειν τοῦ γυναικείου πέρι νόμου λέγοντες, ὥστε μὴ παντάπασι κατακλυσθῆναι τιθέντας ὡς δεῖ κοινῇ πάντα ἐπιτηδεύειν	"So may we say that, in discussing the law about women, we're escaping this one wave, as it were? We haven't been completely swamped by laying

6 "Plucking the unripe fruit of wisdom" adapts a line of the poet Pindar.

GREEK	ENGLISH
τούς τε [457c] φύλακας ἡμῖν καὶ τὰς φυλακίδας, ἀλλά πῃ τὸν λόγον αὐτὸν αὑτῷ ὁμολογεῖσθαι ὡς δυνατά τε καὶ ὠφέλιμα λέγει;	down that our guardians, [457c] male and female, must share all their pursuits in common; instead, the argument somehow agrees with itself that what it proposes is both possible and beneficial?"
καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, οὐ σμικρὸν κῦμα διαφεύγεις.	"And it's no small wave you're escaping," he said.
φήσεις γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐ μέγα αὐτὸ εἶναι, ὅταν τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο ἴδῃς.	"You'll say it isn't a big one," I said, "once you see the next."
λέγε δή, ἴδω, ἔφη.	"Tell me, then; let me see it," he said.
τούτῳ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἕπεται νόμος καὶ τοῖς ἔμπροσθεν τοῖς ἄλλοις, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, ὅδε.	"Following on this one," I said, "and on the others before it, there comes, I think, this law."

THE SECOND WAVE: WIVES AND CHILDREN IN COMMON

Socrates proposes that guardians share wives and children, with state-arranged breeding.

GREEK	ENGLISH
457c **SOCRATES** τίς;	**SOCRATES** "What is it?"
τὰς γυναῖκας ταύτας τῶν ἀνδρῶν τούτων πάντων πάσας [457d] εἶναι κοινάς, ἰδίᾳ δὲ μηδενὶ μηδεμίαν συνοικεῖν· καὶ τοὺς παῖδας αὖ κοινούς, καὶ μήτε γονέα ἔκγονον εἰδέναι τὸν αὑτοῦ μήτε παῖδα γονέα.	"That these women are all [457d] to be shared by all these men, and no woman is to live privately with any man; and that the children, too, are to be shared, and no parent is to know their own offspring, nor any child its parent."
πολύ, ἔφη, τοῦτο ἐκείνου μεῖζον πρὸς ἀπιστίαν καὶ τοῦ δυνατοῦ πέρι καὶ τοῦ ὠφελίμου.	"This one is much bigger than the other," he said, "when it comes to disbelief, both about whether it's possible and about whether it's beneficial."
οὐκ οἶμαι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, περί γε τοῦ ὠφελίμου ἀμφισβητεῖσθαι ἄν, ὡς οὐ μέγιστον ἀγαθὸν κοινὰς μὲν τὰς γυναῖκας εἶναι, κοινοὺς δὲ τοὺς παῖδας, εἴπερ οἷόν τε· ἀλλ' οἶμαι περὶ τοῦ εἰ δυνατὸν ἢ μὴ πλείστην ἂν ἀμφισβήτησιν γενέσθαι. [457e]	"I don't think," I said, "there'd be any dispute about its being beneficial—that it would be a very great good for the women to be shared and the children shared, if it could be done. But I think there'd be a great deal of dispute about whether it's possible or not." [457e]
457e περὶ ἀμφοτέρων, ἦ δ' ὅς, εὖ μάλ' ἂν ἀμφισβητηθείη.	"There could well be plenty of dispute about both," he said.
λέγεις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λόγων σύστασιν· ἐγὼ δ' ᾤμην ἔκ γε τοῦ ἑτέρου ἀποδράσεσθαι, εἴ σοι δόξειεν ὠφέλιμον εἶναι, λοιπὸν δὲ δή μοι ἔσεσθαι περὶ τοῦ δυνατοῦ καὶ μή.	"You're talking about an alliance of arguments against me," I said. "I thought I'd run away from one of them at least, if you thought it beneficial, and that I'd be left with only whether it's possible or not."
ἀλλ' οὐκ ἔλαθες, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἀποδιδράσκων, ἀλλ' ἀμφοτέρων πέρι δίδου λόγον.	"But you didn't slip away unnoticed," he said. "Give an account of both."
ὑφεκτέον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δίκην. τοσόνδε μέντοι χάρισαί [458a] μοι· ἔασόν με ἑορτάσαι, ὥσπερ οἱ ἀργοὶ τὴν διάνοιαν εἰώθασιν ἑστιᾶσθαι ὑφ' ἑαυτῶν, ὅταν μόνοι πορεύωνται. καὶ γὰρ οἱ τοιοῦτοί που, πρὶν ἐξευρεῖν τίνα τρόπον ἔσται τι ὧν ἐπιθυμοῦσι, τοῦτο παρέντες, ἵνα μὴ κάμνωσι βουλευόμενοι περὶ τοῦ δυνατοῦ καὶ μή, θέντες ὡς ὑπάρχον εἶναι ὃ βούλονται, ἤδη τὰ λοιπὰ διατάττουσιν	"I'll have to pay the penalty," I said. "But do me this [458a] one favor. Let me take a holiday, the way lazy-minded people like to feast on their own thoughts when they walk alone. People like that, you know, before they find out how any of the things they desire can come about, skip that question, so as not to wear themselves out deliberating

GREEK

καὶ χαίρουσιν διεξιόντες οἷα δράσουσι γενομένου, ἀργὸν καὶ ἄλλως ψυχὴν ἔτι [458b] ἀργοτέραν ποιοῦντες. ἤδη οὖν καὶ αὐτὸς μαλθακίζομαι, καὶ ἐκεῖνα μὲν ἐπιθυμῶ ἀναβαλέσθαι καὶ ὕστερον ἐπισκέψασθαι, ᾗ δυνατά, νῦν δὲ ὡς δυνατῶν ὄντων θεὶς σκέψομαι, ἄν μοι παριῇς, πῶς διατάξουσιν αὐτὰ οἱ ἄρχοντες γιγνόμενα, καὶ ὅτι πάντων συμφορώτατ' ἂν εἴη πραχθέντα τῇ τε πόλει καὶ τοῖς φύλαξιν.

458b ταῦτα πειράσομαί σοι πρότερα συνδιασκοπεῖσθαι, ὕστερα δ' ἐκεῖνα, εἴπερ παριεῖς.

ἀλλὰ παρίημι, ἔφη, καὶ σκόπει.

οἶμαι τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἴπερ ἔσονται οἱ ἄρχοντες ἄξιοι [458c] τούτου τοῦ ὀνόματος, οἵ τε τούτοις ἐπίκουροι κατὰ ταὐτά, τοὺς μὲν ἐθελήσειν ποιεῖν τὰ ἐπιταττόμενα, τοὺς δὲ ἐπιτάξειν, τὰ μὲν αὐτοὺς πειθομένους τοῖς νόμοις, τὰ δὲ καὶ μιμουμένους, ὅσα ἂν ἐκείνοις ἐπιτρέψωμεν.

εἰκός, ἔφη.

458c σὺ μὲν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὁ νομοθέτης αὐτοῖς, ὥσπερ τοὺς ἄνδρας ἐξέλεξας, οὕτω καὶ τὰς γυναῖκας ἐκλέξας παραδώσεις καθ' ὅσον οἷόν τε ὁμοφυεῖς· οἱ δέ, ἅτε οἰκίας τε καὶ συσσίτια κοινὰ ἔχοντες, ἰδίᾳ δὲ οὐδενὸς οὐδὲν τοιοῦτον κεκτημένου, [458d] ὁμοῦ δὴ ἔσονται, ὁμοῦ δὲ ἀναμεμειγμένων καὶ ἐν γυμνασίοις καὶ ἐν τῇ ἄλλῃ τροφῇ ὑπ' ἀνάγκης οἶμαι τῆς ἐμφύτου ἄξονται πρὸς τὴν ἀλλήλων μεῖξιν. ἢ οὐκ ἀναγκαῖά σοι δοκῶ λέγειν;

458d οὐ γεωμετρικαῖς γε, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἀλλ' ἐρωτικαῖς ἀνάγκαις, αἳ κινδυνεύουσιν ἐκείνων δριμύτεραι εἶναι πρὸς τὸ πείθειν τε καὶ ἕλκειν τὸν πολὺν λεών.

καὶ μάλα, εἶπον. ἀλλὰ μετὰ δὴ ταῦτα, ὦ Γλαύκων, ἀτάκτως μὲν μείγνυσθαι ἀλλήλοις ἢ ἄλλο ὁτιοῦν ποιεῖν οὔτε [458e] ὅσιον ἐν εὐδαιμόνων πόλει οὔτ' ἐάσουσιν οἱ ἄρχοντες.

οὐ γὰρ δίκαιον, ἔφη.

δῆλον δὴ ὅτι γάμους τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο ποιήσομεν ἱεροὺς εἰς δύναμιν ὅτι μάλιστα· εἶεν δ' ἂν ἱεροὶ οἱ ὠφελιμώτατοι.

παντάπασι μὲν οὖν. [459a]

ENGLISH

about what's possible and what isn't. They assume that what they want is already there, and go straight on to arrange the rest, enjoying themselves as they run through all they'll do once it's happened—making a soul that was lazy to begin with [458b] lazier still. Well, I'm going soft myself now. I want to put those questions off and examine later how these things are possible. For now I'll assume they are possible and consider, if you'll let me, how the rulers will arrange them when they happen, and show that carrying them out would be the most advantageous thing of all for both the city and the guardians.

"I'll try to examine these points with you first, and the others afterward—if you'll let me."

"I'll let you," he said. "Go ahead and look."

"Well then," I said, "I think that if the rulers are to be worthy [458c] of that name, and their auxiliaries likewise, the latter will be willing to do what they're ordered, and the former will give the orders—in some cases obeying the laws themselves, and in others, the ones we leave to their discretion, imitating the laws."

"Probably," he said.

"Then you, their lawgiver," I said, "just as you selected the men, will select the women too and hand them over, as close in nature to the men as possible. And since they'll have houses and common meals together, and no one will own anything of that sort privately, [458d] they'll be together; and mixing together both in the gymnasia and in the rest of their upbringing, they'll be drawn, I think, by an innate necessity to have sex with one another. Or don't you think I'm talking about necessities?"

"Not geometrical necessities," he said, "but erotic ones, which are probably sharper than the others when it comes to persuading and pulling along the great mass of people."

"Very much so," I said. "But next, Glaucon: for them to have sex with one another in a disorderly way, or to do anything else that way, would neither [458e] be holy in a city of happy people, nor will the rulers allow it."

"No, because it isn't just," he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		“Then clearly our next step will be to make marriages as sacred as we possibly can; and the sacred ones would be the most beneficial.”
		“Absolutely.” 459a
459a	πῶς οὖν δὴ ὠφελιμώτατοι ἔσονται; τόδε μοι λέγε, ὦ Γλαύκων· ὁρῶ γάρ σου ἐν τῇ οἰκίᾳ καὶ κύνας θηρευτικοὺς καὶ τῶν γενναίων ὀρνίθων μάλα συχνούς· ἆρ’ οὖν, ὦ πρὸς Διός, προσέσχηκάς τι τοῖς τούτων γάμοις τε καὶ παιδοποιίᾳ;	“Then how will they be most beneficial? Tell me this, Glaucon. I see you have hunting dogs in your house, and a great many pedigree birds. Well then, by Zeus, have you paid any attention to their matings and breeding?”
	τὸ ποῖον; ἔφη.	“In what respect?” he said.
	πρῶτον μὲν αὐτῶν τούτων, καίπερ ὄντων γενναίων, ἆρ’ οὐκ εἰσί τινες καὶ γίγνονται ἄριστοι;	“First, among these animals themselves, though they’re all well bred, aren’t there some that are, and turn out to be, the best?”
	εἰσίν.	“There are.”
	πότερον οὖν ἐξ ἁπάντων ὁμοίως γεννᾷς, ἢ προθυμῇ ὅτι μάλιστα ἐκ τῶν ἀρίστων;	“Then do you breed from all of them alike, or are you keen to breed as far as possible from the best?”
	ἐκ τῶν ἀρίστων. 459b	“From the best.” 459b
459b	τί δ’; ἐκ τῶν νεωτάτων ἢ ἐκ τῶν γεραιτάτων ἢ ἐξ ἀκμαζόντων ὅτι μάλιστα;	“And from the youngest, or from the oldest, or as far as possible from those in their prime?”
	ἐξ ἀκμαζόντων.	“From those in their prime.”
	καὶ ἂν μὴ οὕτω γεννᾶται, πολύ σοι ἡγῇ χεῖρον ἔσεσθαι τό τε τῶν ὀρνίθων καὶ τὸ τῶν κυνῶν γένος;	“And if they aren’t bred this way, you think your breed of birds and of dogs will be much worse?”
	ἔγωγ’, ἔφη.	“I do,” he said.
	τί δὲ ἵππων οἴει, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ζῴων; ἢ ἄλλῃ πῃ ἔχειν;	“And what about horses,” I said, “and the other animals? Do you think it’s any different with them?”
	ἄτοπον μεντἄν, ἦ δ’ ὅς, εἴη.	“It would be strange if it were,” he said.
	βαβαῖ, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, ὦ φίλε ἑταῖρε, ὡς ἄρα σφόδρα ἡμῖν δεῖ ἄκρων εἶναι τῶν ἀρχόντων, εἴπερ καὶ περὶ τὸ τῶν ἀνθρώπων γένος ὡσαύτως ἔχει. 459c	“Good heavens, my dear friend,” I said, “how supremely skilled our rulers will need to be, if the same holds for the human race too.” 459c
459c	ἀλλὰ μὲν δὴ ἔχει, ἔφη· ἀλλὰ τί δή;	“Well, it does,” he said. “But why do you say so?”
	ὅτι ἀνάγκη αὐτοῖς, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, φαρμάκοις πολλοῖς χρῆσθαι. ἰατρὸν δέ που μὴ δεομένοις μὲν σώμασι φαρμάκων, ἀλλὰ διαίτῃ ἐθελόντων ὑπακούειν, καὶ φαυλότερον ἐξαρκεῖν ἡγούμεθα εἶναι· ὅταν δὲ δὴ καὶ φαρμακεύειν δέῃ, ἴσμεν ὅτι ἀνδρειοτέρου δεῖ τοῦ ἰατροῦ.	“Because they’ll need to use a lot of drugs,” I said. “For bodies that don’t need drugs but are willing to follow a regimen, we think even a rather ordinary doctor will do. But when drugs are actually needed, we know that a bolder doctor is required.”
	ἀληθῆ· ἀλλὰ πρὸς τί λέγεις;	“True. But what are you getting at?”
	πρὸς τόδε, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ· συχνῷ τῷ ψεύδει καὶ τῇ ἀπάτῃ κινδυνεύει ἡμῖν δεήσειν χρῆσθαι τοὺς ἄρχοντας ἐπ’ ὠφελίᾳ 459d τῶν ἀρχομένων. ἔφαμεν δέ που ἐν φαρμάκου εἴδει πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα χρήσιμα εἶναι.	“This,” I said. “Our rulers will probably have to use a good deal of falsehood and deception for the benefit 459d of those they rule. And we said, I think, that all such things are useful as a kind of drug.”
459d	καὶ ὀρθῶς γε, ἔφη.	“And rightly,” he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἐν τοῖς γάμοις τοίνυν καὶ παιδοποιίαις ἔοικε τὸ ὀρθὸν τοῦτο γίγνεσθαι οὐκ ἐλάχιστον.	"Well, it seems this 'rightly' will come into play not least in marriages and procreation."
	πῶς δή;	"How so?"
	δεῖ μέν, εἶπον, ἐκ τῶν ὡμολογημένων τοὺς ἀρίστους ταῖς ἀρίσταις συγγίγνεσθαι ὡς πλειστάκις, τοὺς δὲ φαυλοτάτους ταῖς φαυλοτάταις τοὐναντίον, καὶ τῶν μὲν τὰ ἔκγονα τρέφειν, [459e] τῶν δὲ μή, εἰ μέλλει τὸ ποίμνιον ὅτι ἀκρότατον εἶναι, καὶ ταῦτα πάντα γιγνόμενα λανθάνειν πλὴν αὐτοὺς τοὺς ἄρχοντας, εἰ αὖ ἡ ἀγέλη τῶν φυλάκων ὅτι μάλιστα ἀστασίαστος ἔσται.	"From what we've agreed," I said, "the best men must have sex with the best women as often as possible, and the most inferior men with the most inferior women as seldom as possible; and the offspring of the former must be reared, [459e] but not those of the latter, if the flock is to be of the highest quality. And all this must happen without anyone knowing except the rulers themselves, if the herd of guardians is to be as free as possible from faction."
	ὀρθότατα, ἔφη.	"Quite right," he said.
459e	οὐκοῦν δὴ ἑορταί τινες νομοθετητέαι ἐν αἷς συνάξομεν τάς τε νύμφας καὶ τοὺς νυμφίους καὶ θυσίαι, καὶ ὕμνοι [460a] ποιητέοι τοῖς ἡμετέροις ποιηταῖς πρέποντες τοῖς γιγνομένοις γάμοις· τὸ δὲ πλῆθος τῶν γάμων ἐπὶ τοῖς ἄρχουσι ποιήσομεν, ἵν' ὡς μάλιστα διασῴζωσι τὸν αὐτὸν ἀριθμὸν τῶν ἀνδρῶν, πρὸς πολέμους τε καὶ νόσους καὶ πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα ἀποσκοποῦντες, καὶ μήτε μεγάλη ἡμῖν ἡ πόλις κατὰ τὸ δυνατὸν μήτε σμικρὰ γίγνηται.	"So we must establish by law certain festivals at which we'll bring together the brides and bridegrooms, with sacrifices, and hymns [460a] composed by our poets to suit the marriages that take place. The number of marriages we'll leave to the rulers, so that they can keep the number of men as constant as possible, taking into account wars, diseases and everything of that sort, and so that our city, as far as possible, becomes neither large nor small."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.	"Right," he said.
	κλῆροι δή τινες οἶμαι ποιητέοι κομψοί, ὥστε τὸν φαῦλον ἐκεῖνον αἰτιᾶσθαι ἐφ' ἑκάστης συνέρξεως τύχην ἀλλὰ μὴ τοὺς ἄρχοντας.	"And I think some clever lots must be devised, so that at each pairing the inferior man we mentioned blames chance, not the rulers."
460a	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη. [460b]	"Certainly," he said. [460b]
	καὶ τοῖς ἀγαθοῖς γέ που τῶν νέων ἐν πολέμῳ ἢ ἄλλοθί που γέρα δοτέον καὶ ἆθλα ἄλλα τε καὶ ἀφθονεστέρα ἡ ἐξουσία τῆς τῶν γυναικῶν συγκοιμήσεως, ἵνα καὶ ἅμα μετὰ προφάσεως ὡς πλεῖστοι τῶν παίδων ἐκ τῶν τοιούτων σπείρωνται.	"And to those of the young men who are good in war or elsewhere we must give honors and prizes, and in particular a more generous license to sleep with the women, so that at the same time, under a plausible pretext, as many as possible of the children will be sired by such men."
	ὀρθῶς.	"Right."
	οὐκοῦν καὶ τὰ ἀεὶ γιγνόμενα ἔκγονα παραλαμβάνουσαι αἱ ἐπὶ τούτων ἐφεστηκυῖαι ἀρχαὶ εἴτε ἀνδρῶν εἴτε γυναικῶν εἴτε ἀμφότερα—κοιναὶ μὲν γάρ που καὶ ἀρχαὶ γυναιξί τε καὶ ἀνδράσιν—	"And the offspring, as they're born, will be taken over by the officials appointed for this—whether men or women or both, since offices, of course, are shared by women and men alike—"
	ναί. [460c]	"Yes." [460c]
460c	τὰ μὲν δὴ τῶν ἀγαθῶν, δοκῶ, λαβοῦσαι εἰς τὸν σηκὸν οἴσουσιν παρά τινας τροφοὺς χωρὶς οἰκούσας ἔν τινι μέρει τῆς πόλεως· τὰ δὲ τῶν χειρόνων, καὶ ἐάν τι τῶν	"The children of the good, I think, they'll take to the fold, to nurses living apart in a certain part of the city; but those of the inferior, and any of the

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἑτέρων ἀνάπηρον γίγνηται, ἐν ἀπορρήτῳ τε καὶ ἀδήλῳ κατακρύψουσιν ὡς πρέπει.	others born defective, they'll hide away, as is fitting, in a secret and unknown place."
	εἴπερ μέλλει, ἔφη, καθαρὸν τὸ γένος τῶν φυλάκων ἔσεσθαι.	"Yes," he said, "if the breed of guardians is to stay pure."
	οὐκοῦν καὶ τροφῆς οὗτοι ἐπιμελήσονται τάς τε μητέρας ἐπὶ τὸν σηκὸν ἄγοντες ὅταν σπαργῶσι, πᾶσαν μηχανὴν 460d μηχανώμενοι ὅπως μηδεμία τὸ αὑτῆς αἰσθήσεται, καὶ ἄλλας γάλα ἐχούσας ἐκπορίζοντες, ἐὰν μὴ αὐταὶ ἱκαναὶ ὦσι, καὶ αὐτῶν τούτων ἐπιμελήσονται ὅπως μέτριον χρόνον θηλάσονται, ἀγρυπνίας δὲ καὶ τὸν ἄλλον πόνον τίτθαις τε καὶ τροφοῖς παραδώσουσιν;	"And they'll also see to the children's feeding, bringing the mothers to the fold when their breasts are full, and using every contrivance 460d to make sure no mother recognizes her own child; they'll provide other women who have milk if the mothers themselves haven't enough; and they'll see to it that the mothers nurse only for a moderate length of time, while the sleepless nights and the rest of the labor they'll hand over to wet nurses and nannies?"
	πολλὴν ῥᾳστώνην, ἔφη, λέγεις τῆς παιδοποιίας ταῖς τῶν φυλάκων γυναιξίν.	"You're making childbearing very easy for the guardians' women," he said.
	πρέπει γάρ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. τὸ δ' ἐφεξῆς διέλθωμεν ὃ προυθέμεθα. ἔφαμεν γὰρ δὴ ἐξ ἀκμαζόντων δεῖν τὰ ἔκγονα γίγνεσθαι.	"As it should be," I said. "But let's go through the next point we proposed. We said that offspring should come from parents in their prime."
	ἀληθῆ. 460e	"True." 460e
460e	ἆρ' οὖν σοι συνδοκεῖ μέτριος χρόνος ἀκμῆς τὰ εἴκοσι ἔτη γυναικί, ἀνδρὶ δὲ τὰ τριάκοντα;	"Do you agree, then, that a reasonable length for the prime is twenty years for a woman and thirty for a man?"
	τὰ ποῖα αὐτῶν; ἔφη.	"Which years?" he said.
	γυναικὶ μέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀρξαμένῃ ἀπὸ εἰκοσιέτιδος μέχρι τετταρακονταέτιδος τίκτειν τῇ πόλει· ἀνδρὶ δέ, ἐπειδὰν τὴν ὀξυτάτην δρόμου ἀκμὴν παρῇ, τὸ ἀπὸ τούτου γεννᾶν τῇ πόλει μέχρι πεντεκαιπεντηκονταέτους.	"A woman," I said, "should bear children for the city from the age of twenty to forty; a man, once he's past his sharpest prime for running, should father children for the city from then until fifty-five."
	ἀμφοτέρων γοῦν, ἔφη, αὕτη ἀκμὴ σώματός τε καὶ φρονήσεως.	"For both of them, at any rate," he said, "that's the prime of body and of understanding."
461a	οὐκοῦν ἐάντε πρεσβύτερος τούτων ἐάντε νεώτερος τῶν εἰς τὸ κοινὸν γεννήσεων ἅψηται, οὔτε ὅσιον οὔτε δίκαιον φήσομεν τὸ ἁμάρτημα, ὡς παῖδα φιτύοντος τῇ πόλει, ὅς, ἂν λάθῃ, γεννήσεται οὐχ ὑπὸ θυσιῶν οὐδ' ὑπὸ εὐχῶν φύς, ἃς ἐφ' ἑκάστοις τοῖς γάμοις εὔξονται καὶ ἱέρειαι καὶ ἱερεῖς καὶ σύμπασα ἡ πόλις ἐξ ἀγαθῶν ἀμείνους καὶ ἐξ ὠφελίμων 461b ὠφελιμωτέρους ἀεὶ τοὺς ἐκγόνους γίγνεσθαι, ἀλλ' ὑπὸ σκότου μετὰ δεινῆς ἀκρατείας γεγονώς.	"Then if anyone older or younger than this takes part in procreation for the community, we'll say his offense is neither holy nor just, since he's fathering a child for the city who, if it goes undetected, will be born without the sacrifices and prayers that priestesses and priests and the whole city will offer at each marriage—that from good parents ever better, and from useful parents ever more 461b useful offspring may come—but will be born instead under cover of darkness, out of terrible lack of self-control."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.	"Right," he said.
461b	ὁ αὐτὸς δέ γ', εἶπον, νόμος, ἐάν τις τῶν ἔτι γεννώντων μὴ συνέρξαντος ἄρχοντος ἅπτηται τῶν ἐν ἡλικίᾳ γυναικῶν·	"The same law applies," I said, "if a man still of procreating age touches a woman of that age

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	νόθον γὰρ καὶ ἀνέγγυον καὶ ἀνίερον φήσομεν αὐτὸν παῖδα τῇ πόλει καθιστάναι.	without a ruler pairing them. We'll say he's foisting on the city a child that is illegitimate, unbetrothed and unhallowed."
	ὀρθότατα, ἔφη.	"Quite right," he said.
	ὅταν δὲ δὴ οἶμαι αἵ τε γυναῖκες καὶ οἱ ἄνδρες τοῦ γεννᾶν ἐκβῶσι τὴν ἡλικίαν, ἀφήσομέν που ἐλευθέρους αὐτοὺς συγγίγνεσθαι [461c] ᾧ ἂν ἐθέλωσι, πλὴν θυγατρὶ καὶ μητρὶ καὶ ταῖς τῶν θυγατέρων παισὶ καὶ ταῖς ἄνω μητρός, καὶ γυναῖκας αὖ πλὴν ὑεῖ καὶ πατρὶ καὶ τοῖς τούτων εἰς τὸ κάτω καὶ ἐπὶ τὸ ἄνω, καὶ ταῦτά γ' ἤδη πάντα διακελευσάμενοι προθυμεῖσθαι μάλιστα μὲν μηδ' εἰς φῶς ἐκφέρειν κύημα μηδέ γ' ἔν, ἐὰν γένηται, ἐὰν δέ τι βιάσηται, οὕτω τιθέναι, ὡς οὐκ οὔσης τροφῆς τῷ τοιούτῳ.	"But when the women and the men are past the age for procreation, I suppose we'll leave them free to have sex [461c] with whomever they like—except that a man may not with his daughter, his mother, his daughter's children or his mother's mother and those above her, nor a woman with her son, her father, or their descendants and ancestors. And we'll leave them free only after instructing them all to do their utmost, preferably, not to let even a single pregnancy see the light, if one occurs; but if one forces its way through, to deal with it on the understanding that there is no rearing for such a child."
461c	καὶ ταῦτα μέν γ', ἔφη, μετρίως λέγεται· πατέρας δὲ καὶ [461d] θυγατέρας καὶ ἃ νυνδὴ ἔλεγες πῶς διαγνώσονται ἀλλήλων;	"That's reasonable enough," he said. "But fathers and [461d] daughters, and the others you just mentioned—how will they tell who is whose?"
461d	οὐδαμῶς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· ἀλλ' ἀφ' ἧς ἂν ἡμέρας τις αὐτῶν νυμφίος γένηται, μετ' ἐκείνην δεκάτῳ μηνὶ καὶ ἑβδόμῳ δὴ ἃ ἂν γένηται ἔκγονα, ταῦτα πάντα προσερεῖ τὰ μὲν ἄρρενα ὑείς, τὰ δὲ θήλεα θυγατέρας, καὶ ἐκεῖνα ἐκεῖνον πατέρα, καὶ οὕτω δὴ τὰ τούτων ἔκγονα παίδων παῖδας, καὶ ἐκεῖν' αὖ ἐκείνους πάππους τε καὶ τηθάς, τὰ δ' ἐν ἐκείνῳ τῷ χρόνῳ γεγονότα, ἐν ᾧ αἱ μητέρες καὶ οἱ πατέρες αὐτῶν ἐγέννων, [461e] ἀδελφάς τε καὶ ἀδελφούς, ὥστε, ὃ νυνδὴ ἐλέγομεν, ἀλλήλων μὴ ἅπτεσθαι. ἀδελφοὺς δὲ καὶ ἀδελφὰς δώσει ὁ νόμος συνοικεῖν, ἐὰν ὁ κλῆρος ταύτῃ συμπίπτῃ καὶ ἡ Πυθία προσαναιρῇ.	"They won't," I said. "But from the day a man becomes a bridegroom, all the children born in the tenth month after that, and in the seventh too, he'll call his sons if they're male and his daughters if they're female, and they'll call him father. In the same way he'll call their offspring his grandchildren, and they in turn will call his generation grandfathers and grandmothers. And those born during the period when their mothers and fathers were having children [461e] they'll call brothers and sisters—so that, as we were just saying, they won't have sex with one another. But the law will allow brothers and sisters to live together, if the lot falls that way and the Pythia approves as well."[7]
461e	ὀρθότατα, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Quite right," he said.
	ἡ μὲν δὴ κοινωνία, ὦ Γλαύκων, αὕτη τε καὶ τοιαύτη γυναικῶν τε καὶ παίδων τοῖς φύλαξί σοι τῆς πόλεως· ὡς δὲ ἑπομένη τε τῇ ἄλλῃ πολιτείᾳ καὶ μακρῷ βελτίστη, δεῖ δὴ τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο βεβαιώσασθαι παρὰ τοῦ λόγου. ἢ πῶς ποιῶμεν;	"This, then, Glaucon, is the sharing of women and children among the guardians of your city, and this is its character. That it's consistent with the rest of the constitution and by far the best, we must next confirm from the argument. Or how shall we proceed?"
	οὕτω νὴ Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"That way, by Zeus," he said.
462a	ἆρ' οὖν οὐχ ἥδε ἀρχὴ τῆς ὁμολογίας, ἐρέσθαι ἡμᾶς αὐτοὺς τί ποτε τὸ μέγιστον ἀγαθὸν ἔχομεν εἰπεῖν εἰς πόλεως	"Well, isn't the starting point for reaching agreement to ask ourselves what we can name as the

7 The Pythia was the priestess of Apollo's oracle at Delphi.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	κατασκευήν, οὗ δεῖ στοχαζόμενον τὸν νομοθέτην τιθέναι τοὺς νόμους, καὶ τί μέγιστον κακόν, εἶτα ἐπισκέψασθαι ἆρα ἃ νυνδὴ διήλθομεν εἰς μὲν τὸ τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ ἴχνος ἡμῖν ἁρμόττει, τῷ δὲ τοῦ κακοῦ ἀναρμοστεῖ;	greatest good in the organization of a city—the thing the lawgiver must aim at in laying down the laws—and what the greatest evil, and then to examine whether what we've just described fits the track of the good for us and doesn't fit that of the evil?"
	πάντων μάλιστα, ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
	ἔχομεν οὖν τι μεῖζον κακὸν πόλει ἢ ἐκεῖνο ὃ ἂν αὐτὴν 462b διασπᾷ καὶ ποιῇ πολλὰς ἀντὶ μιᾶς; ἢ μεῖζον ἀγαθὸν τοῦ ὃ ἂν συνδῇ τε καὶ ποιῇ μίαν;	"Do we know of any greater evil for a city than whatever tears 462b it apart and makes it many instead of one? Or any greater good than whatever binds it together and makes it one?"
	οὐκ ἔχομεν.	"We don't."
462b	οὐκοῦν ἡ μὲν ἡδονῆς τε καὶ λύπης κοινωνία συνδεῖ, ὅταν ὅτι μάλιστα πάντες οἱ πολῖται τῶν αὐτῶν γιγνομένων τε καὶ ἀπολλυμένων παραπλησίως χαίρωσι καὶ λυπῶνται;	"And doesn't the sharing of pleasure and pain bind it together, when, as far as possible, all the citizens rejoice and grieve alike over the same gains and losses?"
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
	ἡ δέ γε τῶν τοιούτων ἰδίωσις διαλύει, ὅταν οἱ μὲν περιαλγεῖς, οἱ δὲ περιχαρεῖς γίγνωνται ἐπὶ τοῖς αὐτοῖς 462c παθήμασι τῆς πόλεώς τε καὶ τῶν ἐν τῇ πόλει;	"Whereas the privatizing of such feelings dissolves it, when some are devastated and others overjoyed at the same 462c things happening to the city and to those in it?"
	τί δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
462c	ἆρ' οὖν ἐκ τοῦδε τὸ τοιόνδε γίγνεται, ὅταν μὴ ἅμα φθέγγωνται ἐν τῇ πόλει τὰ τοιάδε ῥήματα, τό τε ἐμὸν καὶ τὸ οὐκ ἐμόν; καὶ περὶ τοῦ ἀλλοτρίου κατὰ ταὐτά;	"And doesn't that come about when the citizens don't say words like 'mine' and 'not mine' in unison? And likewise with 'someone else's'?"
	κομιδῇ μὲν οὖν.	"Exactly."
	ἐν ᾗτινι δὴ πόλει πλεῖστοι ἐπὶ τὸ αὐτὸ κατὰ ταὐτὰ τοῦτο λέγουσι τὸ ἐμὸν καὶ τὸ οὐκ ἐμόν, αὕτη ἄριστα διοικεῖται;	"So the city in which the greatest number say 'mine' and 'not mine' of the same thing and in the same way is the best governed?"
	πολύ γε.	"By far."
	καὶ ἥτις δὴ ἐγγύτατα ἑνὸς ἀνθρώπου ἔχει; οἷον ὅταν που ἡμῶν δάκτυλός του πληγῇ, πᾶσα ἡ κοινωνία ἡ κατὰ τὸ σῶμα πρὸς τὴν ψυχὴν τεταμένη εἰς μίαν σύνταξιν τὴν τοῦ ἄρχοντος 462d ἐν αὐτῇ ᾗσθετό τε καὶ πᾶσα ἅμα συνήλγησεν μέρους πονήσαντος ὅλη, καὶ οὕτω δὴ λέγομεν ὅτι ὁ ἄνθρωπος τὸν δάκτυλον ἀλγεῖ· καὶ περὶ ἄλλου ὁτουοῦν τῶν τοῦ ἀνθρώπου ὁ αὐτὸς λόγος, περί τε λύπης πονοῦντος μέρους καὶ περὶ ἡδονῆς ῥαΐζοντος;	"And that's the city that most closely resembles a single person? For example, when one of us has a finger struck, the whole community that stretches through the body to the soul, organized into a single structure under the ruling part 462d within it, perceives it, and all of it feels the pain together, the whole along with the suffering part; and that's why we say the person has a pain in his finger. And the same account holds for any other part of a person, both for pain when a part is suffering and for pleasure when it's getting better?"
	ὁ αὐτὸς γάρ, ἔφη· καὶ τοῦτο ὃ ἐρωτᾷς, τοῦ τοιούτου ἐγγύτατα ἡ ἄριστα πολιτευομένη πόλις οἰκεῖ.	"The same," he said. "And as for what you're asking, the best-governed city is the one that lives most like this."
462d		

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἑνὸς δὴ οἶμαι πάσχοντος τῶν πολιτῶν ὁτιοῦν ἢ ἀγαθὸν	"Then when one of its citizens experiences anything, good
462e	ἢ κακὸν ἡ τοιαύτη πόλις μάλιστά τε φήσει ἑαυτῆς εἶναι τὸ πάσχον, καὶ ἢ συνησθήσεται ἅπασα ἢ συλλυπήσεται.	or bad, such a city, I think, will be the most ready to say that the experience is its own, and the whole city will share the pleasure or share the pain."
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, τήν γε εὔνομον.	"It must," he said, "if it's well governed."
	ὥρα ἂν εἴη, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐπανιέναι ἡμῖν ἐπὶ τὴν ἡμετέραν πόλιν, καὶ τὰ τοῦ λόγου ὁμολογήματα σκοπεῖν ἐν αὐτῇ, εἰ αὐτὴ μάλιστ' ἔχει εἴτε καὶ ἄλλη τις μᾶλλον.	"It's time," I said, "for us to return to our own city and look there for the conclusions of our argument, to see whether it has them most of all, or some other city has them more."
	οὐκοῦν χρή, ἔφη.	"Yes, we should," he said.
	τί οὖν; ἔστι μέν που καὶ ἐν ταῖς ἄλλαις πόλεσιν ἄρχοντές τε καὶ δῆμος, ἔστι δὲ καὶ ἐν ταύτῃ;	"Well then: in other cities there are rulers and people, and in this one too?"
	ἔστι.	"There are."
463a	πολίτας μὲν δὴ πάντες οὗτοι ἀλλήλους προσεροῦσι;	"And all of these will call one another citizens?"
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	ἀλλὰ πρὸς τῷ πολίτας τί ὁ ἐν ταῖς ἄλλαις δῆμος τοὺς ἄρχοντας προσαγορεύει;	"But besides 'citizens,' what do the people in other cities call their rulers?"
	ἐν μὲν ταῖς πολλαῖς δεσπότας, ἐν δὲ ταῖς δημοκρατουμέναις αὐτὸ τοὔνομα τοῦτο, ἄρχοντας.	"In most, masters; in democracies, just this very name, rulers."
	τί δ' ὁ ἐν τῇ ἡμετέρᾳ δῆμος; πρὸς τῷ πολίτας τί τοὺς ἄρχοντάς φησιν εἶναι;	"And what about the people in our city? Besides 'citizens,' what do they say their rulers are?"
463b	σωτῆράς τε καὶ ἐπικούρους, ἔφη.	"Saviors and auxiliaries," he said.
	τί δ' οὗτοι τὸν δῆμον;	"And what do these call the people?"
	μισθοδότας τε καὶ τροφέας.	"Paymasters and providers."
	οἱ δ' ἐν ταῖς ἄλλαις ἄρχοντες τοὺς δήμους;	"And what do the rulers in other cities call their peoples?"
	δούλους, ἔφη.	"Slaves," he said.
	τί δ' οἱ ἄρχοντες ἀλλήλους;	"And what do the rulers call one another?"
463b	συνάρχοντας, ἔφη.	"Fellow rulers," he said.
	τί δ' οἱ ἡμέτεροι;	"And ours?"
	συμφύλακας.	"Fellow guardians."
	ἔχεις οὖν εἰπεῖν τῶν ἀρχόντων τῶν ἐν ταῖς ἄλλαις πόλεσιν, εἴ τίς τινα ἔχει προσειπεῖν τῶν συναρχόντων τὸν μὲν ὡς οἰκεῖον, τὸν δ' ὡς ἀλλότριον;	"Can you tell me whether any of the rulers in other cities can address one of his fellow rulers as one of his own and another as an outsider?"
	καὶ πολλούς γε.	"Yes, many can."
	οὐκοῦν τὸν μὲν οἰκεῖον ὡς ἑαυτοῦ νομίζει τε καὶ λέγει,	"And he regards and speaks of the one who is his own as belonging to him,
463c	τὸν δ' ἀλλότριον ὡς οὐχ ἑαυτοῦ;	and of the outsider as not belonging to him?"
	οὕτω.	"Yes."
	τί δὲ οἱ παρὰ σοὶ φύλακες; ἔσθ' ὅστις αὐτῶν ἔχοι ἂν τῶν συμφυλάκων νομίσαι τινὰ ἢ προσειπεῖν ὡς ἀλλότριον;	"And what about your guardians? Could any of them regard or address any of his fellow guardians as an outsider?"

	GREEK	ENGLISH
463c	οὐδαμῶς, ἔφη· παντὶ γὰρ ᾧ ἂν ἐντυγχάνῃ, ἢ ὡς ἀδελφῷ ἢ ὡς ἀδελφῇ ἢ ὡς πατρὶ ἢ ὡς μητρὶ ἢ ὑεῖ ἢ θυγατρὶ ἢ τούτων ἐκγόνοις ἢ προγόνοις νομιεῖ ἐντυγχάνειν.	"Not at all," he said. "Whomever he meets, he'll think he's meeting a brother or a sister, a father or a mother, a son or a daughter, or their descendants or ancestors."
	κάλλιστα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λέγεις, ἀλλ' ἔτι καὶ τόδε εἰπέ· πότερον αὐτοῖς τὰ ὀνόματα μόνον οἰκεῖα νομοθετήσεις, ἢ 463d καὶ τὰς πράξεις πάσας κατὰ τὰ ὀνόματα πράττειν, περί τε τοὺς πατέρας, ὅσα νόμος περὶ πατέρας αἰδοῦς τε πέρι καὶ κηδεμονίας καὶ τοῦ ὑπήκοον δεῖν εἶναι τῶν γονέων, ἢ μήτε πρὸς θεῶν μήτε πρὸς ἀνθρώπων αὐτῷ ἄμεινον ἔσεσθαι, ὡς οὔτε ὅσια οὔτε δίκαια πράττοντος ἄν, εἰ ἄλλα πράττοι ἢ ταῦτα; αὗταί σοι ἢ ἄλλαι φῆμαι ἐξ ἁπάντων τῶν πολιτῶν ὑμνήσουσιν εὐθὺς περὶ τὰ τῶν παίδων ὦτα καὶ περὶ πατέρων, οὓς ἂν αὐτοῖς τις ἀποφήνῃ, καὶ περὶ τῶν ἄλλων συγγενῶν; 463e	"Very well put," I said. "But tell me this too. Will you legislate for them only the family names, or 463d also that they're to act in all things in keeping with the names? Toward their fathers, for instance, doing all that the law prescribes about fathers—respect, care, and the duty to obey one's parents—or else it won't go well for him with gods or with men, since he'd be acting neither piously nor justly if he did otherwise? Will these be the sayings that all the citizens chant in the children's ears from the start—about their fathers, whoever is pointed out to them as such, and about their other relatives—or will they be others?" 463e
463e	αὗται, ἔφη· γελοῖον γὰρ ἂν εἴη εἰ ἄνευ ἔργων οἰκεῖα ὀνόματα διὰ τῶν στομάτων μόνον φθέγγοιντο.	"These," he said. "It would be ridiculous for them just to mouth the names of kinship without the deeds."
	πασῶν ἄρα πόλεων μάλιστα ἐν αὐτῇ συμφωνήσουσιν ἑνός τινος ἢ εὖ ἢ κακῶς πράττοντος ὃ νυνδὴ ἐλέγομεν τὸ ῥῆμα, τὸ ὅτι τὸ ἐμὸν εὖ πράττει ἢ ὅτι τὸ ἐμὸν κακῶς.	"So of all cities, it's in this one that, when any one person is doing well or badly, they'll most of all say in unison the phrase we mentioned just now: 'mine is doing well,' or 'mine is doing badly.'"
	ἀληθέστατα αὖ, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Very true, again," he said.
	οὐκοῦν μετὰ τούτου τοῦ δόγματός τε καὶ ῥήματος ἔφαμεν συνακολουθεῖν τάς τε ἡδονὰς καὶ τὰς λύπας κοινῇ;	"And didn't we say that along with this belief and this way of speaking there follows a sharing of pleasures and pains?"
	καὶ ὀρθῶς γε ἔφαμεν.	"And we were right to say so."
464a	οὐκοῦν μάλιστα τοῦ αὐτοῦ κοινωνήσουσιν ἡμῖν οἱ πολῖται, ὃ δὴ ἐμὸν ὀνομάσουσιν; τούτου δὲ κοινωνοῦντες οὕτω δὴ λύπης τε καὶ ἡδονῆς μάλιστα κοινωνίαν ἕξουσιν;	"So our citizens will share most fully in one and the same thing, which they'll call 'mine'; and sharing in that, they'll have the fullest sharing of pain and pleasure?"
	πολύ γε.	"By far."
	ἆρ' οὖν τούτων αἰτία πρὸς τῇ ἄλλῃ καταστάσει ἡ τῶν γυναικῶν τε καὶ παίδων κοινωνία τοῖς φύλαξιν;	"And the cause of this, besides the rest of our arrangements, is the sharing of women and children among the guardians?"
	πολὺ μὲν οὖν μάλιστα, ἔφη. 464b	"Far more than anything else," he said. 464b
	ἀλλὰ μὴν μέγιστόν γε πόλει αὐτὸ ὡμολογήσαμεν ἀγαθόν, ἀπεικάζοντες εὖ οἰκουμένην πόλιν σώματι πρὸς μέρος αὐτοῦ λύπης τε πέρι καὶ ἡδονῆς ὡς ἔχει.	"But we agreed that this was the greatest good for a city, when we likened a well-governed city to a body and the way it relates to a part of itself in pain and pleasure."
	καὶ ὀρθῶς γ', ἔφη, ὡμολογήσαμεν.	"And we were right to agree," he said.
464b		

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τοῦ μεγίστου ἄρα ἀγαθοῦ τῇ πόλει αἰτία ἡμῖν πέφανται ἡ κοινωνία τοῖς ἐπικούροις τῶν τε παίδων καὶ τῶν γυναικῶν.	"So the sharing of children and women among the auxiliaries has turned out to be the cause of the greatest good for the city."
	καὶ μάλ', ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
	καὶ μὲν δὴ καὶ τοῖς πρόσθεν γε ὁμολογοῦμεν· ἔφαμεν γάρ που οὔτε οἰκίας τούτοις ἰδίας δεῖν εἶναι οὔτε γῆν οὔτε 464c τι κτῆμα, ἀλλὰ παρὰ τῶν ἄλλων τροφὴν λαμβάνοντας, μισθὸν τῆς φυλακῆς, κοινῇ πάντας ἀναλίσκειν, εἰ μέλλοιεν ὄντως φύλακες εἶναι.	"And it's consistent with what we said before, too. We said, I think, that they mustn't have private houses, or land, or 464c any possessions, but must receive their sustenance from the others as wages for their guarding and all spend it in common, if they were to be real guardians."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.	"Right," he said.
464c	ἆρ' οὖν οὐχ, ὅπερ λέγω, τά τε πρόσθεν εἰρημένα καὶ τὰ νῦν λεγόμενα ἔτι μᾶλλον ἀπεργάζεται αὐτοὺς ἀληθινοὺς φύλακας, καὶ ποιεῖ μὴ διασπᾶν τὴν πόλιν τὸ ἐμὸν ὀνομάζοντας μὴ τὸ αὐτὸ ἀλλ' ἄλλον ἄλλο, τὸν μὲν εἰς τὴν ἑαυτοῦ οἰκίαν ἕλκοντα ὅτι ἂν δύνηται χωρὶς τῶν ἄλλων κτήσασθαι, 464d τὸν δὲ εἰς τὴν ἑαυτοῦ ἑτέραν οὖσαν, καὶ γυναῖκά τε καὶ παῖδας ἑτέρους, ἡδονάς τε καὶ ἀλγηδόνας ἐμποιοῦντας ἰδίων ὄντων ἰδίας, ἀλλ' ἑνὶ δόγματι τοῦ οἰκείου πέρι ἐπὶ τὸ αὐτὸ τείνοντας πάντας εἰς τὸ δυνατὸν ὁμοπαθεῖς λύπης τε καὶ ἡδονῆς εἶναι;	"Then, as I say, don't both what was said before and what's being said now make them still more genuine guardians? Don't they keep them from tearing the city apart by applying 'mine' not to the same thing but each to something different—one man dragging into his own house whatever he can acquire apart from the others, 464d another into his own separate house, with a separate wife and children, creating private pleasures and pains for things that are private? Won't they instead share one belief about what is their own, all straining toward the same end, and be as far as possible alike in what they feel of pain and pleasure?"
464d	κομιδῇ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Exactly," he said.
	τί δέ; δίκαι τε καὶ ἐγκλήματα πρὸς ἀλλήλους οὐκ οἰχήσεται ἐξ αὐτῶν ὡς ἔπος εἰπεῖν διὰ τὸ μηδὲν ἴδιον ἐκτῆσθαι πλὴν τὸ σῶμα, τὰ δ' ἄλλα κοινά; ὅθεν δὴ ὑπάρχει 464e τούτοις ἀστασιάστοις εἶναι, ὅσα γε διὰ χρημάτων ἢ παίδων καὶ συγγενῶν κτῆσιν ἄνθρωποι στασιάζουσιν;	"And what about lawsuits and accusations against one another? Won't they all but vanish from among them, since they own nothing private except their bodies, and everything else is shared? And so won't 464e they be free of all the factional strife that people fall into over the possession of money, or children and relatives?"
	πολλὴ ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, ἀπηλλάχθαι.	"They're bound to be rid of it," he said.
	καὶ μὴν οὐδὲ βιαίων γε οὐδ' αἰκίας δίκαι δικαίως ἂν εἶεν ἐν αὐτοῖς· ἥλιξι μὲν γὰρ ἥλικας ἀμύνεσθαι καλὸν καὶ δίκαιόν που φήσομεν, ἀνάγκην σωμάτων ἐπιμελείᾳ τιθέντες.	"Nor would there rightly be any suits for violence or assault among them. For we'll say it's fine and just for people to defend themselves against others of their own age, and we'll make the care of their bodies compulsory."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.	"Right," he said.
465a	καὶ γὰρ τόδε ὀρθὸν ἔχει, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὗτος ὁ νόμος· εἴ πού τίς τῳ θυμοῖτο, ἐν τῷ τοιούτῳ πληρῶν τὸν θυμὸν ἧττον ἐπὶ μείζους ἂν ἴοι στάσεις.	"And this law has another merit," I said. "If someone gets angry with someone else, by venting his anger in this way he'd be less likely to go on to more serious conflicts."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
	πρεσβυτέρῳ μὴν νεωτέρων πάντων ἄρχειν τε καὶ κολάζειν προστετάξεται.	"And an older person will be charged with ruling and disciplining all the younger ones."
	δῆλον.	

GREEK

ENGLISH

"Clearly."

καὶ μὴν ὅτι γε νεώτερος πρεσβύτερον, ἂν μὴ ἄρχοντες προστάττωσιν, οὔτε ἄλλο βιάζεσθαι ἐπιχειρήσει ποτὲ οὔτε τύπτειν, ὡς τὸ εἰκός. οἶμαι δ' οὐδὲ ἄλλως ἀτιμάσει· ἱκανὼ γὰρ τὼ φύλακε κωλύοντε, δέος τε καὶ αἰδώς, αἰδὼς μὲν ὡς 465b γονέων μὴ ἅπτεσθαι εἴργουσα, δέος δὲ τὸ τῷ πάσχοντι τοὺς ἄλλους βοηθεῖν, τοὺς μὲν ὡς ὑεῖς, τοὺς δὲ ὡς ἀδελφούς, τοὺς δὲ ὡς πατέρας.

συμβαίνει γὰρ οὕτως, ἔφη.

πανταχῇ δὴ ἐκ τῶν νόμων εἰρήνην πρὸς ἀλλήλους οἱ ἄνδρες ἄξουσι;

πολλήν γε.

"And it's likely that a younger person will never try to use violence on an older one or strike him, unless the rulers order it. Nor, I think, will he dishonor him in any other way; for there are two guardians enough to stop him, fear and shame: shame 465b forbidding him to lay hands on those who may be his parents, and fear that the others will come to the victim's aid, some as sons, some as brothers, some as fathers."

"That's how it works out," he said.

"So in every way the men will keep peace with one another as a result of the laws?"

"A great deal of peace."

465b τούτων μὴν ἐν ἑαυτοῖς μὴ στασιαζόντων οὐδὲν δεινὸν μή ποτε ἡ ἄλλη πόλις πρὸς τούτους ἢ πρὸς ἀλλήλους διχοστατήσῃ.

οὐ γὰρ οὖν.

"And if these men don't quarrel among themselves, there's no fear that the rest of the city will ever split into factions against them or against one another."

"No, there isn't."

τά γε μὴν σμικρότατα τῶν κακῶν δι' ἀπρέπειαν ὀκνῶ 465c καὶ λέγειν, ὧν ἀπηλλαγμένοι ἂν εἶεν, κολακείας τε πλουσίων πένητες ἀπορίας τε καὶ ἀλγηδόνας ὅσας ἐν παιδοτροφίᾳ καὶ χρηματισμοῖς διὰ τροφὴν οἰκετῶν ἀναγκαίαν ἴσχουσι, τὰ μὲν δανειζόμενοι, τὰ δ' ἐξαρνούμενοι, τὰ δὲ πάντως πορισάμενοι θέμενοι παρὰ γυναῖκάς τε καὶ οἰκέτας, ταμιεύειν παραδόντες, ὅσα τε, ὦ φίλε, περὶ αὐτὰ καὶ οἷα πάσχουσι, δῆλά τε δὴ καὶ ἀγεννῆ καὶ οὐκ ἄξια λέγειν. 465d

δῆλα γάρ, ἔφη, καὶ τυφλῷ.

"As for the pettiest of the evils they'd be rid of, I hesitate 465c even to mention them, they're so unseemly: the poor flattering the rich; all the perplexities and pains people have in raising children and in making money for the necessary upkeep of their households—borrowing here, refusing to pay there, scraping it together somehow and handing it over to their wives and servants to manage. All the things, my friend, that they suffer over these matters, and what sort of things they are, are obvious, mean-spirited, and not worth talking about." 465d

"Obvious even to a blind man," he said.

465d πάντων τε δὴ τούτων ἀπαλλάξονται, ζήσουσί τε τοῦ μακαριστοῦ βίου ὃν οἱ Ὀλυμπιονῖκαι ζῶσι μακαριώτερον.

πῇ;

διὰ σμικρόν που μέρος εὐδαιμονίζονται ἐκεῖνοι ὧν τούτοις ὑπάρχει. ἥ τε γὰρ τῶνδε νίκη καλλίων, ἥ τ' ἐκ τοῦ δημοσίου τροφὴ τελεωτέρα. νίκην τε γὰρ νικῶσι συμπάσης τῆς πόλεως σωτηρίαν, τροφῇ τε καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις πᾶσιν ὅσων βίος δεῖται αὐτοί τε καὶ παῖδες ἀναδοῦνται, καὶ γέρα δέχονται 465e παρὰ τῆς αὐτῶν πόλεως ζῶντές τε καὶ τελευτήσαντες ταφῆς ἀξίας μετέχουσιν.

καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, καλά.

"They'll be rid of all these things, and they'll live a life more blessed than the most blessed life that Olympic victors live."

"How?"

"Those victors are counted happy for only a small part of what these men have. Our guardians' victory is finer, and their maintenance at public expense is more complete. The victory they win is the preservation of the whole city, and they and their children are crowned with sustenance and everything else life needs; they receive honors 465e from their own city while they live, and when they die they're given a worthy burial."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"Very fine things," he said.[8]
465e	μέμνησαι οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι ἐν τοῖς πρόσθεν οὐκ οἶδα ὅτου λόγος ἡμῖν ἐπέπληξεν ὅτι τοὺς φύλακας οὐκ εὐδαίμονας [466a] ποιοῖμεν, οἷς ἐξὸν πάντα ἔχειν τὰ τῶν πολιτῶν οὐδὲν ἔχοιεν; ἡμεῖς δέ που εἴπομεν ὅτι τοῦτο μέν, εἴ που παραπίπτοι, εἰς αὖθις σκεψοίμεθα, νῦν δὲ τοὺς μὲν φύλακας φύλακας ποιοῖμεν, τὴν δὲ πόλιν ὡς οἵοί τ' εἶμεν εὐδαιμονεστάτην, ἀλλ' οὐκ εἰς ἓν ἔθνος ἀποβλέποντες ἐν αὐτῇ τοῦτο εὔδαιμον πλάττοιμεν;	"Do you remember, then," I said, "that earlier someone's argument—I forget whose—reproached us for not making the guardians happy, [466a] since, though they could have all the citizens' possessions, they would have nothing? And we said, I think, that we'd look into this later if the occasion arose, but that for now we were making our guardians guardians, and the city as happy as we could, and weren't fashioning it with an eye to one group in it and making that group happy?"
	μέμνημαι, ἔφη.	"I remember," he said.
466a	τί οὖν; νῦν ἡμῖν ὁ τῶν ἐπικούρων βίος, εἴπερ τοῦ γε τῶν Ὀλυμπιονικῶν πολύ τε καλλίων καὶ ἀμείνων φαίνεται, [466b] μή πῃ κατὰ τὸν τῶν σκυτοτόμων φαίνεται βίον ἤ τινων ἄλλων δημιουργῶν ἢ τὸν τῶν γεωργῶν;	"Well then, now that the life of our auxiliaries appears far finer and better than that of Olympic victors, [466b] does it look at all comparable to the life of shoemakers, or of any other craftsmen, or of farmers?"
	οὔ μοι δοκεῖ, ἔφη.	"I don't think so," he said.
466b	ἀλλὰ μέντοι, ὅ γε καὶ ἐκεῖ ἔλεγον, δίκαιον καὶ ἐνταῦθα εἰπεῖν, ὅτι εἰ οὕτως ὁ φύλαξ ἐπιχειρήσει εὐδαίμων γίγνεσθαι, ὥστε μηδὲ φύλαξ εἶναι, μηδ' ἀρκέσει αὐτῷ βίος οὕτω μέτριος καὶ βέβαιος καὶ ὡς ἡμεῖς φαμεν ἄριστος, ἀλλ' ἀνόητός τε καὶ μειρακιώδης δόξα ἐμπεσοῦσα εὐδαιμονίας πέρι ὀρμήσει [466c] αὐτὸν διὰ δύναμιν ἐπὶ τὸ ἅπαντα τὰ ἐν τῇ πόλει οἰκειοῦσθαι, γνώσεται τὸν Ἡσίοδον ὅτι τῷ ὄντι ἦν σοφὸς λέγων πλέον εἶναί πως ἥμισυ παντός.	"Still, what I said there it's right to say here as well. If the guardian tries to become happy in such a way that he's no longer even a guardian, and a life so moderate, so secure, and—as we claim—the best isn't enough for him, but a foolish, adolescent opinion about happiness takes hold of him and drives [466c] him to use his power to make everything in the city his own, he'll find out that Hesiod was truly wise when he said that half is somehow more than the whole."
	ἐμοὶ μέν, ἔφη, συμβούλῳ χρώμενος μενεῖ ἐπὶ τούτῳ τῷ βίῳ.	"If he takes my advice," he said, "he'll stay with this life."[9]
466c	συγχωρεῖς ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὴν τῶν γυναικῶν κοινωνίαν τοῖς ἀνδράσιν, ἣν διεληλύθαμεν, παιδείας τε πέρι καὶ παίδων καὶ φυλακῆς τῶν ἄλλων πολιτῶν, κατά τε πόλιν μενούσας εἰς πόλεμόν τε ἰούσας καὶ συμφυλάττειν δεῖν καὶ [466d] συνθηρεύειν ὥσπερ κύνας, καὶ πάντα πάντῃ κατὰ τὸ δυνατὸν κοινωνεῖν, καὶ ταῦτα πραττούσας τά τε βέλτιστα πράξειν καὶ οὐ παρὰ φύσιν τὴν τοῦ θήλεος πρὸς τὸ ἄρρεν, ᾗ πεφύκατον πρὸς ἀλλήλω κοινωνεῖν;	"Then do you agree," I said, "to the partnership of the women with the men that we've described—in education, in children, and in guarding the other citizens? That whether they stay in the city or go to war, they must guard together and [466d] hunt together like dogs, and share in everything in every way as far as possible; and that in doing this they'll be doing what's best, and nothing contrary to the nature of female in relation to male, by which the two are naturally made to share with each other?"
	συγχωρῶ, ἔφη.	"I agree," he said.

8 Olympic victors were honored in their home cities, in Athens with free meals at public expense for life.
9 Hesiod, *Works and Days* 40.

THE GUARDIANS AT WAR

Socrates describes how the guardians' children learn war and how Greeks should treat other Greeks.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
466d	**SOCRATES** οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐκεῖνο λοιπὸν διελέσθαι, εἰ ἄρα καὶ ἐν ἀνθρώποις δυνατόν, ὥσπερ ἐν ἄλλοις ζῴοις, ταύτην τὴν κοινωνίαν ἐγγενέσθαι, καὶ ὅπῃ δυνατόν;	**SOCRATES** "Then what remains," I said, "is to determine whether it's really possible for this partnership to arise among human beings, as it does among other animals, and in what way it's possible?"
	ἔφθης, ἔφη, εἰπὼν ᾗ ἔμελλον ὑπολήψεσθαι. [466e]	"You got in ahead of me," he said, "with just what I was going to take up." [466e]
	περὶ μὲν γὰρ τῶν ἐν τῷ πολέμῳ οἶμαι, ἔφην, δῆλον ὃν τρόπον πολεμήσουσιν.	"As for war," I said, "I think it's clear how they'll fight."
	πῶς; ἦ δ' ὅς.	"How?" he said.
	ὅτι κοινῇ στρατεύσονται, καὶ πρός γε ἄξουσι τῶν παίδων εἰς τὸν πόλεμον ὅσοι ἀδροί, ἵν' ὥσπερ οἱ τῶν ἄλλων δημιουργῶν θεῶνται ταῦτα ἃ τελεωθέντας δεήσει δημιουργεῖν·	"They'll campaign together, and they'll also take any of their children who are sturdy enough along to the war, so that, like the children of other craftsmen, they can watch the work they'll have to do themselves when they're grown;
467a	πρὸς δὲ τῇ θέᾳ διακονεῖν καὶ ὑπηρετεῖν πάντα τὰ περὶ τὸν πόλεμον, καὶ θεραπεύειν πατέρας τε καὶ μητέρας. ἢ οὐκ ᾔσθησαι τὰ περὶ τὰς τέχνας, οἷον τοὺς τῶν κεραμέων παῖδας, ὡς πολὺν χρόνον διακονοῦντες θεωροῦσι πρὶν ἅπτεσθαι τοῦ κεραμεύειν;	and, besides watching, they'll assist and wait on them in everything to do with the war, and look after their fathers and mothers. Or haven't you noticed how it goes in the crafts—how the sons of potters, for instance, spend a long time as helpers, watching, before they put their own hands to the potting?"
	καὶ μάλα.	"Very much so."
	ἦ οὖν ἐκείνοις ἐπιμελέστερον παιδευτέον ἢ τοῖς φύλαξι τοὺς αὐτῶν ἐμπειρίᾳ τε καὶ θέᾳ τῶν προσηκόντων;	"Then should potters take more care to train their sons, through experience and by watching what's appropriate, than the guardians take with theirs?"
	καταγέλαστον μεντἄν, ἔφη, εἴη.	"That would be absurd," he said.
	ἀλλὰ μὴν καὶ μαχεῖταί γε πᾶν ζῷον διαφερόντως [467b] παρόντων ὧν ἂν τέκῃ.	"And besides, every animal fights exceptionally hard [467b] when its offspring are present."
467b	ἔστιν οὕτω. κίνδυνος δέ, ὦ Σώκρατες, οὐ σμικρὸς σφαλεῖσιν, οἷα δὴ ἐν πολέμῳ φιλεῖ, πρὸς ἑαυτοῖς παῖδας ἀπολέσαντας ποιῆσαι καὶ τὴν ἄλλην πόλιν ἀδύνατον ἀναλαβεῖν.	"That's so. But the risk, Socrates, is no small one. If they suffer a defeat, as tends to happen in war, they lose their children as well as themselves, and make it impossible for the rest of the city to recover."
	ἀληθῆ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λέγεις. ἀλλὰ σὺ πρῶτον μὲν ἡγῇ παρασκευαστέον τὸ μή ποτε κινδυνεῦσαι;	"What you say is true," I said. "But do you think the first thing to provide for is that they never run any risk at all?"
	οὐδαμῶς.	"Not at all."
	τί δ'; εἴ που κινδυνευτέον, οὐκ ἐν ᾧ βελτίους ἔσονται κατορθοῦντες;	"Well then, if they must take a risk somewhere, shouldn't it be where success will make them better?"
	δῆλον δή. [467c]	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἀλλὰ σμικρὸν οἴει διαφέρειν καὶ οὐκ ἄξιον κινδύνου θεωρεῖν ἢ μὴ τὰ περὶ τὸν πόλεμον παῖδας τοὺς ἄνδρας πολεμικοὺς ἐσομένους;	"Obviously." 467c
	οὔκ, ἀλλὰ διαφέρει πρὸς ὃ λέγεις.	"And do you think it makes little difference, and isn't worth a risk, whether or not children who are to become men of war get to watch what war involves?"
		"No, it does make a difference, for the purpose you mention."
467c	τοῦτο μὲν ἄρα ὑπαρκτέον, θεωροὺς πολέμου τοὺς παῖδας ποιεῖν, προσμηχανᾶσθαι δ' αὐτοῖς ἀσφάλειαν, καὶ καλῶς ἕξει· ἦ γάρ;	"So we must start from this, making the children spectators of war, and devise some safety for them as well, and all will be well. Isn't that so?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πρῶτον μὲν αὐτῶν οἱ πατέρες, ὅσα ἄνθρωποι, οὐκ ἀμαθεῖς ἔσονται ἀλλὰ γνωμονικοὶ τῶν 467d στρατειῶν ὅσαι τε καὶ μὴ ἐπικίνδυνοι;	"Now in the first place," I said, "their fathers won't be ignorant, so far as human beings can know, but will be good judges of which 467d campaigns are dangerous and which aren't?"
	εἰκός, ἔφη.	"Probably," he said.
	εἰς μὲν ἄρα τὰς ἄξουσιν, εἰς δὲ τὰς εὐλαβήσονται.	"So they'll take them on some and be careful to avoid others."
	ὀρθῶς.	"Right."
	καὶ ἄρχοντάς γέ που, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐ τοὺς φαυλοτάτους αὐτοῖς ἐπιστήσουσιν ἀλλὰ τοὺς ἐμπειρίᾳ τε καὶ ἡλικίᾳ ἱκανοὺς ἡγεμόνας τε καὶ παιδαγωγοὺς εἶναι.	"And I suppose," I said, "they won't put the worst men in charge of them, but those whose experience and age qualify them to be leaders and tutors."
	πρέπει γάρ.	"Yes, that's fitting."
467d	ἀλλὰ γάρ, φήσομεν, καὶ παρὰ δόξαν πολλὰ πολλοῖς δὴ ἐγένετο.	"But of course, we'll say, many unexpected things have happened to many people."
	καὶ μάλα.	"Very much so."
	πρὸς τοίνυν τὰ τοιαῦτα, ὦ φίλε, πτεροῦν χρὴ παιδία ὄντα εὐθύς, ἵν', ἄν τι δέῃ, πετόμενοι ἀποφεύγωσιν. 467e	"To meet that sort of thing, then, my friend, we must give them wings while they're still small children, so that if need be they can fly off and escape." 467e
	πῶς λέγεις; ἔφη.	"What do you mean?" he said.
	ἐπὶ τοὺς ἵππους, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀναβιβαστέον ὡς νεωτάτους, καὶ διδαξαμένους ἱππεύειν ἐφ' ἵππων ἀκτέον ἐπὶ τὴν θέαν, μὴ θυμοειδῶν μηδὲ μαχητικῶν, ἀλλ' ὅτι ποδωκεστάτων καὶ εὐηνιωτάτων. οὕτω γὰρ κάλλιστά τε θεάσονται τὸ αὑτῶν ἔργον, καὶ ἀσφαλέστατα, ἄν τι δέῃ, σωθήσονται μετὰ πρεσβυτέρων ἡγεμόνων ἑπόμενοι.	"We must put them on horseback as young as possible," I said, "and once they've learned to ride, take them on horseback to watch—not on spirited, combative horses, but on the swiftest and most obedient to the rein. That way they'll get the best view of their own work, and, if need be, they'll make the safest escape, following their older leaders."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη, μοι δοκεῖς λέγειν.	"I think you're right," he said.
468a	τί δὲ δή, εἶπον, τὰ περὶ τὸν πόλεμον; πῶς ἑκτέον σοι τοὺς στρατιώτας πρὸς αὑτούς τε καὶ τοὺς πολεμίους; ἆρ' ὀρθῶς μοι καταφαίνεται ἢ οὔ;	"And what about the conduct of war?" I said. "How should your soldiers behave toward one another

GREEK	ENGLISH
λέγ', ἔφη, ποῖ αὖ.	and toward the enemy? Am I seeing this rightly or not?"
αὐτῶν μέν, εἶπον, τὸν λιπόντα τάξιν ἢ ὅπλα ἀποβαλόντα ἤ τι τῶν τοιούτων ποιήσαντα διὰ κάκην ἆρα οὐ δημιουργόν τινα δεῖ καθιστάναι ἢ γεωργόν;	"Tell me," he said, "what you have in mind this time."
πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Among themselves," I said, "anyone who deserts his post, or throws away his arms, or does anything of the kind out of cowardice—shouldn't he be made into some kind of craftsman or a farmer?"
τὸν δὲ ζῶντα εἰς τοὺς πολεμίους ἁλόντα ἆρ' οὐ δωρεὰν διδόναι τοῖς ἑλοῦσι χρῆσθαι τῇ ἄγρᾳ ὅτι ἂν βούλωνται; 468b	"Certainly."
κομιδῇ γε.	"And anyone taken alive by the enemy—shouldn't we make a present of him to his captors, to use their catch however they like?" 468b
	"Absolutely."
468b τὸν δὲ ἀριστεύσαντά τε καὶ εὐδοκιμήσαντα οὐ πρῶτον μὲν ἐπὶ στρατιᾶς ὑπὸ τῶν συστρατευομένων μειρακίων τε καὶ παίδων ἐν μέρει ὑπὸ ἑκάστου δοκεῖ σοι χρῆναι στεφανωθῆναι; ἢ οὔ;	"And the man who distinguishes himself and wins a name for bravery—don't you think that first of all, while still on campaign, he should be crowned by each of the youths and boys serving with him, one after another? Or not?"
ἔμοιγε.	"I do."
τί δέ; δεξιωθῆναι;	"And what about having them clasp his right hand?"
καὶ τοῦτο.	"That too."
ἀλλὰ τόδ' οἶμαι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐκέτι σοι δοκεῖ.	"But this next thing, I suspect," I said, "you won't go along with."
τὸ ποῖον;	"What's that?"
τὸ φιλῆσαί τε καὶ φιληθῆναι ὑπὸ ἑκάστου.	"That he should kiss and be kissed by each of them."
πάντων, ἔφη, μάλιστα· καὶ προστίθημί γε τῷ νόμῳ, 468c ἕως ἂν ἐπὶ ταύτης ὦσι τῆς στρατιᾶς, καὶ μηδενὶ ἐξεῖναι ἀπαρνηθῆναι ὃν ἂν βούληται φιλεῖν, ἵνα καί, ἐάν τίς του τύχῃ ἐρῶν ἢ ἄρρενος ἢ θηλείας, προθυμότερος ᾖ πρὸς τὸ τἀριστεῖα φέρειν.	"Most of all," he said. "And I'd add to the law that, 468c as long as they're on that campaign, no one he wants to kiss should be allowed to refuse, so that if anyone happens to be in love with someone, male or female, he'll be all the keener to win the prize for valor."
καλῶς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. ὅτι μὲν γὰρ ἀγαθῷ ὄντι γάμοι τε ἕτοιμοι πλείους ἢ τοῖς ἄλλοις καὶ αἱρέσεις τῶν τοιούτων πολλάκις παρὰ τοὺς ἄλλους ἔσονται, ἵν' ὅτι πλεῖστοι ἐκ τοῦ τοιούτου γίγνωνται, εἴρηται ἤδη.	"Good," I said. "We've already said that a good man will have more marriages open to him than the others, and will be chosen more often than the others for such things, so that as many children as possible are born from someone like him."
εἴπομεν γάρ, ἔφη.	"Yes, we said so," he said.
468c ἀλλὰ μὴν καὶ καθ' Ὅμηρον τοῖς τοιοῖσδε δίκαιον τιμᾶν 468d τῶν νέων ὅσοι ἀγαθοί. καὶ γὰρ Ὅμηρος τὸν εὐδοκιμήσαντα ἐν τῷ πολέμῳ νώτοισιν Αἴαντα ἔφη διηνεκέεσσι γεραίρεσθαι, ὡς ταύτην οἰκείαν οὖσαν τιμὴν τῷ ἡβῶντί τε καὶ ἀνδρείῳ, ἐξ ἧς ἅμα τῷ τιμᾶσθαι καὶ τὴν ἰσχὺν αὐξήσει.	"What's more, according to Homer too, it's right to honor 468d the good among the young in ways like these. Homer says that Ajax, after he'd distinguished himself in battle, was 'honored with the long cuts of the chine,' since this was the honor proper to a brave man in his prime, one that

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ὀρθότατα, ἔφη.	would build up his strength at the same time as it honored him." "Quite right," he said.[10]
468d	πεισόμεθα ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ταῦτά γε Ὁμήρῳ. καὶ γὰρ ἡμεῖς ἔν τε θυσίαις καὶ τοῖς τοιούτοις πᾶσι τοὺς ἀγαθούς, καθ' ὅσον ἂν ἀγαθοὶ φαίνωνται, καὶ ὕμνοις καὶ οἷς νυνδὴ ἐλέγομεν τιμήσομεν, πρὸς δὲ τούτοις ἕδραις τε καὶ κρέασιν [468e] ἰδὲ πλείοις δεπάεσσιν, ἵνα ἅμα τῷ τιμᾶν ἀσκῶμεν τοὺς ἀγαθοὺς ἄνδρας τε καὶ γυναῖκας. κάλλιστα, ἔφη, λέγεις. εἶεν· τῶν δὲ δὴ ἀποθανόντων ἐπὶ στρατιᾶς ὃς ἂν εὐδοκιμήσας τελευτήσῃ ἆρ' οὐ πρῶτον μὲν φήσομεν τοῦ χρυσοῦ γένους εἶναι; πάντων γε μάλιστα.	"Then in this, at least," I said, "we'll follow Homer. At sacrifices and on all such occasions we too will honor the good, to the extent that they show themselves good, with hymns and with the things we just mentioned, and besides these with 'seats of honor, and meat, [468e] and cups brimming full,' so that as we honor good men and women we also train them." "Excellent," he said. "Very well. And of those who die on campaign, whoever dies having distinguished himself—won't we say first of all that he belongs to the golden race?" "Absolutely."
468e	ἀλλ' οὐ πεισόμεθα Ἡσιόδῳ, ἐπειδάν τινες τοῦ τοιούτου γένους τελευτήσωσιν, ὡς ἄρα— [469a] οἱ μὲν δαίμονες ἁγνοὶ ἐπιχθόνιοι τελέθουσιν, ἐσθλοί, ἀλεξίκακοι, φύλακες μερόπων ἀνθρώπων; πεισόμεθα μὲν οὖν. διαπυθόμενοι ἄρα τοῦ θεοῦ πῶς χρὴ τοὺς δαιμονίους τε καὶ θείους τιθέναι καὶ τίνι διαφόρῳ, οὕτω καὶ ταύτῃ θήσομεν ᾗ ἂν ἐξηγῆται; τί δ' οὐ μέλλομεν;	"And won't we believe Hesiod, that when any of this race die, [469a] 'they become holy spirits dwelling on earth, noble, warders-off of evil, guardians of mortal men'?" "Yes, we'll believe him." "Then we'll ask the god how we should lay to rest such spirit-like and godlike people, and with what distinction, and do it in whatever way he directs?" "Of course we will."[11]
469a	καὶ τὸν λοιπὸν δὴ χρόνον ὡς δαιμόνων, οὕτω θεραπεύσομέν [469b] τε καὶ προσκυνήσομεν αὐτῶν τὰς θήκας; ταὐτὰ δὲ ταῦτα νομιοῦμεν ὅταν τις γήρᾳ ἢ τινι ἄλλῳ τρόπῳ τελευτήσῃ τῶν ὅσοι ἂν διαφερόντως ἐν τῷ βίῳ ἀγαθοὶ κριθῶσιν; δίκαιον γοῦν, ἔφη. τί δέ; πρὸς τοὺς πολεμίους πῶς ποιήσουσιν ἡμῖν οἱ στρατιῶται; τὸ ποῖον δή; πρῶτον μὲν ἀνδραποδισμοῦ πέρι, δοκεῖ δίκαιον Ἕλληνας Ἑλληνίδας πόλεις ἀνδραποδίζεσθαι, ἢ μηδ' ἄλλῃ ἐπιτρέπειν κατὰ τὸ δυνατὸν καὶ τοῦτο ἐθίζειν, τοῦ Ἑλληνικοῦ [469c] γένους φείδεσθαι, εὐλαβουμένους τὴν ὑπὸ τῶν βαρβάρων δουλείαν;	"And for all time afterward we'll tend their tombs as the tombs of spirits, [469b] and pay them reverence? And we'll observe these same customs when anyone dies of old age or in any other way, among those judged exceptionally good in their lives?" "That's only just," he said. "Next: how will our soldiers deal with the enemy?" "In what respect?" "First, as to enslavement: does it seem right for Greeks to enslave Greek cities? Or should they, as far as they can, not allow any other city to do it either, and make it their custom to spare the Greek [469c] people, on guard against enslavement by non-Greeks?"
469c	ὅλῳ καὶ παντί, ἔφη, διαφέρει τὸ φείδεσθαι.	"Sparing them makes all the difference in the world," he said.

10 In *Iliad* 7, after Ajax's duel with Hector, Agamemnon rewards him with the choicest cut of the sacrificed ox.
11 Hesiod, *Works and Days* 122–123, describing what became of the golden race, the first and best generation of humankind.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	μηδὲ Ἕλληνα ἄρα δοῦλον ἐκτῆσθαι μήτε αὐτούς, τοῖς τε ἄλλοις Ἕλλησιν οὕτω συμβουλεύειν;	"Then they won't themselves own a Greek slave, and they'll advise the other Greeks to do the same?"
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη· μᾶλλόν γ' ἂν οὖν οὕτω πρὸς τοὺς βαρβάρους τρέποιντο, ἑαυτῶν δ' ἀπέχοιντο.	"Certainly," he said. "That way they'd be more inclined to turn against the non-Greeks and keep their hands off one another."
	τί δέ; σκυλεύειν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοὺς τελευτήσαντας πλὴν ὅπλων, ἐπειδὰν νικήσωσιν, ἦ καλῶς ἔχει; ἢ οὐ πρόφασιν	"And what about stripping the dead of anything but their arms," I said, "once they've won—is that a good practice? Doesn't it give cowards an excuse
469d	μὲν τοῖς δειλοῖς ἔχει μὴ πρὸς τὸν μαχόμενον ἰέναι, ὥς τι τῶν δεόντων δρῶντας ὅταν περὶ τὸν τεθνεῶτα κυπτάζωσι, πολλὰ δὲ ἤδη στρατόπεδα διὰ τὴν τοιαύτην ἁρπαγὴν ἀπώλετο;	469d not to go after the man who's still fighting, as though they were doing their duty by poking about over a corpse? Many armies have been lost before now through that kind of plundering."
	καὶ μάλα.	"Very much so."
469d	ἀνελεύθερον δὲ οὐ δοκεῖ καὶ φιλοχρήματον νεκρὸν συλᾶν, καὶ γυναικείας τε καὶ σμικρᾶς διανοίας τὸ πολέμιον νομίζειν τὸ σῶμα τοῦ τεθνεῶτος ἀποπταμένου τοῦ ἐχθροῦ, λελοιπότος δὲ ᾧ ἐπολέμει; ἢ οἴει τι διάφορον δρᾶν τοὺς τοῦτο 469e ποιοῦντας τῶν κυνῶν, αἳ τοῖς λίθοις οἷς ἂν βληθῶσι χαλεπαίνουσι, τοῦ βάλλοντος οὐχ ἁπτόμεναι;	"And don't you think it's greedy and unworthy of a free man to rob a corpse, and the mark of a small, womanish mind to treat the dead man's body as the enemy, when the enemy has flown off and left behind only what he fought with? Or do you think people who do this 469e behave any differently from dogs that snap at the stones thrown at them but leave the thrower alone?"
	οὐδὲ σμικρόν, ἔφη.	"Not a bit differently," he said.
	ἐατέον ἄρα τὰς νεκροσυλίας καὶ τὰς τῶν ἀναιρέσεων διακωλύσεις;	"Then we must give up robbing corpses and preventing the enemy from taking up their dead?"
	ἐατέον μέντοι, ἔφη, νὴ Δία.	"We certainly must, by Zeus," he said.
469e	οὐδὲ μήν που πρὸς τὰ ἱερὰ τὰ ὅπλα οἴσομεν ὡς ἀναθήσοντες, ἄλλως τε καὶ τὰ τῶν Ἑλλήνων, ἐάν τι ἡμῖν μέλῃ 470a τῆς πρὸς τοὺς ἄλλους Ἕλληνας εὐνοίας· μᾶλλον δὲ καὶ φοβησόμεθα μή τι μίασμα ᾖ πρὸς ἱερὸν τὰ τοιαῦτα ἀπὸ τῶν οἰκείων φέρειν, ἐὰν μή τι δὴ ὁ θεὸς ἄλλο λέγῃ.	"Nor, I take it, will we carry weapons to the temples to dedicate them, especially Greek ones, if we care at all 470a about the goodwill of the other Greeks. Rather, we'll be afraid that bringing such things from our own kin to a temple may be a pollution—unless, that is, the god says otherwise."
	ὀρθότατα, ἔφη.	"Quite right," he said.
	τί δὲ γῆς τε τμήσεως τῆς Ἑλληνικῆς καὶ οἰκιῶν ἐμπρήσεως; ποῖόν τί σοι δράσουσιν οἱ στρατιῶται πρὸς τοὺς πολεμίους;	"And what about laying waste Greek land and burning houses? What will your soldiers do to the enemy?"
	σοῦ, ἔφη, δόξαν ἀποφαινομένου ἡδέως ἂν ἀκούσαιμι.	"I'd be glad to hear your opinion," he said.
470a	ἐμοὶ μὲν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δοκεῖ τούτων μηδέτερα ποιεῖν, 470b ἀλλὰ τὸν ἐπέτειον καρπὸν ἀφαιρεῖσθαι. καὶ ὧν ἕνεκα, βούλει σοι λέγω;	"Well, in my view," I said, "they should do neither, 470b but should carry off the year's harvest. Do you want me to tell you why?"
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
	φαίνεταί μοι, ὥσπερ καὶ ὀνομάζεται δύο ταῦτα ὀνόματα, πόλεμός τε καὶ στάσις, οὕτω καὶ εἶναι δύο, ὄντα ἐπὶ δυοῖν τινοιν διαφοραῖν. λέγω δὲ τὰ δύο τὸ μὲν οἰκεῖον καὶ συγγενές, τὸ δὲ ἀλλότριον καὶ ὀθνεῖον. ἐπὶ μὲν οὖν τῇ τοῦ	"It seems to me that just as there are two names, war and civil strife, so there are two things, answering to two kinds of discord. By the two I mean what is one's own and akin, on the one hand, and

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	οἰκείου ἔχθρᾳ στάσις κέκληται, ἐπὶ δὲ τῇ τοῦ ἀλλοτρίου πόλεμος.	what is alien and foreign, on the other. Hostility with one's own is called civil strife; hostility with the alien, war."
	καὶ οὐδέν γε, ἔφη, ἀπὸ τρόπου λέγεις. 470c	"There's nothing off the mark in that," he said. 470c
470c	ὅρα δὴ καὶ εἰ τόδε πρὸς τρόπου λέγω. φημὶ γὰρ τὸ μὲν Ἑλληνικὸν γένος αὐτὸ αὑτῷ οἰκεῖον εἶναι καὶ συγγενές, τῷ δὲ βαρβαρικῷ ὀθνεῖόν τε καὶ ἀλλότριον.	"Now see whether this is on the mark, too. I say that the Greek people is its own and akin to itself, but foreign and alien to the non-Greek."
	καλῶς γε, ἔφη.	"Well put," he said.
	Ἕλληνας μὲν ἄρα βαρβάροις καὶ βαρβάρους Ἕλλησι πολεμεῖν μαχομένους τε φήσομεν καὶ πολεμίους φύσει εἶναι, καὶ πόλεμον τὴν ἔχθραν ταύτην κλητέον· Ἕλληνας δὲ Ἕλλησιν, ὅταν τι τοιοῦτον δρῶσιν, φύσει μὲν φίλους εἶναι, νοσεῖν δ' ἐν τῷ τοιούτῳ τὴν Ἑλλάδα καὶ στασιάζειν, 470d καὶ στάσιν τὴν τοιαύτην ἔχθραν κλητέον.	"So when Greeks fight non-Greeks, and non-Greeks Greeks, we'll say they're at war and are enemies by nature, and this hostility must be called war. But when Greeks do anything of the kind to Greeks, we'll say they're friends by nature, but that in such a case Greece is sick and divided against itself, 470d and this kind of hostility must be called civil strife."
	ἐγὼ μέν, ἔφη, συγχωρῶ οὕτω νομίζειν.	"I agree to think of it that way," he said.
470d	σκόπει δή, εἶπον, ὅτι ἐν τῇ νῦν ὁμολογουμένῃ στάσει, ὅπου ἄν τι τοιοῦτον γένηται καὶ διαστῇ πόλις, ἐὰν ἑκάτεροι ἑκατέρων τέμνωσιν ἀγροὺς καὶ οἰκίας ἐμπιμπρῶσιν, ὡς ἀλιτηριώδης τε δοκεῖ ἡ στάσις εἶναι καὶ οὐδέτεροι αὐτῶν φιλοπόλιδες—οὐ γὰρ ἄν ποτε ἐτόλμων τὴν τροφόν τε καὶ μητέρα κείρειν—ἀλλὰ μέτριον εἶναι τοὺς καρποὺς ἀφαιρεῖσθαι 470e τοῖς κρατοῦσι τῶν κρατουμένων, καὶ διανοεῖσθαι ὡς διαλλαγησομένων καὶ οὐκ ἀεὶ πολεμησόντων.	"Now consider," I said, "that in what's now agreed to be civil strife, wherever something like this happens and a city is split, if each side ravages the other's fields and burns their houses, the strife is thought to be accursed and neither side to love its city—otherwise they'd never dare to ravage their nurse and mother. What's thought reasonable is for the victors to carry off the crops 470e of the vanquished, and to keep in mind that they'll be reconciled and won't be at war forever."
	πολὺ γάρ, ἔφη, ἡμερωτέρων αὕτη ἡ διάνοια ἐκείνης.	"Yes," he said, "that way of thinking belongs to far more civilized people than the other."
	τί δὲ δή; ἔφην· ἣν σὺ πόλιν οἰκίζεις, οὐχ Ἑλληνὶς ἔσται;	"Well then," I said, "the city you're founding—won't it be Greek?"
	δεῖ γ' αὐτήν, ἔφη.	"It must be," he said.
470e	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἀγαθοί τε καὶ ἥμεροι ἔσονται;	"Then won't its people be good and civilized?"
	σφόδρα γε.	"Very much so."
	ἀλλ' οὐ φιλέλληνες; οὐδὲ οἰκείαν τὴν Ἑλλάδα ἡγήσονται, οὐδὲ κοινωνήσουσιν ὧνπερ οἱ ἄλλοι ἱερῶν;	"And won't they love their fellow Greeks? Won't they regard Greece as their own, and share in the same religious rites as the other Greeks?"
	καὶ σφόδρα γε.	"Very much so."
	οὐκοῦν τὴν πρὸς τοὺς Ἕλληνας διαφοράν, ὡς οἰκείους, στάσιν ἡγήσονται καὶ οὐδὲ ὀνομάσουσιν πόλεμον;	"Then won't they regard a quarrel with Greeks, since they're their own kin, as civil strife, and not even call it war?"
	οὐ γάρ.	"Right."
	καὶ ὡς διαλλαγησόμενοι ἄρα διοίσονται;	"And they'll quarrel as people who will one day be reconciled?"
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	
	εὐμενῶς δὴ σωφρονιοῦσιν, οὐκ ἐπὶ δουλείᾳ κολάζοντες οὐδ' ἐπ' ὀλέθρῳ, σωφρονισταὶ ὄντες, οὐ πολέμιοι.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	οὕτως, ἔφη.	"Certainly."
		"Then they'll bring the others to their senses in a kindly way, not punishing them with slavery or destruction, since they're correctors, not enemies."
		"Just so," he said.
471a	οὐδ' ἄρα τὴν Ἑλλάδα Ἕλληνες ὄντες κεροῦσιν, οὐδὲ οἰκήσεις ἐμπρήσουσιν, οὐδὲ ὁμολογήσουσιν ἐν ἑκάστῃ πόλει πάντας ἐχθροὺς αὐτοῖς εἶναι, καὶ ἄνδρας καὶ γυναῖκας καὶ παῖδας, ἀλλ' ὀλίγους ἀεὶ ἐχθροὺς τοὺς αἰτίους τῆς διαφορᾶς. 471b καὶ διὰ ταῦτα πάντα οὔτε τὴν γῆν ἐθελήσουσιν κείρειν αὐτῶν, ὡς φίλων τῶν πολλῶν, οὔτε οἰκίας ἀνατρέπειν, ἀλλὰ μέχρι τούτου ποιήσονται τὴν διαφοράν, μέχρι οὗ ἂν οἱ αἴτιοι ἀναγκασθῶσιν ὑπὸ τῶν ἀναιτίων ἀλγούντων δοῦναι δίκην.	"Being Greeks, then, they won't ravage Greece or burn homes, and they won't agree that everyone in each city is their enemy—men, women, and children—but that their enemies are always just the few who are to blame for the quarrel. 471b And for all these reasons they won't be willing to ravage these people's land, since most of them are friends, or to tear down their houses; they'll carry the quarrel only so far as it takes for the guilty to be compelled by the innocent, who are suffering, to pay the penalty."
471b	ἐγὼ μέν, ἔφη, ὁμολογῶ οὕτω δεῖν πρὸς τοὺς ἐναντίους τοὺς ἡμετέρους πολίτας προσφέρεσθαι· πρὸς δὲ τοὺς βαρβάρους, ὡς νῦν οἱ Ἕλληνες πρὸς ἀλλήλους.	"I agree," he said, "that this is how our citizens should treat their opponents, and that they should treat the non-Greeks the way Greeks now treat one another."
	τιθῶμεν δὴ καὶ τοῦτον τὸν νόμον τοῖς φύλαξι, μήτε γῆν 471c τέμνειν μήτε οἰκίας ἐμπιμπράναι;	"Shall we lay down this law too for the guardians, then: not to ravage land 471c or burn houses?"
	θῶμεν, ἔφη, καὶ ἔχειν γε καλῶς ταῦτά τε καὶ τὰ πρόσθεν.	"Let's lay it down," he said, "and say that this and what came before are good."
471c	ἀλλὰ γάρ μοι δοκεῖς, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἐάν τίς σοι τὰ τοιαῦτα ἐπιτρέπῃ λέγειν, οὐδέποτε μνησθήσεσθαι ὃ ἐν τῷ πρόσθεν παρωσάμενος πάντα ταῦτα εἴρηκας, τὸ ὡς δυνατὴ αὕτη ἡ πολιτεία γενέσθαι καὶ τίνα τρόπον ποτὲ δυνατή· ἐπεὶ ὅτι γε, εἰ γένοιτο, πάντ' ἂν εἴη ἀγαθὰ πόλει ᾗ γένοιτο, καὶ ἃ σὺ παραλείπεις ἐγὼ λέγω, ὅτι καὶ τοῖς πολεμίοις 471d ἄριστ' ἂν μάχοιντο τῷ ἥκιστα ἀπολείπειν ἀλλήλους, γιγνώσκοντές τε καὶ ἀνακαλοῦντες ταῦτα τὰ ὀνόματα ἑαυτούς, ἀδελφούς, πατέρας, υἱεῖς· εἰ δὲ καὶ τὸ θῆλυ συστρατεύοιτο, εἴτε καὶ ἐν τῇ αὐτῇ τάξει εἴτε καὶ ὄπισθεν ἐπιτεταγμένον, φόβων τε ἕνεκα τοῖς ἐχθροῖς καὶ εἴ ποτέ τις ἀνάγκη βοηθείας γένοιτο, οἶδ' ὅτι ταύτῃ πάντῃ ἄμαχοι ἂν εἶεν· καὶ οἴκοι γε ἃ παραλείπεται ἀγαθά, ὅσα ἂν εἴη αὐτοῖς, ὁρῶ.	"But really, Socrates, I think that if someone lets you talk about things like this, you'll never get around to what you pushed aside earlier before saying all this: whether this constitution can come into being, and how it could ever possibly do so. I grant that if it did come about, everything would be good for the city where it did, and I'll even add what you leave out: they'd fight their enemies 471d best, because they'd be least likely to desert one another, since they'd know one another and call one another by these names—brothers, fathers, sons. And if the women joined the campaign too, whether in the same ranks or posted in the rear, to frighten the enemy or in case help were ever needed, I know that this would make them altogether invincible. And I can see all the good things at home that are being left out, all the good things they would have.
471e	ἀλλ' ὡς ἐμοῦ ὁμολογοῦντος πάντα ταῦτα ὅτι εἴη ἂν καὶ ἄλλα γε μυρία, εἰ γένοιτο ἡ πολιτεία αὕτη, μηκέτι πλείω περὶ αὐτῆς λέγε, ἀλλὰ τοῦτο αὐτὸ ἤδη πειρώμεθα ἡμᾶς	"But take it that I grant all this—that these things and countless others would be theirs, if this constitution came into being—and say no more about

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	αὐτοὺς πείθειν, ὡς δυνατὸν καὶ ᾗ δυνατόν, τὰ δ' ἄλλα χαίρειν ἐῶμεν.	it. Let's now try to convince ourselves of just this: that it's possible, and how it's possible. The rest we can let go."

THE THIRD WAVE: PHILOSOPHER-KINGS

Socrates says cities will not be well governed until philosophers rule, and defines the philosopher.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
472a	**SOCRATES** ἐξαίφνης γε σύ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὥσπερ καταδρομὴν ἐποιήσω ἐπὶ τὸν λόγον μου, καὶ οὐ συγγιγνώσκεις στραγγευομένῳ. ἴσως γὰρ οὐκ οἶσθα ὅτι μόγις μοι τὼ δύο κύματε ἐκφυγόντι νῦν τὸ μέγιστον καὶ χαλεπώτατον τῆς τρικυμίας ἐπάγεις, ὃ ἐπειδὰν ἴδῃς τε καὶ ἀκούσῃς, πάνυ συγγνώμην ἕξεις, ὅτι εἰκότως ἄρα ὤκνουν τε καὶ ἐδεδοίκη οὕτω παράδοξον λόγον λέγειν τε καὶ ἐπιχειρεῖν διασκοπεῖν.	**SOCRATES** "That's quite a sudden raid you've made on my argument," I said, "and you've no sympathy for my dawdling. Perhaps you don't realize that I've barely escaped two waves, and now you're bringing on the biggest and most difficult one, the third. When you see and hear it, you'll surely forgive me, and see that I had good reason to hesitate and be afraid to state so paradoxical an idea and try to examine it."
	ὅσῳ ἄν, ἔφη, τοιαῦτα πλείω λέγῃς, ἧττον ἀφεθήσῃ [472b] ὑφ' ἡμῶν πρὸς τὸ μὴ εἰπεῖν πῇ δυνατὴ γίγνεσθαι αὕτη ἡ πολιτεία. ἀλλὰ λέγε καὶ μὴ διάτριβε.	"The more you talk like this," he said, "the less we'll let you off [472b] from telling us how this constitution can come into being. So speak, and don't waste time."[12]
472b	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πρῶτον μὲν τόδε χρὴ ἀναμνησθῆναι, ὅτι ἡμεῖς ζητοῦντες δικαιοσύνην οἷόν ἐστι καὶ ἀδικίαν δεῦρο ἥκομεν.	"Well then," I said, "first we must remember that we got here by looking for what justice is like, and injustice."
	χρή· ἀλλὰ τί τοῦτο; ἔφη.	"We must. But what of it?" he said.
	οὐδέν· ἀλλ' ἐὰν εὕρωμεν οἷόν ἐστι δικαιοσύνη, ἆρα καὶ ἄνδρα τὸν δίκαιον ἀξιώσομεν μηδὲν δεῖν αὐτῆς ἐκείνης διαφέρειν, ἀλλὰ πανταχῇ τοιοῦτον εἶναι οἷον δικαιοσύνη [472c] ἐστίν; ἢ ἀγαπήσομεν ἐὰν ὅτι ἐγγύτατα αὐτῆς ᾖ καὶ πλεῖστα τῶν ἄλλων ἐκείνης μετέχῃ;	"Nothing. But if we find what justice is like, will we also insist that the just man must not differ from it in any way, but be in every respect such as justice [472c] is? Or will we be content if he comes as close to it as possible and has a greater share in it than anyone else?"
	οὕτως, ἔφη· ἀγαπήσομεν.	"That's it," he said. "We'll be content."
472c	παραδείγματος ἄρα ἕνεκα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐζητοῦμεν αὐτό τε δικαιοσύνην οἷόν ἐστι, καὶ ἄνδρα τὸν τελέως δίκαιον εἰ γένοιτο, καὶ οἷος ἂν εἴη γενόμενος, καὶ ἀδικίαν αὖ καὶ τὸν ἀδικώτατον, ἵνα εἰς ἐκείνους ἀποβλέποντες, οἷοι ἂν ἡμῖν φαίνωνται εὐδαιμονίας τε πέρι καὶ τοῦ ἐναντίου, ἀναγκαζώμεθα καὶ περὶ ἡμῶν αὐτῶν ὁμολογεῖν, ὃς ἂν ἐκείνοις ὅτι [472d] ὁμοιότατος ᾖ, τὴν ἐκείνης μοῖραν ὁμοιοτάτην ἕξειν, ἀλλ' οὐ τούτου ἕνεκα, ἵν' ἀποδείξωμεν ὡς δυνατὰ ταῦτα γίγνεσθαι.	"It was for the sake of a model, then," I said, "that we were looking for what justice itself is like, and for what the perfectly just man would be like, if he existed; and likewise for injustice and the most unjust man. We wanted to look at them, at how they appear to us in point of happiness and its opposite, so that we'd be compelled to agree about ourselves as well: that whoever is most [472d] like them will have a lot most like theirs. It wasn't in order to prove that these things could come into being."
	τοῦτο μέν, ἔφη, ἀληθὲς λέγεις.	"That's true," he said.

12 The first two "waves" were the proposals that women share the guardians' work and that the guardians hold wives and children in common.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
472d	οἴει ἂν οὖν ἧττόν τι ἀγαθὸν ζωγράφον εἶναι ὃς ἂν γράψας παράδειγμα οἷον ἂν εἴη ὁ κάλλιστος ἄνθρωπος καὶ πάντα εἰς τὸ γράμμα ἱκανῶς ἀποδοὺς μὴ ἔχῃ ἀποδεῖξαι ὡς καὶ δυνατὸν γενέσθαι τοιοῦτον ἄνδρα;	"Do you think a painter would be any less good if he painted a model of what the most beautiful human being would be like, and rendered everything in the picture well, but couldn't prove that such a man could actually exist?"
	μὰ Δί' οὐκ ἔγωγ', ἔφη.	"By Zeus, I don't," he said.
	τί οὖν; οὐ καὶ ἡμεῖς, φαμέν, παράδειγμα ἐποιοῦμεν 472e λόγῳ ἀγαθῆς πόλεως;	"Well, weren't we too, as we say, making a model 472e of a good city in words?"
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
	ἧττόν τι οὖν οἴει ἡμᾶς εὖ λέγειν τούτου ἕνεκα, ἐὰν μὴ ἔχωμεν ἀποδεῖξαι ὡς δυνατὸν οὕτω πόλιν οἰκῆσαι ὡς ἐλέγετο;	"Then do you think what we said is any less good because we can't prove that it's possible to run a city as we described?"
	οὐ δῆτα, ἔφη.	"Of course not," he said.
472e	τὸ μὲν τοίνυν ἀληθές, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὕτω· εἰ δὲ δὴ καὶ τοῦτο προθυμηθῆναι δεῖ σὴν χάριν, ἀποδεῖξαι πῇ μάλιστα καὶ κατὰ τί δυνατώτατ' ἂν εἴη, πάλιν μοι πρὸς τὴν τοιαύτην ἀπόδειξιν τὰ αὐτὰ διομολόγησαι.	"That, then, is the truth of it," I said. "But if, to please you, I must also put my mind to proving how and in what respect it would be most possible, then for the purposes of that proof, agree with me on the same points again."
	τὰ ποῖα;	"Which ones?"
	ἆρ' οἷόν τέ τι πραχθῆναι ὡς λέγεται, ἢ φύσιν ἔχει πρᾶξιν λέξεως ἧττον ἀληθείας ἐφάπτεσθαι, κἂν εἰ μή τῳ δοκεῖ; ἀλλὰ σὺ πότερον ὁμολογεῖς οὕτως ἢ οὔ;	"Can anything be done as it's said? Or is it the nature of doing to have less hold on truth than saying does, even if some people don't think so? Do you agree with this or not?"
	ὁμολογῶ, ἔφη.	"I agree," he said.
473a	τοῦτο μὲν δὴ μὴ ἀνάγκαζέ με, οἷα τῷ λόγῳ διήλθομεν, τοιαῦτα παντάπασι καὶ τῷ ἔργῳ δεῖν γιγνόμενα ἂν ἀποφαίνειν· ἀλλ', ἐὰν οἷοί τε γενώμεθα εὑρεῖν ὡς ἂν ἐγγύτατα τῶν εἰρημένων πόλις οἰκήσειεν, φάναι ἡμᾶς 473b ἐξηυρηκέναι ὡς δυνατὰ ταῦτα γίγνεσθαι ἃ σὺ ἐπιτάττεις. ἢ οὐκ ἀγαπήσεις τούτων τυγχάνων; ἐγὼ μὲν γὰρ ἂν ἀγαπῴην.	"Then don't force me to show that what we described in words must come about in fact exactly as described. If we can manage to discover how a city could be run as nearly as possible in the way we've described, say that we've 473b discovered that the things you demand are possible. Or won't you be content to get that much? I would be."
	καὶ γὰρ ἐγώ, ἔφη.	"So would I," he said.
473b	τὸ δὲ δὴ μετὰ τοῦτο, ὡς ἔοικε, πειρώμεθα ζητεῖν τε καὶ ἀποδεικνύναι τί ποτε νῦν κακῶς ἐν ταῖς πόλεσι πράττεται δι' ὃ οὐχ οὕτως οἰκοῦνται, καὶ τίνος ἂν σμικροτάτου μεταβαλόντος ἔλθοι εἰς τοῦτον τὸν τρόπον τῆς πολιτείας πόλις, μάλιστα μὲν ἑνός, εἰ δὲ μή, δυοῖν, εἰ δὲ μή, ὅτι ὀλιγίστων τὸν ἀριθμὸν καὶ σμικροτάτων τὴν δύναμιν. 473c	"Next, it seems, we should try to seek out and show what is being done badly in cities now, which keeps them from being run this way, and what is the smallest change that would bring a city to this kind of constitution—preferably one change; if not, two; if not, as few in number and as slight in effect as possible." 473c
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
	ἑνὸς μὲν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μεταβαλόντος δοκοῦμέν μοι ἔχειν δεῖξαι ὅτι μεταπέσοι ἄν, οὐ μέντοι σμικροῦ γε οὐδὲ ῥᾳδίου, δυνατοῦ δέ.	"Well," I said, "I think we can show that with one change the city would be transformed—not a small or easy change, but a possible one."
	τίνος; ἔφη.	"What change?" he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
473c	ἐπ᾽ αὐτῷ δή, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, εἰμὶ ὃ τῷ μεγίστῳ προσῃκάζομεν κύματι. εἰρήσεται δ᾽ οὖν, εἰ καὶ μέλλει γέλωτί τε ἀτεχνῶς ὥσπερ κῦμα ἐκγελῶν καὶ ἀδοξίᾳ κατακλύσειν. σκόπει δὲ ὃ μέλλω λέγειν.	"I've now come," I said, "to the very thing we likened to the biggest wave. But it will be said all the same, even if it's going to drown me in ridicule and contempt, like a wave that quite literally bursts out laughing. Consider what I'm about to say."
	λέγε, ἔφη.	"Say it," he said.
	ἐὰν μή, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, ἢ οἱ φιλόσοφοι βασιλεύσωσιν ἐν 473d ταῖς πόλεσιν ἢ οἱ βασιλῆς τε νῦν λεγόμενοι καὶ δυνάσται φιλοσοφήσωσι γνησίως τε καὶ ἱκανῶς, καὶ τοῦτο εἰς ταὐτὸν συμπέσῃ, δύναμίς τε πολιτικὴ καὶ φιλοσοφία, τῶν δὲ νῦν πορευομένων χωρὶς ἑφ᾽ ἑκάτερον αἱ πολλαὶ φύσεις ἐξ ἀνάγκης ἀποκλεισθῶσιν, οὐκ ἔστι κακῶν παῦλα, ὦ φίλε Γλαύκων, ταῖς πόλεσι, δοκῶ δ᾽ οὐδὲ τῷ ἀνθρωπίνῳ γένει, 473e οὐδὲ αὕτη ἡ πολιτεία μή ποτε πρότερον φυῇ τε εἰς τὸ δυνατὸν καὶ φῶς ἡλίου ἴδῃ, ἣν νῦν λόγῳ διεληλύθαμεν. ἀλλὰ τοῦτό ἐστιν ὃ ἐμοὶ πάλαι ὄκνον ἐντίθησι λέγειν, ὁρῶντι ὡς πολὺ παρὰ δόξαν ῥηθήσεται· χαλεπὸν γὰρ ἰδεῖν ὅτι οὐκ ἂν ἄλλη τις εὐδαιμονήσειεν οὔτε ἰδίᾳ οὔτε δημοσίᾳ.	"Unless," I said, "either philosophers rule as kings in 473d cities, or those now called kings and potentates genuinely and adequately practice philosophy—unless political power and philosophy coincide, and the many natures that now pursue one apart from the other are forcibly barred from doing so—there is no end to evils, my dear Glaucon, for cities, nor, I think, for the human race. 473e Nor will this constitution we've now described in words ever before then grow to the extent possible and see the light of the sun. This is what has long made me hesitate to speak, seeing how very contrary to common opinion it would sound. For it's hard to see that no other city could be happy, either in private or in public life."
473e	καὶ ὅς, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, τοιοῦτον ἐκβέβληκας ῥῆμά τε καὶ λόγον, ὃν εἰπὼν ἡγοῦ ἐπὶ σὲ πάνυ πολλούς τε καὶ 474a οὐ φαύλους νῦν οὕτως, οἷον ῥίψαντας τὰ ἱμάτια, γυμνοὺς λαβόντας ὅτι ἑκάστῳ παρέτυχεν ὅπλον, θεῖν διατεταμένους ὡς θαυμάσια ἐργασομένους· οὓς εἰ μὴ ἀμυνῇ τῷ λόγῳ καὶ ἐκφεύξῃ, τῷ ὄντι τωθαζόμενος δώσεις δίκην.	And he said, "Socrates, what a word and argument you've let fly! Now that you've said it, you can expect a great many people, and 474a not negligible ones, to throw off their cloaks, so to speak, this very moment, and, stripped for action, grab whatever weapon comes to hand and charge at you full tilt, ready to do who knows what. If you don't fend them off with argument and escape, you'll really pay the price of being laughed to scorn."
	οὐκοῦν σύ μοι, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, τούτων αἴτιος;	"Well, aren't you the one to blame for this?" I said.
474a	καλῶς γ᾽, ἔφη, ἐγὼ ποιῶν. ἀλλά τοί σε οὐ προδώσω, ἀλλ᾽ ἀμυνῶ οἷς δύναμαι· δύναμαι δὲ εὐνοίᾳ τε καὶ τῷ παρακελεύεσθαι, καὶ ἴσως ἂν ἄλλου του ἐμμελέστερόν σοι 474b ἀποκρινοίμην. ἀλλ᾽ ὡς ἔχων τοιοῦτον βοηθὸν πειρῶ τοῖς ἀπιστοῦσιν ἐνδείξασθαι ὅτι ἔχει ᾗ σὺ λέγεις.	"And a good thing I did," he said. "But I won't betray you. I'll defend you with what I can, and what I can offer is goodwill and encouragement, and perhaps I'd give you more fitting answers 474b than someone else would. So, with a helper like that, try to show the unbelievers that things are as you say."
474b	πειρατέον, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, ἐπειδὴ καὶ σὺ οὕτω μεγάλην συμμαχίαν παρέχῃ. ἀναγκαῖον οὖν μοι δοκεῖ, εἰ μέλλομέν πῃ ἐκφεύξεσθαι οὓς λέγεις, διορίσασθαι πρὸς αὐτοὺς τοὺς φιλοσόφους τίνας λέγοντες τολμῶμεν φάναι δεῖν ἄρχειν, ἵνα διαδήλων γενομένων δύνηταί τις ἀμύνεσθαι, ἐνδεικνύμενος 474c ὅτι τοῖς μὲν προσήκει φύσει ἅπτεσθαί	"I must try," I said, "since you're offering such a mighty alliance. Now if we're going to escape the people you mention, I think we need to define for them whom we mean by the philosophers we dare to say must rule. That way, once they're clearly marked out, one can defend oneself by showing

GREEK

τε φιλοσοφίας ἡγεμονεύειν τ' ἐν πόλει, τοῖς δ' ἄλλοις μήτε ἅπτεσθαι ἀκολουθεῖν τε τῷ ἡγουμένῳ.

ὥρα ἂν εἴη, ἔφη, ὁρίζεσθαι.

ἴθι δή, ἀκολούθησόν μοι τῇδε, ἐὰν αὐτὸ ἁμῇ γέ πῃ ἱκανῶς ἐξηγησώμεθα.

ἄγε, ἔφη.

474c ἀναμιμνῄσκειν οὖν σε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δεήσει, ἢ μέμνησαι ὅτι ὂν ἄν φῶμεν φιλεῖν τι, δεῖ φανῆναι αὐτόν, ἐὰν ὀρθῶς λέγηται, οὐ τὸ μὲν φιλοῦντα ἐκείνου, τὸ δὲ μή, ἀλλὰ πᾶν στέργοντα; 474d

ἀναμιμνῄσκειν, ἔφη, ὡς ἔοικεν, δεῖ· οὐ γὰρ πάνυ γε ἐννοῶ.

474d ἄλλῳ, εἶπον, ἔπρεπεν, ὦ Γλαύκων, λέγειν ἃ λέγεις· ἀνδρὶ δ' ἐρωτικῷ οὐ πρέπει ἀμνημονεῖν ὅτι πάντες οἱ ἐν ὥρᾳ τὸν φιλόπαιδα καὶ ἐρωτικὸν ἁμῇ γέ πῃ δάκνουσί τε καὶ κινοῦσι, δοκοῦντες ἄξιοι εἶναι ἐπιμελείας τε καὶ τοῦ ἀσπάζεσθαι. ἢ οὐχ οὕτω ποιεῖτε πρὸς τοὺς καλούς; ὁ μέν, ὅτι σιμός, ἐπίχαρις κληθεὶς ἐπαινεθήσεται ὑφ' ὑμῶν, τοῦ δὲ τὸ γρυπὸν βασιλικόν φατε εἶναι, τὸν δὲ δὴ διὰ 474e μέσου τούτων ἐμμετρώτατα ἔχειν, μέλανας δὲ ἀνδρικοὺς ἰδεῖν, λευκοὺς δὲ θεῶν παῖδας εἶναι· μελιχλώρους δὲ καὶ τοὔνομα οἴει τινὸς ἄλλου ποίημα εἶναι ἢ ἐραστοῦ ὑποκοριζομένου τε καὶ εὐχερῶς φέροντος τὴν ὠχρότητα, ἐὰν ἐπὶ ὥρᾳ ᾖ;

474e καὶ ἑνὶ λόγῳ πάσας προφάσεις προφασίζεσθέ τε 475a καὶ πάσας φωνὰς ἀφίετε, ὥστε μηδένα ἀποβάλλειν τῶν ἀνθούντων ἐν ὥρᾳ.

εἰ βούλει, ἔφη, ἐπ' ἐμοῦ λέγειν περὶ τῶν ἐρωτικῶν ὅτι οὕτω ποιοῦσι, συγχωρῶ τοῦ λόγου χάριν.

τί δέ; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· τοὺς φιλοίνους οὐ τὰ αὐτὰ ταῦτα ποιοῦντας ὁρᾷς; πάντα οἶνον ἐπὶ πάσης προφάσεως ἀσπαζομένους;

καὶ μάλα.

475a καὶ μὴν φιλοτίμους γε, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, καθορᾷς ὅτι, ἂν μὴ στρατηγῆσαι δύνωνται, τριττυαρχοῦσιν, κἂν μὴ ὑπὸ μειζόνων 475b καὶ σεμνοτέρων τιμᾶσθαι, ὑπὸ σμικροτέρων καὶ φαυλοτέρων τιμώμενοι ἀγαπῶσιν, ὡς ὅλως τιμῆς ἐπιθυμηταὶ ὄντες.

ENGLISH

474c that some people are suited by nature to take up philosophy and to lead in a city, while the rest are suited to leave it alone and follow the leader."

"Now would be the time to define them," he said.

"Come on, then, follow me this way, and let's see if we can somehow explain it adequately."

"Lead on," he said.

"Will I need to remind you, then," I said, "or do you remember that when we say someone loves something, he must, if the phrase is used correctly, clearly not love one part of it and not another, but cherish all of it?" 474d

"It seems you'll need to remind me," he said. "I don't quite get it."

"Someone else might say what you're saying, Glaucon," I said, "but it doesn't suit a man given to love to forget that all boys in their bloom somehow sting and stir a man who loves boys and is given to love, since they seem worthy of his attention and his affection. Isn't that how you all behave toward the beautiful ones? One has a snub nose, and you'll praise him as 'charming'; another's hooked nose you call 'regal'; the one 474e in between, you say, is perfectly proportioned; the dark ones look manly, and the fair ones are 'children of the gods.' And 'honey-colored'—do you think that name is the creation of anyone but a lover who uses pet names and has no trouble with a sallow complexion, so long as it comes with the bloom of youth?"

"In short, you make every excuse 475a and use every expression so as not to reject any boy in the flower of youth."

"If you want to make me your example of what lovers do," he said, "I agree, for the sake of the argument."

"And what about wine lovers?" I said. "Don't you see them doing the very same thing, welcoming every wine on any pretext?"

"Very much so."

"And lovers of honor, I think, you can see: if they can't be generals, they command a company, and if they can't be honored by greater 475b and more distinguished people, they're content to be

GREEK

κομιδῇ μὲν οὖν.

τοῦτο δὴ φάθι ἢ μή· ἆρα ὃν ἄν τινος ἐπιθυμητικὸν λέγωμεν, παντὸς τοῦ εἴδους τούτου φήσομεν ἐπιθυμεῖν, ἢ τοῦ μέν, τοῦ δὲ οὔ;

παντός, ἔφη.

οὐκοῦν καὶ τὸν φιλόσοφον σοφίας φήσομεν ἐπιθυμητὴν εἶναι, οὐ τῆς μέν, τῆς δ' οὔ, ἀλλὰ πάσης;

ἀληθῆ.

475b τὸν ἄρα περὶ τὰ μαθήματα δυσχεραίνοντα, ἄλλως τε [475c] καὶ νέον ὄντα καὶ μήπω λόγον ἔχοντα τί τε χρηστὸν καὶ μή, οὐ φήσομεν φιλομαθῆ οὐδὲ φιλόσοφον εἶναι, ὥσπερ τὸν περὶ τὰ σιτία δυσχερῆ οὔτε πεινῆν φαμεν οὔτ' ἐπιθυμεῖν σιτίων, οὐδὲ φιλόσιτον ἀλλὰ κακόσιτον εἶναι.

καὶ ὀρθῶς γε φήσομεν.

τὸν δὲ δὴ εὐχερῶς ἐθέλοντα παντὸς μαθήματος γεύεσθαι καὶ ἀσμένως ἐπὶ τὸ μανθάνειν ἰόντα καὶ ἀπλήστως ἔχοντα, τοῦτον δ' ἐν δίκῃ φήσομεν φιλόσοφον· ἦ γάρ; [475d]

475d καὶ ὁ Γλαύκων ἔφη· πολλοὶ ἄρα καὶ ἄτοποι ἔσονταί σοι τοιοῦτοι. οἵ τε γὰρ φιλοθεάμονες πάντες ἔμοιγε δοκοῦσι τῷ καταμανθάνειν χαίροντες τοιοῦτοι εἶναι, οἵ τε φιλήκοοι ἀτοπώτατοί τινές εἰσιν ὥς γ' ἐν φιλοσόφοις τιθέναι, οἳ πρὸς μὲν λόγους καὶ τοιαύτην διατριβὴν ἑκόντες οὐκ ἂν ἐθέλοιεν ἐλθεῖν, ὥσπερ δὲ ἀπομεμισθωκότες τὰ ὦτα ἐπακοῦσαι πάντων χορῶν περιθέουσι τοῖς Διονυσίοις οὔτε τῶν κατὰ πόλεις οὔτε τῶν κατὰ κώμας ἀπολειπόμενοι. τούτους οὖν πάντας καὶ ἄλλους τοιούτων τινῶν [475e] μαθητικοὺς καὶ τοὺς τῶν τεχνυδρίων φιλοσόφους φήσομεν;

οὐδαμῶς, εἶπον, ἀλλ' ὁμοίους μὲν φιλοσόφοις.

475e τοὺς δὲ ἀληθινούς, ἔφη, τίνας λέγεις;

τοὺς τῆς ἀληθείας, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, φιλοθεάμονας.

καὶ τοῦτο μέν γ', ἔφη, ὀρθῶς· ἀλλὰ πῶς αὐτὸ λέγεις;

οὐδαμῶς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ῥᾳδίως πρός γε ἄλλον· σὲ δὲ οἶμαι ὁμολογήσειν μοι τὸ τοιόνδε.

ENGLISH

honored by lesser and meaner ones, since it's honor as a whole that they desire."

"Quite so."

"Then say yes or no to this. When we say someone desires something, will we say he desires the whole of that kind of thing, or one part and not another?"

"The whole," he said.

"Then we'll say the philosopher, too, desires wisdom—not one part and not another, but all of it?"

"True."

"Then someone who's fussy about what he studies, especially [475c] when he's young and has no way yet of telling what's useful and what isn't, we won't call a lover of learning or a philosopher—just as we say that someone fussy about his food isn't hungry and doesn't desire food, and isn't a lover of food but a poor eater."

"And we'll be right to say so."

"But the one who's readily willing to taste every kind of learning, who goes to his studies gladly and can't get enough—him we'll rightly call a philosopher, won't we?" [475d]

And Glaucon said, "Then you'll have many strange people of that sort. All the lovers of sights seem to me to be like that, because they enjoy learning things; and the lovers of sounds are a very strange lot to count among philosophers. They'd never willingly attend a discussion or spend time that way, but as if they'd hired out their ears to listen to every chorus, they run around at the Dionysia, never missing one, whether in the towns or in the villages. Are we going to call all these people, and others who learn such things, [475e] and the practitioners of the minor arts, philosophers?"

"Not at all," I said, "though they're like philosophers."[13]

"Then who are the true ones?" he said.

"Those who love the sight of truth," I said.

"That's right, too," he said. "But what do you mean by it?"

13 The Dionysia were festivals of Dionysus, held both in Athens and in the country villages, featuring choral and dramatic performances.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τὸ ποῖον; ἐπειδή ἐστιν ἐναντίον καλὸν αἰσχρῷ, δύο αὐτὼ εἶναι. πῶς δ' οὔ; οὐκοῦν ἐπειδὴ δύο, καὶ ἓν ἑκάτερον; καὶ τοῦτο.	"It wouldn't be at all easy to explain to someone else," I said, "but I think you'll agree with me on this." "On what?" "Since the beautiful is the opposite of the ugly, they're two." "Of course." "And since they're two, each is one?" "That too."

KNOWLEDGE AND OPINION

Socrates distinguishes knowledge of the forms from opinion about the many changing things.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
476a	**SOCRATES** καὶ περὶ δὴ δικαίου καὶ ἀδίκου καὶ ἀγαθοῦ καὶ κακοῦ καὶ πάντων τῶν εἰδῶν πέρι ὁ αὐτὸς λόγος, αὐτὸ μὲν ἓν ἕκαστον εἶναι, τῇ δὲ τῶν πράξεων καὶ σωμάτων καὶ ἀλλήλων κοινωνίᾳ πανταχοῦ φανταζόμενα πολλὰ φαίνεσθαι ἕκαστον. ὀρθῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις. ταύτῃ τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, διαιρῶ, χωρὶς μὲν οὓς νυνδὴ ἔλεγες φιλοθεάμονάς τε καὶ φιλοτέχνους καὶ πρακτικούς, [476b] καὶ χωρὶς αὖ περὶ ὧν ὁ λόγος, οὓς μόνους ἄν τις ὀρθῶς προσείποι φιλοσόφους. πῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις;	**SOCRATES** "And the same account holds for just and unjust, good and bad, and all the forms: each is itself one, but because they show up everywhere in association with actions and bodies and one another, each appears to be many." "You're right," he said. "Well, this is where I draw the line," I said. "On one side I put those you were just talking about, the lovers of sights, the lovers of crafts, and the practical people; [476b] and on the other, the ones our argument is about, the only ones who could rightly be called philosophers." "What do you mean?" he said.
476b	οἱ μέν που, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, φιλήκοοι καὶ φιλοθεάμονες τάς τε καλὰς φωνὰς ἀσπάζονται καὶ χρόας καὶ σχήματα καὶ πάντα τὰ ἐκ τῶν τοιούτων δημιουργούμενα, αὐτοῦ δὲ τοῦ καλοῦ ἀδύνατος αὐτῶν ἡ διάνοια τὴν φύσιν ἰδεῖν τε καὶ ἀσπάσασθαι. ἔχει γὰρ οὖν δή, ἔφη, οὕτως. οἱ δὲ δὴ ἐπ' αὐτὸ τὸ καλὸν δυνατοὶ ἰέναι τε καὶ ὁρᾶν καθ' αὐτὸ ἆρα οὐ σπάνιοι ἂν εἶεν; [476c] καὶ μάλα.	"The lovers of sounds and sights, I suppose," I said, "delight in beautiful sounds and colors and shapes and everything made from such things, but their mind is incapable of seeing and delighting in the nature of the beautiful itself." "Yes, that's certainly how it is," he said. "And those who are able to approach the beautiful itself and see it by itself—wouldn't they be rare?" [476c] "Very much so."
476c	ὁ οὖν καλὰ μὲν πράγματα νομίζων, αὐτὸ δὲ κάλλος μήτε νομίζων μήτε, ἄν τις ἡγῆται ἐπὶ τὴν γνῶσιν αὐτοῦ, δυνάμενος ἕπεσθαι, ὄναρ ἢ ὕπαρ δοκεῖ σοι ζῆν; σκόπει δέ. τὸ ὀνειρώττειν ἆρα οὐ τόδε ἐστίν, ἐάντε ἐν ὕπνῳ τις ἐάντ' ἐγρηγορὼς τὸ ὅμοιόν τῳ μὴ ὅμοιον ἀλλ' αὐτὸ ἡγῆται εἶναι ᾧ ἔοικεν; ἐγὼ γοῦν ἄν, ἦ δ' ὅς, φαίην ὀνειρώττειν τὸν τοιοῦτον.	"So someone who believes in beautiful things but doesn't believe in beauty itself, and can't follow if someone leads him to knowledge of it—does he seem to you to be living in a dream or awake? Consider: isn't this what dreaming is, whether one is asleep or awake—taking something that is like something else to be not a likeness but the very thing it resembles?"

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"I'd certainly say," he said, "that such a person is dreaming."
	τί δέ; ὁ τἀναντία τούτων ἡγούμενός τέ τι αὐτὸ καλὸν [476d] καὶ δυνάμενος καθορᾶν καὶ αὐτὸ καὶ τὰ ἐκείνου μετέχοντα, καὶ οὔτε τὰ μετέχοντα αὐτὸ οὔτε αὐτὸ τὰ μετέχοντα ἡγούμενος, ὕπαρ ἢ ὄναρ αὖ καὶ οὗτος δοκεῖ σοι ζῆν;	"And what about the opposite case: someone who believes in something beautiful itself, [476d] and can discern both it and the things that participate in it, and takes neither the participants to be it nor it to be the participants—does he seem to you to be living awake or in a dream?"
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, ὕπαρ.	"Very much awake," he said.
	οὐκοῦν τούτου μὲν τὴν διάνοιαν ὡς γιγνώσκοντος γνώμην ἂν ὀρθῶς φαῖμεν εἶναι, τοῦ δὲ δόξαν ὡς δοξάζοντος;	"Then we'd be right to call this man's thought knowledge, since he knows, and the other's opinion, since he opines?"
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
476d	τί οὖν ἐὰν ἡμῖν χαλεπαίνῃ οὗτος, ὃν φαμεν δοξάζειν ἀλλ' οὐ γιγνώσκειν, καὶ ἀμφισβητῇ ὡς οὐκ ἀληθῆ λέγομεν; [476e] ἔξομέν τι παραμυθεῖσθαι αὐτὸν καὶ πείθειν ἠρέμα, ἐπικρυπτόμενοι ὅτι οὐχ ὑγιαίνει;	"What if this person, who we say opines but doesn't know, gets angry with us and disputes that what we say is true? [476e] Will we have some way to soothe him and gently persuade him, while hiding from him that he isn't quite sound?"
	δεῖ γέ τοι δή, ἔφη.	"We certainly must," he said.
	ἴθι δή, σκόπει τί ἐροῦμεν πρὸς αὐτόν. ἢ βούλει ὧδε πυνθανώμεθα παρ' αὐτοῦ, λέγοντες ὡς εἴ τι οἶδεν οὐδεὶς αὐτῷ φθόνος, ἀλλ' ἄσμενοι ἂν ἴδοιμεν εἰδότα τι. ἀλλ' ἡμῖν εἰπὲ τόδε· ὁ γιγνώσκων γιγνώσκει τὶ ἢ οὐδέν; σὺ οὖν μοι ὑπὲρ ἐκείνου ἀποκρίνου.	"Come on, then, consider what we'll say to him. Or would you like us to question him like this, telling him that if he knows something, nobody begrudges it—on the contrary, we'd be glad to see someone who knows something? 'But tell us this: does the one who knows know something or nothing?' You answer me on his behalf."
	ἀποκρινοῦμαι, ἔφη, ὅτι γιγνώσκει τί.	"I'll answer," he said, "that he knows something."
476e	πότερον ὂν ἢ οὐκ ὄν;	"Something that is, or something that is not?"
	ὄν· πῶς γὰρ ἂν μὴ ὄν γέ τι γνωσθείη;	"Something that is. How could something that is not be known?"
	ἱκανῶς οὖν τοῦτο ἔχομεν, κἂν εἰ πλεοναχῇ σκοποῖμεν, ὅτι τὸ μὲν παντελῶς ὂν παντελῶς γνωστόν, μὴ ὂν δὲ μηδαμῇ πάντῃ ἄγνωστον;	"So we're sure enough of this, even if we were to examine it from more angles: what completely is, is completely knowable, and what in no way is, is in every way unknowable?"
	ἱκανώτατα.	"Quite sure enough."
	εἶεν· εἰ δὲ δή τι οὕτως ἔχει ὡς εἶναί τε καὶ μὴ εἶναι, οὐ μεταξὺ ἂν κέοιτο τοῦ εἰλικρινῶς ὄντος καὶ τοῦ αὖ μηδαμῇ ὄντος;	"Very well. And if something were such as both to be and not to be, wouldn't it lie between what purely is and what in no way is?"
	μεταξύ.	"Between."
477a	οὐκοῦν ἐπὶ μὲν τῷ ὄντι γνῶσις ἦν, ἀγνωσία δ' ἐξ ἀνάγκης ἐπὶ μὴ ὄντι, ἐπὶ δὲ τῷ μεταξὺ τούτῳ μεταξύ τι καὶ ζητητέον [477b] ἀγνοίας τε καὶ ἐπιστήμης, εἴ τι τυγχάνει ὂν τοιοῦτον;	"Then since knowledge was set over what is, and ignorance of necessity over what is not, for what lies between we must also look for something between [477b] ignorance and knowledge, if there is such a thing?"
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἆρ’ οὖν λέγομέν τι δόξαν εἶναι;	“Certainly.”
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	“Now do we say that opinion is something?”
	πότερον ἄλλην δύναμιν ἐπιστήμης ἢ τὴν αὐτήν;	“Of course.”
	ἄλλην.	“A different power from knowledge, or the same?”
	ἐπ’ ἄλλῳ ἄρα τέτακται δόξα καὶ ἐπ’ ἄλλῳ ἐπιστήμη, κατὰ τὴν δύναμιν ἑκατέρα τὴν αὑτῆς.	“Different.”
	οὕτω.	“So opinion is set over one thing and knowledge over another, each according to its own power.”
		“Yes.”
477b	οὐκοῦν ἐπιστήμη μὲν ἐπὶ τῷ ὄντι πέφυκε, γνῶναι ὡς ἔστι τὸ ὄν; —μᾶλλον δὲ ὧδέ μοι δοκεῖ πρότερον ἀναγκαῖον εἶναι διελέσθαι.	“Now knowledge is naturally set over what is, to know what is as it is? But no—I think we first need to make a distinction.”
	πῶς; 477c	“What distinction?” 477c
	φήσομεν δυνάμεις εἶναι γένος τι τῶν ὄντων, αἷς δὴ καὶ ἡμεῖς δυνάμεθα ἃ δυνάμεθα καὶ ἄλλο πᾶν ὅτι περ ἂν δύνηται, οἷον λέγω ὄψιν καὶ ἀκοὴν τῶν δυνάμεων εἶναι, εἰ ἄρα μανθάνεις ὃ βούλομαι λέγειν τὸ εἶδος.	“We’ll say that powers are a class of the things that are, by which we can do what we can do, and by which anything else can do whatever it can. For example, I call sight and hearing powers, if you understand the kind of thing I mean.”
	ἀλλὰ μανθάνω, ἔφη.	“I understand,” he said.
477c	ἄκουσον δὴ ὅ μοι φαίνεται περὶ αὐτῶν. δυνάμεως γὰρ ἐγὼ οὔτε τινὰ χρόαν ὁρῶ οὔτε σχῆμα οὔτε τι τῶν τοιούτων οἷον καὶ ἄλλων πολλῶν, πρὸς ἃ ἀποβλέπων ἔνια διορίζομαι παρ’ ἐμαυτῷ τὰ μὲν ἄλλα εἶναι, τὰ δὲ ἄλλα· δυνάμεως 477d δ’ εἰς ἐκεῖνο μόνον βλέπω ἐφ’ ᾧ τε ἔστι καὶ ὃ ἀπεργάζεται, καὶ ταύτῃ ἑκάστην αὐτῶν δύναμιν ἐκάλεσα, καὶ τὴν μὲν ἐπὶ τῷ αὐτῷ τεταγμένην καὶ τὸ αὐτὸ ἀπεργαζομένην τὴν αὐτὴν καλῶ, τὴν δὲ ἐπὶ ἑτέρῳ καὶ ἕτερον ἀπεργαζομένην ἄλλην. τί δὲ σύ; πῶς ποιεῖς;	“Then hear how they strike me. In a power I don’t see any color or shape or anything of the sort, as I do in many other things, which I look at to distinguish, in my own mind, some things from others. In a power 477d I look only to what it’s set over and what it accomplishes, and that’s how I’ve come to call each of them a power: the one set over the same thing and accomplishing the same thing I call the same power, and the one set over something different and accomplishing something different I call a different one. What about you? How do you do it?”
	οὕτως, ἔφη.	“The same way,” he said.
477d	δεῦρο δὴ πάλιν, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, ὦ ἄριστε. ἐπιστήμην πότερον δύναμίν τινα φῂς εἶναι αὐτήν, ἢ εἰς τί γένος τιθεῖς;	“Come back to this point, then, my excellent friend,” I said. “Knowledge: do you say that it is itself a kind of power, or what class do you put it in?”
	εἰς τοῦτο, ἔφη, πασῶν γε δυνάμεων ἐρρωμενεστάτην. 477e	“In that one,” he said, “and it’s the strongest of all the powers.” 477e
	τί δέ, δόξαν εἰς δύναμιν ἢ εἰς ἄλλο εἶδος οἴσομεν;	“And what about opinion? Shall we assign it to power, or to some other kind?”
	οὐδαμῶς, ἔφη· ᾧ γὰρ δοξάζειν δυνάμεθα, οὐκ ἄλλο τι ἢ δόξα ἐστίν.	“To no other kind,” he said. “What enables us to form opinions is nothing other than opinion.”
	ἀλλὰ μὲν δὴ ὀλίγον γε πρότερον ὡμολόγεις μὴ τὸ αὐτὸ εἶναι ἐπιστήμην τε καὶ δόξαν.	“But a little while ago you agreed that knowledge and opinion are not the same.”
	πῶς γὰρ ἄν, ἔφη, τό γε ἀναμάρτητον τῷ μὴ ἀναμαρτήτῳ ταὐτόν τις νοῦν ἔχων τιθείη;	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"How could anyone with any sense," he said, "treat what is infallible as the same as what is not infallible?"
477e	καλῶς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ δῆλον ὅτι ἕτερον ἐπιστήμης δόξα 478a ὁμολογεῖται ἡμῖν.	"Good," I said. "So clearly we agree that opinion is something other than knowledge." 478a
	ἕτερον.	"Something other."
	ἐφ' ἑτέρῳ ἄρα ἕτερόν τι δυναμένη ἑκατέρα αὐτῶν πέφυκεν;	"Then each of them, having a different power, is by nature directed at a different thing?"
	ἀνάγκη.	"Necessarily."
	ἐπιστήμη μέν γέ που ἐπὶ τῷ ὄντι, τὸ ὂν γνῶναι ὡς ἔχει;	"Knowledge, I take it, is directed at what is, to know what is as it is?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	δόξα δέ, φαμέν, δοξάζειν;	"And opinion, we say, at forming opinions?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	ἦ ταὐτὸν ὅπερ ἐπιστήμη γιγνώσκει; καὶ ἔσται γνωστόν τε καὶ δοξαστὸν τὸ αὐτό; ἢ ἀδύνατον;	"About the very same thing that knowledge knows? Will the same thing be both knowable and an object of opinion? Or is that impossible?"
478a	ἀδύνατον, ἔφη, ἐκ τῶν ὡμολογημένων· εἴπερ ἐπ' ἄλλῳ ἄλλη δύναμις πέφυκεν, δυνάμεις δὲ ἀμφότεραί ἐστον, δόξα τε 478b καὶ ἐπιστήμη, ἄλλη δὲ ἑκατέρα, ὥς φαμεν, ἐκ τούτων δὴ οὐκ ἐγχωρεῖ γνωστὸν καὶ δοξαστὸν ταὐτὸν εἶναι.	"Impossible," he said, "given what we've agreed. If different powers are by nature directed at different things, and both of these, opinion 478b and knowledge, are powers, and each is different, as we say, then it follows that the knowable and the object of opinion can't be the same."
	οὐκοῦν εἰ τὸ ὂν γνωστόν, ἄλλο τι ἂν δοξαστὸν ἢ τὸ ὂν εἴη;	"Then if what is is knowable, the object of opinion would be something other than what is?"
	ἄλλο.	"Something other."
	ἆρ' οὖν τὸ μὴ ὂν δοξάζει; ἢ ἀδύνατον καὶ δοξάσαι τό γε μὴ ὄν; ἐννόει δέ. οὐχ ὁ δοξάζων ἐπὶ τὶ φέρει τὴν δόξαν; ἢ οἷόν τε αὖ δοξάζειν μέν, δοξάζειν δὲ μηδέν;	"Well then, does opinion have what is not as its object? Or is it impossible even to form an opinion about what is not? Think about it. Doesn't someone who forms an opinion bring his opinion to bear on something? Or is it possible to form an opinion, and yet form an opinion about nothing?"
	ἀδύνατον.	"Impossible."
478b	ἀλλ' ἕν γέ τι δοξάζει ὁ δοξάζων;	"So someone who forms an opinion forms an opinion about some one thing?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	ἀλλὰ μὴν μὴ ὄν γε οὐχ ἕν τι ἀλλὰ μηδὲν ὀρθότατ' ἂν 478c προσαγορεύοιτο;	"But surely what is not would most correctly be called not some one thing but 478c nothing?"
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
	μὴ ὄντι μὴν ἄγνοιαν ἐξ ἀνάγκης ἀπέδομεν, ὄντι δὲ γνῶσιν;	"And to what is not we necessarily assigned ignorance, and to what is, knowledge?"
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.	"Rightly," he said.
	οὐκ ἄρα ὂν οὐδὲ μὴ ὂν δοξάζει;	
	οὐ γάρ.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	οὔτε ἄρα ἄγνοια οὔτε γνῶσις δόξα ἂν εἴη;	"So one forms opinions neither about what is nor about what is not?"
	οὐκ ἔοικεν.	"No."
	ἆρ' οὖν ἐκτὸς τούτων ἐστίν, ὑπερβαίνουσα ἢ γνῶσιν σαφηνείᾳ ἢ ἄγνοιαν ἀσαφείᾳ;	"Then opinion would be neither ignorance nor knowledge?"
	οὐδέτερα.	"It seems not."
		"Then does it lie outside them, surpassing either knowledge in clarity or ignorance in obscurity?"
		"Neither."
478c	ἀλλ' ἆρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, γνώσεως μέν σοι φαίνεται δόξα σκοτωδέστερον, ἀγνοίας δὲ φανότερον;	"Then does opinion strike you," I said, "as darker than knowledge but brighter than ignorance?"
	καὶ πολύ γε, ἔφη. 478d	"Very much so," he said. 478d
	ἐντὸς δ' ἀμφοῖν κεῖται;	"And it lies within the two of them?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	μεταξὺ ἄρα ἂν εἴη τούτοιν δόξα.	"Then opinion would be between them."
	κομιδῇ μὲν οὖν.	"Exactly."
	οὐκοῦν ἔφαμεν ἐν τοῖς πρόσθεν, εἴ τι φανείη οἷον ἅμα ὄν τε καὶ μὴ ὄν, τὸ τοιοῦτον μεταξὺ κεῖσθαι τοῦ εἰλικρινῶς ὄντος τε καὶ τοῦ πάντως μὴ ὄντος, καὶ οὔτε ἐπιστήμην οὔτε ἄγνοιαν ἐπ' αὐτῷ ἔσεσθαι, ἀλλὰ τὸ μεταξὺ αὖ φανὲν ἀγνοίας καὶ ἐπιστήμης;	"Now didn't we say earlier that if something turned up that both is and is not at the same time, it would lie between what purely is and what in every way is not, and that neither knowledge nor ignorance would be directed at it, but whatever in turn turned up between ignorance and knowledge?"
	ὀρθῶς.	"Right."
478d	νῦν δέ γε πέφανται μεταξὺ τούτοιν ὃ δὴ καλοῦμεν δόξαν;	"And now what we call opinion has turned up between them?"
	πέφανται. 478e	"It has." 478e
	ἐκεῖνο δὴ λείποιτ' ἂν ἡμῖν εὑρεῖν, ὡς ἔοικε, τὸ ἀμφοτέρων μετέχον, τοῦ εἶναί τε καὶ μὴ εἶναι, καὶ οὐδέτερον εἰλικρινὲς ὀρθῶς ἂν προσαγορευόμενον, ἵνα, ἐὰν φανῇ, δοξαστὸν αὐτὸ εἶναι ἐν δίκῃ προσαγορεύωμεν, τοῖς μὲν ἄκροις τὰ ἄκρα, τοῖς δὲ μεταξὺ τὰ μεταξὺ ἀποδιδόντες. ἢ οὐχ οὕτως;	"So what's left for us, it seems, is to find the thing that shares in both, in being and in not being, and couldn't rightly be called purely either one; so that, if it turns up, we can justly call it the object of opinion, assigning extremes to extremes and what is between to what is between. Isn't that so?"
	οὕτω.	"It is."
478e	τούτων δὴ ὑποκειμένων λεγέτω μοι, φήσω, καὶ ἀποκρινέσθω 479a ὁ χρηστὸς ὃς αὐτὸ μὲν καλὸν καὶ ἰδέαν τινὰ αὐτοῦ κάλλους μηδεμίαν ἡγεῖται ἀεὶ μὲν κατὰ ταὐτὰ ὡσαύτως ἔχουσαν, πολλὰ δὲ τὰ καλὰ νομίζει, ἐκεῖνος ὁ φιλοθεάμων καὶ οὐδαμῇ ἀνεχόμενος ἄν τις ἓν τὸ καλὸν φῇ εἶναι καὶ δίκαιον καὶ τἆλλα οὕτω. "τούτων γὰρ δή, ὦ ἄριστε, φήσομεν, τῶν πολλῶν καλῶν μῶν τι ἔστιν ὃ οὐκ αἰσχρὸν φανήσεται; καὶ τῶν δικαίων, ὃ οὐκ ἄδικον; καὶ τῶν ὁσίων, ὃ οὐκ ἀνόσιον;" 479b	"With this laid down, then, let him tell me, I'll say, let him answer me, 479a this fine fellow who thinks there is no beautiful itself, no form of beauty itself that stays always the same in the same respects, but believes in the many beautiful things—that lover of sights who can't bear it if anyone says that the beautiful is one, or the just, and so on. 'My excellent friend,' we'll say, 'of these many beautiful things, is there one that won't also appear ugly? Of the just things, one that won't appear unjust? Of

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		the pious things, one that won't appear impious?'" 479b
479b	οὔκ, ἀλλ' ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, καὶ καλά πως αὐτὰ καὶ αἰσχρὰ φανῆναι, καὶ ὅσα ἄλλα ἐρωτᾷς.	"No," he said, "they're bound to appear somehow both beautiful and ugly, and the same goes for everything else you ask about."
	τί δὲ τὰ πολλὰ διπλάσια; ἧττόν τι ἡμίσεα ἢ διπλάσια φαίνεται;	"What about the many doubles? Do they appear any less halves than doubles?"
	οὐδέν.	"Not at all."
	καὶ μεγάλα δὴ καὶ σμικρὰ καὶ κοῦφα καὶ βαρέα μή τι μᾶλλον ἃ ἂν φήσωμεν, ταῦτα προσρηθήσεται ἢ τἀναντία;	"And big and small things, light and heavy ones—will they be called by whatever names we give them any more than by the opposites?"
	οὔκ, ἀλλ' ἀεί, ἔφη, ἕκαστον ἀμφοτέρων ἕξεται.	"No," he said, "each of them will always have something of both."
	πότερον οὖν ἔστι μᾶλλον ἢ οὐκ ἔστιν ἕκαστον τῶν πολλῶν τοῦτο ὃ ἄν τις φῇ αὐτὸ εἶναι;	"Then is each of the many things any more what someone says it is than it is not?"
	τοῖς ἐν ταῖς ἑστιάσεσιν, ἔφη, ἐπαμφοτερίζουσιν ἔοικεν, 479c καὶ τῷ τῶν παίδων αἰνίγματι τῷ περὶ τοῦ εὐνούχου, τῆς βολῆς πέρι τῆς νυκτερίδος, ᾧ καὶ ἐφ' οὗ αὐτὸν αὐτὴν αἰνίττονται βαλεῖν· καὶ γὰρ ταῦτα ἐπαμφοτερίζειν, καὶ οὔτ' εἶναι οὔτε μὴ εἶναι οὐδὲν αὐτῶν δυνατὸν παγίως νοῆσαι, οὔτε ἀμφότερα οὔτε οὐδέτερον.	"They're like the double meanings people play with at dinner parties," he said, 479c "and the children's riddle about the eunuch hitting the bat—what he hit it with and what it was sitting on. These things too have a double meaning, and you can't firmly conceive any of them as being or as not being, or as both, or as neither."
	ἔχεις οὖν αὐτοῖς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι χρήσῃ, ἢ ὅποι θήσεις καλλίω θέσιν τῆς μεταξὺ οὐσίας τε καὶ τοῦ μὴ εἶναι; οὔτε γάρ που σκοτωδέστερα μὴ ὄντος πρὸς τὸ μᾶλλον μὴ εἶναι 479d φανήσεται, οὔτε φανότερα ὄντος πρὸς τὸ μᾶλλον εἶναι.	"Then do you know what to do with them," I said, "or where you could put them better than between being and not being? They surely won't appear darker than what is not, so as to be more not, 479d or brighter than what is, so as to be more."[14]
479d	ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη.	"Very true," he said.
	ηὑρήκαμεν ἄρα, ὡς ἔοικεν, ὅτι τὰ τῶν πολλῶν πολλὰ νόμιμα καλοῦ τε πέρι καὶ τῶν ἄλλων μεταξύ που κυλινδεῖται τοῦ τε μὴ ὄντος καὶ τοῦ ὄντος εἰλικρινῶς.	"Then we've found, it seems, that the many conventions of the many about the beautiful and the rest roll around somewhere between what is not and what purely is."
	ηὑρήκαμεν.	"We have."
	προωμολογήσαμεν δέ γε, εἴ τι τοιοῦτον φανείη, δοξαστὸν αὐτὸ ἀλλ' οὐ γνωστὸν δεῖν λέγεσθαι, τῇ μεταξὺ δυνάμει τὸ μεταξὺ πλανητὸν ἁλισκόμενον.	"But we agreed beforehand that if anything of that sort turned up, it should be called an object of opinion, not of knowledge: the wanderer in between, caught by the power in between."
	ὡμολογήκαμεν. 479e	"We did agree." 479e
479e	τοὺς ἄρα πολλὰ καλὰ θεωμένους, αὐτὸ δὲ τὸ καλὸν μὴ ὁρῶντας μηδ' ἄλλῳ ἐπ' αὐτὸ ἄγοντι δυναμένους ἕπεσθαι, καὶ πολλὰ δίκαια, αὐτὸ δὲ τὸ δίκαιον μή, καὶ πάντα οὕτω,	"Those, then, who look at many beautiful things but don't see the beautiful itself, and can't follow someone else who leads them to it, who look at many just things but not the just itself, and so on

14 The riddle ran roughly: a man who was not a man, seeing and not seeing a bird that was not a bird, sitting on wood that was not wood, hit and did not hit it with a stone that was not a stone (a half-blind eunuch, a bat, a reed, a pumice stone).

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	δοξάζειν φήσομεν ἅπαντα, γιγνώσκειν δὲ ὧν δοξάζουσιν οὐδέν.	for everything—we'll say that they have opinions about everything but know nothing of what they have opinions about."
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη.	"Necessarily," he said.
	τί δὲ αὖ τοὺς αὐτὰ ἕκαστα θεωμένους καὶ ἀεὶ κατὰ ταὐτὰ ὡσαύτως ὄντα; ἆρ' οὐ γιγνώσκειν ἀλλ' οὐ δοξάζειν;	"And what about those who look at each of the things themselves, which are always the same in the same respects? Won't we say they know, and don't merely have opinions?"
	ἀνάγκη καὶ ταῦτα.	"That's necessary too."
	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἀσπάζεσθαί τε καὶ φιλεῖν τούτους μὲν ταῦτα 480a φήσομεν ἐφ' οἷς γνῶσίς ἐστιν, ἐκείνους δὲ ἐφ' οἷς δόξα; ἢ οὐ μνημονεύομεν ὅτι φωνάς τε καὶ χρόας καλὰς καὶ τὰ τοιαῦτ' ἔφαμεν τούτους φιλεῖν τε καὶ θεᾶσθαι, αὐτὸ δὲ τὸ καλὸν οὐδ' ἀνέχεσθαι ὥς τι ὄν;	"And won't we say that these welcome and love the things 480a that knowledge is about, and the others the things opinion is about? Or don't we remember saying that the others love and look at beautiful sounds and colors and things of that kind, but can't even bear the idea that the beautiful itself is something?"
	μεμνήμεθα.	"We remember."
	μὴ οὖν τι πλημμελήσομεν φιλοδόξους καλοῦντες αὐτοὺς μᾶλλον ἢ φιλοσόφους; καὶ ἆρα ἡμῖν σφόδρα χαλεπανοῦσιν ἂν οὕτω λέγωμεν;	"Then will we be striking a false note if we call them lovers of opinion rather than lovers of wisdom? And will they be very angry with us if we speak that way?"
	οὔκ, ἄν γέ μοι πείθωνται, ἔφη· τῷ γὰρ ἀληθεῖ χαλεπαίνειν οὐ θέμις.	"Not if they take my advice," he said. "It isn't right to be angry at the truth."[15]
480a	τοὺς αὐτὸ ἄρα ἕκαστον τὸ ὂν ἀσπαζομένους φιλοσόφους ἀλλ' οὐ φιλοδόξους κλητέον;	"Then those who welcome each thing itself that is must be called lovers of wisdom, and not lovers of opinion?"
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν.	"Absolutely."

15 "Lovers of opinion" (*philodoxoi*) plays on *philosophoi*, "lovers of wisdom"; *doxa*, "opinion," can also mean reputation.

Book VI

The philosopher's nature, and the sun.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
484a	**SOCRATES** οἱ μὲν δὴ φιλόσοφοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Γλαύκων, καὶ οἱ μὴ διὰ μακροῦ τινος διεξελθόντες λόγου μόγις πως ἀνεφάνησαν οἵ εἰσιν ἑκάτεροι.	**SOCRATES** "So, Glaucon," I said, "after going through a long argument, we've managed, with some difficulty, to bring to light who the philosophers are and who the non-philosophers are."
	ἴσως γάρ, ἔφη, διὰ βραχέος οὐ ῥᾴδιον.	"Perhaps," he said, "it wasn't easy to do in a short one."
	οὐ φαίνεται, εἶπον· ἐμοὶ γοῦν ἔτι δοκεῖ ἂν βελτιόνως φανῆναι εἰ περὶ τούτου μόνου ἔδει ῥηθῆναι, καὶ μὴ πολλὰ τὰ λοιπὰ διελθεῖν μέλλοντι κατόψεσθαι τί διαφέρει βίος 484b δίκαιος ἀδίκου.	"Apparently not," I said. "At any rate, I think it would have come out still better if we had only this to discuss, and didn't have many other things left to go through if we're to see how a just life differs 484b from an unjust one."
	τί οὖν, ἔφη, τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο ἡμῖν;	"So what comes next for us?" he said.
484b	τί δ' ἄλλο, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἢ τὸ ἑξῆς; ἐπειδὴ φιλόσοφοι μὲν οἱ τοῦ ἀεὶ κατὰ ταὐτὰ ὡσαύτως ἔχοντος δυνάμενοι ἐφάπτεσθαι, οἱ δὲ μὴ ἀλλ' ἐν πολλοῖς καὶ παντοίως ἴσχουσιν πλανώμενοι οὐ φιλόσοφοι, ποτέρους δὴ δεῖ πόλεως ἡγεμόνας εἶναι;	"What else," I said, "but the next step? Since philosophers are those who can grasp what is always the same in the same respects, while those who can't, but wander among many things of every sort, are not philosophers, which of them should be the leaders of a city?"
	πῶς οὖν λέγοντες ἂν αὐτό, ἔφη, μετρίως λέγοιμεν;	"What could we say about it," he said, "that would be reasonable?"
	ὁπότεροι ἄν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δυνατοὶ φαίνωνται φυλάξαι νόμους τε καὶ ἐπιτηδεύματα πόλεων, τούτους καθιστάναι 484c φύλακας.	"Whichever of them," I said, "appear capable of guarding the laws and practices of cities, those are the ones we should appoint 484c as guardians."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.	"Right," he said.
	τόδε δέ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἆρα δῆλον, εἴτε τυφλὸν εἴτε ὀξὺ ὁρῶντα χρὴ φύλακα τηρεῖν ὁτιοῦν;	"And is this clear," I said, "whether a guardian who is to keep watch over anything should be blind or sharp-sighted?"
484c	καὶ πῶς, ἔφη, οὐ δῆλον;	"Of course it's clear," he said.
	ἦ οὖν δοκοῦσί τι τυφλῶν διαφέρειν οἱ τῷ ὄντι τοῦ ὄντος ἑκάστου ἐστερημένοι τῆς γνώσεως, καὶ μηδὲν ἐναργὲς ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ ἔχοντες παράδειγμα, μηδὲ δυνάμενοι ὥσπερ γραφῆς εἰς τὸ ἀληθέστατον ἀποβλέποντες κἀκεῖσε ἀεὶ ἀναφέροντές τε 484d καὶ θεώμενοι ὡς οἷόν τε ἀκριβέστατα, οὕτω δὴ καὶ τὰ ἐνθάδε νόμιμα καλῶν τε πέρι καὶ δικαίων καὶ ἀγαθῶν τίθεσθαί τε, ἐὰν δέῃ τίθεσθαι, καὶ τὰ κείμενα φυλάττοντες σῴζειν;	"Well, do you think the blind differ at all from those who are really deprived of the knowledge of each thing that is, who have no clear model in their soul, and can't, like painters, look to what is most true, always referring back to it 484d and studying it as closely as possible, and so establish here too conventions about what is beautiful and just and good, when they need establishing, and guard and preserve those already established?"
	οὐ μὰ τὸν Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐ πολύ τι διαφέρει.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		“No, by Zeus,” he said, “they don’t differ much.”
484d	τούτους οὖν μᾶλλον φύλακας στησόμεθα ἢ τοὺς ἐγνωκότας μὲν ἕκαστον τὸ ὄν, ἐμπειρίᾳ δὲ μηδὲν ἐκείνων ἐλλείποντας μηδ’ ἐν ἄλλῳ μηδενὶ μέρει ἀρετῆς ὑστεροῦντας;	“Shall we make these our guardians, then, rather than those who have come to know each thing that is, and who don’t lag behind the others in experience or fall short of them in any other part of excellence?”
	ἄτοπον μεντἄν, ἔφη, εἴη ἄλλους αἱρεῖσθαι, εἴ γε τἆλλα μὴ ἐλλείποιντο· τούτῳ γὰρ αὐτῷ σχεδόν τι τῷ μεγίστῳ ἂν προέχοιεν.	“It would be absurd,” he said, “to choose the others, if these didn’t fall short in other respects, since in this very point, which is perhaps the most important, they would have the advantage.”
	οὐκοῦν τοῦτο δὴ λέγωμεν, τίνα τρόπον οἷοί τ’ ἔσονται οἱ αὐτοὶ κἀκεῖνα καὶ ταῦτα ἔχειν;	“Then shouldn’t we say how the same people will be able to have both this and that?”
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	“Certainly.”
485a	ὃ τοίνυν ἀρχόμενοι τούτου τοῦ λόγου ἐλέγομεν, τὴν φύσιν αὐτῶν πρῶτον δεῖ καταμαθεῖν· καὶ οἶμαι, ἐὰν ἐκείνην ἱκανῶς ὁμολογήσωμεν, ὁμολογήσειν καὶ ὅτι οἷοί τε ταῦτα ἔχειν οἱ αὐτοί, ὅτι τε οὐκ ἄλλους πόλεων ἡγεμόνας δεῖ εἶναι ἢ τούτους.	“Well, as we said at the beginning of this discussion, we must first understand their nature. And I think that if we reach adequate agreement about that, we’ll also agree that the same people can have both, and that no one but these should be leaders of cities.”
	πῶς;	“How so?”
	τοῦτο μὲν δὴ τῶν φιλοσόφων φύσεων πέρι ὡμολογήσθω 485b ἡμῖν ὅτι μαθήματός γε ἀεὶ ἐρῶσιν ὃ ἂν αὐτοῖς δηλοῖ ἐκείνης τῆς οὐσίας τῆς ἀεὶ οὔσης καὶ μὴ πλανωμένης ὑπὸ γενέσεως καὶ φθορᾶς.	“Let’s take this as agreed about philosophic natures: 485b that they always love any learning that reveals to them something of that being which always is, and doesn’t wander between coming to be and passing away.”
	ὡμολογήσθω.	“Let it be agreed.”
485b	καὶ μήν, ἦν δ’ ἐγώ, καὶ ὅτι πάσης αὐτῆς, καὶ οὔτε σμικροῦ οὔτε μείζονος οὔτε τιμιωτέρου οὔτε ἀτιμοτέρου μέρους ἑκόντες ἀφίενται, ὥσπερ ἐν τοῖς πρόσθεν περί τε τῶν φιλοτίμων καὶ ἐρωτικῶν διήλθομεν.	“And further,” I said, “that they love the whole of it, and don’t willingly give up any part of it, small or larger, more valued or less, as we described earlier in the case of lovers of honor and people in love.”
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις.	“You’re right,” he said.
	τόδε τοίνυν μετὰ τοῦτο σκόπει εἰ ἀνάγκη ἔχειν πρὸς 485c τούτῳ ἐν τῇ φύσει οἳ ἂν μέλλωσιν ἔσεσθαι οἵους ἐλέγομεν.	“Next, then, consider whether those who are to be as we described must also have this in their nature besides 485c the rest.”
	τὸ ποῖον;	“What?”
	τὴν ἀψεύδειαν καὶ τὸ ἑκόντας εἶναι μηδαμῇ προσδέχεσθαι τὸ ψεῦδος ἀλλὰ μισεῖν, τὴν δ’ ἀλήθειαν στέργειν.	“Truthfulness: never willingly accepting what is false, but hating it, and cherishing the truth.”
	εἰκός γ’, ἔφη.	“That’s likely,” he said.
485c	οὐ μόνον γε, ὦ φίλε, εἰκός, ἀλλὰ καὶ πᾶσα ἀνάγκη τὸν ἐρωτικῶς του φύσει ἔχοντα πᾶν τὸ συγγενές τε καὶ οἰκεῖον τῶν παιδικῶν ἀγαπᾶν.	“Not just likely, my friend: it’s entirely necessary that someone who is by nature in love with someone should cherish everything related and akin to his beloved.”
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.	“Right,” he said.
	ἦ οὖν οἰκειότερον σοφίᾳ τι ἀληθείας ἂν εὕροις;	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καὶ πῶς; ἦ δ’ ὅς.	“And could you find anything more akin to wisdom than truth?”
	ἦ οὖν δυνατὸν εἶναι τὴν αὐτὴν φύσιν φιλόσοφόν τε καὶ 485d φιλοψευδῆ;	“How could I?” he said.
	οὐδαμῶς γε.	“Then can the same nature be a lover of wisdom and 485d a lover of falsehood?”
	τὸν ἄρα τῷ ὄντι φιλομαθῆ πάσης ἀληθείας δεῖ εὐθὺς ἐκ νέου ὅτι μάλιστα ὀρέγεσθαι.	“Not at all.”
	παντελῶς γε.	“So the real lover of learning must, from earliest youth, reach out as far as he can for every kind of truth.”
		“Absolutely.”
485d	ἀλλὰ μὴν ὅτῳ γε εἰς ἕν τι αἱ ἐπιθυμίαι σφόδρα ῥέπουσιν, ἴσμεν που ὅτι εἰς τἆλλα τούτῳ ἀσθενέστεραι, ὥσπερ ῥεῦμα ἐκεῖσε ἀπωχετευμένον.	“But we surely know that when someone’s desires lean strongly toward one thing, they are weaker toward everything else, like a stream channeled off in that direction.”
	τί μήν;	“Of course.”
	ὧι δὴ πρὸς τὰ μαθήματα καὶ πᾶν τὸ τοιοῦτον ἐρρυήκασιν, περὶ τὴν τῆς ψυχῆς οἶμαι ἡδονὴν αὐτῆς καθ’ αὑτὴν εἶεν ἄν, τὰς δὲ διὰ τοῦ σώματος ἐκλείποιεν, εἰ μὴ πεπλασμένως ἀλλ’ 485e ἀληθῶς φιλόσοφός τις εἴη.	“So when someone’s desires have flowed toward learning and everything of that kind, I think they will be concerned with the pleasure of the soul itself by itself, and will leave behind the pleasures that come through the body—if he is a philosopher not in pretense but 485e in truth.”
	μεγάλη ἀνάγκη.	“That’s quite necessary.”
	σώφρων μὴν ὅ γε τοιοῦτος καὶ οὐδαμῇ φιλοχρήματος· ὧν γὰρ ἕνεκα χρήματα μετὰ πολλῆς δαπάνης σπουδάζεται, ἄλλῳ τινὶ μᾶλλον ἢ τούτῳ προσήκει σπουδάζειν.	“Such a person will be moderate, then, and not at all a lover of money. The things for which money is so eagerly pursued, at such great expense, are for anyone but him to take seriously.”
	οὕτω.	“Yes.”
486a	καὶ μήν που καὶ τόδε δεῖ σκοπεῖν, ὅταν κρίνειν μέλλῃς φύσιν φιλόσοφόν τε καὶ μή.	“And there’s surely this to consider too, when you’re going to judge whether a nature is philosophic or not.”
	τὸ ποῖον;	“What?”
	μή σε λάθῃ μετέχουσα ἀνελευθερίας· ἐναντιώτατον γάρ που σμικρολογία ψυχῇ μελλούσῃ τοῦ ὅλου καὶ παντὸς ἀεὶ ἐπορέξεσθαι θείου τε καὶ ἀνθρωπίνου.	“That you don’t miss any trace of meanness in it. Pettiness is surely the thing most opposed to a soul that is always going to reach out for the whole and for everything, divine and human.”
	ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη.	“Very true,” he said.
	ἦι οὖν ὑπάρχει διανοίᾳ μεγαλοπρέπεια καὶ θεωρία παντὸς μὲν χρόνου, πάσης δὲ οὐσίας, οἷόν τε οἴει τούτῳ μέγα τι δοκεῖν εἶναι τὸν ἀνθρώπινον βίον;	“Then if a mind has grandeur and contemplates all time and all being, do you think it possible for such a person to regard human life as anything great?”
	ἀδύνατον, ἦ δ’ ὅς. 486b	“Impossible,” he said. 486b
	οὐκοῦν καὶ θάνατον οὐ δεινόν τι ἡγήσεται ὁ τοιοῦτος;	“So such a person won’t think death anything terrible either?”
	ἥκιστά γε.	“Not in the least.”

	GREEK	ENGLISH
486b	δειλῇ δὴ καὶ ἀνελευθέρῳ φύσει φιλοσοφίας ἀληθινῆς, ὡς ἔοικεν, οὐκ ἂν μετείη.	"Then a cowardly and mean nature, it seems, would have no share in true philosophy."
	οὔ μοι δοκεῖ.	"I don't think so."
	τί οὖν; ὁ κόσμιος καὶ μὴ φιλοχρήματος μηδ' ἀνελεύθερος μηδ' ἀλαζὼν μηδὲ δειλὸς ἔσθ' ὅπῃ ἂν δυσσύμβολος ἢ ἄδικος γένοιτο;	"Well then, could an orderly person, who isn't a lover of money, or mean, or a braggart, or a coward, ever turn out hard to deal with, or unjust?"
	οὐκ ἔστιν.	"He couldn't."
	καὶ τοῦτο δὴ ψυχὴν σκοπῶν φιλόσοφον καὶ μὴ εὐθὺς νέου ὄντος ἐπισκέψῃ, εἰ ἄρα δικαία τε καὶ ἥμερος ἢ δυσκοινώνητος καὶ ἀγρία.	"So when you're examining whether a soul is philosophic or not, you'll look at this too, right from its youth: whether it is just and gentle, or unsociable and savage."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν. 486c	"Certainly." 486c
	οὐ μὴν οὐδὲ τόδε παραλείψεις, ὡς ἐγᾦμαι.	"Nor, I think, will you leave out this."
	τὸ ποῖον;	"What?"
486c	εὐμαθὴς ἢ δυσμαθής. ἢ προσδοκᾷς ποτέ τινά τι ἱκανῶς ἂν στέρξαι, ὃ πράττων ἂν ἀλγῶν τε πράττοι καὶ μόγις σμικρὸν ἀνύτων;	"Whether it learns easily or with difficulty. Or do you ever expect anyone to be properly fond of something that pains him to do, and in which he barely accomplishes a little?"
	οὐκ ἂν γένοιτο.	"That couldn't happen."
	τί δ' εἰ μηδὲν ὧν μάθοι σῴζειν δύναιτο, λήθης ὢν πλέως; ἆρ' ἂν οἷός τ' εἴη ἐπιστήμης μὴ κενὸς εἶναι;	"And what if he couldn't retain anything he learned, being full of forgetfulness? Could he avoid being empty of knowledge?"
	καὶ πῶς;	"How could he?"
	ἀνόνητα δὴ πονῶν οὐκ οἴει ἀναγκασθήσεται τελευτῶν αὐτόν τε μισεῖν καὶ τὴν τοιαύτην πρᾶξιν;	"Laboring to no profit, don't you think he'll be forced in the end to hate both himself and that activity?"
	πῶς δ' οὔ; 486d	"Of course." 486d
	ἐπιλήσμονα ἄρα ψυχὴν ἐν ταῖς ἱκανῶς φιλοσόφοις μή ποτε ἐγκρίνωμεν, ἀλλὰ μνημονικὴν αὐτὴν ζητῶμεν δεῖν εἶναι.	"Then let's never admit a forgetful soul among those who are properly philosophic; let's insist on looking for one with a good memory."
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν.	"Absolutely."
486d	ἀλλ' οὐ μὴν τό γε τῆς ἀμούσου τε καὶ ἀσχήμονος φύσεως ἄλλοσέ ποι ἂν φαῖμεν ἔλκειν ἢ εἰς ἀμετρίαν.	"And surely we would say that an unmusical and graceless nature tends in only one direction: toward disproportion."
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
	ἀλήθειαν δ' ἀμετρίᾳ ἡγῇ συγγενῆ εἶναι ἢ ἐμμετρίᾳ;	"And do you think truth is akin to disproportion or to proportion?"
	ἐμμετρίᾳ.	"To proportion."
	ἔμμετρον ἄρα καὶ εὔχαριν ζητῶμεν πρὸς τοῖς ἄλλοις διάνοιαν φύσει, ἣν ἐπὶ τὴν τοῦ ὄντος ἰδέαν ἑκάστου τὸ αὐτοφυὲς εὐάγωγον παρέξει.	"Then, in addition to the rest, let's look for a mind that is by nature well proportioned and graceful, whose innate disposition will make it easy to lead toward the form of each thing that is."
	πῶς δ' οὔ; 486e	"Of course." 486e
	τί οὖν; μή πῃ δοκοῦμέν σοι οὐκ ἀναγκαῖα ἕκαστα διεληλυθέναι καὶ ἑπόμενα ἀλλήλοις τῇ μελλούσῃ τοῦ ὄντος ἱκανῶς τε καὶ τελέως ψυχῇ μεταλήψεσθαι;	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἀναγκαιότατα μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Well then? Do you think that the qualities we've gone through are in any way not necessary, or not bound up with one another, for a soul that is to have an adequate and complete share in what is?" "They're absolutely necessary," he said.
487a	ἔστιν οὖν ὅπῃ μέμψῃ τοιοῦτον ἐπιτήδευμα, ὃ μή ποτ' ἄν τις οἷός τε γένοιτο ἱκανῶς ἐπιτηδεῦσαι, εἰ μὴ φύσει εἴη μνήμων, εὐμαθής, μεγαλοπρεπής, εὔχαρις, φίλος τε καὶ συγγενὴς ἀληθείας, δικαιοσύνης, ἀνδρείας, σωφροσύνης; οὐδ' ἂν ὁ Μῶμος, ἔφη, τό γε τοιοῦτον μέμψαιτο. ἀλλ', ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τελειωθεῖσι τοῖς τοιούτοις παιδείᾳ τε καὶ ἡλικίᾳ ἆρα οὐ μόνοις ἂν τὴν πόλιν ἐπιτρέποις; 487b	"Then is there any way you could find fault with a pursuit that no one could ever practice adequately unless he were by nature good at remembering, quick to learn, high-minded, graceful, a friend and kinsman of truth, justice, courage and moderation?" "Not even Momus," he said, "could find fault with that." "Well," I said, "when such people have been perfected by education and age, wouldn't you entrust the city to them alone?" 487b 1

WHY PHILOSOPHERS SEEM USELESS

Adeimantus objects that philosophers are useless, and Socrates answers with the image of the ship.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
487b	**SOCRATES** καὶ ὁ Ἀδείμαντος, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, πρὸς μὲν ταῦτά σοι οὐδεὶς ἂν οἷός τ' εἴη ἀντειπεῖν. ἀλλὰ γὰρ τοιόνδε τι πάσχουσιν οἱ ἀκούοντες ἑκάστοτε ἃ νῦν λέγεις· ἡγοῦνται δι' ἀπειρίαν τοῦ ἐρωτᾶν καὶ ἀποκρίνεσθαι ὑπὸ τοῦ λόγου παρ' ἕκαστον τὸ ἐρώτημα σμικρὸν παραγόμενοι, ἀθροισθέντων τῶν σμικρῶν ἐπὶ τελευτῆς τῶν λόγων μέγα τὸ σφάλμα καὶ ἐναντίον τοῖς πρώτοις ἀναφαίνεσθαι, καὶ ὥσπερ ὑπὸ τῶν πεττεύειν δεινῶν οἱ μὴ τελευτῶντες ἀποκλείονται καὶ οὐκ ἔχουσιν ὅτι 487c φέρωσιν, οὕτω καὶ σφεῖς τελευτῶντες ἀποκλείεσθαι καὶ οὐκ ἔχειν ὅτι λέγωσιν ὑπὸ πεττείας αὖ ταύτης τινὸς ἑτέρας, οὐκ ἐν ψήφοις ἀλλ' ἐν λόγοις· ἐπεὶ τό γε ἀληθὲς οὐδέν τι μᾶλλον ταύτῃ ἔχειν. λέγω δ' εἰς τὸ παρὸν ἀποβλέψας.	**SOCRATES** "Socrates," said Adeimantus, "no one could argue against you on these points. But this is what happens to the people who hear you say what you're saying now, every time. They think that because they're inexperienced at question and answer, they're led a little astray by the argument at each question, and when the little steps are added up at the end of the discussion, a big slip comes to light, contrary to what they said at first. And just as, against people who are clever at draughts, the unskilled players end up hemmed in, with no move to 487c make, so they too end up hemmed in and with nothing to say, by this other kind of draughts, played not with counters but with words. Yet the truth isn't any more on that side for all that. I say this with an eye to the present case.
487c	νῦν γὰρ φαίη ἄν τίς σοι λόγῳ μὲν οὐκ ἔχειν καθ' ἕκαστον τὸ ἐρωτώμενον ἐναντιοῦσθαι, ἔργῳ δὲ ὁρᾶν, ὅσοι ἂν ἐπὶ φιλοσοφίαν ὁρμήσαντες μὴ τοῦ πεπαιδεῦσθαι ἕνεκα ἁψάμενοι νέοι ὄντες 487d ἀπαλλάττωνται, ἀλλὰ μακρότερον ἐνδιατρίψωσιν, τοὺς μὲν πλείστους καὶ πάνυ ἀλλοκότους γιγνομένους, ἵνα μὴ παμπονήρους εἴπωμεν, τοὺς δ' ἐπιεικεστάτους δοκοῦντας ὅμως τοῦτό γε ὑπὸ τοῦ	"For right now someone might say to you that in words he can't oppose you at each question you ask, but in fact he can see that of those who launch into philosophy—not those who take it up while young for the sake of their education and then 487d leave it, but those who spend longer in it—most become very odd, not to say thoroughly wicked,

1 Momus: the personification of blame and fault-finding, who criticized even the works of the gods.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἐπιτηδεύματος οὗ σὺ ἐπαινεῖς πάσχοντας, ἀχρήστους ταῖς πόλεσι γιγνομένους.	while even those who seem the most decent are still affected by the pursuit you praise to this extent: they become useless to their cities."
487d	καὶ ἐγὼ ἀκούσας, οἴει οὖν, εἶπον, τοὺς ταῦτα λέγοντας ψεύδεσθαι;	When I heard this, I said, "Do you think the people who say this are lying?"
	οὐκ οἶδα, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἀλλὰ τὸ σοὶ δοκοῦν ἡδέως ἂν ἀκούοιμι.	"I don't know," he said, "but I'd be glad to hear what you think."
	ἀκούοις ἂν ὅτι ἔμοιγε φαίνονται τἀληθῆ λέγειν. 487e	"You'd hear that to me they seem to be telling the truth." 487e
	πῶς οὖν, ἔφη, εὖ ἔχει λέγειν ὅτι οὐ πρότερον κακῶν παύσονται αἱ πόλεις, πρὶν ἂν ἐν αὐταῖς οἱ φιλόσοφοι ἄρξωσιν, οὓς ἀχρήστους ὁμολογοῦμεν αὐταῖς εἶναι;	"Then how can it be right," he said, "to say that cities will have no rest from their evils until philosophers rule in them, when we agree that philosophers are useless to them?"
	ἐρωτᾷς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐρώτημα δεόμενον ἀποκρίσεως δι' εἰκόνος λεγομένης.	"You're asking a question," I said, "that needs an answer given through an image."
	σὺ δέ γε, ἔφη, οἶμαι οὐκ εἴωθας δι' εἰκόνων λέγειν.	"And you, I suppose," he said, "aren't in the habit of talking in images!"
487e	εἶεν, εἶπον· σκώπτεις ἐμβεβληκώς με εἰς λόγον οὕτω 488a δυσαπόδεικτον; ἄκουε δ' οὖν τῆς εἰκόνος, ἵν' ἔτι μᾶλλον ἴδῃς ὡς γλίσχρως εἰκάζω. οὕτω γὰρ χαλεπὸν τὸ πάθος τῶν ἐπιεικεστάτων, ὃ πρὸς τὰς πόλεις πεπόνθασιν, ὥστε οὐδ' ἔστιν ἓν οὐδὲν ἄλλο τοιοῦτον πεπονθός, ἀλλὰ δεῖ ἐκ πολλῶν αὐτὸ συναγαγεῖν εἰκάζοντα καὶ ἀπολογούμενον ὑπὲρ αὐτῶν, οἷον οἱ γραφῆς τραγελάφους καὶ τὰ τοιαῦτα μειγνύντες γράφουσιν.	"Very well," I said. "Are you making fun of me, after pushing me into an argument so 488a hard to prove? Anyway, listen to the image, so that you can see even better how hard I have to strain for my images. What the most decent people suffer in their relation to their cities is so harsh that there is no single thing that has suffered anything like it. To make an image of it and speak in their defense, one has to assemble it from many sources, the way painters paint goat-stags and such creatures by mixing things together.[2]
488a	νόησον γὰρ τοιουτονὶ γενόμενον εἴτε πολλῶν νεῶν πέρι εἴτε μιᾶς·	"Imagine something like this happening, whether on many ships or on one:
	ναύκληρον μεγέθει μὲν καὶ 488b ῥώμῃ ὑπὲρ τοὺς ἐν τῇ νηὶ πάντας, ὑπόκωφον δὲ καὶ ὁρῶντα ὡσαύτως βραχύ τι καὶ γιγνώσκοντα περὶ ναυτικῶν ἕτερα τοιαῦτα, τοὺς δὲ ναύτας στασιάζοντας πρὸς ἀλλήλους περὶ τῆς κυβερνήσεως, ἕκαστον οἰόμενον δεῖν κυβερνᾶν, μήτε μαθόντα πώποτε τὴν τέχνην μήτε ἔχοντα ἀποδεῖξαι διδάσκαλον ἑαυτοῦ μηδὲ χρόνον ἐν ᾧ ἐμάνθανεν, πρὸς δὲ τούτοις φάσκοντας μηδὲ διδακτὸν εἶναι, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὸν λέγοντα ὡς διδακτὸν ἑτοίμους κατατέμνειν, αὐτοὺς δὲ αὐτῷ ἀεὶ τῷ 488c ναυκλήρῳ περικεχύσθαι δεομένους καὶ πάντα ποιοῦντας ὅπως ἂν σφίσι τὸ πηδάλιον ἐπιτρέψῃ, ἐνίοτε δ' ἂν μὴ πείθωσιν ἀλλὰ ἄλλοι μᾶλλον, τοὺς μὲν ἄλλους ἢ ἀποκτεινύντας ἢ ἐκβάλλοντας ἐκ τῆς νεώς, τὸν δὲ γενναῖον ναύκληρον μανδραγόρᾳ ἢ μέθῃ ἤ τινι ἄλλῳ συμποδίσαντας τῆς νεὼς ἄρχειν χρωμένους τοῖς ἐνοῦσι,	"There is a shipowner who is bigger and 488b stronger than everyone else on board, but somewhat deaf, similarly short-sighted, and with a knowledge of seamanship to match. The sailors are quarreling with one another over the navigation, each thinking he ought to navigate, though he has never learned the art and can't point to a teacher or to a time when he learned it. What's more, they claim it can't even be taught, and they're ready to cut to pieces anyone who says it can. They're forever crowding around the 488c shipowner himself, begging him and doing everything they can to get him to hand them the tiller. Sometimes, if they fail to persuade him and others succeed instead, they kill the others or

2 Goat-stags: fantastic hybrid beasts familiar from decorated textiles and pottery.

GREEK

καὶ πίνοντάς τε καὶ εὐωχουμένους πλεῖν ὡς τὸ εἰκὸς τοὺς τοιούτους, πρὸς δὲ τούτοις ἐπαινοῦντας 488d ναυτικὸν μὲν καλοῦντας καὶ κυβερνητικὸν καὶ ἐπιστάμενον τὰ κατὰ ναῦν, ὃς ἂν συλλαμβάνειν δεινὸς ᾖ ὅπως ἄρξουσιν ἢ πείθοντες ἢ βιαζόμενοι τὸν ναύκληρον, τὸν δὲ μὴ τοιοῦτον ψέγοντας ὡς ἄχρηστον, τοῦ δὲ ἀληθινοῦ κυβερνήτου πέρι μηδ' ἐπαΐοντες, ὅτι ἀνάγκη αὐτῷ τὴν ἐπιμέλειαν ποιεῖσθαι ἐνιαυτοῦ καὶ ὡρῶν καὶ οὐρανοῦ καὶ ἄστρων καὶ πνευμάτων καὶ πάντων τῶν τῇ τέχνῃ προσηκόντων, εἰ μέλλει τῷ ὄντι νεὼς ἀρχικὸς ἔσεσθαι, ὅπως δὲ κυβερνήσει 488e ἐάντε τινες βούλωνται ἐάντε μή, μήτε τέχνην τούτου μήτε μελέτην οἰόμενοι δυνατὸν εἶναι λαβεῖν ἅμα καὶ τὴν κυβερνητικήν.

ENGLISH

throw them overboard. Then they tie up their noble shipowner with mandrake or drink or something else, take command of the ship, help themselves to its stores, and, drinking and feasting, sail the way you'd expect such people to sail. On top of this they praise anyone 488d who is clever at helping them take command, by persuading or forcing the shipowner, calling him a real seaman, a navigator, a man who knows ships; anyone who isn't like that they denounce as useless. They don't even understand that the true navigator must pay attention to the year and the seasons, the sky, the stars, the winds, and everything that belongs to his art, if he is really going to be fit to command a ship. As for how he will take the helm, 488e whether anyone wants him to or not, they don't think it possible to acquire an art or practice of that and, at the same time, the art of navigation.

488e τοιούτων δὴ περὶ τὰς ναῦς γιγνομένων τὸν ὡς ἀληθῶς κυβερνητικὸν οὐχ ἡγῇ ἂν τῷ ὄντι μετεωροσκόπον 489a τε καὶ ἀδολέσχην καὶ ἄχρηστόν σφισι καλεῖσθαι ὑπὸ τῶν ἐν ταῖς οὕτω κατεσκευασμέναις ναυσὶ πλωτήρων;

καὶ μάλα, ἔφη ὁ Ἀδείμαντος.

οὐ δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οἶμαι δεῖσθαί σε ἐξεταζομένην τὴν εἰκόνα ἰδεῖν, ὅτι ταῖς πόλεσι πρὸς τοὺς ἀληθινοὺς φιλοσόφους τὴν διάθεσιν ἔοικεν, ἀλλὰ μανθάνειν ὃ λέγω.

καὶ μάλ', ἔφη.

"When this is what goes on aboard ships, don't you think the real navigator would be called a stargazer, 489a a babbler, and useless to them by those who sail on ships run this way?"

"Very much so," said Adeimantus.

"I don't think," I said, "that you need to see the image examined in detail to see that it resembles the attitude of cities toward true philosophers. I think you understand what I mean."

"I certainly do," he said.

489a πρῶτον μὲν τοίνυν ἐκεῖνον τὸν θαυμάζοντα ὅτι οἱ φιλόσοφοι οὐ τιμῶνται ἐν ταῖς πόλεσι δίδασκέ τε τὴν εἰκόνα καὶ πειρῶ πείθειν ὅτι πολὺ ἂν θαυμαστότερον ἦν 489b εἰ ἐτιμῶντο.

ἀλλὰ διδάξω, ἔφη.

"First, then, teach this image to the man who is surprised that philosophers aren't honored in cities, and try to persuade him that it would be far more surprising 489b if they were."

"I will teach him," he said.

489b καὶ ὅτι τοίνυν τἀληθῆ λέγεις, ὡς ἄχρηστοι τοῖς πολλοῖς οἱ ἐπιεικέστατοι τῶν ἐν φιλοσοφίᾳ· τῆς μέντοι ἀχρηστίας τοὺς μὴ χρωμένους κέλευε αἰτιᾶσθαι, ἀλλὰ μὴ τοὺς ἐπιεικεῖς. οὐ γὰρ ἔχει φύσιν κυβερνήτην ναυτῶν δεῖσθαι ἄρχεσθαι ὑφ' αὑτοῦ οὐδὲ τοὺς σοφοὺς ἐπὶ τὰς τῶν πλουσίων θύρας ἰέναι, ἀλλ' ὁ τοῦτο κομψευσάμενος ἐψεύσατο, τὸ δὲ ἀληθὲς πέφυκεν, ἐάντε πλούσιος ἐάντε πένης κάμνῃ, ἀναγκαῖον 489c εἶναι ἐπὶ ἰατρῶν θύρας ἰέναι καὶ πάντα τὸν ἄρχεσθαι δεόμενον ἐπὶ τὰς τοῦ ἄρχειν δυναμένου, οὐ τὸν ἄρχοντα δεῖσθαι τῶν ἀρχομένων ἄρχεσθαι, οὗ ἂν τῇ ἀληθείᾳ τι ὄφελος ᾖ. ἀλλὰ τοὺς νῦν πολιτικοὺς ἄρχοντας ἀπεικάζων οἷς ἄρτι ἐλέγομεν ναύταις οὐχ ἁμαρτήσῃ, καὶ τοὺς ὑπὸ τούτων ἀχρήστους

"And tell him he's right that the most decent people in philosophy are useless to the many. But tell him to blame their uselessness on those who don't make use of them, and not on the decent ones. It isn't natural for a navigator to beg the sailors to be ruled by him, or for the wise to go to the doors of the rich; whoever came up with that witticism was lying. The truth of the matter is that when someone is sick, rich or poor, he has 489c to go to the doctor's door, and anyone who needs to be ruled must go to the door of the one who can rule. It isn't for the ruler, if he is really any use, to beg those he rules to be ruled. You won't go wrong if you liken our present political rulers to the sail-

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	λεγομένους καὶ μετεωρολέσχας τοῖς ὡς ἀληθῶς κυβερνήταις.	ors we were just describing, and those they call useless stargazing babblers to the true navigators."[3]
489c	ὀρθότατα, ἔφη.	"Quite right," he said.
	ἔκ τε τοίνυν τούτων καὶ ἐν τούτοις οὐ ῥᾴδιον εὐδοκιμεῖν τὸ βέλτιστον ἐπιτήδευμα ὑπὸ τῶν τἀναντία ἐπιτηδευόντων· 489d πολὺ δὲ μεγίστη καὶ ἰσχυροτάτη διαβολὴ γίγνεται φιλοσοφίᾳ διὰ τοὺς τὰ τοιαῦτα φάσκοντας ἐπιτηδεύειν, οὓς δὴ σὺ φῂς τὸν ἐγκαλοῦντα τῇ φιλοσοφίᾳ λέγειν ὡς παμπόνηροι οἱ πλεῖστοι τῶν ἰόντων ἐπ' αὐτήν, οἱ δὲ ἐπιεικέστατοι ἄχρηστοι, καὶ ἐγὼ συνεχώρησα ἀληθῆ σε λέγειν. ἦ γάρ;	"For these reasons, then, and in these conditions, it isn't easy for the best pursuit to be well thought of by those who pursue the opposite. 489d But by far the greatest and most damaging slander comes upon philosophy through those who claim to pursue it—the ones you had in mind when you said that philosophy's accuser claims most of those who go in for it are thoroughly wicked, and the most decent are useless. And I agreed that you were telling the truth, didn't I?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	οὐκοῦν τῆς μὲν τῶν ἐπιεικῶν ἀχρηστίας τὴν αἰτίαν διεληλύθαμεν;	"Well, we've gone through the reason why the decent ones are useless?"
	καὶ μάλα.	"We certainly have."
489d	τῆς δὲ τῶν πολλῶν πονηρίας τὴν ἀνάγκην βούλει τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο διέλθωμεν, καὶ ὅτι οὐδὲ τούτου φιλοσοφία αἰτία, 489e ἂν δυνώμεθα, πειραθῶμεν δεῖξαι;	"Next, then, shall we go through why the wickedness of the majority is inevitable, and try to show, if we can, that philosophy isn't to blame for this either?" 489e
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
	ἀκούωμεν δὴ καὶ λέγωμεν ἐκεῖθεν ἀναμνησθέντες, ὅθεν διῆμεν τὴν φύσιν οἷον ἀνάγκη φῦναι τὸν καλόν τε κἀγαθὸν 490a ἐσόμενον. ἡγεῖτο δ' αὐτῷ, εἰ νῷ ἔχεις, πρῶτον μὲν ἀλήθεια, ἣν διώκειν αὐτὸν πάντως καὶ πάντῃ ἔδει ἢ ἀλαζόνι ὄντι μηδαμῇ μετεῖναι φιλοσοφίας ἀληθινῆς.	"Then let's listen and speak, going back in memory to where we described the nature that someone who is to be fine and good must 490a have by birth. Leading him, if you remember, was first of all truth, which he had to pursue wholly and in every way; otherwise he would be a braggart with no share at all in true philosophy."
	ἦν γὰρ οὕτω λεγόμενον.	"Yes, that's what was said."
	οὐκοῦν ἓν μὲν τοῦτο σφόδρα οὕτω παρὰ δόξαν τοῖς νῦν δοκουμένοις περὶ αὐτοῦ;	"Isn't this one point, at least, flatly at odds with current opinion about him?"
490a	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
	ἆρ' οὖν δὴ οὐ μετρίως ἀπολογησόμεθα ὅτι πρὸς τὸ ὂν πεφυκὼς εἴη ἁμιλλᾶσθαι ὅ γε ὄντως φιλομαθής, καὶ οὐκ 490b ἐπιμένοι ἐπὶ τοῖς δοξαζομένοις εἶναι πολλοῖς ἑκάστοις, ἀλλ' ἴοι καὶ οὐκ ἀμβλύνοιτο οὐδ' ἀπολήγοι τοῦ ἔρωτος, πρὶν αὐτοῦ ὃ ἔστιν ἑκάστου τῆς φύσεως ἅψασθαι ᾧ προσήκει ψυχῆς ἐφάπτεσθαι τοῦ τοιούτου—προσήκει δὲ συγγενεῖ— ᾧ πλησιάσας καὶ μιγεὶς τῷ ὄντι ὄντως, γεννήσας νοῦν καὶ ἀλήθειαν, γνοίη τε καὶ ἀληθῶς ζῴη καὶ τρέφοιτο καὶ οὕτω λήγοι ὠδῖνος, πρὶν δ' οὔ;	"Then won't we be making a reasonable defense if we say that the real lover of learning is naturally inclined to strive toward what is, and doesn't 490b linger among the many particular things that are believed to be, but goes on, without losing his edge or giving up his love, until he grasps the nature of each thing that is, itself, with the part of the soul fitted to grasp such a thing—and the part fitted to it is the part akin to it; and that, having drawn near to what really is and coupled with it,
	ὡς οἷόν τ', ἔφη, μετριώτατα.	

3 The witticism is attributed to the poet Simonides, who remarked that the wise are found at the doors of the rich.

GREEK

ENGLISH

and begotten intelligence and truth, he knows, and truly lives and is nourished, and only then is released from his labor pains, but not before?"

"That would be as reasonable a defense as possible," he said.

490b τί οὖν; τούτῳ τι μετέσται ψεῦδος ἀγαπᾶν ἢ πᾶν τοὐναντίον μισεῖν; 490c

μισεῖν, ἔφη.

ἡγουμένης δὴ ἀληθείας οὐκ ἄν ποτε οἶμαι φαμὲν αὐτῇ χορὸν κακῶν ἀκολουθῆσαι.

πῶς γάρ;

ἀλλ' ὑγιές τε καὶ δίκαιον ἦθος, ᾧ καὶ σωφροσύνην ἕπεσθαι.

ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.

"Well then? Will such a person have any part in loving falsehood, or will he do quite the opposite and hate it?" 490c

"Hate it," he said.

"And when truth leads the way, I don't think we'd ever say that a chorus of evils follows."

"How could it?"

"Rather, a healthy and just character, with moderation following too."

"Right," he said.

490c καὶ δὴ τὸν ἄλλον τῆς φιλοσόφου φύσεως χορὸν τί δεῖ πάλιν ἐξ ἀρχῆς ἀναγκάζοντα τάττειν; μέμνησαι γάρ που ὅτι συνέβη προσῆκον τούτοις ἀνδρεία, μεγαλοπρέπεια, εὐμάθεια, μνήμη· καὶ σοῦ ἐπιλαβομένου ὅτι πᾶς μὲν ἀναγκασθήσεται 490d ὁμολογεῖν οἷς λέγομεν, ἐάσας δὲ τοὺς λόγους, εἰς αὐτοὺς ἀποβλέψας περὶ ὧν ὁ λόγος, φαίη ὁρᾶν αὐτῶν τοὺς μὲν ἀχρήστους, τοὺς δὲ πολλοὺς κακοὺς πᾶσαν κακίαν, τῆς διαβολῆς τὴν αἰτίαν ἐπισκοποῦντες ἐπὶ τούτῳ νῦν γεγόναμεν, τί ποθ' οἱ πολλοὶ κακοί, καὶ τούτου δὴ ἕνεκα πάλιν ἀνειλήφαμεν τὴν τῶν ἀληθῶς φιλοσόφων φύσιν καὶ ἐξ ἀνάγκης ὡρισάμεθα. 490e

"And why should I marshal the rest of the chorus of the philosophic nature all over again from the start? You remember, I suppose, that courage, high-mindedness, ease of learning and memory turned out to belong to these people. You objected that anyone would be compelled to 490d agree with what we're saying, but that if he left the arguments aside and looked at the very people the argument is about, he would say he saw that some of them were useless, and most of them bad with every kind of badness. Looking into the cause of this slander, we have now arrived at the question of why most of them are bad; and that is why we have taken up the nature of true philosophers again and have had to define it." 490e

HOW THE PHILOSOPHIC NATURE IS CORRUPTED

Socrates explains how gifted natures are corrupted by the crowd and how impostors disgrace philosophy.

GREEK

ENGLISH

490e **SOCRATES** ἔστιν, ἔφη, ταῦτα.

ταύτης δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τῆς φύσεως δεῖ θεάσασθαι τὰς φθοράς, ὡς διόλλυται ἐν πολλοῖς, σμικρὸν δέ τι ἐκφεύγει, οὓς δὴ καὶ οὐ πονηρούς, ἀχρήστους δὲ καλοῦσι· καὶ μετὰ 491a τοῦτο αὖ τὰς μιμουμένας ταύτην καὶ εἰς τὸ ἐπιτήδευμα καθισταμένας αὐτῆς, οἵαι οὖσαι φύσεις ψυχῶν εἰς ἀνάξιον καὶ μεῖζον ἑαυτῶν ἀφικνούμεναι ἐπιτήδευμα, πολλαχῇ πλημμελοῦσαι, πανταχῇ καὶ ἐπὶ πάντας δόξαν οἵαν λέγεις φιλοσοφίᾳ προσῆψαν.

τίνας δέ, ἔφη, τὰς διαφθορὰς λέγεις;

SOCRATES "That's so," he said.

"Then we must look at how this nature is corrupted," I said, "how it's ruined in many people, while only a few escape—the ones people call not wicked but useless. And after 491a that, we must look in turn at the natures that imitate it and set themselves up in its pursuit: what sort of souls they are that, arriving at a pursuit they're unworthy of, one too big for them, go wrong in many ways and have attached to philosophy, everywhere and in everyone's eyes, the reputation you describe."

GREEK

ENGLISH

"What corruptions do you mean?" he said.

491a ἐγώ σοι, εἶπον, ἂν οἷός τε γένωμαι, πειράσομαι διελθεῖν. τόδε μὲν οὖν οἶμαι πᾶς ἡμῖν ὁμολογήσει, τοιαύτην φύσιν καὶ πάντα ἔχουσαν ὅσα προσετάξαμεν νυνδή, εἰ τελέως [491b] μέλλοι φιλόσοφος γενέσθαι, ὀλιγάκις ἐν ἀνθρώποις φύεσθαι καὶ ὀλίγας. ἢ οὐκ οἴει;

σφόδρα γε.

τούτων δὴ τῶν ὀλίγων σκόπει ὡς πολλοὶ ὄλεθροι καὶ μεγάλοι.

τίνες δή;

ὃ μὲν πάντων θαυμαστότατον ἀκοῦσαι, ὅτι ἓν ἕκαστον ὧν ἐπῃνέσαμεν τῆς φύσεως ἀπόλλυσι τὴν ἔχουσαν ψυχὴν καὶ ἀποσπᾷ φιλοσοφίας. λέγω δὲ ἀνδρείαν, σωφροσύνην καὶ πάντα ἃ διήλθομεν.

ἄτοπον, ἔφη, ἀκοῦσαι. [491c]

"I'll try to go through them for you," I said, "if I can. I think everyone will agree with us on this much: a nature like this, with everything we just prescribed for it if it is to become a complete [491b] philosopher, is born rarely among human beings, and in few. Don't you think so?"

"Very much."

"Then consider how many and how great are the forces that destroy these few."

"What are they?"

"The most surprising thing of all to hear is that each of the qualities of that nature which we praised destroys the soul that has it and drags it away from philosophy. I mean courage, moderation and all the rest we went through."

"That's strange to hear," he said. [491c]

491c ἔτι τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πρὸς τούτοις τὰ λεγόμενα ἀγαθὰ πάντα φθείρει καὶ ἀποσπᾷ, κάλλος καὶ πλοῦτος καὶ ἰσχὺς σώματος καὶ συγγένεια ἐρρωμένη ἐν πόλει καὶ πάντα τὰ τούτων οἰκεῖα· ἔχεις γὰρ τὸν τύπον ὧν λέγω.

ἔχω, ἔφη· καὶ ἡδέως γ' ἂν ἀκριβέστερον ἃ λέγεις πυθοίμην.

λαβοῦ τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅλου αὐτοῦ ὀρθῶς, καί σοι εὔδηλόν τε φανεῖται καὶ οὐκ ἄτοπα δόξει τὰ προειρημένα περὶ αὐτῶν.

πῶς οὖν, ἔφη, κελεύεις; [491d]

"What's more," I said, "besides these, all the so-called good things corrupt it and drag it away: beauty, wealth, bodily strength, powerful family connections in the city, and everything that goes with them. You have the general outline of what I mean."

"I do," he said, "and I'd be glad to learn more precisely what you mean."

"Then grasp the whole thing correctly," I said, "and it will be perfectly clear to you, and what I said about them just now won't seem strange."

"So what are you telling me to do?" he said. [491d]

491d παντός, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, σπέρματος πέρι ἢ φυτοῦ, εἴτε ἐγγείων εἴτε τῶν ζῴων, ἴσμεν ὅτι τὸ μὴ τυχὸν τροφῆς ἧς προσήκει ἑκάστῳ μηδ' ὥρας μηδὲ τόπου, ὅσῳ ἂν ἐρρωμενέστερον ᾖ, τοσούτῳ πλειόνων ἐνδεῖ τῶν πρεπόντων· ἀγαθῷ γάρ που κακὸν ἐναντιώτερον ἢ τῷ μὴ ἀγαθῷ.

πῶς δ' οὔ;

ἔχει δὴ οἶμαι λόγον τὴν ἀρίστην φύσιν ἐν ἀλλοτριωτέρᾳ οὖσαν τροφῇ κάκιον ἀπαλλάττειν τῆς φαύλης.

ἔχει. [491e]

"With every seed or growing thing," I said, "whether plant or animal, we know that if it doesn't get the nourishment, climate or place that suits it, the more vigorous it is, the more it falls short of what it should be. For bad is surely more opposed to good than to what is not good."

"Of course."

"So it makes sense, I think, that the best nature, when it gets nurture alien to it, turns out worse than an inferior one."

"It does." [491e]

491e οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Ἀδείμαντε, καὶ τὰς ψυχὰς οὕτω φῶμεν τὰς εὐφυεστάτας κακῆς παιδαγωγίας τυχούσας διαφερόντως κακὰς γίγνεσθαι; ἢ οἴει τὰ μεγάλα ἀδικήματα καὶ τὴν ἄκρατον πονηρίαν ἐκ φαύλης ἀλλ'

"Then, Adeimantus," I said, "shall we say the same of souls: that the most gifted, if they get a bad upbringing, become exceptionally bad? Or do you think great crimes and unmixed wickedness come

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	οὐκ ἐκ νεανικῆς φύσεως τροφῇ διολομένης γίγνεσθαι, ἀσθενῆ δὲ φύσιν μεγάλων οὔτε ἀγαθῶν οὔτε κακῶν αἰτίαν ποτὲ ἔσεσθαι;	from an inferior nature rather than from a vigorous one ruined by its upbringing, and that a weak nature will ever be the cause of great things, either good or bad?"
	οὔκ, ἀλλά, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὕτως.	"No," he said, "it's as you say."
492a	ἦν τοίνυν ἔθεμεν τοῦ φιλοσόφου φύσιν, ἂν μὲν οἶμαι μαθήσεως προσηκούσης τύχῃ, εἰς πᾶσαν ἀρετὴν ἀνάγκη αὐξανομένην ἀφικνεῖσθαι, ἐὰν δὲ μὴ ἐν προσηκούσῃ σπαρεῖσά τε καὶ φυτευθεῖσα τρέφηται, εἰς πάντα τἀναντία αὖ, ἐὰν μή τις αὐτῇ βοηθήσας θεῶν τύχῃ. ἢ καὶ σὺ ἡγῇ, ὥσπερ οἱ πολλοί, διαφθειρομένους τινὰς εἶναι ὑπὸ σοφιστῶν νέους, διαφθείροντας δέ τινας σοφιστὰς ἰδιωτικούς, ὅτι καὶ ἄξιον λόγου, ἀλλ' οὐκ αὐτοὺς τοὺς ταῦτα λέγοντας μεγίστους 492b μὲν εἶναι σοφιστάς, παιδεύειν δὲ τελεώτατα καὶ ἀπεργάζεσθαι οἵους βούλονται εἶναι καὶ νέους καὶ πρεσβυτέρους καὶ ἄνδρας καὶ γυναῖκας;	"Then the nature we assigned to the philosopher, if it gets the learning that suits it, must grow and arrive at every excellence; but if it is sown and planted and grows up in surroundings that don't suit it, it will arrive at every opposite, unless one of the gods happens to come to its rescue. Or do you too believe, like the many, that some young people are corrupted by sophists, and that there are private sophists who corrupt them to any extent worth mentioning? Don't you think rather that the people who say this are themselves the greatest 492b sophists, who educate most thoroughly and turn out young and old, men and women, to be just the sort they want?"
492b	πότε δή; ἦ δ' ὅς.	"When?" he said.
	ὅταν, εἶπον, συγκαθεζόμενοι ἀθρόοι πολλοὶ εἰς ἐκκλησίας ἢ εἰς δικαστήρια ἢ θέατρα ἢ στρατόπεδα ἤ τινα ἄλλον κοινὸν πλήθους σύλλογον σὺν πολλῷ θορύβῳ τὰ μὲν ψέγωσι τῶν λεγομένων ἢ πραττομένων, τὰ δὲ ἐπαινῶσιν, ὑπερβαλλόντως ἑκάτερα, καὶ ἐκβοῶντες καὶ κροτοῦντες, πρὸς δ' 492c αὐτοῖς αἵ τε πέτραι καὶ ὁ τόπος ἐν ᾧ ἂν ὦσιν ἐπηχοῦντες διπλάσιον θόρυβον παρέχωσι τοῦ ψόγου καὶ ἐπαίνου. ἐν δὴ τῷ τοιούτῳ τὸν νέον, τὸ λεγόμενον, τίνα οἴει καρδίαν ἴσχειν; ἢ ποίαν ἂν αὐτῷ παιδείαν ἰδιωτικὴν ἀνθέξειν, ἣν οὐ κατακλυσθεῖσαν ὑπὸ τοῦ τοιούτου ψόγου ἢ ἐπαίνου οἰχήσεσθαι φερομένην κατὰ ῥοῦν ᾗ ἂν οὗτος φέρῃ, καὶ φήσειν τε τὰ αὐτὰ τούτοις καλὰ καὶ αἰσχρὰ εἶναι, καὶ ἐπιτηδεύσειν ἅπερ ἂν οὗτοι, καὶ ἔσεσθαι τοιοῦτον; 492d	"When," I said, "many of them sit crowded together in assemblies, law courts, theaters, army camps or any other public gathering of the crowd, and with a great uproar censure some of the things said or done and praise others, both to excess, shouting and clapping, while 492c the rocks and the place around them echo back and double the uproar of blame and praise. In a situation like that, what do you think becomes of a young man's heart, as the saying goes? What private education will hold out for him, and not be swept away by such blame and praise and go off, carried by the current wherever it carries it? Won't he call the same things fine and shameful as they do, pursue what they pursue, and become just like them?" 492d
492d	πολλή, ἦ δ' ὅς, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἀνάγκη.	"He'll have no choice at all, Socrates," he said.
	καὶ μήν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὔπω τὴν μεγίστην ἀνάγκην εἰρήκαμεν.	"And yet," I said, "we haven't yet mentioned the strongest compulsion."
	ποίαν; ἔφη.	"What's that?" he said.
	ἣν ἔργῳ προστιθέασι λόγῳ μὴ πείθοντες οὗτοι οἱ παιδευταί τε καὶ σοφισταί. ἢ οὐκ οἶσθα ὅτι τὸν μὴ πειθόμενον ἀτιμίαις τε καὶ χρήμασι καὶ θανάτοις κολάζουσι;	"The one these educators and sophists add in deeds when they fail to persuade with words. Or don't you know that they punish anyone who isn't persuaded with loss of civic rights, with fines, and with death?"
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, σφόδρα.	"They most certainly do," he said.
	τίνα οὖν ἄλλον σοφιστὴν οἴει ἢ ποίους ἰδιωτικοὺς λόγους ἐναντία τούτοις τείνοντας κρατήσειν; 492e	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	οἶμαι μὲν οὐδένα, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Then what other sophist, or what private teachings, do you think will prevail when pulling against them?" 492e
	οὐ γάρ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὸ ἐπιχειρεῖν πολλὴ ἄνοια.	"None, I think," he said.
		"No," I said, "and even to try is great folly.
492e	οὔτε γὰρ γίγνεται οὔτε γέγονεν οὐδὲ οὖν μὴ γένηται ἀλλοῖον ἦθος πρὸς ἀρετὴν παρὰ τὴν τούτων παιδείαν πεπαιδευμένον, ἀνθρώπειον, ὦ ἑταῖρε—θεῖον μέντοι κατὰ τὴν παροιμίαν ἐξαιρῶμεν λόγου· εὖ γὰρ χρὴ εἰδέναι, ὅτιπερ ἂν σωθῇ τε 493a καὶ γένηται οἷον δεῖ ἐν τοιαύτῃ καταστάσει πολιτειῶν, θεοῦ μοῖραν αὐτὸ σῶσαι λέγων οὐ κακῶς ἐρεῖς.	"No character ever does, ever has, or ever will turn out differently with respect to excellence by being educated against the education these people give—no human character, that is, my friend. The divine, as the proverb says, we should leave out of the account. You can be quite sure that whatever is saved 493a and turns out as it should in cities constituted as they are now, you won't be wrong to say a divine dispensation saved it."
	οὐδ' ἐμοὶ ἄλλως, ἔφη, δοκεῖ.	"That's how it seems to me too," he said.
	ἔτι τοίνυν σοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πρὸς τούτοις καὶ τόδε δοξάτω.	"Then here's something else you should think, besides," I said.
	τὸ ποῖον;	"What's that?"
493a	ἕκαστος τῶν μισθαρνούντων ἰδιωτῶν, οὓς δὴ οὗτοι σοφιστὰς καλοῦσι καὶ ἀντιτέχνους ἡγοῦνται, μὴ ἄλλα παιδεύειν ἢ ταῦτα τὰ τῶν πολλῶν δόγματα, ἃ δοξάζουσιν ὅταν ἀθροισθῶσιν, καὶ σοφίαν ταύτην καλεῖν·	"That each of the private teachers who work for fees—the ones these people call sophists and regard as their rivals—teaches nothing but the convictions of the many, the opinions they hold when they're gathered together, and calls this wisdom.
	οἷόνπερ ἂν εἰ θρέμματος μεγάλου καὶ ἰσχυροῦ τρεφομένου τὰς ὀργάς τις καὶ 493b ἐπιθυμίας κατεμάνθανεν, ὅπῃ τε προσελθεῖν χρὴ καὶ ὅπῃ ἅψασθαι αὐτοῦ, καὶ ὁπότε χαλεπώτατον ἢ πρᾳότατον καὶ ἐκ τίνων γίγνεται, καὶ φωνὰς δὴ ἐφ' οἷς ἑκάστας εἴωθεν φθέγγεσθαι, καὶ οἵας αὖ ἄλλου φθεγγομένου ἡμεροῦταί τε καὶ ἀγριαίνει, καταμαθὼν δὲ ταῦτα πάντα συνουσίᾳ τε καὶ χρόνου τριβῇ σοφίαν τε καλέσειεν καὶ ὡς τέχνην συστησάμενος ἐπὶ διδασκαλίαν τρέποιτο, μηδὲν εἰδὼς τῇ ἀληθείᾳ τούτων τῶν δογμάτων τε καὶ ἐπιθυμιῶν ὅτι καλὸν ἢ αἰσχρὸν 493c ἢ ἀγαθὸν ἢ κακὸν ἢ δίκαιον ἢ ἄδικον, ὀνομάζοι δὲ πάντα ταῦτα ἐπὶ ταῖς τοῦ μεγάλου ζῴου δόξαις, οἷς μὲν χαίροι ἐκεῖνο ἀγαθὰ καλῶν, οἷς δὲ ἄχθοιτο κακά, ἄλλον δὲ μηδένα ἔχοι λόγον περὶ αὐτῶν, ἀλλὰ τἀναγκαῖα δίκαια καλοῖ καὶ καλά, τὴν δὲ τοῦ ἀναγκαίου καὶ ἀγαθοῦ φύσιν, ὅσον διαφέρει τῷ ὄντι, μήτε ἑωρακὼς εἴη μήτε ἄλλῳ δυνατὸς δεῖξαι.	"It's as if someone were rearing a great, powerful beast and had learned its moods and 493b appetites: how to approach it and where to touch it, when it's most savage or most gentle and what makes it so, what sounds it tends to make on each occasion, and what sounds from someone else soothe it or make it wild. Having learned all this through long association and time spent, he calls it wisdom, organizes it into a craft, and turns to teaching it, though he knows nothing in truth about which of these convictions and appetites is fine or shameful, 493c good or bad, just or unjust. He applies all these names according to the great animal's opinions, calling what pleases it good and what annoys it bad. He has no other account of them; he calls what's necessary just and fine, but he has never seen how much the nature of the necessary really differs from that of the good, and he couldn't show it to anyone else.
493c	τοιοῦτος δὴ ὢν πρὸς Διὸς οὐκ ἄτοπος ἄν σοι δοκεῖ εἶναι παιδευτής;	"Wouldn't a man like that, by Zeus, seem to you a strange educator?"
	ἔμοιγ', ἔφη.	"He would to me," he said.

GREEK

ENGLISH

ἦ οὖν τι τούτου δοκεῖ διαφέρειν ὁ τὴν τῶν πολλῶν καὶ [493d] παντοδαπῶν συνιόντων ὀργὴν καὶ ἡδονὰς κατανενοηκέναι σοφίαν ἡγούμενος, εἴτ' ἐν γραφικῇ εἴτ' ἐν μουσικῇ εἴτε δὴ ἐν πολιτικῇ; ὅτι μὲν γὰρ ἄν τις τούτοις ὁμιλῇ ἐπιδεικνύμενος, ἢ ποίησιν ἥ τινα ἄλλην δημιουργίαν ἢ πόλει διακονίαν, κυρίους αὐτοῦ ποιῶν τοὺς πολλούς, πέρα τῶν ἀναγκαίων, ἡ Διομηδεία λεγομένη ἀνάγκη ποιεῖν αὐτῷ ταῦτα ἃ ἂν οὗτοι ἐπαινῶσιν· ὡς δὲ καὶ ἀγαθὰ καὶ καλὰ ταῦτα τῇ ἀληθείᾳ, ἤδη πώποτέ του ἤκουσας αὐτῶν λόγον διδόντος οὐ καταγέλαστον; [493e]

"Well, does he seem any different from the man who thinks it wisdom to have figured out the moods and pleasures of the many and [493d] varied people gathered together, whether in painting or music or, for that matter, in politics? If someone associates with the many and shows them a poem, or some other piece of craftsmanship, or a service to the city, making the many his masters beyond what's necessary, the so-called necessity of Diomedes will compel him to produce whatever they praise. But as for these things being truly good and fine—have you ever yet heard any of them give an argument for that which wasn't ridiculous?" [493e] [4]

[493e] οἶμαι δέ γε, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐδ' ἀκούσομαι.

"No, and I don't suppose I ever will," he said.

ταῦτα τοίνυν πάντα ἐννοήσας ἐκεῖνο ἀναμνήσθητι· αὐτὸ τὸ καλὸν ἀλλὰ μὴ τὰ πολλὰ καλά, ἢ αὐτό τι ἕκαστον καὶ [494a] μὴ τὰ πολλὰ ἕκαστα, ἔσθ' ὅπως πλῆθος ἀνέξεται ἢ ἡγήσεαι εἶναι;

"Keep all this in mind, then, and recall the earlier point. Can the multitude possibly accept or believe that the beautiful itself exists, rather than the many beautiful things, or each thing itself [494a] rather than the many particular things?"

ἥκιστά γ', ἔφη.

"Not in the least," he said.

φιλόσοφον μὲν ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πλῆθος ἀδύνατον εἶναι.

"Then it's impossible," I said, "for the multitude to be philosophical."

ἀδύνατον.

"Impossible."

καὶ τοὺς φιλοσοφοῦντας ἄρα ἀνάγκη ψέγεσθαι ὑπ' αὐτῶν.

"So those who do philosophy are bound to be criticized by them."

ἀνάγκη.

"Bound to be."

καὶ ὑπὸ τούτων δὴ τῶν ἰδιωτῶν, ὅσοι προσομιλοῦντες ὄχλῳ ἀρέσκειν αὐτῷ ἐπιθυμοῦσι.

"And by those private individuals who associate with the crowd and want to please it."

δῆλον.

"Clearly."

[494a] ἐκ δὴ τούτων τίνα ὁρᾷς σωτηρίαν φιλοσόφῳ φύσει, ὥστ' ἐν τῷ ἐπιτηδεύματι μείνασαν πρὸς τέλος ἐλθεῖν; ἐννόει δ' [494b] ἐκ τῶν ἔμπροσθεν. ὡμολόγηται γὰρ δὴ ἡμῖν εὐμάθεια καὶ μνήμη καὶ ἀνδρεία καὶ μεγαλοπρέπεια ταύτης εἶναι τῆς φύσεως.

"Given all this, what salvation do you see for a philosophical nature, so that it stays in its pursuit and reaches the end? Think about it in light [494b] of what we said before. We agreed that quickness at learning, memory, courage and high-mindedness belong to this nature."

ναί.

"Yes."

οὐκοῦν εὐθὺς ἐν παισὶν ὁ τοιοῦτος πρῶτος ἔσται ἐν ἅπασιν, ἄλλως τε καὶ ἐὰν τὸ σῶμα φυῇ προσφερὴς τῇ ψυχῇ;

"Then won't such a person be first in everything right from childhood, especially if his body grows to match his soul?"

τί δ' οὐ μέλλει; ἔφη.

"Why wouldn't he?" he said.

βουλήσονται δὴ οἶμαι αὐτῷ χρῆσθαι, ἐπειδὰν πρεσβύτερος γίγνηται, ἐπὶ τὰ αὑτῶν πράγματα οἵ τε οἰκεῖοι καὶ οἱ πολῖται.

πῶς δ' οὔ; [494c]

4 "The necessity of Diomedes" was a proverbial phrase for irresistible compulsion; its origin was disputed even in antiquity.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"And when he gets older, I imagine, his family and fellow citizens will want to use him for their own affairs." "Of course." 494c
494c	ὑποκείσονται ἄρα δεόμενοι καὶ τιμῶντες, προκαταλαμβάνοντες καὶ προκολακεύοντες τὴν μέλλουσαν αὐτοῦ δύναμιν. φιλεῖ γοῦν, ἔφη, οὕτω γίγνεσθαι. τί οὖν οἴει, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸν τοιοῦτον ἐν τοῖς τοιούτοις ποιήσειν, ἄλλως τε καὶ ἐὰν τύχῃ μεγάλης πόλεως ὢν καὶ ἐν ταύτῃ πλούσιός τε καὶ γενναῖος, καὶ ἔτι εὐειδὴς καὶ μέγας; ἆρ' οὐ πληρωθήσεσθαι ἀμηχάνου ἐλπίδος, ἡγούμενον καὶ τὰ τῶν Ἑλλήνων καὶ τὰ τῶν βαρβάρων ἱκανὸν ἔσεσθαι 494d πράττειν, καὶ ἐπὶ τούτοις ὑψηλὸν ἐξαρεῖν αὑτόν, σχηματισμοῦ καὶ φρονήματος κενοῦ ἄνευ νοῦ ἐμπιμπλάμενον; καὶ μάλ', ἔφη.	"So they'll lie at his feet with requests and honors, getting hold of his future power in advance and flattering it ahead of time." "That's certainly how it usually goes," he said. "So what do you think such a person will do in such circumstances," I said, "especially if he happens to be from a great city, rich and well-born in it, and handsome and tall besides? Won't he be filled with boundless hope, believing he'll be capable of managing the affairs of Greeks and non-Greeks alike, 494d and won't he exalt himself on that account, filling up with posturing and empty pride, without any sense?" "He certainly will," he said.
494d	τῷ δὴ οὕτω διατιθεμένῳ ἐάν τις ἠρέμα προσελθὼν τἀληθῆ λέγῃ, ὅτι νοῦς οὐκ ἔνεστιν αὐτῷ, δεῖται δέ, τὸ δὲ οὐ κτητὸν μὴ δουλεύσαντι τῇ κτήσει αὐτοῦ, ἆρ' εὐπετὲς οἴει εἶναι εἰσακοῦσαι διὰ τοσούτων κακῶν; πολλοῦ γε δεῖ, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Now if someone gently approaches a person in this condition and tells him the truth—that there's no sense in him, that he needs it, and that it can't be acquired unless he slaves to acquire it—do you think it will be easy for him to listen, surrounded by so many bad influences?" "Far from it," he said.
	ἐὰν δ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, διὰ τὸ εὖ πεφυκέναι καὶ τὸ συγγενὲς 494e τῶν λόγων εἰσαισθάνηταί τέ πῃ καὶ κάμπτηται καὶ ἕλκηται πρὸς φιλοσοφίαν, τί οἰόμεθα δράσειν ἐκείνους τοὺς ἡγουμένους ἀπολλύναι αὐτοῦ τὴν χρείαν τε καὶ ἑταιρίαν; οὐ πᾶν μὲν ἔργον, πᾶν δ' ἔπος λέγοντάς τε καὶ πράττοντας καὶ περὶ αὐτόν, ὅπως ἂν μὴ πεισθῇ, καὶ περὶ τὸν πείθοντα, ὅπως ἂν μὴ οἷός τ' ᾖ, καὶ ἰδίᾳ ἐπιβουλεύοντας καὶ δημοσίᾳ εἰς ἀγῶνας καθιστάντας; πολλή, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἀνάγκη. ἔστιν οὖν ὅπως ὁ τοιοῦτος φιλοσοφήσει; οὐ πάνυ.	"But suppose," I said, "that because of his good nature and his kinship 494e with the arguments he does somehow perceive something, and is turned and drawn toward philosophy. What do we think those people will do who believe they're losing his usefulness and his companionship? Won't they stop at nothing, in word or deed, both with him, so that he won't be persuaded, and with the one persuading him, so that he won't be able to—plotting against him in private and hauling him into court in public?" "They're bound to," he said. "So is there any way such a person will do philosophy?" "Hardly."
495a	ὁρᾷς οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι οὐ κακῶς ἐλέγομεν ὡς ἄρα καὶ αὐτὰ τὰ τῆς φιλοσόφου φύσεως μέρη, ὅταν ἐν κακῇ τροφῇ γένηται, αἴτια τρόπον τινὰ τοῦ ἐκπεσεῖν ἐκ τοῦ ἐπιτηδεύματος, καὶ τὰ λεγόμενα ἀγαθά, πλοῦτοί τε καὶ πᾶσα ἡ τοιαύτη παρασκευή;	"So you see," I said, "that we weren't wrong to say that the very components of the philosophical nature, when it gets a bad upbringing, are in a way responsible for its falling away from the pursuit—

GREEK

οὐ γάρ, ἀλλ' ὀρθῶς, ἔφη, ἐλέχθη.

οὗτος δή, εἶπον, ὦ θαυμάσιε, ὅλεθρός τε καὶ διαφθορὰ
495b τοσαύτη τε καὶ τοιαύτη τῆς βελτίστης φύσεως εἰς τὸ
ἄριστον ἐπιτήδευμα, ὀλίγης καὶ ἄλλως γιγνομένης, ὡς
ἡμεῖς φαμεν. καὶ ἐκ τούτων δὴ τῶν ἀνδρῶν καὶ οἱ τὰ
μέγιστα κακὰ ἐργαζόμενοι τὰς πόλεις γίγνονται καὶ τοὺς
ἰδιώτας, καὶ οἱ τἀγαθά, οἳ ἂν ταύτῃ τύχωσι ῥυέντες·
σμικρὰ δὲ φύσις οὐδὲν μέγα οὐδέποτε οὐδένα οὔτε
ἰδιώτην οὔτε πόλιν δρᾷ.

ἀληθέστατα, ἦ δ' ὅς.

495b οὗτοι μὲν δὴ οὕτως ἐκπίπτοντες, οἷς μάλιστα προσήκει,
495c ἔρημον καὶ ἀτελῆ φιλοσοφίαν λείποντες αὐτοί τε
βίον οὐ προσήκοντα οὐδ' ἀληθῆ ζῶσιν, τὴν δέ, ὥσπερ
ὀρφανὴν συγγενῶν, ἄλλοι ἐπεισελθόντες ἀνάξιοι
ἧσχυνάν τε καὶ ὀνείδη περιῆψαν, οἷα καὶ σὺ φῂς
ὀνειδίζειν τοὺς ὀνειδίζοντας, ὡς οἱ συνόντες αὐτῇ οἱ μὲν
οὐδενός, οἱ δὲ πολλοὶ πολλῶν κακῶν ἄξιοί εἰσιν.

καὶ γὰρ οὖν, ἔφη, τά γε λεγόμενα ταῦτα.

495c εἰκότως γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λεγόμενα. καθορῶντες γὰρ ἄλλοι
ἀνθρωπίσκοι κενὴν τὴν χώραν ταύτην γιγνομένην,
καλῶν 495d δὲ ὀνομάτων καὶ προσχημάτων μεστήν, ὥσπερ
οἱ ἐκ τῶν εἱργμῶν εἰς τὰ ἱερὰ ἀποδιδράσκοντες, ἅσμενοι
καὶ οὗτοι ἐκ τῶν τεχνῶν ἐκπηδῶσιν εἰς τὴν φιλοσοφίαν,
οἳ ἂν κομψότατοι ὄντες τυγχάνωσι περὶ τὸ αὑτῶν
τεχνίον. ὅμως γὰρ δὴ πρός γε τὰς ἄλλας τέχνας καίπερ
οὕτω πραττούσης φιλοσοφίας τὸ ἀξίωμα
μεγαλοπρεπέστερον λείπεται, οὗ δὴ ἐφιέμενοι πολλοὶ
ἀτελεῖς μὲν τὰς φύσεις, ὑπὸ δὲ τῶν τεχνῶν τε καὶ
δημιουργιῶν ὥσπερ τὰ σώματα λελώβηνται, οὕτω 495e
καὶ τὰς ψυχὰς συγκεκλασμένοι τε καὶ ἀποτεθρυμμένοι
διὰ τὰς βαναυσίας τυγχάνουσιν—ἢ οὐκ ἀνάγκη;

495e καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.

δοκεῖς οὖν τι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, διαφέρειν αὐτοὺς ἰδεῖν ἀργύριον
κτησαμένου χαλκέως φαλακροῦ καὶ σμικροῦ, νεωστὶ μὲν
ἐκ δεσμῶν λελυμένου, ἐν βαλανείῳ δὲ λελουμένου,
νεουργὸν ἱμάτιον ἔχοντος, ὡς νυμφίου
παρεσκευασμένου, διὰ πενίαν καὶ ἐρημίαν τοῦ δεσπότου
τὴν θυγατέρα μέλλοντος γαμεῖν;

οὐ πάνυ, ἔφη, διαφέρει.

ENGLISH

and so are the so-called goods, wealth and all such resources?"

"No, we weren't," he said. "What we said was right."

"This, then, my remarkable friend," I said, "is the ruin and corruption, 495b so great and of such a kind, of the best nature with respect to the best pursuit—a nature that's rare enough anyway, as we say. And it's from among these men that there come both those who do the greatest harm to cities and to individuals, and those who do them good, if they happen to be swept in that direction. A small nature never does anything great to anyone, individual or city."

"Very true," he said.

"So the people she most belongs with fall away like this, 495c leaving philosophy deserted and unfulfilled. They themselves live a life that doesn't suit them and isn't true, while others, unworthy of her, move in on her as if she were an orphan with no kin, and disgrace her and fasten reproaches on her—the very ones you say her critics make: that of those who spend time with her, some are worthless and most deserve all sorts of bad things."

"Yes," he said, "that's certainly what people say."

"And it's natural that they say it," I said. "Other little men see this territory emptying out, though it's full of fine 495d names and pretensions, and like people who escape from prison into temples, they gladly leap out of their crafts into philosophy—those, that is, who happen to be cleverest at their own little craft. For even faring as she does, philosophy still keeps a grander prestige than the other crafts, and many people with imperfect natures aspire to it: people whose bodies have been deformed by their crafts and trades, and whose souls 495e have likewise been cramped and crushed by their menial work. Or isn't that inevitable?"

"It certainly is," he said.

"Do you think," I said, "that they look any different from a bald little metalworker who's come into some money, just released from prison, freshly washed at the bathhouse, wearing a brand-new cloak, all dressed up like a bridegroom, about to marry his master's daughter because she's poor and has been left without anyone?"

GREEK

ENGLISH

ποῖ᾽ ἄττα οὖν εἰκὸς γεννᾶν τοὺς τοιούτους; οὐ νόθα καὶ φαῦλα;

πολλὴ ἀνάγκη.

"No different at all," he said.

"And what sort of offspring are such people likely to father? Won't they be illegitimate and inferior?"

"That's inevitable."

496a τί δέ; τοὺς ἀναξίους παιδεύσεως, ὅταν αὐτῇ πλησιάζοντες ὁμιλῶσι μὴ κατ᾽ ἀξίαν, ποῖ᾽ ἄττα φῶμεν γεννᾶν διανοήματά τε καὶ δόξας; ἆρ᾽ οὐχ ὡς ἀληθῶς προσήκοντα ἀκοῦσαι σοφίσματα, καὶ οὐδὲν γνήσιον οὐδὲ φρονήσεως ἄξιον ἀληθινῆς ἐχόμενον;

παντελῶς μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

"What about this? When those unworthy of education draw near it and consort with it unworthily, what sort of thoughts and opinions should we say they father? Won't they be what can truly be called sophisms, with nothing genuine about them, nothing that has any share in true understanding?"

"Absolutely," he said.

πάνσμικρον δή τι, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὦ Ἀδείμαντε, λείπεται τῶν 496b κατ᾽ ἀξίαν ὁμιλούντων φιλοσοφίᾳ, ἢ που ὑπὸ φυγῆς καταληφθὲν γενναῖον καὶ εὖ τεθραμμένον ἦθος, ἀπορίᾳ τῶν διαφθερούντων κατὰ φύσιν μεῖναν ἐπ᾽ αὐτῇ, ἢ ἐν σμικρᾷ πόλει ὅταν μεγάλη ψυχὴ φυῇ καὶ ἀτιμάσασα τὰ τῆς πόλεως ὑπερίδῃ· βραχὺ δέ πού τι καὶ ἀπ᾽ ἄλλης τέχνης δικαίως ἀτιμάσαν εὐφυὲς ἐπ᾽ αὐτὴν ἂν ἔλθοι. εἴη δ᾽ ἂν καὶ ὁ τοῦ ἡμετέρου ἑταίρου Θεάγους χαλινὸς οἷος κατασχεῖν· καὶ γὰρ 496c Θεάγει τὰ μὲν ἄλλα πάντα παρεσκεύασται πρὸς τὸ ἐκπεσεῖν φιλοσοφίας, ἡ δὲ τοῦ σώματος νοσοτροφία ἀπείργουσα αὐτὸν τῶν πολιτικῶν κατέχει. τὸ δ᾽ ἡμέτερον οὐκ ἄξιον λέγειν, τὸ δαιμόνιον σημεῖον· ἢ γάρ πού τινι ἄλλῳ ἢ οὐδενὶ τῶν ἔμπροσθεν γέγονεν.

"Then there remains, Adeimantus," I said, "only a very small group of those 496b who consort with philosophy worthily. Perhaps a noble, well-brought-up character held back by exile, who, with no one around to corrupt him, stays with her as his nature leads; or a great soul born in a small city, who disdains the city's affairs and looks down on them. And a few, perhaps, with good natures might come to her from some other craft that they rightly disdain. Then there's the bridle of our friend Theages, which could also hold someone back: for 496c Theages had everything else in place for falling away from philosophy, but his sickly body keeps him out of politics and holds him back. My own case, the divine sign, isn't worth mentioning; it has happened to perhaps one other person before me, or to no one.[5]

496c καὶ τούτων δὴ τῶν ὀλίγων οἱ γενόμενοι καὶ γευσάμενοι ὡς ἡδὺ καὶ μακάριον τὸ κτῆμα, καὶ τῶν πολλῶν αὖ ἱκανῶς ἰδόντες τὴν μανίαν, καὶ ὅτι οὐδεὶς οὐδὲν ὑγιὲς ὡς ἔπος εἰπεῖν περὶ τὰ τῶν πόλεων πράττει οὐδ᾽ ἔστι 496d σύμμαχος μεθ᾽ ὅτου τις ἰὼν ἐπὶ τὴν τῷ δικαίῳ βοήθειαν σῴζοιτ᾽ ἄν, ἀλλ᾽ ὥσπερ εἰς θηρία ἄνθρωπος ἐμπεσών, οὔτε συναδικεῖν ἐθέλων οὔτε ἱκανὸς ὢν εἷς πᾶσιν ἀγρίοις ἀντέχειν, πρίν τι τὴν πόλιν ἢ φίλους ὀνῆσαι προαπολόμενος ἀνωφελὴς αὐτῷ τε καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις ἂν γένοιτο—ταῦτα πάντα λογισμῷ λαβών, ἡσυχίαν ἔχων καὶ τὰ αὑτοῦ πράττων, οἷον ἐν χειμῶνι κονιορτοῦ καὶ ζάλης ὑπὸ πνεύματος φερομένου ὑπὸ τειχίον ἀποστάς, ὁρῶν τοὺς ἄλλους καταπιμπλαμένους ἀνομίας, ἀγαπᾷ εἴ πῃ αὐτὸς καθαρὸς ἀδικίας τε καὶ ἀνοσίων 496e ἔργων τόν τε ἐνθάδε βίον βιώσεται καὶ τὴν ἀπαλλαγὴν αὐτοῦ μετὰ καλῆς ἐλπίδος ἵλεώς τε καὶ εὐμενὴς ἀπαλλάξεται.

"Someone who has become one of these few and has tasted how sweet and blessed a possession it is, and who has also seen clearly enough the madness of the many—that practically no one does anything sound in public affairs, and that there's no 496d ally with whom one could go to the aid of justice and survive; that he'd be like a man fallen among wild beasts, unwilling to join in their wrongdoing and unable to hold out alone against all these wild creatures, and would perish before he could benefit his city or his friends, useless to himself and to everyone else—taking all this into account, he keeps quiet and minds his own business. Like someone who shelters behind a little wall in a storm, when the wind drives dust and rain along, he watches others filled with lawlessness and is content if he can somehow live his life

5 Theages was a young companion of Socrates; a dialogue attributed to Plato bears his name.

GREEK

ENGLISH

here pure of injustice and unholy [496e] deeds, and take his leave of it with good hope, calm and kindly."

497a ἀλλά τοι, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐ τὰ ἐλάχιστα ἂν διαπραξάμενος ἀπαλλάττοιτο.

"Well," he said, "that's no small accomplishment to take his leave with."

οὐδέ γε, εἶπον, τὰ μέγιστα, μὴ τυχὼν πολιτείας προσηκούσης· ἐν γὰρ προσηκούσῃ αὐτός τε μᾶλλον αὐξήσεται καὶ μετὰ τῶν ἰδίων τὰ κοινὰ σώσει.

"Nor the greatest," I said, "if he doesn't find a constitution that suits him. In a suitable one he himself will grow more, and will preserve the common good along with his own.

τὸ μὲν οὖν τῆς φιλοσοφίας ὧν ἕνεκα διαβολὴν εἴληφεν καὶ ὅτι οὐ δικαίως, ἐμοὶ μὲν δοκεῖ μετρίως εἰρῆσθαι, εἰ μὴ ἔτ' ἄλλο λέγεις τι σύ.

"As for philosophy, then—why it has got its bad reputation, and that the reputation is unjust—I think that's been adequately said, unless you have something more to say."

ἀλλ' οὐδέν, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἔτι λέγω περὶ τούτου· ἀλλὰ τὴν προσήκουσαν αὐτῇ τίνα τῶν νῦν λέγεις πολιτειῶν; [497b]

"No, I've nothing more to say about that," he said. "But which of today's constitutions do you say suits her?" [497b]

497b οὐδ' ἡντινοῦν, εἶπον, ἀλλὰ τοῦτο καὶ ἐπαιτιῶμαι, μηδεμίαν ἀξίαν εἶναι τῶν νῦν κατάστασιν πόλεως φιλοσόφου φύσεως· διὸ καὶ στρέφεσθαί τε καὶ ἀλλοιοῦσθαι αὐτήν, ὥσπερ ξενικὸν σπέρμα ἐν γῇ ἄλλῃ σπειρόμενον ἐξίτηλον εἰς τὸ ἐπιχώριον φιλεῖ κρατούμενον ἰέναι, οὕτω καὶ τοῦτο τὸ γένος νῦν μὲν οὐκ ἴσχειν τὴν αὐτοῦ δύναμιν, ἀλλ' εἰς ἀλλότριον ἦθος ἐκπίπτειν· εἰ δὲ λήψεται τὴν ἀρίστην πολιτείαν, ὥσπερ [497c] καὶ αὐτὸ ἄριστόν ἐστιν, τότε δηλώσει ὅτι τοῦτο μὲν τῷ ὄντι θεῖον ἦν, τὰ δὲ ἄλλα ἀνθρώπινα, τά τε τῶν φύσεων καὶ τῶν ἐπιτηδευμάτων. δῆλος δὴ οὖν εἶ ὅτι μετὰ τοῦτο ἐρήσῃ τίς αὕτη ἡ πολιτεία.

"None at all," I said. "That's exactly my complaint: no city constitution of today is worthy of the philosophical nature. That's why it gets twisted and altered. Just as a foreign seed sown in other soil tends to be overpowered and fade into the local kind, so this breed too does not now keep its own power, but degenerates into an alien character. But if it finds the best constitution, just [497c] as it is itself the best, then it will make plain that it was really divine, and everything else human, both natures and pursuits. Clearly, then, you're going to ask next what this constitution is."

497c οὐκ ἔγνως, ἔφη· οὐ γὰρ τοῦτο ἔμελλον, ἀλλ' εἰ αὐτὴ ἣν ἡμεῖς διεληλύθαμεν οἰκίζοντες τὴν πόλιν ἢ ἄλλη.

"You guessed wrong," he said. "That wasn't what I was going to ask, but whether it's the one we described in founding our city, or another."

τὰ μὲν ἄλλα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, αὕτη· τοῦτο δὲ αὐτὸ ἐρρήθη μὲν καὶ τότε, ὅτι δεήσοι τι ἀεὶ ἐνεῖναι ἐν τῇ πόλει λόγον [497d] ἔχον τῆς πολιτείας τὸν αὐτὸν ὅνπερ καὶ σὺ ὁ νομοθέτης ἔχων τοὺς νόμους ἐτίθεις.

"In other respects it's that one," I said. "But this very point was mentioned then too: that there would always need to be something in the city with the same rationale [497d] for the constitution that you, the lawgiver, had when you laid down the laws."

ἐρρήθη γάρ, ἔφη.

"Yes, it was mentioned," he said.

ἀλλ' οὐχ ἱκανῶς, εἶπον, ἐδηλώθη, φόβῳ ὧν ὑμεῖς ἀντιλαμβανόμενοι δεδηλώκατε μακρὰν καὶ χαλεπὴν αὐτοῦ τὴν ἀπόδειξιν· ἐπεὶ καὶ τὸ λοιπὸν οὐ πάντων ῥᾷστον διελθεῖν.

"But it wasn't made sufficiently clear," I said, "because I was afraid of the objections you all have seized on to show that its demonstration would be long and difficult. And what remains isn't the easiest thing to go through, either."

τὸ ποῖον;

"What is it?"

497d

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τίνα τρόπον μεταχειριζομένη πόλις φιλοσοφίαν οὐ διολεῖται. τὰ γὰρ δὴ μεγάλα πάντα ἐπισφαλῆ, καὶ τὸ λεγόμενον τὰ καλὰ τῷ ὄντι χαλεπά. 497e	"How a city can take up philosophy without being destroyed. For all great things are precarious, and, as the saying goes, fine things really are hard." 497e
	ἀλλ' ὅμως, ἔφη, λαβέτω τέλος ἡ ἀπόδειξις τούτου φανεροῦ γενομένου.	"All the same," he said, "let the demonstration be completed by making this clear."
	οὐ τὸ μὴ βούλεσθαι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀλλ' εἴπερ, τὸ μὴ δύνασθαι διακωλύσει· παρὼν δὲ τήν γ' ἐμὴν προθυμίαν εἴσῃ. σκόπει δὲ καὶ νῦν ὡς προθύμως καὶ παρακινδυνευτικῶς μέλλω λέγειν, ὅτι τοὐναντίον ἢ νῦν δεῖ τοῦ ἐπιτηδεύματος τούτου πόλιν ἅπτεσθαι.	"It won't be lack of will that stops me," I said, "but, if anything, lack of ability. You'll be here to see my eagerness for yourself. And notice even now how eagerly and recklessly I'm about to say that a city should take up this pursuit in the opposite way from how it does now."
	πῶς;	"How so?"
497e	νῦν μέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οἱ καὶ ἁπτόμενοι μειράκια ὄντα ἄρτι 498a ἐκ παίδων τὸ μεταξὺ οἰκονομίας καὶ χρηματισμοῦ πλησιάσαντες αὐτοῦ τῷ χαλεπωτάτῳ ἀπαλλάττονται, οἱ φιλοσοφώτατοι ποιούμενοι—λέγω δὲ χαλεπώτατον τὸ περὶ τοὺς λόγους —ἐν δὲ τῷ ἔπειτα, ἐὰν καὶ ἄλλων τοῦτο πραττόντων παρακαλούμενοι ἐθέλωσιν ἀκροαταὶ γίγνεσθαι, μεγάλα ἡγοῦνται, πάρεργον οἰόμενοι αὐτὸ δεῖν πράττειν· πρὸς δὲ τὸ γῆρας ἐκτὸς δή τινων ὀλίγων ἀποσβέννυνται πολὺ μᾶλλον τοῦ 498b Ἡρακλειτείου ἡλίου, ὅσον αὖθις οὐκ ἐξάπτονται.	"Now," I said, "those who take it up at all are youngsters just out 498a of childhood, who approach it in the interval before running a household and making money, and then, just when they've come to its hardest part, they drop it—and these are counted the most philosophical. By the hardest part I mean the part about arguments. Later, if they're invited to listen when others are doing it, and they agree to, they think that's a great thing, since they believe it should be done as a sideline. And toward old age, with a few exceptions, they're extinguished much more thoroughly than 498b Heraclitus' sun, in that they're never rekindled."
	δεῖ δὲ πῶς; ἔφη.	"So how should it be?" he said.[6]
498b	πᾶν τοὐναντίον· μειράκια μὲν ὄντα καὶ παῖδας μειρακιώδη παιδείαν καὶ φιλοσοφίαν μεταχειρίζεσθαι, τῶν τε σωμάτων, ἐν ᾧ βλαστάνει τε καὶ ἀνδροῦται, εὖ μάλα ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, ὑπηρεσίαν φιλοσοφίᾳ κτωμένους· προϊούσης δὲ τῆς ἡλικίας, ἐν ᾗ ἡ ψυχὴ τελεοῦσθαι ἄρχεται, ἐπιτείνειν τὰ ἐκείνης γυμνάσια· ὅταν δὲ λήγῃ μὲν ἡ ῥώμη, πολιτικῶν δὲ καὶ 498c στρατειῶν ἐκτὸς γίγνηται, τότε ἤδη ἀφέτους νέμεσθαι καὶ μηδὲν ἄλλο πράττειν, ὅτι μὴ πάρεργον, τοὺς μέλλοντας εὐδαιμόνως βιώσεσθαι καὶ τελευτήσαντας τῷ βίῳ τῷ βεβιωμένῳ τὴν ἐκεῖ μοῖραν ἐπιστήσειν πρέπουσαν.	"Quite the opposite. While they're youngsters and children, they should engage in an education and philosophy suited to youth, and take very good care of their bodies while these are growing and becoming a man's, securing them as servants for philosophy. As they advance in age, when the soul begins to reach maturity, they should intensify its exercises. And when their strength fails and they're past political 498c and military service, then at last they should be let loose to graze, and do nothing else except as a sideline—those, that is, who are going to live happily and, after death, crown the life they've lived with a fitting lot in the other world."
498c	ὡς ἀληθῶς μοι δοκεῖς, ἔφη, λέγειν γε προθύμως, ὦ Σώκρατες· οἶμαι μέντοι τοὺς πολλοὺς τῶν ἀκουόντων προθυμότερον ἔτι ἀντιτείνειν οὐδ' ὁπωστιοῦν πεισομένους, ἀπὸ Θρασυμάχου ἀρξαμένους.	"You really do seem to be speaking eagerly, Socrates," he said. "But I think most of your listeners will resist you even more eagerly and won't be per-

6 Heraclitus held that the sun is new each day, so it goes out every evening and is kindled again.

GREEK

μὴ διάβαλλε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐμὲ καὶ Θρασύμαχον ἄρτι φίλους γεγονότας, οὐδὲ πρὸ τοῦ ἐχθροὺς ὄντας. πείρας γὰρ οὐδὲν ἀνήσομεν, ἕως ἂν ἢ πείσωμεν καὶ τοῦτον καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους, ἢ προὔργου τι ποιήσωμεν εἰς ἐκεῖνον τὸν βίον, ὅταν αὖθις γενόμενοι τοῖς τοιούτοις ἐντύχωσι λόγοις.

εἰς μικρόν γ', ἔφη, χρόνον εἴρηκας.

498d εἰς οὐδὲν μὲν οὖν, ἔφην, ὥς γε πρὸς τὸν ἅπαντα. τὸ μέντοι μὴ πείθεσθαι τοῖς λεγομένοις τοὺς πολλοὺς θαῦμα οὐδέν· οὐ γὰρ πώποτε εἶδον γενόμενον τὸ νῦν λεγόμενον, 498e ἀλλὰ πολὺ μᾶλλον τοιαῦτ' ἄττα ῥήματα ἐξεπίτηδες ἀλλήλοις ὡμοιωμένα, ἀλλ' οὐκ ἀπὸ τοῦ αὐτομάτου ὥσπερ νῦν συμπεσόντα.

ἄνδρα δὲ ἀρετῇ παρισωμένον καὶ ὡμοιωμένον μέχρι τοῦ δυνατοῦ τελέως ἔργῳ τε καὶ λόγῳ, δυναστεύοντα 499a ἐν πόλει ἑτέρᾳ τοιαύτῃ, οὐ πώποτε ἑωράκασιν, οὔτε ἕνα οὔτε πλείους. ἢ οἴει;

οὐδαμῶς γε.

499a οὐδέ γε αὖ λόγων, ὦ μακάριε, καλῶν τε καὶ ἐλευθέρων ἱκανῶς ἐπήκοοι γεγόνασιν, οἵων ζητεῖν μὲν τὸ ἀληθὲς συντεταμένως ἐκ παντὸς τρόπου τοῦ γνῶναι χάριν, τὰ δὲ κομψά τε καὶ ἐριστικὰ καὶ μηδαμόσε ἄλλοσε τείνοντα ἢ πρὸς δόξαν καὶ ἔριν καὶ ἐν δίκαις καὶ ἐν ἰδίαις συνουσίαις πόρρωθεν ἀσπαζομένων.

οὐδὲ τούτων, ἔφη.

τούτων τοι χάριν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ ταῦτα προορώμενοι 499b ἡμεῖς τότε καὶ δεδιότες ὅμως ἐλέγομεν, ὑπὸ τἀληθοῦς ἠναγκασμένοι, ὅτι οὔτε πόλις οὔτε πολιτεία οὐδέ γ' ἀνὴρ ὁμοίως μή ποτε γένηται τέλεος, πρὶν ἂν τοῖς φιλοσόφοις τούτοις τοῖς ὀλίγοις καὶ οὐ πονηροῖς, ἀχρήστοις δὲ νῦν κεκλημένοις, ἀνάγκη τις ἐκ τύχης περιβάλῃ, εἴτε βούλονται εἴτε μή, πόλεως ἐπιμεληθῆναι, καὶ τῇ πόλει κατηκόῳ γενέσθαι, ἢ τῶν νῦν ἐν δυναστείαις ἢ βασιλείαις ὄντων ὑέσιν ἢ αὐτοῖς 499c ἔκ τινος θείας ἐπιπνοίας ἀληθινῆς φιλοσοφίας ἀληθινὸς ἔρως ἐμπέσῃ. τούτων δὲ πότερα γενέσθαι ἢ ἀμφότερα ὡς ἄρα ἐστὶν ἀδύνατον, ἐγὼ μὲν οὐδένα φημὶ ἔχειν λόγον. οὕτω γὰρ ἂν ἡμεῖς δικαίως

ENGLISH

suaded in the slightest—starting with Thrasymachus."

"Don't stir up trouble," I said, "between Thrasymachus and me, when we've just 498d become friends—not that we were enemies before. We won't give up trying until we either persuade him and the others, or do something to help them in that other life, when they're born again and come across arguments like these."

"That's a short time you're talking about," he said.

"No time at all," I said, "compared with the whole. Still, it's no wonder that most people aren't persuaded by what we say. They've never seen the thing we're now stating actually come into being, 498e but rather phrases like these, deliberately made to match one another, not falling together by chance as they did just now.

"But a man matched and made like to excellence as perfectly as possible in deed and word, ruling 499a in a city of the same kind—that they have never seen, not one or more than one. Or do you think they have?"

"Not at all."[7]

"Nor, my good friend, have they listened enough to fine and free discussions, the kind that search strenuously and in every way for the truth for the sake of knowing it, and that keep their distance from the clever, contentious stuff that aims at nothing but reputation and strife, whether in lawsuits or in private gatherings."

"No, they haven't," he said.

"That's why," I said, "even though we foresaw this then 499b and were afraid, we still said, compelled by the truth, that no city or constitution, nor any man either, will ever become perfect until some necessity by chance compels these few philosophers—the ones who aren't wicked but are now called useless—to take charge of a city, whether they want to or not, and compels the city to obey them; or until the sons of those now holding power or kingship, or the rulers 499c themselves, are struck by some divine inspiration with a true passion for true philosophy. I say there's no reason to think that either or both of these is impossible.

7 Socrates is poking fun at rhetorical jingles (in Greek, *genomenon/legomenon, parisōmenon/hōmoiōmenon*), the contrived sound-matching associated with Gorgias.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καταγελῴμεθα, ὡς ἄλλως εὐχαῖς ὅμοια λέγοντες. ἢ οὐχ οὕτως;	If it were, we'd rightly be laughed at for saying things that are no better than wishful prayers. Or isn't that so?"
499c	οὕτως. εἰ τοίνυν ἄκροις εἰς φιλοσοφίαν πόλεώς τις ἀνάγκη ἐπιμεληθῆναι ἢ γέγονεν ἐν τῷ ἀπείρῳ τῷ παρεληλυθότι χρόνῳ ἢ καὶ νῦν ἔστιν ἔν τινι βαρβαρικῷ τόπῳ, πόρρω που [499d] ἐκτὸς ὄντι τῆς ἡμετέρας ἐπόψεως, ἢ καὶ ἔπειτα γενήσεται, περὶ τούτου ἕτοιμοι τῷ λόγῳ διαμάχεσθαι, ὡς γέγονεν ἡ εἰρημένη πολιτεία καὶ ἔστιν καὶ γενήσεταί γε, ὅταν αὕτη ἡ Μοῦσα πόλεως ἐγκρατὴς γένηται. οὐ γὰρ ἀδύνατος γενέσθαι, οὐδ' ἡμεῖς ἀδύνατα λέγομεν· χαλεπὰ δὲ καὶ παρ' ἡμῶν ὁμολογεῖται. καὶ ἐμοί, ἔφη, οὕτω δοκεῖ.	"It is." "So if, in the infinite time that has passed, some necessity has compelled those who are supreme in philosophy to take charge of a city, or does so now in some non-Greek land far [499d] beyond our view, or will do so hereafter, we're ready to fight it out in argument that the constitution we've described has existed, exists, and will exist whenever this Muse gains control of a city. It isn't impossible for it to come about, and we're not talking about impossibilities. That it's difficult, we ourselves admit." "I think so too," he said.
499d	τοῖς δὲ πολλοῖς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι οὐκ αὖ δοκεῖ, ἐρεῖς; ἴσως, ἔφη. ὦ μακάριε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μὴ πάνυ οὕτω τῶν πολλῶν κατηγόρει. [499e] ἀλλοίαν τοι δόξαν ἕξουσιν, ἐὰν αὐτοῖς μὴ φιλονικῶν ἀλλὰ παραμυθούμενος καὶ ἀπολυόμενος τὴν τῆς φιλομαθείας διαβολὴν ἐνδεικνύῃ οὓς λέγεις τοὺς φιλοσόφους, καὶ διορίζῃ [500a] ὥσπερ ἄρτι τήν τε φύσιν αὐτῶν καὶ τὴν ἐπιτήδευσιν, ἵνα μὴ ἡγῶνταί σε λέγειν οὓς αὐτοὶ οἴονται.	"But you'll tell me," I said, "that most people don't think so?" "Perhaps," he said. "My good friend," I said, "don't be so very hard on the many. [499e] They'll have a different opinion if, instead of picking a fight, you soothe them and try to clear away the slander against the love of learning, pointing out whom you mean by philosophers and defining, [500a] as we did just now, their nature and their pursuit, so that they don't think you mean the people they have in mind.
500a	ἢ καὶ ἐὰν οὕτω θεῶνται, ἀλλοίαν τοι φήσεις αὐτοὺς δόξαν λήψεσθαι καὶ ἄλλα ἀποκρινεῖσθαι. ἢ οἴει τινὰ χαλεπαίνειν τῷ μὴ χαλεπῷ ἢ φθονεῖν τῷ μὴ φθονερῷ ἄφθονόν τε καὶ πρᾷον ὄντα; ἐγὼ μὲν γάρ σε προφθάσας λέγω ὅτι ἐν ὀλίγοις τισὶν ἡγοῦμαι, ἀλλ' οὐκ ἐν τῷ πλήθει, χαλεπὴν οὕτω φύσιν γίγνεσθαι. καὶ ἐγὼ ἀμέλει, ἔφη, συνοίομαι. [500b]	"Or even if they do look at it that way, won't you say they'll take a different view and give different answers? Do you think anyone is harsh toward someone who isn't harsh, or envious of someone who isn't envious, when he himself is free of envy and gentle? I'll get in ahead of you and say that I think such a harsh nature is found in a few people, not in the majority." "And I certainly agree," he said. [500b]

PHILOSOPHERS AS RULERS

Socrates argues philosopher-rulers are possible and must take the longer way of study.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
500b	**SOCRATES** οὐκοῦν καὶ αὐτὸ τοῦτο συνοίει, τοῦ χαλεπῶς πρὸς φιλοσοφίαν τοὺς πολλοὺς διακεῖσθαι ἐκείνους αἰτίους εἶναι τοὺς ἔξωθεν οὐ προσῆκον ἐπεισκεκωμακότας, λοιδορουμένους τε αὐτοῖς καὶ φιλαπεχθημόνως ἔχοντας καὶ ἀεὶ περὶ ἀνθρώπων τοὺς	**SOCRATES** "Then do you also agree about this: that the cause of the many's hostility toward philosophy is those outsiders who have crashed in where they don't belong, like drunken revelers, abusing one another, spoiling for a fight, and al-

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	λόγους ποιουμένους, ἥκιστα φιλοσοφίᾳ πρέπον ποιοῦντας;	ways making people the subject of their talk—doing what least befits philosophy?"
	πολύ γ', ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
	οὐδὲ γάρ που, ὦ Ἀδείμαντε, σχολὴ τῷ γε ὡς ἀληθῶς πρὸς τοῖς οὖσι τὴν διάνοιαν ἔχοντι κάτω βλέπειν εἰς ἀνθρώπων [500c] πραγματείας, καὶ μαχόμενον αὐτοῖς φθόνου τε καὶ δυσμενείας ἐμπίμπλασθαι, ἀλλ' εἰς τεταγμένα ἄττα καὶ κατὰ ταὐτὰ ἀεὶ ἔχοντα ὁρῶντας καὶ θεωμένους οὔτ' ἀδικοῦντα οὔτ' ἀδικούμενα ὑπ' ἀλλήλων, κόσμῳ δὲ πάντα καὶ κατὰ λόγον ἔχοντα, ταῦτα μιμεῖσθαί τε καὶ ὅτι μάλιστα ἀφομοιοῦσθαι. ἢ οἴει τινὰ μηχανὴν εἶναι, ὅτῳ τις ὁμιλεῖ ἀγάμενος, μὴ μιμεῖσθαι ἐκεῖνο;	"For surely, Adeimantus, someone whose thought is truly directed toward the things that are has no leisure to look down at human [500c] affairs, and to fight with people and be filled with envy and ill will. Instead, looking at and contemplating things that are ordered and always the same, that neither do wrong nor are wronged by one another, but are all in order and in accordance with reason, he imitates them and makes himself as like them as he can. Or do you think there's any way someone can avoid imitating what he admires and associates with?"
	ἀδύνατον, ἔφη.	"Impossible," he said.
500c	θείῳ δὴ καὶ κοσμίῳ ὅ γε φιλόσοφος ὁμιλῶν κόσμιός τε [500d] καὶ θεῖος εἰς τὸ δυνατὸν ἀνθρώπῳ γίγνεται· διαβολὴ δ' ἐν πᾶσι πολλή.	"So the philosopher, associating with what is divine and orderly, becomes orderly [500d] and divine himself, as far as a human being can. But there's plenty of slander everywhere."
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν.	"Absolutely."
	ἂν οὖν τις, εἶπον, αὐτῷ ἀνάγκη γένηται ἃ ἐκεῖ ὁρᾷ μελετῆσαι εἰς ἀνθρώπων ἤθη καὶ ἰδίᾳ καὶ δημοσίᾳ τιθέναι καὶ μὴ μόνον ἑαυτὸν πλάττειν, ἆρα κακὸν δημιουργὸν αὐτὸν οἴει γενήσεσθαι σωφροσύνης τε καὶ δικαιοσύνης καὶ συμπάσης τῆς δημοτικῆς ἀρετῆς;	"Now if some necessity arises for him," I said, "to practice putting what he sees there into people's characters, both privately and publicly, instead of shaping only himself, do you think he'll prove a poor craftsman of moderation, justice and civic excellence as a whole?"
	ἥκιστά γε, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Not at all," he said.
500d	ἀλλ' ἐὰν δὴ αἴσθωνται οἱ πολλοὶ ὅτι ἀληθῆ περὶ αὐτοῦ [500e] λέγομεν, χαλεπανοῦσι δὴ τοῖς φιλοσόφοις καὶ ἀπιστήσουσιν ἡμῖν λέγουσιν ὡς οὐκ ἄν ποτε ἄλλως εὐδαιμονήσειε πόλις, εἰ μὴ αὐτὴν διαγράψειαν οἱ τῷ θείῳ παραδείγματι χρώμενοι ζωγράφοι;	"But if the many realize that what we're saying about him [500e] is true, will they really be harsh with philosophers and distrust us when we say that a city could never be happy unless its outlines were drawn by painters using the divine model?"
	οὐ χαλεπανοῦσιν, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἐάνπερ αἴσθωνται.	"They won't be harsh," he said, "if they do realize it.
	ἀλλὰ δὴ [501a] τίνα λέγεις τρόπον τῆς διαγραφῆς;	"But [501a] what way of drawing it do you mean?"
501a	λαβόντες, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὥσπερ πίνακα πόλιν τε καὶ ἤθη ἀνθρώπων, πρῶτον μὲν καθαρὰν ποιήσειαν ἄν, ὃ οὐ πάνυ ῥᾴδιον· ἀλλ' οἶσθ' ὅτι τούτῳ ἂν εὐθὺς τῶν ἄλλων διενέγκοιεν, τῷ μήτε ἰδιώτου μήτε πόλεως ἐθελῆσαι ἂν ἅψασθαι μηδὲ γράφειν νόμους, πρὶν ἢ παραλαβεῖν καθαρὰν ἢ αὐτοὶ ποιῆσαι.	"They would take a city and people's characters," I said, "as if they were a painter's panel, and first wipe it clean—which isn't at all easy. But you know that right away they'd differ from everyone else in this: they'd be unwilling to touch either an individual or a city, or to write laws, until they had either received it clean or made it clean themselves."
	καὶ ὀρθῶς γ', ἔφη.	"And rightly," he said.
	οὐκοῦν μετὰ ταῦτα οἴει ὑπογράψασθαι ἂν τὸ σχῆμα τῆς πολιτείας;	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τί μήν; [501b]	"Then after that, don't you think they'd sketch in the outline of the constitution?"
		"Of course." [501b]
501b	ἔπειτα οἶμαι ἀπεργαζόμενοι πυκνὰ ἂν ἑκατέρωσ' ἀποβλέποιεν, πρός τε τὸ φύσει δίκαιον καὶ καλὸν καὶ σῶφρον καὶ πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα, καὶ πρὸς ἐκεῖν' αὖ τὸ ἐν τοῖς ἀνθρώποις ἐμποιοῖεν, συμμειγνύντες τε καὶ κεραννύντες ἐκ τῶν ἐπιτηδευμάτων τὸ ἀνδρείκελον, ἀπ' ἐκείνου τεκμαιρόμενοι, ὃ δὴ καὶ Ὅμηρος ἐκάλεσεν ἐν τοῖς ἀνθρώποις ἐγγιγνόμενον θεοειδές τε καὶ θεοείκελον.	"Next, I imagine, as they work, they'd look often in both directions: toward what is by nature just, beautiful, moderate and all such things, and in turn toward what they're putting into human beings, mixing and blending the pursuits into a man-like tint, taking their cue from what Homer, too, called 'godlike' and 'the image of the gods' when it appears in human beings."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.	"Right," he said.
	καὶ τὸ μὲν ἂν οἶμαι ἐξαλείφοιεν, τὸ δὲ πάλιν ἐγγράφοιεν, [501c] ἕως ὅτι μάλιστα ἀνθρώπεια ἤθη εἰς ὅσον ἐνδέχεται θεοφιλῆ ποιήσειαν.	"And I suppose they'd rub out one thing and paint another in again, [501c] until they had made human characters as dear to the gods as they can possibly be."
	καλλίστη γοῦν ἄν, ἔφη, ἡ γραφὴ γένοιτο.	"That would certainly make a very beautiful painting," he said.[8]
501c	ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πείθομέν πῃ ἐκείνους, οὓς διατεταμένους ἐφ' ἡμᾶς ἔφησθα ἰέναι, ὡς τοιοῦτός ἐστι πολιτειῶν ζωγράφος ὃν τότ' ἐπῃνοῦμεν πρὸς αὐτούς, δι' ὃν ἐκεῖνοι ἐχαλέπαινον ὅτι τὰς πόλεις αὐτῷ παρεδίδομεν, καί τι μᾶλλον αὐτὸ νῦν ἀκούοντες πραΰνονται;	"So are we somehow persuading those you said were charging at us with all their might," I said, "that this is the sort of painter of constitutions we were praising to them before—the one they were angry about because we were handing cities over to him? Are they any calmer hearing it now?"
	καὶ πολύ γε, ἦ δ' ὅς, εἰ σωφρονοῦσιν. [501d]	"Much calmer," he said, "if they're sensible." [501d]
	πῇ γὰρ δὴ ἔξουσιν ἀμφισβητῆσαι; πότερον μὴ τοῦ ὄντος τε καὶ ἀληθείας ἐραστὰς εἶναι τοὺς φιλοσόφους;	"Yes, for on what ground will they be able to dispute it? That philosophers aren't lovers of what is and of truth?"
	ἄτοπον μεντἄν, ἔφη, εἴη.	"That would be absurd," he said.
	ἀλλὰ μὴ τὴν φύσιν αὐτῶν οἰκείαν εἶναι τοῦ ἀρίστου, ἣν ἡμεῖς διήλθομεν;	"Or that their nature, as we described it, isn't akin to the best?"
	οὐδὲ τοῦτο.	"Not that either."
501d	τί δέ; τὴν τοιαύτην τυχοῦσαν τῶν προσηκόντων ἐπιτηδευμάτων οὐκ ἀγαθὴν τελέως ἔσεσθαι καὶ φιλόσοφον, εἴπερ τινὰ ἄλλην; ἢ ἐκείνους φήσει μᾶλλον, οὓς ἡμεῖς ἀφωρίσαμεν; [501e]	"Well then, won't such a nature, when it gets the pursuits suited to it, be completely good and philosophical, if any is? Or will anyone say that the ones we excluded are more so?" [501e]
	οὐ δήπου.	"Surely not."
	ἔτι οὖν ἀγριανοῦσι λεγόντων ἡμῶν ὅτι πρὶν ἂν πόλεως τὸ φιλόσοφον γένος ἐγκρατὲς γένηται, οὔτε πόλει οὔτε πολίταις κακῶν παῦλα ἔσται, οὐδὲ ἡ πολιτεία ἣν μυθολογοῦμεν λόγῳ ἔργῳ τέλος λήψεται;	"So will they still be enraged when we say that until the philosophical class gains control of a city, there will be no rest from evils for city or citizens, and the constitution we're telling as a story in words will not be completed in fact?"
	ἴσως, ἔφη, ἧττον.	"Less so, perhaps," he said.

8 "Man-like" (*andreikelon*) was a painters' term for flesh color; Socrates plays it off Homer's epithet *theoeikelos*, "godlike."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	βούλει οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μὴ ἧττον φῶμεν αὐτοὺς ἀλλὰ [502a] παντάπασι πρᾴους γεγονέναι καὶ πεπεῖσθαι, ἵνα, εἰ μή τι, ἀλλὰ αἰσχυνθέντες ὁμολογήσωσιν;	"Would you like us to say not that they're less enraged but [502a] that they've become completely gentle and been persuaded, so that, if nothing else, they'll agree out of shame?"
502a	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Certainly," he said.
	οὗτοι μὲν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοῦτο πεπεισμένοι ἔστων· τοῦδε δὲ πέρι τις ἀμφισβητήσει, ὡς οὐκ ἂν τύχοιεν γενόμενοι βασιλέων ἔκγονοι ἢ δυναστῶν τὰς φύσεις φιλόσοφοι;	"Then let's take it that they've been persuaded of this," I said. "Now will anyone dispute this: that the offspring of kings or rulers might happen to be born philosophers by nature?"
	οὐδ' ἂν εἷς, ἔφη.	"Not a single person," he said.
	τοιούτους δὲ γενομένους ὡς πολλὴ ἀνάγκη διαφθαρῆναι, ἔχει τις λέγειν; ὡς μὲν γὰρ χαλεπὸν σωθῆναι, καὶ ἡμεῖς [502b] συγχωροῦμεν· ὡς δὲ ἐν παντὶ τῷ χρόνῳ τῶν πάντων οὐδέποτε οὐδ' ἂν εἷς σωθείη, ἔσθ' ὅστις ἀμφισβητήσειε;	"And can anyone claim that once born such, they're absolutely bound to be corrupted? That it's hard for them to be saved, we too [502b] admit. But that in all of time not a single one of them all could ever be saved—is there anyone who would argue that?"
	καὶ πῶς;	"How could there be?"
502b	ἀλλὰ μήν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἷς ἱκανὸς γενόμενος, πόλιν ἔχων πειθομένην, πάντ' ἐπιτελέσαι τὰ νῦν ἀπιστούμενα.	"But surely," I said, "one is enough, if he has a city that obeys him, to accomplish everything that's now disbelieved."
	ἱκανὸς γάρ, ἔφη.	"Yes, one is enough," he said.
	ἄρχοντος γάρ που, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τιθέντος τοὺς νόμους καὶ τὰ ἐπιτηδεύματα ἃ διεληλύθαμεν, οὐ δήπου ἀδύνατον ἐθέλειν ποιεῖν τοὺς πολίτας.	"For if a ruler lays down the laws and pursuits we've described," I said, "it's surely not impossible that the citizens will be willing to carry them out."
	οὐδ' ὁπωστιοῦν.	"Not at all."
	ἀλλὰ δή, ἅπερ ἡμῖν δοκεῖ, δόξαι καὶ ἄλλοις θαυμαστόν τι καὶ ἀδύνατον; [502c]	"And would it be astonishing or impossible that what we think should seem right to others too?" [502c]
	οὐκ οἶμαι ἔγωγε, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"I don't think so," he said.
	καὶ μὴν ὅτι γε βέλτιστα, εἴπερ δυνατά, ἱκανῶς ἐν τοῖς ἔμπροσθεν, ὡς ἐγᾦμαι, διήλθομεν.	"And that these things are best, if they're possible, we've gone through adequately earlier, I believe."
	ἱκανῶς γάρ.	"Yes, adequately."
502c	νῦν δή, ὡς ἔοικεν, συμβαίνει ἡμῖν περὶ τῆς νομοθεσίας ἄριστα μὲν εἶναι ἃ λέγομεν, εἰ γένοιτο, χαλεπὰ δὲ γενέσθαι, οὐ μέντοι ἀδύνατά γε.	"So now, it seems, our conclusion about the legislation is that what we're describing is best, if it could come about, and that it's difficult to bring about, but not impossible."
	συμβαίνει γάρ, ἔφη.	"That is the conclusion," he said.
	οὐκοῦν ἐπειδὴ τοῦτο μόγις τέλος ἔσχεν, τὰ ἐπίλοιπα δὴ μετὰ τοῦτο λεκτέον, τίνα τρόπον ἡμῖν καὶ ἐκ τίνων μαθημάτων [502d] τε καὶ ἐπιτηδευμάτων οἱ σωτῆρες ἐνέσονται τῆς πολιτείας, καὶ κατὰ ποίας ἡλικίας ἕκαστοι ἑκάστων ἁπτόμενοι;	"Then since this has finally, with difficulty, been brought to an end, we must discuss what remains: in what way, and through what studies [502d] and pursuits, the saviors of the constitution will come to be present in it for us, and at what ages each will take up each."
	λεκτέον μέντοι, ἔφη.	"Yes, we must discuss that," he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
502d	οὐδέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ σοφόν μοι ἐγένετο τήν τε τῶν γυναικῶν τῆς κτήσεως δυσχέρειαν ἐν τῷ πρόσθεν παραλιπόντι καὶ παιδογονίαν καὶ τὴν τῶν ἀρχόντων κατάστασιν, εἰδότι ὡς ἐπίφθονός τε καὶ χαλεπὴ γίγνεσθαι ἡ παντελῶς ἀληθής· νῦν γὰρ οὐδὲν ἧττον ἦλθεν τὸ δεῖν αὐτὰ διελθεῖν. [502e] καὶ τὰ μὲν δὴ τῶν γυναικῶν τε καὶ παίδων πεπέρανται, τὸ δὲ τῶν ἀρχόντων ὥσπερ ἐξ ἀρχῆς μετελθεῖν δεῖ.	"My cleverness got me nowhere," I said, "when I left aside earlier the troublesome business of the possession of women, and of producing children, and the appointment of rulers, knowing that the completely true arrangement would provoke envy and be hard to bring about. For now the need to go through them has come around no less. [502e] The matters concerning women and children have been finished, but the question of the rulers has to be taken up again as if from the beginning.
502e	ἐλέγομεν [503a] δ', εἰ μνημονεύεις, δεῖν αὐτοὺς φιλοπόλιδάς τε φαίνεσθαι, βασανιζομένους ἐν ἡδοναῖς τε καὶ λύπαις, καὶ τὸ δόγμα τοῦτο μήτ' ἐν πόνοις μήτ' ἐν φόβοις μήτ' ἐν ἄλλῃ μηδεμιᾷ μεταβολῇ φαίνεσθαι ἐκβάλλοντας, ἢ τὸν ἀδυνατοῦντα ἀποκριτέον, τὸν δὲ πανταχοῦ ἀκήρατον ἐκβαίνοντα ὥσπερ χρυσὸν ἐν πυρὶ βασανιζόμενον, στατέον ἄρχοντα καὶ γέρα δοτέον καὶ ζῶντι καὶ τελευτήσαντι καὶ ἆθλα. τοιαῦτ' ἄττα ἦν τὰ λεγόμενα παρεξιόντος καὶ παρακαλυπτομένου τοῦ [503b] λόγου, πεφοβημένου κινεῖν τὸ νῦν παρόν. ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη, λέγεις· μέμνημαι γάρ.	"We said, [503a] if you remember, that they must show themselves lovers of their city, tested in pleasures and pains, and must be seen not to throw away this conviction in labors or fears or any other reversal. Whoever can't do this must be rejected, but whoever comes through pure in every way, like gold tested in fire, must be appointed ruler and given privileges and prizes both while alive and after death. Something like this is what was said, while the argument slipped past with its face veiled, [503b] afraid to stir up the question now before us." "What you say is very true," he said. "I remember."
503b	ὄκνος γάρ, ἔφην, ὦ φίλε, ἐγώ, εἰπεῖν τὰ νῦν ἀποτετολμημένα· νῦν δὲ τοῦτο μὲν τετολμήσθω εἰπεῖν, ὅτι τοὺς ἀκριβεστάτους φύλακας φιλοσόφους δεῖ καθιστάναι. εἰρήσθω γάρ, ἔφη. νόησον δὴ ὡς εἰκότως ὀλίγοι ἔσονταί σοι· ἢν γὰρ διήλθομεν φύσιν δεῖν ὑπάρχειν αὐτοῖς, εἰς ταὐτὸν συμφύεσθαι αὐτῆς τὰ μέρη ὀλιγάκις ἐθέλει, τὰ πολλὰ δὲ διεσπασμένη φύεται. [503c] πῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις;	"Yes, my friend," I said, "I shrank from saying what I've now dared to say. But now let this be ventured: that we must establish philosophers as the guardians in the strictest sense." "Let it be said," he said. "Consider, then, how few you're likely to have. For the parts of the nature we described, which they must have, seldom tend to grow together into one; mostly it grows up torn apart." [503c] "How do you mean?" he said.
503c	εὐμαθεῖς καὶ μνήμονες καὶ ἀγχίνοι καὶ ὀξεῖς καὶ ὅσα ἄλλα τούτοις ἕπεται οἶσθ' ὅτι οὐκ ἐθέλουσιν ἅμα φύεσθαι καὶ νεανικοί τε καὶ μεγαλοπρεπεῖς τὰς διανοίας οἷοι κοσμίως μετὰ ἡσυχίας καὶ βεβαιότητος ἐθέλειν ζῆν, ἀλλ' οἱ τοιοῦτοι ὑπὸ ὀξύτητος φέρονται ὅπῃ ἂν τύχωσιν, καὶ τὸ βέβαιον ἅπαν αὐτῶν ἐξοίχεται. ἀληθῆ, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"You know that people who are quick to learn, have good memories, and are shrewd and sharp, with all that goes along with these, don't usually grow up to be at the same time youthfully vigorous and grand in their thinking and the kind who are willing to live in an orderly way, with quiet and stability. Instead, such people are carried wherever their sharpness takes them, and all stability goes out of them." "That's true," he said.
	οὐκοῦν τὰ βέβαια αὖ ταῦτα ἤθη καὶ οὐκ εὐμετάβολα, οἷς [503d] ἄν τις μᾶλλον ὡς πιστοῖς χρήσαιτο, καὶ ἐν τῷ πολέμῳ	"And again, those steady characters that don't change easily, whom [503d] one would rather rely on

GREEK

πρὸς τοὺς φόβους δυσκίνητα ὄντα, πρὸς τὰς μαθήσεις αὖ ποιεῖ ταὐτόν· δυσκινήτως ἔχει καὶ δυσμαθῶς ὥσπερ ἀπονεναρκωμένα, καὶ ὕπνου τε καὶ χάσμης ἐμπίμπλανται, ὅταν τι δέῃ τοιοῦτον διαπονεῖν.

ἔστι ταῦτα, ἔφη.

ἡμεῖς δέ γέ φαμεν ἀμφοτέρων δεῖν εὖ τε καὶ καλῶς μετέχειν, ἢ μήτε παιδείας τῆς ἀκριβεστάτης δεῖν αὐτῷ μεταδιδόναι μήτε τιμῆς μήτε ἀρχῆς.

ὀρθῶς, ἦ δ' ὅς.

οὐκοῦν σπάνιον αὐτὸ οἴει ἔσεσθαι;

503d πῶς δ' οὔ; 503e

βασανιστέον δὴ ἔν τε οἷς τότε ἐλέγομεν πόνοις τε καὶ φόβοις καὶ ἡδοναῖς, καὶ ἔτι δὴ ὃ τότε παρεῖμεν νῦν λέγομεν, ὅτι καὶ ἐν μαθήμασι πολλοῖς γυμνάζειν δεῖ, σκοποῦντας εἰ καὶ τὰ μέγιστα μαθήματα δυνατὴ ἔσται ἐνεγκεῖν εἴτε καὶ 504a ἀποδειλιάσει, ὥσπερ οἱ ἐν τοῖς ἄλλοις ἀποδειλιῶντες.

πρέπει γέ τοι δή, ἔφη, οὕτω σκοπεῖν. ἀλλὰ ποῖα δὴ λέγεις μαθήματα μέγιστα;

μνημονεύεις μέν που, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι τριττὰ εἴδη ψυχῆς διαστησάμενοι συνεβιβάζομεν δικαιοσύνης τε πέρι καὶ σωφροσύνης καὶ ἀνδρείας καὶ σοφίας ὃ ἕκαστον εἴη.

504a μὴ γὰρ μνημονεύων, ἔφη, τὰ λοιπὰ ἂν εἴην δίκαιος μὴ ἀκούειν.

ἦ καὶ τὸ προρρηθὲν αὐτῶν;

τὸ ποῖον δή; 504b

ἐλέγομέν που ὅτι ὡς μὲν δυνατὸν ἦν κάλλιστα αὐτὰ κατιδεῖν ἄλλη μακροτέρα εἴη περίοδος, ἣν περιελθόντι καταφανῆ γίγνοιτο, τῶν μέντοι ἔμπροσθεν προειρημένων ἑπομένας ἀποδείξεις οἷόν τ' εἴη προσάψαι. καὶ ὑμεῖς ἐξαρκεῖν ἔφατε, καὶ οὕτω δὴ ἐρρήθη τὰ τότε τῆς μὲν ἀκριβείας, ὡς ἐμοὶ ἐφαίνετο, ἐλλιπῆ, εἰ δὲ ὑμῖν ἀρεσκόντως, ὑμεῖς ἂν τοῦτο εἴποιτε.

ἀλλ' ἔμοιγε, ἔφη, μετρίως· ἐφαίνετο μὴν καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις. 504c

504c ἀλλ', ὦ φίλε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μέτρον τῶν τοιούτων ἀπολεῖπον καὶ ὁτιοῦν τοῦ ὄντος οὐ πάνυ μετρίως γίγνεται· ἀτελὲς

ENGLISH

as trustworthy, and who in war are hard to move to fear—they do the same thing when it comes to learning. They're hard to move and slow to learn, as if they'd been numbed, and they're filled with sleep and yawning whenever they have to work hard at anything of that sort."

"That's so," he said.

"But we say that one must have a good and fine share of both, or else he must not be given the most rigorous education, or honor, or rule."

"Right," he said.

"Don't you think this will be rare?"

"Of course." 503e

"So he must be tested in the labors, fears and pleasures we mentioned then, and we now add what we passed over then: he must also be exercised in many studies, as we watch whether his nature will be able to bear the greatest studies or will 504a lose heart, like those who lose heart in the other trials."

"It's certainly right to examine it that way," he said. "But which do you mean by the greatest studies?"

"You remember, I suppose," I said, "that we distinguished three forms in the soul and pieced together what justice, moderation, courage and wisdom each are."

"If I didn't remember," he said, "I'd deserve not to hear the rest."

"And what was said before that, too?"

"What was that?" 504b

"We said, I think, that to see them in the finest way possible there was another, longer road, and that they would become clear to someone who had traveled it, but that it was possible to add demonstrations in keeping with what had been said before. You all said that was enough, and so what was said then was, as it seemed to me, lacking in precision; whether it satisfied you, you'd be the ones to say."

"Well, to me it seemed a fair measure," he said, "and to the others too." 504c

"But, my friend," I said, "a measure of such things that falls short of what is in any way at all is no fair measure. Nothing incomplete is the measure

GREEK

ENGLISH

γὰρ οὐδὲν οὐδενὸς μέτρον. δοκεῖ δ' ἐνίοτέ τισιν ἱκανῶς ἤδη ἔχειν καὶ οὐδὲν δεῖν περαιτέρω ζητεῖν.

καὶ μάλ', ἔφη, συχνοὶ πάσχουσιν αὐτὸ διὰ ῥᾳθυμίαν.

τούτου δέ γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοῦ παθήματος ἥκιστα προσδεῖ φύλακι πόλεώς τε καὶ νόμων.

εἰκός, ἦ δ' ὅς.

of anything. Yet people sometimes think they already have enough and there's no need to look any further."

"Yes," he said, "plenty of people feel that way, out of laziness."

"But that's a feeling," I said, "that a guardian of a city and its laws can least afford."

"That makes sense," he said.

τὴν μακροτέραν τοίνυν, ὦ ἑταῖρε, ἔφην, περιιτέον τῷ [504d] τοιούτῳ, καὶ οὐχ ἧττον μανθάνοντι πονητέον ἢ γυμναζομένῳ· ἥ, ὃ νυνδὴ ἐλέγομεν, τοῦ μεγίστου τε καὶ μάλιστα προσήκοντος μαθήματος ἐπὶ τέλος οὔποτε ἥξει.

οὐ γὰρ ταῦτα, ἔφη, μέγιστα, ἀλλ' ἔτι τι μεῖζον δικαιοσύνης τε καὶ ὧν διήλθομεν;

"Then someone like that, my friend," I said, "has to go the longer way round, [504d] and has to work as hard at learning as at physical training. Otherwise, as we were just saying, he'll never reach the end of the greatest and most fitting subject of study."

"What?" he said. "Aren't these the greatest? Is there something still greater than justice and the other things we went through?"

THE FORM OF THE GOOD

Socrates says the form of the good is the greatest object of study, but will not define it.

GREEK

ENGLISH

504d **SOCRATES** καὶ μεῖζον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ αὐτῶν τούτων οὐχ ὑπογραφὴν δεῖ ὥσπερ νῦν θεάσασθαι, ἀλλὰ τὴν τελεωτάτην ἀπεργασίαν μὴ παριέναι. ἢ οὐ γελοῖον ἐπὶ μὲν ἄλλοις σμικροῦ ἀξίοις [504e] πᾶν ποιεῖν συντεινομένους ὅπως ὅτι ἀκριβέστατα καὶ καθαρώτατα ἕξει, τῶν δὲ μεγίστων μὴ μεγίστας ἀξιοῦν εἶναι καὶ τὰς ἀκριβείας;

καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, ἄξιον τὸ διανόημα· ὃ μέντοι μέγιστον μάθημα καὶ περὶ ὅτι αὐτὸ λέγεις, οἴει τιν' ἄν σε, ἔφη, ἀφεῖναι μὴ ἐρωτήσαντα τί ἐστιν;

οὐ πάνυ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀλλὰ καὶ σὺ ἐρώτα.

SOCRATES "There is something greater," I said. "And even with these themselves, we mustn't look at a sketch, as we did just now; we mustn't settle for anything short of the most finished work. Isn't it absurd to strain every nerve over other things of little worth [504e] so as to get them as precise and pure as possible, and not to think that the greatest things deserve the greatest precision?"

"A thought very much worth having," he said. "But as for what you call the greatest subject of study, and what it's about—do you think anyone's going to let you go without asking what it is?"

"Not at all," I said. "Go ahead and ask it yourself.

504e πάντως αὐτὸ οὐκ ὀλιγάκις ἀκήκοας, νῦν δὲ ἢ οὐκ ἐννοεῖς ἢ αὖ διανοῇ [505a] ἐμοὶ πράγματα παρέχειν ἀντιλαμβανόμενος. οἶμαι δὲ τοῦτο μᾶλλον· ἐπεὶ ὅτι γε ἡ τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ ἰδέα μέγιστον μάθημα, πολλάκις ἀκήκοας, ᾗ δὴ καὶ δίκαια καὶ τἆλλα προσχρησάμενα χρήσιμα καὶ ὠφέλιμα γίγνεται. καὶ νῦν σχεδὸν οἶσθ' ὅτι μέλλω τοῦτο λέγειν, καὶ πρὸς τούτῳ ὅτι αὐτὴν οὐχ ἱκανῶς ἴσμεν· εἰ δὲ μὴ ἴσμεν, ἄνευ δὲ ταύτης εἰ ὅτι μάλιστα τἆλλα ἐπισταίμεθα, οἶσθ' ὅτι οὐδὲν ἡμῖν ὄφελος, ὥσπερ οὐδ' εἰ [505b] κεκτήμεθά τι ἄνευ τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ. ἢ οἴει τι πλέον εἶναι πᾶσαν κτῆσιν ἐκτῆσθαι, μὴ μέντοι ἀγαθήν; ἢ πάντα

"You've certainly heard it many times. But right now either you're not paying attention, or else you mean [505a] to make trouble for me by seizing on what I say. I think it's more the latter. You've often heard that the form of the good is the greatest subject of study: it is by making use of it that just things and everything else become useful and beneficial. And you pretty well know by now that this is what I'm going to say, and in addition that we don't know it adequately. And if we don't know it, then even if we knew everything else as well as

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τἆλλα φρονεῖν ἄνευ τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ, καλὸν δὲ καὶ ἀγαθὸν μηδὲν φρονεῖν;	could be, without it—you know this—it would do us no good, just as it would do us no good [505b] to possess anything without the good. Or do you think there's any advantage in possessing every possession, if it isn't good? Or in understanding everything else without the good, while understanding nothing fine and good?"
505b	μὰ Δί' οὐκ ἔγωγ', ἔφη.	"No, by Zeus, I don't," he said.
	ἀλλὰ μὴν καὶ τόδε γε οἶσθα, ὅτι τοῖς μὲν πολλοῖς ἡδονὴ δοκεῖ εἶναι τὸ ἀγαθόν, τοῖς δὲ κομψοτέροις φρόνησις.	"But you surely also know this: most people think the good is pleasure, while the more refined think it's understanding."
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	καὶ ὅτι γε, ὦ φίλε, οἱ τοῦτο ἡγούμενοι οὐκ ἔχουσι δεῖξαι ἥτις φρόνησις, ἀλλ' ἀναγκάζονται τελευτῶντες τὴν τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ φάναι.	"And, my friend, that those who hold the latter view can't show what understanding it is, but end up being forced to say it's understanding of the good."
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, γελοίως. [505c]	"Yes," he said, "which is quite ridiculous." [505c]
505c	πῶς γὰρ οὐχί, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἰ ὀνειδίζοντές γε ὅτι οὐκ ἴσμεν τὸ ἀγαθὸν λέγουσι πάλιν ὡς εἰδόσιν; φρόνησιν γὰρ αὐτό φασιν εἶναι ἀγαθοῦ, ὡς αὖ συνιέντων ἡμῶν ὅτι λέγουσιν, ἐπειδὰν τὸ τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ φθέγξωνται ὄνομα.	"How could it not be," I said, "when they reproach us for not knowing the good and then talk to us as though we did know it? They say it's understanding of the good, as if we understood what they mean as soon as they utter the word 'good.'"
	ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη.	"Very true," he said.
	τί δὲ οἱ τὴν ἡδονὴν ἀγαθὸν ὁριζόμενοι; μῶν μή τι ἐλάττονος πλάνης ἔμπλεῳ τῶν ἑτέρων; ἢ οὐ καὶ οὗτοι ἀναγκάζονται ὁμολογεῖν ἡδονὰς εἶναι κακάς;	"And what about those who define the good as pleasure? Are they any less full of confusion than the others? Aren't they forced to agree, too, that there are bad pleasures?"
	σφόδρα γε.	"They certainly are."
	συμβαίνει δὴ αὐτοῖς οἶμαι ὁμολογεῖν ἀγαθὰ εἶναι καὶ κακὰ ταὐτά. ἦ γάρ; [505d]	"So the result, I think, is that they have to agree that the same things are both good and bad. Isn't that so?" [505d]
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
505d	οὐκοῦν ὅτι μὲν μεγάλαι καὶ πολλαὶ ἀμφισβητήσεις περὶ αὐτοῦ, φανερόν;	"Then it's clear that there are many great disputes about it?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
	τί δέ; τόδε οὐ φανερόν, ὡς δίκαια μὲν καὶ καλὰ πολλοὶ ἂν ἕλοιντο τὰ δοκοῦντα, κἂν εἰ μὴ εἴη, ὅμως ταῦτα πράττειν καὶ κεκτῆσθαι καὶ δοκεῖν, ἀγαθὰ δὲ οὐδενὶ ἔτι ἀρκεῖ τὰ δοκοῦντα κτᾶσθαι, ἀλλὰ τὰ ὄντα ζητοῦσιν, τὴν δὲ δόξαν ἐνταῦθα ἤδη πᾶς ἀτιμάζει;	"And what about this? Isn't it clear that with just and fine things, many people would choose what seems so—and even if it isn't, they'd still do and have them and have the reputation for them—but with good things nobody is satisfied any more to get what only seems so? They look for what really is, and here everyone has contempt for mere seeming."
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.

GREEK

ὃ δὴ διώκει μὲν ἅπασα ψυχὴ καὶ τούτου ἕνεκα πάντα πράττει, ἀπομαντευομένη τι εἶναι, ἀποροῦσα δὲ καὶ οὐκ ἔχουσα λαβεῖν ἱκανῶς τί ποτ' ἐστὶν οὐδὲ πίστει χρήσασθαι μονίμῳ οἵᾳ καὶ περὶ τἆλλα, διὰ τοῦτο δὲ ἀποτυγχάνει καὶ τῶν ἄλλων εἴ τι ὄφελος ἦν, περὶ δὴ τὸ τοιοῦτον καὶ τοσοῦτον [506a] οὕτω φῶμεν δεῖν ἐσκοτῶσθαι καὶ ἐκείνους τοὺς βελτίστους ἐν τῇ πόλει, οἷς πάντα ἐγχειριοῦμεν;

ἥκιστά γ', ἔφη.

ENGLISH

"This is what every soul pursues, and for its sake it does everything. [505e] It divines that it is something, but it's at a loss and can't adequately grasp what it is, or have a stable conviction about it as it can about other things, and for that reason it misses whatever benefit there was in the other things as well. About something of this kind and this importance, [506a] are we to say that even the best people in the city, into whose hands we'll put everything, should be left in the dark like this?"

"Least of all," he said.

506a οἶμαι γοῦν, εἶπον, δίκαιά τε καὶ καλὰ ἀγνοούμενα ὅπῃ ποτὲ ἀγαθά ἐστιν, οὐ πολλοῦ τινος ἄξιον φύλακα κεκτῆσθαι ἂν ἑαυτῶν τὸν τοῦτο ἀγνοοῦντα· μαντεύομαι δὲ μηδένα αὐτὰ πρότερον γνώσεσθαι ἱκανῶς.

καλῶς γάρ, ἔφη, μαντεύῃ.

οὐκοῦν ἡμῖν ἡ πολιτεία τελέως κεκοσμήσεται, ἐὰν ὁ [506b] τοιοῦτος αὐτὴν ἐπισκοπῇ φύλαξ, ὁ τούτων ἐπιστήμων;

ἀνάγκη, ἔφη. ἀλλὰ σὺ δή, ὦ Σώκρατες, πότερον ἐπιστήμην τὸ ἀγαθὸν φῂς εἶναι ἢ ἡδονήν, ἢ ἄλλο τι παρὰ ταῦτα;

"At any rate, I think," I said, "that if it isn't known in what way just and fine things are good, they won't have acquired a guardian worth much in someone who doesn't know this. And I divine that no one will know them adequately before that."

"Yes, and you divine well," he said.

"So our constitution will be perfectly ordered if a [506b] guardian of this kind watches over it, one who has knowledge of these things?"

"Necessarily," he said. "But you yourself, Socrates—do you say that the good is knowledge, or pleasure, or something else besides these?"

506b οὗτος, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀνήρ, καλῶς ἦσθα καὶ πάλαι καταφανὴς ὅτι σοι οὐκ ἀποχρήσοι τὸ τοῖς ἄλλοις δοκοῦν περὶ αὐτῶν.

οὐδὲ γὰρ δίκαιόν μοι, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, φαίνεται τὰ τῶν ἄλλων μὲν ἔχειν εἰπεῖν δόγματα, τὸ δ' αὐτοῦ μή, τοσοῦτον [506c] χρόνον περὶ ταῦτα πραγματευόμενον.

τί δέ; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· δοκεῖ σοι δίκαιον εἶναι περὶ ὧν τις μὴ οἶδεν λέγειν ὡς εἰδότα;

οὐδαμῶς γ', ἔφη, ὡς εἰδότα, ὡς μέντοι οἰόμενον ταῦθ' ἃ οἴεται ἐθέλειν λέγειν.

"What a man!" I said. "You made it very plain long ago that other people's views on these things wouldn't satisfy you."

"Well, Socrates," he said, "it doesn't seem just to me for someone to be able to state other people's beliefs but not his own, after spending so much [506c] time on these matters."

"What?" I said. "Do you think it's just to talk about things one doesn't know as though one knew them?"

"Not at all as though one knew them," he said, "but one should be willing to say what one thinks, as what one thinks."

506c τί δέ; εἶπον· οὐκ ᾔσθησαι τὰς ἄνευ ἐπιστήμης δόξας, ὡς πᾶσαι αἰσχραί; ὧν αἱ βέλτισται τυφλαί—ἢ δοκοῦσί τί σοι τυφλῶν διαφέρειν ὁδὸν ὀρθῶς πορευομένων οἱ ἄνευ νοῦ ἀληθές τι δοξάζοντες;

οὐδέν, ἔφη.

βούλει οὖν αἰσχρὰ θεάσασθαι, τυφλά τε καὶ σκολιά, ἐξὸν [506d] παρ' ἄλλων ἀκούειν φανά τε καὶ καλά;

μὴ πρὸς Διός, ἦ δ' ὅς, ὦ Σώκρατες, ὁ Γλαύκων, ὥσπερ ἐπὶ τέλει ὢν ἀποστῇς. ἀρκέσει γὰρ ἡμῖν, κἂν ὥσπερ

"What?" I said. "Haven't you noticed that opinions without knowledge are all ugly? The best of them are blind—or do you think people who hold some true opinion without intelligence are any different from blind people traveling the right road?"

"No different," he said.

"So do you want to look at ugly things, blind and crooked, when you could [506d] hear bright and beautiful ones from others?"

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	δικαιοσύνης πέρι καὶ σωφροσύνης καὶ τῶν ἄλλων διῆλθες, οὕτω καὶ περὶ τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ διέλθῃς.	"For Zeus's sake, Socrates," said Glaucon, "don't back off now, as if you were at the finish line. We'll be satisfied if you go through the good the way you went through justice and moderation and the rest."

THE SUN

Socrates compares the good to the sun, which gives both light for seeing and life to things.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
506d	**SOCRATES** καὶ γὰρ ἐμοί, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ ἑταῖρε, καὶ μάλα ἀρκέσει· ἀλλ' ὅπως μὴ οὐχ οἷός τ' ἔσομαι, προθυμούμενος δὲ ἀσχημονῶν γέλωτα ὀφλήσω. ἀλλ', ὦ μακάριοι, αὐτὸ μὲν τί ποτ' [506e] ἐστὶ τἀγαθὸν ἐάσωμεν τὸ νῦν εἶναι—πλέον γάρ μοι φαίνεται ἢ κατὰ τὴν παροῦσαν ὁρμὴν ἐφικέσθαι τοῦ γε δοκοῦντος ἐμοὶ τὰ νῦν—ὃς δὲ ἔκγονός τε τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ φαίνεται καὶ ὁμοιότατος ἐκείνῳ, λέγειν ἐθέλω, εἰ καὶ ὑμῖν φίλον, εἰ δὲ μή, ἐᾶν.	**SOCRATES** "So will I, my friend," I said, "very much satisfied. But I'm afraid I won't be up to it, and that in my eagerness I'll make a fool of myself and be laughed at. No, my dear friends, let's leave aside for now what the good [506e] itself is. Even to reach my own present view of it seems too much for our present effort. But I'm willing to talk about what appears to be the offspring of the good and most like it, if you'd like; if not, we'll let it go."
	ἀλλ', ἔφη, λέγε· εἰς αὖθις γὰρ τοῦ πατρὸς ἀποτείσεις τὴν διήγησιν.	"No, tell us," he said. "You can pay us the account of the father another time."
507a	βουλοίμην ἄν, εἶπον, ἐμέ τε δύνασθαι αὐτὴν ἀποδοῦναι καὶ ὑμᾶς κομίσασθαι, ἀλλὰ μὴ ὥσπερ νῦν τοὺς τόκους μόνον. τοῦτον δὲ δὴ οὖν τὸν τόκον τε καὶ ἔκγονον αὐτοῦ τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ κομίσασθε. εὐλαβεῖσθε μέντοι μή πῃ ἐξαπατήσω ὑμᾶς ἄκων, κίβδηλον ἀποδιδοὺς τὸν λόγον τοῦ τόκου.	"I wish," I said, "that I could pay it and you could collect it, and not just the interest, as now. Still, take this interest, this offspring of the good itself. But be careful I don't somehow cheat you without meaning to, by paying you a counterfeit account of the interest."
	εὐλαβησόμεθα, ἔφη, κατὰ δύναμιν· ἀλλὰ μόνον λέγε.	"We'll be as careful as we can," he said. "Just tell us."
	διομολογησάμενός γ' ἔφην ἐγώ, καὶ ἀναμνήσας ὑμᾶς τά τ' ἐν τοῖς ἔμπροσθεν ῥηθέντα καὶ ἄλλοτε ἤδη πολλάκις εἰρημένα. [507b]	"Once we've come to an agreement," I said, "and I've reminded you of what was said earlier, and has often been said at other times too." [507b]
	τὰ ποῖα; ἦ δ' ὅς.	"What's that?" he said.[9]
507b	πολλὰ καλά, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ πολλὰ ἀγαθὰ καὶ ἕκαστα οὕτως εἶναί φαμέν τε καὶ διορίζομεν τῷ λόγῳ.	"We say that there are many beautiful things," I said, "and many good things, and so on for each kind, and we distinguish them in our account."
	φαμὲν γάρ.	"We do."
	καὶ αὐτὸ δὴ καλὸν καὶ αὐτὸ ἀγαθόν, καὶ οὕτω περὶ πάντων ἃ τότε ὡς πολλὰ ἐτίθεμεν, πάλιν αὖ κατ' ἰδέαν μίαν ἑκάστου ὡς μιᾶς οὔσης τιθέντες, "ὃ ἔστιν" ἕκαστον προσαγορεύομεν.	"And we also speak of the beautiful itself and the good itself. And so with all the things we then posited as many: we posit them in turn according to a single form of each, on the view that there is one, and call each 'what it is.'"
	ἔστι ταῦτα.	"That's so."
	καὶ τὰ μὲν δὴ ὁρᾶσθαί φαμεν, νοεῖσθαι δ' οὔ, τὰς δ' αὖ ἰδέας νοεῖσθαι μέν, ὁρᾶσθαι δ' οὔ.	
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν. [507c]	

9 The Greek word *tokos* means both "offspring" and "interest" on a loan, which drives the joke here.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τῷ οὖν ὁρῶμεν ἡμῶν αὐτῶν τὰ ὁρώμενα;	"And we say that the many things are seen but not grasped by intelligence, while the forms are grasped by intelligence but not seen."
	τῇ ὄψει, ἔφη.	"Absolutely." 507c
		"Now with what part of ourselves do we see the things that are seen?"
		"With sight," he said.
507c	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ ἀκοῇ τὰ ἀκουόμενα, καὶ ταῖς ἄλλαις αἰσθήσεσι πάντα τὰ αἰσθητά;	"And with hearing the things that are heard," I said, "and with the other senses all the things that are perceived?"
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
	ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐννενόηκας τὸν τῶν αἰσθήσεων δημιουργὸν ὅσῳ πολυτελεστάτην τὴν τοῦ ὁρᾶν τε καὶ ὁρᾶσθαι δύναμιν ἐδημιούργησεν;	"Well," I said, "have you noticed how lavishly the craftsman of the senses crafted the power of seeing and being seen?"
	οὐ πάνυ, ἔφη.	"Not really," he said.
	ἀλλ' ὧδε σκόπει. ἔστιν ὅτι προσδεῖ ἀκοῆ καὶ φωνῇ γένους ἄλλου εἰς τὸ τὴν μὲν ἀκούειν, τὴν δὲ ἀκούεσθαι, ὃ 507d ἐὰν μὴ παραγένηται τρίτον, ἡ μὲν οὐκ ἀκούσεται, ἡ δὲ οὐκ ἀκουσθήσεται;	"Then look at it this way. Do hearing and sound need some further kind of thing, for the one to hear and the other to be heard—a third thing such that, 507d if it isn't present, the one won't hear and the other won't be heard?"
	οὐδενός, ἔφη.	"They need nothing," he said.
507d	οἶμαι δέ γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐδ' ἄλλαις πολλαῖς, ἵνα μὴ εἴπω ὅτι οὐδεμιᾷ, τοιούτου προσδεῖ οὐδενός. ἢ σύ τινα ἔχεις εἰπεῖν;	"And I think," I said, "that many of the others—not to say all of them—need nothing of the kind either. Or can you name one that does?"
	οὐκ ἔγωγε, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"I can't," he said.
	τὴν δὲ τῆς ὄψεως καὶ τοῦ ὁρατοῦ οὐκ ἐννοεῖς ὅτι προσδεῖται;	"But don't you realize that sight and the visible do need something?"
	πῶς;	"How so?"
	ἐνούσης που ἐν ὄμμασιν ὄψεως καὶ ἐπιχειροῦντος τοῦ ἔχοντος χρῆσθαι αὐτῇ, παρούσης δὲ χρόας ἐν αὐτοῖς, ἐὰν μὴ 507e παραγένηται γένος τρίτον ἰδίᾳ ἐπ' αὐτὸ τοῦτο πεφυκός, οἶσθα ὅτι ἥ τε ὄψις οὐδὲν ὄψεται, τά τε χρώματα ἔσται ἀόρατα.	"Sight may be present in the eyes, and its owner may try to use it, and color may be present in things; but unless 507e a third kind of thing is present, one naturally suited to this very purpose, you know that sight will see nothing and the colors will be invisible."
	τίνος δὴ λέγεις, ἔφη, τούτου;	"What is this thing you mean?" he said.
507e	ὃ δὴ σὺ καλεῖς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, φῶς.	"What you call light," I said.
	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"True," he said.
	οὐ σμικρᾷ ἄρα ἰδέᾳ ἡ τοῦ ὁρᾶν αἴσθησις καὶ ἡ τοῦ ὁρᾶσθαι 508a δύναμις τῶν ἄλλων συζεύξεων τιμιωτέρῳ ζυγῷ ἐζύγησαν, εἴπερ μὴ ἄτιμον τὸ φῶς.	"Then the sense of seeing and the power of being 508a seen are yoked together by a yoke more precious than the other pairings, and by no small measure—unless light is something without value."
	ἀλλὰ μήν, ἔφη, πολλοῦ γε δεῖ ἄτιμον εἶναι.	"Far from it," he said.
	τίνα οὖν ἔχεις αἰτιάσασθαι τῶν ἐν οὐρανῷ θεῶν τούτου κύριον, οὗ ἡμῖν τὸ φῶς ὄψιν τε ποιεῖ ὁρᾶν ὅτι κάλλιστα καὶ τὰ ὁρώμενα ὁρᾶσθαι;	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ὅνπερ καὶ σύ, ἔφη, καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι· τὸν ἥλιον γὰρ δῆλον ὅτι ἐρωτᾷς.	"So which of the gods in heaven can you name as master of this, whose light makes our sight see as well as possible and the things seen be seen?" "The same one you and everyone else would," he said. "Obviously you're asking about the sun."
508a	ἆρ' οὖν ὧδε πέφυκεν ὄψις πρὸς τοῦτον τὸν θεόν; πῶς; οὐκ ἔστιν ἥλιος ἡ ὄψις οὔτε αὐτὴ οὔτ' ἐν ᾧ ἐγγίγνεται, ὃ 508b δὴ καλοῦμεν ὄμμα. οὐ γὰρ οὖν. ἀλλ' ἡλιοειδέστατόν γε οἶμαι τῶν περὶ τὰς αἰσθήσεις ὀργάνων. πολύ γε. οὐκοῦν καὶ τὴν δύναμιν ἣν ἔχει ἐκ τούτου ταμιευομένην ὥσπερ ἐπίρρυτον κέκτηται; πάνυ μὲν οὖν. ἆρ' οὖν οὐ καὶ ὁ ἥλιος ὄψις μὲν οὐκ ἔστιν, αἴτιος δ' ὢν αὐτῆς ὁρᾶται ὑπ' αὐτῆς ταύτης; οὕτως, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Now is sight related to this god in the following way?" "What way?" "Neither sight itself nor the thing it comes to be in, which 508b we call the eye, is the sun." "No, it isn't." "But I think it's the most sunlike of the sense organs." "By far." "And doesn't it get the power it has from the sun, dispensed to it like an inflowing stream?" "Certainly." "Then isn't the sun, too, not sight, but, as the cause of sight, seen by sight itself?" "That's so," he said.
508b	τοῦτον τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, φάναι με λέγειν τὸν τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ ἔκγονον, ὃν τἀγαθὸν ἐγέννησεν ἀνάλογον ἑαυτῷ, ὅτιπερ αὐτὸ 508c ἐν τῷ νοητῷ τόπῳ πρός τε νοῦν καὶ τὰ νοούμενα, τοῦτο τοῦτον ἐν τῷ ὁρατῷ πρός τε ὄψιν καὶ τὰ ὁρώμενα. πῶς; ἔφη· ἔτι δίελθέ μοι. ὀφθαλμοί, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οἶσθ' ὅτι, ὅταν μηκέτι ἐπ' ἐκεῖνά τις αὐτοὺς τρέπῃ ὧν ἂν τὰς χρόας τὸ ἡμερινὸν φῶς ἐπέχῃ, ἀλλὰ ὧν νυκτερινὰ φέγγη, ἀμβλυώττουσί τε καὶ ἐγγὺς φαίνονται τυφλῶν, ὥσπερ οὐκ ἐνούσης καθαρᾶς ὄψεως; καὶ μάλα, ἔφη. 508d	"The sun, then," I said, "is what you should say I mean by the offspring of the good, which the good begot in proportion to itself: as the good itself is 508c in the intelligible realm in relation to intelligence and the things grasped by intelligence, so the sun is in the visible realm in relation to sight and the things seen." "How?" he said. "Explain it to me further." "You know," I said, "that when someone no longer turns his eyes toward things whose colors are lit by daylight, but toward things lit by the glimmers of night, they grow dim and seem nearly blind, as though there were no clear sight in them?" "Very much so," he said. 508d
508d	ὅταν δέ γ' οἶμαι ὧν ὁ ἥλιος καταλάμπει, σαφῶς ὁρῶσι, καὶ τοῖς αὐτοῖς τούτοις ὄμμασιν ἐνοῦσα φαίνεται. τί μήν; οὕτω τοίνυν καὶ τὸ τῆς ψυχῆς ὧδε νόει· ὅταν μὲν οὗ καταλάμπει ἀλήθειά τε καὶ τὸ ὄν, εἰς τοῦτο ἀπερείσηται, ἐνόησέν τε καὶ ἔγνω αὐτὸ καὶ νοῦν ἔχειν φαίνεται· ὅταν δὲ εἰς τὸ τῷ σκότῳ κεκραμένον, τὸ γιγνόμενόν τε καὶ ἀπολλύμενον, δοξάζει τε καὶ ἀμβλυώττει ἄνω καὶ κάτω τὰς δόξας μεταβάλλον, καὶ ἔοικεν αὖ νοῦν οὐκ ἔχοντι. ἔοικε γάρ. 508e	"But when, I think, they're turned toward things the sun shines on, they see clearly, and sight appears to be present in those very same eyes." "Of course." "Then think of the soul in the same way. When it fixes itself on what truth and what is shine upon, it grasps and knows it and appears to have intelligence. But when it fixes on what is mixed with darkness, on what comes to be and passes away, it opines and grows dim, changing its opinions up

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		and down, and seems in turn to have no intelligence." "Yes, it does seem so." 508e
508e	τοῦτο τοίνυν τὸ τὴν ἀλήθειαν παρέχον τοῖς γιγνωσκομένοις καὶ τῷ γιγνώσκοντι τὴν δύναμιν ἀποδιδὸν τὴν τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ ἰδέαν φάθι εἶναι· αἰτίαν δ' ἐπιστήμης οὖσαν καὶ ἀληθείας, ὡς γιγνωσκομένης μὲν διανοοῦ, οὕτω δὲ καλῶν ἀμφοτέρων ὄντων, γνώσεώς τε καὶ ἀληθείας, ἄλλο καὶ κάλλιον ἔτι τούτων ἡγούμενος αὐτὸ ὀρθῶς ἡγήσῃ·	"So say that what gives truth to the things known, and gives the knower the power to know, is the form of the good. And since it is the cause of knowledge and truth, think of it as known too; but beautiful as both of these are, knowledge and truth, you'll be right to think of it as something other than them and still more beautiful.
	ἐπιστήμην 509a δὲ καὶ ἀλήθειαν, ὥσπερ ἐκεῖ φῶς τε καὶ ὄψιν ἡλιοειδῆ μὲν νομίζειν ὀρθόν, ἥλιον δ' ἡγεῖσθαι οὐκ ὀρθῶς ἔχει, οὕτω καὶ ἐνταῦθα ἀγαθοειδῆ μὲν νομίζειν ταῦτ' ἀμφότερα ὀρθόν, ἀγαθὸν δὲ ἡγεῖσθαι ὁπότερον αὐτῶν οὐκ ὀρθόν, ἀλλ' ἔτι μειζόνως τιμητέον τὴν τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ ἕξιν. ἀμήχανον κάλλος, ἔφη, λέγεις, εἰ ἐπιστήμην μὲν καὶ ἀλήθειαν παρέχει, αὐτὸ δ' ὑπὲρ ταῦτα κάλλει ἐστίν· οὐ γὰρ δήπου σύ γε ἡδονὴν αὐτὸ λέγεις. εὐφήμει, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· ἀλλ' ὧδε μᾶλλον τὴν εἰκόνα αὐτοῦ ἔτι ἐπισκόπει. 509b πῶς;	"As for knowledge 509a and truth: just as in the other case it's right to think of light and sight as sunlike, but wrong to believe they're the sun, so here it's right to think of both of these as goodlike, but wrong to believe that either of them is the good. The good's condition must be honored still more highly." "You're talking about an extraordinary beauty," he said, "if it provides knowledge and truth but is itself above them in beauty. Surely you don't mean it's pleasure." "Hush!" I said. "Look at its image further, this way, instead." 509b "How?"
509b	τὸν ἥλιον τοῖς ὁρωμένοις οὐ μόνον οἶμαι τὴν τοῦ ὁρᾶσθαι δύναμιν παρέχειν φήσεις, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὴν γένεσιν καὶ αὔξην καὶ τροφήν, οὐ γένεσιν αὐτὸν ὄντα. πῶς γάρ; καὶ τοῖς γιγνωσκομένοις τοίνυν μὴ μόνον τὸ γιγνώσκεσθαι φάναι ὑπὸ τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ παρεῖναι, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὸ εἶναί τε καὶ τὴν οὐσίαν ὑπ' ἐκείνου αὐτοῖς προσεῖναι, οὐκ οὐσίας ὄντος τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ, ἀλλ' ἔτι ἐπέκεινα τῆς οὐσίας πρεσβείᾳ καὶ δυνάμει ὑπερέχοντος. 509c καὶ ὁ Γλαύκων μάλα γελοίως, Ἄπολλον, ἔφη, δαιμονίας ὑπερβολῆς.	"The sun, I think you'll say, not only gives the things that are seen the power of being seen, but also their coming to be and growth and nourishment, though it isn't itself coming to be." "Of course not." "Then say likewise that the things known not only get their being known from the good, but also have their existence and their being from it, though the good is not being, but is still beyond being, surpassing it in dignity and power." 509c And Glaucon, very comically, said, "Apollo! What superhuman hyperbole!"
509c	σὺ γάρ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, αἴτιος, ἀναγκάζων τὰ ἐμοὶ δοκοῦντα περὶ αὐτοῦ λέγειν. καὶ μηδαμῶς γ', ἔφη, παύσῃ, εἰ μή τι, ἀλλὰ τὴν περὶ τὸν ἥλιον ὁμοιότητα αὖ διεξιών, εἴ πῃ ἀπολείπεις. ἀλλὰ μήν, εἶπον, συχνά γε ἀπολείπω. μηδὲ σμικρὸν τοίνυν, ἔφη, παραλίπῃς. οἶμαι μέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ πολύ· ὅμως δέ, ὅσα γ' ἐν τῷ παρόντι δυνατόν, ἑκὼν οὐκ ἀπολείψω. μὴ γάρ, ἔφη. 509d	"Well, it's your fault," I said, "for forcing me to say what I think about it." "And don't stop on any account," he said, "or if nothing else, at least go through the likeness with the sun again, in case you're leaving anything out." "Well, I'm certainly leaving out a lot," I said. "Then don't skip even a little," he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"I expect I'll skip a great deal," I said. "Still, as far as is possible at present, I won't leave anything out on purpose."
		"Don't," he said. 509d

THE DIVIDED LINE

Socrates divides reality with the image of a line and describes prisoners in a cave.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
509d	**SOCRATES** νόησον τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὥσπερ λέγομεν, δύο αὐτὼ εἶναι, καὶ βασιλεύειν τὸ μὲν νοητοῦ γένους τε καὶ τόπου, τὸ δ' αὖ ὁρατοῦ, ἵνα μὴ οὐρανοῦ εἰπὼν δόξω σοι σοφίζεσθαι περὶ τὸ ὄνομα. ἀλλ' οὖν ἔχεις ταῦτα διττὰ εἴδη, ὁρατόν, νοητόν;	**SOCRATES** "Then think of it," I said, "as we say: there are these two, and one rules over the intelligible kind and realm, the other over the visible—I won't say 'the heavens,' in case you think I'm playing the sophist with the word. Anyway, do you have these two kinds, visible and intelligible?"
	ἔχω.	"I do."
	ὥσπερ τοίνυν γραμμὴν δίχα τετμημένην λαβὼν ἄνισα τμήματα, πάλιν τέμνε ἑκάτερον τὸ τμῆμα ἀνὰ τὸν αὐτὸν λόγον, τό τε τοῦ ὁρωμένου γένους καὶ τὸ τοῦ νοουμένου, καί σοι ἔσται σαφηνείᾳ καὶ ἀσαφείᾳ πρὸς ἄλληλα ἐν μὲν τῷ ὁρωμένῳ 509e τὸ μὲν ἕτερον τμῆμα εἰκόνες—	"Then take a line cut into two unequal sections, and cut each section again in the same ratio, the section of the visible kind and that of the intelligible. Then, in terms of relative clarity and unclarity, in the visible section 509e one subsection will be images—[10]
509e	λέγω δὲ τὰς εἰκόνας πρῶτον 510a μὲν τὰς σκιάς, ἔπειτα τὰ ἐν τοῖς ὕδασι φαντάσματα καὶ ἐν τοῖς ὅσα πυκνά τε καὶ λεῖα καὶ φανὰ συνέστηκεν, καὶ πᾶν τὸ τοιοῦτον, εἰ κατανοεῖς.	"by images I mean first 510a shadows, then reflections in water and in everything that is dense, smooth and bright, and everything of that sort, if you follow me."
	ἀλλὰ κατανοῶ.	"I do."
	τὸ τοίνυν ἕτερον τίθει ᾧ τοῦτο ἔοικεν, τά τε περὶ ἡμᾶς ζῷα καὶ πᾶν τὸ φυτευτὸν καὶ τὸ σκευαστὸν ὅλον γένος.	"Then take as the other subsection the things these images resemble: the animals around us, and everything that grows, and the whole class of manufactured things."
	τίθημι, ἔφη.	"I'll take it so," he said.
	ἦ καὶ ἐθέλοις ἂν αὐτὸ φάναι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, διῃρῆσθαι ἀληθείᾳ τε καὶ μή, ὡς τὸ δοξαστὸν πρὸς τὸ γνωστόν, οὕτω τὸ ὁμοιωθὲν πρὸς τὸ ᾧ ὡμοιώθη; 510b	"Would you also be willing to say," I said, "that it has been divided in terms of truth and its lack, so that as the object of opinion is to the object of knowledge, so the likeness is to what it is a likeness of?" 510b
510b	ἔγωγ', ἔφη, καὶ μάλα.	"I certainly would," he said.
	σκόπει δὴ αὖ καὶ τὴν τοῦ νοητοῦ τομὴν ᾗ τμητέον.	"Now consider in turn how the intelligible section should be cut."
	πῇ;	"How?"
	ἦι τὸ μὲν αὐτοῦ τοῖς τότε μιμηθεῖσιν ὡς εἰκόσιν χρωμένη ψυχὴ ζητεῖν ἀναγκάζεται ἐξ ὑποθέσεων, οὐκ ἐπ' ἀρχὴν πορευομένη ἀλλ' ἐπὶ τελευτήν, τὸ δ' αὖ ἕτερον—τὸ ἐπ'	"Like this. In one part of it the soul, using as images the things that were imitated before, is forced

10 The Greek for "heaven" (*ouranos*) sounds a little like the word for "visible" (*horatos*), so Socrates avoids what might look like a pun.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἀρχὴν ἀνυπόθετον—ἐξ ὑποθέσεως ἰοῦσα καὶ ἄνευ τῶν περὶ ἐκεῖνο εἰκόνων, αὐτοῖς εἴδεσι δι' αὐτῶν τὴν μέθοδον ποιουμένη.	to inquire from hypotheses, proceeding not to a first principle but to a conclusion. In the other it proceeds from a hypothesis to a first principle that is not hypothetical, without the images used in the first part, making its way by means of forms themselves, through them."
	ταῦτ', ἔφη, ἃ λέγεις, οὐχ ἱκανῶς ἔμαθον. 510c	"I didn't quite understand what you're saying," he said. 510c
510c	ἀλλ' αὖθις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· ῥᾷον γὰρ τούτων προειρημένων μαθήσῃ. οἶμαι γάρ σε εἰδέναι ὅτι οἱ περὶ τὰς γεωμετρίας τε καὶ λογισμοὺς καὶ τὰ τοιαῦτα πραγματευόμενοι, ὑποθέμενοι τό τε περιττὸν καὶ τὸ ἄρτιον καὶ τὰ σχήματα καὶ γωνιῶν τριττὰ εἴδη καὶ ἄλλα τούτων ἀδελφὰ καθ' ἑκάστην μέθοδον, ταῦτα μὲν ὡς εἰδότες, ποιησάμενοι ὑποθέσεις αὐτά, οὐδένα λόγον οὔτε αὐτοῖς οὔτε ἄλλοις ἔτι ἀξιοῦσι περὶ αὐτῶν διδόναι 510d ὡς παντὶ φανερῶν, ἐκ τούτων δ' ἀρχόμενοι τὰ λοιπὰ ἤδη διεξιόντες τελευτῶσιν ὁμολογουμένως ἐπὶ τοῦτο οὗ ἂν ἐπὶ σκέψιν ὁρμήσωσι.	"Let's try again," I said. "You'll understand more easily with this said first. I think you know that people who work on geometry and arithmetic and that sort of thing hypothesize the odd and the even, the figures, three kinds of angle, and other things akin to these in each line of inquiry. They treat these as known, making them hypotheses, and don't think fit to give any further account of them either to themselves or to others, 510d as though they were clear to everyone. Starting from these, they go through the rest and arrive, consistently, at the conclusion they set out to investigate."
510d	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, τοῦτό γε οἶδα.	"Yes," he said, "I certainly know that."
	οὐκοῦν καὶ ὅτι τοῖς ὁρωμένοις εἴδεσι προσχρῶνται καὶ τοὺς λόγους περὶ αὐτῶν ποιοῦνται, οὐ περὶ τούτων διανοούμενοι, ἀλλ' ἐκείνων πέρι οἷς ταῦτα ἔοικε, τοῦ τετραγώνου αὐτοῦ ἕνεκα τοὺς λόγους ποιούμενοι καὶ διαμέτρου αὐτῆς, ἀλλ' οὐ 510e ταύτης ἣν γράφουσιν, καὶ τἆλλα οὕτως, αὐτὰ μὲν ταῦτα ἃ πλάττουσίν τε καὶ γράφουσιν, ὧν καὶ σκιαὶ καὶ ἐν ὕδασιν εἰκόνες εἰσίν, τούτοις μὲν ὡς εἰκόσιν αὖ χρώμενοι, ζητοῦντες 511a δὲ αὐτὰ ἐκεῖνα ἰδεῖν ἃ οὐκ ἂν ἄλλως ἴδοι τις ἢ τῇ διανοίᾳ.	"Then you also know that they make use of visible figures and argue about them, though they aren't thinking about these, but about the things these resemble. They argue for the sake of the square itself and the diagonal itself, not 510e the one they draw, and so on. These very things they model and draw, which themselves have shadows and reflections in water, they use in turn as images, seeking 511a to see those other things themselves, which one can't see except by thought."
	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"That's true," he said.
511a	τοῦτο τοίνυν νοητὸν μὲν τὸ εἶδος ἔλεγον, ὑποθέσεσι δ' ἀναγκαζομένην ψυχὴν χρῆσθαι περὶ τὴν ζήτησιν αὐτοῦ, οὐκ ἐπ' ἀρχὴν ἰοῦσαν, ὡς οὐ δυναμένην τῶν ὑποθέσεων ἀνωτέρω ἐκβαίνειν, εἰκόσι δὲ χρωμένην αὐτοῖς τοῖς ὑπὸ τῶν κάτω ἀπεικασθεῖσιν καὶ ἐκείνοις πρὸς ἐκεῖνα ὡς ἐναργέσι δεδοξασμένοις τε καὶ τετιμημένοις. 511b	"This, then, is what I was calling intelligible. The soul is forced to use hypotheses in investigating it, not going to a first principle, since it can't climb above the hypotheses; and it uses as images the very things of which the things below are likenesses, things regarded and valued as clear in comparison with those likenesses." 511b
	μανθάνω, ἔφη, ὅτι τὸ ὑπὸ ταῖς γεωμετρίαις τε καὶ ταῖς ταύτης ἀδελφαῖς τέχναις λέγεις.	"I understand," he said, "that you mean what falls under geometry and its sister arts."
511b	τὸ τοίνυν ἕτερον μάνθανε τμῆμα τοῦ νοητοῦ λέγοντά με τοῦτο οὗ αὐτὸς ὁ λόγος ἅπτεται τῇ τοῦ διαλέγεσθαι δυνάμει, τὰς ὑποθέσεις ποιούμενος οὐκ ἀρχὰς ἀλλὰ τῷ ὄντι ὑποθέσεις, οἷον ἐπιβάσεις τε καὶ ὁρμάς, ἵνα μέχρι τοῦ ἀνυποθέτου ἐπὶ τὴν τοῦ παντὸς ἀρχὴν ἰών, ἁψάμενος	"Then understand that by the other section of the intelligible I mean what reason itself grasps by the power of dialectic. It treats its hypotheses not as first principles but as genuinely hypotheses—stepping-stones and springboards, as it were—so that

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	αὐτῆς, πάλιν αὖ ἐχόμενος τῶν ἐκείνης ἐχομένων, οὕτως ἐπὶ τελευτὴν καταβαίνῃ, [511c] αἰσθητῷ παντάπασιν οὐδενὶ προσχρώμενος, ἀλλ᾽ εἴδεσιν αὐτοῖς δι᾽ αὐτῶν εἰς αὐτά, καὶ τελευτᾷ εἰς εἴδη.	it can go all the way up to what is unhypothetical, to the first principle of everything. Having grasped this, it turns back, holding on to what follows from it, and so comes down to a conclusion, [511c] making no use of anything perceptible at all, but only of forms themselves, through forms, to forms; and it ends in forms."
511c	μανθάνω, ἔφη, ἱκανῶς μὲν οὔ—δοκεῖς γάρ μοι συχνὸν ἔργον λέγειν—ὅτι μέντοι βούλει διορίζειν σαφέστερον εἶναι τὸ ὑπὸ τῆς τοῦ διαλέγεσθαι ἐπιστήμης τοῦ ὄντος τε καὶ νοητοῦ θεωρούμενον ἢ τὸ ὑπὸ τῶν τεχνῶν καλουμένων, αἷς αἱ ὑποθέσεις ἀρχαὶ καὶ διανοίᾳ μὲν ἀναγκάζονται ἀλλὰ μὴ αἰσθήσεσιν αὐτὰ θεᾶσθαι οἱ θεώμενοι, διὰ δὲ τὸ μὴ ἐπ᾽ ἀρχὴν [511d] ἀνελθόντες σκοπεῖν ἀλλ᾽ ἐξ ὑποθέσεων, νοῦν οὐκ ἴσχειν περὶ αὐτὰ δοκοῦσί σοι, καίτοι νοητῶν ὄντων μετὰ ἀρχῆς. διάνοιαν δὲ καλεῖν μοι δοκεῖς τὴν τῶν γεωμετρικῶν τε καὶ τὴν τῶν τοιούτων ἕξιν ἀλλ᾽ οὐ νοῦν, ὡς μεταξύ τι δόξης τε καὶ νοῦ τὴν διάνοιαν οὖσαν.	"I understand," he said, "though not adequately—it seems an enormous task you're describing. But I understand that you want to mark off what is contemplated of what is and is intelligible by the knowledge of dialectic as clearer than what is contemplated by the so-called arts, for which hypotheses are first principles. Those who contemplate their objects are forced to do so by thought and not by the senses; but because they don't go back up to a first principle [511d] in their investigation, but proceed from hypotheses, you think they don't have intelligence about them, even though these things are intelligible when taken with a first principle. And I think you call the state of geometers and people like them thought, not intelligence, as though thought were something between opinion and intelligence."
511d	ἱκανώτατα, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, ἀπεδέξω. καί μοι ἐπὶ τοῖς τέτταρσι τμήμασι τέτταρα ταῦτα παθήματα ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ γιγνόμενα λαβέ, νόησιν μὲν ἐπὶ τῷ ἀνωτάτω, διάνοιαν [511e] δὲ ἐπὶ τῷ δευτέρῳ, τῷ τρίτῳ δὲ πίστιν ἀπόδος καὶ τῷ τελευταίῳ εἰκασίαν, καὶ τάξον αὐτὰ ἀνὰ λόγον, ὥσπερ ἐφ᾽ οἷς ἐστιν ἀληθείας μετέχει, οὕτω ταῦτα σαφηνείας ἡγησάμενος μετέχειν. μανθάνω, ἔφη, καὶ συγχωρῶ καὶ τάττω ὡς λέγεις.	"You've taken it in very adequately," I said. "Now take these four conditions that arise in the soul, corresponding to the four sections: understanding for the highest, thought [511e] for the second; assign belief to the third and imagination to the last. And arrange them in proportion, considering that each shares in clarity to the degree that its objects share in truth." "I understand," he said, "and I agree, and I'll arrange them as you say."

Book VII

The cave, and the philosopher's education.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
514a	**SOCRATES** μετὰ ταῦτα δή, εἶπον, ἀπείκασον τοιούτῳ πάθει τὴν ἡμετέραν φύσιν παιδείας τε πέρι καὶ ἀπαιδευσίας. ἰδὲ γὰρ ἀνθρώπους οἷον ἐν καταγείῳ οἰκήσει σπηλαιώδει, ἀναπεπταμένην πρὸς τὸ φῶς τὴν εἴσοδον ἐχούσῃ μακρὰν παρὰ πᾶν τὸ σπήλαιον, ἐν ταύτῃ ἐκ παίδων ὄντας ἐν δεσμοῖς καὶ τὰ σκέλη καὶ τοὺς αὐχένας, ὥστε μένειν τε αὐτοὺς εἴς τε τὸ [514b] πρόσθεν μόνον ὁρᾶν, κύκλῳ δὲ τὰς κεφαλὰς ὑπὸ τοῦ δεσμοῦ ἀδυνάτους περιάγειν, φῶς δὲ αὐτοῖς πυρὸς ἄνωθεν καὶ πόρρωθεν καόμενον ὄπισθεν αὐτῶν, μεταξὺ δὲ τοῦ πυρὸς καὶ τῶν δεσμωτῶν ἐπάνω ὁδόν, παρ' ἣν ἰδὲ τειχίον παρῳκοδομημένον, ὥσπερ τοῖς θαυματοποιοῖς πρὸ τῶν ἀνθρώπων πρόκειται τὰ παραφράγματα, ὑπὲρ ὧν τὰ θαύματα δεικνύασιν.	**SOCRATES** "Next," I said, "compare our nature, in its education and lack of education, to a condition like this. Picture people living in a sort of underground cave-like dwelling, with a long entrance open to the light across the whole width of the cave. They've been there since childhood, fettered by the legs and neck, so that they stay where they are and see only what's in [514b] front of them, unable to turn their heads around because of the fetters. Light comes to them from a fire burning above and far behind them. Between the fire and the prisoners there's a road higher up, and along it, picture a low wall built, like the screens that puppeteers set up in front of the audience, above which they show their puppets."
514b	ὁρῶ, ἔφη.	"I see," he said.
	ὅρα τοίνυν παρὰ τοῦτο τὸ τειχίον φέροντας ἀνθρώπους [514c] σκεύη τε παντοδαπὰ ὑπερέχοντα τοῦ τειχίου καὶ ἀνδριάντας [515a] καὶ ἄλλα ζῷα λίθινά τε καὶ ξύλινα καὶ παντοῖα εἰργασμένα, οἷον εἰκὸς τοὺς μὲν φθεγγομένους, τοὺς δὲ σιγῶντας τῶν παραφερόντων.	"Then see people carrying along this low wall [514c] all kinds of artifacts that stick up above it, and statues of people [515a] and other animals made of stone and wood and every sort of material. As you'd expect, some of the carriers are talking and some are silent."
	ἄτοπον, ἔφη, λέγεις εἰκόνα καὶ δεσμώτας ἀτόπους.	"It's a strange image you're describing," he said, "and strange prisoners."
	ὁμοίους ἡμῖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· τοὺς γὰρ τοιούτους πρῶτον μὲν ἑαυτῶν τε καὶ ἀλλήλων οἴει ἄν τι ἑωρακέναι ἄλλο πλὴν τὰς σκιὰς τὰς ὑπὸ τοῦ πυρὸς εἰς τὸ καταντικρὺ αὐτῶν τοῦ σπηλαίου προσπιπτούσας;	"Like us," I said. "First of all, do you think such people would have seen anything of themselves or of one another except the shadows cast by the fire onto the wall of the cave in front of them?"
515a	πῶς γάρ, ἔφη, εἰ ἀκινήτους γε τὰς κεφαλὰς ἔχειν ἠναγκασμένοι [515b] εἶεν διὰ βίου;	"How could they," he said, "if they'd been forced to keep their heads motionless [515b] all their lives?"
	τί δὲ τῶν παραφερομένων; οὐ ταὐτὸν τοῦτο;	"And what about the things being carried past? Isn't it the same?"
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
	εἰ οὖν διαλέγεσθαι οἷοί τ' εἶεν πρὸς ἀλλήλους, οὐ ταῦτα ἡγῇ ἂν τὰ ὄντα αὐτοὺς νομίζειν ἅπερ ὁρῷεν;	"Then if they could talk to one another, don't you think they'd believe that the things they saw were the things that are?"
	ἀνάγκη.	"Necessarily."
	τί δ' εἰ καὶ ἠχὼ τὸ δεσμωτήριον ἐκ τοῦ καταντικρὺ ἔχοι; ὁπότε τις τῶν παριόντων φθέγξαιτο, οἴει ἂν ἄλλο τι αὐτοὺς ἡγεῖσθαι τὸ φθεγγόμενον ἢ τὴν παριοῦσαν σκιάν;	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	μὰ Δί' οὐκ ἔγωγ', ἔφη. 515c	"And what if the prison also had an echo from the wall facing them? Whenever one of the passers-by spoke, do you think they'd believe that the speaker was anything other than the passing shadow?" "No, by Zeus, I don't," he said. 515c
515c	παντάπασι δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οἱ τοιοῦτοι οὐκ ἂν ἄλλο τι νομίζοιεν τὸ ἀληθὲς ἢ τὰς τῶν σκευαστῶν σκιάς. πολλὴ ἀνάγκη, ἔφη.	"Then in every way," I said, "such people would believe the truth to be nothing other than the shadows of the artifacts." "Quite necessarily," he said.
	σκόπει δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, αὐτῶν λύσιν τε καὶ ἴασιν τῶν τε δεσμῶν καὶ τῆς ἀφροσύνης, οἵα τις ἂν εἴη, εἰ φύσει τοιάδε συμβαίνοι αὐτοῖς· ὁπότε τις λυθείη καὶ ἀναγκάζοιτο ἐξαίφνης ἀνίστασθαί τε καὶ περιάγειν τὸν αὐχένα καὶ βαδίζειν καὶ πρὸς τὸ φῶς ἀναβλέπειν, πάντα δὲ ταῦτα ποιῶν ἀλγοῖ τε καὶ διὰ τὰς μαρμαρυγὰς ἀδυνατοῖ καθορᾶν ἐκεῖνα ὧν 515d τότε τὰς σκιὰς ἑώρα, τί ἂν οἴει αὐτὸν εἰπεῖν, εἴ τις αὐτῷ λέγοι ὅτι τότε μὲν ἑώρα φλυαρίας, νῦν δὲ μᾶλλόν τι ἐγγυτέρω τοῦ ὄντος καὶ πρὸς μᾶλλον ὄντα τετραμμένος ὀρθότερον βλέποι, καὶ δὴ καὶ ἕκαστον τῶν παριόντων δεικνὺς αὐτῷ ἀναγκάζοι ἐρωτῶν ἀποκρίνεσθαι ὅτι ἔστιν; οὐκ οἴει αὐτὸν ἀπορεῖν τε ἂν καὶ ἡγεῖσθαι τὰ τότε ὁρώμενα ἀληθέστερα ἢ τὰ νῦν δεικνύμενα;	"Now consider," I said, "what their release from their fetters and their cure from folly would be like, if something like this happened to them in the course of nature. Whenever one of them was freed and suddenly forced to stand up, turn his neck around, walk and look up toward the light, he'd be in pain doing all this, and because of the dazzle he'd be unable to make out the things whose 515d shadows he'd seen before. What do you think he'd say if someone told him that before he'd been seeing nonsense, but now, being somewhat nearer to what is and turned toward things that more fully are, he was seeing more correctly—and, what's more, pointed to each of the things passing by and forced him to answer the question of what it is? Don't you think he'd be at a loss, and would believe that the things he saw before were truer than the ones now being pointed out to him?"
515d	πολύ γ', ἔφη. 515e οὐκοῦν κἂν εἰ πρὸς αὐτὸ τὸ φῶς ἀναγκάζοι αὐτὸν βλέπειν, ἀλγεῖν τε ἂν τὰ ὄμματα καὶ φεύγειν ἀποστρεφόμενον πρὸς ἐκεῖνα ἃ δύναται καθορᾶν, καὶ νομίζειν ταῦτα τῷ ὄντι σαφέστερα τῶν δεικνυμένων; οὕτως, ἔφη.	"Much truer," he said. 515e "And if someone forced him to look at the light itself, wouldn't his eyes hurt, and wouldn't he turn away and flee toward the things he's able to make out, and believe that these are really clearer than the things being pointed out?" "Yes," he said.
515e	εἰ δέ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐντεῦθεν ἕλκοι τις αὐτὸν βίᾳ διὰ τραχείας τῆς ἀναβάσεως καὶ ἀνάντους, καὶ μὴ ἀνείη πρὶν ἐξελκύσειεν εἰς τὸ τοῦ ἡλίου φῶς, ἆρα οὐχὶ ὀδυνᾶσθαί τε 516a ἂν καὶ ἀγανακτεῖν ἑλκόμενον, καὶ ἐπειδὴ πρὸς τὸ φῶς ἔλθοι, αὐγῆς ἂν ἔχοντα τὰ ὄμματα μεστὰ ὁρᾶν οὐδ' ἂν ἓν δύνασθαι τῶν νῦν λεγομένων ἀληθῶν; οὐ γὰρ ἄν, ἔφη, ἐξαίφνης γε.	"And if someone dragged him by force from there up the rough, steep ascent," I said, "and didn't let go until he'd dragged him out into the light of the sun, wouldn't he be in pain 516a and angry at being dragged? And when he came into the light, with his eyes full of its glare, wouldn't he be unable to see even one of the things we now call true?" "No, he wouldn't," he said, "not right away."
516a	συνηθείας δὴ οἶμαι δέοιτ' ἄν, εἰ μέλλοι τὰ ἄνω ὄψεσθαι. καὶ πρῶτον μὲν τὰς σκιὰς ἂν ῥᾷστα καθορῷ, καὶ μετὰ τοῦτο ἐν τοῖς ὕδασι τά τε τῶν ἀνθρώπων καὶ τὰ τῶν	"He'd need to get used to it, I think, if he were going to see the things up there. At first he'd most easily make out shadows, and after that the reflec-

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἄλλων εἴδωλα, ὕστερον δὲ αὐτά· ἐκ δὲ τούτων τὰ ἐν τῷ οὐρανῷ καὶ αὐτὸν τὸν οὐρανὸν νύκτωρ ἂν ῥᾷον θεάσαιτο, προσβλέπων τὸ τῶν [516b] ἄστρων τε καὶ σελήνης φῶς, ἢ μεθ' ἡμέραν τὸν ἥλιόν τε καὶ τὸ τοῦ ἡλίου.	tions of people and other things in water, and later the things themselves. From these he'd go on to look at the things in the heavens, and the heavens themselves, more easily at night, gazing at the light of the [516b] stars and the moon, than at the sun and the sun's light by day."
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
516b	τελευταῖον δὴ οἶμαι τὸν ἥλιον, οὐκ ἐν ὕδασιν οὐδ' ἐν ἀλλοτρίᾳ ἕδρᾳ φαντάσματα αὐτοῦ, ἀλλ' αὐτὸν καθ' αὑτὸν ἐν τῇ αὑτοῦ χώρᾳ δύναιτ' ἂν κατιδεῖν καὶ θεάσασθαι οἷός ἐστιν.	"And finally, I think, he'd be able to make out the sun—not its reflections in water or in some place not its own, but the sun itself, by itself, in its own place—and to look at it as it is."
	ἀναγκαῖον, ἔφη.	"Necessarily," he said.
	καὶ μετὰ ταῦτ' ἂν ἤδη συλλογίζοιτο περὶ αὐτοῦ ὅτι οὗτος ὁ τάς τε ὥρας παρέχων καὶ ἐνιαυτοὺς καὶ πάντα ἐπιτροπεύων [516c] τὰ ἐν τῷ ὁρωμένῳ τόπῳ, καὶ ἐκείνων ὧν σφεῖς ἑώρων τρόπον τινὰ πάντων αἴτιος.	"And after this he'd reason about it that it's the sun that provides the seasons and the years and governs everything [516c] in the visible realm, and is in a way the cause of all those things he and his companions used to see."
	δῆλον, ἔφη, ὅτι ἐπὶ ταῦτα ἂν μετ' ἐκεῖνα ἔλθοι.	"Clearly," he said, "he'd come to that after the others."
516c	τί οὖν; ἀναμιμνῃσκόμενον αὐτὸν τῆς πρώτης οἰκήσεως καὶ τῆς ἐκεῖ σοφίας καὶ τῶν τότε συνδεσμωτῶν οὐκ ἂν οἴει αὐτὸν μὲν εὐδαιμονίζειν τῆς μεταβολῆς, τοὺς δὲ ἐλεεῖν;	"Well then? When he remembers his first dwelling, and the wisdom there, and his fellow prisoners of that time, don't you think he'd count himself happy for the change, and pity them?"
	καὶ μάλα.	"Very much so."
	τιμαὶ δὲ καὶ ἔπαινοι εἴ τινες αὐτοῖς ἦσαν τότε παρ' ἀλλήλων καὶ γέρα τῷ ὀξύτατα καθορῶντι τὰ παριόντα, καὶ μνημονεύοντι μάλιστα ὅσα τε πρότερα αὐτῶν καὶ ὕστερα [516d] εἰώθει καὶ ἅμα πορεύεσθαι, καὶ ἐκ τούτων δὴ δυνατώτατα ἀπομαντευομένῳ τὸ μέλλον ἥξειν, δοκεῖς ἂν αὐτὸν ἐπιθυμητικῶς αὐτῶν ἔχειν καὶ ζηλοῦν τοὺς παρ' ἐκείνοις τιμωμένους τε καὶ ἐνδυναστεύοντας, ἢ τὸ τοῦ Ὁμήρου ἂν πεπονθέναι καὶ σφόδρα βούλεσθαι ἐπάρουρον ἐόντα θητευέμεν ἄλλῳ ἀνδρὶ παρ' ἀκλήρῳ καὶ ὁτιοῦν ἂν πεπονθέναι μᾶλλον ἢ ᾽κεῖνά τε δοξάζειν καὶ ἐκείνως ζῆν; [516e]	"And suppose they'd had honors and praise from one another back then, and prizes for whoever was sharpest at making out the things passing by and best at remembering which of them usually came earlier, which later, [516d] and which together, and who was therefore best able to divine what was going to come next. Do you think he'd hanker after these things and envy those who are honored and hold power among them? Or would he feel what Homer describes, and very much prefer 'to work the land as a hired hand for another man, a man with no land of his own,' and put up with anything at all rather than hold those opinions and live that way?" [516e] [1]
516e	οὕτως, ἔφη, ἔγωγε οἶμαι, πᾶν μᾶλλον πεπονθέναι ἂν δέξασθαι ἢ ζῆν ἐκείνως.	"Yes," he said, "I think he'd accept anything rather than live that way."
	καὶ τόδε δὴ ἐννόησον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. εἰ πάλιν ὁ τοιοῦτος καταβὰς εἰς τὸν αὐτὸν θᾶκον καθίζοιτο, ἆρ' οὐ σκότους	"Now think about this too," I said. "If such a man went back down and sat in the same seat, wouldn't

1 The quotation is from Homer's *Odyssey* (11.489–90), where the shade of Achilles says he would rather be a poor man's hired laborer than king over all the dead.

GREEK

ἂν ἀνάπλεως σχοίη τοὺς ὀφθαλμούς, ἐξαίφνης ἥκων ἐκ τοῦ ἡλίου;

καὶ μάλα γ', ἔφη.

τὰς δὲ δὴ σκιὰς ἐκείνας πάλιν εἰ δέοι αὐτὸν γνωματεύοντα διαμιλλᾶσθαι τοῖς ἀεὶ δεσμώταις ἐκείνοις, ἐν ᾧ ἀμβλυώττει, [517a] πρὶν καταστῆναι τὰ ὄμματα, οὗτος δ' ὁ χρόνος μὴ πάνυ ὀλίγος εἴη τῆς συνηθείας, ἆρ' οὐ γέλωτ' ἂν παράσχοι, καὶ λέγοιτο ἂν περὶ αὐτοῦ ὡς ἀναβὰς ἄνω διεφθαρμένος ἥκει τὰ ὄμματα, καὶ ὅτι οὐκ ἄξιον οὐδὲ πειρᾶσθαι ἄνω ἰέναι; καὶ τὸν ἐπιχειροῦντα λύειν τε καὶ ἀνάγειν, εἴ πως ἐν ταῖς χερσὶ δύναιντο λαβεῖν καὶ ἀποκτείνειν, ἀποκτεινύναι ἄν;

σφόδρα γ', ἔφη.

ENGLISH

his eyes be full of darkness, coming suddenly out of the sun?"

"Very much so," he said.

"And if he had to compete again with those perpetual prisoners in judging those shadows while his sight was still dim, [517a] before his eyes had settled—and the time it took to get used to it wouldn't be very short—wouldn't he make them laugh? Wouldn't they say of him that he'd gone up and come back with his eyes ruined, and that it isn't worth even trying to go up? And as for anyone who tried to free them and lead them up, if they could somehow get their hands on him and kill him, wouldn't they kill him?"

"They certainly would," he said.

517a ταύτην τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὴν εἰκόνα, ὦ φίλε Γλαύκων, [517b] προσαπτέον ἅπασαν τοῖς ἔμπροσθεν λεγομένοις, τὴν μὲν δι' ὄψεως φαινομένην ἕδραν τῇ τοῦ δεσμωτηρίου οἰκήσει ἀφομοιοῦντα, τὸ δὲ τοῦ πυρὸς ἐν αὐτῇ φῶς τῇ τοῦ ἡλίου δυνάμει· τὴν δὲ ἄνω ἀνάβασιν καὶ θέαν τῶν ἄνω τὴν εἰς τὸν νοητὸν τόπον τῆς ψυχῆς ἄνοδον τιθεὶς οὐχ ἁμαρτήσῃ τῆς γ' ἐμῆς ἐλπίδος, ἐπειδὴ ταύτης ἐπιθυμεῖς ἀκούειν. θεὸς δέ που οἶδεν εἰ ἀληθὴς οὖσα τυγχάνει.

"Now, my dear Glaucon," I said, "this whole image [517b] must be connected with what was said before. Liken the region that appears through sight to the prison dwelling, and the light of the fire in it to the power of the sun. And if you take the ascent and the viewing of the things above as the soul's journey up into the intelligible realm, you won't mistake my hope, since that's what you want to hear. A god knows, perhaps, whether it's actually true.

517b τὰ δ' οὖν ἐμοὶ φαινόμενα οὕτω φαίνεται, ἐν τῷ γνωστῷ τελευταία ἡ τοῦ [517c] ἀγαθοῦ ἰδέα καὶ μόγις ὁρᾶσθαι, ὀφθεῖσα δὲ συλλογιστέα εἶναι ὡς ἄρα πᾶσι πάντων αὕτη ὀρθῶν τε καὶ καλῶν αἰτία, ἔν τε ὁρατῷ φῶς καὶ τὸν τούτου κύριον τεκοῦσα, ἔν τε νοητῷ αὐτὴ κυρία ἀλήθειαν καὶ νοῦν παρασχομένη, καὶ ὅτι δεῖ ταύτην ἰδεῖν τὸν μέλλοντα ἐμφρόνως πράξειν ἢ ἰδίᾳ ἢ δημοσίᾳ.

"But this is how things appear to me: in the knowable realm, the last thing to be seen, and seen only with difficulty, is the form of the [517c] good. But once seen, it must be concluded that it is the cause of all that is right and beautiful in everything. In the visible realm it gave birth to light and to light's lord; in the intelligible realm it is itself lord, providing truth and understanding. And whoever is going to act sensibly, in private or in public life, must see it."

517c συνοίομαι, ἔφη, καὶ ἐγώ, ὅν γε δὴ τρόπον δύναμαι.

ἴθι τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ τόδε συνοιήθητι καὶ μὴ θαυμάσῃς ὅτι οἱ ἐνταῦθα ἐλθόντες οὐκ ἐθέλουσιν τὰ τῶν ἀνθρώπων πράττειν, ἀλλ' ἄνω ἀεὶ ἐπείγονται αὐτῶν αἱ ψυχαὶ διατρίβειν· [517d] εἰκὸς γάρ που οὕτως, εἴπερ αὖ κατὰ τὴν προειρημένην εἰκόνα τοῦτ' ἔχει.

εἰκὸς μέντοι, ἔφη.

"I agree too," he said, "as far as I'm able."

"Come on, then," I said, "agree with me about this as well, and don't be surprised that those who have got this far aren't willing to take part in human affairs, but their souls are always eager to spend their time up above. [517d] That's surely what we'd expect, if this too follows the image we described."

"It is what we'd expect," he said.

517d τί δέ; τόδε οἴει τι θαυμαστόν, εἰ ἀπὸ θείων, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, θεωριῶν ἐπὶ τὰ ἀνθρώπεια τις ἐλθὼν κακὰ ἀσχημονεῖ τε καὶ φαίνεται σφόδρα γελοῖος ἔτι ἀμβλυώττων καὶ πρὶν

"And what about this? Do you think it's at all surprising," I said, "if someone who comes from divine contemplations to human evils behaves awk-

GREEK

ἱκανῶς συνήθης γενέσθαι τῷ παρόντι σκότῳ ἀναγκαζόμενος ἐν δικαστηρίοις ἢ ἄλλοθί που ἀγωνίζεσθαι περὶ τῶν τοῦ δικαίου σκιῶν ἢ ἀγαλμάτων ὧν αἱ σκιαί, καὶ διαμιλλᾶσθαι [517e] περὶ τούτου, ὅπῃ ποτὲ ὑπολαμβάνεται ταῦτα ὑπὸ τῶν αὐτὴν δικαιοσύνην μὴ πώποτε ἰδόντων;

οὐδ' ὁπωστιοῦν θαυμαστόν, ἔφη.

ENGLISH

wardly and looks very ridiculous when, with his sight still dim and before he's become adequately used to the darkness around him, he's forced to contend in law courts or elsewhere about the shadows of justice, or the statues that cast those shadows, and to argue [517e] about how these things are understood by people who have never seen justice itself?"

"Not in the least surprising," he said.

518a ἀλλ' εἰ νοῦν γε ἔχοι τις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μεμνῆτ' ἂν ὅτι διτταὶ καὶ ἀπὸ διττῶν γίγνονται ἐπιταράξεις ὄμμασιν, ἔκ τε φωτὸς εἰς σκότος μεθισταμένων καὶ ἐκ σκότους εἰς φῶς. ταὐτὰ δὲ ταῦτα νομίσας γίγνεσθαι καὶ περὶ ψυχήν, ὁπότε ἴδοι θορυβουμένην τινὰ καὶ ἀδυνατοῦσάν τι καθορᾶν, οὐκ ἂν ἀλογίστως γελῷ, ἀλλ' ἐπισκοποῖ ἂν πότερον ἐκ φανοτέρου βίου ἥκουσα ὑπὸ ἀηθείας ἐσκότωται, ἢ ἐξ ἀμαθίας πλείονος εἰς φανότερον ἰοῦσα ὑπὸ λαμπροτέρου μαρμαρυγῆς [518b] ἐμπέπλησται, καὶ οὕτω δὴ τὴν μὲν εὐδαιμονίσειεν ἂν τοῦ πάθους τε καὶ βίου, τὴν δὲ ἐλεήσειεν, καὶ εἰ γελᾶν ἐπ' αὐτῇ βούλοιτο, ἧττον ἂν καταγέλαστος ὁ γέλως αὐτῷ εἴη ἢ ὁ ἐπὶ τῇ ἄνωθεν ἐκ φωτὸς ἡκούσῃ.

"But anyone with sense," I said, "would remember that the eyes can be confused in two ways, from two causes: when they move from light into darkness, and when they move from darkness into light. Believing that the same thing happens to the soul too, whenever he saw one that was troubled and unable to make anything out, he wouldn't laugh at it thoughtlessly. He would consider whether it had come from a brighter life and was in darkness because it was unused to the dark, or whether it was coming from greater ignorance into something brighter and was [518b] filled with the dazzle of a more brilliant light. Then he would count the one happy in its experience and its life, and pity the other; and if he did want to laugh at that one, his laughter would be less ridiculous than laughter at the soul that had come down from the light above."

EDUCATION AS A TURNING AROUND

Socrates argues that education turns the soul toward the light rather than putting knowledge into it.

GREEK

518b **SOCRATES** καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, μετρίως λέγεις.

δεῖ δή, εἶπον, ἡμᾶς τοιόνδε νομίσαι περὶ αὐτῶν, εἰ ταῦτ' ἀληθῆ· τὴν παιδείαν οὐχ οἵαν τινὲς ἐπαγγελλόμενοί φασιν εἶναι τοιαύτην καὶ εἶναι. φασὶ δέ που οὐκ ἐνούσης ἐν τῇ [518c] ψυχῇ ἐπιστήμης σφεῖς ἐντιθέναι, οἷον τυφλοῖς ὀφθαλμοῖς ὄψιν ἐντιθέντες.

φασὶ γὰρ οὖν, ἔφη.

518c ὁ δέ γε νῦν λόγος, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, σημαίνει ταύτην τὴν ἐνοῦσαν ἑκάστου δύναμιν ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ καὶ τὸ ὄργανον ᾧ καταμανθάνει ἕκαστος, οἷον εἰ ὄμμα μὴ δυνατὸν ἦν ἄλλως ἢ σὺν ὅλῳ τῷ σώματι στρέφειν πρὸς τὸ φανὸν ἐκ τοῦ σκοτώδους, οὕτω σὺν ὅλῃ τῇ ψυχῇ ἐκ τοῦ γιγνομένου περιακτέον εἶναι, ἕως ἂν εἰς τὸ ὂν καὶ τοῦ ὄντος τὸ

ENGLISH

SOCRATES "That's very fairly put," he said.

"Then if this is true," I said, "we must think this about these matters: education isn't what some of those who profess it claim it is. They claim, I think, that they can put knowledge into a [518c] soul that lacks it, as if they were putting sight into blind eyes."

"They do claim that," he said.

"But our present argument," I said, "shows that this power is already present in each person's soul, and so is the instrument each of us learns with. It's as if an eye couldn't turn from darkness toward the light except together with the whole body: in the same way this instrument must be turned around, together with the whole soul, away from

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	φανότατον δυνατὴ γένηται ἀνασχέσθαι θεωμένη· τοῦτο δ' εἶναί φαμεν [518d] τἀγαθόν. ἦ γάρ;	what comes to be, until it is able to bear looking at what is, and at the brightest of what is. And this, we say, is [518d] the good. Isn't it?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
518d	τούτου τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, αὐτοῦ τέχνη ἂν εἴη, τῆς περιαγωγῆς, τίνα τρόπον ὡς ῥᾷστά τε καὶ ἀνυσιμώτατα μεταστραφήσεται, οὐ τοῦ ἐμποιῆσαι αὐτῷ τὸ ὁρᾶν, ἀλλ' ὡς ἔχοντι μὲν αὐτό, οὐκ ὀρθῶς δὲ τετραμμένῳ οὐδὲ βλέποντι οἷ ἔδει, τοῦτο διαμηχανήσασθαι.	"Then there would be an art of this very thing," I said, "of the turning around: of how this instrument can be turned most easily and effectively. It wouldn't be an art of putting sight into it. It would take for granted that it has sight but isn't turned the right way or looking where it should, and contrive to bring that about."
	ἔοικεν γάρ, ἔφη.	"So it seems," he said.
	αἱ μὲν τοίνυν ἄλλαι ἀρεταὶ καλούμεναι ψυχῆς κινδυνεύουσιν ἐγγύς τι εἶναι τῶν τοῦ σώματος—τῷ ὄντι γὰρ [518e] οὐκ ἐνοῦσαι πρότερον ὕστερον ἐμποιεῖσθαι ἔθεσι καὶ ἀσκήσεσιν—ἡ δὲ τοῦ φρονῆσαι παντὸς μᾶλλον θειοτέρου τινὸς τυγχάνει, ὡς ἔοικεν, οὖσα, ὃ τὴν μὲν δύναμιν οὐδέποτε ἀπόλλυσιν, ὑπὸ δὲ τῆς περιαγωγῆς χρήσιμόν τε καὶ ὠφέλιμον [519a] καὶ ἄχρηστον αὖ καὶ βλαβερὸν γίγνεται.	"Now the other so-called excellences of the soul are probably close to those of the body. They really [518e] aren't present beforehand, but are produced later by habit and practice. But the excellence of understanding, it seems, belongs above all to something more divine, which never loses its power, but becomes useful and beneficial, [519a] or else useless and harmful, depending on the way it is turned.
519a	ἢ οὔπω ἐννενόηκας, τῶν λεγομένων πονηρῶν μέν, σοφῶν δέ, ὡς δριμὺ μὲν βλέπει τὸ ψυχάριον καὶ ὀξέως διορᾷ ταῦτα ἐφ' ἃ τέτραπται, ὡς οὐ φαύλην ἔχον τὴν ὄψιν, κακίᾳ δ' ἠναγκασμένον ὑπηρετεῖν, ὥστε ὅσῳ ἂν ὀξύτερον βλέπῃ, τοσούτῳ πλείω κακὰ ἐργαζόμενον;	"Or haven't you ever noticed, with people who are said to be wicked but clever, how sharply their petty little soul sees, and how keenly it discerns the things it's turned toward? Its sight isn't poor, but it's forced to serve badness, so that the more sharply it sees, the more harm it does."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Certainly," he said.
	τοῦτο μέντοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ τῆς τοιαύτης φύσεως εἰ ἐκ παιδὸς εὐθὺς κοπτόμενον περιεκόπη τὰς τῆς γενέσεως [519b] συγγενεῖς ὥσπερ μολυβδίδας, αἳ δὴ ἐδωδαῖς τε καὶ τοιούτων ἡδοναῖς τε καὶ λιχνείαις προσφυεῖς γιγνόμεναι περὶ κάτω στρέφουσι τὴν τῆς ψυχῆς ὄψιν· ὧν εἰ ἀπαλλαγὲν περιεστρέφετο εἰς τὰ ἀληθῆ, καὶ ἐκεῖνα ἂν τὸ αὐτὸ τοῦτο τῶν αὐτῶν ἀνθρώπων ὀξύτατα ἑώρα, ὥσπερ καὶ ἐφ' ἃ νῦν τέτραπται.	"And yet," I said, "suppose this part of such a nature had been hammered at from earliest childhood and struck free of the leaden weights, as it were, that are akin to becoming, [519b] which fasten onto it through eating and the pleasures and greed of that sort and turn the soul's vision downward. If it were freed of these and turned around toward what is true, this same part of the same people would see those things too most sharply, just as it sees the things it's turned toward now."
	εἰκός γε, ἔφη.	"It's likely," he said.

WHY THE PHILOSOPHERS MUST GO BACK DOWN

Socrates insists the philosophers must return to the cave and take their turn at ruling.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
519b	**SOCRATES** τί δέ; τόδε οὐκ εἰκός, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ ἀνάγκη ἐκ τῶν προειρημένων, μήτε τοὺς ἀπαιδεύτους καὶ	**SOCRATES** "Well then, isn't this likely too," I said, "and in fact necessary, given what we've said: that

GREEK

ENGLISH

ἀληθείας ἀπείρους [519c] ἱκανῶς ἄν ποτε πόλιν ἐπιτροπεῦσαι, μήτε τοὺς ἐν παιδείᾳ ἐωμένους διατρίβειν διὰ τέλους, τοὺς μὲν ὅτι σκοπὸν ἐν τῷ βίῳ οὐκ ἔχουσιν ἕνα, οὗ στοχαζομένους δεῖ ἅπαντα πράττειν ἃ ἂν πράττωσιν ἰδίᾳ τε καὶ δημοσίᾳ, τοὺς δὲ ὅτι ἑκόντες εἶναι οὐ πράξουσιν, ἡγούμενοι ἐν μακάρων νήσοις ζῶντες ἔτι ἀπῳκίσθαι;

ἀληθῆ, ἔφη.

neither the uneducated, who have no experience of truth, [519c] could ever govern a city adequately, nor those who are allowed to spend their whole lives in education? The first because they have no single aim in life at which everything they do, in private and in public, must be directed; the second because they won't act if they can help it, believing they've already emigrated, while still alive, to the Isles of the Blessed."

"True," he said.[2]

519c ἡμέτερον δὴ ἔργον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τῶν οἰκιστῶν τάς τε βελτίστας φύσεις ἀναγκάσαι ἀφικέσθαι πρὸς τὸ μάθημα ὃ ἐν τῷ πρόσθεν ἔφαμεν εἶναι μέγιστον, ἰδεῖν τε τὸ ἀγαθὸν [519d] καὶ ἀναβῆναι ἐκείνην τὴν ἀνάβασιν, καὶ ἐπειδὰν ἀναβάντες ἱκανῶς ἴδωσι, μὴ ἐπιτρέπειν αὐτοῖς ὃ νῦν ἐπιτρέπεται.

τὸ ποῖον δή;

τὸ αὐτοῦ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καταμένειν καὶ μὴ ἐθέλειν πάλιν καταβαίνειν παρ' ἐκείνους τοὺς δεσμώτας μηδὲ μετέχειν τῶν παρ' ἐκείνοις πόνων τε καὶ τιμῶν, εἴτε φαυλότεραι εἴτε σπουδαιότεραι.

"Then it's our job as founders," I said, "to compel the best natures to reach the study we earlier called the greatest: to see the good [519d] and make that ascent. And when they've made it and seen enough, we mustn't allow them what is allowed now."

"What's that?"

"To stay there," I said, "and refuse to go back down to those prisoners, or to share their labors and honors, whether these are of less worth or more serious."

519d ἔπειτ', ἔφη, ἀδικήσομεν αὐτούς, καὶ ποιήσομεν χεῖρον ζῆν, δυνατὸν αὐτοῖς ὂν ἄμεινον; [519e]

ἐπελάθου, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πάλιν, ὦ φίλε, ὅτι νόμῳ οὐ τοῦτο μέλει, ὅπως ἔν τι γένος ἐν πόλει διαφερόντως εὖ πράξει, ἀλλ' ἐν ὅλῃ τῇ πόλει τοῦτο μηχανᾶται ἐγγενέσθαι, συναρμόττων τοὺς πολίτας πειθοῖ τε καὶ ἀνάγκῃ, ποιῶν μεταδιδόναι [520a] ἀλλήλοις τῆς ὠφελίας ἣν ἂν ἕκαστοι τὸ κοινὸν δυνατοὶ ὦσιν ὠφελεῖν καὶ αὐτὸς ἐμποιῶν τοιούτους ἄνδρας ἐν τῇ πόλει, οὐχ ἵνα ἀφιῇ τρέπεσθαι ὅπῃ ἕκαστος βούλεται, ἀλλ' ἵνα καταχρῆται αὐτὸς αὐτοῖς ἐπὶ τὸν σύνδεσμον τῆς πόλεως.

"Then," he said, "are we going to do them wrong, and make them live a worse life when a better one is open to them?" [519e]

"You've forgotten again, my friend," I said, "that the law isn't concerned with making any one class in the city do exceptionally well. It contrives to bring this about in the city as a whole, fitting the citizens together by persuasion and compulsion, and making them share [520a] with one another the benefit each group is able to bring to the community. And it produces such men in the city not so as to let each of them turn wherever he likes, but so as to use them itself to bind the city together."

520a ἀληθῆ, ἔφη· ἐπελαθόμην γάρ.

"True," he said. "I had forgotten."

σκέψαι τοίνυν, εἶπον, ὦ Γλαύκων, ὅτι οὐδ' ἀδικήσομεν τοὺς παρ' ἡμῖν φιλοσόφους γιγνομένους, ἀλλὰ δίκαια πρὸς αὐτοὺς ἐροῦμεν, προσαναγκάζοντες τῶν ἄλλων ἐπιμελεῖσθαί τε καὶ φυλάττειν. ἐροῦμεν γὰρ ὅτι οἱ μὲν ἐν ταῖς ἄλλαις [520b] πόλεσι τοιοῦτοι γιγνόμενοι εἰκότως οὐ μετέχουσι τῶν ἐν αὐταῖς πόνων· αὐτόματοι γὰρ ἐμφύονται ἀκούσης τῆς ἐν ἑκάστῃ πολιτείας, δίκην δ' ἔχει τό γε αὐτοφυὲς μηδενὶ τροφὴν ὀφεῖλον μηδ' ἐκτίνειν τῳ

"Consider, then, Glaucon," I said, "that we won't be doing wrong to those who become philosophers among us either. We'll be saying just things to them when we compel them to care for and guard the others. We'll tell them that those who turn out this way in other [520b] cities are reasonable not to share in the labors there. They grow up spontaneously, against the will of the constitution in each

2 In Greek myth, the Isles of the Blessed were where favored heroes lived in bliss after death.

GREEK

προθυμεῖσθαι τὰ τροφεῖα· ὑμᾶς δ' ἡμεῖς ὑμῖν τε αὐτοῖς τῇ τε ἄλλῃ πόλει ὥσπερ ἐν σμήνεσιν ἡγεμόνας τε καὶ βασιλέας ἐγεννήσαμεν, ἄμεινόν τε καὶ τελεώτερον ἐκείνων πεπαιδευμένους καὶ μᾶλλον δυνατοὺς [520c] ἀμφοτέρων μετέχειν.

[520c] καταβατέον οὖν ἐν μέρει ἑκάστῳ εἰς τὴν τῶν ἄλλων συνοίκησιν καὶ συνεθιστέον τὰ σκοτεινὰ θεάσασθαι· συνεθιζόμενοι γὰρ μυρίῳ βέλτιον ὄψεσθε τῶν ἐκεῖ καὶ γνώσεσθε ἕκαστα τὰ εἴδωλα ἄττα ἐστὶ καὶ ὧν, διὰ τὸ τἀληθῆ ἑωρακέναι καλῶν τε καὶ δικαίων καὶ ἀγαθῶν πέρι. καὶ οὕτω ὕπαρ ἡμῖν καὶ ὑμῖν ἡ πόλις οἰκήσεται ἀλλ' οὐκ ὄναρ, ὡς νῦν αἱ πολλαὶ ὑπὸ σκιαμαχούντων τε πρὸς ἀλλήλους καὶ στασιαζόντων περὶ τοῦ ἄρχειν [520d] οἰκοῦνται, ὡς μεγάλου τινὸς ἀγαθοῦ ὄντος. τὸ δέ που ἀληθὲς ὧδ' ἔχει· ἐν πόλει ᾗ ἥκιστα πρόθυμοι ἄρχειν οἱ μέλλοντες ἄρξειν, ταύτην ἄριστα καὶ ἀστασιαστότατα ἀνάγκη οἰκεῖσθαι, τὴν δ' ἐναντίους ἄρχοντας σχοῦσαν ἐναντίως.

[520d] πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

ἀπειθήσουσιν οὖν ἡμῖν οἴει οἱ τρόφιμοι ταῦτ' ἀκούοντες, καὶ οὐκ ἐθελήσουσιν συμπονεῖν ἐν τῇ πόλει ἕκαστοι ἐν μέρει, τὸν δὲ πολὺν χρόνον μετ' ἀλλήλων οἰκεῖν ἐν τῷ καθαρῷ; [520e]

ἀδύνατον, ἔφη· δίκαια γὰρ δὴ δικαίοις ἐπιτάξομεν. παντὸς μὴν μᾶλλον ὡς ἐπ' ἀναγκαῖον αὐτῶν ἕκαστος εἶσι τὸ ἄρχειν, τοὐναντίον τῶν νῦν ἐν ἑκάστῃ πόλει ἀρχόντων.

[520e] οὕτω γὰρ ἔχει, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ ἑταῖρε· εἰ μὲν βίον ἐξευρήσεις [521a] ἀμείνω τοῦ ἄρχειν τοῖς μέλλουσιν ἄρξειν, ἔστι σοι δυνατὴ γενέσθαι πόλις εὖ οἰκουμένη· ἐν μόνῃ γὰρ αὐτῇ ἄρξουσιν οἱ τῷ ὄντι πλούσιοι, οὐ χρυσίου ἀλλ' οὗ δεῖ τὸν εὐδαίμονα πλουτεῖν, ζωῆς ἀγαθῆς τε καὶ ἔμφρονος. εἰ δὲ πτωχοὶ καὶ πεινῶντες ἀγαθῶν ἰδίων ἐπὶ τὰ δημόσια ἴασιν, ἐντεῦθεν οἰόμενοι τἀγαθὸν δεῖν ἁρπάζειν, οὐκ ἔστι· περιμάχητον γὰρ τὸ ἄρχειν γιγνόμενον, οἰκεῖος ὢν καὶ ἔνδον ὁ τοιοῦτος πόλεμος αὐτούς τε ἀπόλλυσι καὶ τὴν ἄλλην πόλιν.

ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη. [521b]

ENGLISH

city, and it's just that what grows by itself, owing its upbringing to no one, shouldn't be eager to repay the cost of that upbringing to anyone. 'But you we have bred, both for yourselves and for the rest of the city, to be like leaders and kings in a beehive. You have been educated better and more completely than they have, and you are more capable [520c] of taking part in both.

[520c] "'So each of you in turn must go down to live with the others and get used to seeing things in the dark. Once you're used to it, you'll see ten thousand times better than the people there, and you'll know what each of the images is and what it's an image of, because you have seen the truth about beautiful and just and good things. And so the city will be governed by us and by you as a waking reality, not in a dream, the way most cities are governed now, by people who fight one another over shadows and form factions over ruling, [520d] as if it were some great good. But the truth, surely, is this: the city where those who are to rule are least eager to rule must be governed best and with least faction, and the city that gets the opposite kind of rulers must be governed in the opposite way.'"

[520d] "Certainly," he said.

"Then do you think our pupils will disobey us when they hear this, and refuse to take their turn sharing the labors of the city, while spending most of their time living with one another in the pure region?" [520e]

"Impossible," he said. "We'll be giving just orders to just people. But each of them will certainly go to rule as to something necessary—the opposite of those who rule in every city now."

[520e] "That's how it is, my friend," I said. "If you can find a life better [521a] than ruling for those who are going to rule, a well-governed city becomes possible for you. For only in that city will the truly rich rule—rich not in gold but in what a happy person must be rich in: a good and sensible life. But if beggars, starved of goods of their own, go into public affairs thinking that's where they must grab the good from, it isn't possible. Ruling becomes something to fight over, and a war like that, a war within the household, destroys them and the rest of the city too."

"Very true," he said. [521b]

	GREEK	ENGLISH
521b	ἔχεις οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, βίον ἄλλον τινὰ πολιτικῶν ἀρχῶν καταφρονοῦντα ἢ τὸν τῆς ἀληθινῆς φιλοσοφίας;	"Then do you know of any life that looks down on political office," I said, "other than the life of true philosophy?"
	οὐ μὰ τὸν Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"No, by Zeus," he said.
	ἀλλὰ μέντοι δεῖ γε μὴ ἐραστὰς τοῦ ἄρχειν ἰέναι ἐπ' αὐτό· εἰ δὲ μή, οἵ γε ἀντερασταὶ μαχοῦνται.	"But those who go into ruling mustn't be in love with it. Otherwise their rival lovers will fight them."
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	τίνας οὖν ἄλλους ἀναγκάσεις ἰέναι ἐπὶ φυλακὴν τῆς πόλεως ἢ οἳ περὶ τούτων τε φρονιμώτατοι δι' ὧν ἄριστα πόλις οἰκεῖται, ἔχουσί τε τιμὰς ἄλλας καὶ βίον ἀμείνω τοῦ πολιτικοῦ;	"Then whom else will you compel to take on guarding the city, if not those who have the best understanding of what makes a city well governed, and who have other honors and a better life than the political one?"
	οὐδένας ἄλλους, ἔφη. 521c	"No one else," he said. 521c

THE STUDIES THAT DRAW THE SOUL UPWARD

Socrates sets out arithmetic, geometry, astronomy and harmonics as studies that turn the mind toward being.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
521c	**SOCRATES** βούλει οὖν τοῦτ' ἤδη σκοπῶμεν, τίνα τρόπον οἱ τοιοῦτοι ἐγγενήσονται, καὶ πῶς τις ἀνάξει αὐτοὺς εἰς φῶς, ὥσπερ ἐξ Ἅιδου λέγονται δή τινες εἰς θεοὺς ἀνελθεῖν;	**SOCRATES** "Then would you like us to consider now how such people will come to be, and how someone will lead them up into the light, as some are said to have gone up from Hades to the gods?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὐ βούλομαι; ἔφη.	"Of course I would," he said.
	τοῦτο δή, ὡς ἔοικεν, οὐκ ὀστράκου ἂν εἴη περιστροφή, ἀλλὰ ψυχῆς περιαγωγὴ ἐκ νυκτερινῆς τινος ἡμέρας εἰς ἀληθινήν, τοῦ ὄντος οὖσαν ἐπάνοδον, ἣν δὴ φιλοσοφίαν ἀληθῆ φήσομεν εἶναι.	"This, it seems, wouldn't be the flip of a shell. It is the turning around of a soul from a day that is a kind of night to the true day: an ascent to what is, which we'll say is true philosophy."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
	οὐκοῦν δεῖ σκοπεῖσθαι τί τῶν μαθημάτων ἔχει τοιαύτην 521d δύναμιν;	"So we must consider which of the studies has that kind of 521d power?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."[3]
521d	τί ἂν οὖν εἴη, ὦ Γλαύκων, μάθημα ψυχῆς ὁλκὸν ἀπὸ τοῦ γιγνομένου ἐπὶ τὸ ὄν; τόδε δ' ἐννοῶ λέγων ἅμα· οὐκ ἀθλητὰς μέντοι πολέμου ἔφαμεν τούτους ἀναγκαῖον εἶναι νέους ὄντας;	"So what study would draw the soul away from what comes to be toward what is, Glaucon? And as I say this, something else occurs to me. Didn't we say that these people must be athletes of war when they're young?"
	ἔφαμεν γάρ.	"We did."
	δεῖ ἄρα καὶ τοῦτο προσέχειν τὸ μάθημα ὃ ζητοῦμεν πρὸς ἐκείνῳ.	"Then the study we're looking for must have this feature in addition to that one."
	τὸ ποῖον;	"What feature?"
	μὴ ἄχρηστον πολεμικοῖς ἀνδράσιν εἶναι.	"It mustn't be useless to men of war."
	δεῖ μέντοι, ἔφη, εἴπερ οἷόν τε.	

3 "The flip of a shell" refers to a children's game: a shell, dark on one side and light on the other, was tossed to decide which team ran and which chased.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	γυμναστικῇ μὴν καὶ μουσικῇ ἔν γε τῷ πρόσθεν ἐπαιδεύοντο [521e] ἡμῖν.	"It must," he said, "if that's possible."
	ἦν ταῦτα, ἔφη.	"Now earlier we educated them in physical training and in music and poetry." [521e]
		"We did," he said.
521e	καὶ γυμναστικὴ μέν που περὶ γιγνόμενον καὶ ἀπολλύμενον τετεύτακεν· σώματος γὰρ αὔξης καὶ φθίσεως. ἐπιστατεῖ.	"And physical training, I take it, is concerned with what comes to be and passes away, since it presides over the growth and decay of the body."
	φαίνεται.	"So it appears."
	τοῦτο μὲν δὴ οὐκ ἂν εἴη ὃ ζητοῦμεν μάθημα.	"Then it wouldn't be the study we're looking for."
	οὐ γάρ.	"No."
	ἀλλ' ἆρα μουσικὴ ὅσην τὸ πρότερον διήλθομεν;	"What about music and poetry, as far as we described them before?"
522a	ἀλλ' ἦν ἐκείνη γ', ἔφη, ἀντίστροφος τῆς γυμναστικῆς, εἰ μέμνησαι, ἔθεσι παιδεύουσα τοὺς φύλακας, κατά τε ἁρμονίαν εὐαρμοστίαν τινά, οὐκ ἐπιστήμην, παραδιδοῦσα, καὶ κατὰ ῥυθμὸν εὐρυθμίαν, ἔν τε τοῖς λόγοις ἕτερα τούτων ἀδελφὰ ἔθη ἄττα ἔχουσα, καὶ ὅσοι μυθώδεις τῶν λόγων καὶ ὅσοι ἀληθινώτεροι ἦσαν· μάθημα δὲ πρὸς τοιοῦτόν τι [522b] ἄγον, οἷον σὺ νῦν ζητεῖς, οὐδὲν ἦν ἐν αὐτῇ.	"But that was the counterpart of physical training," he said, "if you remember. It educated the guardians through habits. Through harmony it passed on a certain harmoniousness, not knowledge, and through rhythm a certain rhythmicalness; and in its stories, both the more mythical ones and the more truthful, it had other habits akin to these. But there was nothing in it that led toward anything [522b] like what you're looking for now."
	ἀκριβέστατα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀναμιμνῄσκεις με· τῷ γὰρ ὄντι τοιοῦτον οὐδὲν εἶχεν. ἀλλ', ὦ δαιμόνιε Γλαύκων, τί ἂν εἴη τοιοῦτον; αἵ τε γὰρ τέχναι βάναυσοί που ἅπασαι ἔδοξαν εἶναι—	"You remind me very precisely," I said. "It really had nothing of the kind. But then, my wonderful Glaucon, what study would be like that? The crafts all seemed to be menial—"
522b	πῶς δ' οὔ; καὶ μὴν τί ἔτ' ἄλλο λείπεται μάθημα, μουσικῆς καὶ γυμναστικῆς καὶ τῶν τεχνῶν κεχωρισμένον;	"Of course they did. And yet what other study is left, apart from music and poetry, physical training and the crafts?"
	φέρε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἰ μηδὲν ἔτι ἐκτὸς τούτων ἔχομεν λαβεῖν, τῶν ἐπὶ πάντα τεινόντων τι λάβωμεν.	"Come on," I said. "If we can't find anything beyond these, let's take something that extends to all of them."
	τὸ ποῖον; [522c]	"Like what?" [522c]
	οἷον τοῦτο τὸ κοινόν, ᾧ πᾶσαι προσχρῶνται τέχναι τε καὶ διάνοιαι καὶ ἐπιστῆμαι—ὃ καὶ παντὶ ἐν πρώτοις ἀνάγκη μανθάνειν.	"Like this common thing that all crafts and kinds of thought and knowledge make use of—which everyone has to learn among the first things."
	τὸ ποῖον; ἔφη.	"What is it?" he said.
522c	τὸ φαῦλον τοῦτο, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ ἕν τε καὶ τὰ δύο καὶ τὰ τρία διαγιγνώσκειν· λέγω δὲ αὐτὸ ἐν κεφαλαίῳ ἀριθμόν τε καὶ λογισμόν. ἢ οὐχ οὕτω περὶ τούτων ἔχει, ὡς πᾶσα τέχνη τε καὶ ἐπιστήμη ἀναγκάζεται αὐτῶν μέτοχος γίγνεσθαι;	"This humble business," I said, "of telling one and two and three apart. In short, I mean number and calculation. Isn't it true that every craft and every kind of knowledge is compelled to take part in them?"
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ ἡ πολεμική;	"Then the art of war too?" I said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	πολλή, ἔφη, ἀνάγκη. 522d	"It absolutely must," he said. 522d
522d	παγγέλοιον γοῦν, ἔφην, στρατηγὸν Ἀγαμέμνονα ἐν ταῖς τραγῳδίαις Παλαμήδης ἑκάστοτε ἀποφαίνει. ἢ οὐκ ἐννενόηκας ὅτι φησὶν ἀριθμὸν εὑρὼν τάς τε τάξεις τῷ στρατοπέδῳ καταστῆσαι ἐν Ἰλίῳ καὶ ἐξαριθμῆσαι ναῦς τε καὶ τἆλλα πάντα, ὡς πρὸ τοῦ ἀναριθμήτων ὄντων καὶ τοῦ Ἀγαμέμνονος, ὡς ἔοικεν, οὐδ' ὅσους πόδας εἶχεν εἰδότος, εἴπερ ἀριθμεῖν μὴ ἠπίστατο; καίτοι ποῖόν τιν' αὐτὸν οἴει στρατηγὸν εἶναι;	"At any rate," I said, "in the tragedies Palamedes keeps showing Agamemnon up as a thoroughly ridiculous general. Haven't you noticed? He says that he invented number and then drew up the ranks of the army at Troy and counted the ships and everything else, as if they had never been counted before, and Agamemnon, apparently, didn't even know how many feet he had, if he really didn't know how to count. And yet what sort of general do you think he'd be?"
	ἄτοπόν τιν', ἔφη, ἔγωγε, εἰ ἦν τοῦτ' ἀληθές. 522e	"A strange one," he said, "if that were true." 522e
	ἄλλο τι οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μάθημα ἀναγκαῖον πολεμικῷ ἀνδρὶ θήσομεν λογίζεσθαί τε καὶ ἀριθμεῖν δύνασθαι;	"Then shall we set it down," I said, "as a study necessary for a man of war to be able to calculate and count?"[4]
522e	πάντων γ', ἔφη, μάλιστα, εἰ καὶ ὁτιοῦν μέλλει τάξεων ἐπαΐειν, μᾶλλον δ' εἰ καὶ ἄνθρωπος ἔσεσθαι.	"More than anything," he said, "if he's going to understand anything at all about drawing up troops—or rather, if he's going to be a human being at all."
	ἐννοεῖς οὖν, εἶπον, περὶ τοῦτο τὸ μάθημα ὅπερ ἐγώ;	"Then do you notice the same thing about this study that I do?" I said.
	τὸ ποῖον;	"What's that?"
	κινδυνεύει τῶν πρὸς τὴν νόησιν ἀγόντων φύσει εἶναι ὧν ζητοῦμεν, χρῆσθαι δ' οὐδεὶς αὐτῷ ὀρθῶς, ἑλκτικῷ ὄντι παντάπασι πρὸς οὐσίαν.	"It's probably one of the studies we're looking for, those that lead naturally to understanding. But no one uses it correctly, though it is entirely able to draw us toward being."
	πῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις;	"What do you mean?" he said.
	ἐγὼ πειράσομαι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τό γ' ἐμοὶ δοκοῦν δηλῶσαι. ἃ γὰρ διαιροῦμαι παρ' ἐμαυτῷ ἀγωγά τε εἶναι οἷ λέγομεν καὶ μή, συνθεατὴς γενόμενος σύμφαθι ἢ ἄπειπε, ἵνα καὶ τοῦτο σαφέστερον ἴδωμεν εἰ ἔστιν οἷον μαντεύομαι.	"I'll try to show you what I think," I said. "As I distinguish in my own mind the things that lead where we said and those that don't, look along with me and agree or disagree, so that we can see more clearly whether it is as I suspect."
523a	δείκνυ', ἔφη.	"Show me," he said.
	δείκνυμι δή, εἶπον, εἰ καθορᾷς, τὰ μὲν ἐν ταῖς αἰσθήσεσιν 523b οὐ παρακαλοῦντα τὴν νόησιν εἰς ἐπίσκεψιν, ὡς ἱκανῶς ὑπὸ τῆς αἰσθήσεως κρινόμενα, τὰ δὲ παντάπασι διακελευόμενα ἐκείνην ἐπισκέψασθαι, ὡς τῆς αἰσθήσεως οὐδὲν ὑγιὲς ποιούσης.	"I'll show you, then," I said, "if you can make it out. Some objects of perception 523b don't summon understanding to examine them, since perception judges them adequately; others urge it in every way to examine them, since perception produces nothing sound."
	τὰ πόρρωθεν, ἔφη, φαινόμενα δῆλον ὅτι λέγεις καὶ τὰ ἐσκιαγραφημένα.	"You obviously mean things seen at a distance," he said, "and illusionistic paintings."
	οὐ πάνυ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἔτυχες οὗ λέγω.	"You haven't quite hit on what I mean," I said.
	ποῖα μήν, ἔφη, λέγεις;	"Then what do you mean?" he said.

4 Palamedes, a Greek hero at Troy, was credited in legend with inventing numbers, letters and other devices; Aeschylus, Sophocles and Euripides each wrote a play about him.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
523b	τὰ μὲν οὐ παρακαλοῦντα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅσα μὴ ἐκβαίνει [523c] εἰς ἐναντίαν αἴσθησιν ἅμα· τὰ δ' ἐκβαίνοντα ὡς παρακαλοῦντα τίθημι, ἐπειδὰν ἡ αἴσθησις μηδὲν μᾶλλον τοῦτο ἢ τὸ ἐναντίον δηλοῖ, εἴτ' ἐγγύθεν προσπίπτουσα εἴτε πόρρωθεν. ὧδε δὲ ἃ λέγω σαφέστερον εἴσῃ. οὗτοί φαμεν τρεῖς ἂν εἶεν δάκτυλοι, ὅ τε σμικρότατος καὶ ὁ δεύτερος καὶ ὁ μέσος.	"The ones that don't summon it," I said, "are those that don't give rise [523c] to the opposite perception at the same time. The ones that do, I count as summoning, since in their case perception makes this no more evident than its opposite, whether it meets the thing close up or from far away. You'll understand what I mean more clearly this way. Here, we'd say, are three fingers: the smallest, the second, and the middle one."
	πάνυ γ', ἔφη.	"Of course," he said.
	ὡς ἐγγύθεν τοίνυν ὁρωμένους λέγοντός μου διανοοῦ. ἀλλά μοι περὶ αὐτῶν τόδε σκόπει.	"Take it that I'm speaking of them as seen close up. Now here's what I want you to consider about them."
	τὸ ποῖον;	"What?"
523c	δάκτυλος μέν που αὐτῶν φαίνεται ὁμοίως ἕκαστος, καὶ [523d] ταύτῃ γε οὐδὲν διαφέρει, ἐάντε ἐν μέσῳ ὁρᾶται ἐάντ' ἐπ' ἐσχάτῳ, ἐάντε λευκὸς ἐάντε μέλας, ἐάντε παχὺς ἐάντε λεπτός, καὶ πᾶν ὅτι τοιοῦτον. ἐν πᾶσι γὰρ τούτοις οὐκ ἀναγκάζεται τῶν πολλῶν ἡ ψυχὴ τὴν νόησιν ἐπερέσθαι τί ποτ' ἐστὶ δάκτυλος· οὐδαμοῦ γὰρ ἡ ὄψις αὐτῇ ἅμα ἐσήμηνεν τὸ δάκτυλον τοὐναντίον ἢ δάκτυλον εἶναι.	"Each of them appears equally to be a finger, and [523d] in that respect it makes no difference whether it's seen in the middle or at the end, whether it's white or black, thick or thin, or anything of that kind. In all these cases the soul of most people isn't compelled to ask understanding what a finger is, since sight never indicated to it at the same time that the finger was the opposite of a finger."
	οὐ γὰρ οὖν, ἔφη.	"No, it didn't," he said.
	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἰκότως τό γε τοιοῦτον νοήσεως οὐκ [523e] ἂν παρακλητικὸν οὐδ' ἐγερτικὸν εἴη.	"So naturally," I said, "a thing like that wouldn't [523e] summon or awaken understanding."
	εἰκότως.	"Naturally."
523e	τί δὲ δή; τὸ μέγεθος αὐτῶν καὶ τὴν σμικρότητα ἡ ὄψις ἆρα ἱκανῶς ὁρᾷ, καὶ οὐδὲν αὐτῇ διαφέρει ἐν μέσῳ τινὰ αὐτῶν κεῖσθαι ἢ ἐπ' ἐσχάτῳ; καὶ ὡσαύτως πάχος καὶ λεπτότητα ἢ μαλακότητα καὶ σκληρότητα ἡ ἁφή; καὶ αἱ ἄλλαι αἰσθήσεις ἆρ' οὐκ ἐνδεῶς τὰ τοιαῦτα δηλοῦσιν;	"But what about this? Does sight see their largeness and smallness adequately, and does it make no difference to it whether one of them lies in the middle or at the end? And the same with touch, for thickness and thinness, or softness and hardness? And don't the other senses reveal such things deficiently?
	ἦ [524a] ὧδε ποιεῖ ἑκάστη αὐτῶν· πρῶτον μὲν ἡ ἐπὶ τῷ σκληρῷ τεταγμένη αἴσθησις ἠνάγκασται καὶ ἐπὶ τῷ μαλακῷ τετάχθαι, καὶ παραγγέλλει τῇ ψυχῇ ὡς ταὐτὸν σκληρόν τε καὶ μαλακὸν αἰσθανομένη;	"Doesn't [524a] each of them work like this? First, the sense assigned to the hard is necessarily assigned to the soft as well, and it reports to the soul that it perceives the same thing as both hard and soft?"
	οὕτως, ἔφη.	"That's so," he said.
524a	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀναγκαῖον ἔν γε τοῖς τοιούτοις αὖ τὴν ψυχὴν ἀπορεῖν τί ποτε σημαίνει αὕτη ἡ αἴσθησις τὸ σκληρόν, εἴπερ τὸ αὐτὸ καὶ μαλακὸν λέγει, καὶ ἡ τοῦ κούφου καὶ ἡ τοῦ βαρέος, τί τὸ κοῦφον καὶ βαρύ, εἰ τό τε βαρὺ κοῦφον καὶ τὸ κοῦφον βαρὺ σημαίνει; [524b]	"Then in such cases," I said, "the soul must be puzzled about what this perception means by hard, if it says the same thing is soft too; and about what the perception of light and heavy means by light and heavy, if it indicates that the heavy is light and the light heavy?" [524b]
	καὶ γάρ, ἔφη, αὖταί γε ἄτοποι τῇ ψυχῇ αἱ ἑρμηνεῖαι καὶ ἐπισκέψεως δεόμεναι.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"Yes," he said, "these reports are strange to the soul and need examining."
524b	εἰκότως ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐν τοῖς τοιούτοις πρῶτον μὲν πειρᾶται λογισμόν τε καὶ νόησιν ψυχὴ παρακαλοῦσα ἐπισκοπεῖν εἴτε ἓν εἴτε δύο ἐστὶν ἕκαστα τῶν εἰσαγγελλομένων.	"So naturally," I said, "in cases like these the soul first calls on calculation and understanding and tries to examine whether each of the things reported to it is one or two."
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	οὐκοῦν ἐὰν δύο φαίνηται, ἕτερόν τε καὶ ἓν ἑκάτερον φαίνεται;	"And if they appear to be two, doesn't each appear to be different, and one?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	εἰ ἄρα ἓν ἑκάτερον, ἀμφότερα δὲ δύο, τά γε δύο κεχωρισμένα 524c νοήσει· οὐ γὰρ ἂν ἀχώριστά γε δύο ἐνόει, ἀλλ' ἕν.	"So if each is one, and both together are two, it will understand the two as separate, 524c since it wouldn't understand things that weren't separate as two, but as one."
	ὀρθῶς.	"Right."
	μέγα μὴν καὶ ὄψις καὶ σμικρὸν ἑώρα, φαμέν, ἀλλ' οὐ κεχωρισμένον ἀλλὰ συγκεχυμένον τι. ἦ γάρ;	"Sight, too, saw large and small, we say, but not as separate—as something mixed together. Isn't that so?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
524c	διὰ δὲ τὴν τούτου σαφήνειαν μέγα αὖ καὶ σμικρὸν ἡ νόησις ἠναγκάσθη ἰδεῖν, οὐ συγκεχυμένα ἀλλὰ διωρισμένα, τοὐναντίον ἢ ᾿κείνη.	"And to get clear about this, understanding in turn was compelled to see large and small, not mixed together but distinguished, the opposite of the way sight saw them."
	ἀληθῆ.	"True."
	οὐκοῦν ἐντεῦθέν ποθεν πρῶτον ἐπέρχεται ἐρέσθαι ἡμῖν τί οὖν ποτ' ἐστὶ τὸ μέγα αὖ καὶ τὸ σμικρόν;	"And isn't it from here that it first occurs to us to ask what, then, the large is, and the small?"
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν.	"Absolutely."
	καὶ οὕτω δὴ τὸ μὲν νοητόν, τὸ δ' ὁρατὸν ἐκαλέσαμεν. 524d	"And that's how we came to call the one intelligible and the other visible." 524d
	ὀρθότατ', ἔφη.	"Quite right," he said.
524d	ταῦτα τοίνυν καὶ ἄρτι ἐπεχείρουν λέγειν, ὡς τὰ μὲν παρακλητικὰ τῆς διανοίας ἐστί, τὰ δ' οὔ, ἃ μὲν εἰς τὴν αἴσθησιν ἅμα τοῖς ἐναντίοις ἑαυτοῖς ἐμπίπτει, παρακλητικὰ ὁριζόμενος, ὅσα δὲ μή, οὐκ ἐγερτικὰ τῆς νοήσεως.	"That's what I was trying to say just now: that some things summon thought and others don't. Those that strike perception together with their own opposites I defined as summoning; those that don't, as not awakening understanding."
	μανθάνω τοίνυν ἤδη, ἔφη, καὶ δοκεῖ μοι οὕτω.	"Now I understand," he said, "and I think so too."
	τί οὖν; ἀριθμός τε καὶ τὸ ἓν ποτέρων δοκεῖ εἶναι;	"Well then, which of the two do number and the one seem to belong to?"
	οὐ συννοῶ, ἔφη.	"I can't work it out," he said.
	ἀλλ' ἐκ τῶν προειρημένων, ἔφην, ἀναλογίζου. εἰ μὲν γὰρ ἱκανῶς αὐτὸ καθ' αὑτὸ ὁρᾶται ἢ ἄλλῃ τινὶ αἰσθήσει 524e λαμβάνεται τὸ ἕν, οὐκ ἂν ὁλκὸν εἴη ἐπὶ τὴν οὐσίαν, ὥσπερ ἐπὶ τοῦ δακτύλου ἐλέγομεν·	"Then reason it out from what we've said," I said. "If the one is adequately seen itself by itself, or grasped by some other 524e sense, it wouldn't draw us toward being, as we said about the finger.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
524e	εἰ δ' ἀεί τι αὐτῷ ἅμα ὁρᾶται ἐναντίωμα, ὥστε μηδὲν μᾶλλον ἓν ἢ καὶ τοὐναντίον φαίνεσθαι, τοῦ ἐπικρινοῦντος δὴ δέοι ἂν ἤδη καὶ ἀναγκάζοιτ' ἂν ἐν αὐτῷ ψυχὴ ἀπορεῖν καὶ ζητεῖν, κινοῦσα ἐν ἑαυτῇ τὴν ἔννοιαν, καὶ ἀνερωτᾶν τί ποτέ ἐστιν αὐτὸ τὸ ἕν, καὶ οὕτω τῶν [525a] ἀγωγῶν ἂν εἴη καὶ μεταστρεπτικῶν ἐπὶ τὴν τοῦ ὄντος θέαν ἡ περὶ τὸ ἓν μάθησις.	"But if something opposed to it is always seen along with it, so that it appears no more one than the opposite, then there would at once be need of something to judge between them. The soul would be compelled to be puzzled about it and to search, stirring up its thinking within itself, and to ask what the one itself is. In that way the study of the one would be among those [525a] that lead us and turn us around toward the contemplation of what is."
	ἀλλὰ μέντοι, ἔφη, τοῦτό γ' ἔχει οὐχ ἥκιστα ἡ περὶ αὐτὸ ὄψις· ἅμα γὰρ ταὐτὸν ὡς ἕν τε ὁρῶμεν καὶ ὡς ἄπειρα τὸ πλῆθος.	"Well," he said, "sight of it has exactly this feature, more than anything. We see the same thing at once as one and as unlimited in number."
525a	οὐκοῦν εἴπερ τὸ ἕν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ σύμπας ἀριθμὸς ταὐτὸν πέπονθε τοῦτο;	"And if that's true of the one," I said, "isn't the same true of all number?"
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	ἀλλὰ μὴν λογιστική τε καὶ ἀριθμητικὴ περὶ ἀριθμὸν πᾶσα.	"But calculation and arithmetic are entirely about number."
	καὶ μάλα. [525b]	"Very much so." [525b]
	ταῦτα δέ γε φαίνεται ἀγωγὰ πρὸς ἀλήθειαν.	"And they clearly lead toward truth."
	ὑπερφυῶς μὲν οὖν.	"Extraordinarily so."
	ὧν ζητοῦμεν ἄρα, ὡς ἔοικε, μαθημάτων ἂν εἴη· πολεμικῷ μὲν γὰρ διὰ τὰς τάξεις ἀναγκαῖον μαθεῖν ταῦτα, φιλοσόφῳ δὲ διὰ τὸ τῆς οὐσίας ἅπτεον εἶναι γενέσεως ἐξαναδύντι, ἢ μηδέποτε λογιστικῷ γενέσθαι.	"Then it seems they would be among the studies we're looking for. A man of war has to learn them to draw up his troops, and a philosopher because he must rise up out of becoming and grasp being, or else never become skilled at calculation."
	ἔστι ταῦτ', ἔφη.	"That's so," he said.
	ὁ δέ γε ἡμέτερος φύλαξ πολεμικός τε καὶ φιλόσοφος τυγχάνει ὤν.	"And our guardian happens to be both a man of war and a philosopher."
525b	τί μήν;	"Of course."
	προσῆκον δὴ τὸ μάθημα ἂν εἴη, ὦ Γλαύκων, νομοθετῆσαι καὶ πείθειν τοὺς μέλλοντας ἐν τῇ πόλει τῶν μεγίστων [525c] μεθέξειν ἐπὶ λογιστικὴν ἰέναι καὶ ἅπτεσθαι αὐτῆς μὴ ἰδιωτικῶς, ἀλλ' ἕως ἂν ἐπὶ θέαν τῆς τῶν ἀριθμῶν φύσεως ἀφίκωνται τῇ νοήσει αὐτῇ, οὐκ ὠνῆς οὐδὲ πράσεως χάριν ὡς ἐμπόρους ἢ καπήλους μελετῶντας, ἀλλ' ἕνεκα πολέμου τε καὶ αὐτῆς τῆς ψυχῆς ῥᾳστώνης μεταστροφῆς ἀπὸ γενέσεως ἐπ' ἀλήθειάν τε καὶ οὐσίαν.	"Then it would be fitting, Glaucon, to prescribe this study by law, and to persuade those who are going to share in the greatest [525c] matters in the city to go in for calculation and take it up, not as amateurs, but until they arrive at the contemplation of the nature of numbers by understanding itself. They shouldn't practice it for buying and selling, like merchants or shopkeepers, but for the sake of war, and to make it easier for the soul itself to turn from becoming to truth and being."
	κάλλιστ', ἔφη, λέγεις.	"Very well said," he said.
525c	καὶ μήν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, νῦν καὶ ἐννοῶ, ῥηθέντος τοῦ περὶ [525d] τοὺς λογισμοὺς μαθήματος, ὡς κομψόν ἐστι καὶ πολλαχῇ χρήσιμον ἡμῖν πρὸς ὃ βουλόμεθα, ἐὰν τοῦ γνωρίζειν ἕνεκά τις αὐτὸ ἐπιτηδεύῃ ἀλλὰ μὴ τοῦ καπηλεύειν.	"And now that the study of calculation has been mentioned," I said, "I notice [525d] how subtle it is, and how useful in many ways for what we want, if

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	πῇ δή; ἔφη.	one pursues it for the sake of knowing rather than trading." "How so?" he said.
525d	τοῦτό γε, ὃ νυνδὴ ἐλέγομεν, ὡς σφόδρα ἄνω ποι ἄγει τὴν ψυχὴν καὶ περὶ αὐτῶν τῶν ἀριθμῶν ἀναγκάζει διαλέγεσθαι, οὐδαμῇ ἀποδεχόμενον ἐάν τις αὐτῇ ὁρατὰ ἢ ἅπτὰ σώματα ἔχοντας ἀριθμοὺς προτεινόμενος διαλέγηται. οἶσθα γάρ που τοὺς περὶ ταῦτα δεινοὺς αὖ ὡς, ἐάν τις αὐτὸ τὸ 525e ἓν ἐπιχειρῇ τῷ λόγῳ τέμνειν, καταγελῶσί τε καὶ οὐκ ἀποδέχονται, ἀλλ' ἐὰν σὺ κερματίζῃς αὐτό, ἐκεῖνοι πολλαπλασιοῦσιν, εὐλαβούμενοι μή ποτε φανῇ τὸ ἓν μὴ ἓν ἀλλὰ πολλὰ μόρια. ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"In the way we just described. It leads the soul forcefully upward, and compels it to discuss numbers themselves, never accepting it if someone offers it numbers that have visible or tangible bodies. You know, surely, how experts in the subject behave: if someone tries to divide the one itself 525e in argument, they laugh at him and won't accept it. If you cut it up into small change, they multiply it, taking care that the one should never appear to be not one but many parts." "Very true," he said.
526a	τί οὖν οἴει, ὦ Γλαύκων, εἴ τις ἔροιτο αὐτούς· "ὦ θαυμάσιοι, περὶ ποίων ἀριθμῶν διαλέγεσθε, ἐν οἷς τὸ ἓν οἷον ὑμεῖς ἀξιοῦτέ ἐστιν, ἴσον τε ἕκαστον πᾶν παντὶ καὶ οὐδὲ σμικρὸν διαφέρον, μόριόν τε ἔχον ἐν ἑαυτῷ οὐδέν;" τί ἂν οἴει αὐτοὺς ἀποκρίνασθαι; τοῦτο ἔγωγε, ὅτι περὶ τούτων λέγουσιν ὧν διανοηθῆναι μόνον ἐγχωρεῖ, ἄλλως δ' οὐδαμῶς μεταχειρίζεσθαι δυνατόν. ὁρᾷς οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ φίλε, ὅτι τῷ ὄντι ἀναγκαῖον 526b ἡμῖν κινδυνεύει εἶναι τὸ μάθημα, ἐπειδὴ φαίνεταί γε προσαναγκάζον αὐτῇ τῇ νοήσει χρῆσθαι τὴν ψυχὴν ἐπ' αὐτὴν τὴν ἀλήθειαν;	"Then what do you think, Glaucon, if someone asked them, 'My remarkable friends, what sort of numbers are you discussing, in which the one is as you claim—each one equal to every other one, without the slightest difference, and having no parts within itself?' What do you think they'd answer?" "This, I think: that they're talking about numbers that can only be thought, and can't be handled in any other way." "So you see, my friend," I said, "that this study really does seem necessary 526b for us, since it clearly compels the soul to use understanding itself to reach the truth itself?"
526b	καὶ μὲν δή, ἔφη, σφόδρα γε ποιεῖ αὐτό. τί δέ; τόδε ἤδη ἐπεσκέψω, ὡς οἵ τε φύσει λογιστικοὶ εἰς πάντα τὰ μαθήματα ὡς ἔπος εἰπεῖν ὀξεῖς φύονται, οἵ τε βραδεῖς, ἂν ἐν τούτῳ παιδευθῶσιν καὶ γυμνάσωνται, κἂν μηδὲν ἄλλο ὠφεληθῶσιν, ὅμως εἴς γε τὸ ὀξύτεροι αὐτοὶ αὑτῶν γίγνεσθαι πάντες ἐπιδιδόασιν; ἔστιν, ἔφη, οὕτω. 526c καὶ μήν, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, ἅ γε μείζω πόνον παρέχει μανθάνοντι καὶ μελετῶντι, οὐκ ἂν ῥᾳδίως οὐδὲ πολλὰ ἂν εὕροις ὡς τοῦτο. οὐ γὰρ οὖν.	"It certainly does that," he said. "Well, and have you ever noticed that those who are naturally good at calculation are, so to speak, naturally quick at all studies, and that slow people, if they're educated and exercised in it, even if they get no other benefit, all improve at least in becoming quicker than they were?" "That's so," he said. 526c "And I don't think you'd easily find many studies that take more effort to learn and practice than this one." "No, you wouldn't."
526c	πάντων δὴ ἕνεκα τούτων οὐκ ἀφετέον τὸ μάθημα, ἀλλ' οἱ ἄριστοι τὰς φύσεις παιδευτέοι ἐν αὐτῷ. σύμφημι, ἦ δ' ὅς. τοῦτο μὲν τοίνυν, εἶπον, ἓν ἡμῖν κείσθω· δεύτερον δὲ τὸ ἐχόμενον τούτου σκεψώμεθα ἆρά τι προσήκει ἡμῖν.	"For all these reasons, then, we mustn't give up this study. Those with the best natures must be educated in it." "I agree," he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τὸ ποῖον; ἢ γεωμετρίαν, ἔφη, λέγεις;	"Then let that be one thing settled," I said. "Second, let's consider whether the study that comes next is of any use to us."
	αὐτὸ τοῦτο, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. 526d	"What study? Do you mean geometry?" he said. "Exactly that," I said. 526d
526d	ὅσον μέν, ἔφη, πρὸς τὰ πολεμικὰ αὐτοῦ τείνει, δῆλον ὅτι προσήκει· πρὸς γὰρ τὰς στρατοπεδεύσεις καὶ καταλήψεις χωρίων καὶ συναγωγὰς καὶ ἐκτάσεις στρατιᾶς καὶ ὅσα δὴ ἄλλα σχηματίζουσι τὰ στρατόπεδα ἐν αὐταῖς τε ταῖς μάχαις καὶ πορείαις διαφέροι ἂν αὐτὸς αὑτοῦ γεωμετρικός τε καὶ μὴ ὤν.	"As much of it as bears on warfare," he said, "is obviously of use. For pitching camp, seizing positions, concentrating and deploying an army, and all the other formations armies take in battle itself and on the march, the same man would do far better as a geometer than otherwise."
	ἀλλ' οὖν δή, εἶπον, πρὸς μὲν τὰ τοιαῦτα καὶ βραχύ τι ἂν ἐξαρκοῖ γεωμετρίας τε καὶ λογισμῶν μόριον· τὸ δὲ πολὺ αὐτῆς καὶ πορρωτέρω προϊὸν σκοπεῖσθαι δεῖ εἴ τι πρὸς ἐκεῖνο 526e τείνει, πρὸς τὸ ποιεῖν κατιδεῖν ῥᾷον τὴν τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ ἰδέαν. τείνει δέ, φαμέν, πάντα αὐτόσε, ὅσα ἀναγκάζει ψυχὴν εἰς ἐκεῖνον τὸν τόπον μεταστρέφεσθαι ἐν ᾧ ἐστι τὸ εὐδαιμονέστατον τοῦ ὄντος, ὃ δεῖ αὐτὴν παντὶ τρόπῳ ἰδεῖν.	"But for things like that," I said, "even a small portion of geometry and calculation would be enough. What we need to consider is whether the larger and more advanced part of it tends toward that goal: 526e making it easier to see the form of the good. And everything tends that way, we say, that compels the soul to turn toward the region where the most blessed part of what is is found, which the soul must by all means see."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"You're right," he said.
	οὐκοῦν εἰ μὲν οὐσίαν ἀναγκάζει θεάσασθαι, προσήκει, εἰ δὲ γένεσιν, οὐ προσήκει.	"Then if it compels us to contemplate being, it's of use; if becoming, it isn't."
	φαμέν γε δή.	"That's what we say."
527a	οὐ τοίνυν τοῦτό γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀμφισβητήσουσιν ἡμῖν ὅσοι καὶ σμικρὰ γεωμετρίας ἔμπειροι, ὅτι αὖτη ἡ ἐπιστήμη πᾶν τοὐναντίον ἔχει τοῖς ἐν αὐτῇ λόγοις λεγομένοις ὑπὸ τῶν μεταχειριζομένων.	"Well, no one with even a little experience of geometry," I said, "will dispute this with us: that this science is the complete opposite of the way its practitioners talk about it."
	πῶς; ἔφη.	"How so?" he said.
	λέγουσι μέν που μάλα γελοίως τε καὶ ἀναγκαίως· ὡς γὰρ πράττοντές τε καὶ πράξεως ἕνεκα πάντας τοὺς λόγους ποιούμενοι λέγουσιν τετραγωνίζειν τε καὶ παρατείνειν καὶ προστιθέναι καὶ πάντα οὕτω φθεγγόμενοι, τὸ δ' ἔστι που 527b πᾶν τὸ μάθημα γνώσεως ἕνεκα ἐπιτηδευόμενον.	"They talk, I think, in a very ridiculous way, though they can't help it. They speak as if they were doing something, and make all their statements for the sake of action: 'squaring,' 'applying,' 'adding,' and so on. But in fact the whole 527b subject is pursued for the sake of knowledge."
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
	οὐκοῦν τοῦτο ἔτι διομολογητέον;	"Mustn't we agree to something further?"
	τὸ ποῖον;	"What?"
527b	ὡς τοῦ ἀεὶ ὄντος γνώσεως, ἀλλὰ οὐ τοῦ ποτέ τι γιγνομένου καὶ ἀπολλυμένου.	"That it's knowledge of what always is, not of something that at some time comes to be and passes away."
	εὐομολόγητον, ἔφη· τοῦ γὰρ ἀεὶ ὄντος ἡ γεωμετρικὴ γνῶσίς ἐστιν.	"That's easily agreed," he said. "Geometry is knowledge of what always is."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ὁλκὸν ἄρα, ὦ γενναῖε, ψυχῆς πρὸς ἀλήθειαν εἴη ἂν καὶ ἀπεργαστικὸν φιλοσόφου διανοίας πρὸς τὸ ἄνω σχεῖν ἃ νῦν κάτω οὐ δέον ἔχομεν.	"Then, my noble friend, it would draw the soul toward truth, and produce philosophical thought, so that we turn upward what we now wrongly turn downward."
	ὡς οἷόν τε μάλιστα, ἔφη. [527c]	"As much as anything can," he said. [527c]
	ὡς οἷόν τ' ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μάλιστα προστακτέον ὅπως οἱ ἐν τῇ καλλιπόλει σοι μηδενὶ τρόπῳ γεωμετρίας ἀφέξονται. καὶ γὰρ τὰ πάρεργα αὐτοῦ οὐ σμικρά.	"Then as much as anything can," I said, "we must order that the people in your beautiful city by no means neglect geometry. Its by-products aren't trivial either."
	ποῖα; ἦ δ' ὅς.	"What are they?" he said.
527c	ἅ τε δὴ σὺ εἶπες, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὰ περὶ τὸν πόλεμον, καὶ δὴ καὶ πρὸς πάσας μαθήσεις, ὥστε κάλλιον ἀποδέχεσθαι, ἴσμεν που ὅτι τῷ ὅλῳ καὶ παντὶ διοίσει ἡμμένος τε γεωμετρίας καὶ μή.	"The ones you mentioned," I said, "concerning war. And as for taking in all other studies better, we know, surely, that someone who has grasped geometry will be completely different from someone who hasn't."
	τῷ παντὶ μέντοι νὴ Δί', ἔφη.	"Completely, by Zeus," he said.
	δεύτερον δὴ τοῦτο τιθῶμεν μάθημα τοῖς νέοις;	"Shall we set this down as the second study for the young, then?"
	τιθῶμεν, ἔφη. [527d]	"Let's," he said. [527d]
	τί δέ; τρίτον θῶμεν ἀστρονομίαν; ἢ οὐ δοκεῖ;	"Well then, shall we set down astronomy third? Or don't you think so?"
	ἐμοὶ γοῦν, ἔφη· τὸ γὰρ περὶ ὥρας εὐαισθητοτέρως ἔχειν καὶ μηνῶν καὶ ἐνιαυτῶν οὐ μόνον γεωργίᾳ οὐδὲ ναυτιλίᾳ προσήκει, ἀλλὰ καὶ στρατηγίᾳ οὐχ ἧττον.	"I do," he said. "Being more perceptive about the seasons, months and years is fitting not only for farming and navigation, but just as much for generalship."
527d	ἡδὺς εἶ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι ἔοικας δεδιότι τοὺς πολλούς, μὴ δοκῇς ἄχρηστα μαθήματα προστάττειν. τὸ δ' ἔστιν οὐ πάνυ φαῦλον ἀλλὰ χαλεπὸν πιστεῦσαι ὅτι ἐν τούτοις τοῖς μαθήμασιν ἑκάστου ὄργανόν τι ψυχῆς ἐκκαθαίρεταί τε καὶ [527e] ἀναζωπυρεῖται ἀπολλύμενον καὶ τυφλούμενον ὑπὸ τῶν ἄλλων ἐπιτηδευμάτων, κρεῖττον ὂν σωθῆναι μυρίων ὀμμάτων· μόνῳ γὰρ αὐτῷ ἀλήθεια ὁρᾶται. οἷς μὲν οὖν ταῦτα συνδοκεῖ ἀμηχάνως ὡς εὖ δόξεις λέγειν, ὅσοι δὲ τούτου μηδαμῇ ἠσθημένοι εἰσὶν εἰκότως ἡγήσονταί σε λέγειν οὐδέν· ἄλλην γὰρ ἀπ' αὐτῶν οὐχ ὁρῶσιν ἀξίαν λόγου ὠφελίαν.	"You amuse me," I said. "You seem to be afraid the majority will think you're prescribing useless studies. But it's no trivial matter—in fact it's hard—to believe that in these studies an instrument in each person's soul is purified and [527e] rekindled, after being destroyed and blinded by other pursuits; and this instrument is more worth saving than ten thousand eyes, since truth is seen by it alone. Those who share this view will think you're speaking remarkably well. But those who've never had any inkling of it will naturally think you're talking nonsense, since they see no other benefit from these studies worth mentioning.
527e	σκόπει [528a] οὖν αὐτόθεν πρὸς ποτέρους διαλέγῃ· ἢ οὐδὲ πρὸς ἑτέρους, ἀλλὰ σαυτοῦ ἕνεκα τὸ μέγιστον ποιῇ τοὺς λόγους, φθονοῖς μὴν οὐδ' ἂν ἄλλῳ, εἴ τίς τι δύναιτο ἀπ' αὐτῶν ὄνασθαι.	"So decide right now [528a] which group you're talking to. Or perhaps it's neither, and you're making your arguments mainly for your own sake, though you wouldn't begrudge anyone else whatever benefit he might get from them."
	οὕτως, ἔφη, αἱροῦμαι, ἐμαυτοῦ ἕνεκα τὸ πλεῖστον λέγειν τε καὶ ἐρωτᾶν καὶ ἀποκρίνεσθαι.	"That's my choice," he said: "to speak, ask and answer mainly for my own sake."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἄναγε τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἰς τοὐπίσω· νυνδὴ γὰρ οὐκ ὀρθῶς τὸ ἑξῆς ἐλάβομεν τῇ γεωμετρίᾳ.	"Then back up a step," I said. "Just now we didn't take the subject that comes after geometry correctly."
	πῶς λαβόντες; ἔφη.	"How did we take it?" he said.
528a	μετὰ ἐπίπεδον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐν περιφορᾷ ὂν ἤδη στερεὸν 528b λαβόντες, πρὶν αὐτὸ καθ' αὑτὸ λαβεῖν· ὀρθῶς δὲ ἔχει ἑξῆς μετὰ δευτέραν αὔξην τρίτην λαμβάνειν. ἔστι δέ που τοῦτο περὶ τὴν τῶν κύβων αὔξην καὶ τὸ βάθους μετέχον.	"After plane surfaces," I said, "we went straight to solids in rotation, taking up the solid 528b before we'd studied it by itself. But the right thing is to take the third dimension straight after the second. And that, I think, is the dimension of cubes and whatever has depth."
	ἔστι γάρ, ἔφη· ἀλλὰ ταῦτά γε, ὦ Σώκρατες, δοκεῖ οὔπω ηὑρῆσθαι.	"Yes, it is," he said. "But these things, Socrates, don't seem to have been discovered yet."
528b	διττὰ γάρ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὰ αἴτια· ὅτι τε οὐδεμία πόλις ἐντίμως αὐτὰ ἔχει, ἀσθενῶς ζητεῖται χαλεπὰ ὄντα, ἐπιστάτου τε δέονται οἱ ζητοῦντες, ἄνευ οὗ οὐκ ἂν εὕροιεν, ὃν πρῶτον μὲν γενέσθαι χαλεπόν, ἔπειτα καὶ γενομένου, ὡς νῦν ἔχει, 528c οὐκ ἂν πείθοιντο οἱ περὶ ταῦτα ζητητικοὶ μεγαλοφρονούμενοι. εἰ δὲ πόλις ὅλη συνεπιστατοῖ ἐντίμως ἄγουσα αὐτά, οὗτοί τε ἂν πείθοιντο καὶ συνεχῶς τε ἂν καὶ ἐντόνως ζητούμενα ἐκφανῆ γένοιτο ὅπῃ ἔχει· ἐπεὶ καὶ νῦν ὑπὸ τῶν πολλῶν ἀτιμαζόμενα καὶ κολουόμενα, ὑπὸ δὲ τῶν ζητούντων λόγον οὐκ ἐχόντων καθ' ὅτι χρήσιμα, ὅμως πρὸς ἅπαντα ταῦτα βίᾳ ὑπὸ χάριτος αὐξάνεται, καὶ οὐδὲν θαυμαστὸν αὐτὰ φανῆναι. 528d	"There are two reasons for that," I said. "First, since no city holds these things in honor, they're researched feebly, being difficult. Second, the researchers need a director, without whom they won't make discoveries. It's hard for such a director to appear in the first place; and even if one did, as things stand 528c the researchers in this field are too proud to obey him. But if a whole city joined in directing them and held these things in honor, the researchers would obey, and with continuous and vigorous research the truth about them would come to light. Even now, slighted and stunted as they are by the many, and by researchers who can't say what they're useful for, they grow in spite of all this, by the force of their charm; so it wouldn't be surprising if they came to light." 528d
528d	καὶ μὲν δή, ἔφη, τό γε ἐπίχαρι καὶ διαφερόντως ἔχει. ἀλλά μοι σαφέστερον εἰπὲ ἃ νυνδὴ ἔλεγες. τὴν μὲν γάρ που τοῦ ἐπιπέδου πραγματείαν γεωμετρίαν ἐτίθεις.	"Yes," he said, "they certainly have exceptional charm. But explain more clearly what you were saying just now. You were counting the study of plane surfaces as geometry."
	ναί, ἦν δ' ἐγώ.	"Yes," I said.
	εἶτά γ', ἔφη, τὸ μὲν πρῶτον ἀστρονομίαν μετὰ ταύτην, ὕστερον δ' ἀνεχώρησας.	"And then," he said, "at first you put astronomy after it, but later you went back."
	σπεύδων γάρ, ἔφην, ταχὺ πάντα διεξελθεῖν μᾶλλον βραδύνω· ἑξῆς γὰρ οὖσαν τὴν βάθους αὔξης μέθοδον, ὅτι τῇ ζητήσει γελοίως ἔχει, ὑπερβὰς αὐτὴν μετὰ γεωμετρίαν 528e ἀστρονομίαν ἔλεγον, φορὰν οὖσαν βάθους.	"Yes," I said, "in my hurry to go through everything quickly, I'm getting there more slowly. The investigation of the dimension of depth came next, but because research into it is in a ridiculous state, I skipped it and after geometry 528e spoke of astronomy, which is the motion of what has depth."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"That's right," he said.
528e		"Then let's set astronomy down as the fourth study," I said, "on the assumption that the one

GREEK

τέταρτον τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τιθῶμεν μάθημα ἀστρονομίαν, ὡς ὑπαρχούσης τῆς νῦν παραλειπομένης, ἐὰν αὐτὴν πόλις μετίῃ.

εἰκός, ἦ δ' ὅς. καὶ ὅ γε νυνδή μοι, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἐπέπληξας περὶ ἀστρονομίας ὡς φορτικῶς ἐπαινοῦντι, νῦν ᾗ σὺ μετέρχῃ [529a] ἐπαινῶ· παντὶ γάρ μοι δοκεῖ δῆλον ὅτι αὕτη γε ἀναγκάζει ψυχὴν εἰς τὸ ἄνω ὁρᾶν καὶ ἀπὸ τῶν ἐνθένδε ἐκεῖσε ἄγει.

ἴσως, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, παντὶ δῆλον πλὴν ἐμοί· ἐμοὶ γὰρ οὐ δοκεῖ οὕτως.

ἀλλὰ πῶς; ἔφη.

529a ὡς μὲν νῦν αὐτὴν μεταχειρίζονται οἱ εἰς φιλοσοφίαν ἀνάγοντες, πάνυ ποιεῖν κάτω βλέπειν.

πῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις;

οὐκ ἀγεννῶς μοι δοκεῖς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὴν περὶ τὰ ἄνω μάθησιν λαμβάνειν παρὰ σαυτῷ ἥ ἐστι· κινδυνεύεις γὰρ [529b] καὶ εἴ τις ἐν ὀροφῇ ποικίλματα θεώμενος ἀνακύπτων καταμανθάνοι τι, ἡγεῖσθαι ἂν αὐτὸν νοήσει ἀλλ' οὐκ ὄμμασι θεωρεῖν. ἴσως οὖν καλῶς ἡγῇ, ἐγὼ δ' εὐηθικῶς. ἐγὼ γὰρ αὖ οὐ δύναμαι ἄλλο τι νομίσαι ἄνω ποιοῦν ψυχὴν βλέπειν μάθημα ἢ ἐκεῖνο ὃ ἂν περὶ τὸ ὂν τε ᾖ καὶ τὸ ἀόρατον, ἐάν τέ τις ἄνω κεχηνὼς ἢ κάτω συμμεμυκὼς τῶν αἰσθητῶν τι ἐπιχειρῇ μανθάνειν, οὔτε μαθεῖν ἄν ποτέ φημι αὐτόν—ἐπιστήμην [529c] γὰρ οὐδὲν ἔχειν τῶν τοιούτων—οὔτε ἄνω ἀλλὰ κάτω αὐτοῦ βλέπειν τὴν ψυχήν, κἂν ἐξ ὑπτίας νέων ἐν γῇ ἢ ἐν θαλάττῃ μανθάνῃ.

529c δίκην, ἔφη, ἔχω· ὀρθῶς γάρ μοι ἐπέπληξας. ἀλλὰ πῶς δὴ ἔλεγες δεῖν ἀστρονομίαν μανθάνειν παρὰ ἃ νῦν μανθάνουσιν, εἰ μέλλοιεν ὠφελίμως πρὸς ἃ λέγομεν μαθήσεσθαι;

ὧδε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. ταῦτα μὲν τὰ ἐν τῷ οὐρανῷ ποικίλματα, ἐπείπερ ἐν ὁρατῷ πεποίκιλται, κάλλιστα μὲν ἡγεῖσθαι καὶ [529d] ἀκριβέστατα τῶν τοιούτων ἔχειν, τῶν δὲ ἀληθινῶν πολὺ ἐνδεῖν, ἃς τὸ ὂν τάχος καὶ ἡ οὖσα βραδυτὴς ἐν τῷ ἀληθινῷ ἀριθμῷ καὶ πᾶσι τοῖς ἀληθέσι σχήμασι φοράς τε πρὸς ἄλληλα φέρεται καὶ τὰ ἐνόντα φέρει, ἃ δὴ λόγῳ μὲν καὶ διανοίᾳ ληπτά, ὄψει δ' οὔ· ἢ σὺ οἴει;

οὐδαμῶς γε, ἔφη.

ENGLISH

we're now leaving out will be available if a city pursues it."

"That's reasonable," he said. "And Socrates, since you scolded me just now for praising astronomy in a vulgar way, I'll now praise it on the lines you're pursuing. [529a] I think it's clear to everyone that this study compels the soul to look upward, and leads it from things here to things there."

"Perhaps it's clear to everyone but me," I said. "I don't think so."

"What do you think, then?" he said.

"The way it's handled now by those who lead people up into philosophy, it makes the soul look very much downward."

"What do you mean?" he said.

"It seems to me," I said, "that you have a rather lordly idea of what the study of things 'above' is. You look likely to think that [529b] if someone tipped his head back and learned something by gazing at decorations on a ceiling, he was contemplating them with his understanding and not with his eyes. Maybe you're right to think so, and I'm being simple-minded. But I, for my part, can't believe that any study makes the soul look upward except the one concerned with what is and is invisible. If someone tries to learn about any perceptible thing, whether gaping upward or squinting down, I say he will never learn it—for there is no knowledge [529c] of such things—and that his soul is looking not up but down, even if he does his studying floating on his back, on land or at sea."

"I've got what I deserve," he said. "You were right to rebuke me. But what did you mean when you said astronomy should be studied differently from the way it's studied now, if it's to be learned in a way that's useful for our purposes?"

"This," I said. "These decorations in the sky, since they are embroidered on something visible, should be regarded as the most beautiful and [529d] most precise of such things, but as falling far short of the true ones—the motions with which real speed and real slowness, in true number and in all the true figures, move relative to each other and carry along what is in them. These can be grasped by reason and thought, but not by sight. Or do you think otherwise?"

GREEK	ENGLISH
	"Not at all," he said.
529d οὐκοῦν, εἶπον, τῇ περὶ τὸν οὐρανὸν ποικιλίᾳ παραδείγμασι χρηστέον τῆς πρὸς ἐκεῖνα μαθήσεως ἕνεκα, ὁμοίως ὥσπερ ἂν [529e] εἴ τις ἐντύχοι ὑπὸ Δαιδάλου ἤ τινος ἄλλου δημιουργοῦ ἢ γραφέως διαφερόντως γεγραμμένοις καὶ ἐκπεπονημένοις διαγράμμασιν.	"Then we should use the decoration in the sky as models for the sake of learning about those other things," I said, "just as [529e] we would if we came across diagrams drawn and worked out with exceptional skill by Daedalus or some other craftsman or painter.
ἡγήσαιτο γὰρ ἄν πού τις ἔμπειρος γεωμετρίας, ἰδὼν τὰ τοιαῦτα, κάλλιστα μὲν ἔχειν ἀπεργασίᾳ, γελοῖον μὴν ἐπισκοπεῖν αὐτὰ σπουδῇ ὡς τὴν ἀλήθειαν ἐν αὐτοῖς ληψόμενον [530a] ἴσων ἢ διπλασίων ἢ ἄλλης τινὸς συμμετρίας.	"Anyone experienced in geometry who saw such things would presumably think them superbly made, but would think it ridiculous to study them seriously in the expectation of finding in them the truth about [530a] equals or doubles or any other ratio."
τί δ' οὐ μέλλει γελοῖον εἶναι; ἔφη.	"How could it not be ridiculous?" he said.[5]
530a τῷ ὄντι δὴ ἀστρονομικόν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὄντα οὐκ οἴει ταὐτὸν πείσεσθαι εἰς τὰς τῶν ἄστρων φορὰς ἀποβλέποντα; νομιεῖν μὲν ὡς οἷόν τε κάλλιστα τὰ τοιαῦτα ἔργα συστήσασθαι, οὕτω συνεστάναι τῷ τοῦ οὐρανοῦ δημιουργῷ αὐτόν τε καὶ τὰ ἐν αὐτῷ· τὴν δὲ νυκτὸς πρὸς ἡμέραν συμμετρίαν καὶ τούτων πρὸς μῆνα καὶ μηνὸς πρὸς ἐνιαυτὸν καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ἄστρων [530b] πρός τε ταῦτα καὶ πρὸς ἄλληλα, οὐκ ἄτοπον, οἴει, ἡγήσεται τὸν νομίζοντα γίγνεσθαί τε ταῦτα ἀεὶ ὡσαύτως καὶ οὐδαμῇ οὐδὲν παραλλάττειν, σῶμά τε ἔχοντα καὶ ὁρώμενα, καὶ ζητεῖν παντὶ τρόπῳ τὴν ἀλήθειαν αὐτῶν λαβεῖν;	"Well, don't you think someone who is really an astronomer will feel the same way when he looks at the motions of the stars?" I said. "He'll believe that the craftsman of the heavens put together the heavens themselves and what is in them as beautifully as such works can be put together. But as for the ratio of night to day, and of these to the month, and of the month to the year, and of the other stars [530b] to these and to one another—don't you think he'll consider it strange to believe that these things always happen in the same way and never deviate in any respect, even though they have bodies and are visible, and to seek by every means to grasp the truth about them?"
530b ἐμοὶ γοῦν δοκεῖ, ἔφη, σοῦ νῦν ἀκούοντι.	"I certainly think so," he said, "now that I hear it from you."
προβλήμασιν ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, χρώμενοι ὥσπερ γεωμετρίαν οὕτω καὶ ἀστρονομίαν μέτιμεν, τὰ δ' ἐν τῷ οὐρανῷ ἐάσομεν, εἰ μέλλομεν ὄντως ἀστρονομίας μεταλαμβάνοντες χρήσιμον [530c] τὸ φύσει φρόνιμον ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ ἐξ ἀχρήστου ποιήσειν.	"Then we'll pursue astronomy as we do geometry," I said, "by means of problems, and leave the things in the sky alone, if we're really going to take part in astronomy and make [530c] the naturally wise part of the soul useful instead of useless."
ἦ πολλαπλάσιον, ἔφη, τὸ ἔργον ἢ ὡς νῦν ἀστρονομεῖται προστάττεις.	"You're prescribing a task many times greater than the way astronomy is done now," he said.
οἶμαι δέ γε, εἶπον, καὶ τἆλλα κατὰ τὸν αὐτὸν τρόπον προστάξειν ἡμᾶς, ἐάν τι ἡμῶν ὡς νομοθετῶν ὄφελος ᾖ. ἀλλὰ γάρ τι ἔχεις ὑπομνῆσαι τῶν προσηκόντων μαθημάτων;	"Yes," I said, "and I think we'll prescribe everything else in the same way too, if we're to be of any use as lawgivers. But can you suggest any other suitable subject?"
οὐκ ἔχω, ἔφη, νῦν γ' οὑτωσί.	"Not right now, just like that," he said.
530c	"Well, motion presents not one kind but several," I said, [530d] "as I think. Some wise person will per-

GREEK

οὐ μὴν ἔν, ἀλλὰ πλείω, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἴδη παρέχεται ἡ φορά, [530d] ὡς ἐγῷμαι. τὰ μὲν οὖν πάντα ἴσως ὅστις σοφὸς ἔξει εἰπεῖν· ἃ δὲ καὶ ἡμῖν προφανῆ, δύο.

ποῖα δή;

πρὸς τούτῳ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀντίστροφον αὐτοῦ.

τὸ ποῖον;

κινδυνεύει, ἔφην, ὡς πρὸς ἀστρονομίαν ὄμματα πέπηγεν, ὣς πρὸς ἐναρμόνιον φορὰν ὦτα παγῆναι, καὶ αὗται ἀλλήλων ἀδελφαί τινες αἱ ἐπιστῆμαι εἶναι, ὡς οἵ τε Πυθαγόρειοί φασι καὶ ἡμεῖς, ὦ Γλαύκων, συγχωροῦμεν. ἢ πῶς ποιοῦμεν;

οὕτως, ἔφη. [530e]

ENGLISH

haps be able to name them all; but there are two that are obvious even to us."

"What are they?"

"Besides the one we've discussed," I said, "its counterpart."

"What's that?"

"It looks as if, just as the eyes are fixed on astronomy," I said, "so the ears are fixed on harmonic motion, and these two sciences are sisters of a sort, as the Pythagoreans say and as we agree, Glaucon. Or what do we do?"

"We agree," he said. [530e] [6]

530e οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐπειδὴ πολὺ τὸ ἔργον, ἐκείνων πευσόμεθα πῶς λέγουσι περὶ αὐτῶν καὶ εἴ τι ἄλλο πρὸς τούτοις· ἡμεῖς δὲ παρὰ πάντα ταῦτα φυλάξομεν τὸ ἡμέτερον.

ποῖον;

μή ποτ' αὐτῶν τι ἀτελὲς ἐπιχειρῶσιν ἡμῖν μανθάνειν οὓς θρέψομεν, καὶ οὐκ ἐξῆκον ἐκεῖσε ἀεί, οἷ πάντα δεῖ ἀφήκειν, οἷον ἄρτι περὶ τῆς ἀστρονομίας ἐλέγομεν.

ἢ οὐκ οἶσθ' ὅτι [531a] καὶ περὶ ἁρμονίας ἕτερον τοιοῦτον ποιοῦσι; τὰς γὰρ ἀκουομένας αὖ συμφωνίας καὶ φθόγγους ἀλλήλοις ἀναμετροῦντες ἀνήνυτα, ὥσπερ οἱ ἀστρονόμοι, πονοῦσιν.

"Then since the task is a big one," I said, "we'll find out from them what they say about these things and whatever else there is besides. But through all of it we'll hold on to our own principle."

"What's that?"

"That those we are going to raise should never attempt to learn any part of these subjects that is incomplete and doesn't always arrive at the point where everything ought to end up, as we were just saying about astronomy.

"Or don't you know that [531a] they do the same kind of thing with harmony too? They measure audible concords and sounds against one another, and so, like the astronomers, they labor to no end."

531a νὴ τοὺς θεούς, ἔφη, καὶ γελοίως γε, πυκνώματ' ἄττα ὀνομάζοντες καὶ παραβάλλοντες τὰ ὦτα, οἷον ἐκ γειτόνων φωνὴν θηρευόμενοι, οἱ μέν φασιν ἔτι κατακούειν ἐν μέσῳ τινὰ ἠχὴν καὶ σμικρότατον εἶναι τοῦτο διάστημα, ᾧ μετρητέον, οἱ δὲ ἀμφισβητοῦντες ὡς ὅμοιον ἤδη φθεγγομένων, ἀμφότεροι [531b] ὦτα τοῦ νοῦ προστησάμενοι.

"Yes, by the gods," he said, "and ridiculously too. They talk about certain 'densities' and put their ears to the strings as if trying to catch a voice from next door. Some say they can still hear a sound in between, and that this is the smallest interval, the one that should be the unit of measure; others argue that the strings are now sounding the same note. Both [531b] put their ears ahead of their understanding."[7]

531b σὺ μέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοὺς χρηστοὺς λέγεις τοὺς ταῖς χορδαῖς πράγματα παρέχοντας καὶ βασανίζοντας, ἐπὶ τῶν κολλόπων στρεβλοῦντας· ἵνα δὲ μὴ μακροτέρα ἡ εἰκὼν γίγνηται πλήκτρῳ τε πληγῶν γιγνομένων καὶ κατηγορίας πέρι καὶ ἐξαρνήσεως καὶ ἀλαζονείας χορδῶν, παύομαι τῆς εἰκόνος καὶ οὔ φημι τούτους λέγειν, ἀλλ' ἐκείνους οὓς ἔφαμεν νυνδὴ περὶ ἁρμονίας ἐρήσεσθαι. ταὐτὸν γὰρ

"You mean those excellent people who harass the strings and torture them, racking them on the pegs," I said. "But so that the image doesn't get too long—with blows from the plectrum, and accusations against the strings, and denials and brazenness on their part—I'll drop the image. I don't mean these people but the ones we said just now

5 Daedalus was the legendary master craftsman of Greek myth, said to have made statues so lifelike they moved.
6 The Pythagoreans, followers of Pythagoras (sixth century BC), studied numerical ratios in music and in the heavens.
7 "Densities" (πυκνώματα) was a technical term of Greek music theory for clusters of very small intervals.

GREEK

ποιοῦσι τοῖς ἐν τῇ [531c] ἀστρονομίᾳ· τοὺς γὰρ ἐν ταύταις ταῖς συμφωνίαις ταῖς ἀκουομέναις ἀριθμοὺς ζητοῦσιν, ἀλλ' οὐκ εἰς προβλήματα ἀνίασιν, ἐπισκοπεῖν τίνες σύμφωνοι ἀριθμοὶ καὶ τίνες οὔ, καὶ διὰ τί ἑκάτεροι.

ENGLISH

we'd ask about harmony. They do the same thing as the [531c] astronomers: they look for the numbers in these audible concords, but they don't go up to problems, to investigate which numbers are concordant and which are not, and why in each case."

531c δαιμόνιον γάρ, ἔφη, πρᾶγμα λέγεις.

χρήσιμον μὲν οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πρὸς τὴν τοῦ καλοῦ τε καὶ ἀγαθοῦ ζήτησιν, ἄλλως δὲ μεταδιωκόμενον ἄχρηστον.

εἰκός γ', ἔφη.

οἶμαι δέ γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ ἡ τούτων πάντων ὧν διεληλύθαμεν [531d] μέθοδος ἐὰν μὲν ἐπὶ τὴν ἀλλήλων κοινωνίαν ἀφίκηται καὶ συγγένειαν, καὶ συλλογισθῇ ταῦτα ᾗ ἐστὶν ἀλλήλοις οἰκεῖα, φέρειν τι αὐτῶν εἰς ἃ βουλόμεθα τὴν πραγματείαν καὶ οὐκ ἀνόνητα πονεῖσθαι, εἰ δὲ μή, ἀνόνητα.

καὶ ἐγώ, ἔφη, οὕτω μαντεύομαι. ἀλλὰ πάμπολυ ἔργον λέγεις, ὦ Σώκρατες.

"That's a superhuman task you're describing," he said.

"A useful one, rather," I said, "for the search for the beautiful and the good, but useless if pursued in any other way."

"Likely enough," he said.

"And I think," I said, "that if the study of all these things we've gone through [531d] reaches their community and kinship with one another, and works out how they are related, then pursuing them contributes something to what we want, and the labor isn't wasted; but otherwise it is."

"I suspect so too," he said. "But it's an enormous task you're talking about, Socrates."

DIALECTIC

Socrates presents dialectic as the crowning study, which reaches the first principle of all.

GREEK

531d **SOCRATES** τοῦ προοιμίου, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἢ τίνος λέγεις; ἢ οὐκ ἴσμεν ὅτι πάντα ταῦτα προοίμιά ἐστιν αὐτοῦ τοῦ νόμου ὃν δεῖ μαθεῖν; οὐ γάρ που δοκοῦσί γέ σοι οἱ ταῦτα δεινοὶ διαλεκτικοὶ [531e] εἶναι.

οὐ μὰ τὸν Δί', ἔφη, εἰ μὴ μάλα γέ τινες ὀλίγοι ὧν ἐγὼ ἐντετύχηκα.

ἀλλὰ δή, εἶπον, μὴ δυνατοὶ οἵτινες δοῦναί τε καὶ ἀποδέξασθαι λόγον εἴσεσθαί ποτέ τι ὧν φαμεν δεῖν εἰδέναι;

οὐδ' αὖ, ἔφη, τοῦτό γε.

532a οὐκοῦν, εἶπον, ὦ Γλαύκων, οὗτος ἤδη αὐτός ἐστιν ὁ νόμος ὃν τὸ διαλέγεσθαι περαίνει; ὃν καὶ ὄντα νοητὸν μιμοῖτ' ἂν ἡ τῆς ὄψεως δύναμις, ἣν ἐλέγομεν πρὸς αὐτὰ ἤδη τὰ ζῷα ἐπιχειρεῖν ἀποβλέπειν καὶ πρὸς αὐτὰ τὰ ἄστρα τε καὶ τελευταῖον δὴ πρὸς αὐτὸν τὸν ἥλιον. οὕτω καὶ ὅταν τις τῷ διαλέγεσθαι ἐπιχειρῇ ἄνευ πασῶν τῶν αἰσθήσεων διὰ τοῦ λόγου ἐπ' αὐτὸ ὃ ἔστιν ἕκαστον ὁρμᾶν, καὶ μὴ ἀποστῇ πρὶν [532b] ἂν αὐτὸ ὃ ἔστιν ἀγαθὸν αὐτῇ νοήσει λάβῃ, ἐπ' αὐτῷ γίγνεται τῷ τοῦ νοητοῦ τέλει, ὥσπερ ἐκεῖνος τότε ἐπὶ τῷ τοῦ ὁρατοῦ.

ENGLISH

SOCRATES "The prelude, you mean," I said, "or what? Don't we know that all these are only preludes to the song itself that has to be learned? Surely you don't think people who are clever at these things are dialecticians." [531e]

"No, by Zeus," he said, "except for a very few of those I've met."

"But will people who can't give and receive an account," I said, "ever know any of the things we say they must know?"

"No," he said, "not that either."[8]

"Then isn't this, Glaucon," I said, "finally the song itself that dialectic performs? Though it is intelligible, the power of sight would imitate it—the power that, we said, tries to look at the animals themselves, then at the stars themselves, and finally at the sun itself. In the same way, when someone tries through dialectic, without any of the senses, to press on by means of reason to what each thing itself is, and doesn't give up until [532b] he

8 The Greek word for "song" here, nomos, also means "law," and Plato plays on both senses.

GREEK

ENGLISH

grasps what the good itself is by understanding itself, he arrives at the very end of the intelligible, just as that other one then arrived at the end of the visible."

532b παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

τί οὖν; οὐ διαλεκτικὴν ταύτην τὴν πορείαν καλεῖς;

τί μήν;

ἡ δέ γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λύσις τε ἀπὸ τῶν δεσμῶν καὶ μεταστροφὴ ἀπὸ τῶν σκιῶν ἐπὶ τὰ εἴδωλα καὶ τὸ φῶς καὶ ἐκ τοῦ καταγείου εἰς τὸν ἥλιον ἐπάνοδος, καὶ ἐκεῖ πρὸς μὲν τὰ ζῷά τε καὶ φυτὰ καὶ τὸ τοῦ ἡλίου φῶς ἔτι ἀδυναμία 532c βλέπειν, πρὸς δὲ τὰ ἐν ὕδασι φαντάσματα θεῖα καὶ σκιὰς τῶν ὄντων, ἀλλ' οὐκ εἰδώλων σκιὰς δι' ἑτέρου τοιούτου φωτὸς ὡς πρὸς ἥλιον κρίνειν ἀποσκιαζομένας—πᾶσα αὕτη ἡ πραγματεία τῶν τεχνῶν ἃς διήλθομεν ταύτην ἔχει τὴν δύναμιν καὶ ἐπαναγωγὴν τοῦ βελτίστου ἐν ψυχῇ πρὸς τὴν τοῦ ἀρίστου ἐν τοῖς οὖσι θέαν, ὥσπερ τότε τοῦ σαφεστάτου ἐν σώματι πρὸς τὴν τοῦ φανοτάτου ἐν τῷ σωματοειδεῖ τε καὶ 532d ὁρατῷ τόπῳ.

"Absolutely," he said.

"Well then, don't you call this journey dialectic?"

"Of course."

"And the release from the bonds," I said, "and the turning from the shadows to the images and the light, and the ascent from the underground cave to the sun; and there, the continued inability to look at the animals and plants and the light of the sun, 532c but the ability to look at divine reflections in water and shadows of the things that are—not shadows of images cast by another light of the same kind, which is itself a shadow compared with the sun—all this practice of the arts we've gone through has this power: it leads the best part of the soul up to the sight of the best among the things that are, just as then the clearest part of the body was led to the sight of the brightest thing in the bodily and 532d visible realm."

532d ἐγὼ μέν, ἔφη, ἀποδέχομαι οὕτω. καίτοι παντάπασί γέ μοι δοκεῖ χαλεπὰ μὲν ἀποδέχεσθαι εἶναι, ἄλλον δ' αὖ τρόπον χαλεπὰ μὴ ἀποδέχεσθαι. ὅμως δέ—οὐ γὰρ ἐν τῷ νῦν παρόντι μόνον ἀκουστέα, ἀλλὰ καὶ αὖθις πολλάκις ἐπανιτέον —ταῦτα θέντες ἔχειν ὡς νῦν λέγεται, ἐπ' αὐτὸν δὴ τὸν νόμον ἴωμεν, καὶ διέλθωμεν οὕτως ὥσπερ τὸ προοίμιον διήλθομεν. λέγε οὖν τίς ὁ τρόπος τῆς τοῦ διαλέγεσθαι δυνάμεως, καὶ 532e κατὰ ποῖα δὴ εἴδη διέστηκεν, καὶ τίνες αὖ ὁδοί· αὗται γὰρ ἂν ἥδη, ὡς ἔοικεν, αἱ πρὸς αὐτὸ ἄγουσαι εἶεν, οἷ ἀφικομένῳ ὥσπερ ὁδοῦ ἀνάπαυλα ἂν εἴη καὶ τέλος τῆς πορείας.

"I accept that," he said. "And yet it seems to me altogether hard to accept, and in another way hard not to accept. All the same—since we don't have to hear this only on the present occasion but must come back to it many times—let's suppose that things are as has now been said, and go on to the song itself, and go through it the way we went through the prelude. So tell me what the character of the power of dialectic is, and 532e into what kinds it is divided, and what its paths are. These, it seems, would be the ones that lead to the place where, once one arrives, there would be a rest from the road and an end of the journey."

533a οὐκέτ', ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ φίλε Γλαύκων, οἷός τ' ἔσῃ ἀκολουθεῖν—ἐπεὶ τό γ' ἐμὸν οὐδὲν ἂν προθυμίας ἀπολίποι—οὐδ' εἰκόνα ἂν ἔτι οὗ λέγομεν ἴδοις, ἀλλ' αὐτὸ τὸ ἀληθές, ὅ γε δή μοι φαίνεται—εἰ δ' ὄντως ἢ μή, οὐκέτ' ἄξιον τοῦτο διισχυρίζεσθαι· ἀλλ' ὅτι μὲν δὴ τοιοῦτόν τι ἰδεῖν, ἰσχυριστέον. ἦ γάρ;

τί μήν;

οὐκοῦν καὶ ὅτι ἡ τοῦ διαλέγεσθαι δύναμις μόνη ἂν φήνειεν ἐμπείρῳ ὄντι ὧν νυνδὴ διήλθομεν, ἄλλῃ δὲ οὐδαμῇ δυνατόν;

καὶ τοῦτ', ἔφη, ἄξιον διισχυρίζεσθαι. 533b

"You won't be able to follow me any further, my dear Glaucon," I said—"though there would be no lack of eagerness on my side—and you would no longer be seeing an image of what we're talking about, but the truth itself, at least as it appears to me. Whether it is really so or not, it isn't worth insisting on that any longer. But that there is something like this to be seen—that we must insist on. Isn't that so?"

"Of course."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"And also that only the power of dialectic could reveal it, to someone experienced in the subjects we've just gone through, and that it's not possible in any other way?"
		"That too," he said, "is worth insisting on." 533b
533b	τόδε γοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐδεὶς ἡμῖν ἀμφισβητήσει λέγουσιν, ὡς αὐτοῦ γε ἑκάστου πέρι ὃ ἔστιν ἕκαστον ἄλλη τις ἐπιχειρεῖ μέθοδος ὁδῷ περὶ παντὸς λαμβάνειν. ἀλλ' αἱ μὲν ἄλλαι πᾶσαι τέχναι ἢ πρὸς δόξας ἀνθρώπων καὶ ἐπιθυμίας εἰσὶν ἢ πρὸς γενέσεις τε καὶ συνθέσεις, ἢ πρὸς θεραπείαν τῶν φυομένων τε καὶ συντιθεμένων ἅπασαι τετράφαται· αἱ δὲ λοιπαί, ἃς τοῦ ὄντος τι ἔφαμεν ἐπιλαμβάνεσθαι, γεωμετρίας τε καὶ τὰς ταύτῃ ἑπομένας, ὁρῶμεν ὡς ὀνειρώττουσι μὲν 533c περὶ τὸ ὄν, ὕπαρ δὲ ἀδύνατον αὐταῖς ἰδεῖν, ἕως ἂν ὑποθέσεσι χρώμεναι ταύτας ἀκινήτους ἐῶσι, μὴ δυνάμεναι λόγον διδόναι αὐτῶν. ᾧ γὰρ ἀρχὴ μὲν ὃ μὴ οἶδε, τελευτὴ δὲ καὶ τὰ μεταξὺ ἐξ οὗ μὴ οἶδεν συμπέπλεκται, τίς μηχανὴ τὴν τοιαύτην ὁμολογίαν ποτὲ ἐπιστήμην γενέσθαι;	"This much, anyway, no one will dispute when we say it," I said: "that no other inquiry attempts to grasp systematically, in every case, what each thing itself is. All the other arts are directed either to human opinions and desires, or to generation and composition, or to the care of things that grow or are put together. As for the rest, which we said grasp something of what is—geometry and the ones that follow it—we see that they dream 533c about what is, but are unable to see it in waking life so long as they use hypotheses and leave them undisturbed, unable to give an account of them. When your starting point is something you don't know, and your conclusion and the steps in between are woven together out of what you don't know, how could such an agreement ever become knowledge?"
533c	οὐδεμία, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"There's no way," he said.
	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἡ διαλεκτικὴ μέθοδος μόνη ταύτῃ πορεύεται, τὰς ὑποθέσεις ἀναιροῦσα, ἐπ' αὐτὴν τὴν ἀρχὴν 533d ἵνα βεβαιώσηται, καὶ τῷ ὄντι ἐν βορβόρῳ βαρβαρικῷ τινι τὸ τῆς ψυχῆς ὄμμα κατορωρυγμένον ἠρέμα ἕλκει καὶ ἀνάγει ἄνω, συνερίθοις καὶ συμπεριαγωγοῖς χρωμένη αἷς διήλθομεν τέχναις· ἃς ἐπιστήμας μὲν πολλάκις προσείπομεν διὰ τὸ ἔθος, δέονται δὲ ὀνόματος ἄλλου, ἐναργεστέρου μὲν ἢ δόξης, ἀμυδροτέρου δὲ ἢ ἐπιστήμης—διάνοιαν δὲ αὐτὴν ἔν γε τῷ πρόσθεν που ὡρισάμεθα—ἔστι δ', ὡς ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ, οὐ περὶ 533e ὀνόματος ἀμφισβήτησις, οἷς τοσούτων πέρι σκέψις ὅσων ἡμῖν πρόκειται.	"Then only the dialectical method proceeds in this way," I said, "doing away with the hypotheses and going to the first principle itself, 533d so as to make them secure. And when the eye of the soul is really buried in some outlandish mire, dialectic gently draws it out and leads it upward, using as helpers and fellow guides in the turning around the arts we went through. We have often called these knowledge, out of habit, but they need another name, clearer than opinion but dimmer than knowledge—somewhere earlier we defined it as thought. But I don't think there should be any dispute about 533e a name, for people who have to investigate things as important as those before us."
533e	οὐ γὰρ οὖν, ἔφη.	"No, there shouldn't," he said.
	ἀλλ' ὃ ἂν μόνον δηλοῖ πως τὴν ἕξιν σαφηνείᾳ λέγειν ἐν ψυχῇ ἀρκέσει;	"So it will be enough to use whatever name merely makes clear, in some way, the state in the soul we mean?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	ἀρκέσει οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὥσπερ τὸ πρότερον, τὴν μὲν πρώτην μοῖραν ἐπιστήμην καλεῖν, δευτέραν δὲ διάνοιαν, τρίτην 534a δὲ πίστιν καὶ εἰκασίαν τετάρτην· καὶ συναμφότερα μὲν ταῦτα δόξαν, συναμφότερα δ' ἐκεῖνα	"Then it will be enough," I said, "as before, to call the first section knowledge, the second thought, the third 534a belief, and the fourth imagination;

GREEK	ENGLISH
νόησιν· καὶ δόξαν μὲν περὶ γένεσιν, νόησιν δὲ περὶ οὐσίαν· καὶ ὅτι οὐσία πρὸς γένεσιν, νόησιν πρὸς δόξαν, καὶ ὅτι νόησις πρὸς δόξαν, ἐπιστήμην πρὸς πίστιν καὶ διάνοιαν πρὸς εἰκασίαν· τὴν δ' ἐφ' οἷς ταῦτα ἀναλογίαν καὶ διαίρεσιν διχῇ ἑκατέρου, δοξαστοῦ τε καὶ νοητοῦ, ἐῶμεν, ὦ Γλαύκων, ἵνα μὴ ἡμᾶς πολλαπλασίων λόγων ἐμπλήσῃ ἢ ὅσων οἱ παρεληλυθότες. 534b	and the last two together opinion, and the first two together understanding. Opinion is concerned with becoming, and understanding with being. As being is to becoming, so understanding is to opinion; and as understanding is to opinion, so knowledge is to belief and thought to imagination. But the proportion between the things these are set over, and the division of each of the two—the opinable and the intelligible—into two parts, let's leave aside, Glaucon, so that it doesn't fill us up with arguments many times longer than the ones we've already been through." 534b
534b ἀλλὰ μὴν ἔμοιγ', ἔφη, τά γε ἄλλα, καθ' ὅσον δύναμαι ἕπεσθαι, συνδοκεῖ. ἦ καὶ διαλεκτικὸν καλεῖς τὸν λόγον ἑκάστου λαμβάνοντα τῆς οὐσίας; καὶ τὸν μὴ ἔχοντα, καθ' ὅσον ἂν μὴ ἔχῃ λόγον αὐτῷ τε καὶ ἄλλῳ διδόναι, κατὰ τοσοῦτον νοῦν περὶ τούτου οὐ φήσεις ἔχειν; πῶς γὰρ ἄν, ἦ δ' ὅς, φαίην;	"As for the rest," he said, "I agree with you, so far as I can follow." "And do you also call someone a dialectician who grasps the account of the being of each thing? And as for someone who can't, won't you say that insofar as he is unable to give an account to himself and to another, to that extent he lacks understanding of it?" "How could I say otherwise?" he said.
οὐκοῦν καὶ περὶ τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ ὡσαύτως· ὃς ἂν μὴ ἔχῃ διορίσασθαι τῷ λόγῳ ἀπὸ τῶν ἄλλων πάντων ἀφελὼν τὴν 534c τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ ἰδέαν, καὶ ὥσπερ ἐν μάχῃ διὰ πάντων ἐλέγχων διεξιών, μὴ κατὰ δόξαν ἀλλὰ κατ' οὐσίαν προθυμούμενος ἐλέγχειν, ἐν πᾶσι τούτοις ἀπτῶτι τῷ λόγῳ διαπορεύηται, οὔτε αὐτὸ τὸ ἀγαθὸν φήσεις εἰδέναι τὸν οὕτως ἔχοντα οὔτε ἄλλο ἀγαθὸν οὐδέν, ἀλλ' εἴ πῃ εἰδώλου τινὸς ἐφάπτεται, δόξῃ, οὐκ ἐπιστήμῃ ἐφάπτεσθαι, καὶ τὸν νῦν βίον ὀνειροπολοῦντα καὶ ὑπνώττοντα, πρὶν ἐνθάδ' ἐξεγρέσθαι, εἰς Ἅιδου 534d πρότερον ἀφικόμενον τελέως ἐπικαταδαρθεῖν;	"And the same goes for the good. Suppose someone can't distinguish in an account the 534c form of the good, separating it from everything else, and can't come through all the tests as if in battle, eager to test things by what they are rather than by what people think of them, and make his way through all of this with his account never falling. Won't you say that someone in that condition doesn't know the good itself, or any other good either, and that if he somehow grasps an image of it, he grasps it by opinion, not by knowledge? And that he is dreaming and dozing through his present life, and before he wakes up here, he'll arrive in Hades 534d and fall asleep there for good?"
534d νὴ τὸν Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς, σφόδρα γε πάντα ταῦτα φήσω. ἀλλὰ μὴν τούς γε σαυτοῦ παῖδας, οὓς τῷ λόγῳ τρέφεις τε καὶ παιδεύεις, εἴ ποτε ἔργῳ τρέφοις, οὐκ ἂν ἐάσαις, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, ἀλόγους ὄντας ὥσπερ γραμμάς, ἄρχοντας ἐν τῇ πόλει κυρίους τῶν μεγίστων εἶναι. οὐ γὰρ οὖν, ἔφη. νομοθετήσεις δὴ αὐτοῖς ταύτης μάλιστα τῆς παιδείας ἀντιλαμβάνεσθαι, ἐξ ἧς ἐρωτᾶν τε καὶ ἀποκρίνεσθαι ἐπιστημονέστατα οἷοί τ' ἔσονται; 534e νομοθετήσω, ἔφη, μετά γε σοῦ.	"Yes, by Zeus," he said, "I'll certainly say all that." "Well then, as for your own children, whom you are raising and educating in words—if you ever raised them in fact, I don't imagine you would let them be rulers in the city, with authority over the most important matters, while they were as irrational as lines in geometry." "No, I wouldn't," he said. "Then you'll make it a law that they give particular attention to this education, which will enable

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		them to ask and answer questions with the most knowledge?" 534e
		"I will," he said, "together with you."[9]
534e	ἆρ' οὖν δοκεῖ σοι, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὥσπερ θριγκὸς τοῖς μαθήμασιν ἡ διαλεκτικὴ ἡμῖν ἐπάνω κεῖσθαι, καὶ οὐκέτ' ἄλλο τούτου μάθημα ἀνωτέρω ὀρθῶς ἂν ἐπιτίθεσθαι, ἀλλ' ἔχειν 535a ἤδη τέλος τὰ τῶν μαθημάτων;	"So do you think," I said, "that dialectic lies on top of our subjects like a coping stone, and that no other subject can rightly be placed above it, but that the subjects of study 535a have now reached their end?"
	ἔμοιγ', ἔφη.	"I do," he said.
	διανομὴ τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ λοιπόν σοι, τίσιν ταῦτα τὰ μαθήματα δώσομεν καὶ τίνα τρόπον.	"Then what remains for you," I said, "is the distribution: to whom we are to give these subjects, and in what way."
	δῆλον, ἔφη.	"Clearly," he said.
	μέμνησαι οὖν τὴν προτέραν ἐκλογὴν τῶν ἀρχόντων, οἵους ἐξελέξαμεν;	"Do you remember our earlier selection of rulers, and what sort of people we chose?"
	πῶς γάρ, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὔ;	"Of course I do," he said.

CHOOSING AND TRAINING THE RULERS

Socrates describes selecting the rulers by nature and training them in stages until age fifty.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
535a	**SOCRATES** τὰ μὲν ἄλλα τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐκείνας τὰς φύσεις οἵου δεῖν ἐκλεκτέας εἶναι· τούς τε γὰρ βεβαιοτάτους καὶ τοὺς ἀνδρειοτάτους προαιρετέον, καὶ κατὰ δύναμιν τοὺς εὐειδεστάτους· 535b πρὸς δὲ τούτοις ζητητέον μὴ μόνον γενναίους τε καὶ βλοσυροὺς τὰ ἤθη, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἃ τῇδε τῇ παιδείᾳ τῆς φύσεως πρόσφορα ἐκτέον αὐτοῖς.	**SOCRATES** "Well, in other respects," I said, "you should assume those are the natures that must be chosen. We must prefer the steadiest and the most courageous, and, as far as possible, the best-looking. 535b But besides this, we must look for people who are not only noble and stern in character, but who also have the natural qualities that suit them for this education."
	ποῖα δὴ διαστέλλῃ;	"What qualities are you specifying?"
535b	δριμύτητα, ὦ μακάριε, ἔφην, δεῖ αὐτοῖς πρὸς τὰ μαθήματα ὑπάρχειν, καὶ μὴ χαλεπῶς μανθάνειν. πολὺ γάρ τοι μᾶλλον ἀποδειλιῶσι ψυχαὶ ἐν ἰσχυροῖς μαθήμασιν ἢ ἐν γυμνασίοις· οἰκειότερος γὰρ αὐταῖς ὁ πόνος, ἴδιος ἀλλ' οὐ κοινὸς ὢν μετὰ τοῦ σώματος.	"They need keenness for their studies, my good friend," I said, "and must not find learning hard. Souls are much more likely to lose heart in hard studies than in physical training, since the toil is closer to home: it belongs to the soul alone and isn't shared with the body."
	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη. 535c	"True," he said. 535c
	καὶ μνήμονα δὴ καὶ ἄρρατον καὶ πάντῃ φιλόπονον ζητητέον. ἢ τίνι τρόπῳ οἴει τά τε τοῦ σώματος ἐθελήσειν τινὰ διαπονεῖν καὶ τοσαύτην μάθησίν τε καὶ μελέτην ἐπιτελεῖν;	"And we must look for someone with a good memory, who is tireless and loves hard work in every way. Otherwise how do you think anyone will be willing both to put his body through its labors and to complete so much study and practice?"
	οὐδένα, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἐὰν μὴ παντάπασί γ' ᾖ εὐφυής.	

9 Irrational (alogos, "without an account") was the term for lines whose lengths cannot be expressed as ratios of whole numbers.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"No one will," he said, "unless he is altogether well endowed by nature."
535c	τὸ γοῦν νῦν ἁμάρτημα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ ἡ ἀτιμία φιλοσοφίᾳ διὰ ταῦτα προσπέπτωκεν, ὃ καὶ πρότερον εἴπομεν, ὅτι οὐ κατ' ἀξίαν αὐτῆς ἅπτονται· οὐ γὰρ νόθους ἔδει ἅπτεσθαι, ἀλλὰ γνησίους.	"At any rate the present mistake," I said, "and the discredit that has fallen on philosophy because of it, come from this, as we said before: people take it up without being worthy of it. Illegitimate students shouldn't take it up, but legitimate ones."
	πῶς; ἔφη. 535d	"How do you mean?" he said. 535d
535d	πρῶτον μέν, εἶπον, φιλοπονίᾳ οὐ χωλὸν δεῖ εἶναι τὸν ἁψόμενον, τὰ μὲν ἡμίσεα φιλόπονον ὄντα, τὰ δ' ἡμίσεα ἄπονον. ἔστι δὲ τοῦτο, ὅταν τις φιλογυμναστὴς μὲν καὶ φιλόθηρος ᾖ καὶ πάντα τὰ διὰ τοῦ σώματος φιλοπονῇ, φιλομαθὴς δὲ μή, μηδὲ φιλήκοος μηδὲ ζητητικός, ἀλλ' ἐν πᾶσι τούτοις μισοπονῇ· χωλὸς δὲ καὶ ὁ τἀναντία τούτου μεταβεβληκὼς τὴν φιλοπονίαν.	"First," I said, "whoever takes it up must not limp in his love of hard work, loving work in one half of things and shirking it in the other. That's what happens when someone loves physical training and hunting and loves every labor done through the body, but doesn't love learning or listening or inquiring, and hates work in all of these. And someone whose love of work has swung to the opposite side limps too."
	ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"That's very true," he said.
	οὐκοῦν καὶ πρὸς ἀλήθειαν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ταὐτὸν τοῦτο ἀνάπηρον 535e ψυχὴν θήσομεν, ἣ ἂν τὸ μὲν ἑκούσιον ψεῦδος μισῇ καὶ χαλεπῶς φέρῃ αὐτή τε καὶ ἐτέρων ψευδομένων ὑπεραγανακτῇ, τὸ δ' ἀκούσιον εὐκόλως προσδέχηται καὶ ἀμαθαίνουσά που ἁλισκομένη μὴ ἀγανακτῇ, ἀλλ' εὐχερῶς ὥσπερ θηρίον ὕειον ἐν ἀμαθίᾳ μολύνηται;	"And with regard to truth," I said, "won't we count as maimed in the same way 535e a soul that hates the voluntary lie, finding it hard to bear itself and growing furious when others lie, but readily accepts the involuntary lie, and isn't upset when it's caught being ignorant, but wallows in its ignorance as contentedly as a pig?"
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
536a	καὶ πρὸς σωφροσύνην, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ ἀνδρείαν καὶ μεγαλοπρέπειαν καὶ πάντα τὰ τῆς ἀρετῆς μέρη οὐχ ἥκιστα δεῖ φυλάττειν τὸν νόθον τε καὶ τὸν γνήσιον. ὅταν γάρ τις μὴ ἐπίστηται πάντῃ τὰ τοιαῦτα σκοπεῖν καὶ ἰδιώτης καὶ πόλις, λανθάνουσι χωλοῖς τε καὶ νόθοις χρώμενοι πρὸς ὅτι ἂν τύχωσι τούτων, οἱ μὲν φίλοις, οἱ δὲ ἄρχουσι.	"And with regard to moderation," I said, "and courage and greatness of spirit and all the parts of excellence, we must watch especially closely for the illegitimate and the legitimate. When a private person or a city doesn't know how to look at such things from every angle, they unwittingly employ the limping and the illegitimate for whichever of these purposes they happen to need—the one as friends, the other as rulers."
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, οὕτως ἔχει.	"That's exactly how it is," he said.
	ἡμῖν δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα διευλαβητέον· 536b ὡς ἐὰν μὲν ἀρτιμελεῖς τε καὶ ἀρτίφρονας ἐπὶ τοσαύτην μάθησιν καὶ τοσαύτην ἄσκησιν κομίσαντες παιδεύωμεν, ἥ τε δίκη ἡμῖν οὐ μέμψεται αὐτή, τήν τε πόλιν καὶ πολιτείαν σώσομεν, ἀλλοίους δὲ ἄγοντες ἐπὶ ταῦτα τἀναντία πάντα καὶ πράξομεν καὶ φιλοσοφίας ἔτι πλείω γέλωτα καταντλήσομεν.	"So we must be very careful about all these things," I said. 536b "If we bring people sound of limb and sound of mind to so much learning and so much training, and educate them, then Justice herself won't find fault with us, and we'll preserve the city and its constitution. But if we bring people of another sort to these things, we'll do the very opposite, and pour an even greater flood of ridicule over philosophy."
	αἰσχρὸν μεντἂν εἴη, ἦ δ' ὅς.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, εἶπον· γελοῖον δ' ἔγωγε καὶ ἐν τῷ παρόντι τι ἔοικα παθεῖν.	"That would certainly be shameful," he said. "Very much so," I said. "But I think I've just done something rather ridiculous myself."
	τὸ ποῖον; ἔφη. 536c	"What's that?" he said. 536c
536c	ἐπελαθόμην, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι ἐπαίζομεν, καὶ μᾶλλον ἐντεινάμενος εἶπον. λέγων γὰρ ἅμα ἔβλεψα πρὸς φιλοσοφίαν, καὶ ἰδὼν προπεπηλακισμένην ἀναξίως ἀγανακτήσας μοι δοκῶ καὶ ὥσπερ θυμωθεὶς τοῖς αἰτίοις σπουδαιότερον εἰπεῖν ἃ εἶπον.	"I forgot we were only playing," I said, "and spoke too intensely. As I was talking I glanced at philosophy, and when I saw her undeservedly trampled in the mud, I think I got indignant and, as if angry with those responsible, said what I said too seriously."
	οὐ μὰ τὸν Δί', ἔφη, οὔκουν ὥς γ' ἐμοὶ ἀκροατῇ.	"No, by Zeus," he said, "not too seriously for me as a listener."
	ἀλλ' ὡς ἐμοί, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ῥήτορι. τόδε δὲ μὴ ἐπιλανθανώμεθα, ὅτι ἐν μὲν τῇ προτέρᾳ ἐκλογῇ πρεσβύτας ἐξελέγομεν, 536d ἐν δὲ ταύτῃ οὐκ ἐγχωρήσει· Σόλωνι γὰρ οὐ πειστέον ὡς γηράσκων τις πολλὰ δυνατὸς μανθάνειν, ἀλλ' ἧττον ἢ τρέχειν, νέων δὲ πάντες οἱ μεγάλοι καὶ οἱ πολλοὶ πόνοι.	"But too seriously for me as a speaker," I said. "Now let's not forget this: in our earlier selection we chose older people, 536d but in this one that won't do. We mustn't believe Solon when he says that someone growing old can learn many things; he can learn even less than he can run. All great and numerous labors belong to the young."
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη.	"Necessarily," he said.
	τὰ μὲν τοίνυν λογισμῶν τε καὶ γεωμετριῶν καὶ πάσης τῆς προπαιδείας, ἣν τῆς διαλεκτικῆς δεῖ προπαιδευθῆναι, παισὶν οὖσι χρὴ προβάλλειν, οὐχ ὡς ἐπάναγκες μαθεῖν τὸ σχῆμα τῆς διδαχῆς ποιουμένους.	"So arithmetic and geometry and all the preliminary education that must come before dialectic should be put before them while they are children —but not by giving the teaching the form of compulsion."
	τί δή; 536e	"Why not?" 536e 10
536e	ὅτι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐδὲν μάθημα μετὰ δουλείας τὸν ἐλεύθερον χρὴ μανθάνειν. οἱ μὲν γὰρ τοῦ σώματος πόνοι βίᾳ πονούμενοι χεῖρον οὐδὲν τὸ σῶμα ἀπεργάζονται, ψυχῇ δὲ βίαιον οὐδὲν ἔμμονον μάθημα.	"Because," I said, "a free person shouldn't learn any subject like a slave. Physical labors, when forced, do the body no harm, but nothing learned by force stays in the soul."
	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη.	"True," he said.
	μὴ τοίνυν βίᾳ, εἶπον, ὦ ἄριστε, τοὺς παῖδας ἐν τοῖς 537a μαθήμασιν ἀλλὰ παίζοντας τρέφε, ἵνα καὶ μᾶλλον οἷός τ' ἦς καθορᾶν ἐφ' ὃ ἕκαστος πέφυκεν.	"Then don't use force, my excellent friend," I said, "in bringing up the children in their 537a studies, but let them learn through play. That way you'll also be better able to see what each of them is naturally suited for."
	ἔχει ὃ λέγεις, ἔφη, λόγον.	"What you say makes sense," he said.
537a	οὐκοῦν μνημονεύεις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι καὶ εἰς τὸν πόλεμον ἔφαμεν τοὺς παῖδας εἶναι ἀκτέον ἐπὶ τῶν ἵππων θεωρούς, καὶ ἐάν που ἀσφαλὲς ᾖ, προσακτέον ἐγγὺς καὶ γευστέον αἵματος, ὥσπερ τοὺς σκύλακας;	"And do you remember," I said, "that we said the children should also be taken to war on horseback as spectators, and, wherever it's safe, be brought up close and given a taste of blood, like puppies?"
	μέμνημαι, ἔφη.	"I remember," he said.

10 Solon, the Athenian lawmaker and poet of the early sixth century BC, wrote that he grew old "always learning many things."

GREEK	ENGLISH
ἐν πᾶσι δὴ τούτοις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοῖς τε πόνοις καὶ μαθήμασι καὶ φόβοις ὃς ἂν ἐντρεχέστατος ἀεὶ φαίνηται, εἰς ἀριθμόν τινα ἐγκριτέον. 537b	"Then in all these things," I said, "the labors, the studies and the dangers, whoever always proves most adept must be enrolled in a select group." 537b
ἐν τίνι, ἔφη, ἡλικίᾳ;	"At what age?" he said.
537b ἡνίκα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τῶν ἀναγκαίων γυμνασίων μεθίενται· οὗτος γὰρ ὁ χρόνος, ἐάντε δύο ἐάντε τρία ἔτη γίγνηται, ἀδύνατός τι ἄλλο πρᾶξαι· κόποι γὰρ καὶ ὕπνοι μαθήμασι πολέμιοι. καὶ ἅμα μία καὶ αὕτη τῶν βασάνων οὐκ ἐλαχίστη, τίς ἕκαστος ἐν τοῖς γυμνασίοις φανεῖται.	"When they are released from their compulsory physical training," I said. "That period, whether it lasts two years or three, leaves them unable to do anything else, since fatigue and sleep are enemies of study. And at the same time, how each of them shows up in that training is itself one of the tests, and not the least of them."
πῶς γὰρ οὔκ; ἔφη.	"Of course," he said.
μετὰ δὴ τοῦτον τὸν χρόνον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐκ τῶν εἰκοσιετῶν οἱ προκριθέντες τιμάς τε μείζους τῶν ἄλλων οἴσονται, 537c τά τε χύδην μαθήματα παισὶν ἐν τῇ παιδείᾳ γενόμενα τούτοις συνακτέον εἰς σύνοψιν οἰκειότητός τε ἀλλήλων τῶν μαθημάτων καὶ τῆς τοῦ ὄντος φύσεως.	"After that period," I said, "those picked out from among the twenty-year-olds will receive greater honors than the others, 537c and the subjects they studied haphazardly as children in their education must be brought together for them into an overview of the kinship of the subjects with one another and with the nature of what is."
μόνη γοῦν, εἶπεν, ἡ τοιαύτη μάθησις βέβαιος, ἐν οἷς ἂν ἐγγένηται.	"That's the only kind of learning," he said, "that stays firm in those who acquire it."
καὶ μεγίστη γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πεῖρα διαλεκτικῆς φύσεως καὶ μή· ὁ μὲν γὰρ συνοπτικὸς διαλεκτικός, ὁ δὲ μὴ οὔ.	"And it's the greatest test," I said, "of whether someone's nature is dialectical or not. Whoever can see things together is dialectical, and whoever can't is not."
συνοίομαι, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"I agree," he said.
537c ταῦτα τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δεήσει σε ἐπισκοποῦντα οἳ ἂν 537d μάλιστα τοιοῦτοι ἐν αὐτοῖς ὦσι καὶ μόνιμοι μὲν ἐν μαθήμασι, μόνιμοι δ' ἐν πολέμῳ καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις νομίμοις, τούτους αὖ, ἐπειδὰν τὰ τριάκοντα ἔτη ἐκβαίνωσιν, ἐκ τῶν προκρίτων προκρινάμενον εἰς μείζους τε τιμὰς καθιστάναι καὶ σκοπεῖν, τῇ τοῦ διαλέγεσθαι δυνάμει βασανίζοντα τίς ὀμμάτων καὶ τῆς ἄλλης αἰσθήσεως δυνατὸς μεθιέμενος ἐπ' αὐτὸ τὸ ὂν μετ' ἀληθείας ἰέναι. καὶ ἐνταῦθα δὴ πολλῆς φυλακῆς ἔργον, ὦ ἑταῖρε.	"So you will have to keep an eye on this," I said, "and see who 537d are most like this among them, steadfast in their studies and steadfast in war and in the other things required of them. When they pass the age of thirty, you must select them again from among those already selected and place them in still greater honors, and examine them, testing them by the power of dialectic to see which of them can let go of his eyes and the rest of his senses and go on, in company with truth, to what is itself. And this is where a great deal of caution is needed, my friend."
τί μάλιστα; ἦ δ' ὅς. 537e	"Why, especially?" he said. 537e

THE DANGERS OF ARGUMENT

Socrates warns that early exposure to argument makes young people lawless, then turns to the worse constitutions.

GREEK	ENGLISH
537e **SOCRATES** οὐκ ἐννοεῖς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ νῦν περὶ τὸ διαλέγεσθαι κακὸν γιγνόμενον ὅσον γίγνεται;	**SOCRATES** "Don't you realize," I said, "how great an evil is arising around dialectic at present?"

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τὸ ποῖον; ἔφη.	"What evil?" he said.
	παρανομίας που, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἐμπίμπλανται.	"Its practitioners are filled with lawlessness, I suppose," I said.
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.	"They certainly are," he said.
	θαυμαστὸν οὖν τι οἴει, εἶπον, πάσχειν αὐτούς, καὶ οὐ συγγιγνώσκεις;	"Do you think there's anything surprising in what's happening to them?" I said. "Don't you sympathize?"
	πῇ μάλιστα; ἔφη.	"Why in particular?" he said.
	οἷον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἴ τις ὑποβολιμαῖος τραφείη ἐν πολλοῖς 538a μὲν χρήμασι, πολλῷ δὲ καὶ μεγάλῳ γένει καὶ κόλαξι πολλοῖς, ἀνὴρ δὲ γενόμενος αἴσθοιτο ὅτι οὐ τούτων ἐστὶ τῶν φασκόντων γονέων, τοὺς δὲ τῷ ὄντι γεννήσαντας μὴ εὕροι, τοῦτον ἔχεις μαντεύσασθαι πῶς ἂν διατεθείη πρός τε τοὺς κόλακας καὶ πρὸς τοὺς ὑποβαλομένους ἐν ἐκείνῳ τε τῷ χρόνῳ ᾧ οὐκ ᾔδει τὰ περὶ τῆς ὑποβολῆς, καὶ ἐν ᾧ αὖ ᾔδει; ἢ βούλει ἐμοῦ μαντευομένου ἀκοῦσαι;	"It's like this," I said. "Suppose a child passed off as someone else's were brought up amid great 538a wealth, in a large and important family, with many flatterers around him, and when he became a man realized that he was not the son of those who claimed to be his parents, but couldn't find the people who were really his parents. Can you guess how he would be disposed toward the flatterers and toward those who had taken him in as their own, both during the time when he didn't know the truth about the substitution and during the time when he did? Or would you like to hear my guess?"
	βούλομαι, ἔφη.	"I would," he said.
538a	μαντεύομαι τοίνυν, εἶπον, μᾶλλον αὐτὸν τιμᾶν ἂν τὸν 538b πατέρα καὶ τὴν μητέρα καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους οἰκείους δοκοῦντας ἢ τοὺς κολακεύοντας, καὶ ἧττον μὲν ἂν περιιδεῖν ἐνδεεῖς τινος, ἧττον δὲ παράνομόν τι δρᾶσαι ἢ εἰπεῖν εἰς αὐτούς, ἧττον δὲ ἀπειθεῖν τὰ μεγάλα ἐκείνοις ἢ τοῖς κόλαξιν, ἐν ᾧ χρόνῳ τὸ ἀληθὲς μὴ εἰδείη.	"Well, my guess," I said, "is that he would honor his supposed 538b father and mother and other relatives more than the flatterers. He would be less likely to let them go in need of anything, less likely to do or say anything lawless against them, and less likely to disobey them in important matters than the flatterers—during the time when he didn't know the truth."
	εἰκός, ἔφη.	"Likely enough," he said.
538b	αἰσθόμενον τοίνυν τὸ ὂν μαντεύομαι αὖ περὶ μὲν τούτους ἀνεῖναι ἂν τὸ τιμᾶν τε καὶ σπουδάζειν, περὶ δὲ τοὺς κόλακας ἐπιτεῖναι, καὶ πείθεσθαί τε αὐτοῖς διαφερόντως ἢ πρότερον 538c καὶ ζῆν ἂν ἤδη κατ' ἐκείνους, συνόντα αὐτοῖς ἀπαρακαλύπτως, πατρὸς δὲ ἐκείνου καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ποιουμένων οἰκείων, εἰ μὴ πάνυ εἴη φύσει ἐπιεικής, μέλειν τὸ μηδέν.	"But once he found out the facts, my guess is that his honor and devotion toward them would slacken and toward the flatterers would intensify. He would obey the flatterers far more than before 538c and start living by their standards, keeping company with them openly; and he would care nothing for that father and the other so-called relatives, unless he were of a very decent nature."
	πάντ', ἔφη, λέγεις οἷά περ ἂν γένοιτο. ἀλλὰ πῇ πρὸς τοὺς ἁπτομένους τῶν λόγων αὕτη φέρει ἡ εἰκών;	"Everything you say is just what would happen," he said. "But how does this image apply to those who take up arguments?"
538c	τῇδε. ἔστι που ἡμῖν δόγματα ἐκ παίδων περὶ δικαίων καὶ καλῶν, ἐν οἷς ἐκτεθράμμεθα ὥσπερ ὑπὸ γονεῦσι, πειθαρχοῦντές τε καὶ τιμῶντες αὐτά.	"Like this. We have, I think, convictions from childhood about what is just and fine, and we have

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἔστι γάρ. 538d	been brought up under them as if under parents, obeying and honoring them."
	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἄλλα ἐναντία τούτων ἐπιτηδεύματα ἡδονὰς ἔχοντα, ἃ κολακεύει μὲν ἡμῶν τὴν ψυχὴν καὶ ἕλκει ἐφ' αὑτά, πείθει δ' οὔ τοὺς καὶ ὁπηοῦν μετρίους· ἀλλ' ἐκεῖνα τιμῶσι τὰ πάτρια καὶ ἐκείνοις πειθαρχοῦσιν.	"We do." 538d "And there are other practices opposed to these, which bring pleasures with them, flatter our soul and drag it toward themselves, but they don't persuade anyone who is at all moderate. Such people honor those ancestral convictions and obey them."
	ἔστι ταῦτα.	"That's so."
538d	τί οὖν; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· ὅταν τὸν οὕτως ἔχοντα ἐλθὸν ἐρώτημα ἔρηται· τί ἐστι τὸ καλόν, καὶ ἀποκριναμένου ὃ τοῦ νομοθέτου ἤκουεν ἐξελέγχῃ ὁ λόγος, καὶ πολλάκις καὶ πολλαχῇ ἐλέγχων εἰς δόξαν καταβάλῃ ὡς τοῦτο οὐδὲν μᾶλλον 538e καλὸν ἢ αἰσχρόν, καὶ περὶ δικαίου ὡσαύτως καὶ ἀγαθοῦ καὶ ἃ μάλιστα ἦγεν ἐν τιμῇ, μετὰ τοῦτο τί οἴει ποιήσειν αὐτὸν πρὸς αὐτὰ τιμῆς τε πέρι καὶ πειθαρχίας;	"Well then," I said, "when someone in this condition is met by a question—'What is the fine?'—and he answers what he heard from the lawgiver, and the argument refutes him, and by refuting him many times and in many ways reduces him to the opinion that this is no more 538e fine than shameful, and the same with the just and the good and the things he held in highest honor—after that, what do you think he'll do about honoring and obeying them?"
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, μήτε τιμᾶν ἔτι ὁμοίως μήτε πείθεσθαι.	"He's bound to stop honoring and obeying them as he did," he said.
538e	ὅταν οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μήτε ταῦτα ἡγῆται τίμια καὶ οἰκεῖα ὥσπερ πρὸ τοῦ, τά τε ἀληθῆ μὴ εὑρίσκῃ, ἔστι πρὸς ὁποῖον 539a βίον ἄλλον ἢ τὸν κολακεύοντα εἰκότως προσχωρήσεται;	"And when he no longer thinks these things are worthy of honor and his own, as he did before," I said, "and he doesn't find the true ones, what kind of 539a life will he naturally turn to, other than the one that flatters him?"
	οὐκ ἔστιν, ἔφη.	"None," he said.
	παράνομος δὴ οἶμαι δόξει γεγονέναι ἐκ νομίμου.	"So he'll be seen, I think, to have turned lawless from law-abiding."
	ἀνάγκη.	"Necessarily."
	οὐκοῦν, ἔφην, εἰκὸς τὸ πάθος τῶν οὕτω λόγων ἁπτομένων καί, ὃ ἄρτι ἔλεγον, πολλῆς συγγνώμης ἄξιον;	"Then isn't this natural," I said, "for those who take up arguments this way, and, as I said just now, deserving of much sympathy?"
	καὶ ἐλέου γ', ἔφη.	"And pity too," he said.
	οὐκοῦν ἵνα μὴ γίγνηται ὁ ἔλεος οὗτος περὶ τοὺς τριακοντούτας σοι, εὐλαβουμένῳ παντὶ τρόπῳ τῶν λόγων ἁπτέον;	"So that this pity doesn't arise concerning your thirty-year-olds, mustn't they take up arguments with every possible precaution?"
	καὶ μάλ', ἦ δ' ὅς. 539b	"Very much so," he said. 539b
539b	ἆρ' οὖν οὐ μία μὲν εὐλάβεια αὕτη συχνή, τὸ μὴ νέους ὄντας αὐτῶν γεύεσθαι; οἶμαι γάρ σε οὐ λεληθέναι ὅτι οἱ μειρακίσκοι, ὅταν τὸ πρῶτον λόγων γεύωνται, ὡς παιδιᾷ αὐτοῖς καταχρῶνται, ἀεὶ εἰς ἀντιλογίαν χρώμενοι, καὶ μιμούμενοι τοὺς ἐξελέγχοντας αὐτοὶ ἄλλους ἐλέγχουσι, χαίροντες ὥσπερ σκυλάκια τῷ ἕλκειν τε καὶ σπαράττειν τῷ λόγῳ τοὺς πλησίον ἀεί.	"And isn't one important precaution not letting them taste arguments while they are young? I don't think it has escaped you that when youngsters first get a taste of arguments, they misuse them as a game, always using them to contradict. They imitate those who refute them and refute others themselves, delighting like puppies in drag-

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ὑπερφυῶς μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	ging and tearing apart with argument whoever happens to be near." "Enormously so," he said.
	οὐκοῦν ὅταν δὴ πολλοὺς μὲν αὐτοὶ ἐλέγξωσιν, ὑπὸ πολλῶν [539c] δὲ ἐλεγχθῶσι, σφόδρα καὶ ταχὺ ἐμπίπτουσιν εἰς τὸ μηδὲν ἡγεῖσθαι ὧνπερ πρότερον· καὶ ἐκ τούτων δὴ αὐτοί τε καὶ τὸ ὅλον φιλοσοφίας πέρι εἰς τοὺς ἄλλους διαβέβληνται. ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη. ὁ δὲ δὴ πρεσβύτερος, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τῆς μὲν τοιαύτης μανίας οὐκ ἂν ἐθέλοι μετέχειν, τὸν δὲ διαλέγεσθαι ἐθέλοντα καὶ σκοπεῖν τἀληθὲς μᾶλλον μιμήσεται ἢ τὸν παιδιᾶς χάριν παίζοντα καὶ ἀντιλέγοντα, καὶ αὐτός τε μετριώτερος ἔσται [539d] καὶ τὸ ἐπιτήδευμα τιμιώτερον ἀντὶ ἀτιμοτέρου ποιήσει. ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.	"So when they have refuted many people themselves, and been refuted by many, [539c] they fall quickly and hard into believing nothing of what they believed before. And as a result, both they themselves and the whole of philosophy get a bad name with everyone else." "Very true," he said. "But an older man," I said, "wouldn't want to share in madness of this kind. He'll imitate the one who is willing to engage in dialectic and look for the truth rather than the one who plays and contradicts for the sake of the game. He himself will be more measured, [539d] and he'll bring the practice honor instead of discredit." "Right," he said.
539d	οὐκοῦν καὶ τὰ προειρημένα τούτου ἐπ' εὐλαβείᾳ πάντα προείρηται, τὸ τὰς φύσεις κοσμίους εἶναι καὶ στασίμους οἷς τις μεταδώσει τῶν λόγων, καὶ μὴ ὡς νῦν ὁ τυχὼν καὶ οὐδὲν προσήκων ἔρχεται ἐπ' αὐτό; πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη. ἀρκεῖ δὴ ἐπὶ λόγων μεταλήψει μεῖναι ἐνδελεχῶς καὶ συντόνως μηδὲν ἄλλο πράττοντι, ἀλλ' ἀντιστρόφως γυμναζομένῳ τοῖς περὶ τὸ σῶμα γυμνασίοις, ἔτη διπλάσια ἢ τότε; [539e] ἕξ, ἔφη, ἢ τέτταρα λέγεις;	"And wasn't everything we said before this also said as a precaution—that those with whom one shares arguments must have orderly and steady natures, and not, as now, anyone who happens along, with no fitness for it at all?" "Certainly," he said. "Then will it be enough for them to stay with the study of arguments, continuously and intensely, doing nothing else, exercising in them as they earlier exercised in bodily training, but for twice as many years?" [539e] "Do you mean six years or four?" he said.
539e	ἀμέλει, εἶπον, πέντε θές. μετὰ γὰρ τοῦτο καταβιβαστέοι ἔσονταί σοι εἰς τὸ σπήλαιον πάλιν ἐκεῖνο, καὶ ἀναγκαστέοι ἄρχειν τά τε περὶ τὸν πόλεμον καὶ ὅσαι νέων ἀρχαί, ἵνα μηδ' ἐμπειρίᾳ ὑστερῶσι τῶν ἄλλων· καὶ ἔτι καὶ ἐν τούτοις [540a] βασανιστέοι εἰ ἐμμενοῦσιν ἑλκόμενοι πανταχόσε ἤ τι καὶ παρακινήσουσι. χρόνον δέ, ἦ δ' ὅς, πόσον τοῦτον τιθεῖς;	"Never mind," I said, "make it five. After that you must make them go back down into that cave again, and compel them to hold office in matters of war and in all the offices suited to the young, so that they won't fall short of the others in experience either. And there too [540a] they must be tested, to see whether they'll stand firm when pulled in every direction, or whether they'll give way at all." "How long a time do you allow for this?" he said.
540a	πεντεκαίδεκα ἔτη, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. γενομένων δὲ πεντηκοντουτῶν τοὺς διασωθέντας καὶ ἀριστεύσαντας πάντα πάντῃ ἐν ἔργοις τε καὶ ἐπιστήμαις πρὸς τέλος ἤδη ἀκτέον, καὶ ἀναγκαστέον ἀνακλίναντας τὴν τῆς ψυχῆς αὐγὴν εἰς αὐτὸ ἀποβλέψαι τὸ πᾶσι φῶς παρέχον, καὶ ἰδόντας τὸ ἀγαθὸν αὐτό, παραδείγματι χρωμένους	"Fifteen years," I said. "And when they are fifty, those who have come through safely and have excelled in every way, both in action and in knowledge, must at last be led to the end. They must be compelled to lift up the radiance of their souls and look at the very thing that gives light to all, and

GREEK

ENGLISH

ἐκείνῳ, καὶ πόλιν καὶ ἰδιώτας [540b] καὶ ἑαυτοὺς κοσμεῖν τὸν ἐπίλοιπον βίον ἐν μέρει ἑκάστους, τὸ μὲν πολὺ πρὸς φιλοσοφίᾳ διατρίβοντας, ὅταν δὲ τὸ μέρος ἥκῃ, πρὸς πολιτικοῖς ἐπιταλαιπωροῦντας καὶ ἄρχοντας ἑκάστους τῆς πόλεως ἕνεκα, οὐχ ὡς καλόν τι ἀλλ' ὡς ἀναγκαῖον πράττοντας, καὶ οὕτως ἄλλους ἀεὶ παιδεύσαντας τοιούτους, ἀντικαταλιπόντας τῆς πόλεως φύλακας, εἰς μακάρων νήσους ἀπιόντας οἰκεῖν· μνημεῖα δ' αὐτοῖς καὶ θυσίας [540c] τὴν πόλιν δημοσίᾳ ποιεῖν, ἐὰν καὶ ἡ Πυθία συναναιρῇ, ὡς δαίμοσιν, εἰ δὲ μή, ὡς εὐδαίμοσί τε καὶ θείοις.

when they have seen the good itself, they must use it as a model and put the city, private individuals [540b] and themselves in order for the rest of their lives, each in turn. They will spend most of their time on philosophy, but when their turn comes, they will toil at political affairs and rule, each of them, for the city's sake, doing it not as something fine but as something necessary. And so, having always educated others like themselves and left them behind in their place as guardians of the city, they will depart to live in the Isles of the Blessed. The city will establish memorials and sacrifices to them [540c] at public expense—as to divinities, if the Pythia concurs, and if not, as to blessed and godlike men."

540c παγκάλους, ἔφη, τοὺς ἄρχοντας, ὦ Σώκρατες, ὥσπερ ἀνδριαντοποιὸς ἀπείργασαι.

καὶ τὰς ἀρχούσας γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Γλαύκων· μηδὲν γάρ τι οἷου με περὶ ἀνδρῶν εἰρηκέναι μᾶλλον ἃ εἴρηκα ἢ περὶ γυναικῶν, ὅσαι ἂν αὐτῶν ἱκαναὶ τὰς φύσεις ἐγγίγνωνται.

ὀρθῶς, ἔφη, εἴπερ ἴσα γε πάντα τοῖς ἀνδράσι κοινωνήσουσιν, ὡς διήλθομεν. [540d]

"You've turned out rulers of perfect beauty, Socrates," he said, "like a sculptor."

"Women rulers too, Glaucon," I said. "Don't suppose that what I've said applies any more to men than to women—to those of them, that is, who are born with adequate natures."

"That's right," he said, "if they're to share everything equally with the men, as we described." [540d]

540d τί οὖν; ἔφην· συγχωρεῖτε περὶ τῆς πόλεώς τε καὶ πολιτείας μὴ παντάπασιν ἡμᾶς εὐχὰς εἰρηκέναι, ἀλλὰ χαλεπὰ μέν, δυνατὰ δέ πῃ, καὶ οὐκ ἄλλῃ ἢ εἴρηται, ὅταν οἱ ὡς ἀληθῶς φιλόσοφοι δυνάσται, ἢ πλείους ἢ εἷς, ἐν πόλει γενόμενοι τῶν μὲν νῦν τιμῶν καταφρονήσωσιν, ἡγησάμενοι ἀνελευθέρους εἶναι καὶ οὐδενὸς ἀξίας, τὸ δὲ ὀρθὸν περὶ [540e] πλείστου ποιησάμενοι καὶ τὰς ἀπὸ τούτου τιμάς, μέγιστον δὲ καὶ ἀναγκαιότατον τὸ δίκαιον, καὶ τούτῳ δὴ ὑπηρετοῦντές τε καὶ αὔξοντες αὐτὸ διασκευωρήσωνται τὴν ἑαυτῶν πόλιν;

πῶς; ἔφη.

"Well then," I said, "do you agree that what we've said about the city and its constitution isn't altogether wishful thinking? It's difficult, but possible somehow—and in no other way than the one we've described: when true philosophers, whether several or one, come to power in a city. They will scorn the honors of the present day, believing them unfit for a free man and worth nothing; they will value what is right, and the honors that come from it, above [540e] everything, and hold justice the greatest and most necessary thing; and serving justice and making it grow, they will set their own city in order."

"How?" he said.

540e ὅσοι μὲν ἄν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πρεσβύτεροι τυγχάνωσι δεκετῶν [541a] ἐν τῇ πόλει, πάντας ἐκπέμψωσιν εἰς τοὺς ἀγρούς, τοὺς δὲ παῖδας αὐτῶν παραλαβόντες ἐκτὸς τῶν νῦν ἠθῶν, ἃ καὶ οἱ γονῆς ἔχουσι, θρέψωνται ἐν τοῖς σφετέροις τρόποισι καὶ νόμοις, οὗσιν οἵοις διεληλύθαμεν τότε· καὶ οὕτω τάχιστά τε καὶ ῥᾷστα πόλιν τε καὶ πολιτείαν, ἣν ἐλέγομεν, καταστᾶσαν αὐτήν τε εὐδαιμονήσειν καὶ τὸ ἔθνος ἐν ᾧ ἂν ἐγγένηται πλεῖστα ὀνήσειν;

"They'll send everyone in the city over ten years old [541a] out into the country," I said. "They'll take charge of their children, away from the present habits that their parents share, and raise them in their own ways and laws, which are the ones we described earlier. Isn't this the quickest and easiest way for the city and constitution we were describing to be established, to be happy itself, and

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	πολύ γ', ἔφη· καὶ ὡς ἂν γένοιτο, εἴπερ ποτὲ γίγνοιτο, 541b δοκεῖς μοι, ὦ Σώκρατες, εὖ εἰρηκέναι.	to bring the greatest benefit to the people among whom it arises?" "Much the quickest," he said. "And how it would come about, if it ever did, 541b I think you've explained well, Socrates."
541b	οὐκοῦν ἄδην ἤδη, εἶπον ἐγώ, ἔχουσιν ἡμῖν οἱ λόγοι περί τε τῆς πόλεως ταύτης καὶ τοῦ ὁμοίου ταύτῃ ἀνδρός; δῆλος γάρ που καὶ οὗτος οἷον φήσομεν δεῖν αὐτὸν εἶναι. δῆλος, ἔφη· καὶ ὅπερ ἐρωτᾷς, δοκεῖ μοι τέλος ἔχειν.	"Then haven't we now said enough," I said, "about this city and about the man who resembles it? It's clear, I suppose, what sort of person we'll say he has to be." "It's clear," he said. "And as to your question, I think the subject is finished."

Book VIII

How constitutions decline.

GREEK

ENGLISH

543a **SOCRATES** εἶεν· ταῦτα μὲν δὴ ὡμολόγηται, ὦ Γλαύκων, τῇ μελλούσῃ ἄκρως οἰκεῖν πόλει κοινὰς μὲν γυναῖκας, κοινοὺς δὲ παῖδας εἶναι καὶ πᾶσαν παιδείαν, ὡσαύτως δὲ τὰ ἐπιτηδεύματα κοινὰ ἐν πολέμῳ τε καὶ εἰρήνῃ, βασιλέας δὲ αὐτῶν εἶναι τοὺς ἐν φιλοσοφίᾳ τε καὶ πρὸς τὸν πόλεμον γεγονότας ἀρίστους.

ὡμολόγηται, ἔφη. 543b

SOCRATES "Very well. We've agreed, Glaucon, that in the city that is to be governed at its best, women are to be in common, children are to be in common, and all education too; likewise their pursuits in war and peace are to be in common; and their kings are to be those who have proved best in philosophy and in war."

"It's agreed," he said. 543b

543b καὶ μὴν καὶ τάδε συνεχωρήσαμεν, ὡς, ὅταν δὴ καταστῶσιν οἱ ἄρχοντες, ἄγοντες τοὺς στρατιώτας κατοικιοῦσιν εἰς οἰκήσεις οἵας προείπομεν, ἴδιον μὲν οὐδὲν οὐδενὶ ἐχούσας, κοινὰς δὲ πᾶσι· πρὸς δὲ ταῖς τοιαύταις οἰκήσεσι, καὶ τὰς κτήσεις, εἰ μνημονεύεις, διωμολογησάμεθά που οἵαι ἔσονται αὐτοῖς.

ἀλλὰ μνημονεύω, ἔφη, ὅτι γε οὐδὲν οὐδένα ᾠόμεθα δεῖν κεκτῆσθαι ὧν νῦν οἱ ἄλλοι, ὥσπερ δὲ ἀθλητὰς τε πολέμου 543c καὶ φύλακας, μισθὸν τῆς φυλακῆς δεχομένους εἰς ἐνιαυτὸν τὴν εἰς ταῦτα τροφὴν παρὰ τῶν ἄλλων, αὐτῶν τε δεῖν καὶ τῆς ἄλλης πόλεως ἐπιμελεῖσθαι.

"And we also granted this: that once the rulers are established, they'll lead the soldiers and settle them in the sort of housing we described, where no one has anything private and everything is common to all. And besides housing like that, we also agreed, if you remember, what sort of possessions they would have."

"Yes, I remember," he said. "We thought none of them should own any of the things other people own now; instead, like athletes of war 543c and guardians, they should receive from the others their year's keep as wages for their guarding, and devote themselves to caring for themselves and the rest of the city."

543c ὀρθῶς, ἔφην, λέγεις. ἀλλ' ἄγ', ἐπειδὴ τοῦτ' ἀπετελέσαμεν, ἀναμνησθῶμεν πόθεν δεῦρο ἐξετραπόμεθα, ἵνα πάλιν τὴν αὐτὴν ἴωμεν.

οὐ χαλεπόν, ἔφη. σχεδὸν γάρ, καθάπερ νῦν, ὡς διεληλυθὼς περὶ τῆς πόλεως τοὺς λόγους ἐποιοῦ, λέγων ὡς ἀγαθὴν μὲν τὴν τοιαύτην, οἵαν τότε διῆλθες, τιθείης πόλιν, 543d καὶ ἄνδρα τὸν ἐκείνῃ ὅμοιον, καὶ ταῦτα, ὡς ἔοικας, καλλίω 544a ἔτι ἔχων εἰπεῖν πόλιν τε καὶ ἄνδρα.

"You're right," I said. "But come on, now that we've finished this, let's recall where we turned off to get here, so that we can go back along the same road."

"That's not hard," he said. "You were talking pretty much as you are now, as if you'd finished describing the city. You said that you would set down as good the sort of city you had then described, 543d and the man who resembles it—and that, apparently, though you had a still finer 544a city and man to tell of.

544a ἀλλ' οὖν δὴ τὰς ἄλλας ἡμαρτημένας ἔλεγες, εἰ αὕτη ὀρθή. τῶν δὲ λοιπῶν πολιτειῶν ἔφησθα, ὡς μνημονεύω, τέτταρα εἴδη εἶναι, ὧν καὶ πέρι λόγον ἄξιον εἴη ἔχειν καὶ ἰδεῖν αὐτῶν τὰ ἁμαρτήματα καὶ τοὺς ἐκείναις αὖ ὁμοίους, ἵνα πάντας αὐτοὺς ἰδόντες, καὶ ὁμολογησάμενοι τὸν ἄριστον καὶ τὸν κάκιστον ἄνδρα, ἐπισκεψαίμεθα εἰ ὁ

"Anyway, you said that if this one is right, the others are defective. Of the remaining constitutions, as I recall, you said there were four kinds worth discussing, whose faults we should look at, along with the men who resemble each of them. That way, once we had seen them all and agreed on

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἄριστος εὐδαιμονέστατος καὶ ὁ κάκιστος ἀθλιώτατος, ἢ ἄλλως ἔχοι· καὶ ἐμοῦ ἐρομένου τίνας λέγοις [544b] τὰς τέτταρας πολιτείας, ἐν τούτῳ ὑπέλαβε Πολέμαρχός τε καὶ Ἀδείμαντος, καὶ οὕτω δὴ σὺ ἀναλαβὼν τὸν λόγον δεῦρ' ἀφῖξαι.	who is the best man and who the worst, we could investigate whether the best is happiest and the worst most wretched, or not. And when I asked which [544b] four constitutions you meant, Polemarchus and Adeimantus interrupted at that point; and that's how you took up the discussion and arrived here."
	ὀρθότατα, εἶπον, ἐμνημόνευσας.	"You've remembered it exactly," I said.
544b	πάλιν τοίνυν, ὥσπερ παλαιστής, τὴν αὐτὴν λαβὴν πάρεχε, καὶ τὸ αὐτὸ ἐμοῦ ἐρομένου πειρῶ εἰπεῖν ἅπερ τότε ἔμελλες λέγειν.	"Then give me the same hold again, like a wrestler: I'll ask the same question, and you try to say what you were going to say then."
	ἐάνπερ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δύνωμαι.	"If I can," I said.
	καὶ μήν, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἐπιθυμῶ γε καὶ αὐτὸς ἀκοῦσαι τίνας ἔλεγες τὰς τέτταρας πολιτείας. [544c]	"Well, I really do want to hear for myself," he said, "which four constitutions you meant." [544c]
544c	οὐ χαλεπῶς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀκούσῃ. εἰσὶ γὰρ ἃς λέγω, αἵπερ καὶ ὀνόματα ἔχουσιν, ἥ τε ὑπὸ τῶν πολλῶν ἐπαινουμένη, ἡ Κρητική τε καὶ Λακωνικὴ αὕτη· καὶ δευτέρα καὶ δευτέρως ἐπαινουμένη, καλουμένη δ' ὀλιγαρχία, συχνῶν γέμουσα κακῶν πολιτεία· ἥ τε ταύτῃ διάφορος καὶ ἐφεξῆς γιγνομένη δημοκρατία, καὶ ἡ γενναία δὴ τυραννὶς καὶ πασῶν τούτων διαφέρουσα, τέταρτόν τε καὶ ἔσχατον πόλεως νόσημα. ἤ τινα ἄλλην ἔχεις ἰδέαν πολιτείας, ἥτις καὶ ἐν εἴδει διαφανεῖ [544d] τινι κεῖται; δυναστεῖαι γὰρ καὶ ὠνηταὶ βασιλεῖαι καὶ τοιαῦταί τινες πολιτεῖαι μεταξύ τι τούτων πού εἰσιν, εὕροι δ' ἄν τις αὐτὰς οὐκ ἐλάττους περὶ τοὺς βαρβάρους ἢ τοὺς Ἕλληνας.	"You won't find that hard to hear," I said. "The ones I mean are the ones that also have names. There's the one most people praise, the Cretan and Spartan constitution. Second, and second in praise, is the one called oligarchy, a constitution full of evils. Then its opposite, which comes next, democracy. And then that noble thing, tyranny, which outdoes all of them, the fourth and last disease of a city. Or do you know some other form of constitution that falls into a clearly distinct [544d] class? Hereditary dynasties, purchased kingships and other constitutions of that sort lie somewhere in between these, and you'd find them no less among non-Greeks than among Greeks."
544d	πολλαὶ γοῦν καὶ ἄτοποι, ἔφη, λέγονται.	"Certainly there are many strange ones spoken of," he said.
	οἶσθ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι καὶ ἀνθρώπων εἴδη τοσαῦτα ἀνάγκη τρόπων εἶναι, ὅσαπερ καὶ πολιτειῶν; ἢ οἴει ἐκ δρυός ποθεν ἢ ἐκ πέτρας τὰς πολιτείας γίγνεσθαι, ἀλλ' [544e] οὐχὶ ἐκ τῶν ἠθῶν τῶν ἐν ταῖς πόλεσιν, ἃ ἂν ὥσπερ ῥέψαντα τἆλλα ἐφελκύσηται;	"Then do you realize," I said, "that there must be as many kinds of human character as there are of constitutions? Or do you think constitutions come from some oak or rock, and not [544e] from the characters of the people in the cities, which tip the scale, so to speak, and drag everything else along with them?"
	οὐδαμῶς ἔγωγ', ἔφη, ἄλλοθεν ἢ ἐντεῦθεν.	"No," he said, "I think they come from nowhere but there."
	οὐκοῦν εἰ τὰ τῶν πόλεων πέντε, καὶ αἱ τῶν ἰδιωτῶν κατασκευαὶ τῆς ψυχῆς πέντε ἂν εἶεν.	"Then if the arrangements of cities are five, the arrangements of individual souls would be five too."
	τί μήν;	"Of course."[1]
544e	τὸν μὲν δὴ τῇ ἀριστοκρατίᾳ ὅμοιον διειληλύθαμεν ἤδη, ὃν ἀγαθόν τε καὶ δίκαιον ὀρθῶς φαμεν εἶναι.	

1 "From oak or rock" echoes a proverbial phrase in Homer (*Odyssey* 19.163) for someone of unknown origin.

GREEK

διεληλύθαμεν.

ἆρ' οὖν τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο διιτέον τοὺς χείρους, τὸν φιλόνικόν τε καὶ φιλότιμον, κατὰ τὴν Λακωνικὴν ἑστῶτα πολιτείαν, καὶ ὀλιγαρχικὸν αὖ καὶ δημοκρατικὸν καὶ τὸν τυραννικόν, ἵνα τὸν ἀδικώτατον ἰδόντες ἀντιθῶμεν τῷ δικαιοτάτῳ καὶ ἡμῖν τελέα ἡ σκέψις ᾖ, πῶς ποτε ἡ ἄκρατος δικαιοσύνη πρὸς ἀδικίαν τὴν ἄκρατον ἔχει εὐδαιμονίας τε πέρι τοῦ ἔχοντος καὶ ἀθλιότητος, ἵνα ἢ Θρασυμάχῳ πειθόμενοι [545b] διώκωμεν ἀδικίαν ἢ τῷ νῦν προφαινομένῳ λόγῳ δικαιοσύνην;

ENGLISH

"Now we've already described the man who resembles aristocracy, whom we rightly call good and just."

"We have."

"Next, then, shouldn't we go through the worse ones? First the man who loves victory and honor, corresponding to the Spartan constitution; then the oligarchic, the democratic and the tyrannical man. That way we can look at the most unjust man and set him beside the most just, and our inquiry will be complete: how pure justice compares with pure injustice in the happiness or wretchedness of the person who has it. Then we can either be persuaded by Thrasymachus [545b] and pursue injustice, or by the argument now coming to light and pursue justice."

545b παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, οὕτω ποιητέον.

ἆρ' οὖν, ὥσπερ ἠρξάμεθα ἐν ταῖς πολιτείαις πρότερον σκοπεῖν τὰ ἤθη ἢ ἐν τοῖς ἰδιώταις, ὡς ἐναργέστερον ὄν, καὶ νῦν οὕτω πρῶτον μὲν τὴν φιλότιμον σκεπτέον πολιτείαν —ὄνομα γὰρ οὐκ ἔχω λεγόμενον ἄλλο· ἢ τιμοκρατίαν ἢ τιμαρχίαν αὐτὴν κλητέον—πρὸς δὲ ταύτην τὸν τοιοῦτον [545c] ἄνδρα σκεψόμεθα, ἔπειτα ὀλιγαρχίαν καὶ ἄνδρα ὀλιγαρχικόν, αὖθις δὲ εἰς δημοκρατίαν ἀποβλέψαντες θεασόμεθα ἄνδρα δημοκρατικόν, τὸ δὲ τέταρτον εἰς τυραννουμένην πόλιν ἐλθόντες καὶ ἰδόντες, πάλιν εἰς τυραννικὴν ψυχὴν βλέποντες, πειρασόμεθα περὶ ὧν προυθέμεθα ἱκανοὶ κριταὶ γενέσθαι;

"Absolutely," he said, "that's what we must do."

"Well, earlier we began by examining characters in constitutions before examining them in individuals, since that's clearer. Shouldn't we do the same now? First we examine the constitution that loves honor—I have no other name in use for it; we'll have to call it timocracy or timarchy—and alongside it we'll consider the man of that sort; [545c] then oligarchy and the oligarchic man; next we'll look at democracy and observe the democratic man; and fourth, we'll go to the city ruled by a tyrant and look at it, and then look into the tyrannical soul. And so we'll try to become competent judges of the questions we set ourselves."

545c κατὰ λόγον γέ τοι ἄν, ἔφη, οὕτω γίγνοιτο ἥ τε θέα καὶ ἡ κρίσις.

φέρε τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πειρώμεθα λέγειν τίνα τρόπον τιμοκρατία γένοιτ' ἂν ἐξ ἀριστοκρατίας. ἢ τόδε μὲν ἁπλοῦν, [545d] ὅτι πᾶσα πολιτεία μεταβάλλει ἐξ αὐτοῦ τοῦ ἔχοντος τὰς ἀρχάς, ὅταν ἐν αὐτῷ τούτῳ στάσις ἐγγένηται· ὁμονοοῦντος δέ, κἂν πάνυ ὀλίγον ᾖ, ἀδύνατον κινηθῆναι;

ἔστι γὰρ οὕτω.

"That would certainly be a reasonable way," he said, "to do both the viewing and the judging."

"Come on, then," I said, "let's try to say how a timocracy would arise from an aristocracy. Or is it simply this: [545d] every constitution changes because of the very group that holds office, when civil strife breaks out within that group; but as long as it is of one mind, however small it is, it can't be shaken?"

"Yes, that's so."

HOW THE BEST CITY DECLINES

Socrates explains how strife among the rulers turns the best city into a timocracy.

GREEK

545d **SOCRATES** πῶς οὖν δή, εἶπον, ὦ Γλαύκων, ἡ πόλις ἡμῖν κινηθήσεται, καὶ πῇ στασιάσουσιν οἱ ἐπίκουροι καὶ οἱ

ENGLISH

SOCRATES "Then how, Glaucon," I said, "will our city be shaken? How will the auxiliaries and the

GREEK

ENGLISH

ἄρχοντες πρὸς ἀλλήλους τε καὶ πρὸς ἑαυτούς; ἢ βούλει, ὥσπερ Ὅμηρος, εὐχώμεθα ταῖς Μούσαις εἰπεῖν ἡμῖν ὅπως δὴ [545e] πρῶτον στάσις ἔμπεσε , καὶ φῶμεν αὐτὰς τραγικῶς ὡς πρὸς παῖδας ἡμᾶς παιζούσας καὶ ἐρεσχηλούσας, ὡς δὴ σπουδῇ λεγούσας, ὑψηλολογουμένας λέγειν;

πῶς;

rulers fall into strife with each other and among themselves? Or would you like us, like Homer, to pray to the Muses to tell us how [545e] 'strife first fell upon them'? We could say that they speak to us in a lofty, tragic style, playing and teasing us as if we were children, while talking as though they were in earnest."

"How?"[2]

546a ὧδέ πως. χαλεπὸν μὲν κινηθῆναι πόλιν οὕτω συστᾶσαν· ἀλλ' ἐπεὶ γενομένῳ παντὶ φθορά ἐστιν, οὐδ' ἡ τοιαύτη σύστασις τὸν ἅπαντα μενεῖ χρόνον, ἀλλὰ λυθήσεται. λύσις δὲ ἥδε· οὐ μόνον φυτοῖς ἐγγείοις, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἐν ἐπιγείοις ζῴοις φορὰ καὶ ἀφορία ψυχῆς τε καὶ σωμάτων γίγνονται, ὅταν περιτροπαὶ ἑκάστοις κύκλων περιφορὰς συνάπτωσι, βραχυβίοις μὲν βραχυπόρους, ἐναντίοις δὲ ἐναντίας. γένους δὲ ὑμετέρου εὐγονίας τε καὶ ἀφορίας, καίπερ ὄντες σοφοί, [546b] οὓς ἡγεμόνας πόλεως ἐπαιδεύσασθε, οὐδὲν μᾶλλον λογισμῷ μετ' αἰσθήσεως τεύξονται, ἀλλὰ πάρεισιν αὐτοὺς καὶ γεννήσουσι παῖδάς ποτε οὐ δέον.

Something like this. It is hard for a city constituted like this to be shaken. But since everything that comes into being must decay, not even a structure like this will last for all time; it will be dissolved. And this is how. Not only for plants in the earth but also for animals upon it, there come times of fertility and barrenness of soul and body, whenever the revolutions complete the circuits of each kind's cycles—short circuits for the short-lived, and the opposite for the opposite. As for the fertility and barrenness of your race, those [546b] you have educated as leaders of the city, wise though they are, will be no more successful at hitting on them through reasoning combined with perception. The times will slip past them, and they will beget children when they should not.

546b ἔστι δὲ θείῳ μὲν γεννητῷ περίοδος ἣν ἀριθμὸς περιλαμβάνει τέλειος, ἀνθρωπείῳ δὲ ἐν ᾧ πρώτῳ αὐξήσεις δυνάμεναί τε καὶ δυναστευόμεναι, τρεῖς ἀποστάσεις, τέτταρας δὲ ὅρους λαβοῦσαι ὁμοιούντων τε καὶ ἀνομοιούντων καὶ αὐξόντων καὶ φθινόντων, πάντα προσήγορα [546c] καὶ ῥητὰ πρὸς ἄλληλα ἀπέφηναν· ὧν ἐπίτριτος πυθμὴν πεμπάδι συζυγεὶς δύο ἁρμονίας παρέχεται τρὶς αὐξηθείς, τὴν μὲν ἴσην ἰσάκις, ἑκατὸν τοσαυτάκις, τὴν δὲ ἰσομήκη μὲν τῇ, προμήκη δέ, ἑκατὸν μὲν ἀριθμῶν ἀπὸ διαμέτρων ῥητῶν πεμπάδος, δεομένων ἑνὸς ἑκάστων, ἀρρήτων δὲ δυοῖν, ἑκατὸν δὲ κύβων τριάδος.

For a divine creature that is born, there is a period comprehended by a perfect number. For a human one, it is the first number in which increases, both dominating and dominated, taking three intervals and four terms of things that make like and unlike, that wax and wane, render everything [546c] commensurable and rational with everything else. Of these, the four-thirds base, yoked with five and increased three times, yields two harmonies. One is equal an equal number of times, so many times a hundred. The other is equal in length one way but oblong: on one side, a hundred numbers from the rational diameters of five, each less one (or less two, from the irrational diameters); on the other, a hundred cubes of three.[3]

546c σύμπας δὲ οὗτος ἀριθμὸς γεωμετρικός, τοιούτου κύριος, ἀμεινόνων τε καὶ χειρόνων γενέσεων, [546d] ἃς ὅταν ἀγνοήσαντες ὑμῖν οἱ φύλακες συνοικίζωσιν νύμφας νυμφίοις παρὰ καιρόν, οὐκ εὐφυεῖς οὐδ' εὐτυχεῖς παῖδες ἔσονται· ὧν καταστήσουσι μὲν τοὺς ἀρίστους οἱ πρότεροι, ὅμως δὲ ὄντες ἀνάξιοι, εἰς τὰς τῶν πατέρων αὖ δυνάμεις

This whole geometrical number controls this matter: better and worse births. [546d] And when your guardians, not knowing about them, pair brides with bridegrooms at the wrong time, the children will be neither well endowed by nature nor fortunate. The older generation will appoint the best of

2 Homer invokes the Muses to tell how fire first fell on the Greek ships (*Iliad* 16.112); Socrates adapts the phrase.
3 This "nuptial number" is famously obscure; one common reckoning makes it 12,960,000, the square of 3,600 and also the product 4,800 × 2,700.

GREEK

ἐλθόντες, ἡμῶν πρῶτον ἄρξονται ἀμελεῖν φύλακες ὄντες, παρ' ἔλαττον τοῦ δέοντος ἡγησάμενοι τὰ μουσικῆς, δεύτερον δὲ τὰ γυμναστικῆς, ὅθεν ἀμουσότεροι γενήσονται ὑμῖν οἱ νέοι. ἐκ δὲ τούτων ἄρχοντες οὐ πάνυ φυλακικοὶ 546e καταστήσονται πρὸς τὸ δοκιμάζειν τὰ Ἡσιόδου τε καὶ τὰ παρ' 547a ὑμῖν γένη, χρυσοῦν τε καὶ ἀργυροῦν καὶ χαλκοῦν καὶ σιδηροῦν·

547a ὁμοῦ δὲ μιγέντος σιδηροῦ ἀργυρῷ καὶ χαλκοῦ χρυσῷ ἀνομοιότης ἐγγενήσεται καὶ ἀνωμαλία ἀνάρμοστος, ἃ γενόμενα, οὗ ἂν ἐγγένηται, ἀεὶ τίκτει πόλεμον καὶ ἔχθραν. ταύτης τοι γενεῆς χρὴ φάναι εἶναι στάσιν, ὅπου ἂν γίγνηται ἀεί.

καὶ ὀρθῶς γ', ἔφη, αὐτὰς ἀποκρίνεσθαι φήσομεν.

καὶ γάρ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀνάγκη μούσας γε οὔσας. 547b

τί οὖν, ἦ δ' ὅς, τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο λέγουσιν αἱ Μοῦσαι;

547b στάσεως, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, γενομένης εἰλκέτην ἄρα ἑκατέρω τὼ γένει, τὸ μὲν σιδηροῦν καὶ χαλκοῦν ἐπὶ χρηματισμὸν καὶ γῆς κτῆσιν καὶ οἰκίας χρυσίου τε καὶ ἀργύρου, τὼ δ' αὖ, τὸ χρυσοῦν τε καὶ ἀργυροῦν, ἅτε οὐ πενομένω ἀλλὰ φύσει ὄντε πλουσίω, τὰς ψυχὰς ἐπὶ τὴν ἀρετὴν καὶ τὴν ἀρχαίαν κατάστασιν ἠγέτην· βιαζομένων δὲ καὶ ἀντιτεινόντων ἀλλήλοις, εἰς μέσον ὡμολόγησαν γῆν μὲν καὶ οἰκίας κατανειμαμένους 547c ἰδιώσασθαι, τοὺς δὲ πρὶν φυλαττομένους ὑπ' αὐτῶν ὡς ἐλευθέρους φίλους τε καὶ τροφέας, δουλωσάμενοι τότε περιοίκους τε καὶ οἰκέτας ἔχοντες, αὐτοὶ πολέμου τε καὶ φυλακῆς αὐτῶν ἐπιμελεῖσθαι.

547c δοκεῖ μοι, ἔφη, αὕτη ἡ μετάβασις ἐντεῦθεν γίγνεσθαι.

οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐν μέσῳ τις ἂν εἴη ἀριστοκρατίας τε καὶ ὀλιγαρχίας αὕτη ἡ πολιτεία;

πάνυ μὲν οὖν.

μεταβήσεται μὲν δὴ οὕτω· μεταβᾶσα δὲ πῶς οἰκήσει; ἢ 547d φανερὸν ὅτι τὰ μὲν μιμήσεται τὴν προτέραν πολιτείαν, τὰ δὲ τὴν ὀλιγαρχίαν, ἅτ' ἐν μέσῳ οὖσα, τὸ δέ τι καὶ αὐτῆς ἕξει ἴδιον;

οὕτως, ἔφη.

547d οὐκοῦν τῷ μὲν τιμᾶν τοὺς ἄρχοντας καὶ γεωργιῶν ἀπέχεσθαι τὸ προπολεμοῦν αὐτῆς καὶ χειροτεχνιῶν καὶ τοῦ ἄλλου χρηματισμοῦ, συσσίτια δὲ κατεσκευάσθαι καὶ

ENGLISH

them, but they will still be unworthy, and when they come into their fathers' powers they will begin, though guardians, to neglect us: first by valuing music and poetry less than they should, and second physical training, so that your young people will be less cultivated. From these will come rulers not very well suited 546e to guarding, to testing the races—Hesiod's, and those among 547a you—of gold, silver, bronze and iron.[4]

When iron is mixed with silver and bronze with gold, unlikeness will arise, and a discordant irregularity; and wherever these arise, they always breed war and hatred. "Of this lineage," we must say, is civil strife, wherever it arises.

"And we'll say that their answer is right," he said.

"It has to be," I said, "since they're Muses." 547b

"Then what do the Muses say next?" he said.

"Once strife has arisen," I said, "the two races pull in different directions. The iron and bronze pull toward moneymaking and the acquisition of land and houses, gold and silver. The other two, the gold and silver, since they are not poor but rich by nature, draw their souls toward excellence and the old order. They struggle and strain against each other, and then they agree on a middle course: they distribute land and houses 547c as private property; they enslave those they previously guarded as free friends and providers, and hold them as dependents and servants; and they themselves see to war and to keeping guard over them."

"I think that's where this change comes from," he said.

"Then wouldn't this constitution be somewhere between aristocracy and oligarchy?" I said.

"Certainly."

"That's how the change will happen. But once changed, how will it be run? Isn't it 547d clear that since it's in between, it will imitate the previous constitution in some ways and oligarchy in others, and also have something peculiar to itself?"

"Just so," he said.

"So in honoring its rulers; in having its warrior class keep away from farming, crafts and other

4 In Hesiod's *Works and Days*, humankind passes through successive races of gold, silver, bronze and iron.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	γυμναστικῆς τε καὶ τῆς τοῦ πολέμου ἀγωνίας ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, πᾶσι τοῖς τοιούτοις τὴν προτέραν μιμήσεται;	moneymaking; in establishing common meals and attending to physical training and the contests of war—in all such things it will imitate the previous one?"
	ναί. 547e	"Yes." 547e
547e	τῷ δέ γε φοβεῖσθαι τοὺς σοφοὺς ἐπὶ τὰς ἀρχὰς ἄγειν, ἅτε οὐκέτι κεκτημένην ἁπλοῦς τε καὶ ἀτενεῖς τοὺς τοιούτους ἄνδρας ἀλλὰ μεικτούς, ἐπὶ δὲ θυμοειδεῖς τε καὶ ἁπλουστέρους ἀποκλίνειν, τοὺς πρὸς πόλεμον μᾶλλον πεφυκότας ἢ πρὸς 548a εἰρήνην, καὶ τοὺς περὶ ταῦτα δόλους τε καὶ μηχανὰς ἐντίμως ἔχειν, καὶ πολεμοῦσα τὸν ἀεὶ χρόνον διάγειν, αὐτὴ ἑαυτῆς αὖ τὰ πολλὰ τῶν τοιούτων ἴδια ἕξει;	"But in being afraid to bring the wise into office, since it no longer has men of that kind who are simple and intense, only mixed ones; in leaning instead toward spirited and simpler men, more naturally suited to war than to 548a peace; in holding the tricks and stratagems of war in honor; and in spending all its time at war—in most such things it will have features peculiar to itself?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
548a	ἐπιθυμηταὶ δέ γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, χρημάτων οἱ τοιοῦτοι ἔσονται, ὥσπερ οἱ ἐν ταῖς ὀλιγαρχίαις, καὶ τιμῶντες ἀγρίως ὑπὸ σκότου χρυσόν τε καὶ ἄργυρον, ἅτε κεκτημένοι ταμιεῖα καὶ οἰκείους θησαυρούς, οἷ θέμενοι ἂν αὐτὰ κρύψειαν, καὶ αὖ περιβόλους οἰκήσεων, ἀτεχνῶς νεοττιὰς ἰδίας, ἐν αἷς 548b ἀναλίσκοντες γυναιξί τε καὶ οἷς ἐθέλοιεν ἄλλοις πολλὰ ἂν δαπανῷντο.	"Men like these will also be greedy for money," I said, "like those in oligarchies. They'll have a fierce, secret reverence for gold and silver, since they'll own storehouses and private treasuries where they can put it away and hide it, and walled houses—private nests, quite literally—in which 548b they can spend lavishly on women and on anyone else they like."
	ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη.	"Very true," he said.
548b	οὐκοῦν καὶ φειδωλοὶ χρημάτων, ἅτε τιμῶντες καὶ οὐ φανερῶς κτώμενοι, φιλαναλωταὶ δὲ ἀλλοτρίων δι' ἐπιθυμίαν, καὶ λάθρᾳ τὰς ἡδονὰς καρπούμενοι, ὥσπερ παῖδες πατέρα τὸν νόμον ἀποδιδράσκοντες, οὐχ ὑπὸ πειθοῦς ἀλλ' ὑπὸ βίας πεπαιδευμένοι διὰ τὸ τῆς ἀληθινῆς Μούσης τῆς μετὰ λόγων 548c τε καὶ φιλοσοφίας ἠμεληκέναι καὶ πρεσβυτέρως γυμναστικὴν μουσικῆς τετιμηκέναι.	"And won't they be stingy with their own money, since they value it and can't acquire it openly, but happy to spend other people's to satisfy their appetites? They'll enjoy their pleasures in secret, running away from the law like boys from their father. That's because they've been educated not by persuasion but by force, since they've neglected the true Muse, the one who goes with discussion 548c and philosophy, and honored physical training above music and poetry."
	παντάπασιν, ἔφη, λέγεις μεμειγμένην πολιτείαν ἐκ κακοῦ τε καὶ ἀγαθοῦ.	"The constitution you're describing," he said, "is a complete mixture of bad and good."
	μέμεικται γάρ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· διαφανέστατον δ' ἐν αὐτῇ ἐστὶν ἕν τι μόνον ὑπὸ τοῦ θυμοειδοῦς κρατοῦντος, φιλονικίαι καὶ φιλοτιμίαι.	"Yes, it is mixed," I said. "But one thing alone stands out most clearly in it, because the spirited part is in control: love of victory and love of honor."
	σφόδρα γε, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Very much so," he said.

THE TIMOCRATIC MAN

Socrates describes the honor-loving man and how he grows from the son of a good father.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
548c		

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	SOCRATES οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, αὕτη μὲν ἡ πολιτεία οὕτω γεγονυῖα καὶ τοιαύτη ἄν τις εἴη, ὡς λόγῳ σχῆμα πολιτείας ὑπογράψαντα [548d] μὴ ἀκριβῶς ἀπεργάσασθαι διὰ τὸ ἐξαρκεῖν μὲν ἰδεῖν καὶ ἐκ τῆς ὑπογραφῆς τόν τε δικαιότατον καὶ τὸν ἀδικώτατον, ἀμήχανον δὲ μήκει ἔργον εἶναι πάσας μὲν πολιτείας, πάντα δὲ ἤθη μηδὲν παραλιπόντα διελθεῖν.	**SOCRATES** "So this constitution would come into being in this way and be of this sort," I said, "to sketch the outline of a constitution in words [548d] without working it out precisely. The sketch is enough to let us see the most just and the most unjust man, and it would be an impossibly long task to go through every constitution and every character without leaving anything out."
	καὶ ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.	"That's right," he said.
	τίς οὖν ὁ κατὰ ταύτην τὴν πολιτείαν ἀνήρ; πῶς τε γενόμενος ποῖός τέ τις ὤν;	"Then who is the man who corresponds to this constitution? How does he come into being, and what is he like?"
	οἶμαι μέν, ἔφη ὁ Ἀδείμαντος, ἐγγύς τι αὐτὸν Γλαύκωνος τουτουὶ τείνειν ἕνεκά γε φιλονικίας. [548e]	"I think," said Adeimantus, "that he comes pretty close to Glaucon here, at least in his love of victory." [548e]
548e	ἴσως, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοῦτό γε· ἀλλά μοι δοκεῖ τάδε οὐ κατὰ τοῦτον πεφυκέναι.	"Perhaps in that respect," I said, "but I don't think he's like him in these ways."
	τὰ ποῖα;	"Which ones?"
	αὐθαδέστερόν τε δεῖ αὐτόν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἶναι καὶ ὑποαμουσότερον, φιλόμουσον δέ, καὶ φιλήκοον μέν, ῥητορικὸν δ' [549a] οὐδαμῶς. καὶ δούλοις μέν τις ἂν ἄγριος εἴη ὁ τοιοῦτος, οὐ καταφρονῶν δούλων, ὥσπερ ὁ ἱκανῶς πεπαιδευμένος, ἐλευθέροις δὲ ἥμερος, ἀρχόντων δὲ σφόδρα ὑπήκοος, φίλαρχος δὲ καὶ φιλότιμος, οὐκ ἀπὸ τοῦ λέγειν ἀξιῶν ἄρχειν οὐδ' ἀπὸ τοιούτου οὐδενός, ἀλλ' ἀπὸ ἔργων τῶν τε πολεμικῶν καὶ τῶν περὶ τὰ πολεμικά, φιλογυμναστής τέ τις ὢν καὶ φιλόθηρος.	"He has to be more self-willed," I said, "and somewhat less cultivated, though he loves the arts; fond of listening, but [549a] no speaker at all. A man like this would be harsh to slaves, instead of simply looking down on them as an adequately educated man does; gentle to free men, and very obedient to those in office. He loves ruling and loves honor, but he thinks he deserves to rule not because of his speaking or anything of that sort, but because of his deeds in war and in matters related to war. He's a lover of physical training and of hunting."
549a	ἔστι γάρ, ἔφη, τοῦτο τὸ ἦθος ἐκείνης τῆς πολιτείας.	"Yes," he said, "that's the character that goes with that constitution."
	οὐκοῦν καὶ χρημάτων, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὁ τοιοῦτος νέος μὲν ὢν [549b] καταφρονοῖ ἄν, ὅσῳ δὲ πρεσβύτερος γίγνοιτο, μᾶλλον ἀεὶ ἀσπάζοιτο ἂν τῷ τε μετέχειν τῆς τοῦ φιλοχρημάτου φύσεως καὶ μὴ εἶναι εἰλικρινὴς πρὸς ἀρετὴν διὰ τὸ ἀπολειφθῆναι τοῦ ἀρίστου φύλακος;	"And a man like this," I said, "would despise money while he's young, [549b] but the older he got, the more he'd welcome it. That's because he shares in the money-loving nature, and his commitment to excellence isn't pure, since he's been deprived of the best guardian."
	τίνος; ἦ δ' ὅς ὁ Ἀδείμαντος.	"What guardian?" said Adeimantus.
	λόγου, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μουσικῇ κεκραμένου· ὃς μόνος ἐγγενόμενος σωτὴρ ἀρετῆς διὰ βίου ἐνοικεῖ τῷ ἔχοντι.	"Reason blended with music and poetry," I said. "It's the only thing that, once it's present in a person, lives in him all his life as the preserver of his excellence."
	καλῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"Well put," he said.
549b	καὶ ἔστι μέν γ', ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοιοῦτος ὁ τιμοκρατικὸς νεανίας, τῇ τοιαύτῃ πόλει ἐοικώς. [549c]	"That, then, is the timocratic young man," I said, "resembling the city of that sort." [549c]

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
	γίγνεται δέ γ', εἶπον, οὗτος ὧδέ πως· ἐνίοτε πατρὸς ἀγαθοῦ ὢν νέος ὑὸς ἐν πόλει οἰκοῦντος οὐκ εὖ πολιτευομένῃ, φεύγοντος τάς τε τιμὰς καὶ ἀρχὰς καὶ δίκας καὶ τὴν τοιαύτην πᾶσαν φιλοπραγμοσύνην καὶ ἐθέλοντος ἐλαττοῦσθαι ὥστε πράγματα μὴ ἔχειν—	"And he comes into being something like this," I said. "Sometimes he's the young son of a good father who lives in a badly governed city, who shuns honors and offices and lawsuits and all that kind of busybodying, and is willing to take less so as to avoid trouble—"
	πῇ δή, ἔφη, γίγνεται;	"How does he come into being, then?" he said.
549c	ὅταν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πρῶτον μὲν τῆς μητρὸς ἀκούῃ ἀχθομένης ὅτι οὐ τῶν ἀρχόντων αὐτῇ ὁ ἀνὴρ ἐστιν, καὶ ἐλαττουμένης διὰ [549d] ταῦτα ἐν ταῖς ἄλλαις γυναιξίν, ἔπειτα ὁρώσης μὴ σφόδρα περὶ χρήματα σπουδάζοντα μηδὲ μαχόμενον καὶ λοιδορούμενον ἰδίᾳ τε ἐν δικαστηρίοις καὶ δημοσίᾳ, ἀλλὰ ῥᾳθύμως πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα φέροντα, καὶ ἑαυτῷ μὲν τὸν νοῦν προσέχοντα ἀεὶ αἰσθάνηται, ἑαυτὴν δὲ μήτε πάνυ τιμῶντα μήτε ἀτιμάζοντα, ἐξ ἁπάντων τούτων ἀχθομένης τε καὶ λεγούσης ὡς ἄνανδρός τε αὐτῷ ὁ πατὴρ καὶ λίαν ἀνειμένος, καὶ ἄλλα δὴ ὅσα καὶ [549e] οἷα φιλοῦσιν αἱ γυναῖκες περὶ τῶν τοιούτων ὑμνεῖν.	"First," I said, "when he hears his mother complaining that her husband isn't one of the rulers, and that because of this she's slighted [549d] among the other women. Then she sees that he isn't very serious about money, and doesn't fight or trade insults in private lawsuits or in public, but takes all that sort of thing easily; and she notices that his mind is always on himself, and that he neither particularly honors her nor slights her. The boy hears her resenting all this and telling him that his father is unmanly and far too easygoing, and all the other things [549e] women love to harp on in such cases."
549e	καὶ μάλ', ἔφη ὁ Ἀδείμαντος, πολλά τε καὶ ὅμοια ἑαυταῖς.	"Yes," said Adeimantus, "plenty of them, and just what you'd expect from them."
	οἶσθα οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι καὶ οἱ οἰκέται τῶν τοιούτων ἐνίοτε λάθρᾳ πρὸς τοὺς ὑεῖς τοιαῦτα λέγουσιν, οἱ δοκοῦντες εὖνοι εἶναι, καὶ ἐάν τινα ἴδωσιν ἢ ὀφείλοντα χρήματα, ᾧ μὴ ἐπεξέρχεται ὁ πατήρ, ἤ τι ἄλλο ἀδικοῦντα, διακελεύονται ὅπως, ἐπειδὰν ἀνὴρ γένηται, τιμωρήσεται πάντας τοὺς τοιούτους [550a] καὶ ἀνὴρ μᾶλλον ἔσται τοῦ πατρός. καὶ ἐξιὼν ἕτερα τοιαῦτα ἀκούει καὶ ὁρᾷ, τοὺς μὲν τὰ αὑτῶν πράττοντας ἐν τῇ πόλει ἠλιθίους τε καλουμένους καὶ ἐν σμικρῷ λόγῳ ὄντας, τοὺς δὲ μὴ τὰ αὑτῶν τιμωμένους τε καὶ ἐπαινουμένους.	"And you know," I said, "that the servants of such men—the ones who seem loyal—sometimes say the same sort of thing to the sons in secret. If they see someone who owes the father money and isn't being prosecuted by him, or who wrongs him in some other way, they urge the son to punish all such people when he grows up, [550a] and to be more of a man than his father. And when he goes out, he hears and sees more of the same: people who mind their own business in the city are called fools and held of little account, while those who don't are honored and praised."
550a	τότε δὴ ὁ νέος πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα ἀκούων τε καὶ ὁρῶν, καὶ αὖ τοὺς τοῦ πατρὸς λόγους ἀκούων τε καὶ ὁρῶν τὰ ἐπιτηδεύματα αὐτοῦ ἐγγύθεν παρὰ τὰ τῶν ἄλλων, ἑλκόμενος ὑπ' ἀμφοτέρων [550b] τούτων, τοῦ μὲν πατρὸς αὐτοῦ τὸ λογιστικὸν ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ ἄρδοντός τε καὶ αὔξοντος, τῶν δὲ ἄλλων τό τε ἐπιθυμητικὸν καὶ τὸ θυμοειδές, διὰ τὸ μὴ κακοῦ ἀνδρὸς εἶναι τὴν φύσιν, ὁμιλίαις δὲ ταῖς τῶν ἄλλων κακαῖς κεχρῆσθαι, εἰς τὸ μέσον ἑλκόμενος ὑπ' ἀμφοτέρων τούτων ἦλθε, καὶ τὴν ἐν ἑαυτῷ ἀρχὴν παρέδωκε τῷ μέσῳ τε καὶ φιλονίκῳ καὶ θυμοειδεῖ, καὶ ἐγένετο ὑψηλόφρων τε καὶ φιλότιμος ἀνήρ.	"Then the young man hears and sees all this; and on the other hand, he hears his father's words and sees his pursuits up close, next to those of others. He is pulled by both [550b] of them: his father waters and nourishes the reasoning part in his soul, the others the appetitive and the spirited parts. Since he isn't a bad man by nature but has kept bad company with the others, being pulled by both he settles in the middle. He hands over the rule within himself to the middle part, the victory-loving and spirited one, and becomes a haughty, honor-loving man."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
550b	κομιδῇ μοι, ἔφη, δοκεῖς τὴν τούτου γένεσιν διεληλυθέναι. 550c	"I think you've described his origin exactly," he said. 550c
	ἔχομεν ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τήν τε δευτέραν πολιτείαν καὶ τὸν δεύτερον ἄνδρα.	"Then we have the second constitution and the second man," I said.
	ἔχομεν, ἔφη.	"We do," he said.
	οὐκοῦν μετὰ τοῦτο, τὸ τοῦ Αἰσχύλου, λέγωμεν, ἄλλον ἄλλῃ πρὸς πόλει τεταγμένον , μᾶλλον δὲ κατὰ τὴν ὑπόθεσιν προτέραν τὴν πόλιν;	"Next, then, shall we tell, as Aeschylus has it, of 'another, posted at another gate'—or rather, following our plan, of the city first?"
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Certainly," he said.
	εἴη δέ γ' ἄν, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, ὀλιγαρχία ἡ μετὰ τὴν τοιαύτην πολιτείαν.	"And the constitution that comes after this sort, I think, would be oligarchy."
	λέγεις δέ, ἦ δ' ὅς, τὴν ποίαν κατάστασιν ὀλιγαρχίαν;	"And what sort of system," he said, "do you mean by oligarchy?"

OLIGARCHY AND THE OLIGARCHIC MAN

Socrates describes how timocracy becomes oligarchy, rule by the rich, and the miserly man who matches it.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
550c	SOCRATES τὴν ἀπὸ τιμημάτων, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πολιτείαν, ἐν ᾗ οἱ μὲν 550d πλούσιοι ἄρχουσιν, πένητι δὲ οὐ μέτεστιν ἀρχῆς.	SOCRATES "The constitution based on property assessment," I said, "in which the 550d rich rule and the poor man has no share in office."
	μανθάνω, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"I understand," he said.
	οὐκοῦν ὡς μεταβαίνει πρῶτον ἐκ τῆς τιμαρχίας εἰς τὴν ὀλιγαρχίαν, ῥητέον;	"Then shouldn't we first describe how the change from timarchy to oligarchy happens?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	καὶ μήν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ τυφλῷ γε δῆλον ὡς μεταβαίνει.	"Well," I said, "even a blind man can see how it happens."
	πῶς;	"How?"
	τὸ ταμιεῖον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐκεῖνο ἑκάστῳ χρυσίου πληρούμενον ἀπόλλυσι τὴν τοιαύτην πολιτείαν. πρῶτον μὲν γὰρ δαπάνας αὐτοῖς ἐξευρίσκουσιν, καὶ τοὺς νόμους ἐπὶ τοῦτο παράγουσιν, ἀπειθοῦντες αὐτοί τε καὶ γυναῖκες αὐτῶν.	"That storehouse full of gold that each man has," I said, "destroys a constitution like this. First they find new ways to spend money on themselves, and bend the laws to suit, disobeying them—both they and their wives."
	εἰκός, ἔφη. 550e	"That's likely," he said. 550e
550e	ἔπειτά γε οἶμαι ἄλλος ἄλλον ὁρῶν καὶ εἰς ζῆλον ἰὼν τὸ πλῆθος τοιοῦτον αὐτῶν ἀπηργάσαντο.	"Then, I think, each one watches the next and tries to match him, and so they make the majority of them like this."
	εἰκός.	"Likely."
	τοὐντεῦθεν τοίνυν, εἶπον, προϊόντες εἰς τὸ πρόσθεν τοῦ χρηματίζεσθαι, ὅσῳ ἂν τοῦτο τιμιώτερον ἡγῶνται, τοσούτῳ ἀρετὴν ἀτιμοτέραν. ἢ οὐχ οὕτω πλούτου ἀρετὴ διέστηκεν, ὥσπερ ἐν πλάστιγγι ζυγοῦ κειμένου ἑκατέρου, ἀεὶ τοὐναντίον ῥέποντε;	"From there," I said, "they go further and further into moneymaking; and the more they value it, the less they value excellence. Or isn't wealth at odds with excellence in just this way—as if each lay in one pan of a scale, always tipping opposite ways?"
	καὶ μάλ', ἔφη.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τιμωμένου δὴ πλούτου ἐν πόλει καὶ τῶν πλουσίων ἀτιμοτέρα ἀρετή τε καὶ οἱ ἀγαθοί.	"Very much so," he said.
	δῆλον.	"So when wealth and the wealthy are honored in a city, excellence and good men are less honored."
	ἀσκεῖται δὴ τὸ ἀεὶ τιμώμενον, ἀμελεῖται δὲ τὸ ἀτιμαζόμενον.	"Clearly."
	οὕτω.	"And whatever is honored at any time is practiced, and whatever is dishonored is neglected."
		"Just so."
551a	ἀντὶ δὴ φιλονίκων καὶ φιλοτίμων ἀνδρῶν φιλοχρηματισταὶ καὶ φιλοχρήματοι τελευτῶντες ἐγένοντο, καὶ τὸν μὲν πλούσιον ἐπαινοῦσίν τε καὶ θαυμάζουσι καὶ εἰς τὰς ἀρχὰς ἄγουσι, τὸν δὲ πένητα ἀτιμάζουσι.	"So in place of men who love victory and honor, they end up lovers of moneymaking and of money. They praise and admire the rich man and bring him into office, and they treat the poor man with contempt."
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
	οὐκοῦν τότε δὴ νόμον τίθενται ὅρον πολιτείας ὀλιγαρχικῆς [551b] ταξάμενοι πλῆθος χρημάτων, οὗ μὲν μᾶλλον ὀλιγαρχία, πλέον, οὗ δ' ἧττον, ἔλαττον, προειπόντες ἀρχῶν μὴ μετέχειν ᾧ ἂν μὴ ᾖ οὐσία εἰς τὸ ταχθὲν τίμημα, ταῦτα δὲ ἢ βίᾳ μεθ' ὅπλων διαπράττονται, ἢ καὶ πρὸ τούτου φοβήσαντες κατεστήσαντο τὴν τοιαύτην πολιτείαν. ἢ οὐχ οὕτως;	"Then at that point they pass a law defining the oligarchic constitution [551b] by fixing an amount of wealth—larger where it's more of an oligarchy, smaller where it's less—and announcing that no one whose property doesn't reach the fixed assessment may hold office. They carry this through by force of arms, or else they've already set up this sort of constitution beforehand by intimidation. Isn't that so?"
	οὕτω μὲν οὖν.	"It is."
551b	ἡ μὲν δὴ κατάστασις ὡς ἔπος εἰπεῖν αὕτη.	"Well, that, roughly speaking, is how it's established."
	ναί, ἔφη· ἀλλὰ τίς δὴ ὁ τρόπος τῆς πολιτείας; καὶ ποῖά [551c] ἐστιν ἃ ἔφαμεν αὐτὴν ἁμαρτήματα ἔχειν;	"Yes," he said. "But what is this constitution like? And what [551c] are the faults we said it has?"
	πρῶτον μέν, ἔφην, τοῦτο αὐτό, ὅρος αὐτῆς οἷός ἐστιν. ἆθρει γάρ, εἰ νεῶν οὕτω τις ποιοῖτο κυβερνήτας, ἀπὸ τιμημάτων, τῷ δὲ πένητι, εἰ καὶ κυβερνητικώτερος εἴη, μὴ ἐπιτρέποι—	"First," I said, "its very defining standard, and what that is like. Just consider: if someone appointed ships' pilots this way, on the basis of property, and wouldn't entrust a ship to a poor man, even a better pilot—"
	πονηράν, ἦ δ' ὅς, τὴν ναυτιλίαν αὐτοὺς ναυτίλλεσθαι.	"They'd make a wretched voyage of it," he said.
	οὐκοῦν καὶ περὶ ἄλλου οὕτως ὁτουοῦν ἤ τινος ἀρχῆς;	"And isn't it the same with the leadership of anything else whatever?"
	οἶμαι ἔγωγε.	"I think so."
	πλὴν πόλεως; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· ἢ καὶ πόλεως πέρι;	"Except a city?" I said. "Or with a city too?"
551c	πολύ γ', ἔφη, μάλιστα, ὅσῳ χαλεπωτάτη καὶ μεγίστη ἡ ἀρχή. [551d]	"Far more so," he said, "since it's the most difficult and the greatest kind of rule." [551d]
	ἓν μὲν δὴ τοῦτο τοσοῦτον ὀλιγαρχία ἂν ἔχοι ἁμάρτημα.	"So that's one fault, and a big one, that oligarchy would have."
	φαίνεται.	"Evidently."
	τί δέ; τόδε ἆρά τι τούτου ἔλαττον;	"What about this one? Is it any smaller than that?"
	τὸ ποῖον;	"What?"

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τὸ μὴ μίαν ἀλλὰ δύο ἀνάγκῃ εἶναι τὴν τοιαύτην πόλιν, τὴν μὲν πενήτων, τὴν δὲ πλουσίων, οἰκοῦντας ἐν τῷ αὐτῷ, ἀεὶ ἐπιβουλεύοντας ἀλλήλοις.	"That a city like this is necessarily not one but two—one of the poor and one of the rich—living in the same place and always plotting against each other."
	οὐδὲν μὰ Δί', ἔφη, ἔλαττον.	"No, by Zeus," he said, "that's no smaller."
551d	ἀλλὰ μὴν οὐδὲ τόδε καλόν, τὸ ἀδυνάτους εἶναι ἴσως πόλεμόν τινα πολεμεῖν διὰ τὸ ἀναγκάζεσθαι ἢ χρωμένους 551e τῷ πλήθει ὡπλισμένῳ δεδιέναι μᾶλλον ἢ τοὺς πολεμίους, ἢ μὴ χρωμένους ὡς ἀληθῶς ὀλιγαρχικοὺς φανῆναι ἐν αὐτῷ τῷ μάχεσθαι, καὶ ἅμα χρήματα μὴ ἐθέλειν εἰσφέρειν, ἅτε φιλοχρημάτους.	"Nor is this a fine thing: that they're probably unable to fight a war. They're forced either to use 551e the masses armed, and fear them more than the enemy, or not to use them, and then turn out to be oligarchs in the truest sense—the few—on the battlefield itself. And at the same time they're unwilling to pay taxes for it, being lovers of money."
	οὐ καλόν.	"Not fine."
	τί δέ; ὃ πάλαι ἐλοιδοροῦμεν, τὸ πολυπραγμονεῖν γεωργοῦντας 552a καὶ χρηματιζομένους καὶ πολεμοῦντας ἅμα τοὺς αὐτοὺς ἐν τῇ τοιαύτῃ πολιτείᾳ, ἦ δοκεῖ ὀρθῶς ἔχειν;	"And what about the thing we condemned long ago—the same people farming, 552a making money and fighting at once in such a constitution, meddling in many things? Does that seem right?"
	οὐδ' ὁπωστιοῦν.	"Not in the least."
	ὅρα δή, τούτων πάντων τῶν κακῶν εἰ τόδε μέγιστον αὖτη πρώτη παραδέχεται.	"Now see whether this constitution is the first to admit the greatest of all these evils."
552a	τὸ ποῖον;	"What's that?"
	τὸ ἐξεῖναι πάντα τὰ αὑτοῦ ἀποδόσθαι, καὶ ἄλλῳ κτήσασθαι τὰ τούτου, καὶ ἀποδόμενον οἰκεῖν ἐν τῇ πόλει μηδὲν ὄντα τῶν τῆς πόλεως μερῶν, μήτε χρηματιστὴν μήτε δημιουργὸν μήτε ἱππέα μήτε ὁπλίτην, ἀλλὰ πένητα καὶ ἄπορον κεκλημένον. 552b	"Allowing someone to sell everything he has, and another to acquire it; and allowing the one who has sold it to go on living in the city while being no part of it—neither moneymaker nor craftsman nor cavalryman nor hoplite, but called poor and destitute." 552b
	πρώτη, ἔφη.	"Yes, it's the first," he said.
	οὔκουν διακωλύεταί γε ἐν ταῖς ὀλιγαρχουμέναις τὸ τοιοῦτον· οὐ γὰρ ἂν οἱ μὲν ὑπέρπλουτοι ἦσαν, οἱ δὲ παντάπασι πένητες.	"Certainly nothing prevents this in oligarchies. Otherwise some wouldn't be enormously rich and others utterly poor."
	ὀρθῶς.	"Right."
552b	τόδε δὲ ἄθρει· ἆρα ὅτε πλούσιος ὢν ἀνήλισκεν ὁ τοιοῦτος, μᾶλλόν τι τότ' ἦν ὄφελος τῇ πόλει εἰς ἃ νυνδὴ ἐλέγομεν; ἢ ἐδόκει μὲν τῶν ἀρχόντων εἶναι, τῇ δὲ ἀληθείᾳ οὔτε ἄρχων οὔτε ὑπηρέτης ἦν αὐτῆς, ἀλλὰ τῶν ἑτοίμων ἀναλωτής; 552c	"Now look at this. When a man like this was rich and spending his money, was he any more use to the city for the purposes we were just talking about? Or did he seem to be one of the rulers, while in truth he was neither ruler nor servant of the city, but just a consumer of what was at hand?" 552c
	οὕτως, ἔφη· ἐδόκει, ἦν δὲ οὐδὲν ἄλλο ἢ ἀναλωτής.	"Just so," he said. "He seemed to be one, but he was nothing but a consumer."
	βούλει οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, φῶμεν αὐτόν, ὡς ἐν κηρίῳ κηφὴν ἐγγίγνεται, σμήνους νόσημα, οὕτω καὶ τὸν τοιοῦτον ἐν οἰκίᾳ κηφῆνα ἐγγίγνεσθαι, νόσημα πόλεως;	"Then shall we say," I said, "that just as a drone grows up in the honeycomb, a disease of the hive, so a man like this grows up in his house as a drone, a disease of the city?"
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες.	

GREEK	ENGLISH
	"Certainly, Socrates," he said.
552c οὐκοῦν, ὦ Ἀδείμαντε, τοὺς μὲν πτηνοὺς κηφῆνας πάντας ἀκέντρους ὁ θεὸς πεποίηκεν, τοὺς δὲ πεζοὺς τούτους ἐνίους μὲν αὐτῶν ἀκέντρους, ἐνίους δὲ δεινὰ κέντρα ἔχοντας; καὶ ἐκ μὲν τῶν ἀκέντρων πτωχοὶ πρὸς τὸ γῆρας τελευτῶσιν, ἐκ δὲ 552d τῶν κεκεντρωμένων πάντες ὅσοι κέκληνται κακοῦργοι;	"And, Adeimantus, hasn't god made all the winged drones stingless, while of these walking ones he has made some stingless and some with terrible stings? From the stingless ones come those who end up as beggars in old age, while from 552d those with stings come all who are called criminals?"
ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη.	"Very true," he said.
δῆλον ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐν πόλει οὗ ἂν ἴδῃς πτωχούς, ὅτι εἰσί που ἐν τούτῳ τῷ τόπῳ ἀποκεκρυμμένοι κλέπται τε καὶ βαλλαντιατόμοι καὶ ἱερόσυλοι καὶ πάντων τῶν τοιούτων κακῶν δημιουργοί.	"So it's clear," I said, "that wherever you see beggars in a city, there are hidden somewhere in that place thieves, pickpockets, temple-robbers and craftsmen of every such evil."
δῆλον, ἔφη.	"It's clear," he said.
552d τί οὖν; ἐν ταῖς ὀλιγαρχουμέναις πόλεσι πτωχοὺς οὐχ ὁρᾷς ἐνόντας;	"Well then, don't you see beggars in oligarchic cities?"
ὀλίγου γ', ἔφη, πάντας τοὺς ἐκτὸς τῶν ἀρχόντων. 552e	"Nearly everyone outside the ruling class," he said. 552e
μὴ οὖν οἰόμεθα, ἔφην ἐγώ, καὶ κακούργους πολλοὺς ἐν αὐταῖς εἶναι κέντρα ἔχοντας, οὓς ἐπιμελείᾳ βίᾳ κατέχουσιν αἱ ἀρχαί;	"Then aren't we to think," I said, "that there are also many criminals in them with stings, whom the authorities carefully hold down by force?"
οἰόμεθα μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"We certainly are," he said.
ἆρ' οὖν οὐ δι' ἀπαιδευσίαν καὶ κακὴν τροφὴν καὶ κατάστασιν τῆς πολιτείας φήσομεν τοὺς τοιούτους αὐτόθι ἐγγίγνεσθαι;	"And won't we say that such people arise there because of lack of education, bad upbringing and the way the constitution is set up?"
φήσομεν.	"We will."
ἀλλ' οὖν δὴ τοιαύτη γέ τις ἂν εἴη ἡ ὀλιγαρχουμένη πόλις καὶ τοσαῦτα κακὰ ἔχουσα, ἴσως δὲ καὶ πλείω.	"Well, anyway, the oligarchic city would be something like this, and would have all these evils, and perhaps even more."
σχεδόν τι, ἔφη.	"Pretty much," he said.
553a ἀπειργάσθω δὴ ἡμῖν καὶ αὕτη, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἡ πολιτεία, ἣν ὀλιγαρχίαν καλοῦσιν, ἐκ τιμημάτων ἔχουσα τοὺς ἄρχοντας· τὸν δὲ ταύτῃ ὅμοιον μετὰ ταῦτα σκοπῶμεν, ὡς τε γίγνεται οἷός τε γενόμενός ἐστιν.	"Then let's take this constitution too as completed," I said, "the one they call oligarchy, which takes its rulers on the basis of property assessment. Next let's examine the man who resembles it: how he comes into being, and what he's like once he has."
πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Certainly," he said.
ἆρ' οὖν ὧδε μάλιστα εἰς ὀλιγαρχικὸν ἐκ τοῦ τιμοκρατικοῦ ἐκείνου μεταβάλλει;	"Isn't it mostly in this way that the timocratic man we described changes into an oligarchic one?"
πῶς;	"How?"
ὅταν αὐτοῦ παῖς γενόμενος τὸ μὲν πρῶτον ζηλοῖ τε τὸν πατέρα καὶ τὰ ἐκείνου ἴχνη διώκῃ, ἔπειτα αὐτὸν ἴδῃ ἐξαίφνης 553b πταίσαντα ὥσπερ πρὸς ἔρματι πρὸς τῇ πόλει, καὶ ἐκχέαντα τά τε αὑτοῦ καὶ ἑαυτόν, ἢ στρατηγήσαντα ἤ τιν' ἄλλην μεγάλην ἀρχὴν ἄρξαντα,	"When a son of his at first emulates his father and follows in his footsteps, and then suddenly sees him 553b crash into the city like a ship on a reef, losing his property and himself. He has been a general, perhaps, or held some other high office, and

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	εἶτα εἰς δικαστήριον ἐμπεσόντα βλαπτόμενον ὑπὸ συκοφαντῶν ἢ ἀποθανόντα ἢ ἐκπεσόντα ἢ ἀτιμωθέντα καὶ τὴν οὐσίαν ἅπασαν ἀποβαλόντα.	then he's dragged into court, harmed by malicious prosecutors, and put to death or exiled or stripped of his civic rights, losing all his property."
	εἰκός γ', ἔφη.	"That's likely," he said.
553b	ἰδὼν δέ γε, ὦ φίλε, ταῦτα καὶ παθὼν καὶ ἀπολέσας τὰ ὄντα, δείσας οἶμαι εὐθὺς ἐπὶ κεφαλὴν ὠθεῖ ἐκ τοῦ θρόνου 553c τοῦ ἐν τῇ ἑαυτοῦ ψυχῇ φιλοτιμίαν τε καὶ τὸ θυμοειδὲς ἐκεῖνο, καὶ ταπεινωθεὶς ὑπὸ πενίας πρὸς χρηματισμὸν τραπόμενος γλίσχρως καὶ κατὰ σμικρὸν φειδόμενος καὶ ἐργαζόμενος χρήματα συλλέγεται. ἆρ' οὐκ οἴει τὸν τοιοῦτον τότε εἰς μὲν τὸν θρόνον ἐκεῖνον τὸ ἐπιθυμητικόν τε καὶ φιλοχρήματον ἐγκαθίζειν καὶ μέγαν βασιλέα ποιεῖν ἐν ἑαυτῷ, τιάρας τε καὶ στρεπτοὺς καὶ ἀκινάκας παραζωννύντα;	"And having seen this, my friend, and suffered it, and lost what he had, he's frightened, I think, and at once throws love of honor and that spirited part headlong from the throne 553c in his soul. Humbled by poverty, he turns to moneymaking, and by stingy, penny-pinching saving and hard work he scrapes money together. Don't you think that such a man will then set the appetitive, money-loving part on that throne and make it a great king within himself, girding it with tiaras, collars and short swords?"
	ἔγωγ', ἔφη. 553d	"I do," he said. 553d [5]
553d	τὸ δέ γε οἶμαι λογιστικόν τε καὶ θυμοειδὲς χαμαὶ ἕνθεν καὶ ἕνθεν παρακαθίσας ὑπ' ἐκείνῳ καὶ καταδουλωσάμενος, τὸ μὲν οὐδὲν ἄλλο ἐᾷ λογίζεσθαι οὐδὲ σκοπεῖν ἀλλ' ἢ ὁπόθεν ἐξ ἐλαττόνων χρημάτων πλείω ἔσται, τὸ δὲ αὖ θαυμάζειν καὶ τιμᾶν μηδὲν ἄλλο ἢ πλοῦτόν τε καὶ πλουσίους, καὶ φιλοτιμεῖσθαι μηδ' ἐφ' ἑνὶ ἄλλῳ ἢ ἐπὶ χρημάτων κτήσει καὶ ἐάν τι ἄλλο εἰς τοῦτο φέρῃ.	"And the reasoning and spirited parts, I think, he makes sit on the ground on either side, beneath it, as its slaves. The first he allows to reason about and investigate nothing except how to make more money out of less; the second, to admire and honor nothing but wealth and the wealthy, and to take pride in nothing but acquiring money and whatever leads to that."
	οὐκ ἔστ' ἄλλη, ἔφη, μεταβολὴ οὕτω ταχεῖά τε καὶ ἰσχυρὰ ἐκ φιλοτίμου νέου εἰς φιλοχρήματον. 553e	"There's no other change," he said, "so quick and so powerful as that of an honor-loving young man into a money-loving one." 553e
	ἆρ' οὖν οὗτος, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὀλιγαρχικός ἐστιν;	"Then is this man oligarchic?" I said.
553e	ἡ γοῦν μεταβολὴ αὐτοῦ ἐξ ὁμοίου ἀνδρός ἐστι τῇ πολιτείᾳ, ἐξ ἧς ἡ ὀλιγαρχία μετέστη.	"Well, he has changed from a man who resembled the constitution from which oligarchy arose."
	σκοπῶμεν δὴ εἰ ὅμοιος ἂν εἴη.	"Then let's see whether he resembles it."
	σκοπῶμεν.	"Let's."
	οὐκοῦν πρῶτον μὲν τῷ χρήματα περὶ πλείστου ποιεῖσθαι ὅμοιος ἂν εἴη;	"First, wouldn't he resemble it in valuing money above everything?"
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	καὶ μὴν τῷ γε φειδωλὸς εἶναι καὶ ἐργάτης, τὰς ἀναγκαίους ἐπιθυμίας μόνον τῶν παρ' αὑτῷ ἀποπιμπλάς, τὰ δὲ ἄλλα ἀναλώματα μὴ παρεχόμενος, ἀλλὰ δουλούμενος τὰς ἄλλας ἐπιθυμίας ὡς ματαίους.	"And also in being thrifty and hardworking: he satisfies only his necessary appetites and allows himself no other expenses, but enslaves his other appetites as pointless."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
554a	αὐχμηρός γέ τις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὢν καὶ ἀπὸ παντὸς περιουσίαν ποιούμενος, θησαυροποιὸς ἀνήρ—οὗς δὴ καὶ ἐπαινεῖ τὸ	"He's a squalid sort of man," I said, "who makes a profit out of everything, a hoarder—just the kind

5 Tiaras, gold collars and short swords were regalia of the Persian court; the Persian king was known to the Greeks as "the Great King."

GREEK

πλῆθος [554b] —ἢ οὐχ οὗτος ἂν εἴη ὁ τῇ τοιαύτῃ πολιτείᾳ ὅμοιος;

ἐμοὶ γοῦν, ἔφη, δοκεῖ· χρήματα γοῦν μάλιστα ἔντιμα τῇ τε πόλει καὶ παρὰ τῷ τοιούτῳ.

οὐ γὰρ οἶμαι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, παιδείᾳ ὁ τοιοῦτος προσέσχηκεν.

οὐ δοκῶ, ἔφη· οὐ γὰρ ἂν τυφλὸν ἡγεμόνα τοῦ χοροῦ ἐστήσατο καὶ ἐτίμα μάλιστα.

554b εὖ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. τόδε δὲ σκόπει· κηφηνώδεις ἐπιθυμίας ἐν αὐτῷ διὰ τὴν ἀπαιδευσίαν μὴ φῶμεν ἐγγίγνεσθαι, τὰς μὲν [554c] πτωχικάς, τὰς δὲ κακούργους, κατεχομένας βίᾳ ὑπὸ τῆς ἄλλης ἐπιμελείας;

καὶ μάλ', ἔφη.

οἶσθ' οὖν, εἶπον, οἷ ἀποβλέψας κατόψει αὐτῶν τὰς κακουργίας;

ποῖ; ἔφη.

εἰς τὰς τῶν ὀρφανῶν ἐπιτροπεύσεις, καὶ εἴ πού τι αὐτοῖς τοιοῦτον συμβαίνει, ὥστε πολλῆς ἐξουσίας λαβέσθαι τοῦ ἀδικεῖν.

ἀληθῆ.

554c ἆρ' οὖν οὐ τούτῳ δῆλον ὅτι ἐν τοῖς ἄλλοις συμβολαίοις ὁ τοιοῦτος, ἐν οἷς εὐδοκιμεῖ δοκῶν δίκαιος εἶναι, ἐπιεικεῖ [554d] τινὶ ἑαυτοῦ βίᾳ κατέχει ἄλλας κακὰς ἐπιθυμίας ἐνούσας, οὐ πείθων ὅτι οὐκ ἄμεινον, οὐδ' ἡμερῶν λόγῳ, ἀλλ' ἀνάγκῃ καὶ φόβῳ, περὶ τῆς ἄλλης οὐσίας τρέμων;

καὶ πάνυ γ', ἔφη.

καὶ νὴ Δία, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ φίλε, τοῖς πολλοῖς γε αὐτῶν ἐνευρήσεις, ὅταν δέῃ τἀλλότρια ἀναλίσκειν, τὰς τοῦ κηφῆνος συγγενεῖς ἐνούσας ἐπιθυμίας.

καὶ μάλα, ἦ δ' ὅς, σφόδρα.

554d οὐκ ἄρ' ἂν εἴη ἀστασίαστος ὁ τοιοῦτος ἐν ἑαυτῷ, οὐδὲ εἷς ἀλλὰ διπλοῦς τις, ἐπιθυμίας δὲ ἐπιθυμιῶν ὡς τὸ πολὺ [554e] κρατούσας ἂν ἔχοι βελτίους χειρόνων.

ἔστιν οὕτω.

ENGLISH

the majority admire. [554b] Isn't he the one who resembles this sort of constitution?"

"I think so, anyway," he said. "Money, at least, is what's valued most, both by the city and by a man like this."

"Yes, because I don't think a man like this has paid any attention to education," I said.

"I don't think so," he said, "or he wouldn't have made a blind man leader of his chorus and honored him most."[6]

"Good," I said. "Now consider this. Shouldn't we say that because of his lack of education drone-like desires spring up in him, some of them [554c] beggarly, others criminal, but held down by force through his general carefulness?"

"Certainly," he said.

"Then do you know where to look," I said, "if you want to catch sight of their criminality?"

"Where?" he said.

"At their management of orphans' estates, and at any situation like that which happens to give them plenty of license to do wrong."

"True."

"So isn't it clear from this that in his other dealings, where he has a good reputation because he seems to be just, a man like this uses some decent part [554d] of himself to hold down by force the other bad desires within him—not by persuading them that it's better not to, nor by taming them with reason, but by compulsion and fear, because he trembles for the rest of his property?"

"Very much so," he said.

"And by Zeus, my friend," I said, "in most of them you'll find, when it comes to spending other people's money, desires akin to the drone's living inside them."

"Very much so," he said, "absolutely."

"So a man like this wouldn't be free of internal strife. He wouldn't be one man but a sort of double one—though for the most part [554e] his better desires would have the upper hand over his worse."

"That's how it is."

"That's why, I think, he'd be more respectable than many. But the true excellence of a soul in harmony

GREEK

διὰ ταῦτα δὴ οἶμαι εὐσχημονέστερος ἂν πολλῶν ὁ τοιοῦτος εἴη· ὁμονοητικῆς δὲ καὶ ἡρμοσμένης τῆς ψυχῆς ἀληθὴς ἀρετὴ πόρρω ποι ἐκφεύγοι ἂν αὐτόν.

δοκεῖ μοι.

554e καὶ μὴν ἀνταγωνιστής γε ἰδίᾳ ἐν πόλει ὁ φειδωλὸς [555a] φαῦλος ἥ τινος νίκης ἢ ἄλλης φιλοτιμίας τῶν καλῶν, χρήματά τε οὐκ ἐθέλων εὐδοξίας ἕνεκα καὶ τῶν τοιούτων ἀγώνων ἀναλίσκειν, δεδιὼς τὰς ἐπιθυμίας τὰς ἀναλωτικὰς ἐγείρειν καὶ συμπαρακαλεῖν ἐπὶ συμμαχίαν τε καὶ φιλονικίαν, ὀλίγοις τισὶν ἑαυτοῦ πολεμῶν ὀλιγαρχικῶς τὰ πολλὰ ἡττᾶται καὶ πλουτεῖ.

καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.

ἔτι οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀπιστοῦμεν μὴ κατὰ τὴν ὀλιγαρχουμένην πόλιν ὁμοιότητι τὸν φειδωλόν τε καὶ χρηματιστὴν [555b] τετάχθαι;

οὐδαμῶς, ἔφη.

ENGLISH

and at one with itself would escape him and stay far away."

"I think so."

"And certainly as a private citizen competing in the city for a victory or any other fine distinction, the stingy man [555a] is a poor contender. He's unwilling to spend money for the sake of a good name or on contests of that kind, because he's afraid to awaken his spending desires and call them in as allies for the struggle. So he fights in true oligarchic fashion, with only a few of his forces; he loses most of the time—and stays rich."

"Very much so," he said.

"Then do we still doubt," I said, "that the stingy moneymaker is placed [555b] beside the oligarchic city because he resembles it?"

"Not at all," he said.

DEMOCRACY AND THE DEMOCRATIC MAN

Socrates describes how oligarchy becomes democracy and portrays the free, many-sided democratic man.

GREEK

555b **SOCRATES** δημοκρατίαν δή, ὡς ἔοικε, μετὰ τοῦτο σκεπτέον, τίνα τε γίγνεται τρόπον, γενομένη τε ποῖόν τινα ἔχει, ἵν' αὖ τὸν τοῦ τοιούτου ἀνδρὸς τρόπον γνόντες παραστησώμεθ' αὐτὸν εἰς κρίσιν.

ὁμοίως γοῦν ἄν, ἔφη, ἡμῖν αὐτοῖς πορευοίμεθα.

οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μεταβάλλει μὲν τρόπον τινὰ τοιόνδε ἐξ ὀλιγαρχίας εἰς δημοκρατίαν, δι' ἀπληστίαν τοῦ προκειμένου ἀγαθοῦ, τοῦ ὡς πλουσιώτατον δεῖν γίγνεσθαι;

πῶς δή; [555c]

555c ἄτε οἶμαι ἄρχοντες ἐν αὐτῇ οἱ ἄρχοντες διὰ τὸ πολλὰ κεκτῆσθαι, οὐκ ἐθέλουσιν εἴργειν νόμῳ τῶν νέων ὅσοι ἂν ἀκόλαστοι γίγνωνται, μὴ ἐξεῖναι αὐτοῖς ἀναλίσκειν τε καὶ ἀπολλύναι τὰ αὑτῶν, ἵνα ὠνούμενοι τὰ τῶν τοιούτων καὶ εἰσδανείζοντες ἔτι πλουσιώτεροι καὶ ἐντιμότεροι γίγνωνται.

παντός γε μᾶλλον.

οὐκοῦν δῆλον ἤδη τοῦτο ἐν πόλει, ὅτι πλοῦτον τιμᾶν καὶ σωφροσύνην ἅμα ἱκανῶς κτᾶσθαι ἐν τοῖς πολίταις [555d]

ENGLISH

SOCRATES "Next, it seems, we have to examine democracy: how it comes into being, and what it's like once it has, so that we can come to know the character of the corresponding man in turn and bring him forward for judgment."

"That way," he said, "we'd at least be proceeding consistently."

"Well then," I said, "doesn't the change from oligarchy to democracy happen something like this—through an insatiable appetite for the good it has set before itself, the need to become as rich as possible?"

"How so?" [555c]

"Since the rulers in it rule because they own a great deal, I think they're unwilling to use the law to restrain those of the young who turn out undisciplined—to forbid them to spend and squander what's theirs—so that by buying up these people's property and lending money against it they can become still richer and more honored."

"More than anything."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἀδύνατον, ἀλλ᾽ ἀνάγκη ἢ τοῦ ἑτέρου ἀμελεῖν ἢ τοῦ ἑτέρου;	"Then isn't it clear by now that in a city it's impossible to honor wealth and at the same time for the citizens to acquire enough
	ἐπιεικῶς, ἔφη, δῆλον.	"That's reasonably clear," he said.
555d	παραμελοῦντες δὴ ἐν ταῖς ὀλιγαρχίαις καὶ ἐφιέντες ἀκολασταίνειν οὐκ ἀγεννεῖς ἐνίοτε ἀνθρώπους πένητας ἠνάγκασαν γενέσθαι.	"So in oligarchies, by their neglect and by letting people live undisciplined lives, they have sometimes forced men of no mean birth to become poor."
	μάλα γε.	"Very much so."
	κάθηνται δὴ οἶμαι οὗτοι ἐν τῇ πόλει κεκεντρωμένοι τε καὶ ἐξωπλισμένοι, οἱ μὲν ὀφείλοντες χρέα, οἱ δὲ ἄτιμοι γεγονότες, οἱ δὲ ἀμφότερα, μισοῦντές τε καὶ ἐπιβουλεύοντες τοῖς κτησαμένοις τὰ αὑτῶν καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις, νεωτερισμοῦ 555e ἐρῶντες.	"And these men, I think, sit idle in the city, stings at the ready and fully armed—some in debt, some stripped of their civic rights, some both—hating and plotting against those who acquired their property and everyone else, and longing 555e for revolution."
	ἔστι ταῦτα.	"That's so."
555e	οἱ δὲ δὴ χρηματισταὶ ἐγκύψαντες, οὐδὲ δοκοῦντες τούτους ὁρᾶν, τῶν λοιπῶν τὸν ἀεὶ ὑπείκοντα ἐνιέντες ἀργύριον τιτρώσκοντες, καὶ τοῦ πατρὸς ἐκγόνους τόκους πολλαπλασίους 556a κομιζόμενοι, πολὺν τὸν κηφῆνα καὶ πτωχὸν ἐμποιοῦσι τῇ πόλει.	"But the moneymakers keep their heads down and pretend not even to see them. They wound any of the rest who gives way to them by injecting their money, and, collecting as interest the parent sum's offspring many times over, 556a they breed a large crop of drones and beggars in the city."
	πῶς γάρ, ἔφη, οὐ πολύν;	"How could it not be large?" he said.
	καὶ οὔτε γ᾽ ἐκείνῃ, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, τὸ τοιοῦτον κακὸν ἐκκαόμενον ἐθέλουσιν ἀποσβεννύναι, εἴργοντες τὰ αὐτοῦ ὅπῃ τις βούλεται τρέπειν, οὔτε τῇδε, ᾗ αὖ κατὰ ἕτερον νόμον τὰ τοιαῦτα λύεται.	"And they're unwilling to put out this evil as it flares up," I said, "either in the one way—by preventing a man from doing whatever he likes with his property—or in the other, by which, under a different law, such problems are resolved."
	κατὰ δὴ τίνα;	"And what law is that?"
556a	ὃς μετ᾽ ἐκεῖνόν ἐστι δεύτερος καὶ ἀναγκάζων ἀρετῆς ἐπιμελεῖσθαι τοὺς πολίτας. ἐὰν γὰρ ἐπὶ τῷ αὐτοῦ κινδύνῳ 556b τὰ πολλά τις τῶν ἑκουσίων συμβολαίων προστάττῃ συμβάλλειν, χρηματίζοιντο μὲν ἂν ἧττον ἀναιδῶς ἐν τῇ πόλει, ἐλάττω δ᾽ ἐν αὐτῇ φύοιτο τῶν τοιούτων κακῶν οἵων νυνδὴ εἴπομεν.	"The one that comes second to it, which compels the citizens to care about excellence. If someone ordered that most voluntary contracts be made at the lender's own 556b risk, people would make money less shamelessly in the city, and fewer evils of the kind we just described would grow up in it."
	καὶ πολύ γε, ἦ δ᾽ ὅς.	"Far fewer," he said.
556b	νῦν δέ γ᾽, ἔφην ἐγώ, διὰ πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα τοὺς μὲν δὴ ἀρχομένους οὕτω διατιθέασιν ἐν τῇ πόλει οἱ ἄρχοντες· σφᾶς δὲ αὐτοὺς καὶ τοὺς αὑτῶν—ἆρ᾽ οὐ τρυφῶντας μὲν τοὺς νέους καὶ ἀπόνους καὶ πρὸς τὰ τοῦ σώματος καὶ πρὸς 556c τὰ τῆς ψυχῆς, μαλακοὺς δὲ καρτερεῖν πρὸς ἡδονάς τε καὶ λύπας καὶ ἀργούς;	"But as things are," I said, "for all these reasons the rulers put the ruled in the city into this condition. As for themselves and their own—don't they make their young men pampered and lazy, in body and 556c in soul alike, too soft to hold out against pleasures and pains, and idle?"

6 The blind leader is Plutus, god of wealth, traditionally pictured as blind.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
	αὐτοὺς δὲ πλὴν χρηματισμοῦ τῶν ἄλλων ἡμεληκότας, καὶ οὐδὲν πλείω ἐπιμέλειαν πεποιημένους ἀρετῆς ἢ τοὺς πένητας;	"And themselves careless of everything but making money, paying no more attention to excellence than the poor do?"
	οὐ γὰρ οὖν.	"No more, certainly."
556c	οὕτω δὴ παρεσκευασμένοι ὅταν παραβάλλωσιν ἀλλήλοις οἵ τε ἄρχοντες καὶ οἱ ἀρχόμενοι ἢ ἐν ὁδῶν πορείαις ἢ ἐν ἄλλαις τισὶ κοινωνίαις, ἢ κατὰ θεωρίας ἢ κατὰ στρατείας, ἢ σύμπλοι γιγνόμενοι ἢ συστρατιῶται, ἢ καὶ ἐν αὐτοῖς τοῖς 556d κινδύνοις ἀλλήλους θεώμενοι μηδαμῇ ταύτῃ καταφρονῶνται οἱ πένητες ὑπὸ τῶν πλουσίων, ἀλλὰ πολλάκις ἰσχνὸς ἀνὴρ πένης, ἡλιωμένος, παραταχθεὶς ἐν μάχῃ πλουσίῳ ἐσκιατροφηκότι, πολλὰς ἔχοντι σάρκας ἀλλοτρίας, ἴδῃ ἄσθματός τε καὶ ἀπορίας μεστόν, ἆρ' οἴει αὐτὸν οὐχ ἡγεῖσθαι κακίᾳ τῇ σφετέρᾳ πλουτεῖν τοὺς τοιούτους, καὶ ἄλλον ἄλλῳ παραγγέλλειν, ὅταν ἰδίᾳ συγγίγνωνται, ὅτι "ἄνδρες ἡμέτεροι· 556e εἰσὶ γὰρ οὐδέν;"	"So when rulers and ruled, prepared like this, come alongside each other—on a journey, or in some other joint undertaking, on a festival delegation or a campaign, as shipmates or as fellow soldiers—or when they watch each other in the very 556d face of danger, the poor are in no way despised by the rich there. On the contrary, a lean, sunburned poor man is often posted in battle beside a rich man raised in the shade and carrying a lot of extra flesh, and sees him full of gasping and helplessness. Don't you think he concludes that such people are rich because of the poor men's own badness, and that when the poor get together in private they pass the word to one another: 'Those men are ours. 556e They're nothing'?"
556e	εὖ οἶδα μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, ἔγωγε, ὅτι οὕτω ποιοῦσιν.	"Oh, I know perfectly well," he said, "that that's what they do."
	οὐκοῦν ὥσπερ σῶμα νοσῶδες μικρᾶς ῥοπῆς ἔξωθεν δεῖται προσλαβέσθαι πρὸς τὸ κάμνειν, ἐνίοτε δὲ καὶ ἄνευ τῶν ἔξω στασιάζει αὐτὸ αὑτῷ, οὕτω δὴ καὶ ἡ κατὰ ταὐτὰ ἐκείνῳ διακειμένη πόλις ἀπὸ σμικρᾶς προφάσεως, ἔξωθεν ἐπαγομένων ἢ τῶν ἑτέρων ἐξ ὀλιγαρχουμένης πόλεως συμμαχίαν ἢ τῶν ἑτέρων ἐκ δημοκρατουμένης, νοσεῖ τε καὶ αὐτὴ αὑτῇ μάχεται, ἐνίοτε δὲ καὶ ἄνευ τῶν ἔξω στασιάζει;	"Then just as a sickly body needs only a slight push from outside to fall ill, and sometimes is at war with itself even without anything external, so too a city in the same condition falls sick and fights with itself on a slight pretext—when one side brings in allies from an oligarchic city, or the other side from a democratic one—and sometimes falls into civil strife even without outsiders?"
	καὶ σφόδρα γε.	"Very much so."
557a	δημοκρατία δὴ οἶμαι γίγνεται ὅταν οἱ πένητες νικήσαντες τοὺς μὲν ἀποκτείνωσι τῶν ἑτέρων, τοὺς δὲ ἐκβάλωσι, τοῖς δὲ λοιποῖς ἐξ ἴσου μεταδῶσι πολιτείας τε καὶ ἀρχῶν, καὶ ὡς τὸ πολὺ ἀπὸ κλήρων αἱ ἀρχαὶ ἐν αὐτῇ γίγνονται.	"Democracy comes into being, I think, when the poor win, kill some of the other side and banish others, and give the rest an equal share in the constitution and in the offices—and in it offices are mostly assigned by lot."
	ἔστι γάρ, ἔφη, αὕτη ἡ κατάστασις δημοκρατίας, ἐάντε καὶ δι' ὅπλων γένηται ἐάντε καὶ διὰ φόβον ὑπεξελθόντων τῶν ἑτέρων.	"Yes," he said, "that's how democracy is established, whether it happens by force of arms or because the other side withdraws out of fear."
	τίνα δὴ οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὗτοι τρόπον οἰκοῦσι; καὶ ποία 557b τις ἡ τοιαύτη αὖ πολιτεία; δῆλον γὰρ ὅτι ὁ τοιοῦτος ἀνὴρ δημοκρατικός τις ἀναφανήσεται.	"Then how do these people live?" I said. "And what sort 557b of constitution is this one, in its turn? For clearly the man who resembles it will turn out to be a democratic sort of man."
	δῆλον, ἔφη.	"Clearly," he said.[7]

7 In Athens most public offices were filled by drawing lots among eligible citizens.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
557b	οὐκοῦν πρῶτον μὲν δὴ ἐλεύθεροι, καὶ ἐλευθερίας ἡ πόλις μεστὴ καὶ παρρησίας γίγνεται, καὶ ἐξουσία ἐν αὐτῇ ποιεῖν ὅτι τις βούλεται;	"Well, first of all, aren't they free? Doesn't the city become full of freedom and free speech, with license in it to do whatever one wants?"
	λέγεταί γε δή, ἔφη.	"So it's said, anyway," he said.
	ὅπου δέ γε ἐξουσία, δῆλον ὅτι ἰδίαν ἕκαστος ἂν κατασκευὴν τοῦ αὑτοῦ βίου κατασκευάζοιτο ἐν αὐτῇ, ἥτις ἕκαστον ἀρέσκοι.	"And where there's license, clearly each person will arrange his own private way of life in it, whatever pleases him."
	δῆλον. 557c	"Clearly." 557c
	παντοδαποὶ δὴ ἂν οἶμαι ἐν ταύτῃ τῇ πολιτείᾳ μάλιστ' ἐγγίγνοιντο ἄνθρωποι.	"Then in this constitution above all, I think, you'd find human beings of every kind."
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
557c	κινδυνεύει, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καλλίστη αὕτη τῶν πολιτειῶν εἶναι· ὥσπερ ἱμάτιον ποικίλον πᾶσιν ἄνθεσι πεποικιλμένον, οὕτω καὶ αὕτη πᾶσιν ἤθεσιν πεποικιλμένη καλλίστη ἂν φαίνοιτο. καὶ ἴσως μέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ ταύτην, ὥσπερ οἱ παῖδές τε καὶ αἱ γυναῖκες τὰ ποικίλα θεώμενοι, καλλίστην ἂν πολλοὶ κρίνειαν.	"It may well be," I said, "the most beautiful of constitutions. Like a many-colored cloak embroidered with every kind of flower, this one too, embroidered with every kind of character, might look most beautiful. And perhaps," I said, "many people would judge it the most beautiful, like children and women gazing at colorful things."
	καὶ μάλ', ἔφη. 557d	"Very much so," he said. 557d
	καὶ ἔστιν γε, ὦ μακάριε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐπιτήδειον ζητεῖν ἐν αὐτῇ πολιτείαν.	"And it's also a convenient place, my dear fellow," I said, "to look for a constitution."
	τί δή;	"Why's that?"
557d	ὅτι πάντα γένη πολιτειῶν ἔχει διὰ τὴν ἐξουσίαν, καὶ κινδυνεύει τῷ βουλομένῳ πόλιν κατασκευάζειν, ὃ νυνδὴ ἡμεῖς ἐποιοῦμεν, ἀναγκαῖον εἶναι εἰς δημοκρατουμένην ἐλθόντι πόλιν, ὃς ἂν αὐτὸν ἀρέσκῃ τρόπος, τοῦτον ἐκλέξασθαι, ὥσπερ εἰς παντοπώλιον ἀφικομένῳ πολιτειῶν, καὶ ἐκλεξαμένῳ οὕτω κατοικίζειν. 557e	"Because thanks to its license it contains every kind of constitution. Anyone who wants to set up a city, as we were doing just now, may well need to go to a democratic city and pick out whatever model pleases him, as if he'd come to a bazaar of constitutions, and then found his city on the one he's chosen." 557e
	ἴσως γοῦν, ἔφη, οὐκ ἂν ἀποροῖ παραδειγμάτων.	"At any rate," he said, "he probably wouldn't be short of models."
557e	τὸ δὲ μηδεμίαν ἀνάγκην, εἶπον, εἶναι ἄρχειν ἐν ταύτῃ τῇ πόλει, μηδ' ἂν ᾖς ἱκανὸς ἄρχειν, μηδὲ αὖ ἄρχεσθαι, ἐὰν μὴ βούλῃ, μηδὲ πολεμεῖν πολεμούντων, μηδὲ εἰρήνην ἄγειν τῶν ἄλλων ἀγόντων, ἐὰν μὴ ἐπιθυμῇς εἰρήνης, μηδὲ αὖ, ἐάν τις ἄρχειν νόμος σε διακωλύῃ ἢ δικάζειν, μηδὲν ἧττον καὶ 558a ἄρχειν καὶ δικάζειν, ἐὰν αὐτῷ σοι ἐπίῃ, ἆρ' οὐ θεσπεσία καὶ ἡδεῖα ἡ τοιαύτη διαγωγὴ ἐν τῷ παραυτίκα;	"And there's no compulsion to rule in this city," I said, "even if you're capable of ruling, nor again to be ruled if you don't want to be, nor to go to war when the others are at war, nor to keep the peace when the others are keeping it, if you don't want peace. And again, if some law forbids you to hold office or sit on a jury, you can hold office and 558a sit on juries all the same, if the fancy takes you. Isn't that a heavenly, delightful way to live—for the moment?"
	ἴσως, ἔφη, ἔν γε τούτῳ.	"Perhaps," he said, "for the moment, anyway."
558a	τί δέ; ἡ πρᾳότης ἐνίων τῶν δικασθέντων οὐ κομψή; ἢ οὔπω εἶδες, ἐν τοιαύτῃ πολιτείᾳ ἀνθρώπων	"And what about it? Isn't the calm of some of those who've been convicted charming? Or haven't you

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καταψηφισθέντων θανάτου ἢ φυγῆς, οὐδὲν ἧττον αὐτῶν μενόντων τε καὶ ἀναστρεφομένων ἐν μέσῳ, καὶ ὡς οὔτε φροντίζοντος οὔτε ὁρῶντος οὐδενὸς περινοστεῖ ὥσπερ ἥρως;	yet seen how in a constitution like this, when people have been sentenced to death or exile, they stay on all the same and go about in public, and one of them roams around like a hero's ghost, as if no one noticed or saw?"
	καὶ πολλούς γ', ἔφη. 558b	"Lots of them," he said. 558b
558b	ἡ δὲ συγγνώμη καὶ οὐδ' ὁπωστιοῦν σμικρολογία αὐτῆς, ἀλλὰ καταφρόνησις ὧν ἡμεῖς ἐλέγομεν σεμνύνοντες, ὅτε τὴν πόλιν ᾠκίζομεν, ὡς εἰ μή τις ὑπερβεβλημένην φύσιν ἔχοι, οὔποτ' ἂν γένοιτο ἀνὴρ ἀγαθός, εἰ μὴ παῖς ὢν εὐθὺς παίζοι ἐν καλοῖς καὶ ἐπιτηδεύοι τὰ τοιαῦτα πάντα, ὡς μεγαλοπρεπῶς καταπατήσασ' ἅπαντ' αὐτὰ οὐδὲν φροντίζει ἐξ ὁποίων ἄν τις ἐπιτηδευμάτων ἐπὶ τὰ πολιτικὰ ἰὼν πράττῃ, ἀλλὰ τιμᾷ, 558c ἐὰν φῇ μόνον εὔνους εἶναι τῷ πλήθει;	"And its tolerance—not the least bit petty—and its contempt for the things we spoke of so solemnly when we were founding our city: that unless someone had an exceptional nature, he could never become a good man unless from childhood he played among fine things and pursued everything of that sort. How magnificently it tramples all that underfoot, not caring at all what practices a man comes from when he goes into politics, but honoring him 558c if he merely says he's a friend of the people!"
	πάνυ γ', ἔφη, γενναία.	"Oh yes," he said, "very noble of it."
558c	ταῦτά τε δή, ἔφην, ἔχοι ἂν καὶ τούτων ἄλλα ἀδελφὰ δημοκρατία, καὶ εἴη, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἡδεῖα πολιτεία καὶ ἄναρχος καὶ ποικίλη, ἰσότητά τινα ὁμοίως ἴσοις τε καὶ ἀνίσοις διανέμουσα.	"These, then," I said, "and other things akin to them, are what democracy would have. It would be, it seems, a pleasant constitution, anarchic and many-colored, handing out a sort of equality to equals and unequals alike."
	καὶ μάλ', ἔφη, γνώριμα λέγεις.	"What you're describing is very familiar," he said.
	ἄθρει δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τίς ὁ τοιοῦτος ἰδίᾳ. ἢ πρῶτον σκεπτέον, ὥσπερ τὴν πολιτείαν ἐσκεψάμεθα, τίνα τρόπον γίγνεται;	"Now look," I said, "at what the corresponding man is like in private. Or should we first examine, as we did with the constitution, how he comes into being?"
	ναί, ἔφη.	"Yes," he said.
	ἆρ' οὖν οὐχ ὧδε; τοῦ φειδωλοῦ ἐκείνου καὶ ὀλιγαρχικοῦ 558d γένοιτ' ἂν οἶμαι υὸς ὑπὸ τῷ πατρὶ τεθραμμένος ἐν τοῖς ἐκείνου ἤθεσι;	"Then isn't it like this? That stingy, oligarchic man 558d would have a son, I suppose, raised by his father in his father's ways?"
	τί γὰρ οὔ;	"Why not?"
558d	βίᾳ δὴ καὶ οὗτος ἄρχων τῶν ἐν αὐτῷ ἡδονῶν, ὅσαι ἀναλωτικαὶ μέν, χρηματιστικαὶ δὲ μή· αἳ δὴ οὐκ ἀναγκαῖαι κέκληνται—	"And he too rules by force over the pleasures in himself that are spenders rather than money-makers—the ones that have been called unnecessary—"
	δῆλον, ἔφη.	"Clearly," he said.
	βούλει οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἵνα μὴ σκοτεινῶς διαλεγώμεθα, πρῶτον ὁρισώμεθα τάς τε ἀναγκαίους ἐπιθυμίας καὶ τὰς μή;	"Then, so that we don't argue in the dark," I said, "would you like us first to define the necessary desires and the unnecessary ones?"
	βούλομαι, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"I would," he said.
	οὐκοῦν ἅς τε οὐκ ἂν οἷοί τ' εἶμεν ἀποτρέψαι, δικαίως 558e ἂν ἀναγκαῖαι καλοῖντο, καὶ ὅσαι ἀποτελούμεναι ὠφελοῦσιν ἡμᾶς; τούτων γὰρ ἀμφοτέρων ἐφίεσθαι ἡμῶν τῇ φύσει ἀνάγκη. ἢ οὔ;	"Well, the ones we couldn't turn aside would rightly 558e be called necessary, and so would those

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καὶ μάλα.	whose satisfaction benefits us? For our nature compels us to crave both of these. Or not?"
	δικαίως δὴ τοῦτο ἐπ' αὐταῖς ἐροῦμεν, τὸ ἀναγκαῖον.	"Very much so."
	δικαίως.	"Then we'll be right to apply the word 'necessary' to them."
		"Right."
559a	τί δέ; ἅς γέ τις ἀπαλλάξειεν ἄν, εἰ μελετῷ ἐκ νέου, καὶ πρὸς οὐδὲν ἀγαθὸν ἐνοῦσαι δρῶσιν, αἱ δὲ καὶ τοὐναντίον, πάσας ταύτας εἰ μὴ ἀναγκαίους φαῖμεν εἶναι, ἆρ' οὐ καλῶς ἂν λέγοιμεν;	"And what about the ones someone could get rid of if he trained himself from youth, and which do no good by being present—and some even do the opposite? If we said all of these were unnecessary, wouldn't we be speaking correctly?"
	καλῶς μὲν οὖν.	"Correctly, yes."
	προελώμεθα δή τι παράδειγμα ἑκατέρων αἵ εἰσιν, ἵνα τύπῳ λάβωμεν αὐτάς;	"Shall we pick out an example of each kind, so that we can grasp them in outline?"
	οὐκοῦν χρή.	"We should."
	ἆρ' οὖν οὐχ ἡ τοῦ φαγεῖν μέχρι ὑγιείας τε καὶ εὐεξίας [559b] καὶ αὐτοῦ σίτου τε καὶ ὄψου ἀναγκαῖος ἂν εἴη;	"Well, wouldn't the desire to eat, up to the point of health and fitness, [559b] the desire for bread itself and relish, be necessary?"
	οἶμαι.	"I think so."
559b	ἡ μέν γέ που τοῦ σίτου κατ' ἀμφότερα ἀναγκαία, ᾗ τε ὠφέλιμος ᾗ τε μὴ παῦσαι ζῶντα δυνατή.	"The desire for bread, at least, is necessary on both counts: it's beneficial, and we can't make it stop as long as we're alive."
	ναί.	"Yes."
	ἡ δὲ ὄψου, εἴ πῇ τινα ὠφελίαν πρὸς εὐεξίαν παρέχεται,	"And the desire for relish is necessary insofar as it provides some benefit toward fitness."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
	τί δὲ ἡ πέρα τούτων καὶ ἀλλοίων ἐδεσμάτων ἢ τοιούτων ἐπιθυμία, δυνατὴ δὲ κολαζομένη ἐκ νέων καὶ παιδευομένη ἐκ τῶν πολλῶν ἀπαλλάττεσθαι, καὶ βλαβερὰ μὲν σώματι, βλαβερὰ δὲ ψυχῇ πρός τε φρόνησιν καὶ τὸ σωφρονεῖν; ἆρά [559c] γε ὀρθῶς οὐκ ἀναγκαία ἂν καλοῖτο;	"And what about the desire that goes beyond these, for other kinds of food and the like—one most people can get rid of if it's checked and trained from youth, and which harms the body, and harms the soul with respect to understanding and moderation? Wouldn't it [559c] rightly be called unnecessary?"
	ὀρθότατα μὲν οὖν.	"Most rightly."
559c	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἀναλωτικὰς φῶμεν εἶναι ταύτας, ἐκείνας δὲ χρηματιστικὰς διὰ τὸ χρησίμους πρὸς τὰ ἔργα εἶναι;	"Then shall we also call these spending desires, and the others moneymaking desires, because they're useful for our work?"
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
	οὕτω δὴ καὶ περὶ ἀφροδισίων καὶ τῶν ἄλλων φήσομεν;	"And we'll say the same about sex and the rest?"
	οὕτω.	"Yes."
	ἆρ' οὖν καὶ ὃν νυνδὴ κηφῆνα ὠνομάζομεν, τοῦτον ἐλέγομεν τὸν τῶν τοιούτων ἡδονῶν καὶ ἐπιθυμιῶν γέμοντα καὶ [559d] ἀρχόμενον ὑπὸ τῶν μὴ ἀναγκαίων, τὸν δὲ ὑπὸ τῶν ἀναγκαίων φειδωλόν τε καὶ ὀλιγαρχικόν;	"And the man we were calling a drone just now—weren't we saying he was the one full of such pleasures and desires and [559d] ruled by the unne-
	ἀλλὰ τί μήν;	

GREEK

πάλιν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λέγωμεν ὡς ἐξ ὀλιγαρχικοῦ δημοκρατικὸς γίγνεται. φαίνεται δέ μοι τά γε πολλὰ ὧδε γίγνεσθαι.

πῶς;

559d ὅταν νέος, τεθραμμένος ὡς νυνδὴ ἐλέγομεν, ἀπαιδεύτως τε καὶ φειδωλῶς, γεύσηται κηφήνων μέλιτος, καὶ συγγένηται αἴθωσι θηρσὶ καὶ δεινοῖς, παντοδαπὰς ἡδονὰς καὶ ποικίλας καὶ παντοίως ἐχούσας δυναμένοις σκευάζειν, ἐνταῦθά που [559e] οἴου εἶναι ἀρχὴν αὐτῷ μεταβολῆς ὀλιγαρχικῆς τῆς ἑαυτῷ εἰς δημοκρατικήν.

πολλὴ ἀνάγκη, ἔφη.

ἆρ' οὖν, ὥσπερ ἡ πόλις μετέβαλλε βοηθησάσης τῷ ἑτέρῳ μέρει συμμαχίας ἔξωθεν, ὁμοίας ὁμοίῳ, οὕτω καὶ ὁ νεανίας μεταβάλλει βοηθοῦντος αὖ εἴδους ἐπιθυμιῶν ἔξωθεν τῷ ἑτέρῳ τῶν παρ' ἐκείνῳ, συγγενοῦς τε καὶ ὁμοίου;

παντάπασιν μὲν οὖν.

559e καὶ ἐὰν μέν γε οἶμαι ἀντιβοηθήσῃ τις τῷ ἐν ἑαυτῷ ὀλιγαρχικῷ συμμαχία, ἤ ποθεν παρὰ τοῦ πατρὸς ἢ καὶ τῶν [560a] ἄλλων οἰκείων νουθετούντων τε καὶ κακιζόντων, στάσις δὴ καὶ ἀντίστασις καὶ μάχη ἐν αὐτῷ πρὸς αὑτὸν τότε γίγνεται.

τί μήν;

καὶ ποτὲ μὲν οἶμαι τὸ δημοκρατικὸν ὑπεχώρησε τῷ ὀλιγαρχικῷ, καί τινες τῶν ἐπιθυμιῶν αἱ μὲν διεφθάρησαν, αἱ δὲ καὶ ἐξέπεσον, αἰδοῦς τινος ἐγγενομένης ἐν τῇ τοῦ νέου ψυχῇ, καὶ κατεκοσμήθη πάλιν.

γίγνεται γὰρ ἐνίοτε, ἔφη.

560a αὖθις δὲ οἶμαι τῶν ἐκπεσουσῶν ἐπιθυμιῶν ἄλλαι ὑποτρεφόμεναι [560b] συγγενεῖς δι' ἀνεπιστημοσύνην τροφῆς πατρὸς πολλαί τε καὶ ἰσχυραὶ ἐγένοντο.

φιλεῖ γοῦν, ἔφη, οὕτω γίγνεσθαι.

οὐκοῦν εἴλκυσάν τε πρὸς τὰς αὐτὰς ὁμιλίας, καὶ λάθρᾳ συγγιγνόμεναι πλῆθος ἐνέτεκον.

τί μήν;

τελευτῶσαι δὴ οἶμαι κατέλαβον τὴν τοῦ νέου τῆς ψυχῆς ἀκρόπολιν, αἰσθόμεναι κενὴν μαθημάτων τε καὶ ἐπιτηδευμάτων καλῶν καὶ λόγων ἀληθῶν, οἳ δὴ ἄριστοι

ENGLISH

cessary ones, while the one ruled by the necessary ones was stingy and oligarchic?"

"Well, of course."

"Then let's go back," I said, "and describe how the democratic man comes from the oligarchic one. It seems to me that it mostly happens like this."

"How?"

"When a young man, raised as we were just describing, without education and stingily, gets a taste of the drones' honey and falls in with fiery, dangerous beasts who can supply pleasures of every kind and variety and description—that, I suppose, [559e] is where you should expect the change in him from an oligarchic to a democratic constitution within to begin."

"Inevitably," he said.

"Then just as the city changed when an alliance from outside came to the aid of one party, like helping like, doesn't the young man change too when a kind of desire from outside, akin and alike, comes to the aid of one of the parties within him?"

"Absolutely."

"And if, I think, some alliance comes to the aid of the oligarchic part in him from the other side, whether from his father or [560a] from his other relatives admonishing and reproaching him, then there's faction and counter-faction and a battle within him against himself."

"Of course."

"And sometimes, I think, the democratic part gives way to the oligarchic. Some of his desires are destroyed, others are driven out, as a sense of shame arises in the young man's soul, and order is restored."

"That does happen sometimes," he said.

"But then, I think, other desires akin to the exiled ones are secretly nursed along, [560b] and because the father doesn't know how to bring him up, they become many and strong."

"That's usually how it goes," he said.

"So they drag him back to the same company, and through secret intercourse they breed a multitude."

"Of course."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	φρουροί τε καὶ φύλακες ἐν ἀνδρῶν θεοφιλῶν εἰσι διανοίαις. 560c	"And in the end, I think, they seize the acropolis of the young man's soul, finding it empty of learning, of fine pursuits and of true words—which are the best sentinels and guardians in the minds of men the gods love." 560c
	καὶ πολύ γ', ἔφη.	"By far," he said.
560c	ψευδεῖς δὴ καὶ ἀλαζόνες οἶμαι λόγοι τε καὶ δόξαι ἀντ' ἐκείνων ἀναδραμόντες κατέσχον τὸν αὐτὸν τόπον τοῦ τοιούτου.	"And false, boastful words and opinions, I think, rush up in their place and occupy that same position in a man like this."
	σφόδρα γ', ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
	ἆρ' οὖν οὐ πάλιν τε εἰς ἐκείνους τοὺς Λωτοφάγους ἐλθὼν φανερῶς κατοικεῖ, καὶ ἐὰν παρ' οἰκείων τις βοήθεια τῷ φειδωλῷ αὐτοῦ τῆς ψυχῆς ἀφικνῆται, κλήσαντες οἱ ἀλαζόνες λόγοι ἐκεῖνοι τὰς τοῦ βασιλικοῦ τείχους ἐν αὐτῷ πύλας οὔτε αὐτὴν τὴν συμμαχίαν παριᾶσιν, οὔτε πρέσβεις πρεσβυτέρων 560d λόγους ἰδιωτῶν εἰσδέχονται, αὐτοί τε κρατοῦσι μαχόμενοι, καὶ τὴν μὲν αἰδῶ ἡλιθιότητα ὀνομάζοντες ὠθοῦσιν ἔξω ἀτίμως φυγάδα, σωφροσύνην δὲ ἀνανδρίαν καλοῦντές τε καὶ προπηλακίζοντες ἐκβάλλουσι, μετριότητα δὲ καὶ κοσμίαν δαπάνην ὡς ἀγροικίαν καὶ ἀνελευθερίαν οὖσαν πείθοντες ὑπερορίζουσι μετὰ πολλῶν καὶ ἀνωφελῶν ἐπιθυμιῶν;	"So doesn't he go back to those Lotus-eaters and live among them openly? And if some help comes from his relatives to the stingy part of his soul, those boastful words shut the gates of the royal wall within him. They won't let the allied force itself through, and they won't receive the embassy of words from older 560d private individuals either. They win the battle themselves. They call shame 'simple-mindedness' and push it out, a dishonored exile; they call moderation 'unmanliness,' abuse it and throw it out; and they persuade him that measure and orderly spending are boorish and mean, and drive them over the border with the help of many useless desires."
	σφόδρα γε.	"Very much so."[8]
560d	τούτων δέ γέ που κενώσαντες καὶ καθήραντες τὴν τοῦ 560e κατεχομένου τε ὑπ' αὐτῶν καὶ τελουμένου ψυχὴν μεγάλοισι τέλεσι, τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο ἤδη ὕβριν καὶ ἀναρχίαν καὶ ἀσωτίαν καὶ ἀναίδειαν λαμπρὰς μετὰ πολλοῦ χοροῦ κατάγουσιν ἐστεφανωμένας, ἐγκωμιάζοντες καὶ ὑποκοριζόμενοι, ὕβριν μὲν εὐπαιδευσίαν καλοῦντες, ἀναρχίαν δὲ ἐλευθερίαν, ἀσωτίαν 561a δὲ μεγαλοπρέπειαν, ἀναίδειαν δὲ ἀνδρείαν.	"And once they've emptied and purified of all these the soul of the man 560e they've taken possession of and are initiating into their great mysteries, they next bring insolence, anarchy, extravagance and shamelessness back from exile, resplendent and crowned, with a great chorus, singing their praises and giving them pet names: insolence they call good breeding, anarchy freedom, extravagance 561a magnificence, and shamelessness courage."
	ἆρ' οὐχ οὕτω πως, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, νέος ὢν μεταβάλλει ἐκ τοῦ ἐν ἀναγκαίοις ἐπιθυμίαις τρεφομένου τὴν τῶν μὴ ἀναγκαίων καὶ ἀνωφελῶν ἡδονῶν ἐλευθέρωσίν τε καὶ ἄνεσιν;	"Isn't it something like this," I said, "that while still young he changes from a man raised among necessary desires to one who sets free and lets loose the unnecessary and useless pleasures?"
	καὶ μάλα γ', ἦ δ' ὅς, ἐναργῶς.	"Yes," he said, "very vividly."
561a	Ζῇ δὴ οἶμαι μετὰ ταῦτα ὁ τοιοῦτος οὐδὲν μᾶλλον εἰς ἀναγκαίους ἢ μὴ ἀναγκαίους ἡδονὰς ἀναλίσκων καὶ χρήματα καὶ πόνους καὶ διατριβάς· ἀλλ' ἐὰν εὐτυχὴς ᾖ καὶ μὴ πέρα ἐκβακχευθῇ, ἀλλά τι καὶ πρεσβύτερος γενόμενος	"After this, I think, such a man lives spending money, effort and time no more on necessary pleasures than on unnecessary ones. But if he's lucky and his frenzy doesn't go too far—if, as he

8 In Homer's *Odyssey* the Lotus-eaters' food made Odysseus's men forget their homecoming.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τοῦ πολλοῦ [561b] θορύβου παρελθόντος μέρη τε καταδέξηται τῶν ἐκπεσόντων καὶ τοῖς ἐπεισελθοῦσι μὴ ὅλον ἑαυτὸν ἐνδῷ, εἰς ἴσον δή τι καταστήσας τὰς ἡδονὰς διάγει, τῇ παραπιπτούσῃ ἀεὶ ὥσπερ λαχούσῃ τὴν ἑαυτοῦ ἀρχὴν παραδιδοὺς ἕως ἂν πληρωθῇ, καὶ αὖθις ἄλλῃ, οὐδεμίαν ἀτιμάζων ἀλλ' ἐξ ἴσου τρέφων.	gets older and the great [561b] tumult has passed, he readmits some of the exiles and doesn't give himself over entirely to the invaders—then he sets his pleasures on an equal footing and lives that way, handing over the rule of himself to whichever pleasure comes along, as if it had won the office by lot, until it's satisfied, and then to another, dishonoring none but feeding them all equally."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
561b	καὶ λόγον γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀληθῆ οὐ προσδεχόμενος οὐδὲ παριεὶς εἰς τὸ φρούριον, ἐάν τις λέγῃ ὡς αἱ μέν εἰσι τῶν [561c] καλῶν τε καὶ ἀγαθῶν ἐπιθυμιῶν ἡδοναί, αἱ δὲ τῶν πονηρῶν, καὶ τὰς μὲν χρὴ ἐπιτηδεύειν καὶ τιμᾶν, τὰς δὲ κολάζειν τε καὶ δουλοῦσθαι· ἀλλ' ἐν πᾶσι τούτοις ἀνανεύει τε καὶ ὁμοίας φησὶν ἁπάσας εἶναι καὶ τιμητέας ἐξ ἴσου.	"And he doesn't accept true reasoning," I said, "or let it into the fortress, if someone tells him that some pleasures belong to [561c] fine and good desires and others to bad ones, and that the first should be cultivated and honored and the second disciplined and enslaved. To all this he shakes his head and says they're all alike and must be honored equally."
	σφόδρα γάρ, ἔφη, οὕτω διακείμενος τοῦτο δρᾷ.	"Yes," he said, "that's exactly what a man in that condition does."
561c	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ διαζῇ τὸ καθ' ἡμέραν οὕτω χαριζόμενος τῇ προσπιπτούσῃ ἐπιθυμίᾳ, τοτὲ μὲν μεθύων καὶ καταυλούμενος, αὖθις δὲ ὑδροποτῶν καὶ κατισχναινόμενος, [561d] τοτὲ δ' αὖ γυμναζόμενος, ἔστιν δ' ὅτε ἀργῶν καὶ πάντων ἀμελῶν, τοτὲ δ' ὡς ἐν φιλοσοφίᾳ διατρίβων. πολλάκις δὲ πολιτεύεται, καὶ ἀναπηδῶν ὅτι ἂν τύχῃ λέγει τε καὶ πράττει· κἄν ποτέ τινας πολεμικοὺς ζηλώσῃ, ταύτῃ φέρεται, ἢ χρηματιστικούς, ἐπὶ τοῦτ' αὖ. καὶ οὔτε τις τάξις οὔτε ἀνάγκη ἔπεστιν αὐτοῦ τῷ βίῳ, ἀλλ' ἡδύν τε δὴ καὶ ἐλευθέριον καὶ μακάριον καλῶν τὸν βίον τοῦτον χρῆται αὐτῷ διὰ παντός. [561e]	"So he lives from day to day," I said, "indulging whatever desire comes along. Now he's drinking heavily to the music of pipes, then drinking only water and slimming down; [561d] now he's exercising, sometimes lazing about and neglecting everything, and now spending his time on what he takes to be philosophy. Often he takes part in politics, jumping up to say and do whatever occurs to him. If he ever envies military men, off he goes in that direction; if moneymakers, off in that one. There's no order or necessity in his life. He calls this life pleasant, free and blessed, and he follows it to the end." [561e]
561e	παντάπασιν, ἦ δ' ὅς, διελήλυθας βίον ἰσονομικοῦ τινος ἀνδρός.	"You've perfectly described," he said, "the life of a man devoted to equal rights."
	οἶμαι δέ γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ παντοδαπόν τε καὶ πλείστων ἠθῶν μεστόν, καὶ τὸν καλόν τε καὶ ποικίλον, ὥσπερ ἐκείνην τὴν πόλιν, τοῦτον τὸν ἄνδρα εἶναι· ὃν πολλοὶ ἂν καὶ πολλαὶ ζηλώσειαν τοῦ βίου, παραδείγματα πολιτειῶν τε καὶ τρόπων πλεῖστα ἐν αὑτῷ ἔχοντα.	"Yes, and I think," I said, "that this man is varied and full of the greatest number of characters, the beautiful, many-colored man, just like that city. Many men and women would envy his life, since he holds within himself the most models of constitutions and ways of life."
	οὗτος γάρ, ἔφη, ἔστιν.	"That's him," he said.
	τί οὖν; τετάχθω ἡμῖν κατὰ δημοκρατίαν ὁ τοιοῦτος ἀνήρ, ὡς δημοκρατικὸς ὀρθῶς ἂν προσαγορευόμενος;	"Well then? Shall we set this man beside democracy, as one who'd rightly be called democratic?"
	τετάχθω, ἔφη.	"Let's," he said.

HOW TYRANNY ARISES

Socrates explains how excessive freedom turns democracy into tyranny under a popular champion.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
562a	**SOCRATES** ἡ καλλίστη δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πολιτεία τε καὶ ὁ κάλλιστος ἀνὴρ λοιπὰ ἂν ἡμῖν εἴη διελθεῖν, τυραννίς τε καὶ τύραννος.	**SOCRATES** "Then what's left for us to describe," I said, "would be the finest constitution and the finest man: tyranny and the tyrant."
	κομιδῇ γ', ἔφη.	"Exactly," he said.
	φέρε δή, τίς τρόπος τυραννίδος, ὦ φίλε ἑταῖρε, γίγνεται; ὅτι μὲν γὰρ ἐκ δημοκρατίας μεταβάλλει σχεδὸν δῆλον.	"Come then, my dear friend, how does tyranny arise? That it comes from democracy is pretty clear."
	δῆλον.	"Clear."
	ἆρ' οὖν τρόπον τινὰ τὸν αὐτὸν ἔκ τε ὀλιγαρχίας δημοκρατία 562b γίγνεται καὶ ἐκ δημοκρατίας τυραννίς;	"Then does democracy come from oligarchy 562b and tyranny from democracy in much the same way?"
	πῶς;	"How?"
	ὃ προύθεντο, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀγαθόν, καὶ δι' ὃ ἡ ὀλιγαρχία καθίστατο—τοῦτο δ' ἦν ὑπερπλοῦτος· ἦ γάρ; —	"The good they set before themselves," I said, "the one oligarchy was established for—that was great wealth, wasn't it?—"
	ναί.	"Yes."
562b	ἡ πλούτου τοίνυν ἀπληστία καὶ ἡ τῶν ἄλλων ἀμέλεια διὰ χρηματισμὸν αὐτὴν ἀπώλλυ.	"So it was the insatiable appetite for wealth, and the neglect of everything else for the sake of moneymaking, that destroyed it."
	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη.	"True," he said.
	ἆρ' οὖν καὶ ὃ δημοκρατία ὁρίζεται ἀγαθόν, ἡ τούτου ἀπληστία καὶ ταύτην καταλύει;	"Then does democracy's insatiable appetite for what it defines as good destroy it too?"
	λέγεις δ' αὐτὴν τί ὁρίζεσθαι;	"And what do you say it defines as good?"
	τὴν ἐλευθερίαν, εἶπον. τοῦτο γάρ που ἐν δημοκρατουμένῃ 562c πόλει ἀκούσαις ἂν ὡς ἔχει τε κάλλιστον καὶ διὰ ταῦτα ἐν μόνῃ ταύτῃ ἄξιον οἰκεῖν ὅστις φύσει ἐλεύθερος.	"Freedom," I said. "Surely in a democratic 562c city you'd hear that this is the finest thing it has, and that for this reason it's the only city worth living in for anyone free by nature."
	λέγεται γὰρ δή, ἔφη, καὶ πολὺ τοῦτο τὸ ῥῆμα.	"Yes," he said, "that's said, and said often."
562c	ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅπερ ἦα νυνδὴ ἐρῶν, ἡ τοῦ τοιούτου ἀπληστία καὶ ἡ τῶν ἄλλων ἀμέλεια καὶ ταύτην τὴν πολιτείαν μεθίστησίν τε καὶ παρασκευάζει τυραννίδος δεηθῆναι;	"Then, as I was just about to say," I said, "doesn't the insatiable appetite for this, and the neglect of everything else, change this constitution too, and prepare it to need a tyranny?"
	πῶς; ἔφη.	"How?" he said.
	ὅταν οἶμαι δημοκρατουμένη πόλις ἐλευθερίας διψήσασα 562d κακῶν οἰνοχόων προστατούντων τύχῃ, καὶ πορρωτέρω τοῦ δέοντος ἀκράτου αὐτῆς μεθυσθῇ, τοὺς ἄρχοντας δή, ἂν μὴ πάνυ πρᾳοι ὦσι καὶ πολλὴν παρέχωσι τὴν ἐλευθερίαν, κολάζει αἰτιωμένη ὡς μιαρούς τε καὶ ὀλιγαρχικούς.	"When a democratic city, thirsting for freedom, 562d happens to have bad wine-pourers presiding over it, and gets drunk on freedom unmixed, far past what's proper, then it punishes its rulers, unless they're very lenient and provide plenty of freedom, accusing them of being villains and oligarchs."
	δρῶσιν γάρ, ἔφη, τοῦτο.	"Yes," he said, "that's what they do."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
562d	τοὺς δέ γε, εἶπον, τῶν ἀρχόντων κατηκόους προπηλακίζει ὡς ἐθελοδούλους τε καὶ οὐδὲν ὄντας, τοὺς δὲ ἄρχοντας μὲν ἀρχομένοις, ἀρχομένους δὲ ἄρχουσιν ὁμοίους ἰδίᾳ τε καὶ δημοσίᾳ ἐπαινεῖ τε καὶ τιμᾷ. ἆρ' οὐκ ἀνάγκη ἐν τοιαύτῃ [562e] πόλει ἐπὶ πᾶν τὸ τῆς ἐλευθερίας ἰέναι;	"And those who obey the rulers," I said, "it abuses as willing slaves and nobodies, while in private and in public it praises and honors rulers who are like the ruled and ruled who are like the rulers. In such a city, isn't it inevitable [562e] that freedom goes to every extreme?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
	καὶ καταδύεσθαί γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ φίλε, εἴς τε τὰς ἰδίας οἰκίας καὶ τελευτᾶν μέχρι τῶν θηρίων τὴν ἀναρχίαν ἐμφυομένην.	"And that the anarchy seeps down, my friend," I said, "into private households, and in the end takes root even among the animals?"
	πῶς, ἦ δ' ὅς, τὸ τοιοῦτον λέγομεν;	"What do we mean by that?" he said.
562e	οἷον, ἔφην, πατέρα μὲν ἐθίζεσθαι παιδὶ ὅμοιον γίγνεσθαι καὶ φοβεῖσθαι τοὺς υἱεῖς, υἱὸν δὲ πατρί, καὶ μήτε αἰσχύνεσθαι μήτε δεδιέναι τοὺς γονέας, ἵνα δὴ ἐλεύθερος ᾖ· μέτοικον δὲ [563a] ἀστῷ καὶ ἀστὸν μετοίκῳ ἐξισοῦσθαι, καὶ ξένον ὡσαύτως.	"For instance," I said, "the father gets used to being like his child and fearing his sons, and the son to being like his father, feeling neither shame nor fear before his parents, so that he can be free. Resident alien [563a] and citizen are put on an equal footing, and the foreigner likewise."
	γίγνεται γὰρ οὕτως, ἔφη.	"Yes," he said, "that's what happens."[9]
563a	ταῦτά τε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ σμικρὰ τοιάδε ἄλλα γίγνεται· διδάσκαλός τε ἐν τῷ τοιούτῳ φοιτητὰς φοβεῖται καὶ θωπεύει, φοιτηταί τε διδασκάλων ὀλιγωροῦσιν, οὕτω δὲ καὶ παιδαγωγῶν· καὶ ὅλως οἱ μὲν νέοι πρεσβυτέροις ἀπεικάζονται καὶ διαμιλλῶνται καὶ ἐν λόγοις καὶ ἐν ἔργοις, οἱ δὲ γέροντες συγκαθιέντες τοῖς νέοις εὐτραπελίας τε καὶ χαριεντισμοῦ [563b] ἐμπίμπλανται, μιμούμενοι τοὺς νέους, ἵνα δὴ μὴ δοκῶσιν ἀηδεῖς εἶναι μηδὲ δεσποτικοί.	"That, and other little things like it," I said. "In such a city the teacher fears and flatters his pupils, and the pupils think little of their teachers, and of their attendants too. In general the young imitate their elders and compete with them in word and deed, while the old men lower themselves to the young's level and are full of wit and [563b] pleasantry, imitating the young so as not to seem disagreeable or authoritarian."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Certainly," he said.[10]
563b	τὸ δέ γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἔσχατον, ὦ φίλε, τῆς ἐλευθερίας τοῦ πλήθους, ὅσον γίγνεται ἐν τῇ τοιαύτῃ πόλει, ὅταν δὴ οἱ ἐωνημένοι καὶ αἱ ἐωνημέναι μηδὲν ἧττον ἐλεύθεροι ὦσι τῶν πριαμένων. ἐν γυναιξὶ δὲ πρὸς ἄνδρας καὶ ἀνδράσι πρὸς γυναῖκας ὅση ἡ ἰσονομία καὶ ἐλευθερία γίγνεται, ὀλίγου ἐπελαθόμεθ' εἰπεῖν. [563c]	"But the height of the people's freedom, my friend," I said, "in a city like this, is reached when purchased slaves, male and female, are no less free than those who bought them. And we almost forgot to mention how much equality and freedom there is in the relations of women with men and men with women." [563c]
	οὐκοῦν κατ' Αἰσχύλον, ἔφη, "ἐροῦμεν ὅτι νῦν ἦλθ' ἐπὶ στόμα;"	"So shall we, in Aeschylus's words," he said, "'say what just now came to our lips'?"[11]
563c	πάνυ γε, εἶπον· καὶ ἔγωγε οὕτω λέγω· τὸ μὲν γὰρ τῶν θηρίων τῶν ὑπὸ τοῖς ἀνθρώποις ὅσῳ ἐλευθερώτερά ἐστιν ἐνταῦθα ἢ ἐν ἄλλῃ, οὐκ ἄν τις πείθοιτο ἄπειρος. ἀτεχνῶς γὰρ αἵ τε κύνες κατὰ τὴν παροιμίαν οἷαίπερ αἱ δέσποιναι γίγνονταί τε δὴ καὶ ἵπποι καὶ ὄνοι, πάνυ ἐλευθέρως καὶ	"Certainly," I said. "That's just what I'm doing. How much freer the animals owned by people are here than anywhere else, no one who hasn't seen it would believe. Just as the proverb says, the dogs

9 A resident alien (metic) was a free foreigner living permanently in a Greek city without citizen rights.
10 The attendant (*paidagōgos*) was a slave who escorted a boy to school and looked after his conduct.
11 The line comes from a lost play of Aeschylus.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	σεμνῶς εἰθισμένοι πορεύεσθαι, κατὰ τὰς ὁδοὺς ἐμβάλλοντες τῷ ἀεὶ ἀπαντῶντι, ἐὰν μὴ ἐξίστηται, καὶ τἆλλα πάντα οὕτω 563d μεστὰ ἐλευθερίας γίγνεται.	become exactly like their mistresses. And the horses and donkeys too get used to walking the roads with great freedom and dignity, bumping into anyone they meet who doesn't step aside. Everything else becomes just as 563d full of freedom."
	τὸ ἐμόν γ', ἔφη, ἐμοὶ λέγεις ὄναρ· αὐτὸς γὰρ εἰς ἀγρὸν πορευόμενος θαμὰ αὐτὸ πάσχω.	"You're telling me my own dream," he said. "It happens to me all the time on my way out to the country."
563d	τὸ δὲ δὴ κεφάλαιον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πάντων τούτων συνηθροισμένων, ἐννοεῖς ὡς ἁπαλὴν τὴν ψυχὴν τῶν πολιτῶν ποιεῖ, ὥστε κἂν ὁτιοῦν δουλείας τις προσφέρηται, ἀγανακτεῖν καὶ μὴ ἀνέχεσθαι; τελευτῶντες γάρ που οἶσθ' ὅτι οὐδὲ τῶν νόμων φροντίζουσιν γεγραμμένων ἢ ἀγράφων, ἵνα δὴ μηδαμῇ 563e μηδεὶς αὐτοῖς ᾖ δεσπότης.	"And the sum of it all," I said, "taken together—do you see how touchy it makes the citizens' souls, so that if anyone imposes the slightest bit of slavery, they get angry and can't bear it? And in the end, you know, they pay no attention even to the laws, written or unwritten, so that no one 563e will be their master in any way at all."
	καὶ μάλ', ἔφη, οἶδα.	"I know it very well," he said.
	αὕτη μὲν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ φίλε, ἡ ἀρχὴ οὑτωσὶ καλὴ καὶ νεανική, ὅθεν τυραννὶς φύεται, ὡς ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ.	"This, then, my friend," I said, "is the beginning, so fine and so headstrong, from which tyranny grows, it seems to me."
	νεανικὴ δῆτα, ἔφη· ἀλλὰ τί τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο;	"Headstrong it certainly is," he said. "But what comes next?"
563e	ταὐτόν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅπερ ἐν τῇ ὀλιγαρχίᾳ νόσημα ἐγγενόμενον ἀπώλεσεν αὐτήν, τοῦτο καὶ ἐν ταύτῃ πλέον τε καὶ ἰσχυρότερον ἐκ τῆς ἐξουσίας ἐγγενόμενον καταδουλοῦται δημοκρατίαν. καὶ τῷ ὄντι τὸ ἄγαν τι ποιεῖν μεγάλην φιλεῖ εἰς τοὐναντίον μεταβολὴν ἀνταποδιδόναι, ἐν ὥραις τε καὶ ἐν 564a φυτοῖς καὶ ἐν σώμασιν, καὶ δὴ καὶ ἐν πολιτείαις οὐχ ἥκιστα.	"The same disease," I said, "that arose in oligarchy and destroyed it arises in this one too, more widespread and stronger because of the license, and enslaves democracy. In fact, doing anything to excess tends to bring about a great change in the opposite direction—in seasons, in 564a plants, in bodies, and not least in constitutions."
	εἰκός, ἔφη.	"That's likely," he said.
	ἡ γὰρ ἄγαν ἐλευθερία ἔοικεν οὐκ εἰς ἄλλο τι ἢ εἰς ἄγαν δουλείαν μεταβάλλειν καὶ ἰδιώτῃ καὶ πόλει.	"Yes, for too much freedom seems to change into nothing other than too much slavery, for a private individual and a city alike."
	εἰκὸς γάρ.	"That's likely."
564a	εἰκότως τοίνυν, εἶπον, οὐκ ἐξ ἄλλης πολιτείας τυραννὶς καθίσταται ἢ ἐκ δημοκρατίας, ἐξ οἶμαι τῆς ἀκροτάτης ἐλευθερίας δουλεία πλείστη τε καὶ ἀγριωτάτη.	"Then it's likely," I said, "that tyranny is established from no other constitution than democracy: out of the most extreme freedom, I think, comes the greatest and most savage slavery."
	ἔχει γάρ, ἔφη, λόγον.	"That makes sense," he said.
	ἀλλ' οὐ τοῦτ' οἶμαι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἠρώτας, ἀλλὰ ποῖον 564b νόσημα ἐν ὀλιγαρχίᾳ τε φυόμενον ταὐτὸν καὶ ἐν δημοκρατίᾳ δουλοῦται αὐτήν.	"But that wasn't what you were asking, I think," I said. "You were asking what disease 564b arises in oligarchy and in democracy alike and enslaves democracy."
	ἀληθῆ, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"That's true," he said.
	ἐκεῖνο τοίνυν, ἔφην, ἔλεγον τὸ τῶν ἀργῶν τε καὶ δαπανηρῶν ἀνδρῶν γένος, τὸ μὲν ἀνδρειότατον ἡγούμενον αὐτῶν, τὸ δ' ἀνανδρότερον ἑπόμενον· οὓς δὴ	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἀφομοιοῦμεν κηφῆσι, τοὺς μὲν κέντρα ἔχουσι, τοὺς δὲ ἀκέντροις.	"Well, what I meant," I said, "was that breed of idle, spendthrift men, the bravest of them leading and the more cowardly following. We compared them to drones—the leaders to drones with stings, the followers to stingless ones."
564b	καὶ ὀρθῶς γ', ἔφη.	"And rightly," he said.
	τούτω τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ταράττετον ἐν πάσῃ πολιτείᾳ ἐγγιγνομένω, οἷον περὶ σῶμα φλέγμα τε καὶ χολή· ὧ δὴ καὶ 564c δεῖ τὸν ἀγαθὸν ἰατρόν τε καὶ νομοθέτην πόλεως μὴ ἧττον ἢ σοφὸν μελιττουργὸν πόρρωθεν εὐλαβεῖσθαι, μάλιστα μὲν ὅπως μὴ ἐγγενήσεσθον, ἂν δὲ ἐγγένησθον, ὅπως ὅτι τάχιστα σὺν αὐτοῖσι τοῖς κηρίοις ἐκτετμήσεσθον.	"Well, these two," I said, "cause trouble in every constitution they arise in, like phlegm and bile in the body. And the good doctor and lawgiver of a city 564c must guard against them well in advance, no less than a wise beekeeper does—above all so that they don't arise, but if they do, so that they're cut out as quickly as possible, honeycombs and all."
	ναὶ μὰ Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς, παντάπασί γε.	"Yes, by Zeus," he said, "absolutely."
	ὧδε τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λάβωμεν, ἵν' εὐκρινέστερον ἴδωμεν ὃ βουλόμεθα.	"Then let's take it like this," I said, "so that we can see what we want more distinctly."
	πῶς;	"How?"
564c	τριχῇ διαστησώμεθα τῷ λόγῳ δημοκρατουμένην πόλιν, 564d ὥσπερ οὖν καὶ ἔχει. ἓν μὲν γάρ που τὸ τοιοῦτον γένος ἐν αὐτῇ ἐμφύεται δι' ἐξουσίαν οὐκ ἔλαττον ἢ ἐν τῇ ὀλιγαρχουμένῃ.	"Let's divide a democratic city into three in our account, 564d which is in fact how it's divided. One part, I suppose, is this breed, which grows up in it because of the license no less than in the oligarchic city."
	ἔστιν οὕτω.	"That's so."
	πολὺ δέ γε δριμύτερον ἐν ταύτῃ ἢ ἐν ἐκείνῃ.	"But it's much fiercer in this one than in that."
	πῶς;	"How so?"
564d	ἐκεῖ μὲν διὰ τὸ μὴ ἔντιμον εἶναι, ἀλλ' ἀπελαύνεσθαι τῶν ἀρχῶν, ἀγύμναστον καὶ οὐκ ἐρρωμένον γίγνεται· ἐν δημοκρατίᾳ δὲ τοῦτό που τὸ προεστὸς αὐτῆς, ἐκτὸς ὀλίγων, καὶ τὸ μὲν δριμύτατον αὐτοῦ λέγει τε καὶ πράττει, τὸ δ' ἄλλο περὶ τὰ βήματα προσίζον βομβεῖ τε καὶ οὐκ ἀνέχεται τοῦ 564e ἄλλα λέγοντος, ὥστε πάντα ὑπὸ τοῦ τοιούτου διοικεῖται ἐν τῇ τοιαύτῃ πολιτείᾳ χωρίς τινων ὀλίγων.	"There, because it isn't held in honor but is kept out of office, it goes unexercised and doesn't grow strong. But in a democracy this breed is pretty much the ruling element, with a few exceptions. Its fiercest part does the speaking and acting, while the rest settles around the speakers' platforms, buzzing and refusing to put up with anyone 564e who says otherwise. So in a constitution like this, everything is run by this breed, apart from a few things."
	μάλα γε, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Very much so," he said.
	ἄλλο τοίνυν τοιόνδε ἀεὶ ἀποκρίνεται ἐκ τοῦ πλήθους.	"Now, there's another group that's always being separated off from the majority."
	τὸ ποῖον;	"What's that?"
564e	χρηματιζομένων που πάντων, οἱ κοσμιώτατοι φύσει ὡς τὸ πολὺ πλουσιώτατοι γίγνονται.	"When everyone is out to make money, those who are most orderly by nature generally become the richest."
	εἰκός.	"Likely."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	πλεῖστον δὴ οἶμαι τοῖς κηφῆσι μέλι καὶ εὐπορώτατον ἐντεῦθεν βλίττει.	"And that's where, I think, the drones find the most honey and the easiest to squeeze."
	πῶς γὰρ ἄν, ἔφη, παρά γε τῶν σμικρὰ ἐχόντων τις βλίσειεν;	"Well, how could anyone squeeze honey," he said, "out of those who have little?"
	πλούσιοι δὴ οἶμαι οἱ τοιοῦτοι καλοῦνται κηφήνων βοτάνη.	"And so rich people like these, I think, are called drone-fodder."
	σχεδόν τι, ἔφη.	"Pretty much," he said.
	δῆμος δ' ἂν εἴη τρίτον γένος, ὅσοι αὐτουργοί τε καὶ ἀπράγμονες, οὐ πάνυ πολλὰ κεκτημένοι· ὃ δὴ πλεῖστόν τε καὶ κυριώτατον ἐν δημοκρατίᾳ ὅτανπερ ἀθροισθῇ.	"The people would be the third group: those who work with their own hands and stay out of public affairs, and don't own very much. Whenever it assembles, this is the largest and most powerful group in a democracy."
	ἔστιν γάρ, ἔφη· ἀλλ' οὐ θαμὰ ἐθέλει ποιεῖν τοῦτο, ἐὰν μὴ μέλιτός τι μεταλαμβάνῃ.	"So it is," he said. "But it isn't often willing to do that unless it gets some share of the honey."
565a	οὐκοῦν μεταλαμβάνει, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀεί, καθ' ὅσον δύνανται οἱ προεστῶτες, τοὺς ἔχοντας τὴν οὐσίαν ἀφαιρούμενοι, διανέμοντες τῷ δήμῳ, τὸ πλεῖστον αὐτοὶ ἔχειν. 565b	"And it always does get a share," I said, "insofar as its leaders can manage it, when they take property away from those who have it and distribute it to the people, while keeping the most for themselves." 565b
	μεταλαμβάνει γὰρ οὖν, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὕτως.	"Yes," he said, "that's how it gets its share."
	ἀναγκάζονται δὴ οἶμαι ἀμύνεσθαι, λέγοντές τε ἐν τῷ δήμῳ καὶ πράττοντες ὅπῃ δύνανται, οὗτοι ὢν ἀφαιροῦνται.	"So, I think, the people whose property is being taken are forced to defend themselves, speaking before the people and taking action however they can."
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
	αἰτίαν δὴ ἔσχον ὑπὸ τῶν ἑτέρων, κἂν μὴ ἐπιθυμῶσι νεωτερίζειν, ὡς ἐπιβουλεύουσι τῷ δήμῳ καί εἰσιν ὀλιγαρχικοί.	"And then the others accuse them, even if they have no desire for revolution, of plotting against the people and of being oligarchs."
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
565b	οὐκοῦν καὶ τελευτῶντες, ἐπειδὰν ὁρῶσι τὸν δῆμον, οὐχ ἑκόντα ἀλλ' ἀγνοήσαντά τε καὶ ἐξαπατηθέντα ὑπὸ τῶν 565c διαβαλλόντων, ἐπιχειροῦντα σφᾶς ἀδικεῖν, τότ' ἤδη, εἴτε βούλονται εἴτε μή, ὡς ἀληθῶς ὀλιγαρχικοὶ γίγνονται, οὐχ ἑκόντες, ἀλλὰ καὶ τοῦτο τὸ κακὸν ἐκεῖνος ὁ κηφὴν ἐντίκτει κεντῶν αὐτούς.	"And so in the end, when they see the people trying to wrong them—not willingly, but out of ignorance, deceived by the 565c slanderers—then at last, whether they want to or not, they really do become oligarchs. They don't do it willingly: this evil too is bred in them by that drone, which stings them."
	κομιδῇ μὲν οὖν.	"Exactly."
	εἰσαγγελίαι δὴ καὶ κρίσεις καὶ ἀγῶνες περὶ ἀλλήλων γίγνονται.	"Then come impeachments, trials and lawsuits, each side against the other."
	καὶ μάλα.	"Certainly."
	οὐκοῦν ἕνα τινὰ ἀεὶ δῆμος εἴωθεν διαφερόντως προΐστασθαι ἑαυτοῦ, καὶ τοῦτον τρέφειν τε καὶ αὔξειν μέγαν;	"And isn't it the people's habit always to set up one man in particular as their champion, and to nurture him and make him great?"
	εἴωθε γάρ. 565d	"Yes, it is." 565d

	GREEK	ENGLISH
565d	τοῦτο μὲν ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, δῆλον, ὅτι, ὅτανπερ φύηται τύραννος, ἐκ προστατικῆς ῥίζης καὶ οὐκ ἄλλοθεν ἐκβλαστάνει.	"So this much is clear," I said: "whenever a tyrant springs up, he sprouts from this root of championship and from nowhere else."
	καὶ μάλα δῆλον.	"Very clear."
	τίς ἀρχὴ οὖν μεταβολῆς ἐκ προστάτου ἐπὶ τύραννον; ἢ δῆλον ὅτι ἐπειδὰν ταὐτὸν ἄρξηται δρᾶν ὁ προστάτης τῷ ἐν τῷ μύθῳ ὃς περὶ τὸ ἐν Ἀρκαδίᾳ τὸ τοῦ Διὸς τοῦ Λυκαίου ἱερὸν λέγεται;	"Then what is the starting point of the change from champion to tyrant? Isn't it obviously when the champion begins to do the same thing as the man in the story told about the sanctuary of Lycaean Zeus in Arcadia?"
	τίς; ἔφη.	"What story?" he said.
	ὡς ἄρα ὁ γευσάμενος τοῦ ἀνθρωπίνου σπλάγχνου, ἐν ἄλλοις ἄλλων ἱερείων ἑνὸς ἐγκατατετμημένου, ἀνάγκη δὴ 565e τούτῳ λύκῳ γενέσθαι. ἢ οὐκ ἀκήκοας τὸν λόγον;	"That whoever tastes human innards, when a single piece is chopped up in among the innards of the other victims, is bound 565e to become a wolf. Or haven't you heard the tale?"
	ἔγωγε.	"I have."[12]
565e	ἆρ' οὖν οὕτω καὶ ὃς ἂν δήμου προεστώς, λαβὼν σφόδρα πειθόμενον ὄχλον, μὴ ἀπόσχηται ἐμφυλίου αἵματος, ἀλλ' ἀδίκως ἐπαιτιώμενος, οἷα δὴ φιλοῦσιν, εἰς δικαστήρια ἄγων μιαιφονῇ, βίον ἀνδρὸς ἀφανίζων, γλώττῃ τε καὶ στόματι ἀνοσίῳ γευόμενος φόνου συγγενοῦς, καὶ ἀνδρηλατῇ καὶ 566a ἀποκτεινύῃ καὶ ὑποσημαίνῃ χρεῶν τε ἀποκοπὰς καὶ γῆς ἀναδασμόν, ἆρα τῷ τοιούτῳ ἀνάγκη δὴ τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο καὶ εἵμαρται ἢ ἀπολωλέναι ὑπὸ τῶν ἐχθρῶν ἢ τυραννεῖν καὶ λύκῳ ἐξ ἀνθρώπου γενέσθαι;	"Well, isn't it the same with a champion of the people? He gets hold of a mob that's thoroughly obedient to him, and he doesn't hold back from the blood of his own people. He brings unjust charges, the way these men like to, hauls people into court and stains himself with murder; he wipes out a man's life, and with unholy tongue and lips he tastes the blood of his kin; he banishes and 566a kills, and hints at the cancellation of debts and the redistribution of land. Isn't such a man bound after that, isn't it his fate, either to be destroyed by his enemies or to become a tyrant and turn from a man into a wolf?"
	πολλὴ ἀνάγκη, ἔφη.	"It's absolutely inevitable," he said.
	οὗτος δή, ἔφην, ὁ στασιάζων γίγνεται πρὸς τοὺς ἔχοντας τὰς οὐσίας.	"He's the one, then," I said, "who starts the faction against those who own property."
	οὗτος.	"He is."
566a	ἆρ' οὖν ἐκπεσὼν μὲν καὶ κατελθὼν βίᾳ τῶν ἐχθρῶν τύραννος ἀπειργασμένος κατέρχεται;	"And if he's driven out and then comes back in spite of his enemies, doesn't he come back a finished tyrant?"
	δῆλον. 566b	"Obviously." 566b
	ἐὰν δὲ ἀδύνατοι ἐκβάλλειν αὐτὸν ὦσιν ἢ ἀποκτεῖναι διαβάλλοντες τῇ πόλει, βιαίῳ δὴ θανάτῳ ἐπιβουλεύουσιν ἀποκτεινύναι λάθρᾳ.	"And if they can't drive him out, or have him put to death by slandering him to the city, they plot to kill him violently, in secret."
	φιλεῖ γοῦν, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὕτω γίγνεσθαι.	"That's certainly how it usually goes," he said.
	τὸ δὴ τυραννικὸν αἴτημα τὸ πολυθρύλητον ἐπὶ τούτῳ πάντες οἱ εἰς τοῦτο προβεβηκότες ἐξευρίσκουσιν, αἰτεῖν τὸν δῆμον φύλακάς τινας τοῦ σώματος, ἵνα σῶς αὐτοῖς ᾖ ὁ τοῦ δήμου βοηθός.	"And at this point everyone who has got this far comes up with the famous tyrant's request: they

12 Legend held that at the sanctuary of Zeus Lycaeus on Mount Lycaeon, anyone who ate human flesh mixed into the sacrificial meat was turned into a wolf.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καὶ μάλ', ἔφη.	ask the people for a bodyguard, so that the people's champion may be kept safe for them."
	διδόασι δὴ οἶμαι δείσαντες μὲν ὑπὲρ ἐκείνου, θαρρήσαντες δὲ ὑπὲρ ἑαυτῶν. 566c	"They certainly do," he said.
	καὶ μάλα.	"And the people grant it, I suppose, afraid for him and confident for themselves." 566c
		"Certainly."
566c	οὐκοῦν τοῦτο ὅταν ἴδῃ ἀνὴρ χρήματα ἔχων καὶ μετὰ τῶν χρημάτων αἰτίαν μισόδημος εἶναι, τότε δὴ οὗτος, ὦ ἑταῖρε, κατὰ τὸν Κροίσῳ γενόμενον χρησμὸν— πολυψήφιδα παρ' Ἕρμον φεύγει, οὐδὲ μένει, οὐδ' αἰδεῖται κακὸς εἶναι.	"And when a man who has money—and, along with his money, the charge of hating the people—sees this, then, my friend, as the oracle given to Croesus says, 'by pebbly Hermus he flees, nor stays, nor is ashamed to be a coward.'"
	οὐ γὰρ ἄν, ἔφη, δεύτερον αὖθις αἰδεσθείη.	"No," he said, "he wouldn't get a second chance to be ashamed."
	ὁ δέ γε οἶμαι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καταληφθεὶς θανάτῳ δίδοται.	"And the one who's caught," I said, "is handed over to death, I imagine."
	ἀνάγκη.	"Inevitably."
	ὁ δὲ δὴ προστάτης ἐκεῖνος αὐτὸς δῆλον δὴ ὅτι μέγας 566d μεγαλωστὶ οὐ κεῖται, ἀλλὰ καταβαλὼν ἄλλους πολλοὺς ἕστηκεν ἐν τῷ δίφρῳ τῆς πόλεως, τύραννος ἀντὶ προστάτου ἀποτετελεσμένος.	"And as for that champion himself, it's clear he doesn't lie there, 'great 566d in his greatness'; he has thrown down many others and stands in the city's chariot, transformed from champion into finished tyrant."
	τί δ' οὐ μέλλει; ἔφη.	"How could he not?" he said.[13]

THE TYRANT IN POWER

Socrates describes how the tyrant stirs up wars, purges the best citizens and relies on mercenaries.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
566d	**SOCRATES** διέλθωμεν δὴ τὴν εὐδαιμονίαν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοῦ τε ἀνδρὸς καὶ τῆς πόλεως, ἐν ᾗ ἂν ὁ τοιοῦτος βροτὸς ἐγγένηται;	**SOCRATES** "Shall we go through the happiness of the man," I said, "and of the city in which such a mortal arises?"
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, διέλθωμεν.	"Yes, by all means," he said, "let's go through it."
	ἆρ' οὖν, εἶπον, οὐ ταῖς μὲν πρώταις ἡμέραις τε καὶ χρόνῳ προσγελᾷ τε καὶ ἀσπάζεται πάντας, ᾧ ἂν περιτυγχάνῃ, καὶ 566e οὔτε τύραννός φησιν εἶναι ὑπισχνεῖταί τε πολλὰ καὶ ἰδίᾳ καὶ δημοσίᾳ, χρεῶν τε ἠλευθέρωσε καὶ γῆν διένειμε δήμῳ τε καὶ τοῖς περὶ ἑαυτὸν καὶ πᾶσιν ἵλεώς τε καὶ πρᾷος εἶναι προσποιεῖται;	"Well," I said, "in the early days, for the first while, doesn't he smile and greet everyone he meets, and 566e deny that he's a tyrant, and make lots of promises in private and in public? Doesn't he free people from debts, distribute land to the people and to those around him, and put on a show of being gracious and gentle to everyone?"
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη.	"He has to," he said.
566e	ὅταν δέ γε οἶμαι πρὸς τοὺς ἔξω ἐχθροὺς τοῖς μὲν καταλλαγῇ, τοὺς δὲ καὶ διαφθείρῃ, καὶ ἡσυχία ἐκείνων γένηται, πρῶτον μὲν πολέμους τινὰς ἀεὶ κινεῖ, ἵν' ἐν χρείᾳ ἡγεμόνος ὁ δῆμος ᾖ.	"But once he has settled matters with his enemies abroad, coming to terms with some and destroying others, and things are quiet on that front, I

13 Croesus, king of Lydia, was told by the Delphic oracle to flee by the river Hermus when a mule became king of the Medes (Herodotus 1.55). "Great in his greatness" echoes Homer's description of a fallen warrior.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	εἰκός γε.	imagine the first thing he does is keep stirring up wars, so that the people will need a leader."
	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἵνα χρήματα εἰσφέροντες πένητες γιγνόμενοι πρὸς τῷ καθ' ἡμέραν ἀναγκάζωνται εἶναι καὶ ἧττον αὐτῷ ἐπιβουλεύωσι;	"That's likely."
	δῆλον.	"And also so that, made poor by paying war taxes, they'll be forced to concentrate on their daily needs and be less likely to plot against him?"
	καὶ ἄν γέ τινας οἶμαι ὑποπτεύῃ ἐλεύθερα φρονήματα ἔχοντας μὴ ἐπιτρέψειν αὐτῷ ἄρχειν, ὅπως ἂν τούτους μετὰ προφάσεως ἀπολλύῃ ἐνδοὺς τοῖς πολεμίοις; τούτων πάντων ἕνεκα τυράννῳ ἀεὶ ἀνάγκη πόλεμον ταράττειν;	"Clearly."
	ἀνάγκη.	"And if he suspects that some have free spirits and won't let him rule, so that he can have a pretext for destroying them by handing them over to the enemy? For all these reasons, isn't a tyrant always bound to stir up war?"
		"He has to."
567a	ταῦτα δὴ ποιοῦντα ἔτοιμον μᾶλλον ἀπεχθάνεσθαι τοῖς [567b] πολίταις;	"And by doing this he becomes all the more readily hated by the [567b] citizens?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
	οὐκοῦν καί τινας τῶν συγκαταστησάντων καὶ ἐν δυνάμει ὄντων παρρησιάζεσθαι καὶ πρὸς αὐτὸν καὶ πρὸς ἀλλήλους, ἐπιπλήττοντας τοῖς γιγνομένοις, οἳ ἂν τυγχάνωσιν ἀνδρικώτατοι ὄντες;	"And some of those who helped set him up and are in positions of power will speak their minds freely, both to him and to one another, criticizing what's going on—the ones who happen to be the bravest?"
	εἰκός γε.	"That's likely."
	ὑπεξαιρεῖν δὴ τούτους πάντας δεῖ τὸν τύραννον, εἰ μέλλει ἄρξειν, ἕως ἂν μήτε φίλων μήτ' ἐχθρῶν λίπῃ μηδένα ὅτου τι ὄφελος.	"Then the tyrant has to get rid of all of them if he's going to keep ruling, until he has left no one of any worth, friend or enemy."
	δῆλον.	"Clearly."
567b	ὀξέως ἄρα δεῖ ὁρᾶν αὐτὸν τίς ἀνδρεῖος, τίς μεγαλόφρων, [567c] τίς φρόνιμος, τίς πλούσιος· καὶ οὕτως εὐδαίμων ἐστίν, ὥστε τούτοις ἅπασιν ἀνάγκη αὐτῷ, εἴτε βούλεται εἴτε μή, πολεμίῳ εἶναι καὶ ἐπιβουλεύειν, ἕως ἂν καθήρῃ τὴν πόλιν.	"So he has to keep a sharp eye out for who is courageous, who is high-minded, [567c] who has understanding, who is rich. And so happy is he that he is compelled, whether he likes it or not, to be the enemy of all of these and to plot against them until he has purged the city of them."
	καλόν γε, ἔφη, καθαρμόν.	"A fine purge," he said.
	ναί, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸν ἐναντίον ἢ οἱ ἰατροὶ τὰ σώματα· οἱ μὲν γὰρ τὸ χείριστον ἀφαιροῦντες λείπουσι τὸ βέλτιστον, ὁ δὲ τοὐναντίον.	"Yes," I said, "the opposite of the one doctors give bodies. They remove the worst and leave the best; he does the reverse."
	ὡς ἔοικε γάρ, αὐτῷ, ἔφη, ἀνάγκη, εἴπερ ἄρξει. [567d]	"It seems he has to," he said, "if he's going to rule." [567d]
567d	ἐν μακαρίᾳ ἄρα, εἶπον ἐγώ, ἀνάγκῃ δέδεται, ἣ προστάττει αὐτῷ ἢ μετὰ φαύλων τῶν πολλῶν οἰκεῖν, καὶ ὑπὸ τούτων μισούμενον, ἢ μὴ ζῆν.	"Then he's bound by a blessed necessity," I said, "which orders him either to live with a crowd of worthless people, and be hated by them too, or not to live at all."
	ἐν τοιαύτῃ, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"That's the kind of necessity it is," he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἆρ' οὖν οὐχὶ ὅσῳ ἂν μᾶλλον τοῖς πολίταις ἀπεχθάνηται ταῦτα δρῶν, τοσούτῳ πλειόνων καὶ πιστοτέρων δορυφόρων δεήσεται;	"And the more he makes himself hated by the citizens by doing these things, won't he need more bodyguards, and more loyal ones?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
	τίνες οὖν οἱ πιστοί; καὶ πόθεν αὐτοὺς μεταπέμψεται;	"Who are these loyal ones, then? And where will he send for them?"
	αὐτόματοι, ἔφη, πολλοὶ ἥξουσι πετόμενοι, ἐὰν τὸν μισθὸν διδῷ.	"Plenty will come flying of their own accord," he said, "if he gives them their pay."
	κηφῆνας, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, νὴ τὸν κύνα, δοκεῖς αὖ τινάς μοι [567e] λέγειν ξενικούς τε καὶ παντοδαπούς.	"Drones, by the dog!" I said. "You seem to me to be talking [567e] about drones again, foreign ones of every sort."
567e	ἀληθῆ γάρ, ἔφη, δοκῶ σοι.	"You're right," he said, "that's what I mean."
	τίς δὲ αὐτόθεν; ἆρ' οὐκ ἂν ἐθελήσειεν—	"But what about from right there at home? Wouldn't he be willing—"
	πῶς;	"To do what?"
	τοὺς δούλους ἀφελόμενος τοὺς πολίτας, ἐλευθερώσας, τῶν περὶ ἑαυτὸν δορυφόρων ποιήσασθαι.	"—to take the citizens' slaves away from them, free them, and make them part of his bodyguard?"
	σφόδρα γ', ἔφη· ἐπεί τοι καὶ πιστότατοι αὐτῷ οὗτοί εἰσιν.	"Very much so," he said, "since these are in fact the most loyal to him."
	ἦ μακάριον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λέγεις τυράννου χρῆμα, εἰ τοιούτοις [568a] φίλοις τε καὶ πιστοῖς ἀνδράσι χρῆται, τοὺς προτέρους ἐκείνους ἀπολέσας.	"What a blessed thing a tyrant is, on your account," I said, "if these are the [568a] friends and loyal men he makes use of, after destroying those earlier ones."
	ἀλλὰ μήν, ἔφη, τοιούτοις γε χρῆται.	"Well, these are the ones he does make use of," he said.
	καὶ θαυμάζουσι δή, εἶπον, οὗτοι οἱ ἑταῖροι αὐτὸν καὶ σύνεισιν οἱ νέοι πολῖται, οἱ δ' ἐπιεικεῖς μισοῦσί τε καὶ φεύγουσι;	"And these companions admire him," I said, "and the new citizens keep him company, while decent people hate and avoid him?"
568a	τί δ' οὐ μέλλουσιν;	"How could they not?"
	οὐκ ἐτός, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἥ τε τραγῳδία ὅλως σοφὸν δοκεῖ εἶναι καὶ ὁ Εὐριπίδης διαφέρων ἐν αὐτῇ.	"It's not for nothing," I said, "that tragedy in general is thought to be wise, and Euripides outstanding at it."
	τί δή;	"Why's that?"
	ὅτι καὶ τοῦτο πυκνῆς διανοίας ἐχόμενον ἐφθέγξατο, ὡς [568b] ἄρα "σοφοὶ τύραννοί" εἰσι "τῶν σοφῶν συνουσίᾳ." καὶ ἔλεγε δῆλον ὅτι τούτους εἶναι τοὺς σοφοὺς οἷς σύνεστιν.	"Because among other things he uttered this saying, the product of shrewd thought: that [568b] 'tyrants are wise through the company of the wise.' And he clearly meant that the wise are the people the tyrant keeps company with."
	καὶ ὡς ἰσόθεόν γ', ἔφη, τὴν τυραννίδα ἐγκωμιάζει, καὶ ἕτερα πολλά, καὶ οὗτος καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι ποιηταί.	"Yes," he said, "and he praises tyranny as godlike, and much else besides—he and the other poets too."[14]
568b	τοιγάρτοι, ἔφην, ἅτε σοφοὶ ὄντες οἱ τῆς τραγῳδίας ποιηταὶ συγγιγνώσκουσιν ἡμῖν τε καὶ ἐκείνοις ὅσοι ἡμῶν	"Well then," I said, "being wise, the tragic poets will forgive us, and all those whose constitutions

GREEK

ἐγγὺς πολιτεύονται, ὅτι αὐτοὺς εἰς τὴν πολιτείαν οὐ παραδεξόμεθα ἅτε τυραννίδος ὑμνητάς.

οἶμαι ἔγωγ', ἔφη, συγγιγνώσκουσιν ὅσοιπέρ γε αὐτῶν [568c] κομψοί.

εἰς δέ γε οἶμαι τὰς ἄλλας περιιόντες πόλεις, συλλέγοντες τοὺς ὄχλους, καλὰς φωνὰς καὶ μεγάλας καὶ πιθανὰς μισθωσάμενοι, εἰς τυραννίδας τε καὶ δημοκρατίας ἕλκουσι τὰς πολιτείας.

μάλα γε.

568c οὐκοῦν καὶ προσέτι τούτων μισθοὺς λαμβάνουσι καὶ τιμῶνται, μάλιστα μέν, ὥσπερ τὸ εἰκός, ὑπὸ τυράννων, δεύτερον δὲ ὑπὸ δημοκρατίας· ὅσῳ δ' ἂν ἀνωτέρω ἴωσιν πρὸς [568d] τὸ ἄναντες τῶν πολιτειῶν, μᾶλλον ἀπαγορεύει αὐτῶν ἡ τιμή, ὥσπερ ὑπὸ ἄσθματος ἀδυνατοῦσα πορεύεσθαι.

πάνυ μὲν οὖν.

ἀλλὰ δή, εἶπον, ἐνταῦθα μὲν ἐξέβημεν· λέγωμεν δὲ πάλιν ἐκεῖνο τὸ τοῦ τυράννου στρατόπεδον, τὸ καλόν τε καὶ πολὺ καὶ ποικίλον καὶ οὐδέποτε ταὐτόν, πόθεν θρέψεται.

568d δῆλον, ἔφη, ὅτι, ἐάν τε ἱερὰ χρήματα ᾖ ἐν τῇ πόλει, ταῦτα ἀναλώσει, ὅποι ποτὲ ἂν ἀεὶ ἐξαρκῇ τὰ τῶν ἀποδομένων, ἐλάττους εἰσφορὰς ἀναγκάζων τὸν δῆμον εἰσφέρειν. [568e]

τί δ' ὅταν δὴ ταῦτα ἐπιλίπῃ;

δῆλον, ἔφη, ὅτι ἐκ τῶν πατρῴων θρέψεται αὐτός τε καὶ οἱ συμπόται τε καὶ ἑταῖροι καὶ ἑταῖραι.

μανθάνω, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· ὅτι ὁ δῆμος ὁ γεννήσας τὸν τύραννον θρέψει αὐτόν τε καὶ ἑταίρους.

πολλὴ αὐτῷ, ἔφη, ἀνάγκη.

568e πῶς δὲ λέγεις; εἶπον· ἐὰν δὲ ἀγανακτῇ τε καὶ λέγῃ ὁ δῆμος ὅτι οὔτε δίκαιον τρέφεσθαι ὑπὸ πατρὸς ὑὸν ἡβῶντα, ἀλλὰ τοὐναντίον ὑπὸ υἱέος πατέρα, οὔτε τούτου αὐτὸν ἕνεκα [569a] ἐγέννησέν τε καὶ κατέστησεν, ἵνα, ἐπειδὴ μέγας γένοιτο, τότε αὐτὸς δουλεύων τοῖς αὑτοῦ δούλοις τρέφοι ἐκεῖνόν τε καὶ τοὺς δούλους μετὰ συγκλύδων ἄλλων, ἀλλ' ἵνα ἀπὸ τῶν πλουσίων τε καὶ καλῶν κἀγαθῶν λεγομένων ἐν τῇ πόλει ἐλευθερωθείη ἐκείνου προστάντος, καὶ νῦν κελεύει ἀπιέναι ἐκ τῆς πόλεως αὐτόν τε καὶ τοὺς ἑταίρους, ὥσπερ πατὴρ ὑὸν ἐξ οἰκίας μετὰ ὀχληρῶν συμποτῶν ἐξελαύνων;

ENGLISH

are close to ours, for not admitting them into our constitution, seeing that they sing the praises of tyranny."

"I think they'll forgive us," he said, "at least those of them who are [568c] sophisticated."

"But they go around to the other cities, I imagine, gathering crowds and hiring fine, loud, persuasive voices, and draw the constitutions toward tyrannies and democracies."

"They certainly do."

"And on top of this they get paid and honored for it —most of all, as you'd expect, by tyrants, and second by democracy. But the higher they climb up [568d] the slope of constitutions, the more their honor gives out, as if it were too short of breath to go on."

"Certainly."

"But we've digressed here," I said. "Let's go back and talk about the tyrant's army—that fine, large, many-colored army that's never the same—and how it will be fed."

"Clearly," he said, "if there are sacred treasures in the city, he'll spend them, for as long as the proceeds of their sale hold out, and so require smaller war taxes from the people." [568e]

"And what happens when these run out?"

"Clearly," he said, "he'll be fed from his father's estate, he and his drinking companions and his comrades and his mistresses."

"I see," I said. "You mean that the people who fathered the tyrant will feed him and his comrades."

"They'll have no choice," he said.

"What do you mean?" I said. "What if the people get angry and say that it isn't just for a grown-up son to be fed by his father—on the contrary, the father should be fed by the son—and that they didn't father [569a] and establish him so that, when he grew great, they themselves would be slaves to their own slaves and feed him and those slaves along with a rabble of others, but so that, with him as their champion, they would be freed from the rich and the so-called gentlemen in the city? And what if they now order him and his comrades to

14 The line is elsewhere attributed to Sophocles.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		leave the city, like a father driving his son out of the house along with his rowdy drinking companions?"
569a	γνώσεταί γε, νὴ Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς, τότ' ἤδη ὁ δῆμος οἷος οἷον [569b] θρέμμα γεννῶν ἠσπάζετό τε καὶ ηὔξεν, καὶ ὅτι ἀσθενέστερος ὢν ἰσχυροτέρους ἐξελαύνει.	"Then, by Zeus," he said, "the people will learn what kind of [569b] creature they fathered, welcomed and raised, and that they're the weaker ones trying to drive out the stronger."
	πῶς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λέγεις; τολμήσει τὸν πατέρα βιάζεσθαι, κἂν μὴ πείθηται, τύπτειν ὁ τύραννος;	"What are you saying?" I said. "The tyrant will dare to use force on his father, and beat him if he doesn't obey?"
	ναί, ἔφη, ἀφελόμενός γε τὰ ὅπλα.	"Yes," he said, "once he's taken away his weapons."
569b	πατραλοίαν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λέγεις τύραννον καὶ χαλεπὸν γηροτρόφον, καὶ ὡς ἔοικε τοῦτο δὴ ὁμολογουμένη ἂν ἤδη τυραννὶς εἴη, καί, τὸ λεγόμενον, ὁ δῆμος φεύγων ἂν καπνὸν [569c] δουλείας ἐλευθέρων εἰς πῦρ δούλων δεσποτείας ἂν ἐμπεπτωκὼς εἴη, ἀντὶ τῆς πολλῆς ἐκείνης καὶ ἀκαίρου ἐλευθερίας τὴν χαλεπωτάτην τε καὶ πικροτάτην δούλων δουλείαν μεταμπισχόμενος.	"You're calling the tyrant a father-beater," I said, "and a harsh nurse of old age. And this, it seems, would at last be tyranny openly acknowledged. As the saying goes, the people, trying to escape the smoke of [569c] slavery to free men, would have fallen into the fire of being ruled by slaves; in exchange for that excessive and untimely freedom, they would have put on the harshest and bitterest slavery, slavery to slaves."
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, ταῦτα οὕτω γίγνεται.	"That is exactly what happens," he said.
	τί οὖν; εἶπον· οὐκ ἐμμελῶς ἡμῖν εἰρήσεται, ἐὰν φῶμεν ἱκανῶς διεληλυθέναι ὡς μεταβαίνει τυραννὶς ἐκ δημοκρατίας, γενομένη τε οἵα ἐστίν;	"Well then," I said, "wouldn't we be right to say that we've given an adequate account of how tyranny develops out of democracy, and of what it's like once it has come about?"
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν ἱκανῶς, ἔφη.	"Quite adequate," he said.

Book IX

The tyrant, and which life is happiest.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
571a	**SOCRATES** αὐτὸς δὴ λοιπός, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὁ τυραννικὸς ἀνὴρ σκέψασθαι, πῶς τε μεθίσταται ἐκ δημοκρατικοῦ, γενόμενός τε ποῖός τίς ἐστιν καὶ τίνα τρόπον ζῇ, ἄθλιον ἢ μακάριον.	**SOCRATES** "What remains," I said, "is to examine the tyrannical man himself: how he develops out of the democratic man, what he's like once he's come about, and how he lives—wretchedly or blessedly."
	λοιπὸς γὰρ οὖν ἔτι οὗτος, ἔφη.	"Yes, he's the one who's still left," he said.
	οἶσθ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὃ ποθῶ ἔτι;	"Do you know," I said, "what I still feel is missing?"
	τὸ ποῖον;	"What?"
	τὸ τῶν ἐπιθυμιῶν, οἵαί τε καὶ ὅσαι εἰσίν, οὗ μοι δοκοῦμεν ἱκανῶς διῃρῆσθαι. τούτου δὴ ἐνδεῶς ἔχοντος, ἀσαφεστέρα 571b ἔσται ἡ ζήτησις οὗ ζητοῦμεν.	"I don't think we've adequately distinguished the desires—what kinds there are and how many. And as long as that's lacking, the inquiry 571b we're pursuing will be less clear."
	οὐκοῦν, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἔτ' ἐν καλῷ;	"Well, isn't there still time to do it?" he said.
571b	πάνυ μὲν οὖν· καὶ σκόπει γε ὃ ἐν αὐταῖς βούλομαι ἰδεῖν. ἔστιν δὲ τόδε. τῶν μὴ ἀναγκαίων ἡδονῶν τε καὶ ἐπιθυμιῶν δοκοῦσί τινές μοι εἶναι παράνομοι, αἳ κινδυνεύουσι μὲν ἐγγίγνεσθαι παντί, κολαζόμεναι δὲ ὑπό τε τῶν νόμων καὶ τῶν βελτιόνων ἐπιθυμιῶν μετὰ λόγου ἐνίων μὲν ἀνθρώπων ἢ παντάπασιν ἀπαλλάττεσθαι ἢ ὀλίγαι λείπεσθαι καὶ ἀσθενεῖς, 571c τῶν δὲ ἰσχυρότεραι καὶ πλείους.	"Certainly. And look at what I want to see in them. It's this. Among the unnecessary pleasures and desires, some seem to me to be lawless. They are probably born in everyone, but when they are held in check by the laws and by the better desires, with the help of reason, in some people they are got rid of entirely or only a few weak ones are left, 571c while in others they remain stronger and more numerous."
	λέγεις δὲ καὶ τίνας, ἔφη, ταύτας;	"Which ones do you mean?" he said.
571c	τὰς περὶ τὸν ὕπνον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐγειρομένας, ὅταν τὸ μὲν ἄλλο τῆς ψυχῆς εὕδῃ, ὅσον λογιστικὸν καὶ ἥμερον καὶ ἄρχον ἐκείνου, τὸ δὲ θηριῶδές τε καὶ ἄγριον, ἢ σίτων ἢ μέθης πλησθέν, σκιρτᾷ τε καὶ ἀπωσάμενον τὸν ὕπνον ζητῇ ἰέναι καὶ ἀποπιμπλάναι τὰ αὑτοῦ ἤθη· οἶσθ' ὅτι πάντα ἐν τῷ τοιούτῳ τολμᾷ ποιεῖν, ὡς ἀπὸ πάσης λελυμένον τε καὶ ἀπηλλαγμένον αἰσχύνης καὶ φρονήσεως. μητρί τε γὰρ ἐπιχειρεῖν 571d μείγνυσθαι, ὡς οἴεται, οὐδὲν ὀκνεῖ, ἄλλῳ τε ὁτῳοῦν ἀνθρώπων καὶ θεῶν καὶ θηρίων, μιαιφονεῖν τε ὁτιοῦν, βρώματός τε ἀπέχεσθαι μηδενός· καὶ ἑνὶ λόγῳ οὔτε ἀνοίας οὐδὲν ἐλλείπει οὔτ' ἀναισχυντίας.	"The ones that wake up in sleep," I said, "when the rest of the soul—the reasoning, gentle part that rules over it—is asleep, and the bestial and savage part, stuffed with food or drink, leaps up, pushes sleep away and tries to go and satisfy its own instincts. You know that in such a state it dares to do anything, as though released and freed from all shame and understanding. It doesn't shrink from trying to have sex 571d with its mother, as it imagines, or with anyone else at all, human, god or beast; it will commit any murder and abstain from no food. In a word, it falls short of no folly or shamelessness."
571d	ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"What you say is very true," he said.

GREEK

ENGLISH

ὅταν δέ γε οἶμαι ὑγιεινῶς τις ἔχῃ αὐτὸς αὑτοῦ καὶ σωφρόνως, καὶ εἰς τὸν ὕπνον ἴῃ τὸ λογιστικὸν μὲν ἐγείρας ἑαυτοῦ καὶ ἑστιάσας λόγων καλῶν καὶ σκέψεων, εἰς σύννοιαν [571e] αὐτὸς αὑτῷ ἀφικόμενος, τὸ ἐπιθυμητικὸν δὲ μήτε ἐνδείᾳ δοὺς μήτε πλησμονῇ, ὅπως ἂν κοιμηθῇ καὶ μὴ παρέχῃ θόρυβον [572a] τῷ βελτίστῳ χαῖρον ἢ λυπούμενον, ἀλλ' ἐᾷ αὐτὸ καθ' αὑτὸ μόνον καθαρὸν σκοπεῖν καὶ ὀρέγεσθαί του αἰσθάνεσθαι ὃ μὴ οἶδεν, ἤ τι τῶν γεγονότων ἢ ὄντων ἢ καὶ μελλόντων,

"But when someone is in a healthy and moderate condition, I think, and goes to sleep after he has roused his reasoning part and feasted it on fine arguments and inquiries, having come to reflect [571e] within himself; and when he has given his appetitive part neither too little nor too much, so that it will go to sleep and not disturb [572a] the best part with its pleasure or pain, but will leave it alone, itself by itself and pure, to investigate and reach out to perceive something it doesn't know—something past, present or future;

572a ὡσαύτως δὲ καὶ τὸ θυμοειδὲς πραΰνας καὶ μή τισιν εἰς ὀργὰς ἐλθὼν κεκινημένῳ τῷ θυμῷ καθεύδῃ, ἀλλ' ἡσυχάσας μὲν τὼ δύο εἴδη, τὸ τρίτον δὲ κινήσας ἐν ᾧ τὸ φρονεῖν ἐγγίγνεται, οὕτως ἀναπαύηται, οἶσθ' ὅτι τῆς τ' ἀληθείας ἐν τῷ τοιούτῳ μάλιστα ἅπτεται καὶ ἥκιστα παράνομοι τότε αἱ ὄψεις [572b] φαντάζονται τῶν ἐνυπνίων.

παντελῶς μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, οἶμαι οὕτως.

and when in the same way he has calmed his spirited part and doesn't fall asleep with his spirit stirred up by anger at anyone; when he has quieted these two kinds and stirred up the third, the one in which understanding arises, and so takes his rest—you know that in such a state he grasps the truth best, and the visions that [572b] appear in his dreams are least lawless."

"I think that's entirely right," he said.

HOW THE TYRANNICAL MAN COMES TO BE

Socrates explains how lawless desires, seen in dreams, take over a young man and make him tyrannical.

GREEK

ENGLISH

572b **SOCRATES** ταῦτα μὲν τοίνυν ἐπὶ πλέον ἐξήχθημεν εἰπεῖν· ὃ δὲ βουλόμεθα γνῶναι τόδ' ἐστίν, ὡς ἄρα δεινόν τι καὶ ἄγριον καὶ ἄνομον ἐπιθυμιῶν εἶδος ἑκάστῳ ἔνεστι, καὶ πάνυ δοκοῦσιν ἡμῶν ἐνίοις μετρίοις εἶναι· τοῦτο δὲ ἄρα ἐν τοῖς ὕπνοις γίγνεται ἔνδηλον. εἰ οὖν τι δοκῶ λέγειν καὶ συγχωρεῖς, ἄθρει.

ἀλλὰ συγχωρῶ.

τὸν τοίνυν δημοτικὸν ἀναμνήσθητι οἷον ἔφαμεν εἶναι. [572c] ἦν δέ που γεγονὼς ἐκ νέου ὑπὸ φειδωλῷ πατρὶ τεθραμμένος, τὰς χρηματιστικὰς ἐπιθυμίας τιμῶντι μόνας, τὰς δὲ μὴ ἀναγκαίους ἀλλὰ παιδιᾶς τε καὶ καλλωπισμοῦ ἕνεκα γιγνομένας ἀτιμάζοντι. ἦ γάρ;

ναί.

SOCRATES "Well, we've been carried away into saying more about this than we needed to. What we want to recognize is this: that there's a terrible, savage and lawless kind of desire in every one of us, even in some of us who seem entirely measured. And this becomes plain in our sleep. So see whether you think I'm saying something and whether you agree."

"I do agree."

"Then recall what we said the democratic man was like. [572c] He had been brought up from youth, I think, by a thrifty father who valued only the money-making desires and despised the unnecessary ones that exist for the sake of amusement and show. Isn't that right?"

"Yes."

572c συγγενόμενος δὲ κομψοτέροις ἀνδράσι καὶ μεστοῖς ὧν ἄρτι διήλθομεν ἐπιθυμιῶν, ὁρμήσας εἰς ὕβριν τε πᾶσαν καὶ τὸ ἐκείνων εἶδος μίσει τῆς τοῦ πατρὸς φειδωλίας, φύσιν δὲ τῶν διαφθειρόντων βελτίω ἔχων, ἀγόμενος ἀμφοτέρωσε [572d] κατέστη εἰς μέσον ἀμφοῖν τοῖν τρόποιν, καὶ μετρίως δή, ὡς ᾤετο, ἑκάστων ἀπολαύων οὔτε

"And after he fell in with more sophisticated men, full of the desires we've just described, he rushed into every kind of excess and into their way of life, out of hatred for his father's thrift. But since he had a better nature than those who were corrupting him, he was pulled in both directions [572d] and

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἀνελεύθερον οὔτε παράνομον βίον ζῇ, δημοτικὸς ἐξ ὀλιγαρχικοῦ γεγονώς.	settled in the middle between the two ways of life. Enjoying each in due measure, as he thought, he lives a life that is neither slavish nor lawless, having become a democratic man instead of an oligarchic one."
	ἦν γάρ, ἔφη, καὶ ἔστιν αὕτη ἡ δόξα περὶ τὸν τοιοῦτον.	"Yes," he said, "that was and still is the opinion about such a man."
	θὲς τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πάλιν τοῦ τοιούτου ἤδη πρεσβυτέρου γεγονότος νέον ὑὸν ἐν τοῖς τούτου αὖ ἤθεσιν τεθραμμένον.	"Now suppose again," I said, "that such a man, now grown older, has a young son brought up in his turn in his father's ways."
	τίθημι.	"All right."
572d	τίθει τοίνυν καὶ τὰ αὐτὰ ἐκεῖνα περὶ αὐτὸν γιγνόμενα ἅπερ καὶ περὶ τὸν πατέρα αὐτοῦ, ἀγόμενόν τε εἰς πᾶσαν [572e] παρανομίαν, ὀνομαζομένην δ' ὑπὸ τῶν ἀγόντων ἐλευθερίαν ἅπασαν, βοηθοῦντά τε ταῖς ἐν μέσῳ ταύταις ἐπιθυμίαις πατέρα τε καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους οἰκείους, τοὺς δ' αὖ παραβοηθοῦντας·	"Suppose too that the same things happen to him as happened to his father: that he is led into total [572e] lawlessness, which those leading him call total freedom; that his father and the rest of his family come to the aid of these middle desires, while the others come to the aid of the opposite side.
	ὅταν δ' ἐλπίσωσιν οἱ δεινοὶ μάγοι τε καὶ τυραννοποιοὶ οὗτοι μὴ ἄλλως τὸν νέον καθέξειν, ἔρωτά τινα αὐτῷ μηχανωμένους ἐμποιῆσαι προστάτην τῶν ἀργῶν καὶ τὰ [573a] ἕτοιμα διανεμομένων ἐπιθυμιῶν, ὑπόπτερον καὶ μέγαν κηφῆνά τινα—ἢ τί ἄλλο οἴει εἶναι τὸν τῶν τοιούτων ἔρωτα; —	"And when these terrible magicians and tyrant-makers despair of holding on to the young man any other way, they contrive to plant in him some passionate love, as champion of the idle desires that divide up whatever's [573a] at hand—a great winged drone. Or do you think the love of such people is anything else?"
573a	οὐδὲν ἔγωγε, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἄλλ' ἢ τοῦτο.	"I think it's nothing but that," he said.
	οὐκοῦν ὅταν δὴ περὶ αὐτὸν βομβοῦσαι αἱ ἄλλαι ἐπιθυμίαι, θυμιαμάτων τε γέμουσαι καὶ μύρων καὶ στεφάνων καὶ οἴνων καὶ τῶν ἐν ταῖς τοιαύταις συνουσίαις ἡδονῶν ἀνειμένων, ἐπὶ τὸ ἔσχατον αὔξουσαί τε καὶ τρέφουσαι πόθου κέντρον ἐμποιήσωσι τῷ κηφῆνι, τότε δὴ δορυφορεῖταί τε ὑπὸ μανίας καὶ [573b] οἰστρᾷ οὗτος ὁ προστάτης τῆς ψυχῆς, καὶ ἐάν τινας ἐν αὐτῷ δόξας ἢ ἐπιθυμίας λάβῃ ποιουμένας χρηστὰς καὶ ἔτι ἐπαισχυνομένας, ἀποκτείνει τε καὶ ἔξω ὠθεῖ παρ' αὐτοῦ, ἕως ἂν καθήρῃ σωφροσύνης, μανίας δὲ πληρώσῃ ἐπακτοῦ.	"And when the other desires buzz around it, loaded with incense and perfumes, garlands and wine and all the pleasures let loose in such gatherings, and they make it grow as large as it can and nourish it and implant in the drone the sting of longing, then this champion of the soul takes madness as its bodyguard and [573b] goes into a frenzy. If it finds any opinions or desires in him that are considered good and that still feel shame, it kills them and pushes them out of him, until it has purged him of moderation and filled him with madness brought in from outside."
573b	παντελῶς, ἔφη, τυραννικοῦ ἀνδρὸς λέγεις γένεσιν.	"You're describing the birth of a tyrannical man perfectly," he said.
	ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ τὸ πάλαι διὰ τὸ τοιοῦτον τύραννος ὁ Ἔρως λέγεται;	"And isn't this why," I said, "Love has long been called a tyrant?"
	κινδυνεύει, ἔφη.	"It may well be," he said.
	οὐκοῦν, ὦ φίλε, εἶπον, καὶ μεθυσθεὶς ἀνὴρ τυραννικόν τι [573c] φρόνημα ἴσχει;	"And my friend," I said, "doesn't a drunken man also have a sort of tyrannical [573c] spirit?"
	ἴσχει γάρ.	"He does."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καὶ μὴν ὅ γε μαινόμενος καὶ ὑποκεκινηκὼς οὐ μόνον ἀνθρώπων ἀλλὰ καὶ θεῶν ἐπιχειρεῖ τε καὶ ἐλπίζει δυνατὸς εἶναι ἄρχειν.	"And a man who's mad and deranged tries to rule not only human beings but gods as well, and expects to be able to."
	καὶ μάλ', ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
	τυραννικὸς δέ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ δαιμόνιε, ἀνὴρ ἀκριβῶς γίγνεται, ὅταν ἢ φύσει ἢ ἐπιτηδεύμασιν ἢ ἀμφοτέροις μεθυστικός τε καὶ ἐρωτικὸς καὶ μελαγχολικὸς γένηται.	"Then, my remarkable friend," I said, "a man becomes tyrannical in the strict sense when, by nature or by his habits or both, he has become drunken, lustful and crazed with black bile."
573c	παντελῶς μὲν οὖν.	"Absolutely."
	γίγνεται μέν, ὡς ἔοικεν, οὕτω καὶ τοιοῦτος ἀνήρ· ζῇ δὲ δὴ πῶς; 573d	"That, it seems, is how such a man comes about. But how does he live?" 573d
	τὸ τῶν παιζόντων, ἔφη, τοῦτο σὺ καὶ ἐμοὶ ἐρεῖς.	"As they say in the game," he said, "you'll tell me that too."
	λέγω δή, ἔφην. οἶμαι γὰρ τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο ἑορταὶ γίγνονται παρ' αὐτοῖς καὶ κῶμοι καὶ θάλειαι καὶ ἑταῖραι καὶ τὰ τοιαῦτα πάντα, ὧν ἂν Ἔρως τύραννος ἔνδον οἰκῶν διακυβερνᾷ τὰ τῆς ψυχῆς ἅπαντα.	"I'll tell you," I said. "Next, I think, there are festivals among them, and revels and feasts and mistresses and everything of that sort, for people in whom Love lives as a tyrant and steers everything in the soul."
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη.	"Inevitably," he said.
	ἆρ' οὖν οὐ πολλαὶ καὶ δειναὶ παραβλαστάνουσιν ἐπιθυμίαι ἡμέρας τε καὶ νυκτὸς ἑκάστης, πολλῶν δεόμεναι;	"And don't many terrible desires sprout up alongside, day and night, needing a great deal?"
	πολλαὶ μέντοι.	"Yes, many."
	ταχὺ ἄρα ἀναλίσκονται ἐάν τινες ὦσι πρόσοδοι.	"So whatever income there is gets spent quickly."
573d	πῶς δ' οὔ; 573e	"Of course." 573e
	καὶ μετὰ τοῦτο δὴ δανεισμοὶ καὶ τῆς οὐσίας παραιρέσεις.	"And after that come borrowing and cutting into the estate."
	τί μήν;	"Naturally."
	ὅταν δὲ δὴ πάντ' ἐπιλείπῃ, ἆρα οὐκ ἀνάγκη μὲν τὰς ἐπιθυμίας βοᾶν πυκνάς τε καὶ σφοδρὰς ἐννενεοττευμένας, τοὺς δ' ὥσπερ ὑπὸ κέντρων ἐλαυνομένους τῶν τε ἄλλων ἐπιθυμιῶν καὶ διαφερόντως ὑπ' αὐτοῦ τοῦ Ἔρωτος, πάσαις ταῖς ἄλλαις ὥσπερ δορυφόροις ἡγουμένου, οἰστρᾶν καὶ σκοπεῖν τίς τι ἔχει, ὃν δυνατὸν ἀφελέσθαι ἀπατήσαντα ἢ 574a βιασάμενον;	"And when everything runs out, won't the desires that have nested in him, thick and fierce, inevitably clamor? And won't he, driven as if by goads by the other desires and above all by Love himself, who leads all the rest as if they were his bodyguard, go into a frenzy and look for anyone who has anything he can take away by deceit or 574a force?"
	σφόδρα γ', ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
	ἀναγκαῖον δὴ πανταχόθεν φέρειν, ἢ μεγάλαις ὠδῖσί τε καὶ ὀδύναις συνέχεσθαι.	"Then he has to get money from every source, or be gripped by great pangs and pains."
	ἀναγκαῖον.	"He has to."
574a	ἆρ' οὖν, ὥσπερ αἱ ἐν αὐτῷ ἡδοναὶ ἐπιγιγνόμεναι τῶν ἀρχαίων πλέον εἶχον καὶ τὰ ἐκείνων ἀφῃροῦντο, οὕτω καὶ αὐτὸς ἀξιώσει νεώτερος ὢν πατρός τε καὶ μητρὸς πλέον ἔχειν, καὶ ἀφαιρεῖσθαι, ἐὰν τὸ αὑτοῦ μέρος ἀναλώσῃ, ἀπονειμάμενος τῶν πατρῴων;	"And just as the pleasures that came into him later got the better of the old ones and took away what was theirs, won't he likewise, being younger, think he deserves to get the better of his father and mother and take their things—to take a share of

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἀλλὰ τί μήν; ἔφη. 574b	the family property once he's spent his own portion?"
	ἂν δὲ δὴ αὐτῷ μὴ ἐπιτρέπωσιν, ἆρ' οὐ τὸ μὲν πρῶτον ἐπιχειροῖ ἂν κλέπτειν καὶ ἀπατᾶν τοὺς γονέας;	"Of course," he said. 574b
	πάντως.	"And if they won't let him, wouldn't he first try to steal from his parents and deceive them?"
	ὁπότε δὲ μὴ δύναιτο, ἁρπάζοι ἂν καὶ βιάζοιτο μετὰ τοῦτο;	"Certainly."
	οἶμαι, ἔφη.	"And when he couldn't do that, he'd use robbery and force next?"
		"I think so," he said.
574b	ἀντεχομένων δὴ καὶ μαχομένων, ὦ θαυμάσιε, γέροντός τε καὶ γραός, ἆρ' εὐλαβηθείη ἂν καὶ φείσαιτο μή τι δρᾶσαι τῶν τυραννικῶν;	"And if the old man and old woman held on and fought back, my good friend, would he be careful and hold back from doing something tyrannical?"
	οὐ πάνυ, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἔγωγε θαρρῶ περὶ τῶν γονέων τοῦ τοιούτου.	"I'm not at all confident," he said, "about the parents of such a man."
	ἀλλ', ὦ Ἀδείμαντε, πρὸς Διός, ἕνεκα νεωστὶ φίλης καὶ οὐκ ἀναγκαίας ἑταίρας γεγονυίας τὴν πάλαι φίλην καὶ ἀναγκαίαν 574c μητέρα, ἢ ἕνεκα ὡραίου νεωστὶ φίλου γεγονότος οὐκ ἀναγκαίου τὸν ἄωρόν τε καὶ ἀναγκαῖον πρεσβύτην πατέρα καὶ τῶν φίλων ἀρχαιότατον δοκεῖ ἄν σοι ὁ τοιοῦτος πληγαῖς τε δοῦναι καὶ καταδουλώσασθαι ἂν αὐτοὺς ὑπ' ἐκείνοις, εἰ εἰς τὴν αὐτὴν οἰκίαν ἀγάγοιτο;	"But, Adeimantus, by Zeus, do you think that for the sake of a mistress he's just fallen for, who's dear to him but unnecessary, such a man would strike the mother who has long been dear to him and necessary; 574c or that for the sake of a young man in his bloom, newly dear and unnecessary, he would strike his aged and necessary father, the oldest of his friends; and that he'd make his parents slaves to them, if he brought them into the same house?"
	ναὶ μὰ Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Yes, by Zeus, I do," he said.
	σφόδρα γε μακάριον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἔοικεν εἶναι τὸ τυραννικὸν ὑὸν τεκεῖν.	"What a very blessed thing it seems to be," I said, "to give birth to a tyrannical son!"
	πάνυ γ', ἔφη. 574d	"It certainly does," he said. 574d [1]
574d	τί δ', ὅταν δὴ τὰ πατρὸς καὶ μητρὸς ἐπιλείπῃ τὸν τοιοῦτον, πολὺ δὲ ἤδη συνειλεγμένον ἐν αὐτῷ ᾖ τὸ τῶν ἡδονῶν σμῆνος, οὐ πρῶτον μὲν οἰκίας τινὸς ἐφάψεται τοίχου ἤ τινος ὀψὲ νύκτωρ ἰόντος τοῦ ἱματίου, μετὰ δὲ ταῦτα ἱερόν τι νεωκορήσει; καὶ ἐν τούτοις δὴ πᾶσιν, ἃς πάλαι εἶχεν δόξας ἐκ παιδὸς περὶ καλῶν τε καὶ αἰσχρῶν, τὰς δικαίας ποιουμένας, αἱ νεωστὶ ἐκ δουλείας λελυμέναι, δορυφοροῦσαι τὸν ἔρωτα, κρατήσουσι μετ' ἐκείνου, αἷ πρότερον μὲν ὄναρ 574e ἐλύοντο ἐν ὕπνῳ, ὅτε ἦν αὐτὸς ἔτι ὑπὸ νόμοις τε καὶ πατρὶ δημοκρατούμενος ἐν ἑαυτῷ·	"And what happens when his father's and mother's resources give out on him, and the swarm of pleasures gathered in him is already large? Won't he first lay hands on the wall of some house, or on the cloak of someone out late at night, and after that give some temple a thorough clearing-out? And in all this the opinions he has held since childhood about what is fine and what is shameful, the ones considered just, will be overpowered by the opinions newly released from slavery, which serve as Love's bodyguard and will prevail along with him. Before, these were set loose only in dreams, 574e during sleep, when he himself was still under the laws and his father and there was democracy within him.

1 The Greek word for "necessary" (anankaios) also means "closely related by blood," so Socrates is playing on both senses.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
574e	τυραννευθεὶς δὲ ὑπὸ Ἔρωτος, οἷος ὀλιγάκις ἐγίγνετο ὄναρ, ὕπαρ τοιοῦτος ἀεὶ γενόμενος, οὔτε τινὸς φόνου δεινοῦ ἀφέξεται οὔτε βρώματος οὔτ' ἔργου, 575a ἀλλὰ τυραννικῶς ἐν αὐτῷ ὁ Ἔρως ἐν πάσῃ ἀναρχίᾳ καὶ ἀνομίᾳ ζῶν, ἅτε αὐτὸς ὢν μόναρχος, τὸν ἔχοντά τε αὐτὸν ὥσπερ πόλιν ἄξει ἐπὶ πᾶσαν τόλμαν, ὅθεν αὐτόν τε καὶ τὸν περὶ αὐτὸν θόρυβον θρέψει, τὸν μὲν ἔξωθεν εἰσεληλυθότα ἀπὸ κακῆς ὁμιλίας, τὸν δ' ἔνδοθεν ὑπὸ τῶν αὐτῶν τρόπων καὶ ἑαυτοῦ ἀνεθέντα καὶ ἐλευθερωθέντα· ἢ οὐχ οὗτος ὁ βίος τοῦ τοιούτου;	But once he is ruled by Love as a tyrant, he is always, awake, what he used to be only occasionally in dreams. He'll hold back from no terrible murder, no food, no deed. 575a Love lives in him like a tyrant, in total anarchy and lawlessness, since he is sole ruler himself; and he will lead the man who harbors him, as if he were a city, into every kind of daring, to find ways of feeding himself and the mob around him—some of it brought in from outside by bad company, some let loose and freed from within by the same ways of life and by himself. Isn't this the life of such a man?"
	οὗτος μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Yes, it is," he said.
575a	καὶ ἂν μέν γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὀλίγοι οἱ τοιοῦτοι ἐν πόλει 575b ὦσι καὶ τὸ ἄλλο πλῆθος σωφρονῇ, ἐξελθόντες ἄλλον τινὰ δορυφοροῦσι τύραννον ἢ μισθοῦ ἐπικουροῦσιν, ἐάν που πόλεμος ᾖ· ἐὰν δ' ἐν εἰρήνῃ τε καὶ ἡσυχίᾳ γένωνται, αὐτοῦ δὴ ἐν τῇ πόλει κακὰ δρῶσι σμικρὰ πολλά.	"And if there are only a few such people in a city," I said, 575b "and the rest of the population is moderate, they go off and serve as bodyguards for some other tyrant, or as mercenaries if there's a war somewhere. But if they turn up in peace and quiet, they stay right there in the city and do a lot of small evils."
	τὰ ποῖα δὴ λέγεις;	"What sort of evils do you mean?"
	οἷα κλέπτουσι, τοιχωρυχοῦσι, βαλλαντιοτομοῦσι, λωποδυτοῦσιν, ἱεροσυλοῦσιν, ἀνδραποδίζονται· ἔστι δ' ὅτε συκοφαντοῦσιν, ἐὰν δυνατοὶ ὦσι λέγειν, καὶ ψευδομαρτυροῦσι καὶ δωροδοκοῦσιν. 575c	"Things like stealing, breaking into houses, cutting purses, stripping people of their clothes, robbing temples, kidnapping people into slavery. Sometimes, if they're good speakers, they become malicious prosecutors, bear false witness and take bribes." 575c
	σμικρά γ', ἔφη, κακὰ λέγεις, ἐὰν ὀλίγοι ὦσιν οἱ τοιοῦτοι.	"Those are small evils, as you say," he said, "if such people are few."
575c	τὰ γὰρ σμικρά, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πρὸς τὰ μεγάλα σμικρά ἐστιν, καὶ ταῦτα δὴ πάντα πρὸς τύραννον πονηρίᾳ τε καὶ ἀθλιότητι πόλεως, τὸ λεγόμενον, οὐδ' ἴκταρ βάλλει. ὅταν γὰρ δὴ πολλοὶ ἐν πόλει γένωνται οἱ τοιοῦτοι καὶ ἄλλοι οἱ συνεπόμενοι αὐτοῖς, καὶ αἴσθωνται ἑαυτῶν τὸ πλῆθος, τότε οὗτοί εἰσιν οἱ τὸν τύραννον γεννῶντες μετὰ δήμου ἀνοίας ἐκεῖνον, ὃς ἂν αὐτῶν μάλιστα αὐτὸς ἐν αὐτῷ μέγιστον καὶ πλεῖστον 575d ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ τύραννον ἔχῃ.	"Yes," I said, "because small things are small compared to large ones. And all these things together, in terms of the wickedness and misery of a city, don't come anywhere near a tyrant, as the saying goes. For when such people and their followers become numerous in a city and become aware of their numbers, then it is they who, with the help of the people's folly, give birth to the tyrant: the one among them who has the greatest and strongest tyrant within himself, 575d in his own soul."
	εἰκότως γ', ἔφη· τυραννικώτατος γὰρ ἂν εἴη.	"Naturally," he said, "since he would be the most tyrannical."
575d	οὐκοῦν ἐὰν μὲν ἑκόντες ὑπείκωσιν· ἐὰν δὲ μὴ ἐπιτρέπῃ ἡ πόλις, ὥσπερ τότε μητέρα καὶ πατέρα ἐκόλαζεν, οὕτω πάλιν τὴν πατρίδα, ἐὰν οἷός τ' ᾖ, κολάσεται ἐπεισαγόμενος νέους ἑταίρους, καὶ ὑπὸ τούτοις δὴ	"That's all very well if they yield willingly. But if the city doesn't allow it, then just as he once punished his mother and father, so now, if he can, he'll punish his fatherland, bringing in new comrades;

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	δουλεύουσαν τὴν πάλαι φίλην μητρίδα τε, Κρῆτές φασι, καὶ πατρίδα ἕξει τε καὶ θρέψει. καὶ τοῦτο δὴ τὸ τέλος ἂν εἴη τῆς ἐπιθυμίας τοῦ τοιούτου ἀνδρός. 575e	and he'll keep his once-dear motherland, as the Cretans call it, and his fatherland enslaved to them and feed them from it. And this would be the goal of such a man's desire." 575e
	τοῦτο, ἦ δ' ὅς, παντάπασί γε.	"That's absolutely it," he said.[2]
575e	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὗτοί γε τοιοίδε γίγνονται ἰδίᾳ καὶ πρὶν ἄρχειν· πρῶτον μὲν οἷς ἂν συνῶσιν, ἢ κόλαξιν ἑαυτῶν συνόντες καὶ πᾶν ἑτοίμοις ὑπηρετεῖν, ἢ ἐάν τού τι δέωνται, 576a αὐτοὶ ὑποπεσόντες, πάντα σχήματα τολμῶντες ποιεῖν ὡς οἰκεῖοι, διαπραξάμενοι δὲ ἀλλότριοι;	"Now," I said, "aren't such men like this in private life too, even before they rule? First, in the company they keep: either they associate with flatterers who are ready to serve them in anything, or, if they need something from someone, 576a they grovel themselves, daring to strike any posture of intimacy, and then, once they've got what they want, they act like strangers?"
	καὶ σφόδρα γε.	"Very much so."
	ἐν παντὶ ἄρα τῷ βίῳ ζῶσι φίλοι μὲν οὐδέποτε οὐδενί, ἀεὶ δέ του δεσπόζοντες ἢ δουλεύοντες ἄλλῳ, ἐλευθερίας δὲ καὶ φιλίας ἀληθοῦς τυραννικὴ φύσις ἀεὶ ἄγευστος.	"So all their lives they live without ever being a friend to anyone, always a master to someone or a slave to another. The tyrannical nature never tastes freedom or true friendship."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
	ἆρ' οὖν οὐκ ὀρθῶς ἂν τοὺς τοιούτους ἀπίστους καλοῖμεν;	"Then wouldn't we be right to call such people untrustworthy?"
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
576a	καὶ μὴν ἀδίκους γε ὡς οἷόν τε μάλιστα, εἴπερ ὀρθῶς 576b ἐν τοῖς πρόσθεν ὡμολογήσαμεν περὶ δικαιοσύνης οἷόν ἐστιν.	"And as unjust as it's possible to be, if we were right 576b in what we agreed earlier about what justice is."
	ἀλλὰ μήν, ἦ δ' ὅς, ὀρθῶς γε.	"And we certainly were right," he said.
	κεφαλαιωσώμεθα τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸν κάκιστον. ἔστιν δέ που, οἷον ὄναρ διήλθομεν, ὃς ἂν ὕπαρ τοιοῦτος ᾖ.	"Then let's sum up the worst man," I said. "He is, I suppose, the man who is, awake, what we described in a dream."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
	οὐκοῦν οὗτος γίγνεται ὃς ἂν τυραννικώτατος φύσει ὢν μοναρχήσῃ, καὶ ὅσῳ ἂν πλείω χρόνον ἐν τυραννίδι βιῷ, τοσούτῳ μᾶλλον τοιοῦτος.	"And he comes about when someone who is most tyrannical by nature rules alone, and the longer he spends his life as a tyrant, the more like this he becomes."
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη διαδεξάμενος τὸν λόγον ὁ Γλαύκων.	"Inevitably," said Glaucon, taking over the argument.

THE TYRANT IS THE MOST WRETCHED

Socrates argues the tyrant is the most enslaved and wretched of men, and the just the happiest.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
576b	**SOCRATES** ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὃς ἂν φαίνηται πονηρότατος, καὶ 576c ἀθλιώτατος φανήσεται; καὶ ὃς ἂν πλεῖστον χρόνον καὶ μάλιστα τυραννεύσῃ, μάλιστά τε καὶ	**SOCRATES** "Then," I said, "won't the man who turns out to be most wicked 576c also turn out to be

2 The Cretans used "motherland" where other Greeks said "fatherland."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	πλεῖστον χρόνον τοιοῦτος γεγονὼς τῇ ἀληθείᾳ; τοῖς δὲ πολλοῖς πολλὰ καὶ δοκεῖ.	most wretched? And won't the one who has been tyrant longest and most absolutely have in truth been most wretched, most and longest? Though the many have many opinions about it."
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, ταῦτα γοῦν οὕτως ἔχειν.	"That much at least must be so," he said.
	ἄλλο τι οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅ γε τυραννικὸς κατὰ τὴν τυραννουμένην πόλιν ἂν εἴη ὁμοιότητι, δημοτικὸς δὲ κατὰ δημοκρατουμένην, καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι οὕτω;	"And," I said, "doesn't the tyrannical man correspond in likeness to the city ruled by a tyrant, and the democratic man to the democratically governed city, and so on for the others?"
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
	οὐκοῦν, ὅτι πόλις πρὸς πόλιν ἀρετῇ καὶ εὐδαιμονίᾳ, τοῦτο καὶ ἀνὴρ πρὸς ἄνδρα; 576d	"And as city stands to city in excellence and happiness, so too does man to man?" 576d
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
576d	τί οὖν ἀρετῇ τυραννουμένη πόλις πρὸς βασιλευομένην οἵαν τὸ πρῶτον διήλθομεν;	"Then how does a city ruled by a tyrant stand in excellence to one ruled by a king, like the one we first described?"
	πᾶν τοὐναντίον, ἔφη· ἡ μὲν γὰρ ἀρίστη, ἡ δὲ κακίστη.	"They're complete opposites," he said. "One is the best, the other the worst."
	οὐκ ἐρήσομαι, εἶπον, ὁποτέραν λέγεις· δῆλον γάρ. ἀλλ' εὐδαιμονίας τε αὖ καὶ ἀθλιότητος ὡσαύτως ἢ ἄλλως κρίνεις; καὶ μὴ ἐκπληττώμεθα πρὸς τὸν τύραννον ἕνα ὄντα βλέποντες, μηδ' εἴ τινες ὀλίγοι περὶ ἐκεῖνον, ἀλλ' ὡς χρὴ ὅλην 576e τὴν πόλιν εἰσελθόντας θεάσασθαι, καταδύντες εἰς ἅπασαν καὶ ἰδόντες, οὕτω δόξαν ἀποφαινώμεθα.	"I won't ask which is which," I said. "It's obvious. But as for happiness and wretchedness, do you judge them the same way or differently? And let's not be dazzled by looking at the tyrant, who is only one man, or at the few around him. We should go in and view the whole 576e city as we ought, getting down into every part and looking at it, and only then declare our opinion."
	ἀλλ' ὀρθῶς, ἔφη, προκαλῇ· καὶ δῆλον παντὶ ὅτι τυραννουμένης μὲν οὐκ ἔστιν ἀθλιωτέρα, βασιλευομένης δὲ οὐκ εὐδαιμονεστέρα.	"That's a fair challenge," he said. "And it's clear to everyone that there's no city more wretched than one ruled by a tyrant, and none happier than one ruled by a king."
576e	ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ περὶ τῶν ἀνδρῶν τὰ αὐτὰ ταῦτα 577a προκαλούμενος ὀρθῶς ἂν προκαλοίμην, ἀξιῶν κρίνειν περὶ αὐτῶν ἐκεῖνον, ὃς δύναται τῇ διανοίᾳ εἰς ἀνδρὸς ἦθος ἐνδὺς διιδεῖν καὶ μὴ καθάπερ παῖς ἔξωθεν ὁρῶν ἐκπλήττεται ὑπὸ τῆς τῶν τυραννικῶν προστάσεως ἣν πρὸς τοὺς ἔξω σχηματίζονται, ἀλλ' ἱκανῶς διορᾷ; εἰ οὖν οἰοίμην δεῖν ἐκείνου πάντας ἡμᾶς ἀκούειν, τοῦ δυνατοῦ μὲν κρῖναι, συνῳκηκότος δὲ ἐν τῷ αὐτῷ καὶ παραγεγονότος ἔν τε ταῖς κατ' οἰκίαν πράξεσιν, ὡς πρὸς ἑκάστους τοὺς οἰκείους ἔχει, ἐν οἷς 577b μάλιστα γυμνὸς ἂν ὀφθείη τῆς τραγικῆς σκευῆς, καὶ ἐν αὖ τοῖς δημοσίοις κινδύνοις, καὶ ταῦτα πάντα ἰδόντα κελεύοιμεν ἐξαγγέλλειν πῶς ἔχει εὐδαιμονίας καὶ ἀθλιότητος ὁ τύραννος πρὸς τοὺς ἄλλους;	"And wouldn't I also be right," I said, "to make the same challenge 577a about the men, and ask that the judge of them be someone who can enter into a man's character in thought and see through it—someone who isn't dazzled, like a child looking from outside, by the pomp that tyrants put on for outsiders, but sees through it adequately? What if I thought that all of us should listen to the man who is able to judge, who has lived under the same roof as the tyrant and been present at his doings at home, seeing how he treats each of his household—where 577b he would most be seen stripped of his tragic costume—and again in times of public danger; and what if we asked him, since he has seen all this, to report how the tyrant compares with the others in happiness and wretchedness?"

	GREEK	ENGLISH
577b	ὀρθότατ᾽ ἄν, ἔφη, καὶ ταῦτα προκαλοῖο.	“That would be a very fair challenge too,” he said.
	βούλει οὖν, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, προσποιησώμεθα ἡμεῖς εἶναι τῶν δυνατῶν ἂν κρῖναι καὶ ἤδη ἐντυχόντων τοιούτοις, ἵνα ἔχωμεν ὅστις ἀποκρινεῖται ἃ ἐρωτῶμεν;	“Then would you like us to pretend,” I said, “that we ourselves are among those able to judge and who have already met such people, so that we’ll have someone to answer our questions?”
	πάνυ γε. 577c	“Certainly.” 577c
	ἴθι δή μοι, ἔφην, ὧδε σκόπει. τὴν ὁμοιότητα ἀναμιμνῃσκόμενος τῆς τε πόλεως καὶ τοῦ ἀνδρός, οὕτω καθ᾽ ἕκαστον ἐν μέρει ἀθρῶν, τὰ παθήματα ἑκατέρου λέγε.	“Come on, then,” I said, “look at it this way. Remember the likeness between the city and the man, and then, looking at each point in turn, tell me what happens to each of them.”
	τὰ ποῖα; ἔφη.	“Such as what?” he said.
	πρῶτον μέν, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, ὡς πόλιν εἰπεῖν, ἐλευθέραν ἢ δούλην τὴν τυραννουμένην ἐρεῖς;	“First,” I said, “speaking of the city, will you say that a city ruled by a tyrant is free or enslaved?”
	ὡς οἷόν τ᾽, ἔφη, μάλιστα δούλην.	“As enslaved as can be,” he said.
577c	καὶ μὴν ὁρᾷς γε ἐν αὐτῇ δεσπότας καὶ ἐλευθέρους.	“And yet you do see masters and free men in it.”
	ὁρῶ, ἔφη, σμικρόν γέ τι τοῦτο· τὸ δὲ ὅλον, ὡς ἔπος εἰπεῖν, ἐν αὐτῇ καὶ τὸ ἐπιεικέστατον ἀτίμως τε καὶ ἀθλίως δοῦλον. 577d	“I see a small portion of such people,” he said. “But the whole, so to speak, and the most decent part of it, is enslaved, in dishonor and misery.” 577d
	εἰ οὖν, εἶπον, ὅμοιος ἀνὴρ τῇ πόλει, οὐ καὶ ἐν ἐκείνῳ ἀνάγκη τὴν αὐτὴν τάξιν ἐνεῖναι, καὶ πολλῆς μὲν δουλείας τε καὶ ἀνελευθερίας γέμειν τὴν ψυχὴν αὐτοῦ, καὶ ταῦτα αὐτῆς τὰ μέρη δουλεύειν, ἅπερ ἦν ἐπιεικέστατα, μικρὸν δὲ καὶ τὸ μοχθηρότατον καὶ μανικώτατον δεσπόζειν;	“Then if the man is like the city,” I said, “isn’t the same arrangement bound to be present in him too? Won’t his soul be full of slavery and servility, with the parts that were most decent enslaved, while a small part, the most wicked and maddest, is master?”
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη.	“It has to be,” he said.
577d	τί οὖν; δούλην ἢ ἐλευθέραν τὴν τοιαύτην φήσεις εἶναι ψυχήν;	“Well then, will you say that such a soul is enslaved or free?”
	δούλην δήπου ἔγωγε.	“Enslaved, surely.”
	οὐκοῦν ἥ γε αὖ δούλη καὶ τυραννουμένη πόλις ἥκιστα ποιεῖ ἃ βούλεται;	“And the enslaved, tyrant-ruled city does least what it wants?”
	πολύ γε. 577e	“By far.” 577e
	καὶ ἡ τυραννουμένη ἄρα ψυχὴ ἥκιστα ποιήσει ἃ ἂν βουληθῇ, ὡς περὶ ὅλης εἰπεῖν ψυχῆς· ὑπὸ δὲ οἴστρου ἀεὶ ἐλκομένη βίᾳ ταραχῆς καὶ μεταμελείας μεστὴ ἔσται.	“Then the tyrant-ruled soul too will least do what it wants—speaking of the soul as a whole. Always dragged by force by a goading frenzy, it will be full of turmoil and regret.”
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	“Of course.”
	πλουσίαν δὲ ἢ πενομένην ἀνάγκη τὴν τυραννουμένην πόλιν εἶναι;	“And is the tyrant-ruled city bound to be rich or poor?”
	πενομένην.	“Poor.”
	καὶ ψυχὴν ἄρα τυραννικὴν πενιχρὰν καὶ ἄπληστον ἀνάγκη ἀεὶ εἶναι.	“Then the tyrannical soul too must always be poor and insatiable.”
	οὕτως, ἦ δ᾽ ὅς.	“Just so,” he said.
578a		

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τί δέ; φόβου γέμειν ἆρ' οὐκ ἀνάγκη τήν τε τοιαύτην πόλιν τόν τε τοιοῦτον ἄνδρα;	"And what about fear? Isn't a city like this, and a man like this, bound to be full of it?"
	πολλή γε.	"Very full."
	ὀδυρμούς τε καὶ στεναγμοὺς καὶ θρήνους καὶ ἀλγηδόνας οἴει ἔν τινι ἄλλῃ πλείους εὑρήσειν;	"And do you think you'll find more wailing and groaning, more lamenting and anguish, in any other city?"
	οὐδαμῶς.	"Not at all."
	ἐν ἀνδρὶ δὲ ἡγῇ τὰ τοιαῦτα ἐν ἄλλῳ τινὶ πλείω εἶναι ἢ ἐν τῷ μαινομένῳ ὑπὸ ἐπιθυμιῶν τε καὶ ἐρώτων τούτῳ τῷ τυραννικῷ;	"And in a man, do you suppose such things are found more in anyone than in this tyrannical man, maddened by appetites and passions?"
	πῶς γὰρ ἄν; ἔφη. 578b	"How could they be?" he said. 578b
	εἰς πάντα δὴ οἶμαι ταῦτά τε καὶ ἄλλα τοιαῦτα ἀποβλέψας τήν τε πόλιν τῶν πόλεων ἀθλιωτάτην ἔκρινας—	"It was by looking at all these things, I think, and others like them, that you judged this city the most wretched of cities—"
	οὐκοῦν ὀρθῶς; ἔφη.	"And wasn't I right?" he said.
578b	καὶ μάλα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. ἀλλὰ περὶ τοῦ ἀνδρὸς αὖ τοῦ τυραννικοῦ τί λέγεις εἰς ταὐτὰ ταῦτα ἀποβλέπων;	"Quite right," I said. "But what do you say about the tyrannical man, looking at these same things?"
	μακρῷ, ἔφη, ἀθλιώτατον εἶναι τῶν ἄλλων ἁπάντων.	"That he's by far the most wretched of all," he said.
	τοῦτο, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐκέτ' ὀρθῶς λέγεις.	"There," I said, "you're no longer right."
	πῶς; ἦ δ' ὅς.	"How so?" he said.
	οὔπω, ἔφην, οἶμαι, οὗτός ἐστιν ὁ τοιοῦτος μάλιστα.	"I don't think," I said, "that he is yet the most wretched."
	ἀλλὰ τίς μήν;	"Then who is?"
	ὅδε ἴσως σοι ἔτι δόξει εἶναι τούτου ἀθλιώτερος.	"Here's one you may think still more wretched than him."
	ποῖος; 578c	"Who?" 578c
	ὃς ἄν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τυραννικὸς ὢν μὴ ἰδιώτην βίον καταβιῷ, ἀλλὰ δυστυχὴς ᾖ καὶ αὐτῷ ὑπό τινος συμφορᾶς ἐκπορισθῇ ὥστε τυράννῳ γενέσθαι.	"The man," I said, "who is tyrannical but doesn't live out his life as a private citizen—who has the bad luck to have some misfortune furnish him with the means of becoming a tyrant."
578c	τεκμαίρομαί σε, ἔφη, ἐκ τῶν προειρημένων ἀληθῆ λέγειν.	"From what's been said before," he said, "I'd infer that you're telling the truth."
	ναί, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀλλ' οὐκ οἴεσθαι χρὴ τὰ τοιαῦτα, ἀλλ' εὖ μάλα τῷ τοιούτῳ λόγῳ σκοπεῖν· περὶ γάρ τοι τοῦ μεγίστου ἡ σκέψις, ἀγαθοῦ τε βίου καὶ κακοῦ.	"Yes," I said, "but we shouldn't just suppose things like this; we should examine them very carefully with an argument of this kind. After all, the inquiry concerns the greatest thing there is: the good life and the bad."
	ὀρθότατα, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Quite right," he said.
	σκόπει δὴ εἰ ἄρα τι λέγω. δοκεῖ γάρ μοι δεῖν ἐννοῆσαι 578d ἐκ τῶνδε περὶ αὐτοῦ σκοποῦντας.	"Then see whether there's anything in what I say. I think we need to get an idea of it 578d by examining the matter from the following."
	ἐκ τίνων;	"From what?"
578d		

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἐξ ἑνὸς ἑκάστου τῶν ἰδιωτῶν, ὅσοι πλούσιοι ἐν πόλεσιν ἀνδράποδα πολλὰ κέκτηνται. οὗτοι γὰρ τοῦτό γε προσόμοιον ἔχουσιν τοῖς τυράννοις, τὸ πολλῶν ἄρχειν· διαφέρει δὲ τὸ ἐκείνου πλῆθος.	"From each of the private citizens in cities who are rich and own many slaves. They have this much in common with tyrants: they rule over many. The difference is in the tyrant's numbers."
	διαφέρει γάρ.	"Yes, that's the difference."
	οἶσθ' οὖν ὅτι οὗτοι ἀδεῶς ἔχουσιν καὶ οὐ φοβοῦνται τοὺς οἰκέτας;	"Now you know that these men feel secure and aren't afraid of their household slaves?"
	τί γὰρ ἂν φοβοῖντο;	"What would they be afraid of?"
	οὐδέν, εἶπον· ἀλλὰ τὸ αἴτιον ἐννοεῖς;	"Nothing," I said. "But do you see the reason?"
	ναί, ὅτι γε πᾶσα ἡ πόλις ἑνὶ ἑκάστῳ βοηθεῖ τῶν ἰδιωτῶν. 578e	"Yes: the whole city comes to the aid of each individual citizen." 578e
578e	καλῶς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λέγεις. τί δέ; εἴ τις θεῶν ἄνδρα ἕνα, ὅτῳ ἔστιν ἀνδράποδα πεντήκοντα ἢ καὶ πλείω, ἄρας ἐκ τῆς πόλεως αὐτόν τε καὶ γυναῖκα καὶ παῖδας θείη εἰς ἐρημίαν μετὰ τῆς ἄλλης οὐσίας τε καὶ τῶν οἰκετῶν, ὅπου αὐτῷ μηδεὶς τῶν ἐλευθέρων μέλλοι βοηθήσειν, ἐν ποίῳ ἄν τινι καὶ ὁπόσῳ φόβῳ οἴει γενέσθαι αὐτὸν περί τε αὑτοῦ καὶ παίδων καὶ γυναικός, μὴ ἀπόλοιντο ὑπὸ τῶν οἰκετῶν;	"Well said," I said. "But what if some god were to lift one man who owns fifty slaves or even more out of the city—him and his wife and children—and set him down in a wilderness along with the rest of his property and his household slaves, where no free man would be coming to help him? What sort of fear, and how much, do you think he'd be in, for himself and his children and his wife, that they might be killed by the slaves?"
	ἐν παντί, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἔγωγε.	"Utter terror," he said, "I'd think."
579a	οὐκοῦν ἀναγκάζοιτο ἄν τινας ἤδη θωπεύειν αὐτῶν τῶν δούλων καὶ ὑπισχνεῖσθαι πολλὰ καὶ ἐλευθεροῦν οὐδὲν δεόμενος, καὶ κόλαξ αὐτὸς ἂν θεραπόντων ἀναφανείη;	"Wouldn't he be forced before long to fawn on some of those very slaves, make them lots of promises and set them free when there was no need to, and so turn out to be a flatterer of his own servants?"
	πολλὴ ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, αὐτῷ, ἢ ἀπολωλέναι.	"He'd have no choice," he said, "or else he'd be killed."
	τί δ', εἰ καὶ ἄλλους, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὁ θεὸς κύκλῳ κατοικίσειεν γείτονας πολλοὺς αὐτῷ, οἳ μὴ ἀνέχοιντο εἴ τις ἄλλος ἄλλου δεσπόζειν ἀξιοῖ, ἀλλ' εἴ πού τινα τοιοῦτον λαμβάνοιεν, ταῖς ἐσχάταις τιμωροῖντο τιμωρίαις; 579b	"And what if the god also settled many other neighbors in a ring around him," I said, "people who wouldn't tolerate anyone claiming to be master of another, and who, if they ever caught such a person, would punish him with the most extreme punishments?" 579b
	ἔτι ἄν, ἔφη, οἶμαι, μᾶλλον ἐν παντὶ κακοῦ εἴη, κύκλῳ φρουρούμενος ὑπὸ πάντων πολεμίων.	"I think he'd be in still worse trouble," he said, "hemmed in on every side by nothing but enemies."
579b	ἆρ' οὖν οὐκ ἐν τοιούτῳ μὲν δεσμωτηρίῳ δέδεται ὁ τύραννος, φύσει ὢν οἷον διεληλύθαμεν, πολλῶν καὶ παντοδαπῶν φόβων καὶ ἐρώτων μεστός· λίχνῳ δὲ ὄντι αὐτῷ τὴν ψυχὴν μόνῳ τῶν ἐν τῇ πόλει οὔτε ἀποδημῆσαι ἔξεστιν οὐδαμόσε, οὔτε θεωρῆσαι ὅσων δὴ καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι ἐλεύθεροι ἐπιθυμηταί εἰσιν, καταδεδυκὼς δὲ ἐν τῇ οἰκίᾳ τὰ πολλὰ ὡς γυνὴ ζῇ, 579c φθονῶν καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις πολίταις, ἐάν τις ἔξω ἀποδημῇ καί τι ἀγαθὸν ὁρᾷ;	"And isn't that the kind of prison the tyrant is bound in, being by nature the sort of person we've described, full of fears and passions of every kind? Greedy as his soul is, he alone of everyone in the city can't travel abroad anywhere, or go to see the festivals that other free men long to see. Instead he lives mostly shut up in his house, like a woman, 579c envying the other citizens too if any of them goes abroad and sees something good."
	παντάπασιν μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	

GREEK	ENGLISH
	"Absolutely," he said.
579c οὐκοῦν τοῖς τοιούτοις κακοῖς πλείω καρποῦται ἀνὴρ ὃς ἂν κακῶς ἐν ἑαυτῷ πολιτευόμενος, ὃν νυνδὴ σὺ ἀθλιώτατον ἔκρινας, τὸν τυραννικόν, ὡς μὴ ἰδιώτης καταβιῷ, ἀλλὰ ἀναγκασθῇ ὑπό τινος τύχης τυραννεῦσαι καὶ ἑαυτοῦ ὢν ἀκράτωρ ἄλλων ἐπιχειρήσῃ ἄρχειν, ὥσπερ εἴ τις κάμνοντι σώματι καὶ ἀκράτορι ἑαυτοῦ μὴ ἰδιωτεύων ἀλλ' ἀγωνιζόμενος [579d] πρὸς ἄλλα σώματα καὶ μαχόμενος ἀναγκάζοιτο διάγειν τὸν βίον.	"So the man who is badly governed within himself—the tyrannical man, whom you just now judged the most wretched—reaps a still larger harvest of such evils when he doesn't live out his life as a private citizen but is forced by some chance to be a tyrant, and tries to rule others when he can't control himself. It's as if a man whose body was sick and had no control over itself were forced to spend his life not in private but competing [579d] and fighting against other bodies."
παντάπασιν, ἔφη, ὁμοιότατά τε καὶ ἀληθέστατα λέγεις, ὦ Σώκρατες.	"Socrates," he said, "your comparison is perfectly apt, and perfectly true."
579d οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ φίλε Γλαύκων, παντελῶς τὸ πάθος ἄθλιον, καὶ τοῦ ὑπὸ σοῦ κριθέντος χαλεπώτατα ζῆν χαλεπώτερον ἔτι ζῇ ὁ τυραννῶν;	"Then, my dear Glaucon," I said, "isn't his condition utterly wretched? And doesn't the man who rules as tyrant have an even harder life than the one you judged to have the hardest?"
κομιδῇ γ', ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said.
ἔστιν ἄρα τῇ ἀληθείᾳ, κἂν εἰ μή τῳ δοκεῖ, ὁ τῷ ὄντι τύραννος τῷ ὄντι δοῦλος τὰς μεγίστας θωπείας καὶ δουλείας [579e] καὶ κόλαξ τῶν πονηροτάτων, καὶ τὰς ἐπιθυμίας οὐδ' ὁπωστιοῦν ἀποπιμπλάς, ἀλλὰ πλείστων ἐπιδεέστατος καὶ πένης τῇ ἀληθείᾳ φαίνεται, ἐάν τις ὅλην ψυχὴν ἐπίστηται θεάσασθαι, καὶ φόβου γέμων διὰ παντὸς τοῦ βίου, σφαδασμῶν τε καὶ ὀδυνῶν πλήρης, εἴπερ τῇ τῆς πόλεως διαθέσει ἧς ἄρχει ἔοικεν. ἔοικεν δέ· ἢ γάρ;	"So in truth, whatever anyone may think, the real tyrant is really a slave, given over to the most abject fawning and servitude, [579e] a flatterer of the worst of men. Far from satisfying his appetites in any way at all, he is plainly in want of most things and truly poor, if one knows how to look at a soul as a whole. All his life he is full of fear, filled with convulsions and pains—if he really does resemble the condition of the city he rules. And he does resemble it, doesn't he?"
καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
580a οὐκοῦν καὶ πρὸς τούτοις ἔτι ἀποδώσομεν τῷ ἀνδρὶ καὶ ἃ τὸ πρότερον εἴπομεν, ὅτι ἀνάγκη καὶ εἶναι καὶ ἔτι μᾶλλον γίγνεσθαι αὐτῷ ἢ πρότερον διὰ τὴν ἀρχὴν φθονερῷ, ἀπίστῳ, ἀδίκῳ, ἀφίλῳ, ἀνοσίῳ καὶ πάσης κακίας πανδοκεῖ τε καὶ τροφεῖ, καὶ ἐξ ἁπάντων τούτων μάλιστα μὲν αὐτῷ δυστυχεῖ εἶναι, ἔπειτα δὲ καὶ τοὺς πλησίον αὐτῷ τοιούτους ἀπεργάζεσθαι.	"And on top of this we'll also attribute to the man what we said earlier: that he is bound to be, and through his rule to become even more than before, envious, untrustworthy, unjust, friendless, impious, a host and nurse to every kind of badness; and that as a result of all this he is, first, supremely unfortunate himself, and then makes those near him like himself."
οὐδείς σοι, ἔφη, τῶν νοῦν ἐχόντων ἀντερεῖ.	"No one with any sense," he said, "will contradict you."
ἴθι δή μοι, ἔφην ἐγώ, νῦν ἤδη ὥσπερ ὁ διὰ πάντων [580b] κριτὴς ἀποφαίνεται, καὶ σὺ οὕτω, τίς πρῶτος κατὰ τὴν σὴν δόξαν εὐδαιμονίᾳ καὶ τίς δεύτερος, καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους ἑξῆς πέντε ὄντας κρῖνε, βασιλικόν, τιμοκρατικόν, ὀλιγαρχικόν, δημοκρατικόν, τυραννικόν.	"Come then," I said. "Now, just as the judge of the final round [580b] declares his verdict, you too decide who in your opinion is first in happiness, who second, and the others in order—there are five of them: the kingly, the timocratic, the oligarchic, the democratic, the tyrannical."

GREEK

ENGLISH

ἀλλὰ ῥᾳδία, ἔφη, ἡ κρίσις. καθάπερ γὰρ εἰσῆλθον ἔγωγε ὥσπερ χοροὺς κρίνω ἀρετῇ καὶ κακίᾳ καὶ εὐδαιμονίᾳ καὶ τῷ ἐναντίῳ.

"The judgment's easy," he said. "I rank them like choruses, in the order they came on stage, in excellence and badness, and in happiness and its opposite."[3]

580b μισθωσώμεθα οὖν κήρυκα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἢ αὐτὸς ἀνείπω ὅτι ὁ Ἀρίστωνος ὑὸς τὸν ἄριστόν τε καὶ δικαιότατον εὐδαιμονέστατον 580c ἔκρινε, τοῦτον δ' εἶναι τὸν βασιλικώτατον καὶ βασιλεύοντα αὑτοῦ, τὸν δὲ κάκιστόν τε καὶ ἀδικώτατον ἀθλιώτατον, τοῦτον δὲ αὖ τυγχάνειν ὄντα ὃς ἂν τυραννικώτατος ὢν ἑαυτοῦ τε ὅτι μάλιστα τυραννῇ καὶ τῆς πόλεως;

ἀνειρήσθω σοι, ἔφη.

ἦ οὖν προσαναγορεύω, εἶπον, ἐάντε λανθάνωσιν τοιοῦτοι ὄντες ἐάντε μὴ πάντας ἀνθρώπους τε καὶ θεούς;

προσαναγόρευε, ἔφη.

"Then shall we hire a herald," I said, "or shall I proclaim it myself: that the son of Ariston has judged the best and most just man to be the happiest, 580c and that this is the most kingly man, who rules as king over himself; and that the worst and most unjust man is the most wretched, and that this happens to be the man who, being most tyrannical, is most completely a tyrant over himself and over the city?"

"Consider it proclaimed," he said.

"And shall I add to the proclamation," I said, "'whether or not all men and gods notice what they are'?"

"Add it," he said.[4]

THREE KINDS OF PLEASURE

Socrates matches three kinds of pleasure to the soul's three parts and judges the philosopher's best.

GREEK

ENGLISH

580c **SOCRATES** εἶεν δή, εἶπον· αὕτη μὲν ἡμῖν ἡ ἀπόδειξις μία ἂν εἴη, 580d δευτέραν δὲ ἰδὲ τήνδε, ἐάν τι δόξῃ εἶναι.

τίς αὕτη;

ἐπειδή, ὥσπερ πόλις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, διῄρηται κατὰ τρία εἴδη, οὕτω καὶ ψυχὴ ἑνὸς ἑκάστου τριχῇ, λογιστικὸν δέξεται, ὡς ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ, καὶ ἑτέραν ἀπόδειξιν.

τίνα ταύτην;

τήνδε. τριῶν ὄντων τριτταὶ καὶ ἡδοναί μοι φαίνονται, ἑνὸς ἑκάστου μία ἰδία· ἐπιθυμίαι τε ὡσαύτως καὶ ἀρχαί.

πῶς λέγεις; ἔφη.

SOCRATES "Well then," I said, "that would be our first proof. 580d Now look at this second one and see if you think there's anything in it."

"What is it?"

"Since the soul of each individual," I said, "is divided in three, just as the city was divided into three classes, it will admit, I think, of another proof as well."

"What is it?"

"This. Since there are three parts, there appear to me to be three kinds of pleasure too, one proper to each; and likewise three kinds of desire and of rule."

"What do you mean?" he said.

580d τὸ μέν, φαμέν, ἦν ᾧ μανθάνει ἄνθρωπος, τὸ δὲ ᾧ θυμοῦται, τὸ δὲ τρίτον διὰ πολυειδίαν ἐνὶ οὐκ ἔσχομεν ὀνόματι προσειπεῖν 580e ἰδίῳ αὐτοῦ, ἀλλὰ ὃ μέγιστον καὶ ἰσχυρότατον εἶχεν ἐν αὑτῷ, τούτῳ ἐπωνομάσαμεν·

ἐπιθυμητικὸν γὰρ αὐτὸ κεκλήκαμεν διὰ σφοδρότητα τῶν τε περὶ τὴν ἐδωδὴν ἐπιθυμιῶν καὶ πόσιν καὶ ἀφροδίσια

"One part, we said, was that with which a person learns, and another that with which he feels anger. The third, because it takes so many forms, we couldn't call by any one name 580e of its own, so we named it after the biggest and strongest thing in it.

"We called it the appetitive part because of the intensity of its appetites for food and drink and sex

3 At Athenian dramatic festivals, judges ranked the competing choruses.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καὶ ὅσα ἄλλα τούτοις ἀκόλουθα, καὶ φιλοχρήματον δή, ὅτι διὰ χρημάτων μάλιστα ἀποτελοῦνται [581a] αἱ τοιαῦται ἐπιθυμίαι.	and everything that goes with them; and we also called it money-loving, since it's above all by means of money that [581a] appetites like these are fulfilled."
	καὶ ὀρθῶς γ', ἔφη.	"And rightly so," he said.
581a	ἆρ' οὖν καὶ τὴν ἡδονὴν αὐτοῦ καὶ φιλίαν εἰ φαῖμεν εἶναι τοῦ κέρδους, μάλιστ' ἂν εἰς ἓν κεφάλαιον ἀπερειδοίμεθα τῷ λόγῳ, ὥστε τι ἡμῖν αὐτοῖς δηλοῦν, ὁπότε τοῦτο τῆς ψυχῆς τὸ μέρος λέγοιμεν, καὶ καλοῦντες αὐτὸ φιλοχρήματον καὶ φιλοκερδὲς ὀρθῶς ἂν καλοῖμεν;	"So if we also said that its pleasure and its love are for profit, wouldn't that be the best way to pin it down under a single heading in our argument, so that it would be clear to us what we meant whenever we spoke of this part of the soul? And wouldn't we be right to call it money-loving and profit-loving?"
	ἐμοὶ γοῦν δοκεῖ, ἔφη.	"I think so, anyway," he said.
	τί δέ; τὸ θυμοειδὲς οὐ πρὸς τὸ κρατεῖν μέντοι φαμὲν καὶ νικᾶν καὶ εὐδοκιμεῖν ἀεὶ ὅλον ὡρμῆσθαι; [581b]	"And what about the spirited part? Don't we say it's always wholly set on control and victory and good repute?" [581b]
	καὶ μάλα.	"Very much so."
	εἰ οὖν φιλόνικον αὐτὸ καὶ φιλότιμον προσαγορεύοιμεν, ἦ ἐμμελῶς ἂν ἔχοι;	"So if we called it victory-loving and honor-loving, would that be apt?"
	ἐμμελέστατα μὲν οὖν.	"Most apt."
581b	ἀλλὰ μὴν ᾧ γε μανθάνομεν, παντὶ δῆλον ὅτι πρὸς τὸ εἰδέναι τὴν ἀλήθειαν ὅπῃ ἔχει πᾶν ἀεὶ τέταται, καὶ χρημάτων τε καὶ δόξης ἥκιστα τούτων τούτῳ μέλει.	"And as for the part with which we learn, it's obvious to everyone that it is always wholly straining to know the truth of how things are, and that of the three it cares least about money and reputation."
	πολύ γε.	"By far."
	φιλομαθὲς δὴ καὶ φιλόσοφον καλοῦντες αὐτὸ κατὰ τρόπον ἂν καλοῖμεν;	"Then would we be right to call it learning-loving and wisdom-loving?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ ἄρχει ἐν ταῖς ψυχαῖς τῶν μὲν [581c] τοῦτο, τῶν δὲ τὸ ἕτερον ἐκείνων, ὁπότερον ἂν τύχῃ;	"And in some people's souls," I said, "it is [581c] this part that rules, while in others it's one of the other two, whichever it happens to be?"
	οὕτως, ἔφη.	"That's right," he said.
	διὰ ταῦτα δὴ καὶ ἀνθρώπων λέγομεν τὰ πρῶτα τριττὰ γένη εἶναι, φιλόσοφον, φιλόνικον, φιλοκερδές;	"And that's why we say there are also three primary kinds of people: the philosophic, the victory-loving, the profit-loving?"
	κομιδῇ γε.	"Exactly."
581c	καὶ ἡδονῶν δὴ τρία εἴδη, ὑποκείμενον ἓν ἑκάστῳ τούτων;	"And three kinds of pleasure too, one underlying each of them?"
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
	οἶσθ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι εἰ 'θέλοις τρεῖς τοιούτους ἀνθρώπους ἐν μέρει ἕκαστον ἀνερωτᾶν τίς τούτων τῶν βίων ἥδιστος, τὸν ἑαυτοῦ ἕκαστος μάλιστα ἐγκωμιάσεται;	"Now you know," I said, "that if you were to ask three such people in turn which of these lives is

4 Ariston's name echoes *aristos*, "best"—hence the pun on "the best and most just man."

GREEK

ENGLISH

ὅ τε [581d] χρηματιστικὸς πρὸς τὸ κερδαίνειν τὴν τοῦ τιμᾶσθαι ἡδονὴν ἢ τὴν τοῦ μανθάνειν οὐδενὸς ἀξίαν φήσει εἶναι, εἰ μὴ εἴ τι αὐτῶν ἀργύριον ποιεῖ;

ἀληθῆ, ἔφη.

the most pleasant, each would praise his own above the rest? The [581d] moneymaker will say that, compared with making a profit, the pleasure of being honored or of learning is worth nothing, unless it makes him some money?"

"True," he said.

581d τί δὲ ὁ φιλότιμος; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· οὐ τὴν μὲν ἀπὸ τῶν χρημάτων ἡδονὴν φορτικήν τινα ἡγεῖται, καὶ αὖ τὴν ἀπὸ τοῦ μανθάνειν, ὅτι μὴ μάθημα τιμὴν φέρει, καπνὸν καὶ φλυαρίαν;

οὕτως, ἔφη, ἔχει.

τὸν δὲ φιλόσοφον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τί οἰώμεθα τὰς ἄλλας [581e] ἡδονὰς νομίζειν πρὸς τὴν τοῦ εἰδέναι τἀληθὲς ὅπῃ ἔχει καὶ ἐν τοιούτῳ τινὶ ἀεὶ εἶναι μανθάνοντα; τῆς ἡδονῆς οὐ πάνυ πόρρω; καὶ καλεῖν τῷ ὄντι ἀναγκαίας, ὡς οὐδὲν τῶν ἄλλων δεόμενον, εἰ μὴ ἀνάγκη ἦν;

εὖ, ἔφη, δεῖ εἰδέναι;

"And what about the honor-lover?" I said. "Doesn't he regard the pleasure that comes from money as rather vulgar, and the pleasure of learning, except insofar as learning brings honor, as so much smoke and nonsense?"

"That's how it is," he said.

"And the philosopher," I said, "what should we suppose he thinks of the other [581e] pleasures, compared with the pleasure of knowing the truth as it is, and of always being in some such state as he goes on learning? Doesn't he think they fall far short of that pleasure? And doesn't he call them necessary in the literal sense, since he'd have no need of any of them if necessity didn't require it?"

"We can be sure of that," he said.

581e ὅτε δὴ οὖν, εἶπον, ἀμφισβητοῦνται ἑκάστου τοῦ εἴδους αἱ ἡδοναὶ καὶ αὐτὸς ὁ βίος, μὴ ὅτι πρὸς τὸ κάλλιον καὶ αἴσχιον ζῆν μηδὲ τὸ χεῖρον καὶ ἄμεινον, ἀλλὰ πρὸς αὐτὸ τὸ [582a] ἥδιον καὶ ἀλυπότερον, πῶς ἂν εἰδεῖμεν τίς αὐτῶν ἀληθέστατα λέγει;

οὐ πάνυ, ἔφη, ἔγωγε ἔχω εἰπεῖν.

ἀλλ' ὧδε σκόπει· τίνι χρὴ κρίνεσθαι τὰ μέλλοντα καλῶς κριθήσεσθαι; ἆρ' οὐκ ἐμπειρίᾳ τε καὶ φρονήσει καὶ λόγῳ; ἢ τούτων ἔχοι ἄν τις βέλτιον κριτήριον;

καὶ πῶς ἄν; ἔφη.

"Then since the pleasures of each type, and their very lives, are in dispute—not over which way of living is finer or more shameful, or better or worse, but over which is actually [582a] more pleasant and less painful—how could we know which of them is speaking most truly?"

"I can't really say," he said.

"Well, look at it this way. By what should things be judged if they're to be judged well? Isn't it by experience and understanding and reason? Or could anyone have a better criterion than these?"

"How could he?" he said.

582a σκόπει δή· τριῶν ὄντων τῶν ἀνδρῶν τίς ἐμπειρότατος πασῶν ὧν εἴπομεν ἡδονῶν; πότερον ὁ φιλοκερδής, μανθάνων αὐτὴν τὴν ἀλήθειαν οἷόν ἐστιν, ἐμπειρότερος δοκεῖ σοι εἶναι τῆς [582b] ἀπὸ τοῦ εἰδέναι ἡδονῆς, ἢ ὁ φιλόσοφος τῆς ἀπὸ τοῦ κερδαίνειν;

πολύ, ἔφη, διαφέρει. τῷ μὲν γὰρ ἀνάγκη γεύεσθαι τῶν ἑτέρων ἐκ παιδὸς ἀρξαμένῳ· τῷ δὲ φιλοκερδεῖ, ὅπῃ πέφυκε τὰ ὄντα μανθάνοντι, τῆς ἡδονῆς ταύτης, ὡς γλυκεῖά ἐστιν, οὐκ ἀνάγκη γεύεσθαι οὐδ' ἐμπείρῳ γίγνεσθαι, μᾶλλον δὲ καὶ προθυμουμένῳ οὐ ῥᾴδιον.

"Consider, then. Of the three men, which has the most experience of all the pleasures we mentioned? Does the profit-lover, by learning what truth itself is like, seem to you to have more experience of the [582b] pleasure of knowing than the philosopher has of the pleasure of profit?"

"There's a great difference," he said. "The philosopher can't help tasting the other pleasures, starting in childhood. But the profit-lover, when he learns the nature of the things that are, has no need to taste this pleasure and find out how sweet it is, or to gain experience of it; in fact, even if he were eager to, it wouldn't be easy."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
582b	πολὺ ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, διαφέρει τοῦ γε φιλοκερδοῦς ὁ φιλόσοφος ἐμπειρίᾳ ἀμφοτέρων τῶν ἡδονῶν. 582c	"So the philosopher far surpasses the profit-lover," I said, "in experience of both pleasures." 582c
	πολὺ μέντοι.	"Far more, certainly."
	τί δὲ τοῦ φιλοτίμου; ἆρα μᾶλλον ἄπειρός ἐστι τῆς ἀπὸ τοῦ τιμᾶσθαι ἡδονῆς ἢ ἐκεῖνος τῆς ἀπὸ τοῦ φρονεῖν;	"And what about the honor-lover? Does the philosopher have less experience of the pleasure of being honored than the honor-lover has of the pleasure of understanding?"
	ἀλλὰ τιμὴ μέν, ἔφη, ἐάνπερ ἐξεργάζωνται ἐπὶ ὃ ἕκαστος ὥρμηκε, πᾶσιν αὐτοῖς ἕπεται—καὶ γὰρ ὁ πλούσιος ὑπὸ πολλῶν τιμᾶται καὶ ὁ ἀνδρεῖος καὶ σοφός—ὥστε ἀπό γε τοῦ τιμᾶσθαι, οἷόν ἐστιν, πάντες τῆς ἡδονῆς ἔμπειροι· τῆς δὲ τοῦ ὄντος θέας, οἵαν ἡδονὴν ἔχει, ἀδύνατον ἄλλῳ γεγεῦσθαι πλὴν τῷ φιλοσόφῳ. 582d	"Well, honor," he said, "comes to all of them, if each accomplishes what he has set out to do—the rich man is honored by many, and so are the brave man and the wise one—so all of them have experience of what the pleasure of being honored is like. But what pleasure there is in beholding what is, no one but the philosopher can have tasted." 582d
582d	ἐμπειρίας μὲν ἄρα, εἶπον, ἕνεκα κάλλιστα τῶν ἀνδρῶν κρίνει οὗτος.	"So as far as experience goes," I said, "he's the best judge of the three."
	πολύ γε.	"By far."
	καὶ μὴν μετά γε φρονήσεως μόνος ἔμπειρος γεγονὼς ἔσται.	"And he alone will have gained his experience together with understanding."
	τί μήν;	"Certainly."
	ἀλλὰ μὴν καὶ δι' οὗ γε δεῖ ὀργάνου κρίνεσθαι, οὐ τοῦ φιλοκερδοῦς τοῦτο ὄργανον οὐδὲ τοῦ φιλοτίμου, ἀλλὰ τοῦ φιλοσόφου.	"Moreover, the instrument by which things must be judged belongs not to the profit-lover or the honor-lover, but to the philosopher."
	τὸ ποῖον;	"What instrument?"
	διὰ λόγων που ἔφαμεν δεῖν κρίνεσθαι. ἦ γάρ;	"We said, I think, that they must be judged by means of arguments. Didn't we?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	λόγοι δὲ τούτου μάλιστα ὄργανον.	"And arguments are above all his instrument."
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	οὐκοῦν εἰ μὲν πλούτῳ καὶ κέρδει ἄριστα ἐκρίνετο τὰ 582e κρινόμενα, ἃ ἐπῄνει ὁ φιλοκερδὴς καὶ ἔψεγεν, ἀνάγκη ἂν ἦν ταῦτα ἀληθέστατα εἶναι.	"Now if the things under 582e judgment were best judged by wealth and profit, what the profit-lover praised and disparaged would necessarily be the truest."
	πολλή γε.	"Quite necessarily."
	εἰ δὲ τιμῇ τε καὶ νίκῃ καὶ ἀνδρείᾳ, ἆρ' οὐχ ἃ ὁ φιλότιμός τε καὶ φιλόνικος;	"And if by honor and victory and courage, wouldn't it be what the honor-lover and victory-lover praised?"
	δῆλον.	"Clearly."
	ἐπειδὴ δ' ἐμπειρίᾳ καὶ φρονήσει καὶ λόγῳ;	"But since it's by experience and understanding and reason?"
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, ἃ ὁ φιλόσοφός τε καὶ ὁ φιλόλογος ἐπαινεῖ, ἀληθέστατα εἶναι.	"Then necessarily," he said, "what the philosopher and lover of reason praises is truest."
583a		

GREEK	ENGLISH
τριῶν ἄρ' οὐσῶν τῶν ἡδονῶν ἡ τούτου τοῦ μέρους τῆς ψυχῆς ᾧ μανθάνομεν ἡδίστη ἂν εἴη, καὶ ἐν ᾧ ἡμῶν τοῦτο ἄρχει, ὁ τούτου βίος ἥδιστος;	"So of the three pleasures, the pleasure of the part of the soul with which we learn would be the most pleasant, and the life of the one among us in whom this part rules would be the most pleasant?"
πῶς δ' οὐ μέλλει; ἔφη· κύριος γοῦν ἐπαινέτης ὢν ἐπαινεῖ τὸν ἑαυτοῦ βίον ὁ φρόνιμος.	"How could it not be?" he said. "The man of understanding, at any rate, speaks with authority when he praises his own life."
τίνα δὲ δεύτερον, εἶπον, βίον καὶ τίνα δευτέραν ἡδονήν φησιν ὁ κριτὴς εἶναι;	"And which life," I said, "and which pleasure does the judge put second?"
δῆλον ὅτι τὴν τοῦ πολεμικοῦ τε καὶ φιλοτίμου· ἐγγυτέρω γὰρ αὐτοῦ ἐστιν ἢ ἡ τοῦ χρηματιστοῦ.	"Clearly the warrior's, the honor-lover's, since it's closer to his own than the moneymaker's is."
ὑστάτην δὴ τὴν τοῦ φιλοκερδοῦς, ὡς ἔοικεν.	"And last, it seems, the profit-lover's."
τί μήν; ἦ δ' ὅς. 583b	"Of course," he said. 583b

TRUE AND FALSE PLEASURE

Socrates argues that only the philosopher's pleasures are true and pure, calculating the king 729 times happier.

GREEK	ENGLISH
583b **SOCRATES** ταῦτα μὲν τοίνυν οὕτω δύ' ἐφεξῆς ἂν εἴη καὶ δὶς νενικηκὼς ὁ δίκαιος τὸν ἄδικον· τὸ δὲ τρίτον Ὀλυμπικῶς τῷ σωτῆρί τε καὶ τῷ Ὀλυμπίῳ Διί, ἄθρει ὅτι οὐδὲ παναληθής ἐστιν ἡ τῶν ἄλλων ἡδονὴ πλὴν τῆς τοῦ φρονίμου οὐδὲ καθαρά, ἀλλ' ἐσκιαγραφημένη τις, ὡς ἐγὼ δοκῶ μοι τῶν σοφῶν τινος ἀκηκοέναι. καίτοι τοῦτ' ἂν εἴη μέγιστόν τε καὶ κυριώτατον τῶν πτωμάτων.	**SOCRATES** "So that makes two in a row, and twice the just man has beaten the unjust. Now for the third, Olympic-style, to Zeus the Savior and Olympian: note that, apart from the pleasure of the man of understanding, the pleasure of the others isn't wholly true or pure, but a kind of shadow-painting, as I think I've heard from one of the wise. And yet this would be the greatest and most decisive of the falls."
πολύ γε· ἀλλὰ πῶς λέγεις; 583c	"By far. But what do you mean?" 583c
ὦδ', εἶπον, ἐξευρήσω, σοῦ ἀποκρινομένου ζητῶν ἅμα.	"I'll find it out," I said, "if I search while you answer."
Ἐρώτα δή, ἔφη.	"Ask away, then," he said.[5]
583c λέγε δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· οὐκ ἐναντίον φαμὲν λύπην ἡδονῇ;	"Tell me, then," I said. "Don't we say that pain is the opposite of pleasure?"
καὶ μάλα.	"Certainly."
οὐκοῦν καὶ τὸ μήτε χαίρειν μήτε λυπεῖσθαι εἶναί τι;	"And that there is such a thing as feeling neither enjoyment nor pain?"
εἶναι μέντοι.	"There is."
μεταξὺ τούτοιν ἀμφοῖν ἐν μέσῳ ὂν ἡσυχίαν τινὰ περὶ ταῦτα τῆς ψυχῆς; ἢ οὐχ οὕτως αὐτὸ λέγεις;	"Lying in the middle between the two—a kind of calm of the soul with respect to them? Or isn't that how you'd put it?"
οὕτως, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"That's how," he said.
ἆρ' οὖν μνημονεύεις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοὺς τῶν καμνόντων λόγους, οὓς λέγουσιν ὅταν κάμνωσιν;	"Now do you remember," I said, "what sick people say when they're ill?"
ποίους;	
ὡς οὐδὲν ἄρα ἐστὶν ἥδιον τοῦ ὑγιαίνειν, ἀλλὰ σφᾶς 583d ἐλελήθει, πρὶν κάμνειν, ἥδιστον ὄν.	

5 The third libation at a feast was poured to Zeus the Savior; and a wrestler won by throwing his opponent three times.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	μέμνημαι, ἔφη.	"What?"
		"That nothing, it turns out, is more pleasant than being healthy, but that [583d] before they fell ill they hadn't noticed it was the most pleasant thing."
		"I remember," he said.
583d	οὐκοῦν καὶ τῶν περιωδυνίᾳ τινὶ ἐχομένων ἀκούεις λεγόντων ὡς οὐδὲν ἥδιον τοῦ παύσασθαι ὀδυνώμενον;	"And you hear people in severe pain saying that nothing is more pleasant than for the pain to stop?"
	ἀκούω.	"I do."
	καὶ ἐν ἄλλοις γε οἶμαι πολλοῖς τοιούτοις αἰσθάνῃ γιγνομένους τοὺς ἀνθρώπους, ἐν οἷς, ὅταν λυπῶνται, τὸ μὴ λυπεῖσθαι καὶ τὴν ἡσυχίαν τοῦ τοιούτου ἐγκωμιάζουσιν ὡς ἥδιστον, οὐ τὸ χαίρειν.	"And I think you notice people in many other situations like these, where, when they're in pain, it's not feeling pain, and the calm that comes with it, that they praise as most pleasant—not enjoyment."
	τοῦτο γάρ, ἔφη, τότε ἡδὺ ἴσως καὶ ἀγαπητὸν γίγνεται, ἡσυχία. [583e]	"Yes," he said, "because at such times, perhaps, calm does become pleasant and welcome." [583e]
	καὶ ὅταν παύσηται ἄρα, εἶπον, χαίρων τις, ἡ τῆς ἡδονῆς ἡσυχία λυπηρὸν ἔσται.	"And so when someone stops enjoying himself," I said, "the calm after pleasure will be painful."
	ἴσως, ἔφη.	"Perhaps," he said.
583e	ὃ μεταξὺ ἄρα νυνδὴ ἀμφοτέρων ἔφαμεν εἶναι, τὴν ἡσυχίαν, τοῦτό ποτε ἀμφότερα ἔσται, λύπη τε καὶ ἡδονή.	"So what we said just now lay between the two—the calm—will at times be both, pain and pleasure."
	ἔοικεν.	"It seems so."
	ἦ καὶ δυνατὸν τὸ μηδέτερα ὂν ἀμφότερα γίγνεσθαι;	"But can what is neither become both?"
	οὔ μοι δοκεῖ.	"I don't think so."
	καὶ μὴν τό γε ἡδὺ ἐν ψυχῇ γιγνόμενον καὶ τὸ λυπηρὸν κίνησίς τις ἀμφοτέρω ἐστόν· ἢ οὔ;	"And further, pleasure and pain, when they arise in the soul, are both a kind of motion, aren't they?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	τὸ δὲ μήτε λυπηρὸν μήτε ἡδὺ οὐχὶ ἡσυχία μέντοι καὶ ἐν μέσῳ τούτοιν ἐφάνη ἄρτι;	"And didn't what is neither painful nor pleasant turn out just now to be a calm, lying in the middle between these two?"
	ἐφάνη γάρ.	"It did."
	πῶς οὖν ὀρθῶς ἔστι τὸ μὴ ἀλγεῖν ἡδὺ ἡγεῖσθαι ἢ τὸ μὴ χαίρειν ἀνιαρόν;	"Then how can it be right to think that not being in pain is pleasant, or that not enjoying oneself is distressing?"
	οὐδαμῶς.	"It can't."
584a	οὐκ ἔστιν ἄρα τοῦτο, ἀλλὰ φαίνεται, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, παρὰ τὸ ἀλγεινὸν ἡδὺ καὶ παρὰ τὸ ἡδὺ ἀλγεινὸν τότε ἡ ἡσυχία, καὶ οὐδὲν ὑγιὲς τούτων τῶν φαντασμάτων πρὸς ἡδονῆς ἀλήθειαν, ἀλλὰ γοητεία τις.	"So it isn't so," I said. "Rather, the calm at such times appears pleasant beside what is painful, and painful beside what is pleasant, and there's nothing sound in these appearances as regards the truth about pleasure; it's a kind of sorcery."
	ὡς γοῦν ὁ λόγος, ἔφη, σημαίνει. [584b]	"So the argument indicates, at any rate," he said. [584b]
	ἰδὲ τοίνυν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἡδονάς, αἳ οὐκ ἐκ λυπῶν εἰσίν, ἵνα μὴ πολλάκις οἰηθῇς ἐν τῷ παρόντι οὕτω τοῦτο πεφυκέναι, ἡδονὴν μὲν παῦλαν λύπης εἶναι, λύπην δὲ ἡδονῆς.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ποῦ δή, ἔφη, καὶ ποίας λέγεις;	"Then look at pleasures that don't come out of pains," I said, "so that you won't happen to suppose, in the present case, that it's the nature of things for pleasure to be the cessation of pain, and pain the cessation of pleasure." "Where are these," he said, "and which pleasures do you mean?"
584b	πολλαὶ μέν, εἶπον, καὶ ἄλλαι, μάλιστα δ' εἰ ᾽θέλεις ἐννοῆσαι τὰς περὶ τὰς ὀσμὰς ἡδονάς. αὗται γὰρ οὐ προλυπηθέντι ἐξαίφνης ἀμήχανοι τὸ μέγεθος γίγνονται, παυσάμεναί τε λύπην οὐδεμίαν καταλείπουσιν. ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη. 584c μὴ ἄρα πειθώμεθα καθαρὰν ἡδονὴν εἶναι τὴν λύπης ἀπαλλαγήν, μηδὲ λύπην τὴν ἡδονῆς. μὴ γάρ. ἀλλὰ μέντοι, εἶπον, αἵ γε διὰ τοῦ σώματος ἐπὶ τὴν ψυχὴν τείνουσαι καὶ λεγόμεναι ἡδοναί, σχεδὸν αἱ πλεῖσταί τε καὶ μέγισται, τούτου τοῦ εἴδους εἰσί, λυπῶν τινες ἀπαλλαγαί. εἰσὶ γάρ.	"There are many others," I said, "but consider especially, if you like, the pleasures of smell. These arise suddenly, with no prior pain, and are of extraordinary intensity, and when they stop they leave no pain behind." "Very true," he said. 584c "Then let's not be persuaded that release from pain is pure pleasure, or that release from pleasure is pain." "No, let's not." "And yet," I said, "the so-called pleasures that reach the soul through the body—pretty much the most numerous and the greatest of them—are of this kind: releases of some sort from pain." "Yes, they are."
584c	οὐκοῦν καὶ αἱ πρὸ μελλόντων τούτων ἐκ προσδοκίας γιγνόμεναι προησθήσεις τε καὶ προλυπήσεις κατὰ ταὐτὰ ἔχουσιν; κατὰ ταὐτά. 584d οἶσθ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οἷαί εἰσιν καὶ ᾧ μάλιστα ἐοίκασιν; τῷ; ἔφη. νομίζεις τι, εἶπον, ἐν τῇ φύσει εἶναι τὸ μὲν ἄνω, τὸ δὲ κάτω, τὸ δὲ μέσον; ἔγωγε.	"And the anticipatory pleasures and pains that arise from expecting these things beforehand are the same way?" "The same." 584d "Now do you know," I said, "what they're like, and what they most resemble?" "What?" he said. "Do you think," I said, "that in nature there is an up, a down, and a middle?" "I do."
584d	οἴει οὖν ἄν τινα ἐκ τοῦ κάτω φερόμενον πρὸς μέσον ἄλλο τι οἴεσθαι ἢ ἄνω φέρεσθαι; καὶ ἐν μέσῳ στάντα, ἀφορῶντα ὅθεν ἐνήνεκται, ἄλλοθί που ἂν ἡγεῖσθαι εἶναι ἢ ἐν τῷ ἄνω, μὴ ἑωρακότα τὸ ἀληθῶς ἄνω; μὰ Δί', οὐκ ἔγωγε, ἔφη, ἄλλως οἶμαι οἰηθῆναι ἂν τὸν τοιοῦτον. 584e ἀλλ' εἰ πάλιν γ', ἔφην, φέροιτο, κάτω τ' ἂν οἴοιτο φέρεσθαι καὶ ἀληθῆ οἴοιτο; πῶς γὰρ οὔ; οὐκοῦν ταῦτα πάσχοι ἂν πάντα διὰ τὸ μὴ ἔμπειρος εἶναι τοῦ ἀληθινῶς ἄνω τε ὄντος καὶ ἐν μέσῳ καὶ κάτω;	"Then do you think that someone being carried from down below to the middle would think anything other than that he was being carried up? And standing in the middle and looking back at where he'd been carried from, would he think he was anywhere but up, never having seen what is truly up?" "By Zeus," he said, "I don't think such a person would think anything else." 584e "And if he were carried back again," I said, "he'd think he was being carried down, and he'd be right?"

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"Of course." "And he'd go through all this because he has no experience of what is truly up and middle and down?"
584e	δῆλον δή. θαυμάζοις ἂν οὖν εἰ καὶ οἱ ἄπειροι ἀληθείας περὶ πολλῶν τε ἄλλων μὴ ὑγιεῖς δόξας ἔχουσιν, πρός τε ἡδονὴν καὶ λύπην καὶ τὸ μεταξὺ τούτων οὕτω διάκεινται, ὥστε, ὅταν μὲν ἐπὶ τὸ 585a λυπηρὸν φέρωνται, ἀληθῆ τε οἴονται καὶ τῷ ὄντι λυποῦνται, ὅταν δὲ ἀπὸ λύπης ἐπὶ τὸ μεταξύ, σφόδρα μὲν οἴονται πρὸς πληρώσει τε καὶ ἡδονῇ γίγνεσθαι, ὥσπερ πρὸς μέλαν φαιὸν ἀποσκοποῦντες ἀπειρίᾳ λευκοῦ, καὶ πρὸς τὸ ἄλυπον οὕτω λύπην ἀφορῶντες ἀπειρίᾳ ἡδονῆς ἀπατῶνται;	"Clearly." "Then would you be surprised if people without experience of truth, just as they hold unsound opinions about many other things, are also so disposed toward pleasure and pain and what lies between them that when they're carried to the 585a painful, they think truly and really are in pain; but when they're carried from pain to the middle, they firmly believe they're arriving at fulfillment and pleasure? Like people who, having no experience of white, look at gray against black, they look at painlessness against pain and are deceived, having no experience of pleasure."
585a	μὰ Δία, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐκ ἂν θαυμάσαιμι, ἀλλὰ πολὺ μᾶλλον, εἰ μὴ οὕτως ἔχει. ὧδέ γ' οὖν, εἶπον, ἐννόει· οὐχὶ πεῖνα καὶ δίψα καὶ τὰ 585b τοιαῦτα κενώσεις τινές εἰσιν τῆς περὶ τὸ σῶμα ἕξεως; τί μήν; ἄγνοια δὲ καὶ ἀφροσύνη ἆρ' οὐ κενότης ἐστὶ γῆς περὶ ψυχὴν αὖ ἕξεως; μάλα γε. οὐκοῦν πληροῖτ' ἂν ὅ τε τροφῆς μεταλαμβάνων καὶ ὁ νοῦν ἴσχων; πῶς δ' οὔ; πλήρωσις δὲ ἀληθεστέρα τοῦ ἧττον ἢ τοῦ μᾶλλον ὄντος; δῆλον ὅτι τοῦ μᾶλλον.	"By Zeus," he said, "I wouldn't be surprised—I'd be much more surprised if it weren't so." "Well, think of it this way," I said. "Aren't hunger and thirst and the 585b like kinds of emptiness in the condition of the body?" "Of course." "And aren't ignorance and folly, in turn, emptiness in the condition of the soul?" "Very much so." "And the one who takes in food and the one who acquires understanding are both filled?" "Of course." "And is the truer filling with what has less being, or with what has more?" "Clearly with what has more."
585b	πότερα οὖν ἡγῇ τὰ γένη μᾶλλον καθαρᾶς οὐσίας μετέχειν, τὰ οἷον σίτου τε καὶ ποτοῦ καὶ ὄψου καὶ συμπάσης τροφῆς, ἢ τὸ δόξης τε ἀληθοῦς εἶδος καὶ ἐπιστήμης καὶ νοῦ καὶ 585c συλλήβδην αὖ πάσης ἀρετῆς; ὧδε δὲ κρῖνε· τὸ τοῦ ἀεὶ ὁμοίου ἐχόμενον καὶ ἀθανάτου καὶ ἀληθείας, καὶ αὐτὸ τοιοῦτον ὂν καὶ ἐν τοιούτῳ γιγνόμενον, μᾶλλον εἶναί σοι δοκεῖ, ἢ τὸ μηδέποτε ὁμοίου καὶ θνητοῦ, καὶ αὐτὸ τοιοῦτον καὶ ἐν τοιούτῳ γιγνόμενον; πολύ, ἔφη, διαφέρει τὸ τοῦ ἀεὶ ὁμοίου.	"Then which kinds of things do you think have a greater share in pure being: things like bread and drink and relish and all nourishment, or the kind that consists of true opinion and knowledge and understanding and, 585c in sum, all excellence? Judge it this way. What is bound up with what is always the same, and immortal, and with truth, and is itself of that sort and comes to be in something of that sort—does that seem to you to have more being than what is bound up with what is never the same, and mortal, and is itself of that sort and comes to be in something of that sort?"

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		"What is bound up with what is always the same," he said, "is far superior."
585c	ἡ οὖν ἀεὶ ὁμοίου οὐσία οὐσίας τι μᾶλλον ἢ ἐπιστήμης μετέχει;	"Then does the being of what is always the same have any more share in being than in knowledge?"
	οὐδαμῶς.	"Not at all."
	τί δ'; ἀληθείας;	"What about truth?"
	οὐδὲ τοῦτο.	"Not in that either."
	εἰ δὲ ἀληθείας ἧττον, οὐ καὶ οὐσίας;	"And if it had less share in truth, wouldn't it have less in being too?"
	ἀνάγκη. 585d	"Necessarily." 585d
	οὐκοῦν ὅλως τὰ περὶ τὴν τοῦ σώματος θεραπείαν γένη τῶν γενῶν αὖ τῶν περὶ τὴν τῆς ψυχῆς θεραπείαν ἧττον ἀληθείας τε καὶ οὐσίας μετέχει;	"So in general, don't the kinds of things that serve the care of the body have less share in truth and being than those that serve the care of the soul?"
	πολύ γε.	"Much less."
	σῶμα δὲ αὐτὸ ψυχῆς οὐκ οἴει οὕτως;	"And don't you think the same holds of the body itself compared with the soul?"
	ἔγωγε.	"I do."
585d	οὐκοῦν τὸ τῶν μᾶλλον ὄντων πληρούμενον καὶ αὐτὸ μᾶλλον ὂν ὄντως μᾶλλον πληροῦται ἢ τὸ τῶν ἧττον ὄντων καὶ αὐτὸ ἧττον ὄν;	"And isn't what is filled with things that have more being, and has more being itself, more really filled than what is filled with things that have less being and has less being itself?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
	εἰ ἄρα τὸ πληροῦσθαι τῶν φύσει προσηκόντων ἡδύ ἐστι, τὸ τῷ ὄντι καὶ τῶν ὄντων πληρούμενον μᾶλλον μᾶλλον 585e ὄντως τε καὶ ἀληθεστέρως χαίρειν ἂν ποιοῖ ἡδονῇ ἀληθεῖ, τὸ δὲ τῶν ἧττον ὄντων μεταλαμβάνον ἧττόν τε ἂν ἀληθῶς καὶ βεβαίως πληροῖτο καὶ ἀπιστοτέρας ἂν ἡδονῆς καὶ ἧττον ἀληθοῦς μεταλαμβάνοι.	"So if being filled with what suits one's nature is pleasant, then what is more really filled, and with things that have more being, would make one more 585e really and truly enjoy a true pleasure; while what takes in things that have less being would be less truly and less securely filled, and would get a share of a less trustworthy and less true pleasure."
	ἀναγκαιότατα, ἔφη.	"Quite necessarily," he said.
586a	οἱ ἄρα φρονήσεως καὶ ἀρετῆς ἄπειροι, εὐωχίαις δὲ καὶ τοῖς τοιούτοις ἀεὶ συνόντες, κάτω, ὡς ἔοικεν, καὶ μέχρι πάλιν πρὸς τὸ μεταξὺ φέρονταί τε καὶ ταύτῃ πλανῶνται διὰ βίου, ὑπερβάντες δὲ τοῦτο πρὸς τὸ ἀληθῶς ἄνω οὔτε ἀνέβλεψαν πώποτε οὔτε ἠνέχθησαν, οὐδὲ τοῦ ὄντος τῷ ὄντι ἐπληρώθησαν, οὐδὲ βεβαίου τε καὶ καθαρᾶς ἡδονῆς ἐγεύσαντο, ἀλλὰ βοσκημάτων δίκην κάτω ἀεὶ βλέποντες καὶ κεκυφότες εἰς γῆν καὶ εἰς τραπέζας βόσκονται χορταζόμενοι καὶ ὀχεύοντες, 586b καὶ ἕνεκα τῆς τούτων πλεονεξίας λακτίζοντες καὶ κυρίττοντες ἀλλήλους σιδηροῖς κέρασί τε καὶ ὁπλαῖς ἀποκτεινύασι δι' ἀπληστίαν, ἅτε οὐχὶ τοῖς οὖσιν οὐδὲ τὸ ὂν οὐδὲ τὸ στέγον ἑαυτῶν πιμπλάντες.	"So those without experience of understanding and excellence, who are always busy with feasting and the like, are carried down, it seems, and then back up as far as the middle, and they wander this way all their lives. They've never passed beyond this to what is truly up—never looked up at it or been carried there—never been filled with what really is, and never tasted secure and pure pleasure. Instead, like cattle, always looking down, heads bent to the ground and to their tables, they graze, fattening themselves and mating; 586b and in their greed for more of these things they kick and butt one another with horns and hooves of iron, and kill each other because they can never be sat-

	GREEK	ENGLISH
		isfied, since they don't fill the real part of themselves, the part that can hold them, with things that are real."
586b	παντελῶς, ἔφη ὁ Γλαύκων, τὸν τῶν πολλῶν, ὦ Σώκρατες, χρησμῳδεῖς βίον.	"Socrates," said Glaucon, "you're describing the life of the many exactly, like an oracle."
	ἆρ' οὖν οὐκ ἀνάγκη καὶ ἡδοναῖς συνεῖναι μεμειγμέναις λύπαις, εἰδώλοις τῆς ἀληθοῦς ἡδονῆς καὶ ἐσκιαγραφημέναις, 586c ὑπὸ τῆς παρ' ἀλλήλας θέσεως ἀποχραινομέναις, ὥστε σφοδροὺς ἑκατέρας φαίνεσθαι, καὶ ἔρωτας ἑαυτῶν λυττῶντας τοῖς ἄφροσιν ἐντίκτειν καὶ περιμαχήτους εἶναι, ὥσπερ τὸ τῆς Ἑλένης εἴδωλον ὑπὸ τῶν ἐν Τροίᾳ Στησίχορός φησι γενέσθαι περιμάχητον ἀγνοίᾳ τοῦ ἀληθοῦς;	"Then aren't they bound to live with pleasures mixed with pains—phantoms of true pleasure, shadow-paintings, 586c colored by being set beside one another, so that each seems intense—and to breed mad passions for themselves in the foolish, and to be fought over, just as Stesichorus says the phantom of Helen was fought over by the men at Troy, in ignorance of the truth?"
	πολλὴ ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, τοιοῦτόν τι αὐτὸ εἶναι.	"Something like that," he said, "is quite inevitable."[6]
586c	τί δέ; περὶ τὸ θυμοειδὲς οὐχ ἕτερα τοιαῦτα ἀνάγκη γίγνεσθαι, ὃς ἂν αὐτὸ τοῦτο διαπράττηται ἢ φθόνῳ διὰ φιλοτιμίαν ἢ βίᾳ διὰ φιλονικίαν ἢ θυμῷ διὰ δυσκολίαν, 586d πλησμονὴν τιμῆς τε καὶ νίκης καὶ θυμοῦ διώκων ἄνευ λογισμοῦ τε καὶ νοῦ;	"And what about the spirited part? Isn't the same sort of thing bound to happen to anyone who gives it full play—through envy prompted by love of honor, or violence prompted by love of victory, or anger prompted by bad temper— 586d pursuing his fill of honor and victory and anger without reasoning or understanding?"
	τοιαῦτα, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἀνάγκη καὶ περὶ τοῦτο εἶναι.	"The same sort of thing," he said, "is bound to happen with this part too."
586d	τί οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· θαρροῦντες λέγωμεν ὅτι καὶ περὶ τὸ φιλοκερδὲς καὶ τὸ φιλόνικον ὅσαι ἐπιθυμίαι εἰσίν, αἳ μὲν ἂν τῇ ἐπιστήμῃ καὶ λόγῳ ἑπόμεναι καὶ μετὰ τούτων τὰς ἡδονὰς διώκουσαι, ἃς ἂν τὸ φρόνιμον ἐξηγῆται, λαμβάνωσι, τὰς ἀληθεστάτας τε λήψονται, ὡς οἷόν τε αὐταῖς ἀληθεῖς 586e λαβεῖν, ἅτε ἀληθείᾳ ἑπομένων, καὶ τὰς ἑαυτῶν οἰκείας, εἴπερ τὸ βέλτιστον ἑκάστῳ, τοῦτο καὶ οἰκειότατον;	"Well then," I said, "may we confidently say that even the desires connected with the profit-loving and victory-loving parts, if they follow knowledge and reason and pursue with them the pleasures that the part with understanding directs them to, will obtain the truest pleasures, so far as they can obtain true ones, 586e since they follow truth—and the pleasures that are their own, if what is best for each thing is also most its own?"
	ἀλλὰ μήν, ἔφη, οἰκειότατόν γε.	"It certainly is most its own," he said.
586e	τῷ φιλοσόφῳ ἄρα ἑπομένης ἁπάσης τῆς ψυχῆς καὶ μὴ στασιαζούσης ἑκάστῳ τῷ μέρει ὑπάρχει εἴς τε τἆλλα τὰ ἑαυτοῦ πράττειν καὶ δικαίῳ εἶναι, καὶ δὴ καὶ τὰς ἡδονὰς τὰς ἑαυτοῦ ἕκαστον καὶ τὰς βελτίστας καὶ εἰς τὸ δυνατὸν τὰς 587a ἀληθεστάτας καρποῦσθαι.	"So when the whole soul follows the philosophic part and isn't in conflict with itself, each part can do its own work in every other respect and be just, and in particular each can enjoy its own pleasures, the best pleasures and, so far as possible, the 587a truest."
	κομιδῇ μὲν οὖν.	"Exactly."
	ὅταν δὲ ἄρα τῶν ἑτέρων τι κρατήσῃ, ὑπάρχει αὐτῷ μήτε τὴν ἑαυτοῦ ἡδονὴν ἐξευρίσκειν, τά τε ἄλλ' ἀναγκάζειν ἀλλοτρίαν καὶ μὴ ἀληθῆ ἡδονὴν διώκειν.	"But when one of the other parts gains control, the result is that it can't find its own pleasure, and it

6 Stesichorus, a Sicilian poet of the sixth century BC, wrote that only a phantom of Helen went to Troy, while she herself stayed in Egypt.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	οὕτως, ἔφη.	compels the other parts to pursue a pleasure that is alien to them and not true."
	οὐκοῦν ἃ πλεῖστον φιλοσοφίας τε καὶ λόγου ἀφέστηκεν, μάλιστ' ἂν τοιαῦτα ἐξεργάζοιτο;	"That's so," he said.
	πολύ γε.	"And wouldn't what stands furthest from philosophy and reason be most likely to produce such effects?"
		"By far."
587a	πλεῖστον δὲ λόγου ἀφίσταται οὐχ ὅπερ νόμου τε καὶ τάξεως;	"And isn't what stands furthest from reason what stands furthest from law and order?"
	δῆλον δή.	"Clearly."
	ἐφάνησαν δὲ πλεῖστον ἀφεστῶσαι οὐχ αἱ ἐρωτικαί τε 587b καὶ τυραννικαὶ ἐπιθυμίαι;	"And didn't the erotic and 587b tyrannical desires turn out to stand furthest off?"
	πολύ γε.	"By far."
	ἐλάχιστον δὲ αἱ βασιλικαί τε καὶ κόσμιαι;	"And the kingly and orderly ones least far?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	πλεῖστον δὴ οἶμαι ἀληθοῦς ἡδονῆς καὶ οἰκείας ὁ τύραννος ἀφεστήξει, ὁ δὲ ὀλίγιστον.	"Then the tyrant, I think, will stand furthest from true pleasure, the pleasure that is his own, and the king least far."
	ἀνάγκη.	"Necessarily."
	καὶ ἀηδέστατα ἄρα, εἶπον, ὁ τύραννος βιώσεται, ὁ δὲ βασιλεὺς ἥδιστα.	"And so the tyrant will live most unpleasantly," I said, "and the king most pleasantly."
	πολλὴ ἀνάγκη.	"Quite necessarily."
	οἶσθ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅσῳ ἀηδέστερον ζῇ τύραννος βασιλέως;	"Then do you know," I said, "how much more unpleasantly the tyrant lives than the king?"
	ἂν εἴπῃς, ἔφη.	"I will if you tell me," he said.
587b	τριῶν ἡδονῶν, ὡς ἔοικεν, οὐσῶν, μιᾶς μὲν γνησίας, δυοῖν 587c δὲ νόθαιν, τῶν νόθων εἰς τὸ ἐπέκεινα ὑπερβὰς ὁ τύραννος, φυγὼν νόμον τε καὶ λόγον, δούλαις τισὶ δορυφόροις ἡδοναῖς συνοικεῖ, καὶ ὁπόσῳ ἐλαττοῦται οὐδὲ πάνυ ῥᾴδιον εἰπεῖν, πλὴν ἴσως ὧδε.	"There are three pleasures, it seems: one genuine and two 587c bastard. The tyrant has gone beyond the bastard ones to the far side, fleeing law and reason, and lives with certain slavish pleasures as his bodyguard. Just how much worse off he is isn't at all easy to say, except perhaps this way."
	πῶς; ἔφη.	"How?" he said.
	ἀπὸ τοῦ ὀλιγαρχικοῦ τρίτος που ὁ τύραννος ἀφειστήκει· ἐν μέσῳ γὰρ αὐτῶν ὁ δημοτικὸς ἦν.	"The tyrant stood third from the oligarchic man, I think, since the democratic man was between them."
	ναί.	"Yes."
	οὐκοῦν καὶ ἡδονῆς τρίτῳ εἰδώλῳ πρὸς ἀλήθειαν ἀπ' ἐκείνου συνοικοῖ ἄν, εἰ τὰ πρόσθεν ἀληθῆ;	"Then if what we said before is true, the phantom of pleasure he lives with would also be third from the oligarch's in point of truth?"
	οὕτω.	"That's right."
587c	ὁ δέ γε ὀλιγαρχικὸς ἀπὸ τοῦ βασιλικοῦ αὖ τρίτος, ἐὰν 587d εἰς ταὐτὸν ἀριστοκρατικὸν καὶ βασιλικὸν τιθῶμεν.	"And the oligarchic man in turn is third from the kingly one, if 587d we count the aristocratic and the kingly as the same."
	τρίτος γάρ.	

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τριπλασίου ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τριπλάσιον ἀριθμῷ ἀληθοῦς ἡδονῆς ἀφέστηκεν τύραννος.	"Yes, third."
	φαίνεται.	"So the tyrant stands removed from true pleasure," I said, "by a number that is three times three."
	ἐπίπεδον ἄρ', ἔφην, ὡς ἔοικεν, τὸ εἴδωλον κατὰ τὸν τοῦ μήκους ἀριθμὸν ἡδονῆς τυραννικῆς ἂν εἴη.	"It seems so."
	κομιδῇ γε.	"Then the phantom of tyrannical pleasure, it seems," I said, "would be a plane figure, as measured by the number of its length."
	κατὰ δὲ δύναμιν καὶ τρίτην αὔξην δῆλον δὴ ἀπόστασιν ὅσην ἀφεστηκὼς γίγνεται.	"Exactly."
	δῆλον, ἔφη, τῷ γε λογιστικῷ.	"And by squaring and then raising to the third dimension, it's clear how great a distance separates him."
		"It's clear," he said, "to someone good at calculating, anyway."
587d	οὐκοῦν ἐάν τις μεταστρέψας ἀληθείᾳ ἡδονῆς τὸν βασιλέα [587e] τοῦ τυράννου ἀφεστηκότα λέγῃ ὅσον ἀφέστηκεν, ἐννεακαιεικοσικαιεπτακοσιοπλασιάκις ἥδιον αὐτὸν ζῶντα εὑρήσει τελειωθείσῃ τῇ πολλαπλασιώσει, τὸν δὲ τύραννον ἀνιαρότερον τῇ αὐτῇ ταύτῃ ἀποστάσει.	"So if someone turns it around and says how far the king [587e] stands from the tyrant in truth of pleasure, he'll find, when the multiplication is complete, that the king lives seven hundred and twenty-nine times more pleasantly, and the tyrant more painfully by that same distance."
	ἀμήχανον, ἔφη, λογισμὸν καταπεφόρηκας τῆς διαφορότητος [588a] τοῖν ἀνδροῖν, τοῦ τε δικαίου καὶ τοῦ ἀδίκου, πρὸς ἡδονήν τε καὶ λύπην.	"What a staggering calculation you've heaped up," he said, "of the difference [588a] between the two men, the just and the unjust, in pleasure and pain!"
	καὶ μέντοι καὶ ἀληθῆ καὶ προσήκοντά γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, βίοις ἀριθμόν, εἴπερ αὐτοῖς προσήκουσιν ἡμέραι καὶ νύκτες καὶ μῆνες καὶ ἐνιαυτοί.	"And yet it's a true number," I said, "and one that fits their lives, if days and nights and months and years fit them."
	ἀλλὰ μήν, ἔφη, προσήκουσιν.	"They certainly do," he said.[7]

THE MANY-HEADED BEAST

Socrates pictures the soul as a many-headed beast, a lion and a man to show injustice never pays.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
588a	**SOCRATES** οὐκοῦν εἰ τοσοῦτον ἡδονῇ νικᾷ ὁ ἀγαθός τε καὶ δίκαιος τὸν κακόν τε καὶ ἄδικον, ἀμηχάνῳ δὴ ὅσῳ πλείονι νικήσει εὐσχημοσύνῃ τε βίου καὶ κάλλει καὶ ἀρετῇ;	**SOCRATES** "So if the good and just man beats the bad and unjust man by that much in pleasure, won't he beat him by an incalculably greater margin in grace of life, and in beauty and excellence?"
	ἀμηχάνῳ μέντοι νὴ Δία, ἔφη. [588b]	"Incalculably greater, by Zeus," he said. [588b]
	εἶεν δή, εἶπον· ἐπειδὴ ἐνταῦθα λόγου γεγόναμεν, ἀναλάβωμεν τὰ πρῶτα λεχθέντα, δι' ἃ δεῦρ' ἥκομεν. ἦν δέ που λεγόμενον λυσιτελεῖν ἀδικεῖν τῷ τελέως μὲν ἀδίκῳ, δοξαζομένῳ δὲ δικαίῳ· ἢ οὐχ οὕτως ἐλέχθη;	"Well then," I said, "since we've reached this point in the argument, let's take up again what was said at the start, which brought us here. It was said, I think, that injustice pays for someone who is completely unjust but has a reputation for justice. Or wasn't that how it was put?"
	οὕτω μὲν οὖν.	"It certainly was."

7 9 cubed is 729, roughly the number of days and nights in a year—hence Socrates' closing remark.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	νῦν δή, ἔφην, αὐτῷ διαλεγώμεθα, ἐπειδὴ διωμολογησάμεθα τό τε ἀδικεῖν καὶ τὸ δίκαια πράττειν ἣν ἑκάτερον ἔχει δύναμιν.	"Then let's talk with the man who said it," I said, "now that we've agreed on the power that doing injustice and doing just things each have."
588b	πῶς; ἔφη.	"How?" he said.
	εἰκόνα πλάσαντες τῆς ψυχῆς λόγῳ, ἵνα εἰδῇ ὁ ἐκεῖνα λέγων οἷα ἔλεγεν. 588c	"By molding an image of the soul in words, so that the one who said those things will see what he was saying." 588c
	ποίαν τινά; ἦ δ' ὅς.	"What sort of image?" he said.
	τῶν τοιούτων τινά, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οἷαι μυθολογοῦνται παλαιαὶ γενέσθαι φύσεις, ἥ τε Χιμαίρας καὶ ἡ Σκύλλης καὶ Κερβέρου, καὶ ἄλλαι τινὲς συχναὶ λέγονται συμπεφυκυῖαι ἰδέαι πολλαὶ εἰς ἓν γενέσθαι.	"One like the creatures the old stories say existed," I said, "such as the Chimera, Scylla and Cerberus, and a great many others in which several shapes are said to have grown together into one."
	λέγονται γάρ, ἔφη.	"Yes, so they say," he said.
	πλάττε τοίνυν μίαν μὲν ἰδέαν θηρίου ποικίλου καὶ πολυκεφάλου, ἡμέρων δὲ θηρίων ἔχοντος κεφαλὰς κύκλῳ καὶ ἀγρίων, καὶ δυνατοῦ μεταβάλλειν καὶ φύειν ἐξ αὐτοῦ πάντα ταῦτα. 588d	"Then mold a single shape of a many-colored, many-headed beast, with a ring of heads of tame and wild animals, which it can change and grow out of itself, all of them." 588d [8]
588d	δεινοῦ πλάστου, ἔφη, τὸ ἔργον· ὅμως δέ, ἐπειδὴ εὐπλαστότερον κηροῦ καὶ τῶν τοιούτων λόγος, πεπλάσθω.	"That's a job for a skilled sculptor," he said. "Still, since words are easier to mold than wax and the like, consider it molded."
	μίαν δὴ τοίνυν ἄλλην ἰδέαν λέοντος, μίαν δὲ ἀνθρώπου· πολὺ δὲ μέγιστον ἔστω τὸ πρῶτον καὶ δεύτερον τὸ δεύτερον.	"Now mold one other shape, a lion's, and one of a human being. Let the first be by far the largest, and the second second."
	ταῦτα, ἔφη, ῥᾴω, καὶ πέπλασται.	"Those are easier," he said, "and they're molded."
	σύναπτε τοίνυν αὐτὰ εἰς ἓν τρία ὄντα, ὥστε πῃ συμπεφυκέναι ἀλλήλοις.	"Now join the three into one, so that they somehow grow together with one another."
	συνῆπται, ἔφη.	"They're joined," he said.
	περίπλασον δὴ αὐτοῖς ἔξωθεν ἑνὸς εἰκόνα, τὴν τοῦ ἀνθρώπου, ὥστε τῷ μὴ δυναμένῳ τὰ ἐντὸς ὁρᾶν, ἀλλὰ τὸ 588e ἔξω μόνον ἔλυτρον ὁρῶντι, ἓν ζῷον φαίνεσθαι, ἄνθρωπον.	"Now mold around them on the outside the image of one of them, the human being, so that to anyone who can't see what's inside, but sees only the 588e outer shell, it looks like a single creature, a human being."
	περιπέπλασται, ἔφη.	"It's molded around them," he said.
588e	λέγωμεν δὴ τῷ λέγοντι ὡς λυσιτελεῖ τούτῳ ἀδικεῖν τῷ ἀνθρώπῳ, δίκαια δὲ πράττειν οὐ συμφέρει, ὅτι οὐδὲν ἄλλο φησὶν ἢ λυσιτελεῖν αὐτῷ τὸ παντοδαπὸν θηρίον εὐωχοῦντι ποιεῖν ἰσχυρὸν καὶ τὸν λέοντα καὶ τὰ περὶ τὸν λέοντα, τὸν 589a δὲ ἄνθρωπον λιμοκτονεῖν καὶ ποιεῖν ἀσθενῆ, ὥστε ἕλκεσθαι ὅπῃ ἂν ἐκείνων ὁπότερον ἄγῃ, καὶ μηδὲν ἕτερον ἑτέρῳ συνεθίζειν μηδὲ φίλον ποιεῖν, ἀλλ' ἐᾶν αὐτὰ ἐν αὐτοῖς δάκνεσθαί τε καὶ μαχόμενα ἐσθίειν ἄλληλα.	"Then let's tell whoever says it pays this human being to do wrong, and that doing just things doesn't benefit him, that he is saying nothing other than this: that it pays him to feast the many-sided beast and make it strong, and the lion and all that belongs to the lion too, while he starves 589a the human being and makes him weak, so that he gets dragged wherever either of the other two leads; and that he shouldn't accustom them to one

8 The Chimera was part lion, part goat, part serpent; Scylla, a sea monster with dogs' heads; Cerberus, the many-headed dog guarding Hades.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	παντάπασι γάρ, ἔφη, ταῦτ' ἂν λέγοι ὁ τὸ ἀδικεῖν ἐπαινῶν.	another or make them friends, but leave them to bite each other and fight and devour one another." "Yes," he said, "that's exactly what someone who praises doing wrong would be saying."
589a	οὐκοῦν αὖ ὁ τὰ δίκαια λέγων λυσιτελεῖν φαίη ἂν δεῖν ταῦτα πράττειν καὶ ταῦτα λέγειν, ὅθεν τοῦ ἀνθρώπου ὁ ἐντὸς [589b] ἄνθρωπος ἔσται ἐγκρατέστατος, καὶ τοῦ πολυκεφάλου θρέμματος ἐπιμελήσεται ὥσπερ γεωργός, τὰ μὲν ἥμερα τρέφων καὶ τιθασεύων, τὰ δὲ ἄγρια ἀποκωλύων φύεσθαι, σύμμαχον ποιησάμενος τὴν τοῦ λέοντος φύσιν, καὶ κοινῇ πάντων κηδόμενος, φίλα ποιησάμενος ἀλλήλοις τε καὶ αὑτῷ, οὕτω θρέψει; κομιδῇ γὰρ αὖ λέγει ταῦτα ὁ τὸ δίκαιον ἐπαινῶν.	"And on the other hand, someone who says that just things pay would say that we must do and say whatever will give the human being within the fullest [589b] mastery over the whole person. He'll take charge of the many-headed creature like a farmer, nurturing and taming the gentle parts and preventing the wild ones from growing, making the lion's nature his ally; and caring for them all in common, making them friends with one another and with himself, that's how he'll raise them. Isn't that so?" "Yes, that's exactly what someone who praises justice says."
589b	κατὰ πάντα τρόπον δὴ ὁ μὲν τὰ δίκαια ἐγκωμιάζων ἀληθῆ [589c] ἂν λέγοι, ὁ δὲ τὰ ἄδικα ψεύδοιτο. πρός τε γὰρ ἡδονὴν καὶ πρὸς εὐδοξίαν καὶ ὠφελίαν σκοπουμένῳ ὁ μὲν ἐπαινέτης τοῦ δικαίου ἀληθεύει, ὁ δὲ ψέκτης οὐδὲν ὑγιὲς οὐδ' εἰδὼς ψέγει ὅτι ψέγει. οὔ μοι δοκεῖ, ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐδαμῇ γε.	"So in every way the one who praises just things would be telling the truth, [589c] and the one who praises unjust things would be lying. Whether you look at it with an eye to pleasure, or to good reputation, or to benefit, the praiser of justice speaks the truth, while the one who finds fault with it says nothing sound, and doesn't even know what he's finding fault with." "No," he said, "it seems to me he doesn't, not in any way."
589c	πείθωμεν τοίνυν αὐτὸν πρᾴως—οὐ γὰρ ἑκὼν ἁμαρτάνει—ἐρωτῶντες· ὦ μακάριε, οὐ καὶ τὰ καλὰ καὶ αἰσχρὰ νόμιμα διὰ τὰ τοιαῦτ' ἂν φαῖμεν γεγονέναι· τὰ μὲν καλὰ τὰ ὑπὸ [589d] τῷ ἀνθρώπῳ, μᾶλλον δὲ ἴσως τὰ ὑπὸ τῷ θείῳ τὰ θηριώδη ποιοῦντα τῆς φύσεως, αἰσχρὰ δὲ τὰ ὑπὸ τῷ ἀγρίῳ τὸ ἥμερον δουλούμενα; συμφήσει· ἢ πῶς; ἐάν μοι, ἔφη, πείθηται.	"Then let's persuade him gently—he isn't going wrong willingly—by asking him: 'My dear fellow, wouldn't we say that what custom counts as fine and shameful came to be so for reasons like these? The fine is what puts the bestial parts of our nature under [589d] the human being, or rather perhaps under the divine; the shameful is what enslaves the gentle to the wild.' Will he agree, or what?" "He will," he said, "if he takes my advice."
589d	ἔστιν οὖν, εἶπον, ὅτῳ λυσιτελεῖ ἐκ τούτου τοῦ λόγου χρυσίον λαμβάνειν ἀδίκως, εἴπερ τοιόνδε τι γίγνεται, λαμβάνων τὸ χρυσίον ἅμα καταδουλοῦται τὸ βέλτιστον ἑαυτοῦ [589e] τῷ μοχθηροτάτῳ; ἢ εἰ μὲν λαβὼν χρυσίον υἱὸν ἢ θυγατέρα ἐδουλοῦτο, καὶ ταῦτ' εἰς ἀγρίων τε καὶ κακῶν ἀνδρῶν, οὐκ ἂν αὐτῷ ἐλυσιτέλει οὐδ' ἂν πάμπολυ ἐπὶ τούτῳ λαμβάνειν, εἰ δὲ τὸ ἑαυτοῦ θειότατον ὑπὸ τῷ ἀθεωτάτῳ τε καὶ μιαρωτάτῳ δουλοῦται καὶ μηδὲν ἐλεεῖ, οὐκ ἄρα ἄθλιός ἐστι καὶ πολὺ [590a] ἐπὶ δεινοτέρῳ ὀλέθρῳ	"Is there anyone, then," I said, "whom it profits, on this account, to take gold unjustly, if what happens is something like this: in taking the gold he at the same time enslaves the best part of himself [589e] to the most wicked? If taking gold meant enslaving his son or daughter, and to savage and wicked men at that, it wouldn't profit him, however much he got for it. But if he enslaves the most divine part of himself to the most godless and foul, and feels no

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	χρυσὸν δωροδοκεῖ ἢ Ἐριφύλη ἐπὶ τῇ τοῦ ἀνδρὸς ψυχῇ τὸν ὅρμον δεξαμένη;	pity, isn't he wretched? Isn't he taking a bribe of gold for a far [590a] more terrible ruin than Eriphyle did when she accepted the necklace in return for her husband's life?"[9]
590a	πολὺ μέντοι, ἦ δ' ὃς ὁ Γλαύκων· ἐγὼ γάρ σοι ὑπὲρ ἐκείνου ἀποκρινοῦμαι.	"Far more terrible," said Glaucon. "I'll answer for him."
	οὐκοῦν καὶ τὸ ἀκολασταίνειν οἴει διὰ τοιαῦτα πάλαι ψέγεσθαι, ὅτι ἀνίεται ἐν τῷ τοιούτῳ τὸ δεινόν, τὸ μέγα ἐκεῖνο καὶ πολυειδὲς θρέμμα, πέρα τοῦ δέοντος;	"And don't you think licentiousness has long been condemned for reasons like these, because in someone like that the terrible thing, that great and many-formed creature, is let loose more than it should be?"
	δῆλον, ἔφη.	"Clearly," he said.
	ἡ δ' αὐθάδεια καὶ δυσκολία ψέγεται οὐχ ὅταν τὸ λεοντῶδές [590b] τε καὶ ὀφεῶδες αὔξηται καὶ συντείνηται ἀναρμόστως;	"And aren't stubbornness and bad temper condemned when the lion-like and [590b] snake-like part grows and is strung too tight, out of tune?"
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
	τρυφὴ δὲ καὶ μαλθακία οὐκ ἐπὶ τῇ αὐτοῦ τούτου χαλάσει τε καὶ ἀνέσει ψέγεται, ὅταν ἐν αὐτῷ δειλίαν ἐμποιῇ;	"And aren't luxury and softness condemned for slackening and loosening this same part, when they produce cowardice in it?"
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
590b	κολακεία δὲ καὶ ἀνελευθερία οὐχ ὅταν τις τὸ αὐτὸ τοῦτο, τὸ θυμοειδές, ὑπὸ τῷ ὀχλώδει θηρίῳ ποιῇ καὶ ἕνεκα χρημάτων καὶ τῆς ἐκείνου ἀπληστίας προπηλακιζόμενον ἐθίζῃ ἐκ νέου ἀντὶ λέοντος πίθηκον γίγνεσθαι; [590c]	"And flattery and servility? Aren't they condemned when someone puts this same part, the spirited part, under the mob-like beast, and lets it be dragged through the mud for the sake of money and that beast's insatiable greed, training it from youth to become an ape instead of a lion?" [590c]
	καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.	"Very much so," he said.
	βαναυσία δὲ καὶ χειροτεχνία διὰ τί οἴει ὄνειδος φέρει; ἢ δι' ἄλλο τι φήσομεν ἢ ὅταν τις ἀσθενὲς φύσει ἔχῃ τὸ τοῦ βελτίστου εἶδος, ὥστε μὴ ἂν δύνασθαι ἄρχειν τῶν ἐν αὑτῷ θρεμμάτων, ἀλλὰ θεραπεύειν ἐκεῖνα, καὶ τὰ θωπεύματα αὐτῶν μόνον δύνηται μανθάνειν;	"And why do you think manual labor and handicraft bring reproach? Shall we say it's for any reason other than that the best part in someone is naturally weak, so that he can't rule the creatures inside him, but only serve them, and can learn nothing but how to flatter them?"
	ἔοικεν, ἔφη.	"So it seems," he said.
590c	οὐκοῦν ἵνα καὶ ὁ τοιοῦτος ὑπὸ ὁμοίου ἄρχηται οἵουπερ ὁ βέλτιστος, δοῦλον αὐτόν φαμεν δεῖν εἶναι ἐκείνου τοῦ βελτίστου [590d] καὶ ἔχοντος ἐν αὑτῷ τὸ θεῖον ἄρχον, οὐκ ἐπὶ βλάβῃ τῇ τοῦ δούλου οἰόμενοι δεῖν ἄρχεσθαι αὐτόν, ὥσπερ Θρασύμαχος ᾤετο τοὺς ἀρχομένους, ἀλλ' ὡς ἄμεινον ὂν παντὶ ὑπὸ θείου καὶ φρονίμου ἄρχεσθαι, μάλιστα μὲν οἰκεῖον ἔχοντος ἐν αὑτῷ, εἰ δὲ μή, ἔξωθεν ἐφεστῶτος, ἵνα εἰς δύναμιν πάντες ὅμοιοι ὦμεν καὶ φίλοι, τῷ αὐτῷ κυβερνώμενοι;	"So isn't this why, in order that someone like that may also be ruled by the same sort of thing that rules the best person, we say he must be the slave of that best person, [590d] the one who has the divine ruling within himself? It isn't that we think he should be ruled to the slave's harm, as Thrasymachus thought about those who are ruled. It's that it is better for everyone to be ruled by what is divine and wise—ideally having it as his

9 Bribed with a necklace, Eriphyle persuaded her husband Amphiaraus to join the expedition of the Seven against Thebes, where he died.

GREEK	ENGLISH
καὶ ὀρθῶς γ', ἔφη. [590e]	own within himself, but otherwise set over him from outside—so that, as far as possible, we may all be alike and friends, steered by the same thing." "Yes, and rightly," he said. [590e]
590e δηλοῖ δέ γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ ὁ νόμος ὅτι τοιοῦτον βούλεται, πᾶσι τοῖς ἐν τῇ πόλει σύμμαχος ὤν· καὶ ἡ τῶν παίδων ἀρχή, τὸ μὴ ἐᾶν ἐλευθέρους εἶναι, ἕως ἂν ἐν αὐτοῖς ὥσπερ ἐν πόλει πολιτείαν καταστήσωμεν, καὶ τὸ βέλτιστον [591a] θεραπεύσαντες τῷ παρ' ἡμῖν τοιούτῳ ἀντικαταστήσωμεν φύλακα ὅμοιον καὶ ἄρχοντα ἐν αὐτῷ, καὶ τότε δὴ ἐλεύθερον ἀφίεμεν. δηλοῖ γάρ, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"And the law, too," I said, "makes it clear that this is what it wants, since it is the ally of everyone in the city. "So does our rule over children. We don't let them be free until we have set up a constitution in them, as in a city, and, having nurtured the best part [591a] in them with the corresponding part in us, have put in place a similar guardian and ruler within them to take its place. Only then do we set them free." "Yes, it makes that clear," he said.
591a πῇ δὴ οὖν φήσομεν, ὦ Γλαύκων, καὶ κατὰ τίνα λόγον λυσιτελεῖν ἀδικεῖν, ἢ ἀκολασταίνειν ἤ τι αἰσχρὸν ποιεῖν, ἐξ ὧν πονηρότερος μὲν ἔσται, πλείω δὲ χρήματα ἢ ἄλλην τινὰ δύναμιν κεκτήσεται; οὐδαμῇ, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Then how, Glaucon, and on what argument, shall we say that it profits a person to do wrong, or be licentious, or do something shameful, when it will make him worse, even if he gains more money or some other kind of power?" "In no way," he said.
πῇ δ' ἀδικοῦντα λανθάνειν καὶ μὴ διδόναι δίκην λυσιτελεῖν; [591b] ἢ οὐχὶ ὁ μὲν λανθάνων ἔτι πονηρότερος γίγνεται, τοῦ δὲ μὴ λανθάνοντος καὶ κολαζομένου τὸ μὲν θηριῶδες κοιμίζεται καὶ ἡμεροῦται, τὸ δὲ ἥμερον ἐλευθεροῦται, καὶ ὅλη ἡ ψυχὴ εἰς τὴν βελτίστην φύσιν καθισταμένη τιμιωτέραν ἕξιν λαμβάνει, σωφροσύνην τε καὶ δικαιοσύνην μετὰ φρονήσεως κτωμένη, ἢ σῶμα ἰσχύν τε καὶ κάλλος μετὰ ὑγιείας λαμβάνον, τοσούτῳ ὅσῳπερ ψυχὴ σώματος τιμιωτέρα; παντάπασιν μὲν οὖν, ἔφη. [591c]	"And how could it profit him to do wrong without being caught, and not pay the penalty? [591b] Doesn't the one who escapes detection become even worse, while in the one who is caught and punished the bestial part is lulled to sleep and tamed, and the gentle part set free? And doesn't his whole soul, settling into its best nature, acquire a more valuable condition—gaining moderation and justice together with understanding—than a body does when it gains strength and beauty together with health, more valuable by as much as the soul is more valuable than the body?" "Absolutely," he said. [591c]

THE CITY WITHIN

Socrates says the wise man lives by the city within himself, then begins the charge against poetry.

GREEK	ENGLISH
591c **SOCRATES** οὐκοῦν ὅ γε νοῦν ἔχων πάντα τὰ αὑτοῦ εἰς τοῦτο συντείνας βιώσεται, πρῶτον μὲν τὰ μαθήματα τιμῶν, ἃ τοιαύτην αὐτοῦ τὴν ψυχὴν ἀπεργάσεται, τὰ δὲ ἄλλα ἀτιμάζων; δῆλον, ἔφη.	**SOCRATES** "So a person with sense will direct all his efforts to this as long as he lives, won't he? First he'll value the studies that will make his soul like this, and think little of the rest." "Clearly," he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἔπειτά γ', εἶπον, τὴν τοῦ σώματος ἕξιν καὶ τροφὴν οὐχ ὅπως τῇ θηριώδει καὶ ἀλόγῳ ἡδονῇ ἐπιτρέψας ἐνταῦθα τετραμμένος ζήσει, ἀλλ' οὐδὲ πρὸς ὑγίειαν βλέπων, οὐδὲ τοῦτο πρεσβεύων, ὅπως ἰσχυρὸς ἢ ὑγιὴς ἢ καλὸς ἔσται, ἐὰν μὴ [591d] καὶ σωφρονήσειν μέλλῃ ἀπ' αὐτῶν, ἀλλ' ἀεὶ τὴν ἐν τῷ σώματι ἁρμονίαν τῆς ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ ἕνεκα συμφωνίας ἁρμοττόμενος φανεῖται.	"Next," I said, "far from handing over the condition and nourishment of his body to bestial, irrational pleasure and living with his face turned that way, he won't even look to health, or make it his priority to be strong or healthy or good-looking, unless [591d] he's also going to become moderate as a result. He'll always be seen tuning the harmony in his body for the sake of the concord in his soul."
591d	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, ἐάνπερ μέλλῃ τῇ ἀληθείᾳ μουσικὸς εἶναι. οὐκοῦν, εἶπον, καὶ τὴν ἐν τῇ τῶν χρημάτων κτήσει σύνταξίν τε καὶ συμφωνίαν; καὶ τὸν ὄγκον τοῦ πλήθους οὐκ ἐκπληττόμενος ὑπὸ τοῦ τῶν πολλῶν μακαρισμοῦ ἄπειρον αὐξήσει, ἀπέραντα κακὰ ἔχων; οὐκ οἶομαι, ἔφη. [591e] ἀλλ' ἀποβλέπων γε, εἶπον, πρὸς τὴν ἐν αὑτῷ πολιτείαν, καὶ φυλάττων μή τι παρακινῇ αὐτοῦ τῶν ἐκεῖ διὰ πλῆθος οὐσίας ἢ δι' ὀλιγότητα, οὕτως κυβερνῶν προσθήσει καὶ ἀναλώσει τῆς οὐσίας καθ' ὅσον ἂν οἷός τ' ᾖ. κομιδῇ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Absolutely," he said, "if he really means to be a true musician." "And the order and concord in acquiring money too?" I said. "Will he be dazzled by what the many call happiness, and increase the mass of his wealth without limit, taking on limitless troubles?" "I don't think so," he said. [591e] "Instead," I said, "he'll keep his eyes on the constitution within himself, and guard against disturbing anything in it through having too much property or too little. Steering in this way, he'll add to his property and spend from it as far as he can." "Quite so," he said.
592a	ἀλλὰ μὴν καὶ τιμάς γε, εἰς ταὐτὸν ἀποβλέπων, τῶν μὲν μεθέξει καὶ γεύσεται ἑκών, ἃς ἂν ἡγῆται ἀμείνω αὐτὸν ποιήσειν, ἃς δ' ἂν λύσειν τὴν ὑπάρχουσαν ἕξιν, φεύξεται ἰδίᾳ καὶ δημοσίᾳ. οὐκ ἄρα, ἔφη, τά γε πολιτικὰ ἐθελήσει πράττειν, ἐάνπερ τούτου κήδηται. νὴ τὸν κύνα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἔν γε τῇ ἑαυτοῦ πόλει καὶ μάλα, οὐ μέντοι ἴσως ἔν γε τῇ πατρίδι, ἐὰν μὴ θεία τις συμβῇ τύχη.	"And as for honors, too, he'll keep his eyes on the same thing. He'll gladly share in and taste those he thinks will make him better, and he'll avoid, in private and in public, any he thinks would undo the condition he has." "Then he won't be willing to take part in politics," he said, "if that's what he cares about." "By the dog," I said, "he certainly will, in his own city at least—though perhaps not in his native country, unless some divine chance comes about."
	μανθάνω, ἔφη· ἐν ᾗ νῦν διήλθομεν οἰκίζοντες πόλει λέγεις, τῇ ἐν λόγοις κειμένῃ, ἐπεὶ γῆς γε οὐδαμοῦ οἶμαι [592b] αὐτὴν εἶναι. ἀλλ', ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐν οὐρανῷ ἴσως παράδειγμα ἀνάκειται τῷ βουλομένῳ ὁρᾶν καὶ ὁρῶντι ἑαυτὸν κατοικίζειν. διαφέρει δὲ οὐδὲν εἴτε που ἔστιν εἴτε ἔσται· τὰ γὰρ ταύτης μόνης ἂν πράξειεν, ἄλλης δὲ οὐδεμιᾶς. εἰκός γ', ἔφη.	"I understand," he said. "You mean in the city we've just been founding in our discussion, the one that exists in words, since I don't think it exists anywhere [592b] on earth." "But perhaps," I said, "a pattern of it is laid up in heaven for anyone who wants to see it and, seeing it, to found a city within himself. It makes no difference whether it exists anywhere, or ever will. He would take part in the affairs of that city alone, and of no other." "That's likely," he said.

Book X

Poetry, and the myth of Er.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
595a	**SOCRATES** καὶ μήν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πολλὰ μὲν καὶ ἄλλα περὶ αὐτῆς ἐννοῶ, ὡς παντὸς ἄρα μᾶλλον ὀρθῶς ᾠκίζομεν τὴν πόλιν, οὐχ ἥκιστα δὲ ἐνθυμηθεὶς περὶ ποιήσεως λέγω.	**SOCRATES** "And in fact," I said, "there are many other things about our city that make me think we were founding it in exactly the right way, but I say so not least when I think about poetry."
	τὸ ποῖον; ἔφη.	"What about it?" he said.
	τὸ μηδαμῇ παραδέχεσθαι αὐτῆς ὅση μιμητική· παντὸς γὰρ μᾶλλον οὐ παραδεκτέα νῦν καὶ ἐναργέστερον, ὡς ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ, φαίνεται, ἐπειδὴ χωρὶς ἕκαστα διῄρηται τὰ τῆς ψυχῆς [595b] εἴδη.	"That we refused to admit any of it that is imitative. That it must not be admitted at all is even clearer now, it seems to me, since we've distinguished the parts of the soul from one [595b] another."
	πῶς λέγεις;	"What do you mean?"
595b	ὡς μὲν πρὸς ὑμᾶς εἰρῆσθαι—οὐ γάρ μου κατερεῖτε πρὸς τοὺς τῆς τραγῳδίας ποιητὰς καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους ἅπαντας τοὺς μιμητικούς—λώβη ἔοικεν εἶναι πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα τῆς τῶν ἀκουόντων διανοίας, ὅσοι μὴ ἔχουσι φάρμακον τὸ εἰδέναι αὐτὰ οἷα τυγχάνει ὄντα.	"Just between ourselves—you won't denounce me to the tragic poets and all the other imitators—all such things seem to be a corruption of the minds of those who hear them, unless they have as an antidote the knowledge of what these things really are."
	πῇ δή, ἔφη, διανοούμενος λέγεις;	"What exactly are you thinking of," he said, "when you say that?"
	ῥητέον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· καίτοι φιλία γέ τίς με καὶ αἰδὼς ἐκ παιδὸς ἔχουσα περὶ Ὁμήρου ἀποκωλύει λέγειν. ἔοικε μὲν [595c] γὰρ τῶν καλῶν ἁπάντων τούτων τῶν τραγικῶν πρῶτος διδάσκαλός τε καὶ ἡγεμὼν γενέσθαι. ἀλλ' οὐ γὰρ πρό γε τῆς ἀληθείας τιμητέος ἀνήρ, ἀλλ', ὃ λέγω, ῥητέον.	"I'll have to say it," I said, "even though a certain love and reverence for Homer that I've had since I was a child holds me back from speaking. For he seems [595c] to have been the first teacher and leader of all these fine tragic poets. Still, no man should be honored above the truth, so, as I say, I must speak."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.	"Certainly," he said.
	ἄκουε δή, μᾶλλον δὲ ἀποκρίνου.	"Listen, then—or rather, answer."
	Ἐρώτα.	"Ask."
	μίμησιν ὅλως ἔχοις ἄν μοι εἰπεῖν ὅτι ποτ' ἐστίν; οὐδὲ γάρ τοι αὐτὸς πάνυ τι συννοῶ τί βούλεται εἶναι.	"Could you tell me what imitation in general is? I don't quite understand myself what it's supposed to be."
	ἦ που ἄρ', ἔφη, ἐγὼ συννοήσω.	"So I suppose I'm going to understand it!" he said.

THE THREE BEDS

Socrates uses a god's, a carpenter's and a painter's bed to show imitation is far from truth.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
595c	**SOCRATES** οὐδέν γε, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἄτοπον, ἐπεὶ πολλά τοι ὀξύτερον [596a] βλεπόντων ἀμβλύτερον ὁρῶντες πρότεροι εἶδον.	**SOCRATES** "That wouldn't be strange at all," I said, "since people with duller sight often see things before those with sharper [596a] sight."
	ἔστιν, ἔφη, οὕτως· ἀλλὰ σοῦ παρόντος οὐδ' ἂν προθυμηθῆναι οἷός τε εἴην εἰπεῖν, εἴ τί μοι καταφαίνεται, ἀλλ' αὐτὸς ὅρα.	"That's so," he said, "but with you here I wouldn't even have the nerve to say anything that occurs to me. You look for yourself."
	βούλει οὖν ἐνθένδε ἀρξώμεθα ἐπισκοποῦντες, ἐκ τῆς εἰωθυίας μεθόδου; εἶδος γάρ πού τι ἓν ἕκαστον εἰώθαμεν τίθεσθαι περὶ ἕκαστα τὰ πολλά, οἷς ταὐτὸν ὄνομα ἐπιφέρομεν. ἢ οὐ μανθάνεις;	"Then shall we begin our inquiry from here, following our usual method? We usually posit, I think, a single form for each set of many things to which we give the same name. Or don't you follow?"
	μανθάνω.	"I follow."
	θῶμεν δὴ καὶ νῦν ὅτι βούλει τῶν πολλῶν. οἷον, εἰ [596b] 'θ'έλεις, πολλαί πού εἰσι κλῖναι καὶ τράπεζαι.	"Then let's take now whichever of the many you like. For example, if [596b] you like, there are many beds and tables."
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
596b	ἀλλὰ ἰδέαι γέ που περὶ ταῦτα τὰ σκεύη δύο, μία μὲν κλίνης, μία δὲ τραπέζης.	"But there are only two forms for these pieces of furniture, one of bed and one of table."
	ναί.	"Yes."
	οὐκοῦν καὶ εἰώθαμεν λέγειν ὅτι ὁ δημιουργὸς ἑκατέρου τοῦ σκεύους πρὸς τὴν ἰδέαν βλέπων οὕτω ποιεῖ ὁ μὲν τὰς κλίνας, ὁ δὲ τὰς τραπέζας, αἷς ἡμεῖς χρώμεθα, καὶ τἆλλα κατὰ ταὐτά; οὐ γάρ που τήν γε ἰδέαν αὐτὴν δημιουργεῖ οὐδεὶς τῶν δημιουργῶν· πῶς γάρ;	"And aren't we also accustomed to say that the craftsman of each of them looks toward the form when he makes the beds, or the tables, that we use, and likewise with everything else? For surely no craftsman makes the form itself. How could he?"
	οὐδαμῶς.	"He couldn't."
	ἀλλ' ὅρα δὴ καὶ τόνδε τίνα καλεῖς τὸν δημιουργόν. [596c]	"Now see what you'd call this craftsman." [596c]
	τὸν ποῖον;	"Which one?"
	ὃς πάντα ποιεῖ, ὅσαπερ εἷς ἕκαστος τῶν χειροτεχνῶν.	"The one who makes everything that each of the individual craftsmen makes."
596c	δεινόν τινα λέγεις καὶ θαυμαστὸν ἄνδρα.	"That's a clever and amazing man you're talking about."
	οὔπω γε, ἀλλὰ τάχα μᾶλλον φήσεις. ὁ αὐτὸς γὰρ οὗτος χειροτέχνης οὐ μόνον πάντα οἷός τε σκεύη ποιῆσαι, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὰ ἐκ τῆς γῆς φυόμενα ἅπαντα ποιεῖ καὶ ζῷα πάντα ἐργάζεται, τά τε ἄλλα καὶ ἑαυτόν, καὶ πρὸς τούτοις γῆν καὶ οὐρανὸν καὶ θεοὺς καὶ πάντα τὰ ἐν οὐρανῷ καὶ τὰ ἐν Ἅιδου ὑπὸ γῆς ἅπαντα ἐργάζεται. [596d]	"Not yet—soon you'll say so even more. This same craftsman can make not only every piece of furniture; he also makes everything that grows from the earth, and produces all living things, himself included, and besides these he produces earth and heaven and gods and everything in heaven and everything in Hades beneath the earth." [596d]
	πάνυ θαυμαστόν, ἔφη, λέγεις σοφιστήν.	"That's a truly amazing sophist you're describing," he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
596d	ἀπιστεῖς; ἦν δ' ἐγώ. καί μοι εἰπέ, τὸ παράπαν οὐκ ἄν σοι δοκεῖ εἶναι τοιοῦτος δημιουργός, ἢ τινὶ μὲν τρόπῳ γενέσθαι ἂν τούτων ἁπάντων ποιητής, τινὶ δὲ οὐκ ἄν; ἢ οὐκ αἰσθάνῃ ὅτι κἂν αὐτὸς οἷός τ' εἴης πάντα ταῦτα ποιῆσαι τρόπῳ γέ τινι;	"Don't you believe me?" I said. "Tell me, do you think there couldn't be such a craftsman at all? Or that in one way someone could become the maker of all these things, but in another way couldn't? Don't you see that you yourself could make all these things, in a way?"
	καὶ τίς, ἔφη, ὁ τρόπος οὗτος;	"And what way is that?" he said.
	οὐ χαλεπός, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀλλὰ πολλαχῇ καὶ ταχὺ δημιουργούμενος, τάχιστα δέ που, εἰ 'θέλεις λαβὼν κάτοπτρον 596e περιφέρειν πανταχῇ· ταχὺ μὲν ἥλιον ποιήσεις καὶ τὰ ἐν τῷ οὐρανῷ, ταχὺ δὲ γῆν, ταχὺ δὲ σαυτόν τε καὶ τἆλλα ζῷα καὶ σκεύη καὶ φυτὰ καὶ πάντα ὅσα νυνδὴ ἐλέγετο.	"It isn't difficult," I said. "It can be done in many ways and quickly—quickest of all, I suppose, if you're willing to take a mirror and 596e carry it around everywhere. You'll quickly make the sun and the things in the heavens, quickly the earth, quickly yourself and the other animals and furniture and plants and everything we were just talking about."
	ναί, ἔφη, φαινόμενα, οὐ μέντοι ὄντα γέ που τῇ ἀληθείᾳ.	"Yes," he said, "things that appear, but not things that really are."
	καλῶς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ εἰς δέον ἔρχῃ τῷ λόγῳ. τῶν τοιούτων γὰρ οἶμαι δημιουργῶν καὶ ὁ ζωγράφος ἐστίν. ἦ γάρ;	"Good," I said. "You've come to the argument just where you should. The painter too, I think, is one of these craftsmen, isn't he?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
596e	ἀλλὰ φήσεις οὐκ ἀληθῆ οἶμαι αὐτὸν ποιεῖν ἃ ποιεῖ. καίτοι τρόπῳ γέ τινι καὶ ὁ ζωγράφος κλίνην ποιεῖ· ἢ οὔ;	"But you'll say, I think, that what he makes isn't true. And yet in a way the painter too makes a bed, doesn't he?"
	ναί, ἔφη, φαινομένην γε καὶ οὗτος.	"Yes," he said, "he too makes a bed that appears."
	τί δὲ ὁ κλινοποιός; οὐκ ἄρτι μέντοι ἔλεγες ὅτι οὐ τὸ εἶδος ποιεῖ, ὃ δή φαμεν εἶναι ὃ ἔστι κλίνη, ἀλλὰ κλίνην τινά;	"What about the bed-maker? Weren't you just saying that he doesn't make the form, which we say is what a bed is, but a particular bed?"
	ἔλεγον γάρ.	"I was."
597a	οὐκοῦν εἰ μὴ ὃ ἔστιν ποιεῖ, οὐκ ἂν τὸ ὂν ποιοῖ, ἀλλά τι τοιοῦτον οἷον τὸ ὄν, ὂν δὲ οὔ· τελέως δὲ εἶναι ὂν τὸ τοῦ κλινουργοῦ ἔργον ἢ ἄλλου τινὸς χειροτέχνου εἴ τις φαίη, κινδυνεύει οὐκ ἂν ἀληθῆ λέγειν;	"Then if he doesn't make what a bed is, he wouldn't be making what is, but something like what is, which is not what is. And if anyone said that the work of the bed-maker or any other craftsman completely is, he'd probably be saying something untrue?"
	οὔκουν, ἔφη, ὥς γ' ἂν δόξειεν τοῖς περὶ τοὺς τοιούσδε λόγους διατρίβουσιν.	"He would," he said, "at least in the view of those who spend their time on arguments like these."
	μηδὲν ἄρα θαυμάζωμεν εἰ καὶ τοῦτο ἀμυδρόν τι τυγχάνει ὂν πρὸς ἀλήθειαν. 597b	"Then let's not be surprised if this too turns out to be something dim compared with the truth." 597b
	μὴ γάρ.	"No, let's not."
	βούλει οὖν, ἔφην, ἐπ' αὐτῶν τούτων ζητήσωμεν τὸν μιμητὴν τοῦτον, τίς ποτ' ἐστίν;	"Then do you want us," I said, "to use these very examples to look for this imitator, and find out what he is?"
	εἰ βούλει, ἔφη.	"If you like," he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
597b	οὐκοῦν τριτταί τινες κλῖναι αὗται γίγνονται· μία μὲν ἡ ἐν τῇ φύσει οὖσα, ἣν φαῖμεν ἄν, ὡς ἐγᾦμαι, θεὸν ἐργάσασθαι. ἢ τίν' ἄλλον;	"Well, these beds turn out to be of three kinds. One is the one in nature, which I think we'd say a god made. Or who else?"
	οὐδένα, οἶμαι.	"No one else, I think."
	μία δέ γε ἦν ὁ τέκτων.	"And one the carpenter makes."
	ναί, ἔφη.	"Yes," he said.
	μία δὲ ἦν ὁ ζωγράφος. ἦ γάρ;	"And one the painter makes, right?"
	ἔστω.	"Let's say so."
	ζωγράφος δή, κλινοποιός, θεός, τρεῖς οὗτοι ἐπιστάται τρισὶν εἴδεσι κλινῶν.	"So painter, bed-maker, god: these three are in charge of three kinds of bed."
	ναὶ τρεῖς. 597c	"Yes, three." 597c
597c	ὁ μὲν δὴ θεός, εἴτε οὐκ ἐβούλετο, εἴτε τις ἀνάγκη ἐπῆν μὴ πλέον ἢ μίαν ἐν τῇ φύσει ἀπεργάσασθαι αὐτὸν κλίνην, οὕτως ἐποίησεν μίαν μόνον αὐτὴν ἐκείνην ὃ ἔστιν κλίνη· δύο δὲ τοιαῦται ἢ πλείους οὔτε ἐφυτεύθησαν ὑπὸ τοῦ θεοῦ οὔτε μὴ φυῶσιν.	"Now the god, whether because he didn't want to or because some necessity compelled him not to make more than one bed in nature, made only one, the very one that is what a bed is. Two or more such beds were never produced by the god, and never will be."
	πῶς δή; ἔφη.	"Why is that?" he said.
	ὅτι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἰ δύο μόνας ποιήσειεν, πάλιν ἂν μία ἀναφανείη ἧς ἐκεῖναι ἂν αὖ ἀμφότεραι τὸ εἶδος ἔχοιεν, καὶ εἴη ἂν ὃ ἔστιν κλίνη ἐκείνη ἀλλ' οὐχ αἱ δύο.	"Because," I said, "if he made just two, one again would appear whose form they would both have, and that would be what a bed is, not the two."
	ὀρθῶς, ἔφη. 597d	"Right," he said. 597d
597d	ταῦτα δὴ οἶμαι εἰδὼς ὁ θεός, βουλόμενος εἶναι ὄντως κλίνης ποιητὴς ὄντως οὔσης, ἀλλὰ μὴ κλίνης τινὸς μηδὲ κλινοποιός τις, μίαν φύσει αὐτὴν ἔφυσεν.	"The god knew this, I think, and wanted to be the real maker of a bed that really is, not the maker of some particular bed, nor some particular bed-maker. So he produced it by nature as one."
	ἔοικεν.	"That seems likely."
	βούλει οὖν τοῦτον μὲν φυτουργὸν τούτου προσαγορεύωμεν, ἤ τι τοιοῦτον;	"Then shall we call him its nature-maker, or something like that?"
	δίκαιον γοῦν, ἔφη, ἐπειδήπερ φύσει γε καὶ τοῦτο καὶ τἆλλα πάντα πεποίηκεν.	"That would be fair," he said, "since he has made both this and everything else by nature."
	τί δὲ τὸν τέκτονα; ἆρ' οὐ δημιουργὸν κλίνης;	"And what about the carpenter? Isn't he a craftsman of beds?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	ἦ καὶ τὸν ζωγράφον δημιουργὸν καὶ ποιητὴν τοῦ τοιούτου;	"And is the painter too a craftsman and maker of such a thing?"
	οὐδαμῶς.	"Not at all."
	ἀλλὰ τί αὐτὸν κλίνης φήσεις εἶναι; 597e	"Then what will you say he is, with respect to a bed?" 597e
597e	τοῦτο, ἦ δ' ὅς, ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ μετριώτατ' ἂν προσαγορεύεσθαι, μιμητὴς οὗ ἐκεῖνοι δημιουργοί.	"It seems to me," he said, "that the most reasonable thing to call him is an imitator of what those others are craftsmen of."
	εἶεν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· τὸν τοῦ τρίτου ἄρα γεννήματος ἀπὸ τῆς φύσεως μιμητὴν καλεῖς;	

GREEK

πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

τοῦτ' ἄρα ἔσται καὶ ὁ τραγῳδοποιός, εἴπερ μιμητής ἐστι, τρίτος τις ἀπὸ βασιλέως καὶ τῆς ἀληθείας πεφυκώς, καὶ πάντες οἱ ἄλλοι μιμηταί.

κινδυνεύει.

τὸν μὲν δὴ μιμητὴν ὡμολογήκαμεν. εἰπὲ δέ μοι περὶ [598a] τοῦ ζωγράφου τόδε· πότερα ἐκεῖνο αὐτὸ τὸ ἐν τῇ φύσει ἕκαστον δοκεῖ σοι ἐπιχειρεῖν μιμεῖσθαι ἢ τὰ τῶν δημιουργῶν ἔργα;

ENGLISH

"Very well," I said. "So you call the one whose product is at the third remove from nature an imitator?"

"Certainly," he said.

"Then this will be true of the tragic poet too, if he's an imitator: he is by nature third from the king and the truth, and so are all the other imitators."

"Probably."

"Well, we've agreed about the imitator. But tell me this about [598a] the painter: does he seem to you to try to imitate each thing itself in nature, or the works of craftsmen?"

598a τὰ τῶν δημιουργῶν, ἔφη.

ἆρα οἷα ἔστιν ἢ οἷα φαίνεται; τοῦτο γὰρ ἔτι διόρισον.

πῶς λέγεις; ἔφη.

ὧδε· κλίνη, ἐάντε ἐκ πλαγίου αὐτὴν θεᾷ ἐάντε καταντικρὺ ἢ ὁπῃοῦν, μή τι διαφέρει αὐτὴ ἑαυτῆς, ἢ διαφέρει μὲν οὐδέν, φαίνεται δὲ ἀλλοία; καὶ τἆλλα ὡσαύτως;

οὕτως, ἔφη· φαίνεται, διαφέρει δ' οὐδέν. [598b]

τοῦτο δὴ αὐτὸ σκόπει· πρὸς πότερον ἡ γραφικὴ πεποίηται περὶ ἕκαστον; πότερα πρὸς τὸ ὄν, ὡς ἔχει, μιμήσασθαι, ἢ πρὸς τὸ φαινόμενον, ὡς φαίνεται, φαντάσματος ἢ ἀληθείας οὖσα μίμησις;

φαντάσματος, ἔφη.

"The works of craftsmen," he said.

"As they are, or as they appear? You still have to settle that."

"What do you mean?" he said.

"This: if you look at a bed from the side, or straight on, or from any angle, does it differ at all from itself? Or does it not differ at all, but only appear different? And the same with other things?"

"That's it," he said. "It appears different, but doesn't differ at all." [598b]

"Then consider this very point. What is painting aimed at in each case? At imitating what is, as it is, or what appears, as it appears? Is it an imitation of appearance, or of truth?"

"Of appearance," he said.

598b πόρρω ἄρα που τοῦ ἀληθοῦς ἡ μιμητικὴ ἐστιν καί, ὡς ἔοικεν, διὰ τοῦτο πάντα ἀπεργάζεται, ὅτι σμικρόν τι ἑκάστου ἐφάπτεται, καὶ τοῦτο εἴδωλον. οἷον ὁ ζωγράφος, φαμέν, ζωγραφήσει ἡμῖν σκυτοτόμον, τέκτονα, τοὺς ἄλλους δημιουργούς, [598c] περὶ οὐδενὸς τούτων ἐπαΐων τῶν τεχνῶν· ἀλλ' ὅμως παῖδάς γε καὶ ἄφρονας ἀνθρώπους, εἰ ἀγαθὸς εἴη ζωγράφος, γράψας ἂν τέκτονα καὶ πόρρωθεν ἐπιδεικνὺς ἐξαπατῷ ἂν τῷ δοκεῖν ὡς ἀληθῶς τέκτονα εἶναι.

τί δ' οὔ;

"Then imitation is surely far from the truth, and that, it seems, is why it can produce everything: because it grasps just a small part of each thing, and that part is an image. The painter, for example, we say, will paint us a shoemaker, a carpenter, and the other craftsmen, [598c] without understanding anything about their crafts. And still, if he's a good painter, he could paint a carpenter, show it from a distance, and deceive children and foolish people into thinking it really is a carpenter."

"Of course."

598c ἀλλὰ γὰρ οἶμαι ὦ φίλε, τόδε δεῖ περὶ πάντων τῶν τοιούτων διανοεῖσθαι· ἐπειδάν τις ἡμῖν ἀπαγγέλλῃ περί του, ὡς ἐνέτυχεν ἀνθρώπῳ πάσας ἐπισταμένῳ τὰς δημιουργίας καὶ τἆλλα πάντα ὅσα εἷς ἕκαστος οἶδεν, οὐδὲν ὅτι οὐχὶ [598d] ἀκριβέστερον ὁτουοῦν ἐπισταμένῳ, ὑπολαμβάνειν δεῖ τῷ τοιούτῳ ὅτι εὐήθης τις ἄνθρωπος,

"But here, my friend, is what I think we should bear in mind about all such things. Whenever someone reports to us about a person, that he's met someone who knows all the crafts and everything else that each individual knows, and there's nothing he doesn't know [598d] more precisely

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	καί, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἐντυχὼν γόητί τινι καὶ μιμητῇ ἐξηπατήθη, ὥστε ἔδοξεν αὐτῷ πάσσοφος εἶναι, διὰ τὸ αὐτὸς μὴ οἷός τ' εἶναι ἐπιστήμην καὶ ἀνεπιστημοσύνην καὶ μίμησιν ἐξετάσαι.	than anyone, we should reply that he's a simple-minded fellow who, it seems, has met some charlatan and imitator and been fooled into thinking him all-wise, because he himself can't tell knowledge from ignorance and imitation."
	ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη.	"Very true," he said.

HOMER AND THE POETS ON TRIAL

Socrates argues that Homer and the tragic poets lack knowledge and feed the soul's worse part.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
598d	**SOCRATES** οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μετὰ τοῦτο ἐπισκεπτέον τήν τε τραγῳδίαν καὶ τὸν ἡγεμόνα αὐτῆς Ὅμηρον, ἐπειδή τινων [598e] ἀκούομεν ὅτι οὗτοι πάσας μὲν τέχνας ἐπίστανται, πάντα δὲ τὰ ἀνθρώπεια τὰ πρὸς ἀρετὴν καὶ κακίαν, καὶ τά γε θεῖα· ἀνάγκη γὰρ τὸν ἀγαθὸν ποιητήν, εἰ μέλλει περὶ ὧν ἂν ποιῇ καλῶς ποιήσειν, εἰδότα ἄρα ποιεῖν, ἢ μὴ οἷόν τε εἶναι ποιεῖν.	**SOCRATES** "Then after this," I said, "we must examine tragedy and its leader, Homer, since we hear some [598e] people say that these poets know all the crafts, and all human affairs that bear on excellence and badness, and divine affairs too. For a good poet, they say, if he's going to write well about whatever he writes about, must know it when he writes, or else he won't be able to write.
598e	δεῖ δὴ ἐπισκέψασθαι πότερον μιμηταῖς τούτοις οὗτοι ἐντυχόντες ἐξηπάτηνται καὶ τὰ ἔργα αὐτῶν ὁρῶντες [599a] οὐκ αἰσθάνονται τριττὰ ἀπέχοντα τοῦ ὄντος καὶ ῥᾴδια ποιεῖν μὴ εἰδότι τὴν ἀλήθειαν—φαντάσματα γὰρ ἀλλ' οὐκ ὄντα ποιοῦσιν—ἤ τι καὶ λέγουσιν καὶ τῷ ὄντι οἱ ἀγαθοὶ ποιηταὶ ἴσασιν περὶ ὧν δοκοῦσιν τοῖς πολλοῖς εὖ λέγειν.	"So we must examine whether these people have met imitators like these and been deceived, and when they see their works [599a] fail to notice that they are at the third remove from what is, and easy to produce without knowing the truth—since what they produce are appearances, not things that are—or whether there's something in what they say, and good poets really do know about the things the many think they speak well about."
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, ἐξεταστέον.	"We certainly must examine it," he said.
	οἴει οὖν, εἴ τις ἀμφότερα δύναιτο ποιεῖν, τό τε μιμηθησόμενον καὶ τὸ εἴδωλον, ἐπὶ τῇ τῶν εἰδώλων δημιουργίᾳ ἑαυτὸν ἀφεῖναι ἂν σπουδάζειν καὶ τοῦτο προστήσασθαι τοῦ [599b] ἑαυτοῦ βίου ὡς βέλτιστον ἔχοντα;	"Then do you think that if someone could make both—the thing to be imitated and the image—he would let himself take image-making seriously, and put it at the forefront of [599b] his life as the best thing he had?"
599b	οὐκ ἔγωγε.	"I don't."
	ἀλλ' εἴπερ γε οἶμαι ἐπιστήμων εἴη τῇ ἀληθείᾳ τούτων πέρι ἅπερ καὶ μιμεῖται, πολὺ πρότερον ἐν τοῖς ἔργοις ἂν σπουδάσειεν ἢ ἐπὶ τοῖς μιμήμασι, καὶ πειρῷτο ἂν πολλὰ καὶ καλὰ ἔργα ἑαυτοῦ καταλιπεῖν μνημεῖα, καὶ εἶναι προθυμοῖτ' ἂν μᾶλλον ὁ ἐγκωμιαζόμενος ἢ ὁ ἐγκωμιάζων.	"Rather, if he truly had knowledge, I think, of the things he imitates, he'd be far more serious about real deeds than about imitations of them, and would try to leave behind many fine deeds as memorials of himself, and would be more eager to be the one praised than the one praising."
	οἶμαι, ἔφη· οὐ γὰρ ἐξ ἴσου ἥ τε τιμὴ καὶ ἡ ὠφελία.	"I think so," he said. "The honor and the benefit aren't equal."
	τῶν μὲν τοίνυν ἄλλων πέρι μὴ ἀπαιτῶμεν λόγον Ὅμηρον [599c] ἢ ἄλλον ὁντινοῦν τῶν ποιητῶν, ἐρωτῶντες εἰ ἰατρικὸς ἦν τις αὐτῶν ἀλλὰ μὴ μιμητὴς μόνον ἰατρικῶν	"About other things, then, let's not demand an account from Homer [599c] or any other poet by asking whether any of them was a doctor and not just an

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	λόγων, τίνας ὑγιεῖς ποιητής τις τῶν παλαιῶν ἢ τῶν νέων λέγεται πεποιηκέναι, ὥσπερ Ἀσκληπιός, ἢ τίνας μαθητὰς ἰατρικῆς κατελίπετο, ὥσπερ ἐκεῖνος τοὺς ἐκγόνους, μηδ' αὖ περὶ τὰς ἄλλας τέχνας αὐτοὺς ἐρωτῶμεν, ἀλλ' ἐῶμεν· περὶ δὲ ὧν μεγίστων τε καὶ καλλίστων ἐπιχειρεῖ λέγειν Ὅμηρος, πολέμων τε πέρι καὶ στρατηγιῶν καὶ διοικήσεων πόλεων, καὶ [599d] παιδείας πέρι ἀνθρώπου, δίκαιόν που ἐρωτᾶν αὐτὸν πυνθανομένους· ὦ φίλε Ὅμηρε, εἴπερ μὴ τρίτος ἀπὸ τῆς ἀληθείας εἶ ἀρετῆς πέρι, εἰδώλου δημιουργός, ὃν δὴ μιμητὴν ὡρισάμεθα, ἀλλὰ καὶ δεύτερος, καὶ οἷός τε ἦσθα γιγνώσκειν ποῖα ἐπιτηδεύματα βελτίους ἢ χείρους ἀνθρώπους ποιεῖ ἰδίᾳ καὶ δημοσίᾳ, λέγε ἡμῖν τίς τῶν πόλεων διὰ σὲ βέλτιον ᾤκησεν, ὥσπερ διὰ Λυκοῦργον Λακεδαίμων καὶ δι' ἄλλους πολλοὺς [599e] πολλαὶ μεγάλαι τε καὶ σμικραί;	imitator of doctors' talk—which poet, old or new, is said to have made anyone healthy, as Asclepius did, or what students of medicine he left behind, as Asclepius left his descendants. And let's not ask them about the other crafts either, but let that go. But about the greatest and finest things Homer undertakes to speak of—wars and generalship and the government of cities, and [599d] the education of human beings—it's surely fair to question him and ask: 'Dear Homer, if you are not third from the truth where excellence is concerned, a craftsman of images, which is how we defined an imitator, but second, and could recognize what practices make people better or worse in private and in public, tell us which city was better governed because of you, as Sparta was because of Lycurgus, and many [599e] cities, great and small, because of many others?[1]
599e	σὲ δὲ τίς αἰτιᾶται πόλις νομοθέτην ἀγαθὸν γεγονέναι καὶ σφᾶς ὠφεληκέναι; Χαρώνδαν μὲν γὰρ Ἰταλία καὶ Σικελία, καὶ ἡμεῖς Σόλωνα· σὲ δὲ τίς; ἔξει τινὰ εἰπεῖν;	"'What city credits you with having been a good lawgiver and having benefited them? Italy and Sicily credit Charondas, and we credit Solon. But who credits you?' Will he be able to name one?"[2]
	οὐκ οἶμαι, ἔφη ὁ Γλαύκων· οὔκουν λέγεταί γε οὐδ' ὑπ' αὐτῶν Ὁμηριδῶν.	"I don't think so," said Glaucon. "At any rate, not even the Homeridae claim it."
	ἀλλὰ δή τις πόλεμος ἐπὶ Ὁμήρου ὑπ' ἐκείνου ἄρχοντος ἢ συμβουλεύοντος εὖ πολεμηθεὶς μνημονεύεται;	"Well, is any war in Homer's day remembered as having been fought well under his command or on his advice?"
	οὐδείς.	"None."
	ἀλλ' οἷα δὴ εἰς τὰ ἔργα σοφοῦ ἀνδρὸς πολλαὶ ἐπίνοιαι καὶ εὐμήχανοι εἰς τέχνας ἤ τινας ἄλλας πράξεις λέγονται, ὥσπερ αὖ Θάλεώ τε πέρι τοῦ Μιλησίου καὶ Ἀναχάρσιος τοῦ Σκύθου;	"Then are many clever inventions for the crafts or other practical activities attributed to him, of the kind you'd expect from a wise man at work, as they are to Thales of Miletus and Anacharsis the Scythian?"
	οὐδαμῶς τοιοῦτον οὐδέν.	"Nothing like that at all."[3]
600a	ἀλλὰ δὴ εἰ μὴ δημοσίᾳ, ἰδίᾳ τισὶν ἡγεμὼν παιδείας αὐτὸς ζῶν λέγεται Ὅμηρος γενέσθαι, οἳ ἐκεῖνον ἠγάπων ἐπὶ [600b] συνουσίᾳ καὶ τοῖς ὑστέροις ὁδόν τινα παρέδοσαν βίου Ὁμηρικήν, ὥσπερ Πυθαγόρας αὐτός τε διαφερόντως ἐπὶ τούτῳ ἠγαπήθη, καὶ οἱ ὕστεροι ἔτι καὶ νῦν Πυθαγόρειον τρόπον ἐπονομάζοντες τοῦ βίου διαφανεῖς πῃ δοκοῦσιν εἶναι ἐν τοῖς ἄλλοις;	"Well, if not in public, is Homer said to have been, while he lived, a leader in education for particular people in private, who loved him for his [600b] company and handed down to those after them a Homeric way of life? Pythagoras, for instance, was especially loved for this himself, and his successors even now call their way of life Pythagorean and seem somehow to stand out among other people."

1 Lycurgus was the legendary lawgiver credited with founding Sparta's constitution.
2 Charondas of Catana was a lawgiver for Greek cities in Sicily and southern Italy.
3 The Homeridae were a guild of reciters of Homer who claimed descent from him. Thales and Anacharsis were proverbial sages credited with practical inventions.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
600b	οὐδ' αὖ, ἔφη, τοιοῦτον οὐδὲν λέγεται. ὁ γὰρ Κρεώφυλος, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἴσως, ὁ τοῦ Ὁμήρου ἑταῖρος, τοῦ ὀνόματος ἂν γελοιότερος ἔτι πρὸς παιδείαν φανείη, εἰ τὰ λεγόμενα περὶ Ὁμήρου ἀληθῆ. λέγεται γὰρ ὡς πολλή τις ἀμέλεια περὶ 600c αὐτὸν ἦν ἐπ' αὐτοῦ ἐκείνου, ὅτε ἔζη.	"Nothing like that is said about him either," he said. "As for Creophylus, Socrates, Homer's companion, his education might prove even more laughable than his name, if what's said about Homer is true. For they say Homer was badly neglected by 600c him in his own day, while he was alive."[4]
600c	λέγεται γὰρ οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. ἀλλ' οἴει, ὦ Γλαύκων, εἰ τῷ ὄντι οἷός τ' ἦν παιδεύειν ἀνθρώπους καὶ βελτίους ἀπεργάζεσθαι Ὅμηρος, ἅτε περὶ τούτων οὐ μιμεῖσθαι ἀλλὰ γιγνώσκειν δυνάμενος, οὐκ ἄρ' ἂν πολλοὺς ἑταίρους ἐποιήσατο καὶ ἐτιμᾶτο καὶ ἠγαπᾶτο ὑπ' αὐτῶν, ἀλλὰ Πρωταγόρας μὲν ἄρα ὁ Ἀβδηρίτης καὶ Πρόδικος ὁ Κεῖος καὶ ἄλλοι πάμπολλοι δύνανται τοῖς ἐφ' ἑαυτῶν παριστάναι ἰδίᾳ συγγιγνόμενοι 600d ὡς οὔτε οἰκίαν οὔτε πόλιν τὴν αὑτῶν διοικεῖν οἷοί τ' ἔσονται, ἐὰν μὴ σφεῖς αὐτῶν ἐπιστατήσωσιν τῆς παιδείας, καὶ ἐπὶ ταύτῃ τῇ σοφίᾳ οὕτω σφόδρα φιλοῦνται, ὥστε μόνον οὐκ ἐπὶ ταῖς κεφαλαῖς περιφέρουσιν αὐτοὺς οἱ ἑταῖροι· Ὅμηρον δ' ἄρα οἱ ἐπ' ἐκείνου, εἴπερ οἷός τ' ἦν πρὸς ἀρετὴν ὀνῆσαι ἀνθρώπους, ἢ Ἡσίοδον ῥαψῳδεῖν ἂν περιιόντας εἴων, καὶ οὐχὶ μᾶλλον ἂν αὐτῶν ἀντείχοντο ἢ τοῦ χρυσοῦ καὶ 600e ἠνάγκαζον παρὰ σφίσιν οἴκοι εἶναι, ἢ εἰ μὴ ἔπειθον, αὐτοὶ ἂν ἐπαιδαγώγουν ὅπῃ ᾖσαν, ἕως ἱκανῶς παιδείας μεταλάβοιεν;	"Yes, that's what they say," I said. "But do you think, Glaucon, that if Homer had really been able to educate people and make them better, since he'd have had knowledge of these things and not just the ability to imitate them, he wouldn't have gained many companions and been honored and loved by them? Protagoras of Abdera, Prodicus of Ceos, and a great many others can convince their contemporaries, by spending time with them in private, 600d that they won't be able to manage their household or their city unless these men supervise their education; and they're loved so intensely for this wisdom that their companions all but carry them around on their heads. Would Homer's contemporaries, then, if he had been able to help people toward excellence, have let him, or Hesiod, go around reciting poems? Wouldn't they have clung to them more than to gold and 600e forced them to stay at home with them, or, if they couldn't persuade them, followed them around themselves wherever they went, until they'd had enough education?"[5]
600e	παντάπασιν, ἔφη, δοκεῖς μοι, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἀληθῆ λέγειν. οὐκοῦν τιθῶμεν ἀπὸ Ὁμήρου ἀρξαμένους πάντας τοὺς ποιητικοὺς μιμητὰς εἰδώλων ἀρετῆς εἶναι καὶ τῶν ἄλλων περὶ ὧν ποιοῦσιν, τῆς δὲ ἀληθείας οὐχ ἅπτεσθαι, ἀλλ' ὥσπερ νυνδὴ ἐλέγομεν, ὁ ζωγράφος σκυτοτόμον ποιήσει δοκοῦντα 601a εἶναι, αὐτός τε οὐκ ἐπαΐων περὶ σκυτοτομίας καὶ τοῖς μὴ ἐπαΐουσιν, ἐκ τῶν χρωμάτων δὲ καὶ σχημάτων θεωροῦσιν; πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"I think what you say is entirely true, Socrates," he said. "Then shall we take it that all poets, starting with Homer, are imitators of images of excellence and of the other things they write about, and don't grasp the truth? Just as we were saying a moment ago, the painter will make what looks like a shoemaker, 601a though he himself understands nothing about shoemaking, to people who don't understand it either, but judge by colors and shapes?" "Certainly."
601a	οὕτω δὴ οἶμαι καὶ τὸν ποιητικὸν φήσομεν χρώματα ἄττα ἑκάστων τῶν τεχνῶν τοῖς ὀνόμασι καὶ ῥήμασιν ἐπιχρωματίζειν αὐτὸν οὐκ ἐπαΐοντα ἀλλ' ἢ μιμεῖσθαι, ὥστε ἑτέροις τοιούτοις ἐκ τῶν λόγων θεωροῦσι δοκεῖν,	"In the same way, I think, we'll say that the poet uses words and phrases to paint on the colors of each of the crafts, though he himself understands nothing but how to imitate, so that to others like

4 Creophylus of Samos, an early epic poet, was said to be Homer's friend; his name sounds like "of the meat tribe."
5 Protagoras and Prodicus were well-known sophists of the fifth century BC who taught for fees.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἐάντε περὶ σκυτοτομίας τις λέγῃ ἐν μέτρῳ καὶ ῥυθμῷ καὶ ἁρμονίᾳ, πάνυ εὖ δοκεῖν λέγεσθαι, ἐάντε περὶ στρατηγίας ἐάντε περὶ ἄλλου [601b] ὁτουοῦν· οὕτω φύσει αὐτὰ ταῦτα μεγάλην τινὰ κήλησιν ἔχειν. ἐπεὶ γυμνωθέντα γε τῶν τῆς μουσικῆς χρωμάτων τὰ τῶν ποιητῶν, αὐτὰ ἐφ᾽ αὑτῶν λεγόμενα, οἶμαί σε εἰδέναι οἷα φαίνεται. τεθέασαι γάρ που.	him, who judge by the words, it seems that if someone speaks about shoemaking in meter and rhythm and harmony, he speaks very well—or about generalship, or about anything [601b] else. So great is the spell these things naturally have. For when the poets' works are stripped of their musical colors and spoken on their own, I think you know how they look. You've surely seen it."
	ἔγωγ᾽, ἔφη.	"I have," he said.
601b	οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, ἔοικεν τοῖς τῶν ὡραίων προσώποις, καλῶν δὲ μή, οἷα γίγνεται ἰδεῖν ὅταν αὐτὰ τὸ ἄνθος προλίπῃ;	"Aren't they," I said, "like the faces of people who are young but not beautiful, as they look when their bloom has left them?"
	παντάπασιν, ἦ δ᾽ ὅς.	"Exactly," he said.
	ἴθι δή, τόδε ἄθρει· ὁ τοῦ εἰδώλου ποιητής, ὁ μιμητής, φαμέν, τοῦ μὲν ὄντος οὐδὲν ἐπαΐει, τοῦ δὲ φαινομένου· οὐχ [601c] οὕτως;	"Come, then, consider this. The maker of the image, the imitator, we say, understands nothing about what is, only about what appears. Isn't [601c] that so?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	μὴ τοίνυν ἡμίσεως αὐτὸ καταλίπωμεν ῥηθέν, ἀλλ᾽ ἱκανῶς ἴδωμεν.	"Then let's not leave it half said, but look at it properly."
	λέγε, ἔφη.	"Go on," he said.
	ζωγράφος, φαμέν, ἡνίας τε γράψει καὶ χαλινόν;	"A painter, we say, will paint reins and a bit?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	ποιήσει δέ γε σκυτοτόμος καὶ χαλκεύς;	"But a leatherworker and a smith will make them?"
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
601c	ἆρ᾽ οὖν ἐπαΐει οἵας δεῖ τὰς ἡνίας εἶναι καὶ τὸν χαλινὸν ὁ γραφεύς; ἢ οὐδ᾽ ὁ ποιήσας, ὅ τε χαλκεὺς καὶ ὁ σκυτεύς, ἀλλ᾽ ἐκεῖνος ὅσπερ τούτοις ἐπίσταται χρῆσθαι, μόνος ὁ ἱππικός;	"Now does the painter understand what the reins and the bit should be like? Or doesn't even the one who makes them, the smith or the leatherworker, understand it, but only the one who knows how to use them, the horseman?"
	ἀληθέστατα.	"Very true."
	ἆρ᾽ οὖν οὐ περὶ πάντα οὕτω φήσομεν ἔχειν;	"And won't we say it's like this with everything?"
	πῶς; [601d]	"How?" [601d]
	περὶ ἕκαστον ταύτας τινὰς τρεῖς τέχνας εἶναι, χρησομένην, ποιήσουσαν, μιμησομένην;	"That for each thing there are these three crafts: one that will use it, one that will make it, and one that will imitate it?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
	οὐκοῦν ἀρετὴ καὶ κάλλος καὶ ὀρθότης ἑκάστου σκεύους καὶ ζῴου καὶ πράξεως οὐ πρὸς ἄλλο τι ἢ τὴν χρείαν ἐστίν, πρὸς ἣν ἂν ἕκαστον ᾖ πεποιημένον ἢ πεφυκός;	"And aren't the excellence, beauty, and correctness of each piece of equipment, each living thing, and each action related to nothing but the use for which each was made, or for which it is naturally suited?"
	οὕτως.	"That's so."

	GREEK	ENGLISH
601d	πολλὴ ἄρα ἀνάγκη τὸν χρώμενον ἑκάστῳ ἐμπειρότατόν τε εἶναι καὶ ἄγγελον γίγνεσθαι τῷ ποιητῇ οἷα ἀγαθὰ ἢ κακὰ ποιεῖ ἐν τῇ χρείᾳ ᾧ χρῆται· οἷον αὐλητής που αὐλοποιῷ [601e] ἐξαγγέλλει περὶ τῶν αὐλῶν, οἳ ἂν ὑπηρετῶσιν ἐν τῷ αὐλεῖν, καὶ ἐπιτάξει οἵους δεῖ ποιεῖν, ὁ δ' ὑπηρετήσει.	"So it's entirely necessary that the user of each thing be the most experienced with it, and that he tell the maker how well or badly the thing he uses performs in use. A pipe-player, for example, [601e] reports to the pipe-maker about the pipes that serve him in his playing, and will prescribe how they should be made, and the maker will serve him."
	πῶς δ' οὔ;	"Of course."
	οὐκοῦν ὁ μὲν εἰδὼς ἐξαγγέλλει περὶ χρηστῶν καὶ πονηρῶν αὐλῶν, ὁ δὲ πιστεύων ποιήσει;	"So the one who knows reports on good and bad pipes, and the other, trusting him, will make them?"
	ναί.	"Yes."
601e	τοῦ αὐτοῦ ἄρα σκεύους ὁ μὲν ποιητὴς πίστιν ὀρθὴν ἕξει περὶ κάλλους τε καὶ πονηρίας, συνὼν τῷ εἰδότι καὶ ἀναγκαζόμενος [602a] ἀκούειν παρὰ τοῦ εἰδότος, ὁ δὲ χρώμενος ἐπιστήμην.	"So about the same piece of equipment, the maker will have correct belief about its fineness and badness, because he associates with the one who knows and is compelled [602a] to listen to him, while the user will have knowledge."
	πάνυ γε.	"Certainly."
	ὁ δὲ μιμητὴς πότερον ἐκ τοῦ χρῆσθαι ἐπιστήμην ἕξει περὶ ὧν ἂν γράφῃ, εἴτε καλὰ καὶ ὀρθὰ εἴτε μή, ἢ δόξαν ὀρθὴν διὰ τὸ ἐξ ἀνάγκης συνεῖναι τῷ εἰδότι καὶ ἐπιτάττεσθαι οἷα χρὴ γράφειν;	"And the imitator? Will he have knowledge, from using them, of whether the things he paints are fine and correct or not? Or correct opinion, through being compelled to associate with the one who knows and being told how he should paint them?"
	οὐδέτερα.	"Neither."
	οὔτε ἄρα εἴσεται οὔτε ὀρθὰ δοξάσει ὁ μιμητὴς περὶ ὧν ἂν μιμῆται πρὸς κάλλος ἢ πονηρίαν.	"So the imitator will neither know nor have correct opinion about the things he imitates, as to their fineness or badness."
	οὐκ ἔοικεν.	"It seems not."
602a	χαρίεις ἂν εἴη ὁ ἐν τῇ ποιήσει μιμητικὸς πρὸς σοφίαν περὶ ὧν ἂν ποιῇ.	"Then the imitator in poetry would be in a charming state of wisdom about the things he writes about!"
	οὐ πάνυ. [602b]	"Hardly." [602b]
	ἀλλ' οὖν δὴ ὅμως γε μιμήσεται, οὐκ εἰδὼς περὶ ἑκάστου ὅπῃ πονηρὸν ἢ χρηστόν· ἀλλ', ὡς ἔοικεν, οἷον φαίνεται καλὸν εἶναι τοῖς πολλοῖς τε καὶ μηδὲν εἰδόσιν, τοῦτο μιμήσεται.	"Still, he'll go on imitating anyway, without knowing in what way each thing is bad or good. Instead, it seems, he'll imitate whatever appears fine to the many, who know nothing."
	τί γὰρ ἄλλο;	"What else?"
602b	ταῦτα μὲν δή, ὥς γε φαίνεται, ἐπιεικῶς ἡμῖν διωμολόγηται, τόν τε μιμητικὸν μηδὲν εἰδέναι ἄξιον λόγου περὶ ὧν μιμεῖται, ἀλλ' εἶναι παιδιάν τινα καὶ οὐ σπουδὴν τὴν μίμησιν, τούς τε τῆς τραγικῆς ποιήσεως ἅπτομένους ἐν ἰαμβείοις καὶ ἐν ἔπεσι πάντας εἶναι μιμητικοὺς ὡς οἷόν τε μάλιστα.	"Well, it seems we're fairly well agreed on these points: that the imitator knows nothing worth mentioning about the things he imitates, that imitation is a kind of play and not a serious business, and that those who take up tragic poetry, in

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν. 602c	iambic or epic verse, are all imitators to the highest possible degree."
	πρὸς Διός, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ δὲ δὴ μιμεῖσθαι τοῦτο οὐ περὶ τρίτον μέν τί ἐστιν ἀπὸ τῆς ἀληθείας; ἦ γάρ;	"Certainly." 602c
	ναί.	"Now, by Zeus," I said, "isn't this imitating concerned with something at the third remove from the truth? Isn't that so?"
	πρὸς δὲ δὴ ποῖόν τί ἐστιν τῶν τοῦ ἀνθρώπου ἔχον τὴν δύναμιν ἣν ἔχει;	"Yes."
		"Then on what sort of part of a human being does it exert the power it has?"
602c	τοῦ ποίου τινὸς πέρι λέγεις;	"What sort of part are you asking about?"
	τοῦ τοιοῦδε· ταὐτόν που ἡμῖν μέγεθος ἐγγύθεν τε καὶ πόρρωθεν διὰ τῆς ὄψεως οὐκ ἴσον φαίνεται.	"This sort. The same magnitude, I suppose, doesn't look equal to us through our sight when it's near and when it's far away."
	οὐ γάρ.	"No, it doesn't."
	καὶ ταὐτὰ καμπύλα τε καὶ εὐθέα ἐν ὕδατί τε θεωμένοις καὶ ἔξω, καὶ κοῖλά τε δὴ καὶ ἐξέχοντα διὰ τὴν περὶ τὰ χρώματα αὖ πλάνην τῆς ὄψεως, καὶ πᾶσά τις ταραχὴ δήλη 602d ἡμῖν ἐνοῦσα αὕτη ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ· ᾧ δὴ ἡμῶν τῷ παθήματι τῆς φύσεως ἡ σκιαγραφία ἐπιθεμένη γοητείας οὐδὲν ἀπολείπει, καὶ ἡ θαυματοποιία καὶ αἱ ἄλλαι πολλαὶ τοιαῦται μηχαναί.	"And the same things look bent and straight when we view them in water and out of it, and concave and convex too, because sight is misled in turn by colors; and every sort of confusion of this kind is clearly 602d present in our soul. It's this weakness in our nature that shadow-painting exploits, and it falls short of nothing in sorcery; so do conjuring and the many other tricks like it."
	ἀληθῆ.	"True."[6]
602d	ἆρ' οὖν οὐ τὸ μετρεῖν καὶ ἀριθμεῖν καὶ ἱστάναι βοήθειαι χαριέσταται πρὸς αὐτὰ ἐφάνησαν, ὥστε μὴ ἄρχειν ἐν ἡμῖν τὸ φαινόμενον μεῖζον ἢ ἔλαττον ἢ πλέον ἢ βαρύτερον, ἀλλὰ τὸ λογισάμενον καὶ μετρῆσαν ἢ καὶ στῆσαν;	"Well, haven't measuring, counting and weighing turned out to be the most welcome helpers against these things, so that what rules in us isn't what appears bigger or smaller or more or heavier, but what has calculated and measured, or even weighed?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ; 602e	"Of course." 602e
	ἀλλὰ μὴν τοῦτό γε τοῦ λογιστικοῦ ἂν εἴη τοῦ ἐν ψυχῇ ἔργον.	"And that, surely, would be the work of the reasoning part in the soul."
	τούτου γὰρ οὖν.	"Yes, it would be that part's."
	τούτῳ δὲ πολλάκις μετρήσαντι καὶ σημαίνοντι μείζω ἄττα εἶναι ἢ ἐλάττω ἕτερα ἑτέρων ἢ ἴσα τἀναντία φαίνεται ἅμα περὶ ταὐτά.	"Yet often, when this part has measured and indicates that some things are bigger or smaller than others, or equal, the opposite appears to it at the same time about the same things."
	ναί.	"Yes."
602e	οὐκοῦν ἔφαμεν τῷ αὐτῷ ἅμα περὶ ταὐτὰ ἐναντία δοξάζειν ἀδύνατον εἶναι;	"Now didn't we say that it's impossible for the same thing to hold opposite opinions about the same things at the same time?"
	καὶ ὀρθῶς γ' ἔφαμεν.	"And we were right to say it."

6 Shadow-painting (skiagraphia) used contrasts of light and shade to create an illusion of depth that works only when seen from a distance.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τὸ παρὰ τὰ μέτρα ἄρα δοξάζον τῆς ψυχῆς τῷ κατὰ τὰ μέτρα οὐκ ἂν εἴη ταὐτόν.	"Then the part of the soul that forms opinions contrary to the measurements can't be the same as the part that forms them in accordance with the measurements."
	οὐ γὰρ οὖν.	"No, it can't."
	ἀλλὰ μὴν τὸ μέτρῳ γε καὶ λογισμῷ πιστεῦον βέλτιστον ἂν εἴη τῆς ψυχῆς.	"But the part that trusts measurement and calculation would be the best part of the soul."
	τί μήν;	"Of course."
	τὸ ἄρα τούτῳ ἐναντιούμενον τῶν φαύλων ἄν τι εἴη ἐν ἡμῖν.	"So the part opposed to it would be one of the inferior things in us."
	ἀνάγκη.	"Necessarily."
603a	τοῦτο τοίνυν διομολογήσασθαι βουλόμενος ἔλεγον ὅτι ἡ γραφικὴ καὶ ὅλως ἡ μιμητικὴ πόρρω μὲν τῆς ἀληθείας ὂν τὸ αὑτῆς ἔργον ἀπεργάζεται, πόρρω δ' αὖ φρονήσεως ὄντι τῷ [603b] ἐν ἡμῖν προσομιλεῖ τε καὶ ἑταίρα καὶ φίλη ἐστὶν ἐπ' οὐδενὶ ὑγιεῖ οὐδ' ἀληθεῖ.	"This, then, is what I wanted us to agree on when I said that painting, and imitation as a whole, produces its own work far from the truth, and that it keeps company with the part of us [603b] that is far from understanding, and is its companion and friend for no healthy or true purpose."
	παντάπασιν, ἦ δ' ὅς.	"Absolutely," he said.
	φαύλη ἄρα φαύλῳ συγγιγνομένη φαῦλα γεννᾷ ἡ μιμητική.	"So imitation, an inferior thing mating with an inferior thing, breeds inferior offspring."
	ἔοικεν.	"So it seems."
	πότερον, ἣν δ' ἐγώ, ἡ κατὰ τὴν ὄψιν μόνον, ἢ καὶ κατὰ τὴν ἀκοήν, ἣν δὴ ποίησιν ὀνομάζομεν;	"Is that true only of the kind that concerns sight," I said, "or also of the kind that concerns hearing, which we call poetry?"
	εἰκός γ', ἔφη, καὶ ταύτην.	"Probably that kind too," he said.
603b	μὴ τοίνυν, ἣν δ' ἐγώ, τῷ εἰκότι μόνον πιστεύσωμεν ἐκ τῆς γραφικῆς, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἐπ' αὐτὸ αὖ ἔλθωμεν τῆς διανοίας [603c] τοῦτο ᾧ προσομιλεῖ ἡ τῆς ποιήσεως μιμητική, καὶ ἴδωμεν φαῦλον ἢ σπουδαῖόν ἐστιν.	"Then let's not rely only on the likelihood drawn from painting," I said. "Let's go on to that very part of the mind [603c] with which poetic imitation keeps company, and see whether it's inferior or worth taking seriously."
	ἀλλὰ χρή.	"We must."
	ὧδε δὴ προθώμεθα· πράττοντας, φαμέν, ἀνθρώπους μιμεῖται ἡ μιμητικὴ βιαίους ἢ ἑκουσίας πράξεις, καὶ ἐκ τοῦ πράττειν ἢ εὖ οἰομένους ἢ κακῶς πεπραγέναι, καὶ ἐν τούτοις δὴ πᾶσιν ἢ λυπουμένους ἢ χαίροντας. μή τι ἄλλο ἦν παρὰ ταῦτα;	"Let's set it out like this. Imitation, we say, imitates human beings performing actions, forced or voluntary, who think that as a result of their actions they have fared well or badly, and who in all of this feel either pain or pleasure. Was there anything besides these?"
	οὐδέν.	"Nothing."
603c	ἆρ' οὖν ἐν ἅπασι τούτοις ὁμονοητικῶς ἄνθρωπος διάκειται; [603d] ἢ ὥσπερ κατὰ τὴν ὄψιν ἐστασίαζεν καὶ ἐναντίας εἶχεν ἐν ἑαυτῷ δόξας ἅμα περὶ τῶν αὐτῶν, οὕτω καὶ ἐν ταῖς πράξεσι στασιάζει τε καὶ μάχεται αὐτὸς αὑτῷ; ἀναμιμνήσκομαι δὲ ὅτι τοῦτό γε νῦν οὐδὲν δεῖ ἡμᾶς διομολογεῖσθαι· ἐν γὰρ τοῖς ἄνω λόγοις ἱκανῶς πάντα	"Then in all these situations is a person of one mind with himself? [603d] Or, just as with sight he was at odds with himself and held opposite opinions within himself about the same things at the same time, is he also at odds and at war with himself in his actions? But I'm reminded that we don't

GREEK

ταῦτα διωμολογησάμεθα, ὅτι μυρίων τοιούτων ἐναντιωμάτων ἅμα γιγνομένων ἡ ψυχὴ γέμει ἡμῶν.

ὀρθῶς, ἔφη.

ὀρθῶς γάρ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· ἀλλ' ὃ τότε ἀπελίπομεν, νῦν μοι 603e δοκεῖ ἀναγκαῖον εἶναι διεξελθεῖν.

τὸ ποῖον; ἔφη.

603e ἀνήρ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐπιεικὴς τοιᾶσδε τύχης μετασχών, ὑὸν ἀπολέσας ἤ τι ἄλλο ὧν περὶ πλείστου ποιεῖται, ἐλέγομέν που καὶ τότε ὅτι ῥᾷστα οἴσει τῶν ἄλλων.

πάνυ γε.

νῦν δέ γε τόδ' ἐπισκεψώμεθα, πότερον οὐδὲν ἀχθέσεται, ἢ τοῦτο μὲν ἀδύνατον, μετριάσει δέ πως πρὸς λύπην.

οὕτω μᾶλλον, ἔφη, τό γε ἀληθές.

τόδε νῦν μοι περὶ αὐτοῦ εἰπέ· πότερον μᾶλλον αὐτὸν οἴει τῇ λύπῃ μαχεῖσθαί τε καὶ ἀντιτείνειν, ὅταν ὁρᾶται ὑπὸ τῶν ὁμοίων, ἢ ὅταν ἐν ἐρημίᾳ μόνος αὐτὸς καθ' αὑτόν γίγνηται;

604a πολύ που, ἔφη, διοίσει, ὅταν ὁρᾶται.

μονωθεὶς δέ γε οἶμαι πολλὰ μὲν τολμήσει φθέγξασθαι, ἃ εἴ τις αὐτοῦ ἀκούοι αἰσχύνοιτ' ἄν, πολλὰ δὲ ποιήσει, ἃ οὐκ ἂν δέξαιτό τινα ἰδεῖν δρῶντα.

οὕτως ἔχει, ἔφη.

οὐκοῦν τὸ μὲν ἀντιτείνειν διακελευόμενον λόγος καὶ νόμος 604b ἐστίν, τὸ δὲ ἕλκον ἐπὶ τὰς λύπας αὐτὸ τὸ πάθος;

ἀληθῆ.

ἐναντίας δὲ ἀγωγῆς γιγνομένης ἐν τῷ ἀνθρώπῳ περὶ τὸ αὐτὸ ἅμα, δύο φαμὲν αὐτὼ ἀναγκαῖον εἶναι.

πῶς δ' οὔ;

604b οὐκοῦν τὸ μὲν ἕτερον τῷ νόμῳ ἕτοιμον πείθεσθαι, ᾗ ὁ νόμος ἐξηγεῖται;

πῶς;

λέγει που ὁ νόμος ὅτι κάλλιστον ὅτι μάλιστα ἡσυχίαν ἄγειν ἐν ταῖς συμφοραῖς καὶ μὴ ἀγανακτεῖν, ὡς οὔτε δήλου ὄντος τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ τε καὶ κακοῦ τῶν τοιούτων, οὔτε εἰς τὸ πρόσθεν οὐδὲν προβαῖνον τῷ χαλεπῶς φέροντι, οὔτε τι τῶν 604c ἀνθρωπίνων ἄξιον ὂν μεγάλης σπουδῆς,

ENGLISH

need to reach agreement on this now. In our earlier discussion we agreed well enough on all of it: that our soul is full of countless oppositions of this kind occurring at the same time."

"Rightly," he said.

"Yes, rightly," I said. "But what we left out then, I think we now 603e have to go through."

"What's that?" he said.

"A decent man," I said, "who meets with a misfortune like losing a son, or anything else he values most, will bear it more easily than others. We said that then too, I think."

"Certainly."

"Now let's look at this: will he feel no grief at all, or is that impossible, and will he instead somehow be moderate in the face of pain?"

"The second is closer to the truth," he said.

"Now tell me this about him. Do you think he'll fight and resist his pain more when he's seen by his peers, or when he's alone by himself in solitude?"

"Far more, I suppose," he said, "when he's seen."

"But when he's alone, I think, he'll dare to say many things he'd be ashamed for anyone to hear, and do many things he wouldn't want anyone to see him doing."

"That's so," he said.

"Now what urges him to resist is reason and law, 604b and what drags him toward grief is the feeling itself?"

"True."

"And when there are opposite pulls in a person about the same thing at the same time, we say there must be two things in him."

"Of course."

"And isn't one of them ready to obey the law, wherever the law leads?"

"How do you mean?"

"The law says, I suppose, that it's finest to stay as calm as possible in misfortunes and not be upset. It isn't clear what is good or bad in such things; taking it hard gets you nowhere; nothing 604c human is worth great seriousness; and grieving gets

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ὅ τε δεῖ ἐν αὐτοῖς ὅτι τάχιστα παραγίγνεσθαι ἡμῖν, τούτῳ ἐμποδὼν γιγνόμενον τὸ λυπεῖσθαι.	in the way of the thing that ought to come to our aid as quickly as possible in these circumstances."
	τίνι, ἦ δ' ὅς, λέγεις;	"Gets in the way of what?" he said.
604c	τῷ βουλεύεσθαι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, περὶ τὸ γεγονὸς καὶ ὥσπερ ἐν πτώσει κύβων πρὸς τὰ πεπτωκότα τίθεσθαι τὰ αὐτοῦ πράγματα, ὅπῃ ὁ λόγος αἱρεῖ βέλτιστ' ἂν ἔχειν, ἀλλὰ μὴ προσπταίσαντας καθάπερ παῖδας ἐχομένους τοῦ πληγέντος ἐν τῷ βοᾶν διατρίβειν, ἀλλ' ἀεὶ ἐθίζειν τὴν ψυχὴν ὅτι 604d τάχιστα γίγνεσθαι πρὸς τὸ ἰᾶσθαί τε καὶ ἐπανορθοῦν τὸ πεσόν τε καὶ νοσῆσαν, ἰατρικῇ θρηνῳδίαν ἀφανίζοντα.	"Of deliberating about what has happened," I said, "and, as with a throw of the dice, arranging one's affairs in light of how things have fallen, in whatever way reason judges best. We shouldn't be like children who've taken a knock, clutching the sore spot and wasting our time howling. We should always train the soul to turn as 604d quickly as possible to healing and to setting right what has fallen and is sick, doing away with lament through medicine."
	ὀρθότατα γοῦν ἄν τις, ἔφη, πρὸς τὰς τύχας οὕτω προσφέροιτο.	"That would certainly be the most correct way to deal with misfortunes," he said.
	οὐκοῦν, φαμέν, τὸ μὲν βέλτιστον τούτῳ τῷ λογισμῷ ἐθέλει ἕπεσθαι.	"And the best part of us, we say, is willing to follow this reasoning."
	δῆλον δή.	"Clearly."
604d	τὸ δὲ πρὸς τὰς ἀναμνήσεις τε τοῦ πάθους καὶ πρὸς τοὺς ὀδυρμοὺς ἄγον καὶ ἀπλήστως ἔχον αὐτῶν ἆρ' οὐκ ἀλόγιστόν τε φήσομεν εἶναι καὶ ἀργὸν καὶ δειλίας φίλον;	"And the part that leads us to dwell on the memory of our suffering and to lamentation, and can never get enough of them—won't we say it's irrational, idle, and a friend of cowardice?"
	φήσομεν μὲν οὖν. 604e	"We will." 604e
	οὐκοῦν τὸ μὲν πολλὴν μίμησιν καὶ ποικίλην ἔχει, τὸ ἀγανακτητικόν, τὸ δὲ φρόνιμόν τε καὶ ἡσύχιον ἦθος, παραπλήσιον ὂν ἀεὶ αὐτὸ αὑτῷ, οὔτε ῥᾴδιον μιμήσασθαι οὔτε μιμουμένου εὐπετὲς καταμαθεῖν, ἄλλως τε καὶ πανηγύρει καὶ παντοδαποῖς ἀνθρώποις εἰς θέατρα συλλεγομένοις· ἀλλοτρίου γάρ που πάθους ἡ μίμησις αὐτοῖς γίγνεται.	"Now the fretful part offers plenty of varied material for imitation. But the sensible and calm character, always much the same as itself, is neither easy to imitate nor, when imitated, easy to understand —especially for a festival crowd, all sorts of people gathered in theaters. The imitation is of a state of feeling that's foreign to them."
	παντάπασι μὲν οὖν.	"Absolutely."
605a	ὁ δὴ μιμητικὸς ποιητὴς δῆλον ὅτι οὐ πρὸς τὸ τοιοῦτον τῆς ψυχῆς πέφυκέ τε καὶ ἡ σοφία αὐτοῦ τούτῳ ἀρέσκειν πέπηγεν, εἰ μέλλει εὐδοκιμήσειν ἐν τοῖς πολλοῖς, ἀλλὰ πρὸς τὸ ἀγανακτητικόν τε καὶ ποικίλον ἦθος διὰ τὸ εὐμίμητον εἶναι.	"Clearly, then, the imitative poet isn't naturally drawn toward that part of the soul, and his wisdom isn't geared to pleasing it, if he's going to win a good name among the many. He's drawn toward the fretful and varied character, because it's easy to imitate."
	δῆλον.	"Clearly."
	οὐκοῦν δικαίως ἂν αὐτοῦ ἤδη ἐπιλαμβανοίμεθα, καὶ τιθεῖμεν ἀντίστροφον αὐτὸν τῷ ζωγράφῳ· καὶ γὰρ τῷ φαῦλα ποιεῖν πρὸς ἀλήθειαν ἔοικεν αὐτῷ, καὶ τῷ πρὸς ἕτερον τοιοῦτον 605b ὁμιλεῖν τῆς ψυχῆς ἀλλὰ μὴ πρὸς τὸ βέλτιστον, καὶ ταύτῃ ὡμοίωται. καὶ οὕτως ἤδη ἂν ἐν δίκῃ οὐ παραδεχοίμεθα εἰς μέλλουσαν εὐνομεῖσθαι πόλιν, ὅτι τοῦτο ἐγείρει τῆς ψυχῆς καὶ τρέφει καὶ ἰσχυρὸν ποιῶν	"So now we'd be justified in taking hold of him and setting him beside the painter as his counterpart. He resembles the painter in producing things that are inferior with respect to truth; and he's like him in this too, that he keeps company with 605b a part of the soul that is likewise inferior, and not with the best part. And so we'd at last be justified in re-

GREEK

ENGLISH

ἀπόλλυσι τὸ λογιστικόν, ὥσπερ ἐν πόλει ὅταν τις μοχθηροὺς ἐγκρατεῖς ποιῶν παραδιδῷ τὴν πόλιν, τοὺς δὲ χαριεστέρους φθείρῃ· ταὐτὸν καὶ τὸν μιμητικὸν ποιητὴν φήσομεν κακὴν πολιτείαν ἰδίᾳ ἑκάστου τῇ ψυχῇ ἐμποιεῖν, τῷ ἀνοήτῳ αὐτῆς [605c] χαριζόμενον καὶ οὔτε τὰ μείζω οὔτε τὰ ἐλάττω διαγιγνώσκοντι, ἀλλὰ τὰ αὐτὰ τοτὲ μὲν μεγάλα ἡγουμένῳ, τοτὲ δὲ σμικρά, εἴδωλα εἰδωλοποιοῦντα, τοῦ δὲ ἀληθοῦς πόρρω πάνυ ἀφεστῶτα.

fusing to admit him into a city that is going to be well governed, because he arouses this part of the soul, nourishes it, and by making it strong destroys the reasoning part—just as happens in a city when someone makes bad men powerful and hands the city over to them, and ruins the better sort. In the same way we'll say that the imitative poet sets up a bad constitution privately in each person's soul, gratifying its senseless part, [605c] which can't tell bigger from smaller but thinks the same things are now big, now small. He makes mere images, and stands very far from the truth."

605c πάνυ μὲν οὖν.

"Certainly."

οὐ μέντοι πω τό γε μέγιστον κατηγορήκαμεν αὐτῆς. τὸ γὰρ καὶ τοὺς ἐπιεικεῖς ἱκανὴν εἶναι λωβᾶσθαι, ἐκτὸς πάνυ τινῶν ὀλίγων, πάνδεινόν που.

"But we haven't yet made the gravest accusation against it. Its ability to corrupt even decent people, with very few exceptions, is surely quite terrible."

τί δ' οὐ μέλλει, εἴπερ γε δρᾷ αὐτό;

"How could it not be, if it really does that?"

ἀκούων σκόπει. οἱ γάρ που βέλτιστοι ἡμῶν ἀκροώμενοι Ὁμήρου ἢ ἄλλου τινὸς τῶν τραγῳδοποιῶν μιμουμένου [605d] τινὰ τῶν ἡρώων ἐν πένθει ὄντα καὶ μακρὰν ῥῆσιν ἀποτείνοντα ἐν τοῖς ὀδυρμοῖς ἢ καὶ ᾄδοντάς τε καὶ κοπτομένους, οἶσθ' ὅτι χαίρομέν τε καὶ ἐνδόντες ἡμᾶς αὐτοὺς ἑπόμεθα συμπάσχοντες καὶ σπουδάζοντες ἐπαινοῦμεν ὡς ἀγαθὸν ποιητήν, ὃς ἂν ἡμᾶς ὅτι μάλιστα οὕτω διαθῇ.

"Listen and consider. When the best of us hear Homer, or one of the other tragic poets, imitating [605d] one of the heroes in mourning, drawing out a long speech of lamentation, or singing and beating their breasts, you know that we enjoy it. We give ourselves up to it and follow along, sharing the suffering, and we earnestly praise as a good poet whoever puts us most in that state."

οἶδα· πῶς δ' οὔ;

"I know. Of course."

605d ὅταν δὲ οἰκεῖόν τινι ἡμῶν κῆδος γένηται, ἐννοεῖς αὖ ὅτι ἐπὶ τῷ ἐναντίῳ καλλωπιζόμεθα, ἂν δυνώμεθα ἡσυχίαν ἄγειν [605e] καὶ καρτερεῖν, ὡς τοῦτο μὲν ἀνδρὸς ὄν, ἐκεῖνο δὲ γυναικός, ὃ τότε ἐπῃνοῦμεν.

"But when a sorrow of our own comes to one of us, you notice that we pride ourselves on the opposite—on being able to keep calm [605e] and endure it—on the grounds that this is a man's part, and what we praised back then a woman's."

ἐννοῶ, ἔφη.

"I notice," he said.

ἦ καλῶς οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὗτος ὁ ἔπαινος ἔχει, τὸ ὁρῶντα τοιοῦτον ἄνδρα, οἷον ἑαυτόν τις μὴ ἀξιοῖ εἶναι ἀλλ' αἰσχύνοιτο ἄν, μὴ βδελύττεσθαι ἀλλὰ χαίρειν τε καὶ ἐπαινεῖν;

"Then is this praise right," I said, "when we see a man of a kind we wouldn't think fit to be ourselves, and would be ashamed to be, and instead of being disgusted we enjoy it and praise him?"

οὐ μὰ τὸν Δί', ἔφη, οὐκ εὐλόγῳ ἔοικεν.

"No, by Zeus," he said, "that doesn't seem reasonable."

ναί, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἰ ἐκείνῃ γ' αὐτὸ σκοποίης.

"No," I said, "especially if you look at it this way."

πῇ;

"How?"

606a εἰ ἐνθυμοῖο ὅτι τὸ βίᾳ κατεχόμενον τότε ἐν ταῖς οἰκείαις συμφοραῖς καὶ πεπεινηκὸς τοῦ δακρῦσαί τε καὶ ἀποδύρασθαι ἱκανῶς καὶ ἀποπλησθῆναι, φύσει ὂν

"If you consider that the part of us held down by force in our own misfortunes, which has been hungering to weep and wail to its heart's content

GREEK

τοιοῦτον οἷον τούτων ἐπιθυμεῖν, τότ' ἐστὶν τοῦτο τὸ ὑπὸ τῶν ποιητῶν πιμπλάμενον καὶ χαῖρον· τὸ δὲ φύσει βέλτιστον ἡμῶν, ἅτε οὐχ ἱκανῶς πεπαιδευμένον λόγῳ οὐδὲ ἔθει, ἀνίησιν τὴν φυλακὴν τοῦ 606b θρηνώδους τούτου, ἅτε ἀλλότρια πάθη θεωροῦν καὶ ἑαυτῷ οὐδὲν αἰσχρὸν ὂν εἰ ἄλλος ἀνὴρ ἀγαθὸς φάσκων εἶναι ἀκαίρως πενθεῖ, τοῦτον ἐπαινεῖν καὶ ἐλεεῖν, ἀλλ' ἐκεῖνο κερδαίνειν ἡγεῖται, τὴν ἡδονήν, καὶ οὐκ ἂν δέξαιτο αὐτῆς στερηθῆναι καταφρονήσας ὅλου τοῦ ποιήματος. λογίζεσθαι γὰρ οἶμαι ὀλίγοις τισὶν μέτεστιν ὅτι ἀπολαύειν ἀνάγκη ἀπὸ τῶν ἀλλοτρίων εἰς τὰ οἰκεῖα· θρέψαντα γὰρ ἐν ἐκείνοις ἰσχυρὸν τὸ ἐλεινὸν οὐ ῥᾴδιον ἐν τοῖς αὑτοῦ πάθεσι κατέχειν. 606c

606c ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη.

ἆρ' οὖν οὐχ ὁ αὐτὸς λόγος καὶ περὶ τοῦ γελοίου; ὅτι, ἂν αὐτὸς αἰσχύνοιο γελωτοποιῶν, ἐν μιμήσει δὲ κωμῳδικῇ ἢ καὶ ἰδίᾳ ἀκούων σφόδρα χαρῇς καὶ μὴ μισῇς ὡς πονηρά, ταὐτὸν ποιεῖς ὅπερ ἐν τοῖς ἐλέοις; ὃ γὰρ τῷ λόγῳ αὖ κατεῖχες ἐν σαυτῷ βουλόμενον γελωτοποιεῖν, φοβούμενος δόξαν βωμολοχίας, τότ' αὖ ἀνιεῖς, καὶ ἐκεῖ νεανικὸν ποιήσας ἔλαθες πολλάκις ἐν τοῖς οἰκείοις ἐξενεχθεὶς ὥστε κωμῳδοποιὸς γενέσθαι.

καὶ μάλα, ἔφη. 606d

606d καὶ περὶ ἀφροδισίων δὴ καὶ θυμοῦ καὶ περὶ πάντων τῶν ἐπιθυμητικῶν τε καὶ λυπηρῶν καὶ ἡδέων ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ, ἃ δή φαμεν πάσῃ πράξει ἡμῖν ἕπεσθαι, ὅτι τοιαῦτα ἡμᾶς ἡ ποιητικὴ μίμησις ἐργάζεται· τρέφει γὰρ ταῦτα ἄρδουσα, δέον αὐχμεῖν, καὶ ἄρχοντα ἡμῖν καθίστησιν, δέον ἄρχεσθαι αὐτὰ ἵνα βελτίους τε καὶ εὐδαιμονέστεροι ἀντὶ χειρόνων καὶ ἀθλιωτέρων γιγνώμεθα.

οὐκ ἔχω ἄλλως φάναι, ἦ δ' ὅς. 606e

606e οὐκοῦν, εἶπον, ὦ Γλαύκων, ὅταν Ὁμήρου ἐπαινέταις ἐντύχῃς λέγουσιν ὡς τὴν Ἑλλάδα πεπαίδευκεν οὗτος ὁ ποιητὴς καὶ πρὸς διοίκησίν τε καὶ παιδείαν τῶν ἀνθρωπίνων πραγμάτων ἄξιος ἀναλαβόντι μανθάνειν τε καὶ κατὰ τοῦτον τὸν ποιητὴν πάντα τὸν αὑτοῦ βίον κατασκευασάμενον ζῆν, 607a φιλεῖν μὲν χρὴ καὶ ἀσπάζεσθαι ὡς ὄντας βελτίστους εἰς ὅσον δύνανται, καὶ συγχωρεῖν Ὅμηρον ποιητικώτατον εἶναι καὶ πρῶτον τῶν

ENGLISH

and be satisfied, since by nature it desires these things, is the very part that the poets fill up and gratify. And the naturally best part of us, because it hasn't been adequately educated by reason or habit, relaxes its guard over 606b this mournful part. It's watching someone else's sufferings, after all, and there's nothing shameful for itself in praising and pitying another man who claims to be good but grieves out of season. Rather, it thinks it gains something—the pleasure—and wouldn't accept being deprived of it by despising the whole poem. For only a few, I think, are capable of reckoning that what we enjoy from others' experiences necessarily carries over into our own. Once you've nourished the pitying part and made it strong on those, it isn't easy to hold it down in your own sufferings." 606c

"Very true," he said.

"And doesn't the same argument apply to the laughable? If there are jokes you'd be ashamed to make yourself, but you hear them in comic imitation, or even in private, and enjoy them hugely instead of hating them as base, aren't you doing the same as with pity? The part of you that wanted to play the clown, which you held down with reason for fear of being thought a buffoon, you now let loose; and having made it lively there, you're often carried away without noticing in your own life, so that you turn into a comic poet yourself."

"Very much so," he said. 606d

"And as for sex and anger and all the desires, pains and pleasures in the soul, which we say accompany our every action, poetic imitation has the same effect on us. It nourishes them by watering them when they ought to dry up, and sets them up as our rulers when they ought to be ruled, so that we may become better and happier rather than worse and more wretched."

"I can't say otherwise," he said. 606e

"Then, Glaucon," I said, "when you meet admirers of Homer who say that this poet educated Greece, and that for managing human affairs and educating people in them he deserves to be taken up and studied, and that one should arrange one's whole life by following this poet, 607a you should love and welcome them as people who are as good as they're able to be, and agree that Homer is the

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	τραγῳδοποιῶν, εἰδέναι δὲ ὅτι ὅσον μόνον ὕμνους θεοῖς καὶ ἐγκώμια τοῖς ἀγαθοῖς ποιήσεως παραδεκτέον εἰς πόλιν·	most poetic of poets and the first of the tragedians. But you should know that the only poetry we can admit into our city is hymns to the gods and praises of good people.
607a	εἰ δὲ τὴν ἡδυσμένην Μοῦσαν παραδέξῃ ἐν μέλεσιν ἢ ἔπεσιν, ἡδονή σοι καὶ λύπη ἐν τῇ πόλει βασιλεύσετον ἀντὶ νόμου τε καὶ τοῦ κοινῇ ἀεὶ δόξαντος εἶναι βελτίστου λόγου.	"If you admit the honeyed Muse in lyric or epic verse, pleasure and pain will be kings in your city instead of law and the reasoning that the community has always judged best."
	ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη. 607b	"Very true," he said. 607b

THE ANCIENT QUARREL

Socrates notes the ancient quarrel between philosophy and poetry and invites poetry to defend itself.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
607b	**SOCRATES** ταῦτα δή, ἔφην, ἀπολελογήσθω ἡμῖν ἀναμνησθεῖσιν περὶ ποιήσεως, ὅτι εἰκότως ἄρα τότε αὐτὴν ἐκ τῆς πόλεως ἀπεστέλλομεν τοιαύτην οὖσαν· ὁ γὰρ λόγος ἡμᾶς ἦρει. προσείπωμεν δὲ αὐτῇ, μὴ καί τινα σκληρότητα ἡμῶν καὶ ἀγροικίαν καταγνῷ, ὅτι παλαιὰ μέν τις διαφορὰ φιλοσοφίᾳ τε καὶ ποιητικῇ· καὶ γὰρ ἡ λακέρυζα πρὸς δεσπόταν κύων ἐκείνη κραυγάζουσα καὶ μέγας ἐν ἀφρόνων κενεαγορίαισι 607c καὶ ὁ τῶν διασόφων ὄχλος κρατῶν καὶ οἱ λεπτῶς μεριμνῶντες, ὅτι ἄρα πένονται, καὶ ἄλλα μυρία σημεῖα παλαιᾶς ἐναντιώσεως τούτων. ὅμως δὲ εἰρήσθω ὅτι ἡμεῖς γε, εἴ τινα ἔχοι λόγον εἰπεῖν ἡ πρὸς ἡδονὴν ποιητικὴ καὶ ἡ μίμησις, ὡς χρὴ αὐτὴν εἶναι ἐν πόλει εὐνομουμένῃ, ἄσμενοι ἂν καταδεχοίμεθα, ὡς σύνισμέν γε ἡμῖν αὐτοῖς κηλουμένοις ὑπ' αὐτῆς· ἀλλὰ γὰρ τὸ δοκοῦν ἀληθὲς οὐχ ὅσιον προδιδόναι.	**SOCRATES** "Let that be our defense, then," I said, "now that we've come back to the subject of poetry: that we had good reason, back then, to send it out of the city, being what it is. The argument compelled us. And let's tell it further, so that it doesn't convict us of harshness and boorishness, that there's an ancient quarrel between philosophy and poetry. There's 'the yelping dog that bays at its master,' and 'great in the empty chatter of fools,' 607c and 'the mob of the overwise that holds sway,' and 'the subtle thinkers who are beggars after all,' and countless other signs of their old opposition. All the same, let it be said that if poetry aimed at pleasure, and imitation, have any argument to offer why they should exist in a well-governed city, we'd be glad to take them back, since we're well aware of being charmed by it ourselves. But it isn't right to betray what seems to be true.[7]
607c	ἦ γάρ, ὦ φίλε, οὐ κηλῇ ὑπ' αὐτῆς 607d καὶ σύ, καὶ μάλιστα ὅταν δι' Ὁμήρου θεωρῇς αὐτήν;	"Aren't you charmed by it too, my friend, 607d especially when you view it through Homer?"
607d	πολύ γε.	"Very much."
	οὐκοῦν δικαία ἐστὶν οὕτω κατιέναι, ἀπολογησαμένη ἐν μέλει ἤ τινι ἄλλῳ μέτρῳ;	"Then isn't it right for it to come back on these terms, once it has made its defense in lyric or some other meter?"
	πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"Certainly."
	δοῖμεν δέ γέ που ἂν καὶ τοῖς προστάταις αὐτῆς, ὅσοι μὴ ποιητικοί, φιλοποιηταὶ δέ, ἄνευ μέτρου λόγον ὑπὲρ αὐτῆς εἰπεῖν, ὡς οὐ μόνον ἡδεῖα ἀλλὰ καὶ ὠφελίμη πρὸς τὰς πολιτείας καὶ τὸν βίον τὸν ἀνθρώπινόν ἐστιν· καὶ εὐμενῶς ἀκουσόμεθα. 607e κερδανοῦμεν γάρ που ἐὰν μὴ μόνον ἡδεῖα φανῇ ἀλλὰ καὶ ὠφελίμη.	"And we'd surely also let its champions who aren't poets themselves, but lovers of poetry, speak on its behalf in prose, and show that it's not only pleasant but also beneficial to constitutions and to human life. We'll listen kindly. 607e We'll gain, surely,

7 The phrases quoted are from unknown poets mocking philosophers; their sources are lost.

GREEK

πῶς δ' οὐ μέλλομεν, ἔφη, κερδαίνειν;

607e εἰ δέ γε μή, ὦ φίλε ἑταῖρε, ὥσπερ οἱ ποτέ του ἐρασθέντες, ἐὰν ἡγήσωνται μὴ ὠφέλιμον εἶναι τὸν ἔρωτα, βίᾳ μέν, ὅμως δὲ ἀπέχονται, καὶ ἡμεῖς οὕτως, διὰ τὸν ἐγγεγονότα μὲν ἔρωτα τῆς τοιαύτης ποιήσεως ὑπὸ τῆς τῶν καλῶν πολιτειῶν [608a] τροφῆς, εὖνοι μὲν ἐσόμεθα φανῆναι αὐτὴν ὡς βελτίστην καὶ ἀληθεστάτην, ἕως δ' ἂν μὴ οἵα τ' ᾖ ἀπολογήσασθαι, ἀκροασόμεθ' αὐτῆς ἐπᾴδοντες ἡμῖν αὐτοῖς τοῦτον τὸν λόγον, ὃν λέγομεν, καὶ ταύτην τὴν ἐπῳδήν, εὐλαβούμενοι πάλιν ἐμπεσεῖν εἰς τὸν παιδικόν τε καὶ τὸν τῶν πολλῶν ἔρωτα. ᾀσόμεθα δ' οὖν ὡς οὐ σπουδαστέον ἐπὶ τῇ τοιαύτῃ ποιήσει ὡς ἀληθείας τε ἁπτομένῃ καὶ σπουδαίᾳ, ἀλλ' εὐλαβητέον [608b] αὐτὴν ὃν τῷ ἀκροωμένῳ, περὶ τῆς ἐν αὐτῷ πολιτείας δεδιότι, καὶ νομιστέα ἅπερ εἰρήκαμεν περὶ ποιήσεως.

608b παντάπασιν, ἦ δ' ὅς, σύμφημι.

μέγας γάρ, ἔφην, ὁ ἀγών, ὦ φίλε Γλαύκων, μέγας, οὐχ ὅσος δοκεῖ, τὸ χρηστὸν ἢ κακὸν γενέσθαι, ὥστε οὔτε τιμῇ ἐπαρθέντα οὔτε χρήμασιν οὔτε ἀρχῇ οὐδεμιᾷ οὐδέ γε ποιητικῇ ἄξιον ἀμελῆσαι δικαιοσύνης τε καὶ τῆς ἄλλης ἀρετῆς.

σύμφημί σοι, ἔφη, ἐξ ὧν διεληλύθαμεν· οἶμαι δὲ καὶ ἄλλον ὁντινοῦν. [608c]

καὶ μήν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τά γε μέγιστα ἐπίχειρα ἀρετῆς καὶ προκείμενα ἆθλα οὐ διεληλύθαμεν.

ἀμήχανόν τι, ἔφη, λέγεις μέγεθος, εἰ τῶν εἰρημένων μείζω ἐστὶν ἄλλα.

ENGLISH

if it turns out to be not only pleasant but beneficial."

"How could we not gain?" he said.

"But if not, my dear friend, then we'll be like people who've once fallen in love with someone and, if they decide the love isn't beneficial, keep away from it, by force but keep away all the same. Because of the love for such poetry bred in us by our upbringing in [608a] fine constitutions, we'll be glad for it to prove as good and as true as possible. But as long as it can't make its defense, we'll listen to it while chanting this argument of ours to ourselves as a counter-charm, taking care not to fall back into the childish love that most people have. So we'll chant that such poetry mustn't be taken seriously, as though it grasped the truth and were a serious thing; the listener should be on guard [608b] against it, fearing for the constitution within himself, and should hold to what we've said about poetry."

"I agree completely," he said.

"Yes," I said, "for the contest is great, my dear Glaucon, great—greater than it seems—the contest over becoming good or bad. So it isn't worth being carried away by honor or money or any office, or by poetry either, into neglecting justice and the rest of excellence."

"I agree with you," he said, "from what we've gone through; and I think anyone else would too." [608c]

"And yet," I said, "we haven't gone through the greatest rewards of excellence, the prizes set out for it."

"You're talking about something of extraordinary size," he said, "if there are others greater than those we've mentioned."

THE IMMORTALITY OF THE SOUL

Socrates argues the soul is immortal because its own evil, injustice, cannot destroy it.

GREEK

608c **SOCRATES** τί δ' ἄν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἔν γε ὀλίγῳ χρόνῳ μέγα γένοιτο; πᾶς γὰρ οὗτός γε ὁ ἐκ παιδὸς μέχρι πρεσβύτου χρόνος πρὸς πάντα ὀλίγος πού τις ἂν εἴη.

οὐδὲν μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

τί οὖν; οἴει ἀθανάτῳ πράγματι ὑπὲρ τοσούτου δεῖν [608d] χρόνου ἐσπουδακέναι, ἀλλ' οὐχ ὑπὲρ τοῦ παντός;

ENGLISH

SOCRATES "What could be great in a short time?" I said. "This whole span from childhood to old age would surely be short compared with all time."

"It's nothing at all," he said.

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	οἶμαι ἔγωγ', ἔφη· ἀλλὰ τί τοῦτο λέγεις;	"Well then? Do you think an immortal thing
	οὐκ ᾔσθησαι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι ἀθάνατος ἡμῶν ἡ ψυχὴ καὶ οὐδέποτε ἀπόλλυται;	should be concerned with so short a 608d time, and not with all time?"
	καὶ ὃς ἐμβλέψας μοι καὶ θαυμάσας εἶπε· μὰ Δί', οὐκ ἔγωγε· σὺ δὲ τοῦτ' ἔχεις λέγειν;	"I do," he said. "But what are you getting at?"
		"Haven't you realized," I said, "that our soul is immortal and never perishes?"
		He looked at me in amazement and said, "No, by Zeus, I haven't. Can you really argue that?"
608d	εἰ μὴ ἀδικῶ γ', ἔφην. οἶμαι δὲ καὶ σύ· οὐδὲν γὰρ χαλεπόν.	"I'd be doing wrong if I couldn't," I said. "And I
	ἔμοιγ', ἔφη· σοῦ δ' ἂν ἡδέως ἀκούσαιμι τὸ οὐ χαλεπὸν τοῦτο.	think you could too. There's nothing difficult about it."
	ἀκούοις ἄν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ.	"There is for me," he said. "But I'd be glad to hear this not-difficult thing from you."
	λέγε μόνον, ἔφη.	"Then listen," I said.
	ἀγαθόν τι, εἶπον, καὶ κακὸν καλεῖς;	"Just go ahead," he said.
	ἔγωγε. 608e	"You call some things good and some bad?" I said.
	ἆρ' οὖν ὥσπερ ἐγὼ περὶ αὐτῶν διανοῇ;	"I do." 608e
	τὸ ποῖον;	"Do you think about them the way I do?"
	τὸ μὲν ἀπολλύον καὶ διαφθεῖρον πᾶν τὸ κακὸν εἶναι, τὸ δὲ σῷζον καὶ ὠφελοῦν τὸ ἀγαθόν.	"What way?"
	ἔγωγ', ἔφη.	"That what destroys and corrupts is always the bad, and what preserves and benefits is the good."
		"I do," he said.
608e	τί δέ; κακὸν ἑκάστῳ τι καὶ ἀγαθὸν λέγεις; οἷον ὀφθαλμοῖς 609a ὀφθαλμίαν καὶ σύμπαντι τῷ σώματι νόσον, σίτῳ τε ἐρυσίβην, σηπεδόνα τε ξύλοις, χαλκῷ δὲ καὶ σιδήρῳ ἰόν, καί, ὅπερ λέγω, σχεδὸν πᾶσι σύμφυτον ἑκάστῳ κακόν τε καὶ νόσημα;	"And what about this? Do you say there's something bad and something good for each thing? For example, for the eyes 609a eye disease, for the whole body sickness, for grain blight, rot for wood, rust for bronze and iron—and, as I say, for nearly everything an evil and disease of its own that belongs to its nature?"
	ἔγωγ', ἔφη.	"I do," he said.
	οὐκοῦν ὅταν τῷ τι τούτων προσγένηται, πονηρόν τε ποιεῖ ᾧ προσεγένετο, καὶ τελευτῶν ὅλον διέλυσεν καὶ ἀπώλεσεν;	"And when one of these attaches itself to something, doesn't it make the thing it attaches to bad, and in the end dissolve and destroy it completely?"
	πῶς γὰρ οὔ;	"Of course."
609a	τὸ σύμφυτον ἄρα κακὸν ἑκάστου καὶ ἡ πονηρία ἕκαστον ἀπόλλυσιν, ἢ εἰ μὴ τοῦτο ἀπολεῖ, οὐκ ἂν ἄλλο γε αὐτὸ ἔτι 609b διαφθείρειεν. οὐ γὰρ τό γε ἀγαθὸν μή ποτέ τι ἀπολέσῃ, οὐδὲ αὖ τὸ μήτε κακὸν μήτε ἀγαθόν.	"So each thing is destroyed by its own innate evil and badness; or if that doesn't destroy it, nothing else could 609b corrupt it. For the good would never destroy anything, nor would what is neither bad nor good."
	πῶς γὰρ ἄν; ἔφη.	"How could they?" he said.
	ἐὰν ἄρα τι εὑρίσκωμεν τῶν ὄντων, ᾧ ἔστι μὲν κακὸν ὃ ποιεῖ αὐτὸ μοχθηρόν, τοῦτο μέντοι οὐχ οἷόν τε αὐτὸ λύειν ἀπολλύον, οὐκ ἤδη εἰσόμεθα ὅτι τοῦ πεφυκότος οὕτως ὄλεθρος οὐκ ἦν;	"So if we find something that has an evil that makes it bad, but which can't dissolve and destroy

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	οὕτως, ἔφη, εἰκός.	it, won't we know at once that a thing of that nature can't be destroyed?" "That seems likely," he said.
609b	τί οὖν; ἦν δ' ἐγώ· ψυχῇ ἆρ' οὐκ ἔστιν ὃ ποιεῖ αὐτὴν αὐτὴν κακήν; καὶ μάλα, ἔφη· ἃ νυνδὴ διῇμεν πάντα, ἀδικία τε καὶ 609c ἀκολασία καὶ δειλία καὶ ἀμαθία.	"Well then," I said, "isn't there something that makes the soul bad?" "Very much so," he said. "All the things we were just going through: injustice, 609c intemperance, cowardice and ignorance."
609c	ἦ οὖν τι τούτων αὐτὴν διαλύει τε καὶ ἀπόλλυσι; καὶ ἐννόει μὴ ἐξαπατηθῶμεν οἰηθέντες τὸν ἄδικον ἄνθρωπον καὶ ἀνόητον, ὅταν ληφθῇ ἀδικῶν, τότε ἀπολωλέναι ὑπὸ τῆς ἀδικίας, πονηρίας οὔσης ψυχῆς. ἀλλ' ὧδε ποίει· ὥσπερ σῶμα ἡ σώματος πονηρία νόσος οὖσα τήκει καὶ διόλλυσι καὶ ἄγει εἰς τὸ μηδὲ σῶμα εἶναι, καὶ ἃ νυνδὴ ἐλέγομεν 609d ἅπαντα ὑπὸ τῆς οἰκείας κακίας, τῷ προσκαθῆσθαι καὶ ἐνεῖναι διαφθειρούσης, εἰς τὸ μὴ εἶναι ἀφικνεῖται—οὐχ οὕτω; ναί.	"Then does any of these dissolve and destroy it? And be careful that we're not deceived into thinking that when an unjust and foolish person is caught doing wrong, he has been destroyed by injustice, since injustice is the soul's badness. Look at it this way instead. Just as the body's badness, which is disease, wastes and ruins a body and brings it to the point of not being a body at all, so all the things we were just talking about 609d arrive at not being through their own evil, which attaches itself to them, settles in them and corrupts them. Isn't that so?" "Yes."
609d	ἴθι δή, καὶ ψυχὴν κατὰ τὸν αὐτὸν τρόπον σκόπει. ἆρα ἐνοῦσα ἐν αὐτῇ ἀδικία καὶ ἡ ἄλλη κακία τῷ ἐνεῖναι καὶ προσκαθῆσθαι φθείρει αὐτὴν καὶ μαραίνει, ἕως ἂν εἰς θάνατον ἀγαγοῦσα τοῦ σώματος χωρίσῃ; οὐδαμῶς, ἔφη, τοῦτό γε. ἀλλὰ μέντοι ἐκεῖνό γε ἄλογον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὴν μὲν ἄλλου πονηρίαν ἀπολλύναι τι, τὴν δὲ αὑτοῦ μή. ἄλογον. 609e	"Come on, then, and consider the soul in the same way. Do the injustice and other badness present in it, by being present and attaching themselves, corrupt it and make it waste away until they bring it to death and separate it from the body?" "Not at all," he said. "And yet it's unreasonable," I said, "that the badness of something else should destroy a thing, while its own badness doesn't." "It's unreasonable." 609e
609e	ἐννόει γάρ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Γλαύκων, ὅτι οὐδ' ὑπὸ τῆς τῶν σιτίων πονηρίας, ἢ ἂν ᾖ αὐτῶν ἐκείνων, εἴτε παλαιότης εἴτε σαπρότης εἴτε ἠτισοῦν οὖσα, οὐκ οἰόμεθα δεῖν σῶμα ἀπόλλυσθαι· ἀλλ' ἐὰν μὲν ἐμποιῇ ἡ αὐτῶν πονηρία τῶν σιτίων τῷ σώματι σώματος μοχθηρίαν, φήσομεν αὐτὸ δι' ἐκεῖνα ὑπὸ τῆς αὑτοῦ κακίας νόσου οὔσης ἀπολωλέναι· ὑπὸ 610a δὲ σιτίων πονηρίας ἄλλων ὄντων ἄλλο ὂν τὸ σῶμα, ὑπ' ἀλλοτρίου κακοῦ μὴ ἐμποιήσαντος τὸ ἔμφυτον κακόν, οὐδέποτε ἀξιώσομεν διαφθείρεσθαι. ὀρθότατ' αὖ, ἔφη, λέγεις.	"Consider, Glaucon," I said, "that we don't think a body should be destroyed by the badness of foods either, whatever badness belongs to the foods themselves, whether staleness or rottenness or anything else. "But if the badness of the foods themselves produces in the body a badness of the body, we'll say that, by way of them, the body was destroyed by its own evil, which is disease. But 610a we'll never accept that the body, which is one thing, is destroyed by the badness of foods, which are another—by an alien evil that has not produced in it the evil that belongs to it." "Again, you're quite right," he said.

GREEK	ENGLISH
610a κατὰ τὸν αὐτὸν τοίνυν λόγον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐὰν μὴ σώματος πονηρία ψυχῇ ψυχῆς πονηρίαν ἐμποιῇ, μή ποτε ἀξιῶμεν ὑπὸ ἀλλοτρίου κακοῦ ἄνευ τῆς ἰδίας πονηρίας ψυχὴν ἀπόλλυσθαι, τῷ ἑτέρου κακῷ ἕτερον.	"By the same argument, then," I said, "unless a badness of the body produces in the soul a badness of the soul, let's never accept that the soul is destroyed by an alien evil without its own particular badness, one thing by the evil of another."
ἔχει γάρ, ἔφη, λόγον.	"That makes sense," he said.
ἢ τοίνυν ταῦτα ἐξελέγξωμεν ὅτι οὐ καλῶς λέγομεν, ἢ 610b ἕως ἂν ᾖ ἀνέλεγκτα, μή ποτε φῶμεν ὑπὸ πυρετοῦ μηδ' αὖ ὑπ' ἄλλης νόσου μηδ' αὖ ὑπὸ σφαγῆς, μηδ' εἴ τις ὅτι σμικρότατα ὅλον τὸ σῶμα κατατέμοι, ἕνεκα τούτων μηδὲν μᾶλλόν ποτε ψυχὴν ἀπόλλυσθαι, πρὶν ἄν τις ἀποδείξῃ ὡς διὰ ταῦτα τὰ παθήματα τοῦ σώματος αὐτὴ ἐκείνη ἀδικωτέρα καὶ ἀνοσιωτέρα γίγνεται· ἀλλοτρίου δὲ κακοῦ ἐν ἄλλῳ γιγνομένου, τοῦ δὲ ἰδίου ἑκάστῳ μὴ ἐγγιγνομένου, 610c μήτε ψυχὴν μήτε ἄλλο μηδὲν ἐῶμεν φάναι τινὰ ἀπόλλυσθαι.	"So either let's refute these claims and show we're wrong, or, 610b as long as they stand unrefuted, let's never say that the soul is ever any the more destroyed by fever or any other disease, or by having one's throat cut, not even if someone chops the whole body into the tiniest pieces—not until someone shows that because of these things happening to the body the soul itself becomes more unjust and more unholy. When an alien evil arises in something else, but the evil that belongs to each thing doesn't arise in it, 610c let's not allow anyone to say that the soul or anything else is destroyed."
610c ἀλλὰ μέντοι, ἔφη, τοῦτό γε οὐδείς ποτε δείξει, ὡς τῶν ἀποθνῃσκόντων ἀδικώτεραι αἱ ψυχαὶ διὰ τὸν θάνατον γίγνονται.	"But certainly," he said, "no one will ever show that the souls of the dying become more unjust because of death."
ἐὰν δέ γέ τις, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὁμόσε τῷ λόγῳ τολμᾷ ἰέναι καὶ λέγειν ὡς πονηρότερος καὶ ἀδικώτερος γίγνεται ὁ ἀποθνῄσκων, ἵνα δὴ μὴ ἀναγκάζηται ἀθανάτους τὰς ψυχὰς ὁμολογεῖν, ἀξιώσομέν που, εἰ ἀληθῆ λέγει ὁ ταῦτα λέγων, τὴν ἀδικίαν εἶναι θανάσιμον τῷ ἔχοντι ὥσπερ νόσον, καὶ ὑπ' 610d αὐτοῦ, τοῦ ἀποκτεινύντος τῇ ἑαυτοῦ φύσει, ἀποθνῄσκειν τοὺς λαμβάνοντας αὐτό, τοὺς μὲν μάλιστα θᾶττον, τοὺς δ' ἧττον σχολαίτερον, ἀλλὰ μὴ ὥσπερ νῦν διὰ τοῦτο ὑπ' ἄλλων δίκην ἐπιτιθέντων ἀποθνῄσκουσιν οἱ ἄδικοι.	"But if someone," I said, "dares to come to grips with the argument and say that a dying man does become worse and more unjust, so as to avoid being forced to admit that souls are immortal, we'll surely claim, if what he says is true, that injustice is fatal to whoever has it, like a disease, and that those who catch it die of 610d it, since it kills by its own nature—those who have most of it more quickly, those who have less more slowly. It wouldn't be as it is now, when the unjust die because of it at the hands of others who punish them."
610d μὰ Δί', ἦ δ' ὅς, οὐκ ἄρα πάνδεινον φανεῖται ἡ ἀδικία, εἰ θανάσιμον ἔσται τῷ λαμβάνοντι—ἀπαλλαγὴ γὰρ ἂν εἴη κακῶν—ἀλλὰ μᾶλλον οἶμαι αὐτὴν φανήσεσθαι πᾶν τοὐναντίον 610e τοὺς ἄλλους ἀποκτεινῦσαν, εἴπερ οἷόν τε, τὸν δ' ἔχοντα καὶ μάλα ζωτικὸν παρέχουσαν, καὶ πρός γ' ἔτι τῷ ζωτικῷ ἄγρυπνον· οὕτω πόρρω που, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἐσκήνηται τοῦ θανάσιμος εἶναι.	"By Zeus," he said, "then injustice won't look so very terrible after all, if it's going to be fatal to whoever catches it—it would be a release from troubles. No, I think it'll turn out to be quite the opposite: 610e it kills others, if it can, while making its possessor very much alive—and not only alive but wide awake. That's how far, it seems, it has pitched its tent from being fatal."
610e καλῶς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λέγεις. ὁπότε γὰρ δὴ μὴ ἱκανὴ ἥ γε οἰκεία πονηρία καὶ τὸ οἰκεῖον κακὸν ἀποκτεῖναι καὶ ἀπολέσαι ψυχήν, σχολῇ τό γε ἐπ' ἄλλου ὀλέθρῳ τεταγμένον κακὸν ψυχὴν ἤ τι ἄλλο ἀπολεῖ, πλὴν ἐφ' ᾧ τέτακται.	"You're right," I said. "For when a thing's own badness, its own evil, isn't enough to kill and destroy the soul, an evil appointed for the destruction of

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	σχολῇ γ', ἔφη, ὥς γε τὸ εἰκός.	something else will hardly destroy the soul or anything else, except what it's appointed for."
	οὐκοῦν ὁπότε μηδ' ὑφ' ἑνὸς ἀπόλλυται κακοῦ, μήτε [611a] οἰκείου μήτε ἀλλοτρίου, δῆλον ὅτι ἀνάγκη αὐτὸ ἀεὶ ὂν εἶναι· εἰ δ' ἀεὶ ὄν, ἀθάνατον.	"Hardly," he said, "as seems likely."
	ἀνάγκη, ἔφη.	"So since it isn't destroyed by any evil at all, [611a] whether its own or alien, clearly it must always be. And if it always is, it's immortal."
		"Necessarily," he said.
611a	τοῦτο μὲν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὕτως ἐχέτω· εἰ δ' ἔχει, ἐννοεῖς ὅτι ἀεὶ ἂν εἶεν αἱ αὐταί. οὔτε γὰρ ἄν που ἐλάττους γένοιντο μηδεμιᾶς ἀπολλυμένης, οὔτε αὖ πλείους· εἰ γὰρ ὁτιοῦν τῶν ἀθανάτων πλέον γίγνοιτο, οἶσθ' ὅτι ἐκ τοῦ θνητοῦ ἂν γίγνοιτο καὶ πάντα ἂν εἴη τελευτῶντα ἀθάνατα.	"Let that be so, then," I said. "And if it is, you realize that the souls would always be the same ones. They couldn't become fewer, since none is destroyed, nor again more numerous. For if any immortal thing were to increase, you know it would come from the mortal, and everything would end up immortal."
	ἀληθῆ λέγεις.	"That's true."
	ἀλλ', ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μήτε τοῦτο οἰώμεθα—ὁ γὰρ λόγος οὐκ [611b] ἐάσει—μήτε γε αὖ τῇ ἀληθεστάτῃ φύσει τοιοῦτον εἶναι ψυχήν, ὥστε πολλῆς ποικιλίας καὶ ἀνομοιότητός τε καὶ διαφορᾶς γέμειν αὐτὸ πρὸς αὑτό.	"But," I said, "let's not believe that—the argument won't [611b] allow it—nor again that in its truest nature the soul is the sort of thing that's full of much variety, unlikeness and difference within itself."
	πῶς λέγεις; ἔφη.	"What do you mean?" he said.
611b	οὐ ῥᾴδιον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀίδιον εἶναι σύνθετόν τε ἐκ πολλῶν καὶ μὴ τῇ καλλίστῃ κεχρημένον συνθέσει, ὡς νῦν ἡμῖν ἐφάνη ἡ ψυχή.	"It isn't easy," I said, "for something to be everlasting if it's composed of many parts and not put together in the finest way, as the soul appeared to us just now."
	οὔκουν εἰκός γε.	"No, it isn't likely."
	ὅτι μὲν τοίνυν ἀθάνατον ψυχή, καὶ ὁ ἄρτι λόγος καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι ἀναγκάσειαν ἄν· οἷον δ' ἐστὶν τῇ ἀληθείᾳ, οὐ λελωβημένον [611c] δεῖ αὐτὸ θεάσασθαι ὑπό τε τῆς τοῦ σώματος κοινωνίας καὶ ἄλλων κακῶν, ὥσπερ νῦν ἡμεῖς θεώμεθα, ἀλλ' οἷόν ἐστιν καθαρὸν γιγνόμενον, τοιοῦτον ἱκανῶς λογισμῷ διαθεατέον, καὶ πολύ γε κάλλιον αὐτὸ εὑρήσει καὶ ἐναργέστερον δικαιοσύνας τε καὶ ἀδικίας διόψεται καὶ πάντα ἃ νῦν διήλθομεν.	"Well, that the soul is immortal, both our recent argument and the others would compel us to accept. But to see what it is really like, we mustn't look at it maimed, [611c] as we do now, by its partnership with the body and by other evils. We must study it adequately, with reasoning, as it is when it becomes pure. Then one will find it far more beautiful, and will make out more clearly justice and injustice and everything we've now gone through.
611c	νῦν δὲ εἴπομεν μὲν ἀληθῆ περὶ αὐτοῦ, οἷον ἐν τῷ παρόντι φαίνεται· τεθεάμεθα μέντοι διακείμενον αὐτό, ὥσπερ οἱ τὸν [611d] θαλάττιον Γλαῦκον ὁρῶντες οὐκ ἂν ἔτι ῥᾳδίως αὐτοῦ ἴδοιεν τὴν ἀρχαίαν φύσιν, ὑπὸ τοῦ τά τε παλαιὰ τοῦ σώματος μέρη τὰ μὲν ἐκκεκλάσθαι, τὰ δὲ συντετρῖφθαι καὶ πάντως λελωβῆσθαι ὑπὸ τῶν κυμάτων, ἄλλα δὲ προσπεφυκέναι, ὄστρεά τε καὶ φυκία καὶ πέτρας, ὥστε παντὶ μᾶλλον θηρίῳ ἐοικέναι ἢ οἷος ἦν φύσει, οὕτω καὶτὴν ψυχὴν ἡμεῖς θεώμεθα διακειμένην ὑπὸ μυρίων κακῶν. ἀλλὰ δεῖ, ὦ Γλαύκων, ἐκεῖσε βλέπειν.	"What we've said about it is true of how it appears at present. But we've seen it in a condition like that of the [611d] sea-god Glaucus. Those who see him can no longer easily make out his original nature, because some of the old parts of his body have been broken off, others crushed and completely maimed by the waves, while other things have grown onto him—shells, seaweed and rocks—so that he looks more like any beast than what he was by nature. That's the condition we see the soul in

GREEK

ENGLISH

too, beset by countless evils. But we have to look over there, Glaucon."[8]

611d ποῖ; ἦ δ' ὅς. 611e

"Where?" he said. 611e

εἰς τὴν φιλοσοφίαν αὐτῆς, καὶ ἐννοεῖν ὧν ἅπτεται καὶ οἵων ἐφίεται ὁμιλιῶν, ὡς συγγενὴς οὖσα τῷ τε θείῳ καὶ ἀθανάτῳ καὶ τῷ ἀεὶ ὄντι, καὶ οἷα ἂν γένοιτο τῷ τοιούτῳ πᾶσα ἐπισπομένη καὶ ὑπὸ ταύτης τῆς ὁρμῆς ἐκκομισθεῖσα ἐκ τοῦ πόντου ἐν ᾧ νῦν ἐστίν, καὶ περικρουσθεῖσα πέτρας 612a τε καὶ ὄστρεα ἃ νῦν αὐτῇ, ἅτε γῆν ἐστιωμένῃ, γεηρὰ καὶ πετρώδη πολλὰ καὶ ἄγρια περιπέφυκεν ὑπὸ τῶν εὐδαιμόνων λεγομένων ἑστιάσεων.

"At its love of wisdom. We have to consider what it grasps and what company it longs for, since it's akin to the divine and immortal and to what always is; and what it would become if it followed that wholly and were carried by this impulse out of the sea it's in now, and had the rocks 612a and shells knocked off it—all that earthy, rocky, wild growth that now encrusts it because it feasts on earth, at those banquets people call happy.

612a καὶ τότ' ἄν τις ἴδοι αὐτῆς τὴν ἀληθῆ φύσιν, εἴτε πολυειδὴς εἴτε μονοειδής, εἴτε ὅπῃ ἔχει καὶ ὅπως· νῦν δὲ τὰ ἐν τῷ ἀνθρωπίνῳ βίῳ πάθη τε καὶ εἴδη, ὡς ἐγᾦμαι, ἐπιεικῶς αὐτῆς διεληλύθαμεν.

παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

"Then one could see its true nature, whether it has many forms or one, or in what way it is and how. But for now, I think, we've given a fair account of what it undergoes and the forms it takes in human life."

"Absolutely," he said.

οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τά τε ἄλλα ἀπελυσάμεθα ἐν τῷ λόγῳ, 612b καὶ οὐ τοὺς μισθοὺς οὐδὲ τὰς δόξας δικαιοσύνης ἐπῃνέκαμεν, ὥσπερ Ἡσίοδόν τε καὶ Ὅμηρον ὑμεῖς ἔφατε, ἀλλ' αὐτὸ δικαιοσύνην αὐτῇ ψυχῇ ἄριστον ηὕρομεν, καὶ ποιητέον εἶναι αὐτῇ τὰ δίκαια, ἐάντ' ἔχῃ τὸν Γύγου δακτύλιον, ἐάντε μή, καὶ πρὸς τοιούτῳ δακτυλίῳ τὴν Ἅιδος κυνῆν;

ἀληθέστατα, ἔφη, λέγεις.

"Well," I said, "haven't we cleared away the other objections in our argument, 612b without praising the rewards and reputations of justice, as you said Hesiod and Homer do? We've found that justice itself is the best thing for the soul itself, and that the soul must do what is just whether it has the ring of Gyges or not, and the cap of Hades on top of such a ring."

"Very true," he said.[9]

THE REWARDS OF JUSTICE

Socrates restores to justice the rewards it earns from gods and humans during life.

GREEK

ENGLISH

612b **SOCRATES** ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Γλαύκων, νῦν ἤδη ἀνεπίφθονόν ἐστιν πρὸς ἐκείνοις καὶ τοὺς μισθοὺς τῇ δικαιοσύνῃ καὶ τῇ 612c ἄλλῃ ἀρετῇ ἀποδοῦναι, ὅσους τε καὶ οἵους τῇ ψυχῇ παρέχει παρ' ἀνθρώπων τε καὶ θεῶν, ζῶντός τε ἔτι τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἐπειδὰν τελευτήσῃ;

παντάπασι μὲν οὖν, ἦ δ' ὅς.

ἆρ' οὖν ἀποδώσετέ μοι ἃ ἐδανείσασθε ἐν τῷ λόγῳ;

τί μάλιστα;

SOCRATES "Then, Glaucon," I said, "surely no one can now object if, in addition to those, we also give back to justice and the rest 612c of excellence their rewards, as many and as great as they provide for the soul from human beings and gods, both while a person is still alive and after he has died?"

"Absolutely," he said.

"Then will you give me back what you borrowed in the argument?"

"What exactly?"

612c ἔδωκα ὑμῖν τὸν δίκαιον δοκεῖν ἄδικον εἶναι καὶ τὸν ἄδικον δίκαιον· ὑμεῖς γὰρ ᾐτεῖσθε, κἂν εἰ μὴ δυνατὸν εἴη

"I granted you that the just man should seem unjust and the unjust man just. You asked for it: even

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ταῦτα λανθάνειν καὶ θεοὺς καὶ ἀνθρώπους, ὅμως δοτέον εἶναι τοῦ λόγου ἕνεκα, ἵνα αὐτὴ δικαιοσύνη πρὸς ἀδικίαν αὐτὴν [612d] κριθείη. ἢ οὐ μνημονεύεις; ἀδικοίην μεντᾶν, ἔφη, εἰ μή.	if it wasn't possible for these things to escape the notice of gods and men, still it had to be granted for the sake of the argument, so that justice itself could be judged against injustice itself. [612d] Or don't you remember?" "I'd be doing wrong," he said, "if I didn't."
612d	ἐπειδὴ τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, κεκριμέναι εἰσί, πάλιν ἀπαιτῶ ὑπὲρ δικαιοσύνης, ὥσπερ ἔχει δόξης καὶ παρὰ θεῶν καὶ παρ' ἀνθρώπων, καὶ ἡμᾶς ὁμολογεῖν περὶ αὐτῆς δοκεῖσθαι οὕτω, ἵνα καὶ τὰ νικητήρια κομίσηται, ἀπὸ τοῦ δοκεῖν κτωμένη ἃ δίδωσι τοῖς ἔχουσιν αὐτήν, ἐπειδὴ καὶ τὰ ἀπὸ τοῦ εἶναι ἀγαθὰ διδοῦσα ἐφάνη καὶ οὐκ ἐξαπατῶσα τοὺς τῷ ὄντι λαμβάνοντας αὐτήν. [612e] δίκαια, ἔφη, αἰτῇ. οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πρῶτον μὲν τοῦτο ἀποδώσετε, ὅτι θεούς γε οὐ λανθάνει ἑκάτερος αὐτῶν οἷός ἐστιν; ἀποδώσομεν, ἔφη.	"Well, since they've been judged," I said, "I ask for it back on behalf of justice: that we too agree that she is regarded by gods and men as she actually is, so that she can also carry off the prizes of victory, which she gains from seeming and gives to those who have her. After all, she has been shown to give the good things that come from being just, and not to deceive those who truly take hold of her." [612e] "What you ask is just," he said. "Then first," I said, "will you give back this: that the gods, at least, aren't deceived about what each of the two men is really like?" "We will," he said.
612e	εἰ δὲ μὴ λανθάνετον, ὁ μὲν θεοφιλὴς ἂν εἴη, ὁ δὲ θεομισής, ὥσπερ καὶ κατ' ἀρχὰς ὡμολογοῦμεν. ἔστι ταῦτα. τῷ δὲ θεοφιλεῖ οὐχ ὁμολογήσομεν, ὅσα γε ἀπὸ θεῶν [613a] γίγνεται, πάντα γίγνεσθαι ὡς οἷόν τε ἄριστα, εἰ μή τι ἀναγκαῖον αὐτῷ κακὸν ἐκ προτέρας ἁμαρτίας ὑπῆρχεν; πάνυ μὲν οὖν.	"And if they aren't deceived, one would be loved by the gods and the other hated, as we agreed at the beginning." "That's so." "And won't we agree that for the one the gods love, everything that comes from the gods [613a] comes in the best possible way, unless some unavoidable evil was his from an earlier wrong?" "Certainly."
613a	οὕτως ἄρα ὑποληπτέον περὶ τοῦ δικαίου ἀνδρός, ἐάντ' ἐν πενίᾳ γίγνηται ἐάντ' ἐν νόσοις ἤ τινι ἄλλῳ τῶν δοκούντων κακῶν, ὡς τούτῳ ταῦτα εἰς ἀγαθόν τι τελευτήσει ζῶντι ἢ καὶ ἀποθανόντι. οὐ γὰρ δὴ ὑπό γε θεῶν ποτε ἀμελεῖται ὃς ἂν προθυμεῖσθαι ἐθέλῃ δίκαιος γίγνεσθαι καὶ ἐπιτηδεύων [613b] ἀρετὴν εἰς ὅσον δυνατὸν ἀνθρώπῳ ὁμοιοῦσθαι θεῷ. εἰκός γ', ἔφη, τὸν τοιοῦτον μὴ ἀμελεῖσθαι ὑπὸ τοῦ ὁμοίου. οὐκοῦν περὶ τοῦ ἀδίκου τἀναντία τούτων δεῖ διανοεῖσθαι; σφόδρα γε. τὰ μὲν δὴ παρὰ θεῶν τοιαῦτ' ἄττ' ἂν εἴη νικητήρια τῷ δικαίῳ.	"So this is how we must think of the just man: whether he falls into poverty or illness or any other of the things that seem bad, it will end in something good for him, in life or even in death. For the gods never neglect anyone who is eager to become just and, by practicing [613b] excellence, to become as like a god as a human being can." "It's likely," he said, "that a man like that isn't neglected by the one he resembles." "And mustn't we think the opposite of all this about the unjust man?" "Very much so."

8 Glaucus was a fisherman who became a sea-god; he was imagined as encrusted with shells and seaweed.
9 The cap of Hades, like the ring of Gyges in Book II, made its wearer invisible.

GREEK	ENGLISH
	"Such, then, would be the prizes of victory that the just man receives from the gods."
613b κατὰ γοῦν ἐμὴν δόξαν, ἔφη.	"In my opinion, at any rate," he said.
τί δέ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, παρ' ἀνθρώπων; ἆρ' οὐχ ὧδε ἔχει, εἰ δεῖ τὸ ὂν τιθέναι; οὐχ οἱ μὲν δεινοί τε καὶ ἄδικοι δρῶσιν ὅπερ οἱ δρομῆς ὅσοι ἂν θέωσιν εὖ ἀπὸ τῶν κάτω, ἀπὸ δὲ τῶν ἄνω μή; τὸ μὲν πρῶτον ὀξέως ἀποπηδῶσιν, τελευτῶντες 613c δὲ καταγέλαστοι γίγνονται, τὰ ὦτα ἐπὶ τῶν ὤμων ἔχοντες καὶ ἀστεφάνωτοι ἀποτρέχοντες· οἱ δὲ τῇ ἀληθείᾳ δρομικοὶ εἰς τέλος ἐλθόντες τά τε ἆθλα λαμβάνουσιν καὶ στεφανοῦνται. οὐχ οὕτω καὶ περὶ τῶν δικαίων τὸ πολὺ συμβαίνει; πρὸς τὸ τέλος ἑκάστης πράξεως καὶ ὁμιλίας καὶ τοῦ βίου εὐδοκιμοῦσί τε καὶ τὰ ἆθλα παρὰ τῶν ἀνθρώπων φέρονται;	"And what about the rewards from human beings?" I said. "Isn't this how things are, if we're to state the truth? Don't clever but unjust people do just what runners do who run the outward leg well but not the return? They spring off sharply at first, but by the end 613c they're a laughingstock, trotting off uncrowned with their ears drooping onto their shoulders. But real runners reach the finish, take the prizes and are crowned. Isn't it generally the same with just people too? Toward the end of each undertaking, each association, and of life itself, they earn a good name and carry off the prizes from their fellow human beings."
613c καὶ μάλα.	"Very much so."
ἀνέξῃ ἄρα λέγοντος ἐμοῦ περὶ τούτων ἅπερ αὐτὸς ἔλεγες 613d περὶ τῶν ἀδίκων; ἐρῶ γὰρ δὴ ὅτι οἱ μὲν δίκαιοι, ἐπειδὰν πρεσβύτεροι γένωνται, ἐν τῇ αὑτῶν πόλει ἄρχουσί τε ἂν βούλωνται τὰς ἀρχάς, γαμοῦσί τε ὁπόθεν ἂν βούλωνται, ἐκδιδόασί τε εἰς οὓς ἂν ἐθέλωσι· καὶ πάντα ἃ σὺ περὶ ἐκείνων, ἐγὼ νῦν λέγω περὶ τῶνδε. καὶ αὖ καὶ περὶ τῶν ἀδίκων, ὅτι οἱ πολλοὶ αὐτῶν, καὶ ἐὰν νέοι ὄντες λάθωσιν, ἐπὶ τέλους τοῦ δρόμου αἱρεθέντες καταγέλαστοί εἰσιν καὶ γέροντες γιγνόμενοι ἄθλιοι προπηλακίζονται ὑπὸ ξένων τε 613e καὶ ἀστῶν, μαστιγούμενοι καὶ ἃ ἄγροικα ἔφησθα σὺ εἶναι, ἀληθῆ λέγων—εἶτα στρεβλώσονται καὶ ἐκκαυθήσονται— πάντα ἐκεῖνα οἴου καὶ ἐμοῦ ἀκηκοέναι ὡς πάσχουσιν. ἀλλ' ὃ λέγω, ὅρα εἰ ἀνέξῃ.	"Then will you put up with my saying about them what you yourself said 613d about the unjust? For I'm going to say that the just, once they're older, hold office in their own city if they want to, marry from whatever family they want, and give their children in marriage to whomever they please. Everything you said about those others, I now say about these. And about the unjust, in turn, I'll say that most of them, even if they escape notice while they're young, are caught at the end of the race and made a laughingstock; and as they grow old they're wretched and abused by foreigners 613e and citizens alike. They're whipped, and suffer the things you called crude—and you were right—then they'll be racked and burned. Imagine you've heard me say that they suffer all of that. But see whether you'll put up with what I'm saying."
613e καὶ πάνυ, ἔφη· δίκαια γὰρ λέγεις.	"Certainly," he said. "What you say is just."
ἃ μὲν τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ζῶντι τῷ δικαίῳ παρὰ θεῶν τε 614a καὶ ἀνθρώπων ἆθλά τε καὶ μισθοὶ καὶ δῶρα γίγνεται πρὸς ἐκείνοις τοῖς ἀγαθοῖς οἷς αὐτὴ παρείχετο ἡ δικαιοσύνη, τοιαῦτ' ἂν εἴη.	"Then these," I said, "would be the prizes, wages, and gifts that come to the just man while he's alive, from gods 614a and human beings, in addition to those good things that justice itself provided."
καὶ μάλ', ἔφη, καλά τε καὶ βέβαια.	"And fine and secure ones they are," he said.
ταῦτα τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐδέν ἐστι πλήθει οὐδὲ μεγέθει πρὸς ἐκεῖνα ἃ τελευτήσαντα ἑκάτερον περιμένει· χρὴ δ' αὐτὰ ἀκοῦσαι, ἵνα τελέως ἑκάτερος αὐτῶν ἀπειλήφῃ τὰ ὑπὸ τοῦ λόγου ὀφειλόμενα ἀκοῦσαι. 614b	"Yet these are nothing," I said, "in number or in size, compared with what awaits each of the two after death. We should hear about those, so that each of them may receive in full the hearing the argument owes him." 614b

GREEK	ENGLISH
614b λέγοις ἄν, ἔφη, ὡς οὐ πολλὰ ἄλλ' ἥδιον ἀκούοντι.	"Please tell us," he said. "There aren't many things I'd rather hear."

THE MYTH OF ER

Socrates tells of Er, who returns from death to describe judgment, the choice of lives and rebirth.

GREEK	ENGLISH
SOCRATES ἀλλ' οὐ μέντοι σοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, Ἀλκίνου γε ἀπόλογον ἐρῶ, ἀλλ' ἀλκίμου μὲν ἀνδρός, Ἠρὸς τοῦ Ἀρμενίου, τὸ γένος Παμφύλου· ὅς ποτε ἐν πολέμῳ τελευτήσας, ἀναιρεθέντων δεκαταίων τῶν νεκρῶν ἤδη διεφθαρμένων, ὑγιὴς μὲν ἀνῃρέθη, κομισθεὶς δ' οἴκαδε μέλλων θάπτεσθαι δωδεκαταῖος ἐπὶ τῇ πυρᾷ κείμενος ἀνεβίω, ἀναβιοὺς δ' ἔλεγεν ἃ ἐκεῖ ἴδοι. ἔφη δέ, ἐπειδὴ οὖ ἐκβῆναι, τὴν ψυχὴν πορεύεσθαι 614c μετὰ πολλῶν, καὶ ἀφικνεῖσθαι σφᾶς εἰς τόπον τινὰ δαιμόνιον, ἐν ᾧ τῆς τε γῆς δύ' εἶναι χάσματα ἐχομένω ἀλλήλοιν καὶ τοῦ οὐρανοῦ αὖ ἐν τῷ ἄνω ἄλλα καταντικρύ.	SOCRATES Well, it isn't a tale for Alcinous that I'll tell you, I said, but the tale of a stalwart man: Er, son of Armenius, a Pamphylian by birth. He was once killed in war. When the dead were taken up on the tenth day, already decaying, he was taken up intact; and he was brought home to be buried, and on the twelfth day, as he lay on the pyre, he came back to life. Once revived, he told what he had seen there. He said that when his soul had gone out of him, it traveled 614c with many others, and they came to an uncanny place, where there were two openings in the earth next to each other, and two more in the heaven above, facing them.[10]
614c δικαστὰς δὲ μεταξὺ τούτων καθῆσθαι, οὕς, ἐπειδὴ διαδικάσειαν, τοὺς μὲν δικαίους κελεύειν πορεύεσθαι τὴν εἰς δεξιάν τε καὶ ἄνω διὰ τοῦ οὐρανοῦ, σημεῖα περιάψαντας τῶν δεδικασμένων ἐν τῷ πρόσθεν, τοὺς δὲ ἀδίκους τὴν εἰς ἀριστεράν τε καὶ κάτω, ἔχοντας καὶ τούτους ἐν τῷ ὄπισθεν σημεῖα πάντων ὧν 614d ἔπραξαν. ἑαυτοῦ δὲ προσελθόντος εἰπεῖν ὅτι δέοι αὐτὸν ἄγγελον ἀνθρώποις γενέσθαι τῶν ἐκεῖ καὶ διακελεύοιντό οἱ ἀκούειν τε καὶ θεᾶσθαι πάντα τὰ ἐν τῷ τόπῳ. ὁρᾶν δὴ ταύτῃ μὲν καθ' ἑκάτερον τὸ χάσμα τοῦ οὐρανοῦ τε καὶ τῆς γῆς ἀπιούσας τὰς ψυχάς, ἐπειδὴ αὐταῖς δικασθείη, κατὰ δὲ τὼ ἑτέρω ἐκ μὲν τοῦ ἀνιέναι ἐκ τῆς γῆς μεστὰς αὐχμοῦ τε καὶ κόνεως, ἐκ δὲ τοῦ ἑτέρου καταβαίνειν ἑτέρας ἐκ τοῦ 614e οὐρανοῦ καθαράς.	Between these sat judges. Whenever they had given their verdict, they ordered the just to take the road to the right and upward through the heaven, with tokens of the judgments fastened on their fronts, and the unjust to take the road to the left and downward, these too wearing on their backs tokens of everything they 614d had done. When he himself came forward, they told him that he was to be a messenger to human beings about what was there, and they instructed him to listen to and watch everything in the place. So he saw, on this side, souls departing through one opening of heaven and one of earth, once they had been judged; and at the other two, souls coming up out of the earth full of grime and dust, and other souls coming down out of 614e heaven, clean.
614e καὶ τὰς ἀεὶ ἀφικνουμένας ὥσπερ ἐκ πολλῆς πορείας φαίνεσθαι ἥκειν, καὶ ἀσμένας εἰς τὸν λειμῶνα ἀπιούσας οἷον ἐν πανηγύρει κατασκηνᾶσθαι, καὶ ἀσπάζεσθαί τε ἀλλήλας ὅσαι γνώριμαι, καὶ πυνθάνεσθαι τάς τε ἐκ τῆς γῆς ἡκούσας παρὰ τῶν ἑτέρων τὰ ἐκεῖ καὶ τὰς ἐκ τοῦ οὐρανοῦ τὰ παρ' ἐκείναις.	The souls that kept arriving looked as if they had come from a long journey. They went off gladly to the meadow and camped there as if at a festival. Those who knew each other exchanged greetings, and the ones who had come from the earth asked the others about things up there, while the ones from heaven asked about what had happened to them.
διηγεῖσθαι δὲ ἀλλήλαις τὰς 615a μὲν ὀδυρομένας τε καὶ κλαούσας, ἀναμιμνῃσκομένας ὅσα τε καὶ οἷα πάθοιεν καὶ	They told each other their stories, the one group 615a grieving and weeping as they recalled how

	GREEK	ENGLISH
	ἴδοιεν ἐν τῇ ὑπὸ γῆς πορείᾳ—εἶναι δὲ τὴν πορείαν χιλιέτη —τὰς δ' αὖ ἐκ τοῦ οὐρανοῦ εὐπαθείας διηγεῖσθαι καὶ θέας ἀμηχάνους τὸ κάλλος.	many things, and what kinds, they had suffered and seen on their journey under the earth—the journey lasted a thousand years—while those from heaven, in turn, told of delights and of sights of unimaginable beauty.
615a	τὰ μὲν οὖν πολλά, ὦ Γλαύκων, πολλοῦ χρόνου διηγήσασθαι· τὸ δ' οὖν κεφάλαιον ἔφη τόδε εἶναι, ὅσα πώποτέ τινα ἠδίκησαν καὶ ὅσους ἕκαστοι, ὑπὲρ ἁπάντων δίκην δεδωκέναι ἐν μέρει, ὑπὲρ ἑκάστου δεκάκις—τοῦτο δ' εἶναι κατὰ ἑκατονταετηρίδα [615b] ἑκάστην, ὡς βίου ὄντος τοσούτου τοῦ ἀνθρωπίνου—ἵνα δεκαπλάσιον τὸ ἔκτεισμα τοῦ ἀδικήματος ἐκτίνοιεν, καὶ οἷον εἴ τινες πολλοῖς θανάτων ἦσαν αἴτιοι, ἢ πόλεις προδόντες ἢ στρατόπεδα, καὶ εἰς δουλείας ἐμβεβληκότες ἤ τινος ἄλλης κακουχίας μεταίτιοι, πάντων τούτων δεκαπλασίας ἀλγηδόνας ὑπὲρ ἑκάστου κομίσαιντο, καὶ αὖ εἴ τινας εὐεργεσίας εὐεργετηκότες καὶ δίκαιοι καὶ ὅσιοι γεγονότες εἶεν, κατὰ ταὐτὰ [615c] τὴν ἀξίαν κομίζοιντο. τῶν δὲ εὐθὺς γενομένων καὶ ὀλίγον χρόνον βιούντων πέρι ἄλλα ἔλεγεν οὐκ ἄξια μνήμης.	To tell it all, Glaucon, would take a long time. But the sum of it, he said, was this. For all the wrongs they had ever done anyone, and for every person each had wronged, they had paid the penalty for them all in turn, ten times over for each. That is, once every hundred [615b] years, since that is the length of a human life, so that they might pay back ten times the crime. For example, if some had caused many deaths, by betraying cities or armies, or had thrown people into slavery or shared the blame for some other ill-treatment, they received ten times the pain for each of these. And again, if they had done good deeds and had been just and pious, they received their due reward [615c] in the same proportion. About those who died as soon as they were born, or lived only a short time, he said other things not worth recording.
615c	εἰς δὲ θεοὺς ἀσεβείας τε καὶ εὐσεβείας καὶ γονέας καὶ αὐτόχειρος φόνου μείζους ἔτι τοὺς μισθοὺς διηγεῖτο.	For impiety and piety toward gods and parents, and for murder by one's own hand, he described still greater repayments.
	ἔφη γὰρ δὴ παραγενέσθαι ἐρωτωμένῳ ἑτέρῳ ὑπὸ ἑτέρου ὅπου εἴη Ἀρδιαῖος ὁ μέγας. ὁ δὲ Ἀρδιαῖος οὗτος τῆς Παμφυλίας ἔν τινι πόλει τύραννος ἐγεγόνει, ἤδη χιλιοστὸν ἔτος εἰς ἐκεῖνον τὸν χρόνον, γέροντά τε πατέρα ἀποκτείνας [615d] καὶ πρεσβύτερον ἀδελφόν, καὶ ἄλλα δὴ πολλά τε καὶ ἀνόσια εἰργασμένος, ὡς ἐλέγετο. ἔφη οὖν τὸν ἐρωτώμενον εἰπεῖν, "οὐχ ἥκει," φάναι, "οὐδ' ἂν ἥξει δεῦρο. ἐθεασάμεθα γὰρ οὖν δὴ καὶ τοῦτο τῶν δεινῶν θεαμάτων· ἐπειδὴ ἐγγὺς τοῦ στομίου ἦμεν μέλλοντες ἀνιέναι καὶ τἆλλα πάντα πεπονθότες, ἐκεῖνόν τε κατείδομεν ἐξαίφνης καὶ ἄλλους—σχεδόν τι αὐτῶν τοὺς πλείστους τυράννους· ἦσαν δὲ καὶ ἰδιῶταί τινες τῶν [615e] μεγάλα ἡμαρτηκότων—οὓς οἰομένους ἤδη ἀναβήσεσθαι οὐκ ἐδέχετο τὸ στόμιον, ἀλλ' ἐμυκᾶτο ὁπότε τις τῶν οὕτως ἀνιάτως ἐχόντων εἰς πονηρίαν ἢ μὴ ἱκανῶς δεδωκὼς δίκην ἐπιχειροῖ ἀνιέναι."	He said he was there when one soul asked another where Ardiaeus the Great was. This Ardiaeus had been tyrant of some city in Pamphylia a thousand years before that time. He had killed his aged father [615d] and his elder brother, and had committed many other unholy acts besides, so it was said. The one who was asked, he said, replied: "He hasn't come, and he never will come here. This too was one of the terrible sights we saw. When we were near the mouth, about to go up, having gone through everything else, we suddenly caught sight of him and others—most of them, pretty well, were tyrants, though there were also some private individuals who had [615e] committed great crimes. They thought they were about to go up, but the mouth wouldn't admit them; it bellowed whenever one of those who were so incurably bad, or who hadn't paid a sufficient penalty, tried to go up.
615e	"ἐνταῦθα δὴ ἄνδρες, ἔφη, ἄγριοι, διάπυροι ἰδεῖν, παρεστῶτες καὶ καταμανθάνοντες τὸ φθέγμα, τοὺς μὲν	"At that point," he said, "some savage men, fiery to look at, who were standing by and understood the

10 The "tale for Alcinous" is Odysseus' long story of his wanderings, told at the court of King Alcinous in the *Odyssey*, including a visit to the dead; Plato puns on *alkimos*, "stalwart."

GREEK

διαλαβόντες ἦγον, τὸν δὲ Ἀρδιαῖον καὶ ἄλλους συμποδίσαντες [616a] χεῖράς τε καὶ πόδας καὶ κεφαλήν, καταβαλόντες καὶ ἐκδείραντες, εἶλκον παρὰ τὴν ὁδὸν ἐκτὸς ἐπ' ἀσπαλάθων κνάμπτοντες, καὶ τοῖς ἀεὶ παριοῦσι σημαίνοντες ὧν ἕνεκά τε καὶ ὅτι εἰς τὸν Τάρταρον ἐμπεσούμενοι ἄγοιντο." ἔνθα δὴ φόβων, ἔφη, πολλῶν καὶ παντοδαπῶν σφίσι γεγονότων, τοῦτον ὑπερβάλλειν, μὴ γένοιτο ἑκάστῳ τὸ φθέγμα ὅτε ἀναβαίνοι, καὶ ἀσμενέστατα ἕκαστον σιγήσαντος ἀναβῆναι. καὶ τὰς μὲν δὴ δίκας τε καὶ τιμωρίας τοιαύτας τινὰς [616b] εἶναι, καὶ αὖ τὰς εὐεργεσίας ταύταις ἀντιστρόφους.

616b ἐπειδὴ δὲ τοῖς ἐν τῷ λειμῶνι ἑκάστοις ἑπτὰ ἡμέραι γένοιντο, ἀναστάντας ἐντεῦθεν δεῖν τῇ ὀγδόῃ πορεύεσθαι, καὶ ἀφικνεῖσθαι τεταρταίους ὅθεν καθορᾶν ἄνωθεν διὰ παντὸς τοῦ οὐρανοῦ καὶ γῆς τεταμένον φῶς εὐθύ, οἷον κίονα, μάλιστα τῇ ἴριδι προσφερῆ, λαμπρότερον δὲ καὶ καθαρώτερον· εἰς ὃ ἀφικέσθαι προελθόντες ἡμερησίαν ὁδόν, καὶ ἰδεῖν αὐτόθι κατὰ [616c] μέσον τὸ φῶς ἐκ τοῦ οὐρανοῦ τὰ ἄκρα αὐτοῦ τῶν δεσμῶν τεταμένα—εἶναι γὰρ τοῦτο τὸ φῶς σύνδεσμον τοῦ οὐρανοῦ, οἷον τὰ ὑποζώματα τῶν τριήρων, οὕτω πᾶσαν συνέχον τὴν περιφοράν—ἐκ δὲ τῶν ἄκρων τεταμένον ἀνάγκης ἄτρακτον, δι' οὗ πάσας ἐπιστρέφεσθαι τὰς περιφοράς· οὗ τὴν μὲν ἠλακάτην τε καὶ τὸ ἄγκιστρον εἶναι ἐξ ἀδάμαντος, τὸν δὲ σφόνδυλον μεικτὸν ἔκ τε τούτου καὶ ἄλλων γενῶν.

616c τὴν δὲ [616d] τοῦ σφονδύλου φύσιν εἶναι τοιάνδε· τὸ μὲν σχῆμα οἵαπερ ἡ τοῦ ἐνθάδε, νοῆσαι δὲ δεῖ ἐξ ὧν ἔλεγεν τοιόνδε αὐτὸν εἶναι, ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ ἐν ἑνὶ μεγάλῳ σφονδύλῳ κοίλῳ καὶ ἐξεγλυμμένῳ διαμπερὲς ἄλλος τοιοῦτος ἐλάττων ἐγκέοιτο ἁρμόττων, καθάπερ οἱ κάδοι οἱ εἰς ἀλλήλους ἁρμόττοντες, καὶ οὕτω δὴ τρίτον ἄλλον καὶ τέταρτον καὶ ἄλλους τέτταρας. ὀκτὼ γὰρ εἶναι τοὺς σύμπαντας σφονδύλους, ἐν ἀλλήλοις ἐγκειμένους, [616e] κύκλους ἄνωθεν τὰ χείλη φαίνοντας, νῶτον συνεχὲς ἑνὸς σφονδύλου ἀπεργαζομένους περὶ τὴν ἠλακάτην· ἐκείνην δὲ διὰ μέσου τοῦ ὀγδόου διαμπερὲς ἐληλάσθαι.

616e τὸν μὲν οὖν πρῶτόν τε καὶ ἐξωτάτω σφόνδυλον πλατύτατον τὸν τοῦ χείλους κύκλον ἔχειν, τὸν δὲ τοῦ ἕκτου δεύτερον, τρίτον δὲ τὸν τοῦ τετάρτου, τέταρτον δὲ τὸν τοῦ ὀγδόου, πέμπτον δὲ τὸν τοῦ ἑβδόμου, ἕκτον δὲ

ENGLISH

sound, seized some of them and led them off. But Ardiaeus and others they bound [616a] hand and foot and head, threw them down and flayed them, and dragged them off the road, carding them on thorn bushes, and explaining to each group that passed by why they were being taken away, and that they were going to be thrown into Tartarus." There, he said, of the many fears of every kind they had felt, this one surpassed them all: that the sound might come for each of them as he went up; and each went up most gladly when it stayed silent. Such, then, were the judgments and punishments, [616b] and the rewards were their counterparts.[11]

When each group had spent seven days in the meadow, they had to get up and move on on the eighth, and on the fourth day they came to a place from which they could see, from above, a straight light stretched through the whole of heaven and earth, like a column, most like the rainbow, but brighter and purer. They reached it after going on another day's journey, and there, at [616c] the middle of the light, they saw the ends of its bonds stretched from heaven—for this light was what bound heaven together, holding the whole revolving vault together like the undergirding ropes of triremes. And from the ends was stretched the spindle of Necessity, by which all the revolutions are turned. Its shaft and its hook were of adamant, and its whorl was a blend of this and other kinds of material.[12]

The [616d] nature of the whorl was this. Its shape was like the ones here, but from what he said we must picture it like this: as if inside one large whorl, hollowed out right through, there lay another smaller one of the same kind, fitting into it, the way nesting pots fit into one another; and so on with a third and a fourth and four more. For there were eight whorls in all, set inside one another, [616e] showing their rims as circles from above and forming the continuous back of a single whorl around the shaft; and the shaft was driven right through the middle of the eighth.

The first and outermost whorl had the widest circular rim; the sixth's was second; the fourth's third; the eighth's fourth; the seventh's fifth; the

11 Tartarus is the deepest pit of the underworld, where the worst offenders are punished.
12 A hand spindle for spinning wool: a shaft with a hook at the top, weighted near the bottom by a disk called the whorl.

GREEK

τὸν τοῦ πέμπτου, ἕβδομον δὲ τὸν τοῦ τρίτου, ὄγδοον δὲ τὸν τοῦ δευτέρου.

καὶ τὸν μὲν τοῦ μεγίστου ποικίλον, τὸν δὲ τοῦ ἑβδόμου λαμπρότατον, τὸν δὲ [617a] τοῦ ὀγδόου τὸ χρῶμα ἀπὸ τοῦ ἑβδόμου ἔχειν προσλάμποντος, τὸν δὲ τοῦ δευτέρου καὶ πέμπτου παραπλήσια ἀλλήλοις, ξανθότερα ἐκείνων, τρίτον δὲ λευκότατον χρῶμα ἔχειν, τέταρτον δὲ ὑπέρυθρον, δεύτερον δὲ λευκότητι τὸν ἕκτον. κυκλεῖσθαι δὲ δὴ στρεφόμενον τὸν ἄτρακτον ὅλον μὲν τὴν αὐτὴν φοράν, ἐν δὲ τῷ ὅλῳ περιφερομένῳ τοὺς μὲν ἐντὸς ἑπτὰ κύκλους τὴν ἐναντίαν τῷ ὅλῳ ἠρέμα περιφέρεσθαι, αὐτῶν δὲ τούτων τάχιστα μὲν ἰέναι τὸν ὄγδοον, δευτέρους δὲ καὶ ἅμα [617b] ἀλλήλοις τόν τε ἕβδομον καὶ ἕκτον καὶ πέμπτον· τὸν τρίτον δὲ φορᾷ ἰέναι, ὡς σφίσι φαίνεσθαι, ἐπανακυκλούμενον τὸν τέταρτον, τέταρτον δὲ τὸν τρίτον καὶ πέμπτον τὸν δεύτερον. στρέφεσθαι δὲ αὐτὸν ἐν τοῖς τῆς ἀνάγκης γόνασιν.

[617b] ἐπὶ δὲ τῶν κύκλων αὐτοῦ ἄνωθεν ἐφ' ἑκάστου βεβηκέναι Σειρῆνα συμπεριφερομένην, φωνὴν μίαν ἱεῖσαν, ἕνα τόνον· ἐκ πασῶν δὲ ὀκτὼ οὐσῶν μίαν ἁρμονίαν συμφωνεῖν. ἄλλας δὲ καθημένας [617c] πέριξ δι' ἴσου τρεῖς, ἐν θρόνῳ ἑκάστην, θυγατέρας τῆς ἀνάγκης, Μοίρας, λευχειμονούσας, στέμματα ἐπὶ τῶν κεφαλῶν ἐχούσας, Λάχεσίν τε καὶ Κλωθὼ καὶ Ἄτροπον, ὑμνεῖν πρὸς τὴν τῶν Σειρήνων ἁρμονίαν, Λάχεσιν μὲν τὰ γεγονότα, Κλωθὼ δὲ τὰ ὄντα, Ἄτροπον δὲ τὰ μέλλοντα. καὶ τὴν μὲν Κλωθὼ τῇ δεξιᾷ χειρὶ ἐφαπτομένην συνεπιστρέφειν τοῦ ἀτράκτου τὴν ἔξω περιφοράν, διαλείπουσαν χρόνον, τὴν δὲ Ἄτροπον τῇ ἀριστερᾷ τὰς ἐντὸς αὖ ὡσαύτως· τὴν δὲ Λάχεσιν [617d] ἐν μέρει ἑκατέρας ἑκατέρᾳ τῇ χειρὶ ἐφάπτεσθαι. σφᾶς οὖν, ἐπειδὴ ἀφικέσθαι, εὐθὺς δεῖν ἰέναι πρὸς τὴν Λάχεσιν.

[617d] προφήτην οὖν τινα σφᾶς πρῶτον μὲν ἐν τάξει διαστῆσαι, ἔπειτα λαβόντα ἐκ τῶν τῆς Λαχέσεως γονάτων κλήρους τε καὶ βίων παραδείγματα, ἀναβάντα ἐπί τι βῆμα ὑψηλὸν εἰπεῖν—

"ἀνάγκης θυγατρὸς κόρης Λαχέσεως λόγος. Ψυχαὶ ἐφήμεροι, ἀρχὴ ἄλλης περιόδου θνητοῦ γένους θανατηφόρου. [617e] οὐχ ὑμᾶς δαίμων λήξεται, ἀλλ' ὑμεῖς δαίμονα αἱρήσεσθε. πρῶτος δ' ὁ λαχὼν πρῶτος αἱρείσθω βίον ᾧ συνέσται ἐξ ἀνάγκης. ἀρετὴ δὲ ἀδέσποτον, ἣν

ENGLISH

fifth's sixth; the third's seventh; and the second's eighth.[13]

The rim of the largest was spangled; that of the seventh was brightest; that of [617a] the eighth took its color from the seventh shining on it; those of the second and fifth were like each other, yellower than those; the third had the whitest color; the fourth was reddish; and the sixth was second in whiteness. The spindle as a whole turned around with a single motion, but within the whole as it revolved, the seven inner circles revolved slowly in the opposite direction to the whole. Of these the eighth went fastest; second, and together [617b] with one another, came the seventh, sixth and fifth; third in speed, as it appeared to them, the fourth went with its counter-revolution; fourth was the third, and fifth the second. And the spindle turned on the knees of Necessity.

On top of each of its circles, up above, stood a Siren, carried around with it and uttering a single sound, a single note; and from all eight together there sounded a single harmony. Three others sat around it, [617c] at equal distances, each on a throne: the daughters of Necessity, the Fates, dressed in white, with garlands on their heads—Lachesis, Clotho and Atropos—singing to the Sirens' harmony, Lachesis of what has been, Clotho of what is, and Atropos of what is to be. Clotho, touching the outer revolution of the spindle with her right hand, helped turn it, pausing from time to time; Atropos did the same to the inner ones with her left; and Lachesis [617d] touched each in turn with either hand. So when they arrived, they had to go straight to Lachesis.[14]

A spokesman first arranged them in order; then he took lots and patterns of lives from the knees of Lachesis, climbed up onto a high platform, and said:

"This is the word of Lachesis, maiden daughter of Necessity. Souls of a day, here begins another cycle of mortal kind, one that ends in death. [617e] No guardian spirit will be allotted to you; you will choose your guardian spirit. Let the one who draws the first lot be first to choose a life, to which

13 The eight whorls are usually understood as, from outermost inward, the fixed stars, Saturn, Jupiter, Mars, Mercury, Venus, the sun, and the moon.
14 The Fates' names mean roughly "Allotter" (Lachesis), "Spinner" (Clotho) and "Unturnable" (Atropos).

GREEK

τιμῶν καὶ ἀτιμάζων πλέον καὶ ἔλαττον αὐτῆς ἕκαστος ἕξει. αἰτία ἑλομένου· θεὸς ἀναίτιος."

ταῦτα εἰπόντα ῥῖψαι ἐπὶ πάντας τοὺς κλήρους, τὸν δὲ παρ' αὐτὸν πεσόντα ἕκαστον ἀναιρεῖσθαι πλὴν οὗ, ἃ δὲ οὐκ ἐᾶν· τῷ δὲ ἀνελομένῳ δῆλον εἶναι ὁπόστος εἰλήχει.

618a μετὰ δὲ τοῦτο αὖθις τὰ τῶν βίων παραδείγματα εἰς τὸ πρόσθεν σφῶν θεῖναι ἐπὶ τὴν γῆν, πολὺ πλείω τῶν παρόντων. εἶναι δὲ παντοδαπά· ζῴων τε γὰρ πάντων βίους καὶ δὴ καὶ τοὺς ἀνθρωπίνους ἅπαντας. τυραννίδας τε γὰρ ἐν αὐτοῖς εἶναι, τὰς μὲν διατελεῖς, τὰς δὲ καὶ μεταξὺ διαφθειρομένας καὶ εἰς πενίας τε καὶ φυγὰς καὶ εἰς πτωχείας τελευτώσας· εἶναι δὲ καὶ δοκίμων ἀνδρῶν βίους, τοὺς μὲν ἐπὶ εἴδεσιν καὶ κατὰ κάλλη καὶ τὴν ἄλλην ἰσχύν 618b τε καὶ ἀγωνίαν, τοὺς δ' ἐπὶ γένεσιν καὶ προγόνων ἀρεταῖς, καὶ ἀδοκίμων κατὰ ταῦτα, ὡσαύτως δὲ καὶ γυναικῶν.

618b ψυχῆς δὲ τάξιν οὐκ ἐνεῖναι διὰ τὸ ἀναγκαίως ἔχειν ἄλλον ἑλομένην βίον ἀλλοίαν γίγνεσθαι· τὰ δ' ἄλλα ἀλλήλοις τε καὶ πλούτοις καὶ πενίαις, τὰ δὲ νόσοις, τὰ δ' ὑγιείαις μεμεῖχθαι, τὰ δὲ καὶ μεσοῦν τούτων. ἔνθα δή, ὡς ἔοικεν, ὦ φίλε Γλαύκων, ὁ πᾶς κίνδυνος ἀνθρώπῳ, καὶ διὰ ταῦτα μάλιστα 618c ἐπιμελητέον ὅπως ἕκαστος ἡμῶν τῶν ἄλλων μαθημάτων ἀμελήσας τούτου τοῦ μαθήματος καὶ ζητητὴς καὶ μαθητὴς ἔσται, ἐάν ποθεν οἷός τ' ᾖ μαθεῖν καὶ ἐξευρεῖν τίς αὐτὸν ποιήσει δυνατὸν καὶ ἐπιστήμονα, βίον καὶ χρηστὸν καὶ πονηρὸν διαγιγνώσκοντα, τὸν βελτίω ἐκ τῶν δυνατῶν ἀεὶ πανταχοῦ αἱρεῖσθαι·

618c ἀναλογιζόμενον πάντα τὰ νυνδὴ ῥηθέντα καὶ συντιθέμενα ἀλλήλοις καὶ διαιρούμενα πρὸς ἀρετὴν βίου πῶς ἔχει, εἰδέναι τί κάλλος πενίᾳ ἢ πλούτῳ κραθὲν καὶ 618d μετὰ ποίας τινὸς ψυχῆς ἕξεως κακὸν ἢ ἀγαθὸν ἐργάζεται, καὶ τί εὐγένειαι καὶ δυσγένειαι καὶ ἰδιωτεῖαι καὶ ἀρχαὶ καὶ ἰσχύες καὶ ἀσθένειαι καὶ εὐμαθίαι καὶ δυσμαθίαι καὶ πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα τῶν φύσει περὶ ψυχὴν ὄντων καὶ τῶν ἐπικτήτων τί συγκεραννύμενα πρὸς ἄλληλα ἐργάζεται, ὥστε ἐξ ἁπάντων αὐτῶν δυνατὸν εἶναι συλλογισάμενον αἱρεῖσθαι, πρὸς τὴν τῆς ψυχῆς φύσιν ἀποβλέποντα, τόν τε χείρω καὶ τὸν ἀμείνω 618e βίον, χείρω μὲν καλοῦντα ὃς αὐτὴν ἐκεῖσε ἄξει, εἰς τὸ

ENGLISH

he will be bound by necessity. Excellence has no master: each will have more or less of it as he honors or dishonors it. The blame is the chooser's; god is blameless."

Having said this, he threw the lots out among them all, and each picked up the one that fell beside him—except Er, whom he didn't allow to; and whoever picked one up could see what number he had drawn.

After this he set the patterns of lives on the ground in front of them, far more of them than there were souls present. They were of every kind: lives of all the animals, and all human lives as well. Among them were tyrannies, some lasting to the end, others collapsing midway and ending in poverty, exile and beggary. There were also lives of men of repute, some for their looks and beauty and for strength 618b and prowess in contests generally, others for their birth and the excellences of their ancestors; and lives of men without repute on these same counts; and likewise lives of women.

But the ordering of the soul was not included in them, because a soul necessarily becomes different according to the life it chooses. All the other things were mixed with one another and with wealth and poverty, some with sickness, some with health, and some were in between. That, it seems, my dear Glaucon, is where the whole danger lies for a human being; and that's why each of us must take the utmost 618c care to neglect all other studies and to seek and learn this one, in the hope that he may be able to learn and discover from somewhere who will make him able and knowledgeable enough to tell a good life from a bad one, and always and everywhere to choose the better one among those available.

He must take into account all the things we've just discussed, both combined with one another and taken separately, and how they bear on the excellence of a life. He must know what beauty mixed with poverty or with wealth does, and 618d with what condition of soul it produces evil or good; and what good birth and low birth, private life and public office, strength and weakness, quickness and slowness at learning, and all such things, both those that belong to the soul by nature and those that are acquired, produce when blended with one another. Then from all of them he will be able to

GREEK	ENGLISH
ἀδικωτέραν γίγνεσθαι, ἀμείνω δὲ ὅστις εἰς τὸ δικαιοτέραν.	reason out his choice, looking to the nature of the soul, between the worse and the better [618e] life, calling worse the one that will lead the soul toward becoming more unjust, and better the one that leads it toward becoming more just.
618e τὰ δὲ ἄλλα πάντα χαίρειν ἐάσει· ἑωράκαμεν γὰρ ὅτι ζῶντί τε καὶ τελευτήσαντι αὕτη κρατίστη αἵρεσις.	Everything else he will let go. For we have seen that for the living and the dead alike, this is the best choice.
ἀδαμαντίνως δὴ [619a] δεῖ ταύτην τὴν δόξαν ἔχοντα εἰς Ἅιδου ἰέναι, ὅπως ἂν ᾖ καὶ ἐκεῖ ἀνέκπληκτος ὑπὸ πλούτων τε καὶ τῶν τοιούτων κακῶν, καὶ μὴ ἐμπεσὼν εἰς τυραννίδας καὶ ἄλλας τοιαύτας πράξεις πολλὰ μὲν ἐργάσηται καὶ ἀνήκεστα κακά, ἔτι δὲ αὐτὸς μείζω πάθῃ, ἀλλὰ γνῷ τὸν μέσον ἀεὶ τῶν τοιούτων βίον αἱρεῖσθαι καὶ φεύγειν τὰ ὑπερβάλλοντα ἑκατέρωσε καὶ ἐν τῷδε τῷ βίῳ κατὰ τὸ δυνατὸν καὶ ἐν παντὶ τῷ ἔπειτα· οὕτω γὰρ [619b] εὐδαιμονέστατος γίγνεται ἄνθρωπος.	One must hold this opinion as firmly as adamant [619a] when one goes to Hades, so as to be undazzled there too by wealth and such evils; so as not to plunge into tyrannies and other such pursuits, committing many incurable evils and suffering still greater ones oneself; but to know always to choose the life in the middle among such things, and to shun the extremes on either side, both in this life, as far as possible, and in all the life that follows. For that's how [619b] a human being becomes happiest.
619b καὶ δὴ οὖν καὶ τότε ὁ ἐκεῖθεν ἄγγελος ἤγγελλε τὸν μὲν προφήτην οὕτως εἰπεῖν· "καὶ τελευταίῳ ἐπιόντι, ξὺν νῷ ἑλομένῳ, συντόνως ζῶντι κεῖται βίος ἀγαπητός, οὐ κακός. μήτε ὁ ἄρχων αἱρέσεως ἀμελείτω μήτε ὁ τελευτῶν ἀθυμείτω."	And so the messenger from that world reported that on that occasion the spokesman spoke as follows: "Even for the one who comes last, if he chooses with understanding and lives with effort, there is laid up a life worth being content with, not a bad one. Let the first to choose not be careless, nor the last lose heart."
εἰπόντος δὲ ταῦτα τὸν πρῶτον λαχόντα ἔφη εὐθὺς ἐπιόντα τὴν μεγίστην τυραννίδα ἑλέσθαι, καὶ ὑπὸ ἀφροσύνης τε καὶ λαιμαργίας οὐ πάντα ἱκανῶς ἀνασκεψάμενον ἑλέσθαι, ἀλλ' [619c] αὐτὸν λαθεῖν ἐνοῦσαν εἱμαρμένην παίδων αὐτοῦ βρώσεις καὶ ἄλλα κακά· ἐπειδὴ δὲ κατὰ σχολὴν σκέψασθαι, κόπτεσθαί τε καὶ ὀδύρεσθαι τὴν αἵρεσιν, οὐκ ἐμμένοντα τοῖς προρρηθεῖσιν ὑπὸ τοῦ προφήτου· οὐ γὰρ ἑαυτὸν αἰτιᾶσθαι τῶν κακῶν, ἀλλὰ τύχην τε καὶ δαίμονας καὶ πάντα μᾶλλον ἀνθ' ἑαυτοῦ. εἶναι δὲ αὐτὸν τῶν ἐκ τοῦ οὐρανοῦ ἡκόντων, ἐν τεταγμένῃ πολιτείᾳ ἐν τῷ προτέρῳ βίῳ βεβιωκότα, ἔθει [619d] ἄνευ φιλοσοφίας ἀρετῆς μετειληφότα.	When he had said this, Er said, the one who had drawn the first lot went straight up and chose the greatest tyranny. Out of folly and greed he chose it without examining everything adequately, and [619c] he failed to notice that it held his fate: to eat his own children, and other evils. When he examined it at leisure, he beat his breast and lamented his choice, not abiding by the spokesman's warning; for he didn't blame himself for his misfortunes, but chance and guardian spirits and anything rather than himself. He was one of those who had come from heaven, having lived his previous life in a well-ordered constitution, [619d] sharing in excellence by habit, without philosophy.
619d ὡς δὲ καὶ εἰπεῖν, οὐκ ἐλάττους εἶναι ἐν τοῖς τοιούτοις ἁλισκομένους τοὺς ἐκ τοῦ οὐρανοῦ ἥκοντας, ἅτε πόνων ἀγυμνάστους· τῶν δ' ἐκ τῆς γῆς τοὺς πολλούς, ἅτε αὐτούς τε πεπονηκότας ἄλλους τε ἑωρακότας, οὐκ ἐξ ἐπιδρομῆς τὰς αἱρέσεις ποιεῖσθαι. διὸ δὴ καὶ μεταβολὴν τῶν κακῶν καὶ τῶν ἀγαθῶν ταῖς πολλαῖς τῶν ψυχῶν γίγνεσθαι καὶ διὰ τὴν τοῦ κλήρου τύχην· ἐπεὶ εἴ τις ἀεί, ὁπότε εἰς τὸν	One might even say that those who had come from heaven were not the fewest among those caught out in this way, since they were untrained in hardship. But most of those from the earth, having suffered hardships themselves and seen others suffer, didn't make their choices in a rush. That is why most of the souls exchanged evil for good and

GREEK

ἐνθάδε βίον ἀφικνοῖτο, ὑγιῶς φιλοσοφοῖ [619e] καὶ ὁ κλῆρος αὐτῷ τῆς αἱρέσεως μὴ ἐν τελευταίοις πίπτοι, κινδυνεύει ἐκ τῶν ἐκεῖθεν ἀπαγγελλομένων οὐ μόνον ἐνθάδε εὐδαιμονεῖν ἄν, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὴν ἐνθένδε ἐκεῖσε καὶ δεῦρο πάλιν πορείαν οὐκ ἂν χθονίαν καὶ τραχεῖαν πορεύεσθαι, ἀλλὰ λείαν τε καὶ οὐρανίαν.

619e ταύτην γὰρ δὴ ἔφη τὴν θέαν ἀξίαν εἶναι ἰδεῖν, ὡς ἕκασται [620a] αἱ ψυχαὶ ἥροῦντο τοὺς βίους· ἐλεινήν τε γὰρ ἰδεῖν εἶναι καὶ γελοίαν καὶ θαυμασίαν. κατὰ συνήθειαν γὰρ τοῦ προτέρου βίου τὰ πολλὰ αἱρεῖσθαι. ἰδεῖν μὲν γὰρ ψυχὴν ἔφη τήν ποτε Ὀρφέως γενομένην κύκνου βίον αἱρουμένην, μίσει τοῦ γυναικείου γένους διὰ τὸν ὑπ' ἐκείνων θάνατον οὐκ ἐθέλουσαν ἐν γυναικὶ γεννηθεῖσαν γενέσθαι· ἰδεῖν δὲ τὴν Θαμύρου ἀηδόνος ἑλομένην· ἰδεῖν δὲ καὶ κύκνον μεταβάλλοντα εἰς ἀνθρωπίνου βίου αἵρεσιν, καὶ ἄλλα ζῷα μουσικὰ ὡσαύτως. [620b] εἰκοστὴν δὲ λαχοῦσαν ψυχὴν ἑλέσθαι λέοντος βίον· εἶναι δὲ τὴν Αἴαντος τοῦ Τελαμωνίου, φεύγουσαν ἄνθρωπον γενέσθαι, μεμνημένην τῆς τῶν ὅπλων κρίσεως. τὴν δ' ἐπὶ τούτῳ Ἀγαμέμνονος· ἔχθρᾳ δὲ καὶ ταύτην τοῦ ἀνθρωπίνου γένους διὰ τὰ πάθη ἀετοῦ διαλλάξαι βίον.

620b ἐν μέσοις δὲ λαχοῦσαν τὴν Ἀταλάντης ψυχήν, κατιδοῦσαν μεγάλας τιμὰς ἀθλητοῦ ἀνδρός, οὐ δύνασθαι παρελθεῖν, ἀλλὰ λαβεῖν. μετὰ [620c] δὲ ταύτην ἰδεῖν τὴν Ἐπειοῦ τοῦ Πανοπέως εἰς τεχνικῆς γυναικὸς ἰοῦσαν φύσιν· πόρρω δ' ἐν ὑστάτοις ἰδεῖν τὴν τοῦ γελωτοποιοῦ Θερσίτου πίθηκον ἐνδυομένην. κατὰ τύχην δὲ τὴν Ὀδυσσέως λαχοῦσαν πασῶν ὑστάτην αἱρησομένην ἰέναι, μνήμῃ δὲ τῶν προτέρων πόνων φιλοτιμίας λελωφηκυῖαν ζητεῖν περιιοῦσαν χρόνον πολὺν βίον ἀνδρὸς ἰδιώτου ἀπράγμονος, καὶ μόγις εὑρεῖν κείμενόν που καὶ παρημελημένον [620d] ὑπὸ τῶν ἄλλων, καὶ εἰπεῖν ἰδοῦσαν ὅτι τὰ αὐτὰ ἂν ἔπραξεν καὶ πρώτη λαχοῦσα, καὶ ἀσμένην ἑλέσθαι. καὶ ἐκ τῶν ἄλλων δὴ θηρίων ὡσαύτως εἰς ἀνθρώπους ἰέναι καὶ εἰς ἄλληλα, τὰ μὲν ἄδικα εἰς τὰ ἄγρια, τὰ δὲ δίκαια εἰς τὰ ἥμερα μεταβάλλοντα, καὶ πάσας μείξεις μείγνυσθαι.

ENGLISH

good for evil—and also because of the luck of the lot. For if someone, whenever he came into life here, always pursued philosophy soundly, [619e] and his lot for choosing didn't fall among the last, it seems likely from what was reported from there that he would not only be happy here, but would also travel the road from here to there and back again not underground and rough, but smooth and through the heavens.

For this, he said, was a spectacle worth seeing: how each [620a] of the souls chose its life. It was pitiful to see, and laughable, and amazing. For the most part they chose according to the habits of their former life. He said he saw the soul that had once been Orpheus' choosing the life of a swan: out of hatred for womankind, because of the death it had suffered at women's hands, it didn't want to be conceived and born of a woman. He saw the soul of Thamyras choosing a nightingale's life; and he also saw a swan changing over to choose a human life, and other musical animals doing likewise. [620b] The soul that drew the twentieth lot chose the life of a lion. It was the soul of Ajax son of Telamon, which shunned becoming a human being, remembering the judgment over the arms. Next came Agamemnon's; this one too, out of hostility to the human race because of what it had suffered, took an eagle's life in exchange.[15]

Atalanta's soul had drawn a lot in the middle, and when it caught sight of the great honors of a male athlete, it couldn't pass them by, but took them. After [620c] her he saw the soul of Epeius son of Panopeus going into the nature of a craftswoman. Far off, among the last, he saw the soul of the clown Thersites putting on an ape. As chance would have it, the soul of Odysseus had drawn the very last lot of all and came up to choose. Remembering its former labors, it had recovered from its love of honor, and it went around for a long time looking for the life of a private man who kept out of affairs. With difficulty it found one lying somewhere, disregarded [620d] by the others, and when it saw it, it said it would have done the same even if it had drawn first, and chose it gladly. And from the other beasts, likewise, some went into human beings and into one another, the unjust changing into

15 Orpheus was torn apart by women; Thamyras was a bard blinded for challenging the Muses. Ajax lost the contest for Achilles' armor to Odysseus, and Agamemnon was murdered by his wife on his return from Troy.

GREEK

ENGLISH

wild ones and the just into tame ones, and there were mixtures of every kind.[16]

620d ἐπειδὴ δ' οὖν πάσας τὰς ψυχὰς τοὺς βίους ᾑρῆσθαι, ὥσπερ ἔλαχον ἐν τάξει προσιέναι πρὸς τὴν Λάχεσιν· ἐκείνην δ' ἑκάστῳ ὃν εἵλετο δαίμονα, τοῦτον φύλακα συμπέμπειν 620e τοῦ βίου καὶ ἀποπληρωτὴν τῶν αἱρεθέντων. ὃν πρῶτον μὲν ἄγειν αὐτὴν πρὸς τὴν Κλωθὼ ὑπὸ τὴν ἐκείνης χεῖρά τε καὶ ἐπιστροφὴν τῆς τοῦ ἀτράκτου δίνης, κυροῦντα ἣν λαχὼν εἵλετο μοῖραν· ταύτης δ' ἐφαψάμενον αὖθις ἐπὶ τὴν τῆς Ἀτρόπου ἄγειν νῆσιν, ἀμετάστροφα τὰ ἐπικλωσθέντα ποιοῦντα·

When all the souls had chosen their lives, they went up to Lachesis in the order of their lots. She sent with each the guardian spirit it had chosen, as protector 620e of its life and fulfiller of what it had chosen. This spirit first led the soul to Clotho, under her hand as she turned the whirling spindle, ratifying the fate it had drawn and chosen. After touching her, the spirit led the soul on to Atropos' spinning, making what had been spun irreversible.

620e ἐντεῦθεν δὲ δὴ ἀμεταστρεπτὶ ὑπὸ τὸν τῆς 621a ἀνάγκης ἰέναι θρόνον, καὶ δι' ἐκείνου διεξελθόντα, ἐπειδὴ καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι διῆλθον, πορεύεσθαι ἅπαντας εἰς τὸ τῆς Λήθης πεδίον διὰ καύματός τε καὶ πνίγους δεινοῦ· καὶ γὰρ εἶναι αὐτὸ κενὸν δένδρων τε καὶ ὅσα γῆ φύει. σκηνᾶσθαι οὖν σφᾶς ἤδη ἑσπέρας γιγνομένης παρὰ τὸν Ἀμέλητα ποταμόν, οὗ τὸ ὕδωρ ἀγγεῖον οὐδὲν στέγειν. μέτρον μὲν οὖν τι τοῦ ὕδατος πᾶσιν ἀναγκαῖον εἶναι πιεῖν, τοὺς δὲ φρονήσει μὴ σῳζομένους πλέον πίνειν τοῦ μέτρου· τὸν δὲ ἀεὶ πιόντα 621b πάντων ἐπιλανθάνεσθαι. ἐπειδὴ δὲ κοιμηθῆναι καὶ μέσας νύκτας γενέσθαι, βροντήν τε καὶ σεισμὸν γενέσθαι, καὶ ἐντεῦθεν ἐξαπίνης ἄλλον ἄλλῃ φέρεσθαι ἄνω εἰς τὴν γένεσιν, ἄττοντας ὥσπερ ἀστέρας.

From there, without turning back, they went under the throne of 621a Necessity. When they had passed through it, and the others had too, they all traveled to the plain of Lethe through terrible, stifling heat; for it was bare of trees and of everything the earth grows. So, as evening was coming on, they camped by the river of Unheeding, whose water no vessel can hold. All of them had to drink a certain measure of the water, and those not saved by understanding drank more than the measure; and each, as he drank, 621b forgot everything. After they had gone to sleep and it was midnight, there was thunder and an earthquake, and suddenly they were carried up from there, one this way, one that, to their birth, shooting like stars.[17]

621b αὐτὸς δὲ τοῦ μὲν ὕδατος κωλυθῆναι πιεῖν· ὅπῃ μέντοι καὶ ὅπως εἰς τὸ σῶμα ἀφίκοιτο, οὐκ εἰδέναι, ἀλλ' ἐξαίφνης ἀναβλέψας ἰδεῖν ἕωθεν αὐτὸν κείμενον ἐπὶ τῇ πυρᾷ.

He himself had been prevented from drinking the water. Yet by what path and in what way he came back into his body he didn't know; but suddenly he opened his eyes and saw himself at dawn, lying on the pyre.

καὶ οὕτως, ὦ Γλαύκων, μῦθος ἐσώθη καὶ οὐκ ἀπώλετο, 621c καὶ ἡμᾶς ἂν σώσειεν, ἂν πειθώμεθα αὐτῷ, καὶ τὸν τῆς Λήθης ποταμὸν εὖ διαβησόμεθα καὶ τὴν ψυχὴν οὐ μιανθησόμεθα. ἀλλ' ἂν ἐμοὶ πειθώμεθα, νομίζοντες ἀθάνατον ψυχὴν καὶ δυνατὴν πάντα μὲν κακὰ ἀνέχεσθαι, πάντα δὲ ἀγαθά, τῆς ἄνω ὁδοῦ ἀεὶ ἐξόμεθα καὶ δικαιοσύνην μετὰ φρονήσεως παντὶ τρόπῳ ἐπιτηδεύσομεν, ἵνα καὶ ἡμῖν αὐτοῖς φίλοι ὦμεν καὶ τοῖς θεοῖς, αὐτοῦ τε μένοντες ἐνθάδε, καὶ ἐπειδὰν τὰ ἆθλα 621d αὐτῆς κομιζώμεθα, ὥσπερ οἱ νικηφόροι περιαγειρόμενοι,

And so, Glaucon, the tale was saved and not lost, 621c and it could save us too, if we're persuaded by it; and we'll cross the river of Lethe safely and not defile our souls. But if we're persuaded by me, believing that the soul is immortal and able to endure every evil and every good, we'll always keep to the upward road and pursue justice with understanding in every way, so that we may be friends to ourselves and to the gods, both while we remain here and when we carry off the prizes 621d of justice, like victors going around collecting their

16 Atalanta was a huntress famed for her speed; Epeius built the wooden horse at Troy; Thersites is the ugly, jeering soldier of the *Iliad*.
17 Lethe means "forgetfulness."

GREEK	ENGLISH
καὶ ἐνθάδε καὶ ἐν τῇ χιλιέτει πορείᾳ, ἣν διεληλύθαμεν, εὖ πράττωμεν.	winnings; and so that both here and on the thousand-year journey we have described, we may fare well.